



Rapid report

Direct nitrogen, phosphorus and carbon exchanges between Mucoromycotina 'fine root endophyte' fungi and a flowering plant in novel monoxenic cultures

Authors for correspondence: Silvia Pressel Email: s.pressel@nhm.ac.uk

Katie Field Email: k.j.field@sheffield.ac.uk

Received: 9 June 2022 Accepted: 15 November 2022 Grace A. Hoysted¹ (D), Katie J. Field¹ (D), Besiana Sinanaj¹ (D), Christopher A. Bell² (D), Martin I. Bidartondo^{3,4} (D) and Silvia Pressel⁵ (D)

¹Plants, Photosynthesis and Soil, School of Bioscience, University of Sheffield, Sheffield, S10 2TN, UK; ²Centre for Plant Sciences, University of Leeds, Leeds, LS2 9JT, UK; ³Department of Life Sciences, Imperial College London, London, SW7 2AZ, UK; ⁴Department of Ecosystem Stewardship, Royal Botanic Gardens, Kew, Richmond, TW9 3DS, UK; ⁵Department of Life Sciences, Natural History Museum, London, SW7 5BD, UK

New Phytologist (2023) 238: 70-79 doi: 10.1111/nph.18630

Key words: arbuscular mycorrhizal fungi, carbon, clover, fine root endophytes, flowering plants, Mucoromycotina, soil nutrients, symbiosis.

Summary

· Most plants form mycorrhizal associations with mutualistic soil fungi. Through these partnerships, resources are exchanged including photosynthetically fixed carbon for fungalacquired nutrients. Recently, it was shown that the diversity of associated fungi is greater than previously assumed, extending to Mucoromycotina fungi. These Mucoromycotina 'fine root endophytes' (MFRE) are widespread and generally co-colonise plant roots together with Glomeromycotina 'coarse' arbuscular mycorrhizal fungi (AMF). Until now, this co-occurrence has hindered the determination of the direct function of MFRE symbiosis.

• To overcome this major barrier, we developed new techniques for fungal isolation and culture and established the first monoxenic *in vitro* cultures of MFRE colonising a flowering plant, clover. Using radio- and stable-isotope tracers in these *in vitro* systems, we measured the transfer of ³³P, ¹⁵N and ¹⁴C between MFRE hyphae and the host plant.

 Our results provide the first unequivocal evidence that MFRE fungi are nutritional mutualists with a flowering plant by showing that clover gained both ¹⁵N and ³³P tracers directly from fungus in exchange for plant-fixed C in the absence of other micro-organisms.

• Our findings and methods pave the way for a new era in mycorrhizal research, firmly establishing MFRE as both mycorrhizal and functionally important in terrestrial ecosystems.

Introduction

Among Earth's most important symbioses are the ancient plantfungus partnerships known as mycorrhizas, or 'mycorrhiza-like' associations in plants without roots (Read et al., 2000). These mutualisms, underpinned by the bidirectional exchange of plantfixed carbon for fungal-acquired mineral nutrients (Raven & Allen, 2003), were instrumental in plant terrestrialisation > 500 million years ago (Morris *et al.*, 2018) by facilitating early, rootless plant access to mineral nutrients held within primeval soils (Pirozynski & Malloch, 1975; Field et al., 2015a). Thus, fungi played a formative role in the development of Earth's terrestrial ecosystems and climate through their contributions to global carbon and nutrient cycles (Taylor et al., 2011; Mills et al., 2018). Today, these associations are formed between most land plants and a diverse subset of soil fungi (Field & Pressel, 2018), including the widespread arbuscular mycorrhizal fungi (AMF) in the subphylum Glomeromycotina (Brundrett & Tedersoo, 2018), estimated to occur in > 70% of plants (Smith & Read, 2008).

Until recently, AMF encompassed the globally distributed 'fine root endophytes' (FRE; Glomus tenue, Thippayrugs et al., 1999), which are known to colonise several vascular plant families (Ali, 1969; Abbott, 1982; Thippayrugs et al., 1999), but have been largely overlooked due to practical limitations in molecular detection and inability to study them apart from coexisting AMF (Orchard et al., 2017a). Through improved molecular detection and identification (Bidartondo et al., 2011), it is now clear that FRE are distinct from Glomeromycotina AMF, belonging instead to the Endogonales in the subphylum Mucoromycotina (Orchard et al., 2017a), and recently renamed Planticonsortium tenue (Walker et al., 2018). Thus, FRE previously reported in flowering plants (Ali, 1969; Abbott, 1982; Thippayrugs et al., 1999) are likely

© 2022 The Authors

closely related to Endogonales fungal associates previously identified (Bidartondo *et al.*, 2011; Rimington *et al.*, 2015; Hoysted *et al.*, 2018, 2019) and shown to be mutualistic in terms of carbonfor-nutrient exchange in a range of nonflowering plants, albeit using nonsterile, soil-based experimental systems (Field *et al.*, 2015b, 2016, 2019; Hoysted *et al.*, 2019, 2020).

Colonisation by FRE is, like AMF, generally characterised by the presence of arbuscules and arbuscule-like structures (Orchard et al., 2017b), while the small diameter of FRE hyphae (< 1.5 μ m), with small swellings and 'fan-like' morphologies, is considered a distinctive trait that separates them from AMF (or 'coarse root endophytes') which consistently develop wider (> $3 \mu m$ in diameter) hyphae and larger vesicles (Orchard et al., 2017a). Morphological plasticity has been noted in transmission and scanning electron micrographs of the ultrastructure of Mucoromycotina FRE (MFRE) exclusively associating with liverworts (Field et al., 2015b, 2016) and a vascular plant (Hoysted et al., 2019). Most recently, cryo-SEM has confirmed uniformly thin hyphae and hyphal 'ropes' as potential diagnostic features of MFRE symbioses (Albornoz et al., 2020). Differently from the strictly biotrophic AMF, MFRE are considered facultative saprotrophs as it has been possible to isolate them from host plants - both a nonvascular (Field et al., 2015b) and vascular plant (as shown herein) - and to grow them axenically, that is without a host in culture.

Latest research indicates that MFRE play a nutritionally complementary role to AMF by facilitating plant nitrogen (N) assimilation alongside AMF-facilitated plant phosphorus (P) acquisition through co-colonisation of the same host (Field et al., 2019). Such functional complementarity is further supported by the observation that MFRE transfer significant amounts of ¹⁵N but relatively little ³³P isotope tracers to a host lycophyte in the first experimental demonstration of MFRE nutritional mutualism with a vascular plant (Hoysted et al., 2019). The apparent ability of MFRE, but not AMF, to transfer N also from organic sources to host liverworts in nonsterile soil (Field et al., 2019) together with their presumed facultative saprotrophic nature points to possible functional similarities with ectomycorrhizal fungi, an assumption in line with results from a recent network analysis of symbiotic fungal associations in liverworts (Rimington et al., 2019). However, evidence for the precise role of MFRE, in the absence of other soil micro-organisms, remains equivocal.

To date, detailed research into plant–MFRE associations has been constrained by a lack of *in vitro* experimental systems that allow indisputable determination of the direct function of the MFRE symbiosis in isolation. Our recent knowledge of MFRE function has been derived largely from experiments using wild soilbased systems and wild-collected plants that naturally only associate with MFRE (Field *et al.*, 2015b, 2016, 2019; Hoysted *et al.*, 2019, 2020), or from soil culture-based experimental pots (Orchard *et al.*, 2017a; Albornoz *et al.*, 2020). Each of these methods has significantly enhanced our understanding of MFRE form and function, shedding new light on the importance of MFRE associations in nature, and remains useful in the studies of plants associating with mixed microbial communities.

However, the development of *in vitro* experimental systems capable of distinguishing between fungal symbionts in the absence of

other soil biota is now critical for the functional significance of MFRE associations to be fully defined (Sinanaj et al., 2021). This is particularly important as evidence is increasingly pointing towards most plants forming simultaneous symbioses with AMF and MFRE (Field et al., 2015a,b, 2016; Hoysted et al., 2019, 2020) and there being complementarity in function between symbionts (Field et al., 2019; Hoysted et al., 2019). Recently, it was reported that a free-living Mucoromycotina, Gongronella sp. W5, utilises plant sucrose as a carbon source (Wang et al., 2021); however, data showing mutualistic transfer of carbon-for-nutrients between MFRE and a plant host in the absence of other micro-organisms do not currently exist. The development of an in vitro experimental system is critical to achieve this and further understand function, development and signalling and to identify specific symbiotic structures and interfaces in MFRE, particularly for comparisons with model AM symbioses. Here, we resolve this research challenge by establishing experimentally tractable, monoxenic symbiotic cultures of MFRE and white clover (Trifolium repens), a flowering plant genus used in other recent studies of MFRE colonisation (e.g. Orchard et al., 2017a; Albornoz et al., 2020), albeit in nonsterile systems. Using radio- and stable-isotope tracers in our in vitro systems, we measured the transfer of ³³P, ¹⁵N and ¹⁴C between MFRE hyphae and the host plant to provide the first unequivocal evidence of mutualistic transfer of MFRE-assimilated nutrients for plant-fixed carbon with a flowering plant, in the absence of other microbes.

Materials and Methods

Isolation of MFRE symbionts

Lycopodiella inundata (L.) Holub gametophytes and young sporophytes (with protocorms; Hoysted *et al.*, 2019) were collected from Thursley Nature Reserve, Surrey, UK (SE 90081 39754) in September 2019 and processed immediately for fungal isolation or stored in their natural substrate in growth chambers at 20° C : 15° C day : night temperatures and a 16-h day length, 225 µmol photons m⁻² s⁻¹, for molecular analyses.

Gametophytes and young sporophytes were carefully cleaned of adhering substratum; rhizoids and (for sporophytes) leaves were removed before thorough rinsing in dH₂O by gentle shaking for 1 h, followed by surface-sterilisation for 1 min in 0.5% sodium hypochlorite. Sterile gametophytes were kept intact or halved, while the sporophytic protocorms were cut into *c*. 0.5-mm sections, placed onto fungal growth medium under sterile conditions and incubated in the dark at 27°C. The fungal medium was the same as that developed by Field *et al.* (2015b) except for a lower concentration of thiamine (thiamine HCl, 100 µg). Once fungal outgrowth from plant fragments became visible (1–2 wk), hyphae were subcultured onto the same medium used for isolation and kept in the dark at 27°C (Fig. 1a–c).

Molecular identification of fungal symbionts

Molecular analyses of fungal symbionts of *Lycopodiella* were carried out within 1 wk of collection (Rimington *et al.*, 2015). Extraction and sequencing of DNA were performed using the method of Bidartondo



et al. (2011). The universal fungal 18S primer combination NS1 (White *et al.*, 1990) and EF3 (Smit *et al.*, 1999) was used to amplify DNA which was cloned (Topota; Invitrogen) and sequenced using an Applied Biosystems Genetic Analyser 3730 (Waltham, MA, USA). Between four and eight clones were sequenced for each of eight samples and identified using NCBI BLAST (Altschul *et al.*, 1997). Sequence editing and assembly were performed in GENEIOUS v.5.6 (http://geneious.com). The alignment algorithms of MUSCLE were used within MEGA v.5.1 (Tamura *et al.*, 2013), with reference sequences from GenBank. Using UCHIME (Edgar *et al.*, 2011) within MOTHUR (http://www.mothur.org), confirmed sequences were not chimeric. Evolutionary models were tested in MEGA. Bayesian inference was carried out using MRBAYES (Huelsenbeck & Ronquist, 2001) and FIGTREE v.1.4 (http://tree.bio.ed.ac.uk) for

Fig. 1 In vitro isolation of Mucoromycotina fine root endophytes (MFRE) from Lycopodiella inundata (a-c) and colonisation of white clover (Trifolium repens) by isolated MFRE (d-i). (a) L. inundata gametophyte (*) with copious fungal outgrowth, magnified in (b) and imaged under a scanning electron microscope (c); note the fine hyphae with numerous swellings (*). (d, e) Monoxenic culture of T. repens and isolated MFRE after 12 wk of culture; (e) note the abundant mycelium extending from plugs of pure MFRE cultures (*) and enveloping the roots (arrowed), enlarged in (f) (see also Fig. 4). (g-i) Trypan blue/ink-stained roots of Trifolium showing fine, irregularly branching hyphae with larger vesicles or spores (g, arrowed), forming tightly wound intracellular coils with small intercalary and terminal swellings (h, arrowed); note also the subtending intracellular hyphal ropes (*). (i) Young arbuscule-like structure (arrowed) forming inside a clover root cell. Bars: (d) 50 mm; (e) 2 mm; (a) 500 µm; (b, f) 300 µm; (g) 50 µm; (c, h, i) 20 µm.

visualisation and editing. The same method was used for molecular identification of the fungus isolated from *Lycopodiella* and introduced in monoxenic microcosms with clover, as well as that of the fungus colonising the roots of clover in our monoxenic microcosms.

Axenic plants

Clover plants were cultured *in vitro* to establish monoxenic cultures with MFRE isolates. Seeds were surface-sterilised in 70% ethanol for 1 min, rinsed in water, followed by shaking in 5% commercial sodium hypochlorite for 30 min and then thorough rinsing in sterilised dH₂O. Seeds were placed in 140-mm triple-vented sterile Petri dishes containing modified Strullu–Romand (MSR) medium lacking vitamins and sucrose (Declerck *et al.*, 1998) solidified with 0.4% Phytagel (Sigma-Aldrich), and adjusted to pH 5.5 before sterilisation, where they germinated in the dark, inverted at 27° C, after 3 d.

In vitro colonisation of clover by MFRE isolate

The same MSR medium used for seed germination was plated slanted in 140 mm sterile, triple-vented raised Petri dishes. Three-day-old axenic clover seedlings (one per dish) were placed with their root system adhering to the medium (and the shoot extending into the medium-free portion of the dish) in Petri dishes pre-inoculated (1 wk) with axenic MFRE hyphae. Control plants were placed in noninoculated dishes containing the same medium. The sterile monoxenic microcosms were sealed with Parafilm, and the root system was covered with aluminium foil to prevent photo-oxidation and placed vertically in a growth chamber at 27°C, with a 16-h photoperiod and a photosynthetic photon flux of 300 μ mol m⁻² s⁻¹. Plates were undisturbed for 12 wk to allow time for the fungus to colonise plant roots. After 12 wk, fungal hyphae were growing in close association with clover roots (Figs 1d-f, 2a); roots were therefore harvested, cleared in 10% KOH and either stained with trypan blue (Hoysted et al., 2019) or 5% ink-vinegar (Vierheilig et al., 1998).



In vitro clover cultures were split into three groups: monoxenic plates colonised by MFRE with hyphae intact and, as controls, monoxenic plates colonised by MFRE with hyphae severed and plates containing only axenic clover without fungus. One hundred microlitres of aqueous solution containing 0.5 MBq ³³Porthophosphate (111 TBq mmol⁻¹ SA, 0.15 ng ³³P supplied; Hartmann Analytics) and ¹⁵N-ammonium chloride (1 mg ml⁻¹; 0.1 mg ¹⁵N added; Sigma-Aldrich) was introduced into a well in each of the plates (Fig. 2a, top-left detail panel). In the plates of clover colonised by MFRE that served as controls, a trench was cut in the medium using a sterile blade and subsequently backfilled with sterile medium to sever hyphae and prevent any direct fungal access to radio- and stable-isotope tracers (Fig. 2a, bottom-left detail panel). As a further control, we included isotope-containing wells in microcosms containing only clover to observe the direct isotope tracer uptake of the asymbiotic plant roots compared with plants that formed mycorrhizal associations with the MFRE isolate. By backfilling trenches with additional medium, diffusion of isotopes from the well was purposefully permitted in all microcosms, allowing us to account for the role of intact MFRE hyphae.



Fig. 2 Set-up of *in vitro* monoxenic experimental system used to quantify fluxes of nutrients exchanged between Mucoromycotina fine root endophytes (MFRE) and white clover (*Trifolium repens*). (a) Monoxenic cultures were developed in sterile conditions in 140 mm Petri dishes half-filled with modified Strullu–Romand (MSR) media, which lacked vitamins and sucrose, solidified with 0.4% Phytagel and poured at a slant. Three plugs of axenic MFRE culture were placed on the media and allowed to establish before the introduction of a *T. repens* seedling. Plates were sealed for 12 wk. One hundred microlitres of an aqueous solution containing ³³P or ¹⁵N was added to a well in each plate (see top-left detail panel). In the control plates, a trench was cut and subsequently filled with sterile medium to sever MFRE and to ensure there was no direct fungal access to radio- and stable-isotope tracers (see bottom-left detail panel). Purple colour on hyphae denotes the flow of fungal-acquired isotope tracers. (b) The MSR media and its contents were sealed off from the aboveground plant tissue, and each plate was placed in a gas-tight chamber before ¹⁴C-labelling. Lactic acid was added to ¹⁴C-labelled sodium bicarbonate to release a 0.5 Mbq pulse of ¹⁴CO₂ for the plant to fix. At the end of the 24-h labelling period, KOH was added to the system to capture any remaining headspace ¹⁴CO₂. Red circles in (a, b) denote regions that were sampled for the analysis of ³³P, ¹⁵N and ¹⁴C.

Research 73

The plates were resealed with Parafilm in sterile conditions and placed in controlled environment chambers (Model no. Micro-Clima 1200; Sneijders Labs, Tilburg, the Netherlands) with 16-h daytime (20°C and 70% humidity) and 8-h night-time (15°C and 70% humidity). Daytime photosynthetically active radiation (PAR), supplied by LED lighting, was 225 μ mol photons m⁻² s⁻¹. Atmospheric [CO₂] was set at 440 μ l l⁻¹, monitored using a sensor system (Vaisala, Birmingham, UK) and maintained through the addition of gaseous CO₂. Assimilation of ³³P into the aboveground plant material was monitored using a hand-held Geiger counter held over the Petri dish.

For ¹⁴C-labelling, the medium containing clover roots and MFRE hyphae was sealed off from the aboveground plant tissue and each plate placed in a gas-tight chamber (Fig. 2b). A 0.5-MBq pulse of ¹⁴CO₂ was then liberated into the headspace of sealed Petri dishes by adding 2 ml of 90% (w/v) lactic acid to 13.5 µl NaH¹⁴CO₃ (specific activity 2.124 GBg mmol⁻¹; Hartmann Analytics; Fig. 2b). Cultures inside sealed chambers were maintained under growth conditions as previously mentioned. Twenty-four hours after the addition of ³³P and ¹⁵N tracers and liberating the pulse of ¹⁴CO₂, the plates were opened and rootand-shoot material was separated, freeze-dried, weighted and homogenised. For the analysis of ³³P, between 0.1 and 4 mg of shoot, root and fungal material was digested in 500 µl of concentrated sulphuric acid at 365°C for 15 min. Fifty microlitres of hydrogen peroxide was added to cooled samples and returned to the digest block (BT5D; Grant Instruments, Cambridge, UK). Cleared digest solutions were then diluted to 5 ml with dH2O. ³³P-radioactivity of plant material was quantified through liquid scintillation (Tri-Carb® 3100TR; PerkinElmer, Beaconsfield, UK). One millilitre of each digest solution was added to 10 ml of Elmusify-safe scintillant, and ³³P content was calculated using Eqn 1.

$$M^{33}P = \left\{ \begin{bmatrix} \frac{cDPM}{60} \\ \frac{60}{SAct} \end{bmatrix} M_{wt} \right\} Df \qquad \text{Eqn 1}$$

where M^{33} P, mass of 33 P (mg); cDPM, counts as disintegrations per min; SAct, specific activity of the course (Bq mmol⁻¹); Df, dilution factor; and M_{wt} , molecular mass of P (Cameron *et al.*, 2007).

Between 0.1 and 4 mg of freeze-dried, homogenised root-andshoot tissues were weighed into $6 \times 4 \text{ mm}^2$ tin capsules (Sercon, Crewe, UK), and ¹⁵N abundance was determined using a continuous flow infrared mass spectrometry (IRMS; model no. PDZ 2020 IRMS; Sercon) using air as the reference standard; the IRMS detector was regularly calibrated to commercially available reference gases. The ¹⁵N transferred from fungus to plant was then calculated using equations published by Field *et al.* (2016).

The ¹⁴C activity of shoot, root and fungal samples was quantified through sample oxidation (307 Packard Sample Oxidation, Isotech) followed by liquid scintillation. Total C ($^{12}C + ^{14}C$) fixed by the plant and transferred to fungus was calculated as a function of the total volume and CO₂ content of the labelling chamber and the proportion of the supplied $^{14}CO_2$ label fixed by

plants. As severing the fungal hyphae only impacts the movement of $^{33}P/^{15}N$ from the well to the plant, the difference in total C between the values obtained for clover cultures with MFRE and those without fungus is considered equivalent to the total C transferred from plant to symbiotic fungus within the Phytagel for that microcosm, noting that a small proportion will be lost through respiration and accounting for plant-fixed C gained by MFRE via diffusion, root exudation and/or dark fixation. The total C budget for each microcosm was calculated using equations adapted from Cameron *et al.* (2007) (Eqn 2). Total per cent allocation of plant-fixed C to extraradical symbiotic fungal hyphae was calculated by subtracting the activity (in Becquerels) of clover cultures with MFRE present, dividing this by the sum of activity detected in all components of each microcosm, then multiplying by 100.

$$M_{\rm c} = \left(\left(\frac{A}{\rm SAct} \right) M^{14} \rm C \right) + (P_r \times M \rm wt_c)$$
 Eqn 2

where M_c , mass of carbon transferred from plant to fungus; A, radioactivity of the tissue sample (Bq); SAct, specific activity of the source (Bq Mol⁻¹); M^{14} C, atomic mass of 14C; P_n proportion of the total ¹⁴C label supplied present in the tissue; Mwt_c, mass of C in the CO₂ present in the labelling chamber (g) (from the ideal gas law; Eqn 3):

$$M_{\rm cd} = M_{\rm cd} \begin{pmatrix} {\rm P} V_{\rm cd} \\ RT \end{pmatrix} :. m_{\rm c=m_{\rm cd}} \times 0.27292$$
 Eqn 3

where m_{cd} , mass of CO₂ (g); M_{cd} , molecular mass of CO₂ (44.01 g mol⁻¹); P, total pressure (kPa); V_{cd} , volume of CO₂ in the chamber (0.003 m³); R, universal gas constant (J K⁻¹ mol⁻¹); T, absolute temperature (K); m_c , mass of C in the CO₂ present in the labelling chamber (g), where 0.27292 is the proportion of C in CO₂ on a mass fraction basis.

Data analyses

Isotope tracing data were analysed in SPSS Statistics v.26 (IBM, Armonk, NY, USA). Data were tested for normality and homogeneity of variances using the Kolmogorov–Smirnov test for normality. Where assumptions for parametric tests were not met, data were transformed using \log_{10} . If assumptions for parametric tests were still not met, a nonparametric statistical test would be performed. The differences between plant assimilation of ³³P and ¹⁵N were tested using Mann–Whitney U and Kruskal–Wallis analyses. Whiskers on box plots represent each of the data points (minimum to maximum) recorded during data collection.

Results

Molecular identification of the MFRE fungus

The molecular identification of the fungus colonising the roots of clover *in vitro* was confirmed as the same fungus introduced in our

monoxenic microcosms following isolation from wild gametophytes and young sporophytes of L. inundata, all of which matched (99.69%) Endogonales sp. GenBank KJ952213 (Rimington et al., 2015).

Axenic culture of plants and fungi and in vitro colonisation of clover by MFRE

Axenic MFRE isolates (Fig. 1a) comprised fine hyphal networks with small intercalary and terminal swellings $< 20 \ \mu m$ in diameter (Fig. 1b,d). After c. 12 wk from the establishment of monoxenic microcosms containing axenic clover seedlings and MFRE hyphae, abundant mycelium extended from the original plugs of pure MFRE cultures (Fig. 1e) and enveloped the roots of clover (Fig. 1f). Root colonisation by MFRE was confirmed by molecular methods and staining (Fig. 1g-i), which revealed copious fungal colonisation with cytology typical of MFRE, consisting of fine (< 1.5 μ m in diameter) irregularly branching hyphae with small intercalary and terminal swellings (Fig. 1g,h), sometimes forming tightly

(a)

0.25

0.20

0.15

а

No fundiar

Trenched Fund 39

þ

1000

100

10

а

а

wound coils and hyphal ropes (Fig. 1h), spores or vesicles (Fig. 1g) and fine arbuscule-like structures (Fig. 1i) in the root cortical cells of clover, with arbuscule-like structures confined to the inner cortex.

MFRE directly transfer ¹⁵N and ³³P to clover

(b)

(d)

Shoot tissue ¹⁵N (ng g⁻¹)

Shoot tissue ³³P (ng g⁻¹)

0.15

0.10

0.05

Untrenched Interched Fundase

100 000

10 000

1000

100

10

а

No fungisp

а

In the experimental microcosms where fungal hyphae remained intact (Fig. 2a), MFRE transferred an average of 48% (±18%) of the supplied 33 P tracer and an average of 43% (±21%) of the supplied ¹⁵N tracer to the shoots of clover during the labelling period. We determined significant transfer of fungal-acquired ³³P to clover by comparing the amount of ³³P in shoot tissues where MFRE hyphae remained intact against amounts of ³³P in shoot tissue in microcosms where hyphae were severed (Fig. 3a; P = 0.003; Table 1) or where MFRE was not present (Fig. 3a; P = 0.036; Table 1) in terms of absolute quantities and when normalised to plant biomass (Fig. 3b; P = 0.057; Table 1). There was significantly more ¹⁵N present in shoots where MFRE hyphae remained intact than in shoot tissue in microcosms where hyphae



© 2022 The Authors New Phytologist © 2022 New Phytologist Foundation Untercited Ungitsh Ingitsh New Phytologist (2023) 238: 70-79 www.newphytologist.com

No fundi SN

Table 1 Summary of statistical results of ¹⁵N and ³³P isotope tracing experiments.

		Intact fungi vs Trenched fungi	Intact fungi vs No fungi	Trenched fungi vs No fungi
Absolute values ³³ P (ng)				
Mann–Whitney U P-value		0.003	0.036	0.057
Kruskal–Wallis P-value	0.004			
Concentration values $[^{33}P]$ (ng g ⁻¹)				
Mann–Whitney U P-value		0.001	0.009	0.036
Kruskal–Wallis P-value	0.001			
Absolute values ¹⁵ N (ng)				
Mann–Whitney U P-value		0.040	0.010	0.662
Kruskal–Wallis P-value	0.013			
Concentration values ^{15}N (ng g ⁻¹)				
Mann–Whitney U P-value		0.349	0.056	1.000
Kruskal–Wallis P-value	0.156			

were severed (Fig. 3c; P = 0.04; Table 1) and axenic plates without MFRE (Fig. 3c; P = 0.01; Table 1) in terms of absolute quantities. However, when ¹⁵N assimilation was normalised to plant biomass, the transfer was not significant (Fig. 3d, severed hyphae, P = 0.349; no MFRE present, P = 0.056; Table 1).

Plant-fixed carbon is detected in extraradical MFRE hyphae

Based on the drawdown and detection of ¹⁴C in plant and fungal materials over the 24-h labelling period, we calculated a complete C budget for each microcosm (Supporting Information Fig. S1). There was significantly more plant-fixed carbon present in microcosms containing MFRE than in plant-only microcosms (Fig. 4a,b; P = 0.047). 606.29 ng (440.73 ng g⁻¹) of plant-fixed C was present in extraradical MFRE hyphae (Fig. 4a,b), equivalent to 0.87% of the total amount of C fixed by the clover during the 24-h labelling period.

Discussion

Our results provide the first unequivocal demonstration that symbiosis between a flowering plant, white clover, and a MFRE fungus is mutualistic, with the plant gaining both ¹⁵N and ³³P tracers directly from the fungus while the fungus gains plant-fixed C, in the absence of other micro-organisms. While we focussed on a specific association, when considered together with those of previous studies (Field *et al.*, 2015b, 2016, 2019; Orchard *et al.*, 2017b; Hoysted *et al.*, 2019, 2020; Albornoz *et al.*, 2020, 2021), our findings indicate that MFRE symbioses are nutritionally mutualistic across diverse land plants.

Analysis of the fungus colonising the roots of clover, confirmed molecularly as an Endogonales (Mucoromycotina) isolate from a lycophyte (Hoysted *et al.*, 2019, 2020), revealed a morphology characterised by fine, irregularly branching hyphae with small intercalary and terminal swellings (Fig. 1g,h), forming vesicles or spores (Fig. 1g) as well as hyphal coils and hyphal ropes (Fig. 1h) alongside arbuscule-like structures (Fig. 1i). This morphology matches that described previously in a range of vascular (Orchard *et al.*, 2017b; Hoysted *et al.*, 2019, 2020; Albornoz *et al.*, 2020) and nonvascular plants (Field *et al.*, 2015b, 2016, 2019) colonised by MFRE.



Fig. 4 Total plant-derived carbon present in extraradical Mucoromycotina fine root endophytes (MFRE) fungal hyphae. (a) Total plant-derived carbon present in Phytagel with MFRE fungi present or plant-only microcosms where no MFRE were present after a 24-h labelling period (ng) and concentrations (ng g⁻¹) (b). For both (a) and (b), n = 17 for microcosms with MFRE present and n = 7 for microcosms with no MFRE present. Letters denote significant differences where P < 0.05, Mann–Whitney U and Kruskal–Wallis tests. Error bars represent the standard error of the mean, with all data points shown (minimum to maximum) collected during the experiments.

To date, MFRE research has been carried out using unpasteurised soil culture-based experimental systems (Orchard *et al.*, 2017a; Albornoz *et al.*, 2020) or wild-collected plants (Field *et al.*, 2015b, 2016, 2019; Hoysted *et al.*, 2020). As such, it is inevitable that these experiments included other soil microorganisms alongside MFRE. As there is no information about how rhizosphere bacteria may influence MFRE metabolic characteristics and function, the inclusion of soil microorganisms in previous studies made it impossible to determine the direct contribution of MFRE to host plant nutrition. Here, we show for the first time, using a novel *in vitro* monoxenic system, that MFRE directly assimilate and transfer both ³³P and ¹⁵N to a flowering plant in the absence of other microbes.

Our results reveal significant transfer of fungal-acquired ³³P to clover; however, while we observed a clear trend of greater [¹⁵N] in plant shoots when MFRE hyphae are intact than where they are severed, the difference is not statistically significant. A possible explanation is that clover, a legume, is not heavily reliant on fungal symbionts for N assimilation, even in the absence of rhizobia. This could also be due to revolatilisation and recapture of ammonium by the plant, and/or mass flow driven by plant transpiration in these microcosms. Nevertheless, and although the abundance of MFRE in our microcosms was not quantified, our results, when tentatively compared with those of previous studies on AMF (Thirkell et al., 2020a,b), indicate that clover (without rhizobia) may assimilate more ¹⁵N tracer via its MFRE symbiont per unit plant biomass than is typically assimilated by plants associated with AMF, albeit in nonsterile systems. This nutritional role, already indicated by studies of MFRE symbioses in nonflowering plants (Field et al., 2019; Hoysted et al., 2019), could help to explain the persistence of MFRE across most modern land plant lineages, facilitating plant access and assimilation of soil N (Howard et al., 2022). The FRE have long been thought to enhance plant P, at least in soils with very low plant-available P (Crush, 1973; Rabatin et al., 1993; Orchard et al., 2017b; Albornoz et al., 2021); however, their potential role in plant N uptake has been overlooked. It is therefore important that N transfer and assimilation from MFRE to plant hosts are now investigated in vitro across a range of other flowering plants that do not associate with Nfixing bacteria. Parallel studies of N and P transfer by AMF are also required before meaningful comparisons between AMF and MFRE function can be made.

Because we used an inorganic N source, additional experiments are also needed to assess potential direct organic N utilisation by MFRE (Field et al., 2019). A recent study on the ability of AMF to utilise N from organic sources (Rozmoš et al., 2022) showed, using an in vitro monoxenic experimental system based on Ri T-DNA transformed chicory roots, that organic nitrogen utilisation by Rhizophagus irregularis was mediated by specific soil bacteria and accelerated by the presence of a protist. These findings, though not based on full plants, may explain the results of previous experiments using organic matter patches labelled with ¹⁵N in soil-based microcosms, which showed successful transfer of the ¹⁵N by AMF to host plants (Hodge et al., 2000, 2001; Thirkell et al., 2016). Thus, it is likely that AMF-associated and free-living rhizospheric bacteria as well as other soil fungi contained in the nonsterile fungal inoculum used in those experiments may have interacted with AMF (Vivas et al., 2003; Frey-Klett et al., 2007; Smith & Smith, 2011; Jiang et al., 2021),

influencing the breakdown, mineralisation and assimilation of ¹⁵N-labelled organic material. It is now important to determine whether similar processes may also explain organic N utilisation by MFRE (Field *et al.*, 2019) or whether these fungi, by virtue of their putative facultatively saprotrophic nature, can directly access and transfer N from organic sources. Since organic N represents a large proportion of total soil N, direct organic N utilisation by MFRE would have important implications for terrestrial N cycling (Hodge & Storer, 2015; Howard *et al.*, 2022).

Further research using monoxenic systems is also needed to compare the 'cost' in terms of plant-to-fungus transfer of C between AMF and MFRE symbioses. Our data show that symbiotic MFRE gain clover-fixed C (Fig. 4a,b), and previous experiments using soil culture-based systems suggested that the 'cost' of MFRE-vascular plant associations is at least on a par with, if not larger than, AMF-vascular plant associations (Hoysted *et al.*, 2020). However, this has only been compared in one vascular plant species; whether it holds true for *in vitro* monoxenic systems remains to be tested.

Previous research into the function of plant-MFRE symbioses raised fundamental questions about their persistence and ecological relevance in modern terrestrial ecosystems. We can now begin to address such questions with new experimental systems knowing that symbiotic MFRE are nutritionally mutualistic with flowering plants. Field et al. (2015b) demonstrated the ability of MFRE isolates to recolonise host liverworts in vitro; however, until now, this had not been achieved in vascular plants. Our in vitro system used a fungal isolate that originated from a wild-collected earlydiverging vascular plant, L. inundata, and was introduced to white clover in vitro. This isolate was molecularly and cytologically confirmed to be colonising the roots of clover used in our experiment. This represents a novel, tractable *in vitro* experimental system designed to manipulate MFRE isolates and the resynthesis of their mycorrhizas with a flowering plant. It opens a realm of exciting possibilities for further research on MFRE mycorrhizal properties, including cytological, molecular and metabolomic comparisons with AMF where host plants are inoculated singly or co-colonised with both MFRE and AMF. Furthermore, a fundamental understanding of how MFRE distribution and function are affected by environmental factors such as temperature, water, light and atmospheric CO₂, in addition to biotic factors such as interactions with other soil microbiota, can now be developed. Successful isolation from wild plants and axenic cultivation of an MFRE isolate offers exciting new opportunities to develop a model system for symbiotic MFRE and for omics in comparison with other fungi.

Acknowledgements

We gratefully acknowledge support from the European Research Council to KJF and SP (Consolidator Grant MYCOREV, 865225) and NERC to KJF, SP and MIB (NE/S009663/1; NE/ N00941X/1). KJF is funded by a BBSRC Translational Fellowship (BB/M026825/1) and a Philip Leverhulme Prize (PLP-2017-079). We thank Juyeon Chae and Agatha Hamon-Pourquery for assistance with culture maintenance and Emily Magkourilou and

New

4698137, 2023, 1, Downloaded from https://mph.onlinelibtary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/nph.18630 by Test, Wiley Online Libtary on [27/06/2023]. See the Terms and Conditions (https://onlinelibtary.wiley.com/terms-and-conditions) on Wiley Online Libtary for rules of use; OA articles are governed by the applicable Creative Commons Licenses

Emily Durant for technical assistance during the harvest of experiments.

Competing interests

None declared.

Author contributions

KJF, SP, MIB and GAH conceived and designed the investigation. SP collected the plant material, carried out the isolation of fungal symbionts and designed the monoxenic cultures with the help of GAH. KJF and CAB undertook the isotope tracing. GAH led the data analysis and writing. BS designed Figure 2 and contributed to the writing. All authors discussed the results and commented on the article. SP and KJF agree to serve as the authors responsible for contact and ensure communication.

ORCID

Christopher A. Bell D https://orcid.org/0000-0002-7437-2793 Martin I. Bidartondo D https://orcid.org/0000-0003-3172-3036 Katie J. Field D https://orcid.org/0000-0002-5196-2360 Grace A. Hoysted D https://orcid.org/0000-0002-3469-2549 Silvia Pressel D https://orcid.org/0000-0001-9652-6338 Besiana Sinanaj D https://orcid.org/0000-0002-7124-7698

Data availability

The data generated in this study are provided in the Main Manuscript file. Full datasets are available from the corresponding authors upon reasonable request. Sequence data have been deposited in GenBank with accession no. KJ952213.

References

- Abbott LK. 1982. Comparative anatomy of vesicular arbuscular mycorrhizas formed on subterranean clover. Australian Journal of Botany 30: 485-499.
- Albornoz FE, Hayes PE, Orchard S, Clode PL, Nazeri NK, Standish RJ, Bending GD, Hilton S, Ryan MH. 2020. First cryo-scanning electron microscopy images and X-ray microanalyses of Mucoromycotinian fine root endophytes in vascular plants. Frontiers in Microbiology 11: 2018.
- Albornoz FE, Orchard S, Standish RJ, Dickie IA, Bending G, Hilton S, Lardner T, Foster KJ, Gleeson DB, Bougoure J et al. 2021. Evidence for niche differentiation in the environmental responses of co-occurring Mucoromycotinian fine root endophytes and Glomeromycotinian arbuscular mycorrhizal fungi. Microbial Ecology 81: 864-873.
- Ali B. 1969. Occurrence and characteristics of the vesicular arbuscular endophytes of Nardus stricta. Nova Hedwigia 17: 409–425.
- Altschul SF, Madden TL, Schäffer AA, Zhang J, Zhang Z, Miller W, Lipman DJ. 1997. Gapped BLAST and PSI-BLAST: a new generation of protein database search programs. Nucleic Acids Research 25: 3389-3402.
- Bidartondo MI, Read DJ, Trappe JM, Merckx V, Ligrone R, Duckett JG. 2011. The dawn of symbiosis between plants and fungi. Biological Letters 7: 574-577.
- Brundrett MC, Tedersoo L. 2018. Evolutionary history of mycorrhizal symbioses and global host plant diversity. New Phytologist 220: 1108-1115.
- Cameron DD, Johnson I, Leak JR, Read DJ. 2007. Mycorrhizal acquisition of inorganic phosphorus by the green-leaved terrestrial orchid Goodyera repens. Annals of Botany 99: 831-834.

- Crush JR. 1973. The effect of Rhizophagus tenuis mycorrhizas on ryegrass, cocksfoot and sweet vernal. New Phytologist 72: 965-973.
- Declerck S, Strullu DG, Plenchette C. 1998. Monoxenic culture of the intraradical forms of Glomus sp. isolated from a tropical ecosystem: a proposed methodology for germplasm collection. Mycologia 90: 579-585.
- Edgar RC, Haas BJ, Clemente JC, Quince C, Knight R. 2011. UCHIME improves sensitivity and speed of chimera detection. Bioinformatics 27: 2194-2000.
- Field KJ, Bidartondo MI, Rimington WR, Hoysted GA, Beerling D, Cameron DD, Duckett JG, Leake JR, Pressel S. 2019. Functional complementarity of ancient plant-fungal mutualisms: contrasting nitrogen, phosphorus and carbon exchange between Mucoromycotina and Glomeromycotina fungal symbionts of liverworts. New Phytologist 223: 908-921.
- Field KJ, Pressel S. 2018. Unity in diversity: structural and functional insights into the ancient partnerships between plants and fungi. New Phytologist 220: 996-1011.
- Field KJ, Pressel S, Duckett JG, Rimington WR, Bidartondo MI. 2015a. Symbiotic options for the conquest of land. Trends in Ecology & Evolution 30: 477-486.
- Field KJ, Rimington WR, Bidartondo MI, Allinson KE, Beerling DJ, Cameron DD, Duckett JG, Leake JR, Pressel S. 2015b. First evidence of mutualism between ancient plant lineages (Haplomitriopsida liverworts) and Mucoromycotina fungi and its response to simulated Palaeozoic changes in atmospheric CO2. New Phytologist 205: 743-756.
- Field KJ, Rimington WR, Bidartondo MI, Allinson KE, Beerling DJ, Cameron DD, Duckett JG, Leake JR, Pressel S. 2016. Functional analysis of liverworts in dual symbiosis with Glomeromycota and Mucoromycotina fungi under a simulated Palaeozoic CO2 decline. ISME Journal 10: 1514-1526.
- Frey-Klett P, Garbaye J, Tarkka M. 2007. The mycorrhiza helper bacteria revisited. New Phytologist 176: 22-36.
- Hodge A, Campbell CD, Fitter AH. 2001. An arbuscular mycorrhizal fungus accelerates decomposition and acquires nitrogen directly from organic material. Nature 413: 297-299.
- Hodge A, Stewart J, Robinson D, Griffiths BS, Fitter AH. 2000. Competition between roots and soil microorganisms for nutrients from nitrogen-rich patches of varying complexity. Journal of Ecology 88: 150-164.
- Hodge A, Storer K. 2015. Arbuscular mycorrhiza and nitrogen: implications for individual plants through to ecosystems. Plant and Soil 386: 1-19.
- Howard N, Pressel N, Kaye RS, Daniell TJ, Field KJ. 2022. The potential role of Mucoromycotina 'fine root endophytes' in plant nitrogen nutrition. Physiologia Plantarum 174: e13715.
- Hoysted GA, Bidartondo MI, Duckett JG, Pressel S, Field KJ. 2020. Phenology and function in lycopod-Mucoromycotina symbiosis. New Phytologist 229: 2389-2394.
- Hoysted GA, Jacob A, Kowal J, Giesemann P, Bidartondo MI, Duckett JG, Gebauer G, Rimington WR, Schornack S, Pressel S et al. 2019. Mucoromycotina fine root endophyte fungi form nutritional mutualisms with vascular plants. Plant Physiology 181: 565-577.
- Hoysted GA, Kowal J, Jacob A, Rimington WR, Duckett JG, Pressel S, Orchard S, Ryan MH, Field KJ, Bidartondo MI. 2018. A mycorrhizal revolution. Current Opinion in Plant Biology 44: 1-6.
- Huelsenbeck JP, Ronquist F. 2001. MRBAYES: Bayesian inference and phylogenetic trees. Bioinformatics 17: 754-755.
- Jiang F, Zhang L, Zhou J, George TS, Feng G. 2021. Arbuscular mycorrhizal fungi enhance mineralisation of organic phosphorus by carrying bacteria along their extraradical hyphae. New Phytologist 230: 304-315.
- Mills BJ, Batterman SA, Field KJ. 2018. Nutrient acquisition by symbiotic fungi governs Palaeozoic climate transition. Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society of London. Series B: Biological Sciences 373: 20160503.
- Morris JL, Puttick MN, Clark JW, Edwards D, Kenrick P, Pressel S, Wellman CH, Yang Z, Schneider H, Donoghue PC. 2018. The timescale of early land plant evolution. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, USA 115: 2274-2283.
- Orchard S, Standish RJ, Dickie IA, Renton M, Walker C, Moot D, Ryan MH. 2017a. Fine endophytes (Glomus tenue) are related to Mucoromycotina, not Glomeromycota. New Phytologist 213: 481-486.
- Orchard S, Standish RJ, Dickie IA, Renton M, Walker C, Moot D, Ryan MH. 2017b. Fine root endophytes under scrutiny: a review of the literature on

New Phytologist

Rapid report

arbuscule-producing fungi recently suggested to belong to the Mucoromycotina. *Mycorrhiza* **27**: 619–638.

- Pirozynski KA, Malloch DW. 1975. The origin of land plants: a matter of mycotrophism. *Biosystems* 6: 153–164.
- Rabatin SC, Stinner BR, Paoletti MG. 1993. Vesicular-arbuscular mycorrhizal fungi, particularly *Glomus tenue*, in Venezuelan bromeliad epiphytes. *Mycorrhiza* 4: 17–20.
- Raven JA, Allen JF. 2003. Genomics and chloroplast evolution: what did cyanobacteria do for plants? *Genome Biology* 4: 209.
- Read DJ, Duckett JG, Francis R, Ligrone R, Russell A. 2000. Symbiotic fungal associations in 'lower' land plants. *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society of London. Series B: Biological Sciences* 355: 815–831.
- Rimington WR, Pressel S, Duckett JG, Bidartondo MI. 2015. Fungal associations of basal vascular plants: reopening a closed book? *New Phytologist* 205: 1394–1398.
- Rimington WR, Pressel S, Duckett JG, Field KJ, Bidartondo MI. 2019. Evolution and networks in ancient and widespread symbioses between Mucoromycotina and liverworts. *Mycorrhiza* 29: 551–565.
- Rozmoš M, Bukovská P, Hršelová H, Kotianová M, Dudáš M, Gančarčíková K, Jansa J. 2022. Organic nitrogen utilisation by an arbuscular mycorrhizal fungus is mediated by specific soil bacteria and a protist. *ISME Journal* 16: 676–685.
- Sinanaj B, Hoysted G, Pressel S, Bidartondo MI, Field KJ. 2021. Critical research challenges facing Mucoromycotina 'fine root endophytes'. *New Phytologist Letter* 232: 1528–1534.
- Smit E, Leeflang P, Glandorf B, Van Elsas JD, Wernars K. 1999. Analysis of fungal diversity in the wheat rhizosphere by sequencing of cloned PCR-amplified genes encoding 18 S rRNA and temperature gradient gel electrophoresis. *Applied Environmental Microbiology* 65: 2614–2621.
- Smith SE, Read DJ. 2008. *Mycorrhizal symbiosis*, 3rd edn. London, UK: Academic Press.
- Smith SE, Smith FA. 2011. Roles of arbuscular mycorrhizas in plant nutrition and growth: new paradigms from cellular to ecosystem scales. *Annual Review of Plant Biology* 62: 227–250.
- Tamura K, Stecher G, Peterson D, Filipski A, Kumar S. 2013. MEGA6: molecular evolutionary genetics analysis v.6.0. *Molecular Biology and Evolution* 30: 2725– 2729.
- Taylor L, Banwart S, Leake J, Beerling DJ. 2011. Modelling the evolutionary rise of ectomycorrhiza on sub-surface weathering environments and the geochemical carbon cycle. *American Journal of Science* 311: 369–403.
- Thippayrugs S, Bansal M, Abbott LK. 1999. Morphology and infectivity of fine endophyte in a Mediterranean environment. *Mycological Research* 103: 1369– 1379.
- Thirkell TJ, Cameron DD, Hodge A. 2016. Resolving the 'nitrogen paradox' of arbuscular mycorrhizas: fertilisation with organic matter brings considerable

benefits for plant nutrition and growth. *Plant, Cell & Environment* **39**: 1683–1690.

- Thirkell TJ, Campbell M, Driver J, Pastok D, Merry B, Field KJ. 2020a. Cultivardependent increases in mycorrhizal nutrient acquisition by barley in response to elevated CO₂. *Plants, People, Planet* 3: 553–566.
- Thirkell TJ, Pastok D, Field KJ. 2020b. Carbon for nutrient exchange between arbuscular mycorrhizal fungi and wheat varies according to cultivar and changes in atmospheric carbon dioxide concentration. *Global Change Biology* 26: 1725–1738.
- Vierheilig H, Coughlan AP, Wyss URS, Piché Y. 1998. Ink and vinegar, a simple staining technique for arbuscular-mycorrhizal fungi. *Applied and Environmental Microbiology* 64: 5004–5007.
- Vivas A, Marulanda A, Ruiz-Lozano JM, Barea JM, Azcón R. 2003. Influence of a *Bacillus* sp. on physiological activities of two arbuscular mycorrhizal fungi and on plant responses to PEG-induced drought stress. *Mycorrhiza* 13: 249–256.
- Walker C, Gollotte A, Redecker D. 2018. A new genus, *Planticonsortium* (Mucoromycotina), and new combination (*P. tenue*), for the fine root endophyte, *Glomus tenue* (basionym *Rhizophagus tenuis*). *Mycorrhiza* 28: 213–219.
- Wang X, Fang J, Liu P, Liu J, Fang W, Fang Z, Xiao Y. 2021. Mucoromycotina fungi possess the ability to utilize plant sucrose as a carbon source: evidence from *Gongronella* sp. w5. *Frontiers in Microbiology* 11: 3322.
- White TJ, Bruns TD, Lee S, Taylor J. 1990. Analysis of phylogenetic relationships by amplification and direct sequencing of ribosomal RNA genes. In: Innis MA, Gelfand JJ, Sninsky JJ, White TJ, eds. *PCR protocols: a guide to methods and applications.* New York, NY, USA: Academic Press, 315–322.

Supporting Information

Additional Supporting Information may be found online in the Supporting Information section at the end of the article.

Fig. S1 Total carbon flux budget for monoxenic *in vitro* cultures of Mucoromycotina fine root endophyte hyphae (MFRE) colonising white clover (*Trifolium repens*).

Please note: Wiley is not responsible for the content or functionality of any Supporting Information supplied by the authors. Any queries (other than missing material) should be directed to the *New Phytologist* Central Office.