

This is a repository copy of *Testing peatland water-table depth transfer functions using high-resolution hydrological monitoring data*.

White Rose Research Online URL for this paper: http://eprints.whiterose.ac.uk/86293/

Version: Accepted Version

# Article:

Swindles, GT, Holden, J, Raby, C et al. (5 more authors) (2015) Testing peatland water-table depth transfer functions using high-resolution hydrological monitoring data. Quaternary Science Reviews, 120. 107 - 117. ISSN 0277-3791

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.quascirev.2015.04.019

© 2015, Elsevier. Licensed under the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/

## Reuse

Unless indicated otherwise, fulltext items are protected by copyright with all rights reserved. The copyright exception in section 29 of the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988 allows the making of a single copy solely for the purpose of non-commercial research or private study within the limits of fair dealing. The publisher or other rights-holder may allow further reproduction and re-use of this version - refer to the White Rose Research Online record for this item. Where records identify the publisher as the copyright holder, users can verify any specific terms of use on the publisher's website.

## Takedown

If you consider content in White Rose Research Online to be in breach of UK law, please notify us by emailing eprints@whiterose.ac.uk including the URL of the record and the reason for the withdrawal request.



eprints@whiterose.ac.uk https://eprints.whiterose.ac.uk/

## Elsevier Editorial System(tm) for Quaternary Science Reviews Manuscript Draft

## Manuscript Number: JQSR-D-14-00453R1

Title: Testing peatland water-table depth transfer functions using high-resolution hydrological monitoring data

Article Type: Research and Review Paper

Keywords: Transfer function; Palaeoecology; Holocene; Peat; Testate amoebae; Hydrology; Wetlands

Corresponding Author: Prof. Graeme Thomas Swindles,

Corresponding Author's Institution: University of Leeds

First Author: Graeme Thomas Swindles

Order of Authors: Graeme Thomas Swindles; Joseph Holden ; Cassandra Raby; Ed Turner; Anthony Blundell; Dan Charman; Meseret Walle Menberu; Bjørn Kløve

Abstract: Transfer functions are now commonly used to reconstruct past environmental variability from palaeoecological data. However, such approaches need to be critically appraised. Testate amoeba-based transfer functions are an established method for the quantitative reconstruction of past water-table variations in peatlands, and have been applied to research questions in palaeoclimatology, peatland ecohydrology and archaeology. We analysed automatically-logged peatland water-table data from dipwells located in England, Wales and Finland and a suite of three year, one year and summer water-table statistics were calculated from each location. Surface moss samples were extracted from beside each dipwell and the testate amoebae community composition was determined. Two published transfer functions were applied to the testate-amoeba data for prediction of water-table depth (England and Europe). Our results show that estimated water-table depths based on the testate amoeba community reflect directional changes, but that they are poor representations of the real mean or median water-table magnitudes for the study sites. We suggest that although testate amoeba-based reconstructions can be used to identify past shifts in peat hydrology, they cannot currently be used to establish precise hydrological baselines such as those needed to inform management and restoration of peatlands. One approach to avoid confusion with contemporary water-table determinations is to use residuals or standardised values for peatland water-table reconstructions. We contend that our test of transfer functions against independent instrumental data sets may be more powerful than relying on statistical testing alone.

\*ManuscriptR1 Click here to view linked References

# 1 Testing peatland water-table depth transfer functions using high-

# 2 resolution hydrological monitoring data

- 3
- 4 (1) Graeme T. Swindles, School of Geography, University of Leeds, LS2 9JT, UK
- 5 (2) Joseph Holden, water@leeds, School of Geography, University of Leeds, LS2 9JT, UK
- 6 (3) Cassandra Raby, Institute of Integrative Biology & Institute of Zoology, University of
   7 Liverpool, L69 7ZB, UK
- 8 (4) T. Edward Turner, water@leeds, School of Geography, University of Leeds, LS2 9JT,
  9 UK
- 10 (5) Anthony Blundell, water@leeds, School of Geography, University of Leeds, LS2 9JT, UK
- (6) Dan J. Charman, Geography, College of Life and Environmental Sciences, University of
   Exeter, EX4 4RJ, UK
- (7) Meseret Walle Menberu, Water Resources and Environmental Engineering Research
   Group, Faculty of Technology, University of Oulu
- 15 (8) Bjørn Kløve, Water Resources and Environmental Engineering Research Group, Faculty
- 16 of Technology, University of Oulu
- 17
- 18
- 19 Corresponding author: G.T. Swindles, School of Geography, University of Leeds, LS2 9JT,
- 20 UK, +44 (0)11334 39127, g.t.swindles@leeds.ac.uk
- 21
- 22 Manuscript for Quaternary Science Reviews
- 23
- 24 Keywords: Transfer function; Palaeoecology; Holocene; Peat; Testate amoebae;
  25 Hydrology; Wetlands
- 26

#### 27 Abstract

Transfer functions are now commonly used to reconstruct past environmental variability from 28 palaeoecological data. However, such approaches need to be critically appraised. Testate 29 amoeba-based transfer functions are an established method for the quantitative 30 31 reconstruction of past water-table variations in peatlands, and have been applied to research 32 questions in palaeoclimatology, peatland ecohydrology and archaeology. We analysed automatically-logged peatland water-table data from dipwells located in England, Wales and 33 34 Finland and a suite of three year, one year and summer water-table statistics were 35 calculated from each location. Surface moss samples were extracted from beside each dipwell and the testate amoebae community composition was determined. Two published 36 37 transfer functions were applied to the testate-amoeba data for prediction of water-table depth 38 (England and Europe). Our results show that estimated water-table depths based on the 39 testate amoeba community reflect directional changes, but that they are poor representations of the real mean or median water-table magnitudes for the study sites. We 40 suggest that although testate amoeba-based reconstructions can be used to identify past 41 shifts in peat hydrology, they cannot currently be used to establish precise hydrological 42 43 baselines such as those needed to inform management and restoration of peatlands. One approach to avoid confusion with contemporary water-table determinations is to use 44 residuals or standardised values for peatland water-table reconstructions. We contend that 45 our test of transfer functions against independent instrumental data sets may be more 46 powerful than relying on statistical testing alone. 47

48

49

## 50 **1. Introduction**

51 Quantitative reconstruction of past environmental variability from fossil data has become 52 increasingly common in palaeoecology since Imbrie and Kipp (1971) first produced a 53 reconstruction of past sea-surface temperature using fossil foraminiferal assemblages. 54 Models for predicting past environmental conditions (so-called 'transfer functions') are firmly 55 based in uniformitarian principles. The relationships between contemporary taxa and environmental variables are modelled and the resultant function is used to transform fossil 56 data from a biostratigraphic sequence into guantitative estimates of an environmental 57 variable in the past. Transfer functions have been developed for several groups of 58 59 microfossils to reconstruct a variety of climatic, chemical and hydrological variables (e.g. Brooks and Birks, 2000; Charman et al., 2007; Fritz et al., 1991; Gasse et al., 1995; Imbrie 60 and Kipp, 1971). It has been suggested that the development of such quantitative 61 reconstructions from biological proxies have revolutionised palaeoecology (e.g. Juggins, 62 63 2013); however, there have been several recent criticisms of transfer function approaches 64 including niche-based models (Belyea, 2007), spatial autocorrelation (Payne et al., 2012; 65 Telford and Birks, 2005), and the confounding influence of non-causal/secondary variables 66 (Juggins, 2013). It is now imperative that transfer functions are thoroughly and critically 67 tested.

68

69 Peatlands accumulated 473-621 Gt of carbon during the Holocene (Yu et al., 2010), and 70 store approximately the same amount of carbon as the atmosphere. Although it is 71 established that global peatlands had a net cooling effect on climate through the Holocene (Frolking et al., 2006), there are still major questions over how they will respond to future 72 climate change. This has led to a recent proliferation of studies examining the dynamics of 73 peatlands in terms of carbon-accumulation, hydrology and ecology during the Holocene (e.g. 74 Charman et al., 2013; Loisel and Garneau, 2010; Turner et al., 2014; van Bellen et al., 75 2011). Testate amoebae (TA) are a group of single-celled organisms that form a shell (their 76 key identification feature - Charman et al., 2000). They are found in abundance on the 77 surface of peatlands and can be well-preserved in Holocene peats (Charman et al., 2000; 78 Charman and Warner, 1992; Tolonen et al., 1992, 1994). TA are sensitive to 79 microenvironmental conditions on peatlands, especially moisture and to a lesser extent pH 80 and water chemistry, and respond rapidly to environmental changes (Marcisz et al., 2014; 81 82 Woodland et al., 1998). TA-based transfer functions have been key in the reconstruction of hydrological changes (primarily water-table depth) in peatlands across several regions of the
world (e.g. Amesbury et al., 2013; Booth, 2002; Charman et al., 2007; Lamarre et al., 2013;
Lamentowicz et al., 2008a; Swindles et al., 2009; Swindles et al., 2014; Turner et al., 2013;
Woodland et al., 1998). These reconstructions have been used widely as proxy records of
Holocene climate change (e.g. Charman et al., 2009; Mauquoy et al., 2008; Swindles et al.,
2013).

89

90 However, one of the potential problems is that the water-table depths used in such studies 91 typically come from a 'one-off' water-table measurement from the TA sample extraction 92 point. The use of one-off water-table depth measurements in TA studies has been debated 93 previously (Bobrov et al., 1999; Booth, 2008); however, it has been suggested that such 94 measurements are adequate to drive a hydrological gradient for TA transfer-function development (Booth, 2008; Charman et al., 2007; Woodland, 1996). Several authors have 95 also suggested that one-off measurements are adequate as long as times of extreme 96 97 weather conditions (e.g. prolonged rain or drought) are avoided (Booth et al., 2008; Charman et al., 2007; Swindles et al., 2009; Turner et al., 2013). 98

99

One value of water-table depth is produced by the transfer function (i.e. n cm below the peat 100 101 surface), with sample-specific errors generated through a statistical resampling approach (bootstrapping). However, we know that water tables fluctuate in peatlands and are dynamic 102 (Evans et al., 1999; Holden et al., 2011; Price, 1992). Traditional TA transfer function-103 generated water-table data may not adequately capture a mean value from a site, and do 104 not account for water-table dynamics (e.g. seasonal or annual variability) which could 105 influence the TA community composition. Here we test the robustness of TA-based transfer 106 functions for water-table reconstruction in peatlands. Previously, model performance and 107 robustness have been tested using advanced statistical tools (cf. Telford, 2013; Telford and 108 109 Birks, 2011). Here we take an alternative approach: we use real-world data from independent test sites with high-resolution monitored water-table data to determine the predictive power of two published transfer functions.

112

## 113 **2. Materials and methods**

114 We tested two established TA transfer functions – 1. The pan-European transfer function from the ACCROTELM project based on eight raised bogs across Europe (Charman et al., 115 2007) and 2. A regional transfer function from Northern England based on three blanket 116 117 peatlands and three raised bogs (Turner et al., 2013). These transfer functions have been 118 used for palaeohydrological reconstruction from fossil data and have provided very similar results (Turner et al., 2013). They were deemed to be appropriate models for our test data in 119 120 terms of community composition and site characteristics. The models chosen were 121 constructed using weighted averaging-tolerance-downweighted regression with inverse 122 deshrinking as this was found to have very good performance in both cases.

123

Three independent test datasets were used – 1. Blanket peatlands in the Pennine region of 124 Northern England; 2. – An oceanic raised bog in Wales and 3. High-latitude peatlands in 125 126 Finland (Table 1). These sites were chosen as they have dipwells equipped with pressure transducers providing high-resolution (logged at least once every two hours, but mainly 15-127 minute) peatland water-table data. These data were checked for quality control and a suite 128 of water-table statistics for each point was determined including means, medians, ranges 129 and temporally-constrained measures including water-table depth residence times 130 (Supplementary file 1). These values were calculated as 3-year, 1-year, and summer values 131 (1 year and 3 years) prior to the TA sampling time for each dipwell. Only summer data are 132 available for the sites in Finland as they are frozen during the rest of the year 133 134 (Supplementary file 1).

135

136 Immediately adjacent (< 0.5 m) to each dipwell (but away from any areas of trampling or</li>137 disturbance), a surface sample of Sphagnum or other moss was extracted and the TA

138 community composition determined in the laboratory. We analysed the green fraction of the moss (the living plant) and a 1-cm thick section of the brown section to ensure that a sample 139 representing only the very recent period was obtained. TA were extracted using a modified 140 141 version of Booth et al. (2010). Moss samples were placed in boiling water for 15 minutes and 142 shaken. Extracts were passed through a 300 µm sieve, back-sieved at 15 µm and allowed to 143 settle before sub-samples were used to make slides for microscopy. Many testate amoebae 144 are not classed as true species in a taxonomic sense; rather, identification is based on test characteristics and groups of similar morphospecies (albeit with intraspecific variability) are 145 146 known as 'types'.

147

100 to 200 amoebae were counted and identified to species level or 'type' in each sample 148 using high-power transmitted light microscopy at 200 to 400x magnification. Identification 149 was aided with reference to several sources (Cash and Hopkinson, 1905; Cash and 150 151 Hopkinson, 1909; Cash et al., 1915; Charman et al., 2000; Corbet, 1973; Deflandre, 1936; 152 Grospietsch, 1958; Leidy, 1879; Meisterfeld, 2001a; Meisterfeld, 2001b; Ogden and Hedley, 1980; Penard, 1902). The taxonomy used is a modified version of Charman et al. (2000), 153 154 where some 'type' groupings were split to the species level (e.g. Difflugia globulosa was split 155 out of Cyclopyxis arcelloides type in the case of the England model). However, the 156 taxonomies were harmonised prior to water-table reconstruction. Transfer function-based 157 reconstructions were carried out on the test data and sample-specific errors were calculated using 1000 bootstrap cycles (presented in Supplementary file 1). Statistical analyses were 158 159 carried out in R version 3.0.2 (R-Core-Team, 2014). As the data are non-normal (based on 160 results of Shapiro-Wilk tests), Spearman's rank correlation was used to determine significant correlations between the monitored water-table statistics and the TA-reconstructed water 161 tables. 162

163

164 To assess the coverage of fossil taxa in the modern calibration set, the maximum 165 abundances of taxa in the modern and fossil dataset were calculated and compared to 166 determine any missing/poor-quality analogues or taxa with poorly-determined optima. Hill's N2 was also calculated to determine rare taxa (defined as N2  $\leq$  5). To compare 167 reconstructed water-table magnitudes with recorded data over a longer timeframe, new fossil 168 TA data from a short core from Moor House blanket peatland, northern England are 169 170 presented. The core was taken from beside one of the water-table monitoring stations following the coring method of De Vleeschouwer et al. (2010). An outline chronology for the 171 profile was established using spheroidal carbonaceous particles (SCPs) following Swindles 172 173 (2010).

174

## 175 **3. Results**

176 Fig. 1 shows the testate amoebae present in the test data, together with reconstructed water tables from both transfer functions alongside the 1-year annual mean water-table values. 177 178 Wet indicator taxa in the blanket peatland include Arcella discoides type, Difflugia pristis type and Pseudodifflugia fulva type; dry indicators include Euglypha strigosa, Hyalosphenia 179 180 subflava and Trigonopyxis arcula type. In the raised bog, wet indicators include Archerella flavum, Centropyxis aculeata type and Hyalosphenia elegans; dry indicators include 181 182 Assulina muscorum, Nebela flabellulum and Corythion-Trinema type. The high-latitude peatland samples are dominated by the wet indicator taxa Archerella flavum and 183 Hyalosphenia papilio. We found four samples from the blanket peatlands with very deep 184 water tables (annual mean > 35 cm), and thus have plotted these separately on Figs 1(b) 185 and 2. In these samples, we suggest that the testate amoebae communities are completely 186 decoupled from the water table, as reflected in the comparison of the monitored and 187 predicted water-table values (Fig. 2). These four samples were excluded from further 188 analyses. 189

190

There were several significant correlations between the statistics derived from the monitored water tables and the TA-based water-table reconstructions (Table 2). For example, there is significant correlation between mean annual water table (1 year) and the reconstructions

using the European model ( $r_s = 0.507$ , p < 0.01) and England model ( $r_s = 0.768$ , p < 0.01). 194 The correlation coefficients are generally higher for the England model for the 1-year annual 195 196 and summer data. In the 3-year dataset there are a greater number of significant correlations between the indices and the England model (Table 2). These significant correlations and the 197 198 comparison of the predicted and monitored values illustrate that testate amoeba-based 199 reconstructions do appear to reflect hydrological inter-site variations (Figure 1, Table 2). However, an examination of the magnitudes suggest that the TA transfer functions poorly 200 201 represent the annual or seasonal mean or median water-table values for the study sites 202 (Figures 1 and 3, Table 3). In most cases, both transfer function predictions are drier than 203 the annual and summer measured mean values (i.e. above the 1:1 line in Fig. 3). Such a 204 false over-deepening of the water table is very clear in the case of the raised bog samples. 205 However, there are a number of samples from the blanket peatland where the transfer 206 functions under-predict (i.e. less deep than observed) water-table depth. This again may reflect decoupling of the testate amoebae communities from the water table dynamics. The 207 208 England model has very poor predictive power for the high-latitude samples as it severely under-predicts water-table depth (Fig. 3 and 4). This is due to the dominant taxa in the 209 210 profile Archerella flavum and Hyalosphenia papilio being present primarily in very wet samples in the training set (cf. Turner et al., 2013). The more accurate reconstructions for 211 the high-latitude peatlands by the European transfer function probably reflects the inclusion 212 of samples from Estonia and Finland (Charman et al., 2007). These results illustrate the 213 potential of transfer functions based on regional training sets or, alternatively, show that the 214 inclusion of contemporary data from the same region as the fossil data is needed in the case 215 of supra-regional transfer functions. 216

217

The variation in predictive power between the two transfer functions may reflect missing taxa or the quality of analogues in the training set (Fig. 5, Table 4). For example, there were several missing analogues in the European model (Eugylpha ciliata, Difflugia globulosa, Hyalosphenia ovalis, Placocista spinosa and Sphenoderia lenta). Although there were no 222 missing analogues in the England model, some taxa probably have poorly-constrained 223 optima (e.g. Difflugia pulex, Hyalosphenia elegans, Pseudodifflugia fulva type and 224 Sphenoderia lenta) due to under-representation in the training set. Taxa with poorly-225 constrained optima in the European model include Arcella catinus type, Difflugia bacillifera, 226 Difflugia lucida type and Nebela collaris.

- 227
- 228

# 4. Discussion and conclusions

229 There have been several recent studies which have identified problems with transfer function 230 approaches in palaeoecology (Belyea, 2007; Juggins, 2013; Payne et al., 2012; Telford and Birks, 2009, 2011; Velle et al., 2012). The majority of these have used statistical tools to test 231 232 transfer functions. Instead, we have used independent data sets to test the models, which is an alternative and potentially more powerful test. Here, the comparison of testate amoeba-233 234 reconstructed water tables against high-resolution monitored data for contemporary samples illustrated that the reconstructions poorly represent the water-table magnitudes for the study 235 sites (in terms of true mean, median or residence time-based statistics). However, directional 236 changes in the testate amoeba-based reconstructions do appear to reflect inter-site 237 238 hydrological variations. Our results show clearly that testate amoeba-based reconstructions can be used to identify past shifts in peat hydrology but reconstructed magnitudes should be 239 interpreted with caution. 240

241

To illustrate our contention on the interpretation of water-table magnitudes, a TA profile and 242 water-table reconstruction from Moor House in Northern England is shown in Fig. 6. The 243 water-table reconstruction shows a transition from near surface to deeper water tables at the 244 boundary of the Little Ice Age (LIA) and Current Warm Period (CWP) at c. 1850. This has 245 been observed in several peatland profiles in the British Isles (e.g. Mauquoy et al., 2008; 246 Swindles et al., 2010; Turner et al., 2014). Such a level of replication suggests that the 247 reconstructed water-table transition is an unambiguous response of peatlands to climate 248 249 change (e.g. Swindles et al., 2013; Swindles et al., 2012). However, a comparison of the

recent part of the reconstruction with the water-table data from beside the coring site suggests that the magnitude of the reconstruction is too dry. In fact, the reconstructed watertable magnitude is equivalent to the maximum water-table depth recorded in the monitoring data (i.e. the end of the whisker of the red boxplot in Fig. 6).

254

255 There are probably two reasons for the transfer functions providing predictions that are mainly too dry. Firstly, the field sampling for the development of the two published transfer 256 257 functions was carried out in the summer season which introduces a warm-season bias. 258 Secondly, not enough time for equilibration of water tables may have been left during sampling leading to water-table data that are artificially too deep. The saturated hydraulic 259 conductivity of peat can vary from  $\sim 1$  cm s<sup>-1</sup> in the uppermost peat to 1 x 10<sup>-8</sup> cm s<sup>-1</sup> a few 260 261 tens of cm from the peat surface (Cunliffe et al., 2013; Hoag and Price, 1997; Holden and 262 Burt, 2003a). Thus, when researchers have performed one-off water-table measurements associated with TA sampling, it may be that in some cases the water level in the auger hole 263 or pit had not have risen sufficiently by the time a reading was taken. This problem may be 264 exaggerated when larger holes are dug as a greater volume of water is required to enter the 265 266 hole. Smearing of the hole sides by spades or augers can also reduce rates of water entry into it. The problem is likely to be greater during summer sampling when water tables are 267 often deeper and more likely to be at depths where the peat has a lower hydraulic 268 conductivity. 269

270

Testate amoebae transfer functions now exist from many regions of the world based on oneoff water-table measurements (e.g. Amesbury et al., 2013; Charman et al., 2007; Lamentowicz et al., 2008a; Swindles et al., 2009; Turner et al., 2013; Van Bellen et al., 2014). A previous model for British peatlands was developed using mean annual water-table data (Woodland et al., 1998). However, not all the samples in this model were based on sites with high-quality monitored water-table data (some mean annual values were inferred between microforms), and the model suffered from problems of missing/poor analogues as well as some poorly-constrained optima-tolerances; thus, more recent transfer functions arenow mostly used.

280

281 Several authors have attempted to obtain mean annual water-table data using a method 282 involving the discolouration of PVC stakes or tape (Amesbury et al., 2013; Markel et al., 283 2010; Payne et al., 2006; Swindles et al., 2009); however, nearly all attempts have failed completely or to some degree. The transfer function of Booth (2008) is the one study where 284 285 the PVC tape-discolouration method has been used with great success to develop a mean 286 annual water-table transfer function for Sphagnum peatlands in the USA. However, the 287 precise relationship of the PVC tape-discolouration and water table is still not completely understood (Belyea, 1999; Booth et al., 2005; Schnitchen et al., 2006). It is clear that the 288 289 best way to achieve high-resolution water-table data is the use of dipwells equipped with 290 logging pressure transducers. However, transfer functions commonly include >100 sample 291 points, thus rendering this approach prohibitively expensive to most researchers.

292

293 The 'decoupling' of testate amoebae from very deep water tables partly explain the relatively 294 poor performance of transfer functions at the drier end reported in a number of studies (e.g. Swindles et al., 2009; Van Bellen et al., 2014). Testate amoebae are probably not 295 responding directly to water-table depth, but instead are responding to variables correlated 296 with it (Jassey et al., 2011; Sullivan and Booth, 2011). Such deep water tables as found at 297 four monitoring points during our study suggest a potentially degraded peatland system at 298 these locations. Indeed the water table never came within 10 cm of the surface at any point 299 in time for these four points although regular saturation and the development of saturation-300 excess and near-surface flow during rainfall events is a typical characteristic of fully 301 functioning blanket peat (Acreman and Holden, 2013; Holden and Burt, 2003b). Thus the 302 303 surface moisture content of the peat at these four points may not have been strongly related 304 to the water-table depth and may instead have been more controlled by individual rainfall 305 episodes. Holden et al. (2011) showed that intact blanket peat water tables are strongly

306 controlled by evapotranspiration, with water tables remaining close to the surface for most of 307 the winter and only dropping a few cm in summer during warm, dry conditions. They also 308 showed that for degraded blanket peat, water tables are more strongly controlled by free 309 drainage of water through the peat, having almost equal levels of variance in both winter and 310 summer.

311

312 Unfortunately, there is no simple way to statistically correct transfer function models to mean 313 annual water-table depth or similar measure, due to the variation in accuracy across the 314 hydrological gradient and complexities of community composition (Figs 3 and 4). Our results may also suggest that the errors generated from bootstrapping are ineffectual as the 315 316 reconstructions are inaccurate in terms of absolute values. Thus, to avoid confusion with contemporary site water-table data, we suggest that peatland water-table reconstructions 317 318 should be converted to residuals or standardised values to avoid confusion with contemporary water-table data with true magnitudes (Fig. 6) (e.g. Swindles et al., 2013). 319 320 This enables researchers to present a useful index of change along a relative water-table gradient rather than present inaccurate absolute values. 321

322

There have been a number of recent studies examining the potential of testate amoebae as 323 management and restoration indicators in peatlands (Butler et al., 1996; Jauhiainen, 2002; 324 Davis and Wilkinson, 2004; Laggoun-Defarge et al., 2008; Turner and Swindles, 2012; 325 Valentine et al., 2013). To the best of our knowledge, testate amoebae reconstructions have 326 not yet been used in a management/restoration based study. While testate amoebae may 327 provide important ecological information about the state of peatlands, our results suggest 328 that testate amoebae-based reconstructions cannot currently be used to establish site 329 hydrological baselines needed to inform management and restoration policies. To achieve 330 such baselines, a new series of TA transfer functions based on high-quality hydrological data 331 332 are needed.

333

334 Clearly, TA-based transfer functions still offer valuable insights into past environmental changes by helping us identify shifts in environmental conditions as demonstrated by 335 numerous research outputs from several regions on Earth (e.g. Kokfelt et al., 2009; 336 Lamentowicz et al., 2008b; Sillasoo et al., 2007; Swindles et al., 2014; Turner et al., 2014). 337 338 However, we assert that the interpretation of water-table reconstructions should move away from reporting actual values in most cases and instead focus on directional shifts. Our work 339 340 highlights that testing transfer functions against independent instrumental data sets is 341 potentially more powerful than relying on statistical techniques alone.

342

### 343 Acknowledgements

Swindles and Holden conceived the idea, carried out the data analysis and wrote the paper.
Raby and Swindles carried out the testate amoebae analysis. Turner, Blundell and Charman
provided transfer function models used in the paper and commented on the paper. Menberu
and Kløve provided water-table data and moss samples from Finnish sites (Metsähallitus).
We thank Rob Low, Rob Rose, Richard Grayson and Gabriel Mason-Dixon for providing
unpublished data. Justin Lyons and Mike Bailey (Natural Resources Wales) are thanked for
providing access to and assisting with sample collection from Cors Fochno.

351

## 352 Figure captions

Fig 1. Percentage testate amoebae data from contemporary samples from (a) blanket 353 peatlands; (b) blanket peatlands with deep water tables; (c) a raised bog; (d) a high-latitude 354 peatland. The reconstructed water tables based on the England and European transfer 355 functions are illustrated. The 1-year (or summer in the case of the high-latitude peatland 356 which is frozen for part of the year) mean water-table data from the automated dipwells are 357 also shown. Refer to supplementary file 1 for the bootstrap errors on the reconstructions. 358 The plotting of these samples here in the style of 'pseudo-palaeo' records show that the 359 transfer functions are generally identifying direction changes in the profiles, but 360 361 demonstrates magnitudes are not reliable.

Fig 2. Boxplots of one-year annual monitored data from four samples from blanket peatlands
with very deep water tables (B20 – Loxely 5, B21 – Loxely 6, B22 – Oakner 7, B23 – Oakner
8). The testate-based water-table reconstructions (blue = Europe; pink = England) suggest
testate amoebae are de-coupled from water-table depth in these sites.

366

Fig 3. Scatterplots of model-predicted water-table depth (England and Europe transfer functions) against water-table statistics from the monitoring data (annual and summer mean, and median). The black diagonal lines represent a 1:1 relationship between the two variables, and the peatland types are differentiated by symbol colour.

371

**Fig 4.** Scatterplots of model-predicted water-table depth (using the (a) England and (b) Europe transfer functions) against annual mean water-table depth from the monitoring data for the three peatland types. Linear regression lines are shown (see Table 3 for the regression statistics). The black diagonal lines represent a 1:1 relationship between the two variables.

377

Fig 5. Maximum abundance of taxa in the calibration (modern) and fossil datasets for testing of analogue quality; (a, b) blanket peatlands; (c, d) raised bog and (e, f) high-latitude peatlands. Taxa with N2  $\leq$  5 are shown by filled red symbols. Abbreviated names are shown for problem taxa (see table 4 for full names). The black diagonal lines represent a 1:1 relationship between the modern and fossil data. Further interpretation is provided in Table 4.

384

**Fig 6.** Percentage testate amoebae data from a core from Moor House blanket peatland, Northern England. Chronological control is achieved through changes in spheroidal carbonaceous particle (SCP) concentration (cf. Swindles, 2010), and water-table depth has been reconstructed using the England model (Turner et al., 2013). Errors on the reconstruction were generated through 1000 bootstrap cycles. The red boxplot illustrates the 390 one-year annual monitored data from a monitoring location beside the coring location. The 391 water-table data is also shown as residual values – one of our recommendations for 392 presentation of water table reconstruction data. The results show a transition from near 393 surface to deeper water tables at the boundary of the little ice age (LIA) and current warm 394 period (CWP) at c. 1850.

395

Table 1. Site and sample details. The samples with codes in brackets were removed fromthe analysis as they had very deep water tables (see Fig. 2).

398

**Table 2.** Correlation statistics (Spearman's rank correlation). The number of samples included in the analysis are shown; B = blanket peatlands; R = raised bog; H = high-latitude peatlands. D represents the water-table level at a given percentage of the time. % values represent the percentage of the time WT within a given depth (in cm) of the peat surface. Significant correlations are given [\*\*p < 0.01 (red); \*p < 0.05 (orange)]. For further information refer to Supplementary file 1.

405

406 **Table 3.** Regression and correlation statistics (see Fig. 4).

407

**Table 4.** Modern analogue quality for the England and Europe transfer function models (refer also to Figure 5). Three different categories of analogue quality have been determined (in descending order of severity): 1) samples left of the 1:1 line with N2  $\leq$  5; 2) Samples left of the 1:1 line but with no N2 problem; 3) Samples right of the 1:1 line with N2  $\leq$  5. Taxon names with an asterisk (\*) have no modern analogue in the training set.

413

414 References

415 Acreman, M., Holden, J., 2013. How wetlands affect floods. Wetlands 33, 773-786.

Amesbury, M.J., Mallon, G., Charman, D.J., Hughes, P.D.M., Booth, R.K., Daley, T.J., Garneau, M., 2013. Statistical testing of a new testate amoeba-based transfer function for water-table depth reconstruction on ombrotrophic peatlands in north-eastern Canada and Maine, United States. J Quaternary Sci 28, 27-39.

Belyea, L.R., 1999. A novel indicator of reducing conditions and water-table depth in mires.
Funct Ecol 13, 431-434.

Belyea, L.R., 2007. Revealing the Emperor's new clothes: niche-based palaeoenvironmental
reconstruction in the light of recent ecological theory. Holocene 17, 683-688.

Bobrov, A.A., Charman, D.J., Warner, B.G., 1999. Ecology of testate amoebae (Protozoa :

Rhizopoda) on peatlands in western Russia with special attention to niche separation inclosely related taxa. Protist 150, 125-136.

Booth, R.K., 2002. Testate amoebae as paleoindicators of surface-moisture changes on
Michigan peatlands: modern ecology and hydrological calibration. J Paleolimnol 28, 329348.

Booth, R.K., 2008. Testate amoebae as proxies for mean annual waiter-table depth in
Sphagnum-dominated peatlands of North America. J Quaternary Sci 23, 43-57.

Booth, R.K., Hotchkiss, S.C., Wilcox, D.A., 2005. Discoloration of polyvinyl chloride (PVC)
tape as a proxy for water-table depth in peatlands: validation and assessment of seasonal
variability. Funct Ecol 19, 1040-1047.

Booth, R.K., Lamentowicz, M., Charman, D.J., 2010. Preparation and analysis of testate
amoebae in peatland paleoenvironmental studies. Mires and Peat 7, 1-7.

Booth, R.K., Sullivan, M.E., Sousa, V.A., 2008. Ecology of testate amoebae in a North
Carolina pocosin and their potential use as environmental and paleoenvironmental
indicators. Ecoscience 15, 277-289.

- Brooks, S.J., Birks, H.J.B., 2000. Chironomid-inferred late-glacial and early-Holocene mean
  July air temperatures for Krakenes Lake, western Norway. J Paleolimnol 23, 77-89.
- Buttler, A., Warner, B.G., Grosvernier, P., Matthey, Y., 1996. Vertical patterns of testate
  amoebae (Protozoa: Rhizopoda) and peat forming vegetation on cutover bogs in the Jura,
  Switzerland. New Phytologist 134,371-382.
- Cash, J., Hopkinson, J., 1905. The British Freshwater Rhizopoda and Heliozoa, Volume I:
  Rhizopoda, Part I. Ray Society, London.
- Cash, J., Hopkinson, J., 1909. The British Freshwater Rhizopoda and Heliozoa, Volume II:
  Rhizopoda, Part II. Ray Society, London.
- Cash, J., Wailes, G.H., Hopkinson, J., 1915. The British Freshwater Rhizopoda and
  Heliozoa, Volume III: Rhizopoda, Part III. Ray Society, London.
- Charman, D.J., Barber, K.E., Blaauw, M., Langdon, P.G., Mauquoy, D., Daley, T.J., Hughes,
  P.D.M., Karofeld, E., 2009. Climate drivers for peatland palaeoclimate records. Quaternary
  Sci Rev 28, 1811-1819.
- Charman, D.J., Beilman, D.W., Blaauw, M., Booth, R.K., Brewer, S., Chambers, F.M., 454 Christen, J.A., Gallego-Sala, A., Harrison, S.P., Hughes, P.D.M., Jackson, S.T., Korhola, A., 455 Mauquoy, D., Mitchell, F.J.G., Prentice, I.C., van der Linden, M., De Vleeschouwer, F., Yu, 456 Z.C., Alm, J., Bauer, I.E., Corish, Y.M.C., Garneau, M., Hohl, V., Huang, Y., Karofeld, E., Le 457 Roux, G., Loisel, J., Moschen, R., Nichols, J.E., Nieminen, T.M., MacDonald, G.M., 458 Phadtare, N.R., Rausch, N., Sillasoo, U., Swindles, G.T., Tuittila, E.S., Ukonmaanaho, L., 459 Valiranta, M., van Bellen, S., van Geel, B., Vitt, D.H., Zhao, Y., 2013. Climate-related 460 changes in peatland carbon accumulation during the last millennium. Biogeosciences 10, 461 929-944. 462

- Charman, D.J., Blundell, A., Accrotelm-members, 2007. A new European testate amoebae
  transfer function for palaeohydrological reconstruction on ombrotrophic peatlands. J
  Quaternary Sci 22, 209-221.
- Charman, D.J., Hendon, D., Woodland, W.A., 2000. The identification of testate amoebae
  (Protozoa: Rhizopoda) in peats. Quaternary Research Association, Oxford.
- Charman, D.J., Warner, B.G., 1992. Relationship between Testate Amebas (Protozoa,
  Rhizopoda) and Microenvironmental Parameters on a Forested Peatland in Northeastern
  Ontario. Can J Zool 70, 2474-2482.
- 471 Corbet, S.A., 1973. An illustrated introduction to the testate rhizopods in Sphagnum, with 472 special reference to the area around Malham Tarn, Yorkshire. Field Studies 3 801–838.
- 473 Cunliffe, A., Baird, A.J., Holden, J., 2013. Hydrological hotspots in peatlands: spatial
  474 variability in hydraulic conductivity around natural soil pipes. Water Resour Res 49, 5342475 5354
- Davis, S.R., Wilkinson, D.M., 2004. The conservation management value of testate
  amoebae as 'restoration' indicators: speculations based on two damaged raised mires in
  northwest England. Holocene 14, 135-143.
- De Vleeschouwer, F., Chambers, F.M., Swindles, G.T., 2010. Coring and sub-sampling of
  peatlands for palaeoenvironmental research. Mires and Peat 7, 1-10.
- 481 Deflandre, G., 1936. Étude monographique sur le genre Nebela Leidy (Rhizopoda 482 Testacea) (Monograph on the genus Nebela Leidy (Rhizopoda Testacea)). Annales de
  483 Protistologie 5, 201–286.
- Evans, M.G., Burt, T.P., Holden, J., Adamson, J., 1999. Runoff generation and water table
  fluctuations in blanket peat: evidence from UK data spanning the dry summer of 1995. J
  Hydrol 221, 141-160.

- Fritz, S.C., Juggins, S., Battarbee, R.W., Engstrom, D.R., 1991. Reconstruction of Past
  Changes in Salinity and Climate Using a Diatom-Based Transfer-Function. Nature 352, 706708.
- Frolking, S., Roulet, N., Fuglestvedt, J., 2006. How northern peatlands influence the Earth's
  radiative budget: Sustained methane emission versus sustained carbon sequestration. J
  Geophys Res-Biogeo 111.
- Gasse, F., Juggins, S., Khelifa, L.B., 1995. Diatom-Based Transfer-Functions for Inferring
  Past Hydrochemical Characteristics of African Lakes. Palaeogeogr Palaeocl 117, 31-54.
- 495 Grospietsch, T., 1958. Wechseltierchen (Rhizopoden). Kosmos, Stuttgart.
- Hoag, R.S., Price, J.S., 1997 The effects of matrix diffusion on solute transport and
  retardation in undisturbed peat in laboratory columns. Journal of Contaminant Hydrology 28,
  193–205.
- Holden, J., Burt, T.P., 2003a. Hydraulic conductivity in upland blanket peat; measurementand variability. Hydrol Process 17, 1227-1237.
- Holden, J., Burt, T.P., 2003b. Runoff production in blanket peat covered catchments. Water
  Resour Res 39, 1191.
- Holden, J., Wallage, Z.E., Lane, S.N., McDonald, A.T., 2011. Water table dynamics in
  drained and restored blanket peat. J Hydrol 402, 103-114.
- Imbrie, J., Kipp, N.G., 1971. A new micropaleontological method for quantitative
  paleoclimatology: Application to a Late Pleistocene Caribbean core, In: Turekian, K. (Ed.),
  The Late Cenozoic Glacial Ages. Yale University Press, New Haven, Connecticut, pp. 71181.

- Jassey, V.E., Chiapusio, G., Mitchell, E.A., Binet, P., Toussaint, M.L., Gilbert, D., 2011. Finescale horizontal and vertical micro-distribution patterns of testate amoebae along a narrow
  Fen/Bog gradient. Microbial ecology 61, 374-385.
- 512 Jauhiainen S., 2002. Testate amoebae in different types of mire fllowing drainage and 513 subsequent restoration. European Journal of Protistology 38, 59-72.
- Juggins, S., 2013. Quantitative reconstructions in palaeolimnology: new paradigm or sick
  science? Quaternary Sci Rev 64, 20-32.
- 516 Kokfelt, U., Rosen, P., Schoning, K., Christensen, T.R., Forster, J., Karlsson, J., Reuss, N.,
- 517 Rundgren, M., Callaghan, T.V., Jonasson, C., Hammarlund, D., 2009. Ecosystem responses
- 518 to increased precipitation and permafrost decay in subarctic Sweden inferred from peat and
- 519 lake sediments. Global Change Biol 15, 1652-1663.
- Laggoun-Defarge, F., Mitchell, E., Gilbert, D., Disnar, J.R., Comont, L., Warner, B.G.,
  Buttler, A., 2008. Cut-over peatland regeneration assessment using organic matter and
  microbial indicators (bacteria and testate amoebae). J Appl Ecol 45, 716-727.
- Lamarre, A., Magnan, G., Garneau, M., Boucher, E., 2013. A testate amoeba-based transfer function for paleohydrological reconstruction from boreal and subarctic peatlands in northeastern Canada. Quatern Int 306, 88-96.
- Lamentowicz, L., Lamentowicz, M., Gabka, M., 2008a. Testate amoebae ecology and a local
  transfer function from a peatland in western Poland. Wetlands 28, 164-175.
- Lamentowicz, M., Cedro, A., Galka, M., Goslar, T., Miotk-Szpiganowicz, G., Mitchell, E.A.D.,
  Pawlyta, J., 2008b. Last millennium palaeoenvironmental changes from a Baltic bog
  (Poland) inferred from stable isotopes, pollen, plant macrofossils and testate amoebae.
  Palaeogeogr Palaeocl 265, 93-106.

Leidy, J., 1879. Fresh-Water Rhizopods of North America. Government Printing Office,Washington.

Loisel, J., Garneau, M., 2010. Late Holocene paleoecohydrology and carbon accumulation estimates from two boreal peat bogs in eastern Canada: Potential and limits of multi-proxy archives. Palaeogeogr Palaeocl 291, 493-533.

Marcisz, K., Fournier, B., Gilbert, D., Lamentowicz, M., Mitchell, E.A.D., 2014. Response of
Sphagnum Peatland Testate Amoebae to a 1-Year Transplantation Experiment Along an
Artificial Hydrological Gradient. Microbial ecology 67, 810-818.

540 Markel, E.R., Booth, R.K., Qin, Y.M., 2010. Testate amoebae and delta C-13 of Sphagnum 541 as surface-moisture proxies in Alaskan peatlands. Holocene 20, 463-475.

542 Mauquoy, D., Yeloff, D., Van Geel, B., Charman, D.J., Blundell, A., 2008. Two decadally 543 resolved records from north-west European peat bogs show rapid climate changes 544 associated with solar variability during the mid-late Holocene. J Quaternary Sci 23, 745-763.

Meisterfeld, R., 2001a. Order Arcellinida, Kent 1880, In: Lee, J.J., Leedale, G.F., Bradbury,
P. (Eds.), The Illustrated Guide to the Protozoa. Allen Press, Lawrence, Kansas pp. 827–
860.

Meisterfeld, R., 2001b. Testate amoebae with filopoda, In: Lee, J.J., Leedale, G.F., Bradbury, P. (Eds.), The Illustrated Guide to the Protozoa. Allen Press, Lawrence, Kansas, pp. 1054–1084.

Ogden, C.G., Hedley, R.H., 1980. An Atlas of Freshwater Testate Amoebae. British Museum
of Natural History and Oxford University Press, London and Oxford.

Payne, R.J., Kishaba, K., Blackford, J.J., Mitchell, E.A.D., 2006. Ecology of testate amoebae
(Protista) in south-central Alaska peatlands: building transfer-function models for
palaeoenvironmental studies. Holocene 16, 403-414.

- Payne, R.J., Telford, R.J., Blackford, J.J., Blundell, A., Booth, R.K., Charman, D.J.,
  Lamentowicz, L., Lamentowicz, M., Mitchell, E.A.D., Potts, G., Swindles, G.T., Warner, B.G.,
  Woodland, W., 2012. Testing peatland testate amoeba transfer functions: Appropriate
  methods for clustered training-sets. Holocene 22, 819-825.
- 560 Penard, E., 1902. Faune Rhizopodique du Bassin du Leman. H. Kündig, Geneva.
- 561 Price, J.S., 1992. Blanket Bog in Newfoundland 2. Hydrological Processes. J Hydrol 135,
  562 103-119.
- 563 R-Core-Team, 2014. R: A language and environment for statistical computing. R Foundation
- for Statistical Computing, Vienna, Austria. ISBN 3-900051-07-0. <u>http://www.R-project.org/</u>.
- 565 Schnitchen, C., Charman, D.J., Magyari, E., Braun, M., Grigorszky, I., Tothmeresz, B.,
- Molnar, M., Szanto, Z., 2006. Reconstructing hydrological variability from testate amoebae
  analysis in Carpathian peatlands. J Paleolimnol 36, 1-17.
- Sillasoo, U., Mauquoy, D., Blundell, A., Charman, D., Blaauw, M., Daniell, J.R.G., Toms, P.,
  Newberry, J., Chambers, F.M., Karofeld, E., 2007. Peat multi-proxy data from Mannikjarve
  bog as indicators of late Holocene climate changes in Estonia. Boreas 36, 20-37.
- Sullivan, M.E., Booth, R.K., 2011. The potential influence of short-term environmental
  variability on the composition of testate amoeba communities in Sphagnum peatlands.
  Microbial ecology 62, 80-93.
- 574 Swindles, G.T., 2010. Dating recent peat profiles using spheroidal carbonaceous particles 575 (SCPs). Mires and Peat 7, 10 pp.
- 576 Swindles, G.T., Blundell, A., Roe, H.M., Hall, V.A., 2010. A 4500-year proxy climate record 577 from peatlands in the North of Ireland: the identification of widespread summer 'drought 578 phases'? Quaternary Sci Rev 29, 1577-1589.

- 579 Swindles, G.T., Charman, D.J., Roe, H.M., Sansum, P.A., 2009. Environmental controls on 580 peatland testate amoebae (Protozoa: Rhizopoda) in the North of Ireland: Implications for 581 Holocene palaeoclimate studies. J Paleolimnol 42, 123-140.
- Swindles, G.T., Lawson, I.T., Matthews, I.P., Blaauw, M., Daley, T.J., Charman, D.J.,
  Roland, T.P., Plunkett, G., Schettler, G., Gearey, B.R., Turner, T.E., Rea, H.A., Roe, H.M.,
  Amesbury, M.J., Chambers, F.M., Holmes, J., Mitchell, F.J.G., Blackford, J., Blundell, A.,
  Branch, N., Holmes, J., Langdon, P., McCarroll, J., McDermott, F., Oksanen, P.O., Pritchard,
  O., Stastney, P., Stefanini, B., Young, D., Wheeler, J., Becker, K., Armit, I., 2013.
  Centennial-scale climate change in Ireland during the Holocene. Earth-Sci Rev 126, 300320.
- 589 Swindles, G.T., Morris, P.J., Baird, A.J., Blaauw, M., Plunkett, G., 2012. Ecohydrological 590 feedbacks confound peat-based climate reconstructions. Geophys Res Lett 39.
- Swindles, G.T., Reczuga, M., Lamentowicz, M., Raby, C.L., Turner, T.E., Charman, D.J.,
  Gallego-Sala, A., Valderrama, E., Williams, C., Draper, F., Coronado, E.N.H., Roucoux,
  K.H., Baker, T., Mullan, D.J., 2014. Ecology of Testate Amoebae in an Amazonian Peatland
  and Development of a Transfer Function for Palaeohydrological Reconstruction. Microbial
  ecology 68, 284-298.
- 596Telford, R.J., 2013. palaeoSig: Significance Tests of Quantitative Palaeoenvironmental597Reconstructions.Rpackageversion1.1-2.<a href="http://cran.r-">http://cran.r-</a>598project.org/web/packages/palaeoSig/index.html.
- Telford, R.J., Birks, H.J.B., 2005. The secret assumption of transfer functions: problems with
  spatial autocorrelation in evaluating model performance. Quaternary Sci Rev 24, 2173-2179.
- Telford, R.J., Birks, H.J.B., 2009. Evaluation of transfer functions in spatially structured
  environments. Quaternary Sci Rev 28, 1309-1316.

- Telford, R.J., Birks, H.J.B., 2011. Effect of uneven sampling along an environmental gradient
  on transfer-function performance. J Paleolimnol 46, 99-106.
- Tolonen, K., Warner, B.G., Vasander, H., 1992. Ecology of Testaceans (Protozoa,
  Rhizopoda) in Mires in Southern Finland .1. Autecology. Arch Protistenkd 142, 119-138.
- Tolonen, K., Warner, B.G., Vasander, H., 1994. Ecology of Testaceans (Protozoa,
  Rhizopoda) in Mires in Southern Finland .2. Multivariate-Analysis. Arch Protistenkd 144, 97112.
- Turner, T.E., Swindles, G.T., 2012. Ecology of Testate Amoebae in Moorland with a
  Complex Fire History: Implications for Ecosystem Monitoring and Sustainable Land
  Management. Protist 163, 844-855.
- Turner, T.E., Swindles, G.T., Charman, D.J., Blundell, A., 2013. Comparing regional and
  supra-regional transfer functions for palaeohydrological reconstruction from Holocene
  peatlands. Palaeogeogr Palaeocl 369, 395-408.
- Turner, T.E., Swindles, G.T., Roucoux, K.H., 2014. Late Holocene ecohydrological and
  carbon dynamics of a UK raised bog: impact of human activity and climate change.
  Quaternary Sci Rev 84, 65-85.
- Valentine, J., Davis, S.R., Kirby, J.R., Wilkinson, D.M., 2013. The Use of Testate Amoebae
  in Monitoring Peatland Restoration Management: Case Studies from North West England
  and Ireland. Acta Protozool 52, 129-145.
- van Bellen, S., Garneau, M., Booth, R.K., 2011. Holocene carbon accumulation rates from
  three ombrotrophic peatlands in boreal Quebec, Canada: Impact of climate-driven
  ecohydrological change. Holocene 21, 1217-1231.
- Van Bellen, S., Mauquoy, D., Payne, R.J., Roland, T.P., Daley, T.J., Hughes, P.D.M.,
  Loader, N.J., Street-Perrott, F.A., Rice, E.M., Pancotto, V.A., 2014. Testate amoebae as a

627	proxy for reconstructing Holocene water table dynamics in southern Patagonian peat bogs. J
628	Quaternary Sci 29, 463-474.

629	Velle, G., Telford, R.J., Heiri, O., Kurek, J., Birks, H.J.B., 2012. Testing intra-site transfer
630	functions: an example using chironomids and water depth. J Paleolimnol 48, 545-558.
631	Woodland, W.A., 1996. Holocene palaeohydrology from testate amoebae analysis :
632	developing a model for British peatlands. [electronic resource]. University of Plymouth.
633	Woodland, W.A., Charman, D.J., Sims, P.C., 1998. Quantitative estimates of water tables
634	and soil moisture in Holocene peatlands from testate amoebae. Holocene 8, 261-273.

Yu, Z., Loisel, J., Brosseau, D.P., Beilman, D.W., Hunt, S.J., 2010. Global peatland
dynamics since the Last Glacial Maximum. Geophys Res Lett 37, L13402.

637

638

Site	Number of automated dipwells	Codes	Туре	Location (decimal degrees)
Keighley Moor (England)	2	B1-2	Blanket peatland	53.850°, -2.034°
Longwood (England)	1	B3	Blanket peatland	53.569°, -1.919°
Loxely (England)	6	B4-7 (B20-21)	Blanket peatland	53.420°, -1.678°
Moor House (England)	4	B8-11	Blanket peatland	54.679°, -2.430°
Oakner (England)	8	B12-17 (B22-23)	Blanket peatland	53.599°, -1.972°
Oxenhope (England)	2	B18-19	Blanket peatland	53.791°, -1.970°
Cors Fochno (Wales)	11	R1-11	Raised bog	52.501°, -4.011°
Röyvänsuo (Finland)	1	F1	Sedge fen	65.820°, 27.804°
Marjasuo (Finland)	1	F2	Sedge fen	65.805°, 27.812°
Helvetinjärvi V (Finland)	1	F3	Sedge fen	61.996°, 23.942°
Helvetinjärvi II (Finland)	1	F4	Sedge bog	61.998°, 23.880°
Susimäki (Finland)	1	F5	Vaccinium bog	61.857°, 24.237°

	Europe	England				Europe	England		
	reconstruction	reconstruction				reconstruction	reconstruction		
	(WA.tol.inv)	(WA.tol.inv)	n	Samples		(WA.tol.inv)	(WA.tol.inv)	n	Samples
Inter-model comparisons									
Turner	.804**	1.000	35	All	1				
Annual 1 yr					Annual 3 year				
Mean	.507**	.768**	30	B+R	Mean	0.335	.637**	18	7B+R
Median	.566**	.798**	30	B+R	Median	0.387	.711**	18	7B+R
Max	0.174	.415*	30	B+R	Max	0.212	0.404	18	7B+R
Min	.544**	.767**	30	B+R	Min	0.100	.501*	18	7B+R
Range	-0.205	-0.130	30	B+R	Range	0.325	0.302	18	7B+R
D95	.567**	.785**	30	B+R	D95	0.325	.600**	18	7B+R
D90	.552**	.782**	30	B+R	D90	0.309	.612**	18	7B+R
D75	.551**	.796**	30	B+R	D75	0.337	.645**	18	7B+R
D50	.566**	.798**	30	B+R	D50	0.387	.711**	18	7B+R
D25	.454*	.705**	30	B+R	D25	0.401	.701**	18	7B+R
D10	.384*	.607**	30	B+R	D10	0.354	.550*	18	7B+R
D5	.366*	.591**	30	B+R	D5	0.255	.480*	18	7B+R
IQR	0.030	0.154	30	B+R	IQR	0.118	0.192	18	7B+R
%surface	405*	713**	30	B+R	%surface	-0.268	533*	18	7B+R
%10	523**	757**	30	B+R	%10	-0.434	697**	18	7B+R
%20	423*	661**	30	B+R	%20	-0.334	-0.448	18	7B+R
%30	-0.156	415*	30	B+R	%30	-0.086	-0.346	18	7B+R
%40	-0.109	-0.198	30	B+R	%40	-0.095	-0.254	18	7B+R
%50	-0.157	-0.100	30	B+R	%50	-0.068	-0.167	18	7B+R
Summer 1 year					Summer 3 year				
Mean	.526**	.667**	35	All	Mean	0.369	.493*	23	7B+R+H
Median	.519**	.658**	35	All	Median	0.411	.535**	23	7B+R+H
Max	0.332	.518**	35	All	Max	0.196	0.294	23	7B+R+H
Min	.534**	.654**	35	All	Min	0.187	.518*	23	7B+R+H
Range	0.041	0.091	35	All	Range	0.212	0.163	23	7B+R+H
D95	.598**	.696**	35	All	D95	0.372	.587**	23	7B+R+H
D90	.577**	.693**	35	All	D90	0.335	.544**	23	7B+R+H
D75	.538**	.671**	35	All	D75	0.364	.514*	23	7B+R+H
D50	.519**	.658**	35	All	D50	0.411	.535**	23	7B+R+H
D25	.439**	.594**	35	All	D25	0.358	.432*	23	7B+R+H
D10	.450**	.617**	35	All	D10	0.264	0.386	23	7B+R+H
D5	.449**	.622**	35	All	D5	0.233	0.352	23	7B+R+H
IQR	-0.082	0.060	35	All	IQR	-0.045	0.008	23	7B+R+H
%surface	-0.293	414*	35	All	%surface	-0.143	-0.355	23	7B+R+H
%10	600**	704**	35	All	%10	477*	566**	23	7B+R+H
%20	518**	652**	35	All	%20	-0.274	-0.323	23	7B+R+H
%30	-0.209	449**	35	All	%30	-0.099	-0.226	23	7B+R+H
%40	-0.179	-0.268	35	All	%40	-0.050	-0.120	23	7B+R+H
%50	0.068	0.136	35	All	%50	-0.188	-0.262	23	7B+R+H

Test data	Model	Slope (a)	Intercept (b)	n	R <sup>2</sup>	r <sub>s</sub>	<i>p</i> -value
All	England	0.59	7.95	35	0.29	0.77	<i>p</i> < 0.01
All	Europe	0.31	11.08	35	0.22	0.51	<i>p</i> < 0.01
Blanket	England	0.54	10.11	19	0.68	0.74	<i>p</i> < 0.01
Blanket	Europe	0.37	9.72	19	0.40	0.61	<i>р</i> < 0.01
Raised	England	1.84	0.95	11	0.72	0.85	<i>p</i> < 0.01
Raised	Europe	0.75	10.22	11	0.42	0.58	<i>p</i> = 0.06
High-latitude	England	0.20	-0.60	5	0.50	0.90	<i>p</i> < 0.05
High-latitude	Europe	0.31	5.29	5	0.43	0.70	<i>p</i> = 0.23

	England	Europe					
Blanket							
(1) Poorest/Missing analogue N2≤5	Difflugia pulex Pseudodifflugia fulva type Sphenoderia lenta	Difflugia bacillifera Difflugia lucida type Euglypha ciliata* Hyalosphenia ovalis* Nebela collaris Sphenoderia lenta*					
(2) Poor analogue N2>5	Cryptodifflugia oviformis Difflugia pristis type Euglypha tuberculata type Nebela collaris	Euglypha tuberculata Heleopera petricola Nebela tincta					
(3) Reasonable analogue, but N2≤5	Hyalosphenia subflava Nebela carinata Physochila griseola type	Centropyxis cassis type Cryptodifflugia oviformis					
Raised							
(1) Poorest/Missing analogue N2≤5	Hyalosphenia elegans	Sphenoderia lenta*					
(2) Poor analogue N2>5	Assulina seminulum Cryptodifflugia oviformis Euglypha rotunda type Nebela flabellulum	Euglypha rotunda type Heleopera petricola Heleopera rosea Nebela flabellulum					
(3) Reasonable	-	Centropyxis cassis					
analogue, but N2≤5		Cryptodifflugia oviformis					
High Latitude	High Latitude						
(1) Poorest/Missing analogue N2≤5	-	Arcella catinus type Difflugia globulosa* Placocista spinosa type*					
(2) Poor analogue N2>5	Hyalosphenia papilio	Hyalosphenia papilio					
(3) Reasonable analogue, but N2≤5	Hyalosphenia elegans	-					















Supplementary Data 1 Click here to download Supplementary Data: Supplementarydata1\_OK.xlsx