

This is a repository copy of Spatiotemporal dynamics of NO2 concentration with linear mixed models: A Bangladesh case study.

White Rose Research Online URL for this paper: <u>https://eprints.whiterose.ac.uk/183139/</u>

Version: Accepted Version

#### Article:

Islam, KMA, Gani Adnan, MS, Zannat, KE orcid.org/0000-0003-3108-5732 et al. (1 more author) (2022) Spatiotemporal dynamics of NO2 concentration with linear mixed models: A Bangladesh case study. Physics and Chemistry of the Earth, 126. 103119. p. 103119. ISSN 1474-7065

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.pce.2022.103119

© 2022 Elsevier Ltd. All rights reserved. This manuscript version is made available under the CC-BY-NC-ND 4.0 license http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/.

#### Reuse

This article is distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivs (CC BY-NC-ND) licence. This licence only allows you to download this work and share it with others as long as you credit the authors, but you can't change the article in any way or use it commercially. More information and the full terms of the licence here: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/

#### Takedown

If you consider content in White Rose Research Online to be in breach of UK law, please notify us by emailing eprints@whiterose.ac.uk including the URL of the record and the reason for the withdrawal request.



eprints@whiterose.ac.uk https://eprints.whiterose.ac.uk/

# 1 Spatiotemporal dynamics of NO<sub>2</sub> concentration with linear mixed

- 2 models: a Bangladesh case study
- 3
- K. M. Ashraful Islam<sup>1</sup>, Mohammed Sarfaraz Gani Adnan<sup>1,2</sup>, Khatun E Zannat<sup>1,3</sup>, Ashraf Dewan<sup>4</sup>
- <sup>1</sup>Department of Urban and Regional Planning, Chittagong University of Engineering and Technology
  (CUET), Chattogram 4319, Bangladesh
- 7 (COLT), Chattogram 4319, Dangiaucsii
- <sup>2</sup>Environmental Change Institute, School of Geography and the Environment, University of Oxford, OX1
  3QY, United Kingdom
- 10 <sup>3</sup>Choice Modelling Centre (CMC), Institute for Transport Studies (ITS), University of Leeds, LS2 9JT,
- 11 Leeds, United Kingdom
- <sup>4</sup>Spatial Sciences Discipline, School of Earth and Planetary Sciences, Curtin University, Perth 6102,
- 13 Australia
- 14
- 15

## 16 Abstract

There is currently a limited understanding of how climatic and anthropogenic factors affect 17 atmospheric NO<sub>2</sub> concentration, and how these factors are associated with air pollution over space 18 19 and time. Using high-resolution TROPOMI satellite data, this study estimates both the degree of association between climatic and anthropogenic factors, and the spatiotemporal variability of NO<sub>2</sub> 20 21 concentration over Bangladesh. Several linear mixed models were developed to isolate possible factors affecting the NO<sub>2</sub> concentration values recorded between July 2018 and June 2019). This 22 included monthly mean maximum temperature (MMAXT), rainfall, wind speed (WS), relative 23 humidity (RH), enhanced vegetation index (EVI), population density, and distance from industrial 24 activities. The study revealed that the very urbanized central region of Bangladesh experienced 25 high NO<sub>2</sub> concentrations, particularly from September through to March. Dynamic variables such 26 as RH, MMAXT, RAIN, and WS can positively or negatively influence NO<sub>2</sub> depending on the 27 time of year. Areas with a high vegetation cover, a low population density, and located some 28 distance from industrial areas tended to have low NO<sub>2</sub> concentrations. This study concluded that 29 policy measures such as transboundary air quality agreements, the introduction of a month-specific 30 green tax, decentralization, industrial relocation, and increased urban tree plantation activities 31 32 could all prove valuable in reducing NO<sub>2</sub> pollution in Bangladesh.

**33** Key words Air pollution; NO<sub>2</sub> concentration; TROPOMI; linear mixed model; remote sensing; Bangladesh

- 34
- 35

## **1. Introduction**

Air pollution is one of the main causes of premature deaths in human populations (Cooper et al., 37 2020). In 2012, approximately seven million people died due to diseases associated with air 38 pollution: one in eight of the total fatalities across the world in that year (WHO, 2014). Many 39 policies and strategies at the global, regional, and local levels have been formulated to ensure 40 environmental sustainability and healthy living by reducing pollution concentrations (Melamed et 41 al., 2016). Nitrogen dioxide (NO<sub>2</sub>) is recognized as a significant pollutant by both the World Health 42 Organization (WHO) and the United States Environmental Protection Agency (US EPA) (Herron-43 Thorpe et al., 2010; Melamed et al., 2016). Various natural and anthropogenic factors are responsible 44 for emitting NO<sub>2</sub> into the air. This includes chemical reactions due to lightning, soil emission, 45 industrial and vehicular burning of fossil fuel, use of natural gas without an outlet, kerosene, 46 liquified petroleum gas (LPG) apparatus, tobacco, and wood-burning, (Spicer et al., 1993; Zhu et al., 47 2019). Consistent exposure to NO<sub>2</sub> can cause various health hazards such as cardiovascular disease, 48 lung cancer, and other life-threatening respiratory diseases (Atkinson et al., 2018). A recent study 49 50 had also noted a positive correlation between atmospheric NO<sub>2</sub> and risks of COVID-19 infection (Zhu et al., 2020). 51

Various environmental policies have been enacted in many countries to reduce NO<sub>2</sub> levels and 52 attempt to lessen the societal costs associated with these emissions (Ryu et al., 2019). Ongoing 53 monitoring and characterization of NO<sub>2</sub> concentrations are considered to be fundamental in any air 54 55 pollution exposure assessment work and associated environmental policy formulation (Bechle et al., 2013; Li et al., 2020). NO<sub>2</sub> has a short photochemical lifetime: 2 to 5 hours during the daytime 56 57 in summer and 12 to 24 hours during winter (Goldberg et al., 2021). The highly variable nature of emission sources means the distribution of this pollutant varies both spatially and temporally 58 59 (Cooper et al., 2020; Goldberg et al., 2021). High-quality in-situ measurements allow an accurate assessment of NO<sub>2</sub>; however, a lack of such measurement capability is evident in many developing 60 countries (Bechle et al., 2013). The limited number of monitoring stations usually found in these 61 countries usually results in a poor understanding of the actual spatiotemporal distribution (Lee and 62 Koutrakis, 2014; Zhu et al., 2019). This can result in the formulation of environmental policies based 63 on inadequate information, and can actually enhance disease burdens. The collection and use of 64 accurate information is vital in supporting informed decision-making. 65

Advances in remote sensing technology now enable researchers to efficiently trace atmospheric
 NO<sub>2</sub> (Bechle et al., 2013; Zhu et al., 2019). Many studies now routinely use satellite data to monitor
 spatiotemporal changes of tropospheric NO<sub>2</sub> (Biswal et al., 2020; Georgoulias et al., 2019; Ryu et al.,

69 2019; Shah et al., 2020; Wang et al., 2019; Xu et al., 2020; Zheng et al., 2018). The data allows the

assessment of long-term pollution trends, mapping at ungauged locations, prediction of future air 70 71 quality scenarios and the detection of extreme air pollution events (Duncan et al., 2014). Currently, the European Remote Sensing (ERS-2) Global Ozone Monitoring Experiment (GOME), Envisat 72 SCanning Imaging Absorption SpectroMeter for Atmospheric CHartographY (SCIAMACHY), 73 NASA's Aura Ozone Monitoring Instrument (OMI), and Exploitation of Meteorological Satellites 74 (EUMETSAT) Metop-A (GOME-2) (Duncan et al., 2014) are available to map and monitor NO<sub>2</sub>. 75 The latest tropospheric vertical column of NO<sub>2</sub> data provided by the European Space Agency's 76 (ESA) Sentinel 5P (commonly known as the TROPOspheric Monitoring Instrument (TROPOMI)) 77 (ESA, 2018) accurately estimates NO<sub>2</sub> emission values when compared with actual in-situ data 78 recordings (Goldberg et al., 2021; Lorente et al., 2019; Omrani et al., 2020). The TROPOMI 79 spectrometer has been collecting NO<sub>2</sub> information since October 2017. The high spatiotemporal 80 81 resolution and improved sensitivity and accuracy of TROPOMI datasets make them very useful in examining atmospheric NO<sub>2</sub> over time and space when compared to previous satellite 82 instrumentation suites (Dix et al., 2020; Goldberg et al., 2021). As a result, its use in monitoring 83 emission products such as NO<sub>2</sub> is increasing globally (Cooper et al., 2020; Dix et al., 2020; Goldberg 84 85 et al., 2021; Shikwambana et al., 2020; Wu et al., 2021). Satellite overpass times differ between latitudes, so global-scale NO<sub>2</sub> studies may be of little use in developing policies to curb increases 86 87 in air pollution in a country experiencing a rapid growth of industries and anthropogenic activities (Bechle et al., 2013). 88

The use of robust, spatial and temporal modeling is essential in any investigations of regional NO<sub>2</sub> 89 pollution, and is critical in helping decision-makers formulate appropriate environmental policies 90 (Vîrghileanu et al., 2020). Accurately analyzing the amount of atmospheric trace gases present at a 91 location is important in characterizing air pollution (Aggarwal and Toshniwal, 2019; Cichowicz et al., 92 2017; Nemet et al., 2010). As with other air quality indicators, the relative level of NO<sub>2</sub> present is 93 generally associated with a set of complex weather parameters (Davis and Kalkstein, 1990). Local 94 and regional climate also play an important role in the spatial and temporal variability of this gas 95 (Elminir, 2005). Anthropogenic factors such as industrial emission and population density, as well 96 97 as the extent of vegetation cover, can also influence NO<sub>2</sub> pollution patterns (Zhu et al., 2019).

Many studies have focused on diagnosing NO<sub>2</sub> concentrations using various combinations of explanatory variables and modeling approaches. Statistical modeling approaches include the use of cokriging (Ryu et al., 2019), geographically weighted regression (GWR) (Zheng et al., 2019), linear regression (ul-Haq et al., 2018), land use regression (LUR) (Lee and Koutrakis, 2014; Novotny et al., 2011), and linear mixed model (LMM) (Lee and Koutrakis, 2014). Machine learning techniques such as Random Forest (RF) (Zhu et al., 2019), support vector machines (SVM), artificial neural

networks (ANN) (Juhos et al., 2008), and space-time neural network (Li et al., 2020) are also used 104 105 for measuring tropospheric NO<sub>2</sub>. Studies indicate that LMM has better predictive power in explaining spatial and temporal NO<sub>2</sub> distribution as compared to classical linear regression 106 approaches, e.g., multivariate model (Lee et al., 2011; Lee and Koutrakis, 2014). Though a linear 107 regression model can establish an empirical relationship between dependent and independent 108 variables, it disregards the variation among groups (e.g., month) (El-Assi et al., 2017). On the other 109 hand, LMM considers grouping/clustering of variables; enabling a better understanding of the 110 temporal changes of a dependent variable (Gelman and Hill, 2006; Magezi, 2015). The LMM 111 application does, however, appear to have limited capability in regards the mapping and modeling 112 113 of NO<sub>2</sub> concentrations (Lee and Koutrakis, 2014).

Various studies have measured the concentration of atmospheric NO<sub>2</sub> in different geographical 114 settings over time and space (Herron-Thorpe et al., 2010; Ryu et al., 2019; ul-Haq et al., 2018), however 115 the majority of them have incorporated only a few factors in the modelling (Elminir, 2005; Zhou et 116 al., 2012). Only a small number of studies have focused specifically on developing countries where 117 station-based NO<sub>2</sub> monitoring data is notably lacking (Azkar et al., 2012; Bechle et al., 2013). In these 118 circumstances a comprehensive evaluation of NO<sub>2</sub> is difficult to perform due to (i) lack of station-119 based data (Bechle et al., 2013; Liu et al., 2016); (ii) spatial heterogeneity of the pollutant (Cooper et 120 al., 2020; Goldberg et al., 2021); (iii) uncertainties in various statistical and machine learning-based 121 models (Li et al., 2020; Zhang et al., 2016); and (iv) a lack of robust spatiotemporal modeling 122 approaches (Bechle et al., 2013; Vîrghileanu et al., 2020). The aim of this research, using Bangladesh 123 as the case study area, is twofold: (i) to model spatiotemporal distribution of NO<sub>2</sub> concentration 124 with high-resolution TROPOMI data; (ii) to isolate factors affecting its distribution through the 125 use of spatial linear mixed models (LMMs). 126

127

#### 128

129

# 2. Materials and methods

### 2.1. NO<sub>2</sub> pollution in Bangladesh

Bangladesh is located between latitude 20°34' and 26°38' N, and longitude 88°01' and 92°41' E in 130 South Asia (Figure 1) and has a population of 164.6 million people (BBS, 2019). The climate regime 131 is sub-tropical, with persistent humidity and precipitation controlled by a monsoonal season 132 (Mullick et al., 2019). The major cities are Dhaka, Chittagong, Rajshahi, Sylhet, Khulna, and Barisal. 133 134 Ever-increasing city populations, as well as essentially uncontrolled urbanization, has resulted in many environmental issues. This includes heavy traffic congestion and severe air pollution (Rana 135 and Khan, 2020). Almost 33% of total population of the country lives in cities, with a 2.92% decadal 136 growth of urban population (DoE, 2018). 137

Bangladesh is considered one of the most polluted countries in the world (Kurata et al., 2020). Every year, it experiences a loss of approximately 200–800 million US\$ due to air pollution, especially in the major cities (Azkar et al., 2012). Emissions from motor vehicles and industrial discharges are major sources of such pollution (Islam et al., 2020). The level of pollution is increasing every year, so damage to lives and resources has become a common feature. As a result, the country is struggling to meet widely accepted, WHO-defined air quality standards (Rana and Khan, 2020).

Researchers commonly employ discrete methods to produce various air pollution scenarios. Salam 144 et al. (2008) used in-situ observations to measure the distribution of gaseous pollutants in Dhaka 145 city. To simulate the severity of air pollutants in Bangladesh, Azkar et al. (2012) used Weather 146 Research and Forecasting (WRF) - Community Multiscale Air Quality Model (CMAQ) model, 147 incorporating data from a limited number of stations. Sadia et al. (2019) measured PM<sub>2.5</sub> and NO<sub>2</sub> 148 concentrations in Dhaka using five locations. Rahman et al. (2019) used data from three monitoring 149 stations to assess trace gases during different seasons. Islam et al. (2019) utilized OMI data to 150 measure aerosol optical properties for more than 15 years. A recent study employed TROPOMI 151 data to evaluate changes in four air pollutants (e.g., NO<sub>2</sub>, SO<sub>2</sub>, CO, and O<sub>3</sub>) in regard COVID-19 152 lockdown policies (Rahman et al., 2020). 153

There were only 11 Department of Environment (DoE) air quality monitoring stations operating in 154 Bangladesh from 2012 to June 2019. The accurate observation of NO<sub>2</sub> concentration is, therefore, 155 very challenging (Azkar et al., 2012; DoE, 2018). Existing studies have used only a specific city, or 156 a few sampling locations, to evaluate NO<sub>2</sub> pollution (Rahman et al., 2019; Sadia et al., 2019), meaning 157 that studies on spatiotemporal patterns of NO<sub>2</sub> concentration at the national level, in relation to 158 anthropogenic and environmental factors, are few and far between. Existing studies could also not 159 quantify temporal variations in NO<sub>2</sub> pollution (ul-Haq et al., 2018) due to the absence of high-160 resolution data. This study attempts to rectify these shortcomings. 161



# 169 **2.2. TROPOMI data**

This study used Sentinel 5P TROPOMI data to monitor spatial and temporal variations of NO2 170 concentration. The tropospheric vertical column density (VCD) dataset of NO<sub>2</sub> was obtained 171 through the Google Earth Engine (GEE) platform (Gorelick et al., 2017). The dataset has a spatial 172 resolution of 0.01 arc-degree. This study utilized preprocessed level 3 (L3) products, which were 173 produced by Quality Assurance (QA) filtering (pixels with QA value <75% were removed) (Eskes 174 et al., 2019). The L3 NO<sub>2</sub> VCD data for 12 months (July 2018 - June 2019) were retrieved, based 175 on periods common to both TROPOMI and the in-situ NO<sub>2</sub> data. TROPOMI NO<sub>2</sub> data are available 176 for different times of the day. A reducer function was used (JavaScript code) in the GEE platform 177 to batch-process time-series data for a month. This was then aggregated to derive the mean monthly 178 VCD of NO<sub>2</sub>. In this function, a scale argument was used for co-registering all monthly grids. The 179 images were subsequently exported to GeoTIFF for further analyses. 180

181

Variable	Resolution	Unit	Data source
Tropospheric NO <sub>2</sub> vertical column density	0.01 arc degree	mol/m <sup>2</sup>	Sentinel-5 Precursor Offline https://scihub.copernicus.eu/
Ambient NO <sub>2</sub> concentration	-	ppb	Department of Environment (DoE), Bangladesh http://case.doe.gov.bd/
Enhanced vegetation index (EVI)	1 km	-	MOD13A2 https://lpdaac.usgs.gov/products/mod13a2v006/
Windspeed	2.5 arc minutes	m/s	Monthly Climate Grid http://www.climatologylab.org/terraclimate.html
Rainfall amount	0.1 arc degrees	mm/hr	Global precipitation measurement (GPM) (v6) https://disc.gsfc.nasa.gov/datasets/GPM_3IMERG M_06/summary
Maximum temperature	-	٥C	Bangladesh Meteorological Department (BMD) http://live3.bmd.gov.bd/
Relative humidity	-	%	Bangladesh Meteorological Department (BMD) http://live3.bmd.gov.bd/
Population density	3 arc second	people/grid	WorldPop Global Project Population Data https://www.worldpop.org/
Location of industrial activity	-	-	HOTOSM Bangladesh Buildings https://www.hotosm.org/ https://data.humdata.org/dataset/hotosm_bgd_build ings

182 Table 1 Datasets used in this study

183

184

#### 186 **2.3.** In-situ data

Many studies have reported a strong correlation between satellite and ground-based NO2 187 observations (Bechle et al., 2013; Li et al., 2020; Tzortziou et al., 2018). A short photochemical life 188 makes atmospheric NO<sub>2</sub> strongly associated with local emissions caused by anthropogenic forcing 189 (Goldberg et al., 2021). For this study, air quality observation data from 11 monitoring stations was 190 obtained from the Department of Environment (DoE) of Bangladesh and used to estimate the 191 degree of alignment between the terrestrial and in-situ observations. The DoE had previously 192 installed air quality monitoring stations across the country (Figure 1) as part of the Clean Air and 193 Sustainable Environment (CASE) project. Three monitoring stations were located in Dhaka, two 194 were in Chittagong, and Gazipur, Naravangonj, Khulna, Rajshahi, Sylhet, and Barisal each had 195 one (DoE, 2018). These stations were installed in urban centers with a population in excess of 196 197 500,000. The chemiluminescence method was used for evaluating the NO<sub>2</sub> concentrations in the air. Monthly NO<sub>2</sub> concentration was measured in parts per billion (ppb) (http://case.doe.gov.bd/). 198

199 200

### 2.4. Indicators of NO<sub>2</sub> concentration

A variety of environmental and anthropogenic parameters influence the degree of tropospheric air 201 pollution in any specific area (Bernard et al., 2001). Existing studies have used various combinations 202 of indicators to examine the association between NO2 and factors (Cichowicz et al., 2017; Elminir, 203 2005; Fallmann et al., 2016; Gorai et al., 2015; Kwak et al., 2017; Ryu et al., 2019; Zheng et al., 2019). 204 This study has selected seven indicators based on an extensive literature review. These are: 205 206 enhanced vegetation index (EVI), wind speed (WS), rainfall, maximum temperature, relative humidity, population, and distance to industrial locations (Table 1). Raster maps of the seven 207 indicators were generated at a 1 km grid to align with the TROPOMI data. 208

Ryu et al. (2019) indicated that an increase in vegetation cover can reduce NO<sub>2</sub> concentrations. The 209 MOD13A2 EVI product (Didan, 2015) was used in this study to examine this factor. Cloud-free 210 EVI pixels were utilized to obtain monthly means. The local wind speed determines how fast 211 pollutants are transported from their point of origin (Gorai et al., 2015). Monthly WS data were 212 collected from TerraClimate (Abatzoglou et al., 2018). This has a resolution of 2.5 arcmin and is 213 measured in meters per second (m/s). For this study the WS data was converted to kilometers per 214 hour (km/hr). Kwak et al. (2017) concluded that fluctuations in rainfall intensity can either have a 215 positive or negative effect on NO<sub>2</sub>, so monthly rainfall data at a spatial resolution of 0.1 arc-degree 216 was acquired from GPM (Huffman et al., 2019) (Table 1). Monthly EVI, WS, and rainfall data over 217 Bangladesh from July 2018 to June 2019 were retrieved using GEE. 218

Elminir (2005) showed that variations in temperature have an impact on NO<sub>2</sub> pollution while relative

humidity is negatively related, so temperature and RH data were collected from BMD (Table 1).

221 The monthly mean of maximum temperature (MMAXT) and RH for all (e.g., 43) stations in

Bangladesh were derived using an inverse distance weighted (IDW) function (Childs, 2004).

Industrial activities and vehicular mobility can significantly influence NO<sub>2</sub> pollution, while a dense population means increased anthropogenic forcing (Zhu et al., 2019). 2019 population density data was obtained from WorldPop (www.worldpop.org) (Table 1) and resampled to a 1 km grid using a nearest neighbor resampling method. The concentration of NO<sub>2</sub> is greatest at the source of industrial emissions (Ryu et al., 2019), so all industrial locations within Bangladesh were retrieved from the HOTOSM (Table 1). Distance to industrial locations was subsequently calculated using a Euclidian distance function.

230

231

#### 2.5. Linear Mixed Models (LMMs)

Several linear mixed models (LMMs) were developed for this study incorporating VCD of NO<sub>2</sub> as
a dependent variable. EVI, rainfall, WS, MMAXT, and RH were employed as dynamic variables,
and population density and distance to industries were used as static independent variables. The
values of all dependent and independent variables were then grouped by month.

- 236
- 237

## 2.5.1. Multicollinearity testing

The existence of multicollinearity among the independent variables needs to be assessed to ensure 238 that values with high standard errors are not produced. As a check, the variance inflation factor 239 (VIF) of all independent variables was estimated (Yu et al., 2015) using an R package (Fox et al., 240 2018). VIF indicates the degree of variance if the estimated coefficients are inflated by 241 multicollinearity. Values exceeding 2.5 are a cause of concern, while a value >10 indicates 242 multicollinearity (Midi et al., 2010). In this study, the VIF value of all independent variables was 243 estimated to be less than 2.1, indicating that the variables of interest were free from 244 multicollinearity. 245

- 246
- 247 **2.5.2.** Model development

Three types of LMMs — base model, random intercept model, and random intercept and slope model — were developed (Table 2). The base model did not include any independent variables to estimate monthly changes in NO<sub>2</sub>. The two other models did incorporate independent variables in their development. The random intercept model allowed intercepts to vary by group (months), while the slopes remained fixed. In contrast, the random intercept and slope model allowed both

the intercepts and slopes to vary by group (i.e., months). Group-specific slopes and intercepts were 253 254 obtained. The Maximum Likelihood (ML) method was used for coefficient estimation. Heck et al. (2013) recommended the use of the ML method when comparing different models, and where the 255 number of observations is sufficient. An analysis of variance (ANOVA) (Rouder et al., 2016) was 256 conducted to compare the performance of different LMMs. Satterthwaite's t-test was used to 257 calculate statistical significance (p values) (Satterthwaite, 1946). An intra-class correlation 258 coefficient (ICC) was also calculated to check how much clustering could be accounted for by each 259 model (Thompson et al., 2012). 260

261

263

262 Table 2 Structures of the LMM model, employed in this study

Model	Equation	
Base model	$y_{ij} = (\alpha_{00} + \alpha_{0j}) + e$	(i)
Random intercept model	$y_{ij} = (\alpha_{00} + \alpha_{0j}) + \beta_1 MMAXT_{ij} + \beta_2 RAIN_{ij} + \beta_3 WS_{ij} + \beta_4 RH_{ij} + \beta_5 EVI_{ij} + \beta_6 POP_i + \beta_7 IND_i + e$	(ii)
Random intercept and slope model	$y_{ij} = (\alpha_{00} + \alpha_{0j}) + (\beta_1 + \mu_{1j})MMAXT_{ij} + (\beta_2 + \mu_{2j})RAIN_{ij} + (\beta_3 + \mu_{3j})WS_{ij} + (\beta_4 + \mu_{4j})RH_{ij} + \beta_5EVI_{ij} + \beta_6POP_i + \beta_7IND_i + e$	(iii)

where,  $y_{ij} = log[VCD \text{ of } NO_2]_{ij}$  is log of the tropospheric NO<sub>2</sub> column number density 264 (normalized to 0-1 scale), observed in the *i*<sup>th</sup> grid in month *j*;  $\alpha_{00}$  is the fixed intercept and  $\alpha_{0i}$  is 265 month specific random intercept; MMAXT<sub>ii</sub>, RAIN<sub>ii</sub>, WS<sub>ii</sub>, RH<sub>ii</sub> and EVI<sub>ii</sub> are monthly mean of 266 maximum temperature, rainfall, WS, RH and EVI observed in the *i*<sup>th</sup> grid in month *j* (normalized 267 to 0-1 scale);  $POP_i = log[Population density]_i$  is the  $i^{th}$  grid (normalized to 0-1 scale);  $IND_i$  is 268 the Euclidean distance of the  $i^{th}$  grid from nearest industrial activity (normalized to 0-1 scale); 269  $\beta_1 \sim \beta_7$  are fixed slopes for dependent variables;  $\mu_1 \sim \mu_7$  are random slopes and they are month 270 specific; and e represents residual error. 271

All data were nested into 12 groups, each group representing an individual month. The primary database was initially used without any kind of data transformation, however some of the models failed to converge due to the high volume of data and the complexity of the models. Sauzet et al. (2013) had recommended the use of LMM in the modelling only when convergence was achieved. To resolve this issue, the highly skewed variables (e.g., NO<sub>2</sub> and population) were log-transformed. Monthly mean rainfall data was converted to mm/day for ease of operation and normalization was 278 performed to rectify the issue of differing variable scales. Iterative trial and error operations were

then conducted until all models converged.

280

#### 281 **2.5.3.** Model hypotheses

The development of the models used multiple hypotheses to explain the relationship between potential factors and NO<sub>2</sub> concentration. The hypotheses of this study were:

- 1. An abundance of healthy vegetation reduces NO<sub>2</sub> pollution.
- 2852. The mean maximum temperature has a positive correlation. The relationship can also be286 temporally negative.
- 287 3. An increase in the amount of rainfall reduces  $NO_2$  concentration.
- 288 4. The pattern of the relationship between wind speed and VCD of NO<sub>2</sub> varies at monthly289 scale.
- 5. Relative humidity is negatively correlated with the accumulation of tropospheric NO<sub>2</sub>.
- 6. The higher the population density, the greater the NO<sub>2</sub> concentration is.
- 292 7.  $NO_2$  pollution tends to be lower in areas where distance to industrial locations is higher.
- 293

# **3. Results**

# **3.1.** Distributions of atmospheric NO<sub>2</sub> and its indicators

296 Density plots, descriptive statistics of atmospheric NO<sub>2</sub> and the seven indicators are shown in Figure 2. The distribution of two variables (e.g., NO<sub>2</sub> and population density) was positively 297 skewed (Figure 2 a, g). The annual mean of NO<sub>2</sub> was found to be  $0.9 \times 10^{-4}$  mol/m<sup>2</sup> for the whole 298 of Bangladesh. The mean of maximum temperature and relative humidity was 31.05 °C and 299 76.12%, respectively (Figure 2 c, e), indicating that a warm humid climate prevailed during the 300 study period. Win speed variability was high, ranging from 0.36 to 15.84 km/hr (Figure 2 h). EVI 301 ranged from -0.19 to 0.98 with a mean of 0.33 (Figure 2 b). In the case of monthly precipitation, a 302 number of areas received a maximum rainfall of 1.51 mm/hr (Figure 2 d), while some areas did 303 not receive any rainfall. The highest population density was found to be 1682 with a standard 304 deviation of 25.65 people/km<sup>2</sup> (Figure 2 g). A total of 680 industrial locations were recorded, with 305 almost half of these located in the districts of Dhaka and Naravanganj. 306

- 307
- 308
- 309
- 310
- 311





Figure 2 Density plot and descriptive statistics of: (a) VCD of NO<sub>2</sub>; (b) Enhanced vegetation index; (c)
Mean maximum temperature; (d) Rainfall; (e) Relative humidity; (f) Windspeed; (g) Population density;
(h) Industrial locations

#### 318

## **3.2.** Distribution of NO<sub>2</sub> concentrations

#### 319 **3.2.1.** Monthly variation

The spatial variability of NO<sub>2</sub> concentration in Bangladesh in each month (July 2018 to June 2019) 320 is shown in Figure 3. Elevated concentrations were observed between September 2018 and March 321 2019. The central part of Bangladesh (particularly the capital city of Dhaka and its surroundings) 322 was characterized by higher NO<sub>2</sub> concentrations than the rest of the country. The district-wise 323 tropospheric NO<sub>2</sub> is shown in Figure 4. Pollutant concentrations were greatest in November 2018. 324 The mean concentration was over  $0.9 \times 10^{-4}$  mol/m<sup>2</sup> in the 5% of the total country area, with the 325 highest value being 5.03  $\times 10^{-4}$  mol/m<sup>2</sup> in the central region (Dhaka and Narayangani districts) 326 (Table S1, Figure 4). 327

- 328 During July to August 2018, and in April 2019, however, the NO<sub>2</sub> concentration was  $<0.3 \times 10^{-1}$
- $^{4}$ mol/m<sup>2</sup> over more than two-thirds of the country, with only 0.33% of the country recording more
- than  $0.9 \times 10^{-4}$  mol/m<sup>2</sup> NO<sub>2</sub> in August 2018. It should be noted that NO<sub>2</sub> concentrations in India
- influence the atmospheric conditions of western Bangladesh, particularly the Chapai Nawabganj
- and Rajshahi districts. Chittagong district, the commercial capital of the country, experienced only
- a moderate level of NO<sub>2</sub> in the atmosphere in March 2019 (Figure 4).





Figure 3 Spatial distribution of tropospheric NO<sub>2</sub> concentration over Bangladesh, 2018-2019





## 342 **3.2.2.** Comparison between satellite and ground-based measurements

Satellite-derived monthly observed NO<sub>2</sub> was plotted against in-situ field data (see Figure 5). This yielded a coefficient of determination ( $r^2$ ) of 0.67, indicating a good correlation between the two datasets (i.e., in-situ versus satellite). This provides evidence that tropospheric NO<sub>2</sub> can be used as a proxy for ambient NO<sub>2</sub>.



Figure 5 Correlation between in-situ and TROPOMI-based NO<sub>2</sub>

- 347
- 348
- 349
- 350 351

## **3.3.** Factors influencing NO<sub>2</sub>

A series of linear mixed models (LMMs) were developed to diagnose factors affecting variations 352 in atmospheric NO<sub>2</sub>. Table 3 presents a comparative performance of six LMMs. Results show that 353 14.4% of the variation of the dependent variable could be accounted for by the base model. In 354 contrast, the ICC value increased to 0.174 in Model 2, suggesting that indicators showing clustering 355 effects were more accurate in describing NO<sub>2</sub>. Results also showed positive intercept values for all 356 357 months (Supplementary Table S2), indicating the presence of atmospheric  $NO_2$  across the year. This model did, however, produce a low value for various performance indicators (e.g., p-value) 358 (Table 3). The relationship between monthly atmospheric NO<sub>2</sub> concentration and environmental 359 variables (e.g., MMAXT, RAIN, WS, RH, and EVI), (Supplementary Fig. S2-S6) was examined 360 to identify variables for the random effect models. Supplementary Fig. S2 (a-d) shows the monthly 361 changes in the relationship between NO<sub>2</sub> and environmental factors. Models 3-6 were developed 362

- to allow both intercepts and slopes to vary by month. The interaction between NO<sub>2</sub> and EVI did
- not vary much by month (Supplementary Fig. S6), so other environmental variables such as RH,
- 365 MMAXT, RAIN, and WS were added incrementally to model 3-6 Model 6 outperformed all others
- 366 (see Table 3), as shown by the low residual standard deviation, so Model 6 was employed to
- determine the effects of various factors on NO<sub>2</sub> distribution in the study area.
- 368

## 369 Table 3 Performance of different LMM models with ANOVA

Model	ID	Equation	Performance indicators	Indicator values
Base specification	Model 1	y ~ 1 + (1   Month)	N. parameters Log-likelihood AIC BIC ICC chi-square	3 1945338 -3890670 -3890633 0.144
Fixed effect model with all independent variables included	Model 2	$y \sim 1 + MMAXT + RAIN$ + WS + RH + EVI + POP + IND + (1   Month)	N. parameters Log-likelihood AIC BIC ICC chi-square ANOVA test <i>vs</i> Model 1	10 2358620 -4717221 -4717097 0.174 826565 <2e <sup>-16***</sup>
Random effect model with only RH slope	Model 3	y ~ 1 + MMAXT + RAIN + WS + RH + EVI + POP + IND + (1 + RH   Month)	N. parameters Log-likelihood AIC BIC ICC chi-square ANOVA test <i>vs</i> Model 2	12 2389421 -4778818 -4778670 0.805 61601 <2e <sup>-16</sup> ***
Random effect model with RH and MMAXT slope	Model 4	$y \sim 1 + MMAXT + RAIN$ + WS + RH + EVI + POP + IND + (1 + RH + MMAXT   Month)	N. parameters Log-likelihood AIC BIC ICC chi-square ANOVA test <i>vs</i> Model 3	15 2419413 -4838796 -4838611 0.858 59984 <2e <sup>-16***</sup>
Random effect model with RH, MMAXT and RAIN slope	Model 5	$\label{eq:starsest} \begin{array}{l} y \sim 1 + MMAXT + RAIN \\ + WS + RH + EVI + POP \\ + IND + (1 + RH + \\ MMAXT + RAIN \mid Month) \end{array}$	N. parameters Log-likelihood AIC BIC ICC chi-square ANOVA test <i>vs</i> Model 4	19 2436430 -4872822 -4872588 0.807 34034 <2e <sup>-16</sup> ***
Random effect model with RH, MAMXT, RAIN and WS slope	Model 6	$y \sim 1 + MMAXT + RAIN$ + WS + RH + EVI + POP + IND + (1 + RH + MMAXT + RAIN + WS   Month)	N. parameters Log-likelihood AIC BIC ICC chi-square ANOVA test <i>vs</i> Model 5	24 2507269 -5014490 -5014194 0.817 141677 <2e <sup>-16***</sup>

Significant codes: 0 \*\*\*\* 0.001 \*\*\* 0.01 \*\* 0.05 \*. 0.1 \* 1

MMAXT = Mean maximum temperature; RAIN = Rainfall amount; WS = Windspeed; RH = Relative humidity; EVI = Enhanced vegetation index; POP = log of population density; IND = Euclidean distance from nearby industrial location

Table 4 summarizes fixed intercept effects of the differing factors. Of the seven independent 371 372 variables, five were deemed to be statistically significant. Rainfall and WS were flagged as insignificant, indicating that the annual mean value of these parameters had a low level of influence 373 on NO<sub>2</sub>. Among the significant variables, both MMAXT and population density had a positive 374 influence, i.e., one unit increase in population density (log-transformed) is likely to increase NO2 375 by 3.83% [10\*(exp(0.25)\*100%-100%)/(10\*Max value of log(POP))]. However, the negative 376 coefficients of RH, EVI, and distance to industry indicated that an increase in these variables would 377 decrease NO<sub>2</sub>. For instance, one unit increase in EVI could potentially decrease NO<sub>2</sub> by 35.68% 378 [10\*(exp(-0.0356)\*100%-100%)/Max value of EVI]. EVI represents vegetation condition, so an 379 increase in healthy vegetation is likely to decrease NO<sub>2</sub> pollution. 380

381

382 Table 4 Fixed effects of different factors on NO<sub>2</sub>

Term	Coefficient	Standard error	<i>p</i> -value	Confidence interval (95%)	
				Low	High
Intercept	0.487	0.033	5.04e-09 ***	0.422	0.553
MMAXT	0.148	0.083	0.098-	-0.014	0.31
RAIN	0.183	0.329	0.589	-0.462	0.827
WS	-0.054	0.065	0.425	-0.182	0.074
RH	-0.187	0.044	0.0011 **	-0.273	-0.101
EVI	-0.036	0.0004	<2e-16 ***	-0.036	-0.035
POP	0.250	0.0005	<2e-16 ***	0.249	0.251
IND	-0.115	0.0004	< 2e-16 ***	-0.115	-0.114
C:	0 (***) 0 001 (**)	0.01 (*) 0.05 ( )	01671		

**383** Significant codes: 0 \*\*\*\* 0.001 \*\*\* 0.01 \*\* 0.05 • 0.1 \* 1

384

Estimates of the random effects of the four indicators (RH, MMAXT, rainfall, and WS) on NO<sub>2</sub> is summarized in Table 5. Although annual mean values of rainfall and WS were statistically insignificant (Table 4), the monthly variation was significant and had a month-specific effect on the temporal change in NO<sub>2</sub> (Table 5). Variation in RH and MMAXT was also evident with the deviations of RH positive in four different months (April, May, July, and August), and negative in other months (Table 5).

391

Term	Parameters	Jul-18	Aug-18	Sep-18	Oct-18	Nov-18	Dec-18	Jan-19	Feb-19	Mar-19	Apr-19	May-19	Jun-19
	Coefficient	-0.244*	-0.119*	-0.001	0.026*	-0.075*	0.005*	0.038*	-0.006*	-0.018*	0.003	0.212*	0.179*
Intercent	Standard error	0.004	0.005	0.006	0.003	0.002	0.002	0.001	0.002	0.002	0.003	0.004	0.006
intercept	Lower bound (95%)	-0.252	-0.130	-0.013	0.020	-0.079	0.002	0.036	-0.010	-0.021	-0.004	0.204	0.166
	Upper bound (95%)	Jul-18         Aug-18         Sep-18         Oct-18         Nov-18         Dec-18         Jan-19         Feb-19         Mar-19         Apr-19         N           -0.244*         -0.119*         -0.001         0.026*         -0.075*         0.005*         0.038*         -0.006*         -0.018*         0.003         0.002         0.001         0.002         0.002         0.002         0.001         0.002         0.002         0.002         0.001         0.002         0.002         0.002         0.001         -0.013         0.002         0.002         0.003         -0.001         -0.004         0.002         0.003         -0.015         0.010         -0.004         0.003         -0.015         0.011         0.032         -0.071         0.008         0.011         -0.003         -0.014*         -0.003         -0.015*         0.011         0.033         0.022         0.002         0.003         0.002         0.003         0.002         0.003         0.002         0.003         0.002         0.003         0.002         0.003         0.002         0.003         0.002         0.003         0.002         0.003         0.002         0.003         0.003         0.003         0.003         0.003         0.003         0.003	0.221	0.191									
	Coefficient	0.053*	0.048*	-0.085*	-0.271*	-0.080*	-0.003	-0.074*	-0.045*	0.327*	0.233*	0.021*	-0.125*
DU	Standard error	0.005	0.004	0.004	0.003	0.002	0.002	0.002	0.003	0.002	0.003	0.004	0.006
КП	Lower bound (95%)	0.044	0.039	-0.093	-0.276	-0.083	-0.007	-0.078	-0.051	0.324	0.227	0.012	-0.136
	Upper bound (95%)	0.062	0.057	-0.076	-0.265	-0.076	0.001	-0.070	-0.040	0.330	0.239	0.029	-0.113
	Coefficient	0.318*	0.154*	0.054*	0.349*	0.561*	-0.452*	-0.308*	0.006*	-0.136*	-0.185*	-0.220*	-0.141*
MMAYT	Standard error	0.004	0.005	0.006	0.004	0.004	0.003	0.003	0.003	0.003	0.003	0.003	0.004
MINIAAI	Lower bound (95%)	0.311	0.144	0.042	0.342	0.552	-0.458	-0.313	0.000	-0.142	-0.190	-0.225	-0.150
	Upper bound (95%)	0.325	0.164	0.066	0.357	0.569	-0.446	-0.302	0.012	-0.130	-0.180	-0.215	-0.133
	Coefficient	-0.173*	-0.343*	-0.208*	-0.050*	-2.220*	2.550*	1.670*	0.492*	-0.613*	-0.590*	-0.290*	-0.233*
<b>D</b> Λ IN	Standard error	0.002	0.002	0.003	0.003	0.039	0.045	0.085	0.005	0.010	0.006	0.002	0.002
KAIN	Lower bound (95%)	-0.176	-0.346	-0.214	-0.055	-2.300	2.470	1.510	0.482	-0.633	-0.601	-0.294	-0.236
	Upper bound (95%)	-0.169	-0.339	-0.202	-0.045	-2.140	2.640	1.840	0.503	-0.593	-0.578	-0.286	-0.230
	Coefficient	-0.053*	-0.079*	0.068*	-0.040*	-0.488*	0.371*	0.425*	0.090*	-0.041*	-0.041*	-0.174*	-0.039*
WC	Standard error	0.001	0.002	0.002	0.002	0.003	0.002	0.002	0.003	0.002	0.001	0.001	0.002
VV 3	Lower bound (95%)	-0.056	-0.082	0.064	-0.044	-0.494	0.367	0.422	0.085	-0.045	-0.044	-0.176	-0.042
	Upper bound (95%)	-0.051	-0.075	0.073	-0.035	-0.482	0.375	0.428	0.095	-0.037	-0.039	-0.172	-0.036

# 393Table 5 Random effects of different factors on NO2

\* Significant at 95% confidence level

Month	Intercept	MMAXT	RAIN	WS	RH	EVI	POP	IND
Jul-18	0.244	0.466	0.010	-0.107	-0.134	-0.036	0.250	-0.115
Aug-18	0.368	0.302	-0.160	-0.133	-0.139	-0.036	0.250	-0.115
Sep-18	0.486	0.202	-0.026	0.014	-0.272	-0.036	0.250	-0.115
Oct-18	0.513	0.497	0.133	-0.094	-0.458	-0.036	0.250	-0.115
Nov-18	0.412	0.709	-2.037	-0.542	-0.266	-0.036	0.250	-0.115
Dec-18	0.493	-0.304	2.737	0.317	-0.189	-0.036	0.250	-0.115
Jan-19	0.526	-0.160	1.855	0.371	-0.261	-0.036	0.250	-0.115
Feb-19	0.481	0.154	0.675	0.036	-0.232	-0.036	0.250	-0.115
Mar-19	0.469	0.012	-0.431	-0.095	0.140	-0.036	0.250	-0.115
Apr-19	0.491	-0.037	-0.407	-0.095	0.046	-0.036	0.250	-0.115
May-19	0.700	-0.072	-0.107	-0.228	-0.166	-0.036	0.250	-0.115
Jun-19	0.666	0.007	-0.051	-0.093	-0.312	-0.036	0.250	-0.115

395 Table 6 Mixed effects of factors on NO<sub>2</sub> concentration

396

The combined effects of environmental and anthropogenic factors on NO<sub>2</sub> were also examined (see 397 Table 6). Both fixed and random effects were integrated. In this study, the mixed effect is important 398 399 mostly for MMAXT and RH, because they have shown a significant relationship. The combined 400 effect of MMAXT is evident during the winter months of December and January and monsoon months of April and May, when MMAXT negatively influenced NO<sub>2</sub>, although the relationship 401 was positive for other months. RH was significant as a fixed and random effect term (except for 402 December). Examining the mixed effects, it can be noted that RH had a negative influence on NO<sub>2</sub> 403 concentration when the annual average RH was greater than 71%. As the slopes of EVI, population 404 density, and distance from the nearby industry do not vary, their coefficient values are the same 405 for each month (Table 6). The relationship between rainfall and NO<sub>2</sub> also varied throughout the 406 study period with a negative correlation observed during the two monsoon months (July and 407 October) and three winter months (December, January, and February). WS had a negative 408 influence on NO<sub>2</sub> concentration in most months. 409

410

#### 411 **4. Discussion**

In this study, several LMMs (linear mixed model) were developed to examine the spatiotemporal 412 patterns of atmospheric NO2 and the factors influencing NO2 pollution. Results revealed good 413 alignment between satellite-derived and in-situ-based NO<sub>2</sub> values. This appeared primarily due to 414 the fine resolution of the TROPOMI data. A similar result was observed in research undertaken in 415 other areas (Cooper et al., 2020; Goldberg et al., 2021). The mixed-effect analyses showed that the 416 month-specific relationships were statistically significant between NO<sub>2</sub>, and the differing climatic 417 variables used. These findings are in accord with Elminir (2005), who reported that ambient 418 419 temperature, in general, is positively correlated with NO<sub>2</sub> concentration, though the correlation coefficients may vary temporarily. The mean maximum temperature across Bangladesh was less 420

than 28 °C during December and January, when the temperature was found to be negatively 421 422 correlated with NO<sub>2</sub>. In an examination of the seasonality of air pollution, Cichowicz et al. (2017) found that a lower temperature in the winter months can lead to an increase in NO<sub>2</sub> levels. Work 423 by Kwak et al. (2017) showed that with an increase in rainfall, NO<sub>2</sub> concentration can either increase 424 or decrease. In the present study, results of the combined mixed effect models revealed that rainfall 425 was positively correlated with NO<sub>2</sub> in October but negatively correlated in November. Further 426 investigation revealed the existence of a positive correlation, especially in large cities (e.g., Dhaka 427 and Chittagong) during July when rainfall intensity is usually very high (Shahid, 2011). Kwak et al. 428 (2017) showed that this feature may be related to city traffic volume which tends to increase with 429 heavy rainfall events. In the case of three winter months however (December, January, and 430 February), this variable also had a positive association, despite a lower rainfall intensity. In general 431 432 an inverse relationship is apparent between precipitation and NO<sub>2</sub> concentration during the summer and rainy seasons. This agrees with Ahmad et al. (2011). The relationship between NO2 433 concentration and RH is also in accord with Elminir (2005). The contrasting relationship between 434 RH and NO<sub>2</sub>, on the other hand, may be related to the area of interest, data and methods used. 435

Zhou et al. (2012) observed that the relationship of wind speed with NO<sub>2</sub> can vary, depending on 436 the wind direction. In Bangladesh, the direction of wind fluctuates seasonally (Khan et al., 2004), 437 so its influence on the dispersal of NO<sub>2</sub> varies. In this study, wind speed (as a random term) was 438 found to be significant. The month-specific relationship between wind speed and NO2 439 concentration were obvious. The wind speed in winter is relatively low compared to the wind speed 440 during summer (Khan et al., 2004). Low wind speeds result in the slow dispersal of pollutants, and 441 therefore NO<sub>2</sub> can be readily deposited within the emission source area. During winter, when wind 442 speed slightly increases, pollutants in the wind get transported to nearby areas from industrial sites. 443 As a result, wind speed showed a positive correlation during December, January, and February. 444 This finding is in accord with Ryu et al. (2019). 445

Sahsuvaroglu et al. (2006) detected a high level of NO<sub>2</sub> pollution in the vicinity of industrial 446 establishments in research conducted in Hamilton, Canada. This supports the findings in the current 447 work. The greater the distance of an area from an industry, the lower is the concentration of NO<sub>2</sub>. 448 For instance, NO<sub>2</sub> concentration over Mirpur area of Dhaka city was  $3.22 \times 10^{-4}$  mol/m<sup>2</sup> during 449 November 2018. Relocating industries 500 m outward from their current position could reduce the 450 mean monthly concentration of NO<sub>2</sub> in the Mirpur area by 46%. Lamsal et al. (2013) reported a 451 positive association between urban population size and NO<sub>2</sub> concentration in the United States, 452 Europe, China, and India. This also agrees with the current study. The present work noted that 453 population density was positively related to NO<sub>2</sub>, and agrees with work by Ryu et al. (2019). This 454

research also noted that vegetation acts as a reduction factor in regards pollutants such as NO<sub>2</sub>.
NDVI was used in this previous work. The current work uses EVI, due to the tendency for NDVI
to saturate. EVI has a higher degree of sensitivity to the regional variation of green footprints
(Zhang et al., 2016). Kumari et al. (2021) observed a negative correlation between NO<sub>2</sub> and EVI which
agrees with the current study results; that higher vegetation cover (denoted by EVI) played a strong
role in reducing NO<sub>2</sub> pollution. Indications are that a unit increase in EVI could reduce NO<sub>2</sub>
concentrations by 35.68%.

462

## 463 **5.** Conclusion

In this study, space-time variations of tropospheric vertical column density (VCD) of NO<sub>2</sub> over 464 Bangladesh for the period July 2018 to June 2019 were examined using TROPOMI satellite data. 465 The influence of environmental and anthropogenic factors on NO<sub>2</sub> was investigated using linear 466 mixed models (LMMs). Results indicated that the monthly variability in NO<sub>2</sub> concentrations was 467 associated with meteorological factors. Month-specific variability of maximum temperature, 468 469 relative humidity, rainfall, and wind speed were used in modelling the NO<sub>2</sub> concentration fluctuations. Monthly average maximum temperature and relative humidity were the main factors 470 affecting monthly variations in NO<sub>2</sub> readings. It was observed that an increase in rainfall during 471 the monsoon season could result in either an increase, or a decrease, in observed NO<sub>2</sub>. Conversely 472 during the winter, industrial and vehicular emissions seemed to affect the distribution of ambient 473 NO<sub>2</sub>, possibly due to the effect of low rainfall. High maximum temperatures can either have a 474 positive or negative relationship with NO2, and are dependent on the time of year. In general, NO2 475 concentrations tended to decrease with an increase in temperature. 476

This study has a number of limitations. There is likely to be a strong relationship between traffic volume and the accumulation of NO<sub>2</sub>. Gridded data on traffic volume throughout Bangladesh are not available, however, so it was not possible to include this variable in the current work. Updated data from DoE air monitoring stations were also not available. Lastly, wind direction as a variable was not considered. Further research is recommended.

Despite the limitations noted above, several suggestions for reducing NO<sub>2</sub> concentrations can be put forward as a result of this work. TROPOMI data can be used, as an alternative to ground-based measurements, to detect the monthly distribution of air pollutants such as NO<sub>2</sub>. Using monthly variations in the climatic variables noted, it may become easier to accurately predict NO<sub>2</sub> concentrations in the different regions. Public awareness can be raised, and citizens encouraged to adopt protective measures such as the use of face masks during the months when air pollution is predicted to be a problem. Air is ubiquitous, and is impossible to be contained by any bounding

structure. Emissions from neighboring countries can create a nuisance so transboundary air quality 489 490 agreements should be in place. A month-specific green tax can be imposed on industries where pollutant emissions are high. Districts with high urbanization rates and high population density 491 normally have high traffic volumes and associated high vehicle emissions. The current study 492 indicates that a decrease in population density could reduce the extent of NO<sub>2</sub> pollution. 493 Decentralization can play two key roles in this regard. Firstly, decentralizing industries and 494 associated activities from major cities could lower population pressure on their surroundings. 495 Secondly, relocating industries from cities would also reduce pollutant concentrations. Increasing 496 the green footprint in urban areas, and use of biophilic designs, can also result in decreased NO<sub>2</sub> 497 pollution. These policy suggestions are applicable not only to Bangladesh, but also to other 498 developing countries that have cities experiencing air pollution problems. 499

500

#### 501 **6. References**

- Abatzoglou, J.T., Dobrowski, S.Z., Parks, S.A., Hegewisch, K.C., 2018. TerraClimate, a high-resolution
  global dataset of monthly climate and climatic water balance from 1958-2015. Scientific Data 5.
- Aggarwal, A., Toshniwal, D., 2019. Detection of anomalous nitrogen dioxide (NO2) concentration in urban
  air of India using proximity and clustering methods. Journal of the Air & Waste Management
  Association 69, 805-822.
- Ahmad, S.S., Biiker, P., Emberson, L., Shabbir, R., 2011. Monitoring nitrogen dioxide levels in urban areas
  in Rawalpindi, Pakistan. Water, Air, & Soil Pollution 220, 141-150.
- Atkinson, R.W., Butland, B.K., Anderson, H.R., Maynard, R.L., 2018. Long-term concentrations of
  nitrogen dioxide and mortality. Epidemiology 29, 460-472.
- Azkar, M.M.B.I., Chatani, S., Sudo, K., 2012. Simulation of urban and regional air pollution in Bangladesh.
  Journal of Geophysical Research. Atmospheres 117.
- BBS, 2019. Bangladesh Statistics 2019. Bangladesh Bureau of Statistics (BBS), Ministry of Planning,
  Dhaka, Bangladesh.
- Bechle, M.J., Millet, D.B., Marshall, J.D., 2013. Remote sensing of exposure to NO2: Satellite versus
  ground-based measurement in a large urban area. Atmospheric Environment 69, 345-353.
- Bernard, S.M., Samet, J.M., Grambsch, A., Ebi, K.L., Romieu, I., 2001. The potential impacts of climate
  variability and change on air pollution-related health effects in the United States. Environmental
  health perspectives 109, 199-209.
- Biswal, A., Singh, T., Singh, V., Ravindra, K., Mor, S., 2020. COVID-19 lockdown and its impact on
   tropospheric NO<inf>2</inf> concentrations over India using satellite-based data. Heliyon 6.
- 522 Childs, C., 2004. Interpolating surfaces in ArcGIS spatial analyst. ArcUser, July-September 3235, 569.
- 523 Cichowicz, R., Wielgosiński, G., Fetter, W., 2017. Dispersion of atmospheric air pollution in summer and
   524 winter season. Environmental Monitoring and Assessment 189.

- 525 Cooper, M.J., Martin, R.V., McLinden, C.A., Brook, J.R., 2020. Inferring ground-level nitrogen dioxide
  526 concentrations at fine spatial resolution applied to the TROPOMI satellite instrument.
  527 Environmental Research Letters 15, 104013.
- Davis, R.E., Kalkstein, L.S., 1990. Development of an automated spatial synoptic climatological
   classification. International Journal of Climatology 10, 769-794.
- 530 Didan, K., 2015. MOD13A2 MODIS/Terra Vegetation Indices 16-Day L3 Global 1km SIN Grid V006
  531 [Data set]. NASA EOSDIS Land Processes DAAC.
- Dix, B., de Bruin, J., Roosenbrand, E., Vlemmix, T., Francoeur, C., Gorchov-Negron, A., McDonald, B.,
  Zhizhin, M., Elvidge, C., Veefkind, P., 2020. Nitrogen oxide emissions from US oil and gas
  production: Recent trends and source attribution. Geophysical Research Letters 47,
  e2019GL085866.
- 536 DoE, 2018. Ambient Air Quality in Bangladesh. Department of Environment (DoE), Ministry of
  537 Environment, Dhaka, Bangladesh.
- Duncan, B.N., Prados, A.I., Lamsal, L.N., Liu, Y., Streets, D.G., Gupta, P., Hilsenrath, E., Kahn, R.A.,
  Nielsen, J.E., Beyersdorf, A.J., Burton, S.P., Fiore, A.M., Fishman, J., Henze, D.K., Hostetler, C.A.,
- 540 Krotkov, N.A., Lee, P., Lin, M., Pawson, S., Pfister, G., Pickering, K.E., Pierce, R.B., Yoshida, Y.,
- Ziemba, L.D., 2014. Satellite data of atmospheric pollution for U.S. air quality applications:
  Examples of applications, summary of data end-user resources, answers to FAQs, and common
  mistakes to avoid. Atmospheric Environment 94, 647-662.
- El-Assi, W., Salah Mahmoud, M., Nurul Habib, K., 2017. Effects of built environment and weather on bike
  sharing demand: a station level analysis of commercial bike sharing in Toronto. Transportation 44,
  546 589-613.
- Elminir, H.K., 2005. Dependence of urban air pollutants on meteorology. Science of the Total Environment
  350, 225-237.
- ESA, 2018. TROPOMI Level 2 Nitrogen Dioxide total column products. Version 01. European Space
  Agency (ESA).
- Eskes, H., Van Geffen, J., Boersma, F., Eichmann, K., Apituley, A., Pedergnana, M., Sneep, M., Veefkind,
  J.P., Loyola, D., 2019. 5P TROPOMI Level-2 Product User Manual Nitrogen Dioxide Document
  Library Sentinel Online.
- Fallmann, J., Forkel, R., Emeis, S., 2016. Secondary effects of urban heat island mitigation measures on air
   quality. Atmospheric Environment 125, 199-211.
- Fox, J., Weisberg, S., Price, B., Adler, D., Bates, D., Baud-Bovy, G., Bolker, B., Ellison, S., Firth, D.,
  Friendly, M., 2018. Package 'car'.
- Gelman, A., Hill, J., 2006. Data analysis using regression and multilevel/hierarchical models. Cambridge
  university press.
- Georgoulias, A.K., Van Der, R.A.J., Stammes, P., Folkert Boersma, K., Eskes, H.J., 2019. Trends and trend
   reversal detection in 2 decades of tropospheric NO2 satellite observations. Atmospheric Chemistry
   and Physics 19, 6269-6294.

- Goldberg, D.L., Anenberg, S.C., Kerr, G.H., Mohegh, A., Lu, Z., Streets, D.G., 2021. TROPOMI NO2 in
  the United States: A detailed look at the annual averages, weekly cycles, effects of temperature, and
  correlation with surface NO2 concentrations. Earth's future 9, e2020EF001665.
- Gorai, A.K., Tuluri, F., Tchounwou, P.B., Ambinakudige, S., 2015. Influence of local meteorology and
   NO2 conditions on ground-level ozone concentrations in the eastern part of Texas, USA. Air
   Quality, Atmosphere and Health 8, 81-96.
- Gorelick, N., Hancher, M., Dixon, M., Ilyushchenko, S., Thau, D., Moore, R., 2017. Google Earth Engine:
  Planetary-scale geospatial analysis for everyone. Remote Sensing of Environment 202, 18-27.
- 571 Heck, R.H., Thomas, S.L., Tabata, L.N., 2013. Multilevel and longitudinal modeling with IBM SPSS.
  572 Routledge.
- Herron-Thorpe, F., Lamb, B., Mount, G., Vaughan, J., 2010. Evaluation of a regional air quality forecast
  model for tropospheric NO2 columns using the OMI/Aura satellite tropospheric NO2 product.
  Atmospheric Chemistry and Physics 10, 8839.
- Huffman, G.J., Stocker, E.F., Bolvin, D.T., Nelkin, E.J., Tan, J., 2019. GPM IMERG Final Precipitation L3
  1 month 0.1 degree x 0.1 degree V06, Greenbelt, MD. Goddard Earth Sciences Data and
  Information Services Center (GES DISC)
- 579
- Islam, M.N., Ali, M.A., Islam, M.M., 2019. Spatiotemporal Investigations of Aerosol Optical Properties
  Over Bangladesh for the Period 2002–2016. Earth Systems and Environment 3, 563-573.
- Islam, M.S., Tusher, T.R., Roy, S., Rahman, M., 2020. Impacts of nationwide lockdown due to COVID-19
  outbreak on air quality in Bangladesh: a spatiotemporal analysis. Air Quality, Atmosphere &
  Health, 1-13.
- Juhos, I., Makra, L., Tóth, B., 2008. Forecasting of traffic origin NO and NO2 concentrations by Support
   Vector Machines and neural networks using Principal Component Analysis. Simulation Modelling
   Practice and Theory 16, 1488-1502.
- 588 Khan, M., Iqbal, M., Mahboob, S., 2004. A wind map of Bangladesh. Renewable energy 29, 643-660.
- Kumari, M., Somvanshi, S.S., Zubair, S., 2021. Estimation of Air Pollution Using Regression Modelling
  Approach for Mumbai Region, Maharashtra, India, Remote Sensing and GIScience. Springer, pp.
  229-247.
- Kurata, M., Takahashi, K., Hibiki, A., 2020. Gender differences in associations of household and ambient
  air pollution with child health: Evidence from household and satellite-based data in Bangladesh.
  World Development 128, 104779.
- Kwak, H.-Y., Ko, J., Lee, S., Joh, C.-H., 2017. Identifying the correlation between rainfall, traffic flow
  performance and air pollution concentration in Seoul using a path analysis. Transportation research
  procedia 25, 3552-3563.
- Lamsal, L., Martin, R., Parrish, D., Krotkov, N., 2013. Scaling relationship for NO2 pollution and urban
   population size: a satellite perspective. Environmental science & technology 47, 7855-7861.

- Lee, H., Liu, Y., Coull, B., Schwartz, J., Koutrakis, P., 2011. A novel calibration approach of MODIS AOD
  data to predict PM 2.5 concentrations. Atmospheric Chemistry and Physics 11, 7991-8002.
- Lee, H.J., Koutrakis, P., 2014. Daily ambient NO2 concentration predictions using satellite ozone
   monitoring instrument NO2 data and land use regression. Environmental science & technology 48,
   2305-2311.
- Li, T., Wang, Y., Yuan, Q., 2020. Remote Sensing Estimation of Regional NO2 via Space-Time Neural
  Networks. Remote Sensing 12, 2514.
- Liu, C., Henderson, B.H., Wang, D., Yang, X., Peng, Z.-r., 2016. A land use regression application into
  assessing spatial variation of intra-urban fine particulate matter (PM2. 5) and nitrogen dioxide
  (NO2) concentrations in City of Shanghai, China. Science of The Total Environment 565, 607-615.
- Lorente, A., Boersma, K., Eskes, H., Veefkind, J., Van Geffen, J., de Zeeuw, M., van der Gon, H.D., Beirle,
  S., Krol, M., 2019. Quantification of nitrogen oxides emissions from build-up of pollution over
  Paris with TROPOMI. Scientific reports 9, 1-10.
- Magezi, D.A., 2015. Linear mixed-effects models for within-participant psychology experiments: an
  introductory tutorial and free, graphical user interface (LMMgui). Frontiers in psychology 6, 2.
- Melamed, M.L., Schmale, J., von Schneidemesser, E., 2016. Sustainable policy—Key considerations for
  air quality and climate change. Current opinion in environmental sustainability 23, 85-91.
- Midi, H., Sarkar, S.K., Rana, S., 2010. Collinearity diagnostics of binary logistic regression model. Journal
  of Interdisciplinary Mathematics 13, 253-267.
- Mullick, M.R.A., Nur, R.M., Alam, M.J., Islam, K.A., 2019. Observed trends in temperature and rainfall in
   Bangladesh using pre-whitening approach. Global and planetary change 172, 104-113.
- Nemet, G.F., Holloway, T., Meier, P., 2010. Implications of incorporating air-quality co-benefits into
  climate change policymaking. Environmental Research Letters 5, 014007.
- Novotny, E.V., Bechle, M.J., Millet, D.B., Marshall, J.D., 2011. National satellite-based land-use
  regression: NO2 in the United States. Environmental science & technology 45, 4407-4414.
- Omrani, H., Omrani, B., Parmentier, B., Helbich, M., 2020. Spatio-temporal data on the air pollutant
  nitrogen dioxide derived from Sentinel satellite for France. Data in brief 28, 105089.
- Rahman, M.M., Mahamud, S., Thurston, G.D., 2019. Recent spatial gradients and time trends in Dhaka,
  Bangladesh, air pollution and their human health implications. Journal of the Air & Waste
  Management Association 69, 478-501.
- Rahman, M.S., Azad, M.A.K., Hasanuzzaman, M., Salam, R., Islam, A.R.M.T., Rahman, M.M., Hoque,
  M.M.M., 2020. How air quality and COVID-19 transmission change under different lockdown
  scenarios? A case from Dhaka city, Bangladesh. Science of The Total Environment, 143161.
- Rana, M.M., Khan, M.H., 2020. Trend Characteristics of Atmospheric Particulate Matters in Major Urban
  Areas of Bangladesh. Asian Journal of Atmospheric Environment (AJAE) 14.
- Rouder, J.N., Engelhardt, C.R., McCabe, S., Morey, R.D., 2016. Model comparison in ANOVA.
  Psychonomic Bulletin & Review 23, 1779-1786.

- Ryu, J., Park, C., Jeon, S.W., 2019. Mapping and Statistical Analysis of NO2 Concentration for Local
  Government Air Quality Regulation. Sustainability 11, 3809.
- Sadia, H.-E., Jeba, F., Uddin, M.Z., Salam, A., 2019. Sensitivity study of plant species due to traffic emitted
  air pollutants (NO 2 and PM 2.5) during different seasons in Dhaka, Bangladesh. SN Applied
  Sciences 1, 1377.
- Sahsuvaroglu, T., Arain, A., Kanaroglou, P., Finkelstein, N., Newbold, B., Jerrett, M., Beckerman, B.,
  Brook, J., Finkelstein, M., Gilbert, N.L., 2006. A land use regression model for predicting ambient
  concentrations of nitrogen dioxide in Hamilton, Ontario, Canada. Journal of the Air & Waste
  Management Association 56, 1059-1069.
- Salam, A., Hossain, T., Siddique, M., Alam, A.S., 2008. Characteristics of atmospheric trace gases,
  particulate matter, and heavy metal pollution in Dhaka, Bangladesh. Air Quality, Atmosphere &
  Health 1, 101.
- 649 Satterthwaite, F.E., 1946. An approximate distribution of estimates of variance components. Biometrics
  650 bulletin 2, 110-114.
- Sauzet, O., Wright, K., Marston, L., Brocklehurst, P., Peacock, J., 2013. Modelling the hierarchical structure
  in datasets with very small clusters: a simulation study to explore the effect of the proportion of
  clusters when the outcome is continuous. Statistics in medicine 32, 1429-1438.
- Shah, V., Jacob, D.J., Li, K., Silvern, R.F., Zhai, S., Liu, M., Lin, J., Zhang, Q., 2020. Effect of changing
  NO x lifetime on the seasonality and long-term trends of satellite-observed tropospheric NO 2
  columns over China. Atmospheric Chemistry and Physics 20, 1483-1495.
- Shahid, S., 2011. Trends in extreme rainfall events of Bangladesh. Theoretical and applied climatology 104,
  489-499.
- Shikwambana, L., Mhangara, P., Mbatha, N., 2020. Trend analysis and first time observations of sulphur
  dioxide and nitrogen dioxide in South Africa using TROPOMI/Sentinel-5 P data. International
  Journal of Applied Earth Observation and Geoinformation 91, 102130.
- Spicer, C.W., Kenny, D.V., Ward, G.F., Billick, I.H., 1993. Transformations, lifetimes, and sources of NO2,
  HONO, and HNO3 in indoor environments. Air & Waste 43, 1479-1485.
- Thompson, D.M., Fernald, D.H., Mold, J.W., 2012. Intraclass correlation coefficients typical of clusterrandomized studies: estimates from the Robert Wood Johnson Prescription for Health projects. The
  Annals of Family Medicine 10, 235-240.
- Tzortziou, M., Parker, O., Lamb, B., Herman, J.R., Lamsal, L., Stauffer, R., Abuhassan, N., 2018.
  Atmospheric Trace Gas (NO2 and O3) variability in South Korean coastal waters, and implications
  for remote sensing of coastal ocean color dynamics. Remote Sensing 10, 1587.
- ul-Haq, Z., Rana, A.D., Tariq, S., Mahmood, K., Ali, M., Bashir, I., 2018. Modeling of tropospheric NO2
  column over different climatic zones and land use/land cover types in South Asia. Journal of
  Atmospheric and Solar-Terrestrial Physics 168, 80-99.

- Vîrghileanu, M., Săvulescu, I., Mihai, B.-A., Nistor, C., Dobre, R., 2020. Nitrogen Dioxide (NO2) Pollution
   Monitoring with Sentinel-5P Satellite Imagery over Europe during the Coronavirus Pandemic
   Outbreak. Remote Sensing 12, 3575.
- Wang, Y., Tao, J., Cheng, L., Yu, C., Wang, Z., Chen, L., 2019. A Retrieval of Glyoxal from OMI over
  China: Investigation of the Effects of Tropospheric NO2. Remote Sensing 11, 137.
- 678 WHO, 2014. 7 million premature deaths annually linked to air pollution. World Health Organization
- 679 Wu, S., Huang, B., Wang, J., He, L., Wang, Z., Yan, Z., Lao, X., Zhang, F., Liu, R., Du, Z., 2021.
- Spatiotemporal mapping and assessment of daily ground NO2 concentrations in China using highresolution TROPOMI retrievals. Environmental Pollution 273, 116456.
- Ku, J., Xie, H., Wang, K., Wang, J., Xia, Z., 2020. Analyzing the spatial and temporal variations in
  tropospheric NO 2 column concentrations over China using multisource satellite remote sensing.
  Journal of Applied Remote Sensing 14, 014519.
- Yu, H., Jiang, S., Land, K.C., 2015. Multicollinearity in hierarchical linear models. Social science research
  53, 118-136.
- Zhang, T., Gong, W., Wang, W., Ji, Y., Zhu, Z., Huang, Y., 2016. Ground level PM2. 5 estimates over
  China using satellite-based geographically weighted regression (GWR) models are improved by
  including NO2 and enhanced vegetation index (EVI). International journal of environmental
  research and public health 13, 1215.
- Zheng, C., Zhao, C., Li, Y., Wu, X., Zhang, K., Gao, J., Qiao, Q., Ren, Y., Zhang, X., Chai, F., 2018. Spatial
  and temporal distribution of NO2 and SO2 in Inner Mongolia urban agglomeration obtained from
  satellite remote sensing and ground observations. Atmospheric environment 188, 50-59.
- Zheng, Z., Yang, Z., Wu, Z., Marinello, F., 2019. Spatial Variation of NO2 and Its Impact Factors in China:
   An Application of Sentinel-5P Products. Remote Sensing 11, 1939.
- Zhou, Y., Brunner, D., Hueglin, C., Henne, S., Staehelin, J., 2012. Changes in OMI tropospheric NO2
  columns over Europe from 2004 to 2009 and the influence of meteorological variability.
  Atmospheric Environment 46, 482-495.
- Zhu, Y., Xie, J., Huang, F., Cao, L., 2020. Association between short-term exposure to air pollution and
   COVID-19 infection: Evidence from China. Science of the total environment, 138704.
- 701 Zhu, Y., Zhan, Y., Wang, B., Li, Z., Qin, Y., Zhang, K., 2019. Spatiotemporally mapping of the relationship
- between NO2 pollution and urbanization for a megacity in Southwest China during 2005–2016.
  Chemosphere 220, 155-162.