



This is a repository copy of *Glacial trimlines to identify former ice margins and subglacial thermal boundaries : a review and classification scheme for trimline expression.*

White Rose Research Online URL for this paper:
<https://eprints.whiterose.ac.uk/165973/>

Version: Accepted Version

Article:

Rootes, C.M. and Clark, C.D. orcid.org/0000-0002-1021-6679 (2020) Glacial trimlines to identify former ice margins and subglacial thermal boundaries : a review and classification scheme for trimline expression. *Earth-Science Reviews*, 210. 103355. ISSN 0012-8252

<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.earscirev.2020.103355>

Article available under the terms of the CC-BY-NC-ND licence
(<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/>).

Reuse

This article is distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivs (CC BY-NC-ND) licence. This licence only allows you to download this work and share it with others as long as you credit the authors, but you can't change the article in any way or use it commercially. More information and the full terms of the licence here: <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/>

Takedown

If you consider content in White Rose Research Online to be in breach of UK law, please notify us by emailing eprints@whiterose.ac.uk including the URL of the record and the reason for the withdrawal request.



eprints@whiterose.ac.uk
<https://eprints.whiterose.ac.uk/>

1 Glacial trimlines to identify former ice margins and subglacial
2 thermal boundaries: a review and classification scheme for
3 trimline expression

4
5 Camilla M. Rootes and Chris D. Clark*

6
7 Department of Geography, University of Sheffield, Sheffield, S10 2TN, UK.

8
9 *Corresponding author: Department of Geography, University of Sheffield, Sheffield, S10
10 2TN, UK Email: C.Clark@sheffield.ac.uk

11
12 **Abstract**

13 Reconstructions of former ice sheets and glaciers provide important palaeoglaciological
14 information about their behaviour in response to climate changes. Glacial trimlines
15 record both the margin positions and palaeo ice thickness, enabling the production of
16 empirically constrained 3-Dimensional reconstructions. However, the literature review into
17 the characteristics, interpretation, and use of glacial trimlines here presented shows
18 that these features have been under-utilised and are poorly described in the existing
19 literature, with a confusing terminology currently in use. A new classification scheme
20 and terminology for trimline identification and interpretation is developed to better
21 facilitate further research into these common features of glacierised and formerly
22 glaciated landscapes.

23
24 **Keywords:** trimline; trim-line; trim line; ice margin; geomorphology; glacial
25 reconstruction

1 **1. Introduction**

2 The former extent of glaciers, ice caps and ice sheets can often be reconstructed by
3 plotting evidence of their margin positions by using moraines, ice-marginal fans or the
4 limit of glacial deposits. Such evidence defines the former spatial footprint of the ice
5 mass saying little about its thickness or vertical extent. On mountain flanks however,
6 it is sometimes possible to define the former vertical extent of ice cover as marked
7 by linear traces across hillslopes and which have been termed glacial trimlines. In its
8 simplest idealisation, glacier flow eroded away vegetated hillslopes ‘trimming’ them such
9 that a clear limit of the glacier is left behind to be observed once the ice receded
10 (Figure 1). Due to their ability to record both the horizontal and vertical dimensions
11 of palaeo ice masses, glacial trimlines are important for the production of 3-dimensional
12 (3D) reconstructions (Ballantyne 2010). This permits calculation of the ice volume and
13 computation of the changes in ice thickness and volume between different glacial
14 events or time periods and comparison with climate records. Additionally, 3D
15 reconstructions are useful for testing and refining numerical modelling of ice masses,
16 which are then used to better understand modern ice masses and predict their
17 responses to on-going climate changes.

18 Despite the usefulness of glacial trimlines they have mostly been reported on a case-
19 by-case basis, with little systematic exploration of their formation, expression and
20 morphology, and their preservation and distribution. Here we review the literature
21 surrounding glacial trimlines and identify areas of conflict as well as under-researched
22 aspects of these features. A discussion of the origins, development and usage of
23 trimline terminology in the literature identifies a confusing and ambiguous set of terms
24 currently in use. We therefore propose a new definition for ‘glacial trimline’, as well as
25 a suggested classification scheme to assist with their identification and usage. The
26 applications of glacial trimlines in reconstructions of Quaternary and more recent historic
27 glacial events (e.g. the Little Ice Age) will also be explored and the distribution of
28 trimline studies globally summarised. The unexplored potential of trimlines will be
29 highlighted.

30 **2. What is a trimline?**

31 This question is more complex than it may first appear due to the range of different
32 glaciogenic features that have been termed ‘trimlines’, or that overlap with glacial
33 trimlines in terms of expression or usage. For example, differences in the vegetation
34 density on glacierised valley sides have been termed ‘trimlines’ (e.g. Wolken *et al.*

1 2005; Harrison *et al.* 2007; Kelley *et al.* 2012). Similarly, distinctions between zones
2 of glacial erosion compared to adjacent areas of periglacial weathering in settings of
3 Quaternary glaciation have also been called 'trimlines' (e.g. McCarroll *et al.* 1995;
4 Ballantyne *et al.* 1998b; Rae *et al.* 2004; McCarroll 2016). These breaks or contrasts
5 in surface characteristics may have formed in different ways but both arise from some
6 sort of 'trimming', can be interpreted as former ice margin positions, and may record
7 ice thickness at the time of their formation. These types of features are what has
8 been traditionally thought of as glacial trimlines and are most likely what comes to the
9 majority of researchers' minds when they hear the term.

10 However, it is also possible to view 'trimlines' as a transition area between two slope
11 zones with differing characteristics, rather than as a single linear feature. In these
12 cases, the term 'trimzone' may be used in place of or as well as 'trimline' (Figure 2;
13 e.g. Csatho *et al.* 2005; Forman *et al.* 2007; Csatho *et al.* 2008). Additionally, the
14 term 'trimline moraines' has been used for frontal features (Ó Cofaigh *et al.* 2003), in
15 contrast to the more usual usage that trimlines are features of the lateral ice margin.

16 It is rare to find an explicit definition of 'trimline' in the literature. The majority of
17 papers discussing glacial trimlines simply use the term without either giving a definition
18 or referring to a previous definition. The meaning of the term 'trimline' can vary,
19 creating ambiguity and potential confusion.

20 **2.1 Trimline manifestations**

21 Our review of the literature suggests that glacial trimlines can be expressed by a
22 variety of means, which are not mutually exclusive within a single trimline or group of
23 trimlines. Some terms previously employed in the literature have included description
24 of trimline expression, such as 'vegetation trimline' (e.g. Figure 1; Wolken *et al.* 2005;
25 Harrison *et al.* 2007; Kelley *et al.* 2012) and 'weathering limit' (e.g. Ballantyne and
26 Harris 1994; Rae *et al.* 2004; Evans *et al.* 2005; Boulton and Hagdorn 2006; Ballantyne
27 *et al.* 2009). However, many manifestations of glacial trimlines do not have explicit
28 terms and individual trimline features are rarely described in detail, making it difficult
29 to identify the full range of possible trimline manifestations or to compare the expression
30 of trimlines in different study areas. This lack of a clear understanding of the ways in
31 which trimlines can be expressed adds to the uncertainty surrounding the clear
32 identification of what constitutes a glacial trimline.

1 **2.2 Quaternary and historic trimlines**

2 For the purpose of this literature review, trimlines will be referred to by age as either
3 Quaternary or historic. Quaternary trimlines are associated with the glaciations of the
4 Quaternary geological period prior to the Little Ice Age (LIA; ca. 1300 to 1850 AD),
5 i.e. these are trimlines associated with glacial events for which we have no written
6 historical record. Conversely, historic trimlines were formed more recently, particularly
7 glacial retreat from the LIA readvance and in response to the on-going modern climate
8 change. This distinction between Quaternary and historic trimlines is made because of
9 significant differences in the methods used to research trimlines of different ages.
10 Additionally, there may be differences in the expression of historic and Quaternary
11 trimlines as well as differences in the applications of historic trimline research compared
12 to Quaternary.

13 **2.3 Trimline terminologies**

14 Efforts to identify the origin of the term 'trimline' have proved inconclusive and no
15 coining definition has been discovered. However, the term 'trimline' appears to have
16 been an established part of the research lexicon by the start of the 1950s (e.g.
17 Lawrence 1950a/b; Mathews 1951; Heusser *et al.* 1954). Prior to the 1950s, trimline
18 features were being utilised in palaeoglaciological reconstructions but without any specific
19 term applied to describe them (e.g. in Scotland by J. Geikie 1873; 1878; and in Wales by
20 Fearnside 1905). James Geikie (1873; 1878) provides an early example, possibly the
21 first, of the use of trimline features for reconstructions on Harris and South Uist in
22 Scotland. Geikie describes clear contrasts between glacial erosion in lowland areas
23 compared with summit-top frost weathering and used the altitude of these contrasts to
24 determine the ice thickness of the regional glaciation. A typical example of Geikie's
25 description of the weathering contrasts, in this case on the mountain Hecla on the
26 island of South Uist, makes it clear that these features would now be termed 'trimlines'.

27 "Nothing can be more distinct than the line of demarcation between its sharp, jagged,
28 peaked summit and its rounded, softly outlined shoulders, with their *moutonnée* surface."

29 (J. Geikie 1878, pp.851)

30 The first identifiable usage of the term 'trimline' appears in North American studies of
31 vegetation trimlines in the early 1950s (Lawrence 1950a/b; Mathews 1951; Heusser *et*
32 *al.* 1954). Lawrence provides an early definition, describing 'forest trimlines' as "the
33 line representing the maximum position attained by the ice front, where the forest was
34 sheared off [trimmed] by the ice" (1950a, pp.243). During the 1950s the term 'trimline'
35 was quickly adopted in other areas, such as Patagonia (Nicols and Miller 1951), and

1 went on to become the dominant term for these glacial features over the following
2 decades (Table 1).

3 The early North American studies used dendrochronology to date changes in vegetation
4 cover and reconstruct former ice limits, a process that was originally developed to
5 identify palaeo nunataks and test the 'glacial refugia' hypothesis (Ives 1974). In Britain
6 and Scandinavia, trimline research took a slightly different path, focused more on
7 identifying weathering contrasts and the limits of glacial erosion (McCarroll *et al.* 1995;
8 Kleman and Stroeven 1997; Ballantyne *et al.* 1997; Ballantyne *et al.* 1998b; Lamb and
9 Ballantyne 1998; Stone *et al.* 1998; Hättestrand and Stroeven 2002; Stroeven *et al.*
10 2002; Rae *et al.* 2004; Evans *et al.* 2005; Nesje *et al.* 2007; Goehring *et al.* 2008;
11 Ballantyne *et al.* 2009). The age of most recent glaciation in these areas meant that
12 there is lack of vegetation trimlines, so the identification of palaeo nunataks used the
13 distribution of streamlined glacial landforms compared to evidence of periglacial
14 weathering, particularly tors (e.g. Linton 1949; Linton 1950; Dahl 1955; Linton 1955).
15 The identification of thick periglacial deposits on mountain summits, particularly in
16 Scotland (Ballantyne 1998), was also suggested to be diagnostic of palaeo nunataks.
17 This led to the emergence of the term 'periglacial trimline' in British trimlines research
18 and the use of these features to reconstruct palaeo ice thickness, after Geikie's early
19 example (Ballantyne and Harris 1994).

20 In Scandinavia, trimline interpretation was influenced by Sugden's work on identifying
21 landscapes of differing glacial erosion and linking these to palaeo thermal regime
22 (summarised in Sugden and John 1976). Researchers applied these ideas in
23 Scandinavia (e.g. Kaitanen, 1969; Kleman and Borgström 1990; Kleman and Stroeven
24 1997) to identify areas of glacial erosion, indicating warm-based ice, and places where
25 pre-glacial landscapes were preserved under cold-based ice. Recognition of trimlines
26 within the palimpsest glacial landscapes of Scandinavia and new understandings of the
27 role of thermal regime in producing these features led to the suggestion that trimlines
28 are not always ice marginal but can sometimes indicate a boundary between areas of
29 warm- and cold-based ice beneath a former ice sheet. This discovery has led to the
30 development of a range of terms to distinguish the two possible trimline origins, such
31 as 'ice marginal trimline' (e.g. Nesje *et al.* 2007) and 'thermal trimline' (e.g. Zasadni
32 and Kłapyta 2014).

33 Previous trimline research has also discussed 'weathering zones' (e.g. Ives 1976; Ives
34 *et al.* 1976; Ives 1978; Ballantyne *et al.* 1998a; Clark, P.U. *et al.* 2003; Sugden *et al.*
35 2005; Goehring *et al.* 2008) and 'erosional zones' (e.g. Hättestrand and Stroeven 2002;

1 Nesje *et al.* 2007; Fu *et al.* 2013). It is notable that, although there are several
2 exceptions (e.g. Ballantyne *et al.* 1998a in Britain; Sugden *et al.* 2005 in Antarctica;
3 Fu *et al.* 2013 in Tibet), there appears to be a preference for using zonal terminology
4 in North American (e.g. Ives 1976; Ives *et al.* 1976; Ives 1978; Clark, P.U. *et al.*
5 2003) and Scandinavian trimline research (e.g. Hättestrand and Stroeven 2002; Nesje
6 *et al.* 2007; Goehring *et al.* 2008). Outside of these areas, trimlines are more commonly
7 referred to in a linear sense as lines, limits, boundaries or similar (Table 1; Figure 3).
8 The use of different terminology in different places is a further confusing factor that
9 complicates the discussion of glacial trimlines in the existing literature.

10 Terms like 'periglacial trimline', 'erosional trimline' and 'thermal trimline' indicate a
11 suggested interpretation, rather than solely describing the trimline expression. Similar
12 interpretative terms, such as 'glacier limit' (Sissons 1974) and 'subglacial zone'
13 (Hättestrand and Stroeven 2002), also suggest either an ice marginal or subglacial
14 interpretation for the formation of the trimline feature. Other terms, such as 'ice sheet
15 trimline' (Ballantyne *et al.* 1998a) or 'palaeo-trimline' (Hubbard *et al.* 2009), suggest
16 that the trimline is linked to a particular style of glaciation or glacial period. Still other
17 terms indicate an interpretation of the significance of a trimline feature within a given
18 study area. For example, Nesje *et al.* (2007) use the term 'regional trimline' to describe
19 the average trimline altitude across their study area. Over time there has been an
20 increasing diversity of trimline expressions that have been identified and discussed,
21 and the use of differing terms for broadly similar features can have the effect of
22 diluting the literature by causing researchers to miss papers that have used terms from
23 the other group.

24 In summary, a wide range of terms are in use to describe trimline features and these
25 are often not mutually exclusive and may be used interchangeably, creating ambiguity.
26 Additionally, there is a lack of standardisation within trimline terminologies, with different
27 terms or groups of terms used at different times and in different places (Figure 3).
28 There are several useful terms that describe a particular way in which trimlines can
29 be expressed, such as 'vegetation trimline', but many forms of trimline expression do
30 not have an appropriate descriptive term. Many of the most common terms for glacial
31 trimlines imply a degree of interpretation, rather than remaining solely descriptive. This
32 fact is often not made clear and leads to confusing and sometimes conflicting usage
33 of the established terminology. We suggest that trimline research would be improved
34 by the application of a simplified and standardised terminology that has specific

1 descriptive terms for all observable means of trimline expression and a clear distinction
2 between descriptive and interpretative terms.

3 **3. Approaches to trimline research**

4 Early research mapped and identified trimline features via extensive fieldwork (e.g.
5 Geikie 1873; 1878). However, it was immediately clear that trimlines are often more
6 visible from a distance, a fact that Geikie (1878) noted in his description of trimlines
7 in the Hebrides Islands of Scotland. Despite these observations, it was not until the
8 1980s that trimlines were mapped from secondary data. The key paper that defined a
9 method for identifying and mapping trimlines from aerial imagery was Thorp (1981),
10 who used glacial trimlines in his reconstruction of an ice cap on Rannoch Moor in
11 Scotland. Thorp's method describes best practice for using a combination of aerial
12 photographs and field mapping to identify the trimlines separating areas of glacial
13 erosion in the valleys from areas of periglacial weathering on mountain summits (Figure
14 4). The 1981 paper set the precedent for mapping trimlines using a combination of
15 aerial imagery and fieldwork observations and also established a method for linking
16 trimlines across different mountains, which was further developed by Thorp (1986,
17 1987).

18 Subsequently, several authors have applied Thorp's methods to other areas in Britain
19 and Ireland and of these the work of Ballantyne has been particularly significant
20 because of both the number of papers utilising trimlines and due to his application of
21 cosmogenic nuclide dating to trimline features (summarised in Ballantyne 2010 and
22 MacCarroll 2016). Brook et al. (1996) were the first to use cosmogenic nuclides to
23 date weathering limits, using this information to reconstruct Younger Dryas ice cover
24 in Norway. The work of Brook et al. (1996) motivated Stone et al. (1998) to apply
25 the cosmogenic nuclide method to test trimline interpretations on the Isle of Skye and
26 in the north-western Scottish Highlands. Arising from further cosmogenic exposure age
27 estimates a really major change in trimline investigations occurred when it was finally
28 demonstrated that trimlines do not necessarily record ice margin elevations but that
29 they can also arise from subglacial boundaries between erosive warm-based ice and
30 non-erosive cold-based ice at higher elevations (Figure 5). Such a shift in interpretation
31 drastically changes a reconstruction of ice sheet thickness from relatively thin ice with
32 exposed nunataks, to thicker ice with mountain summits covered. Such cosmogenic
33 dating became pivotal in the interpretation of trimlines and was able to identify examples
34 of both ice marginal and thermal trimlines (e.g. Ballantyne et al. 1998b; Stone and

1 Ballantyne 2006; Ballantyne et al. 2009; Ballantyne et al. 2011; McCormack et al.
2 2011; Fabel et al. 2012; Glasser et al. 2012; Ballantyne and Stone 2015).

3 Lately, methods of trimline mapping have been developed beyond the aerial method
4 of Thorp (1981; 1986) through the use of satellite imagery. Knight et al. (1987) showed
5 that a multispectral classification of satellite imagery could be used to identify and map
6 the changes in vegetation that mark the Little Ice Age (LIA) trimzone in Greenland.
7 Improvements in the coverage, resolution and availability of satellite imagery have
8 enabled much larger-scale trimline mapping investigations such as Glasser et al.'s
9 (2005; 2008) reconstruction of the glacial history of Patagonia using data from the
10 satellites Landsat 7 and ASTER. These larger-scale reconstructions are particularly
11 significant for validating ice sheet models.

12 Improvements in Geographic Information Science (GIS) have also led to progress in
13 trimline research by enabling more advanced processing and increasing the speed of
14 trimline mapping across large areas. An example is the work of Kelly et al. (2004),
15 who reconstructed the Last Glacial Maximum (LGM) accumulation area ice surface in
16 the Swiss Alps. They mapped trimlines in the field and compared them to a digitisation
17 of an existing reconstruction, using the trimlines to refine the accumulation area
18 geometry. This method was only possible using GIS software to combine the previous
19 reconstruction and the new accumulation area trimline evidence into a single ice surface
20 reconstruction. It is noteworthy that Kelly et al. had to assume that all the maximum
21 glaciation landforms and trimlines in their study area were synchronous. This is an
22 issue common to all regional trimline studies. At present there is no certain way to
23 determining synchronicity between trimlines, particularly in different valleys or on different
24 massifs. Wider application of cosmogenic nuclide dating may help to combat this
25 problem but the large error ranges involved in this dating method can still prevent
26 definitive establishment of synchronicity or lack thereof.

27 Improvements in satellite imagery and GIS capabilities enabled Csatho and colleagues
28 to produce a semi-automated method for mapping vegetation trimlines over large areas
29 (Csatho et al. 2005; van der Veen and Csatho 2005). Their method used multispectral
30 imagery from the Landsat 7 satellite to classify the land surface from which they were
31 able to map the LIA trimzone and associated trimline in Jakobshavn Isfjord, west
32 Greenland. Csatho et al. (2008) expanded on this initial study, utilising the same
33 method but comparing the trimline altitude with recorded ice margin positions to
34 determine rates of ice loss in the study area since the LIA. Building on the work of
35 Csatho et al., Kjeldsen et al. (2015) produced the first, and so far only, empirically

1 based 3D reconstruction of the entire Greenland Ice Sheet during the LIA. Their
2 method involved using vertical stereo photogrammetric aerial imagery to map LIA
3 trimlines in 3D and to compare them to the ice margin position at the time of the
4 photographic survey (1978-1987 AD). By extrapolating from the trimlines, they were
5 able to compute the extent and spatial distribution of ice surface elevation and volume
6 changes for the entire ice sheet between the peak of the LIA (assumed to be 1900
7 AD) and the aerial survey in 1978-1987 AD.

8 Whilst many of the approaches to trimline research are the same between Quaternary
9 and historic trimlines, there can be significant differences in the application of research
10 methods, as well as differences in the analysis and interpretation of these features
11 (Figure 6). In general, Quaternary trimline research places more emphasis on field
12 observations and analyses, compared to the greater significance of remotely sensed
13 data in historical studies. Many Quaternary trimline studies have quantified the contrast
14 in weathering across a trimline using Schmidt hammer measurements, bedrock joint
15 depth analysis and by studying the soil composition above and below the trimline (e.g.
16 McCarroll et al. 1995; Rae et al. 2004; Nesje et al. 2007; see summary of these
17 methods in McCarroll 2016). The use of X-ray diffraction clay-fraction mineralogy is
18 particularly common in Quaternary settings, especially when trying to determine if a
19 trimline is of ice marginal or thermal origin (e.g. McCarroll et al. 1995; Dahl, S.-O. et
20 al. 1996; Ballantyne 1997; Lamb and Ballantyne 1998; Ballantyne et al. 1998b;
21 Ballantyne 1998; McCarroll and Ballantyne 2000; Ballantyne and Hallam 2001; Rae et
22 al. 2004; Ballantyne et al. 2006; Ballantyne et al. 2007; Nesje et al. 2007; Ballantyne
23 et al. 2008; Ballantyne et al. 2011).

24 In historic settings the modern ice surface is often present, potentially acting as a
25 guide for reconstructing the morphology of the previous ice surface, and it is usually
26 clear whether a trimline is ice marginal or thermal in origin (Figure 6). Research into
27 historic trimlines can also make use of additional data sources that are not available
28 for Quaternary settings. For example, repeat aerial surveys and high-resolution satellite
29 imagery of some glacierised areas can allow comparison of the modern ice margin to
30 a series of trimlines and other recorded ice margin positions, which enables rates of
31 down-wasting to be computed (e.g. Harrison et al. 2007; Csatho et al. 2008; Glasser
32 et al. 2011).

33 Historic glacial limits are often recorded in paintings, sketches, documents and
34 photographs. These secondary data can provide additional ice margin positions and
35 can help to date trimlines and establish synchronicity between trimlines and other glacial

1 features. Validation studies have found these secondary data to be generally accurate
2 representations of the former ice extent (e.g. in the Alps by Nussbaumer et al. 2007
3 and Zumbühl et al. 2008). Therefore, historic reconstructions in well-documented areas
4 can be produced with higher confidence and with much more detail than is possible
5 for Quaternary reconstructions, even when the trimline record is similarly preserved.
6 However, the availability of secondary data may be contributing to the tight spatial
7 focus of historic trimlines research in well-documented areas (Figure 7).

8 It appears more common to find multiple trimlines associated with the same ice margin
9 in historic settings compared to Quaternary. This is likely to be a function of the
10 preservation potential of trimline features. For example, Forman et al. (2007) identified
11 a clear LIA vegetation trimline associated with the ice margin in the Kangerlussuaq
12 area of west Greenland but they also noticed several subtler changes in vegetation
13 cover within the LIA trimzone. These features may well be trimlines linked to standstills
14 during the post-LIA retreat of the ice margin. These subtler trimlines probably do not
15 have long-term preservation potential and may well not survive in Quaternary settings.

16 **4. How and where have trimlines been used?**

17 Quaternary trimline research has been primarily focused in the British Isles, Scandinavia
18 and in North America (Figure 7a; Table 2). However, Quaternary trimlines have also
19 been identified and studied in other locations (e.g. in the Balkans by Hughes *et al.* 2006;
20 Hughes *et al.* 2010; Ribolini *et al.* 2017; and Temovski *et al.* 2018; Figure 7d). The temporal
21 focus of Quaternary trimline research has been on the deglaciation from the Last
22 Glacial Maximum (LGM c. 21 ka BP) (e.g. Ives 1976; Ballantyne 1997; Florineth and
23 Schluchter 1998; Kaplan *et al.* 2001; Kelly *et al.* 2004; Sugden *et al.* 2005; Ballantyne
24 *et al.* 2006; Hubbard *et al.* 2006; Stone and Ballantyne 2006; Nesje *et al.* 2007;
25 Glasser *et al.* 2008). In North America and in Europe there has also been significant
26 interest in reconstructing Younger Dryas (c. 13 ka - 11 ka BP) ice limits from trimlines
27 (e.g. Thorp 1981; Thorp 1986; Bennet 1994; Ballantyne 2007). This focus on the LGM
28 and the Younger Dryas is common to all empirical Quaternary reconstructions because
29 the landform record is better preserved for these more recent glacial events compared
30 to more ancient Quaternary glaciations. However, in some locations older trimlines are
31 preserved and have been used to reconstruct glacial fluctuations over much longer
32 time periods. Older trimlines have primarily been found in areas of rugged terrain in
33 West Antarctica, such as the Ohio Range, where the glaciations of the last 200 ka
34 have been dated from trimlines and erratics (Ackert *et al.* 2011), and in the Ellsworth

1 Mountains, where a glacial trimline has been dated to at least 2 million years ago
2 and could be as old as c. 14 million years (Sugden *et al.* 2017).

3 Research into historic trimlines has been focused in the Americas and in Greenland
4 (Figure 7b; Table 2) on reconstructing the extent of the Little Ice Age readvance (LIA
5 1700-1930 AD) (e.g. McKinzey *et al.* 2004; Glasser *et al.* 2005; Wolken *et al.* 2005;
6 Forman *et al.* 2007; Csatho *et al.* 2008; Glasser *et al.* 2011). Surprisingly, little research
7 has considered the very recent trimlines exposed by the rapid glacial retreat recorded
8 over the past 100 years, although it is possible to observe these features in recent
9 and historic photographs of glaciers as well as in the field (Rootes 2018).

10 Thus far trimline research has focused predominantly on vegetation trimlines in historic
11 settings and on contrasts in glacial erosion compared to periglacial weathering in
12 Quaternary settings. This narrow focus does not include the full range of possible
13 modes of trimline expression, many of which have received little to no attention (see
14 later).

15 Given the focus on a narrow range of places, modes of trimline expression, and time
16 periods, both Quaternary and historic trimlines are probably being under-utilised at
17 present. The recent discovery of possible glacial trimlines on Mars (Gourronc *et al.*
18 2014) also raises the possibility of expanding the use of these landforms into extra-
19 terrestrial settings. Exploration of a wider range of modes of trimline expression may
20 also prove fruitful, as could further consideration of associated landforms, such as
21 lateral moraines, which have not generally come under the 'trimline' umbrella but that
22 can be used in similar ways and are often found alongside other glacial trimline
23 expressions (e.g. Ives 1976; Clark, P.U. *et al.* 2003; Glasser *et al.* 2005; 2008; Hormes
24 *et al.* 2008; Carrivick *et al.* 2019). These features may benefit from consideration as
25 a type of glacial trimline, alongside other trimline features.

26 For all temporal periods and all geographic locations, the ability to produce 3D
27 reconstructions using trimlines has been of particular significance. Estimates of palaeo
28 ice thickness, derived from trimlines, allow ice volume change to be computed and
29 have enabled the quantification of the sea level contribution of ice loss (e.g. Glasser
30 *et al.* 2011; Kjeldsen *et al.* 2015; Edwards *et al.* 2017). Trimline studies are also
31 utilised to test the outputs of numerical ice sheet models, a process used to validate
32 and improve the models and hence predictions of future ice sheet behaviour (e.g.
33 Dahl, S.-O. *et al.* 1996; Lamb and Ballantyne 1998; McCarroll and Ballantyne 2000;
34 Ballantyne and Hallam 2001; Hubbard *et al.* 2006; Ackert *et al.* 2007).

1 The 3D reconstructions produced from Quaternary trimlines can be used to reconstruct
2 palaeoclimate. Trimline distribution over large areas can reveal details of the surface
3 morphology of the palaeo ice mass that may indicate particular palaeo wind patterns
4 and precipitation gradients (Glasser *et al.* 2008). Palaeo equilibrium line altitude (ELA)
5 can also be derived from 3D ice surface reconstructions. The ELA is roughly equivalent
6 to the snow line altitude and, as well as being a climate proxy in itself, is also useful
7 for calculating palaeo mass balance and for studying the impact of glaciers on long-
8 term landscape evolution, due to the links between ELA position and patterns of glacial
9 erosion (Ballantyne 2007). Trimlines are particularly important for ELA reconstructions
10 because they record ice thickness and are one of the only ice marginal features that
11 can be found in the accumulation area, above the ELA (Thorp 1981; Kelly *et al.*
12 2004). An example of the use of trimlines in ELA reconstruction is van der Beek and
13 Bourbon (2008), who used trimlines to reconstruct ice thickness and palaeo ELA in
14 the French Alps in order to quantify the impact of glacial erosion on the topography
15 of the region.

16 Reconstructions produced from Quaternary trimlines can also be used to determine ice
17 thickness and volume changes (e.g. Figure 6). The use of ice marginal trimlines to
18 determine ice thickness has been termed the 'dipstick' method, in reference to engine
19 oil dipsticks in cars (Mackintosh *et al.* 2007). For example, Mackintosh *et al.* (2007)
20 looked for the upper limits of erratic distribution, which could be considered a type of
21 trimline, on a transect of mountains in Mac. Robertson Land, East Antarctica. From
22 the altitude of the erratics they were able to determine the LGM ice thickness and,
23 by comparing the trimlines to the modern ice surface, they were able to conclude that
24 there has been little thinning in the study area since the LGM. Research of this
25 'dipstick' style in Antarctica is particularly significant because of the longer landform
26 record preserved there, compared to that typically found in mid-latitude settings. This
27 allows for the production of longer-term reconstructions, which can be compared to ice
28 core climate records and to measurements of post-glacial isostatic adjustment (e.g.
29 Armienti and Baroni 1999; Ackert *et al.* 2007; Ackert *et al.* 2011; White and Fink
30 2014). These long-term linked ice thickness and climate studies are particularly important
31 for testing and empirically constraining ice sheet models (e.g. Ackert *et al.* 2011).

32 In addition to ice marginal trimlines, research into the Quaternary trimlines of
33 Scandinavia and the BIIS has identified examples of palaeo thermal boundaries, for
34 example in the Caithness area of northern Scotland (Ballantyne and Hall 2008). Thermal
35 trimlines such as these are less applicable for reconstructing ice volume loss but

1 instead provide useful information about the distribution of warm-based and cold-based
2 ice at the base of the ice sheet (Goodfellow 2007; Kleman and Glasser 2007; Sugden
3 *et al.* 2005; Baroni *et al.* 2008; in Tibet: Fu *et al.* 2013). This information can also
4 be used to test numerical ice sheet models and can shed light on patterns of glacial
5 erosion and ice flow pathways (Boulton and Hagdorn 2006).

6 As well as testing numerical models, Quaternary trimline reconstructions have also
7 been used to validate satellite measurements. An example is the work of White and
8 Fink (2014), who used cosmogenically dated trimlines in East Antarctica to reconstruct
9 ice thickness and compared their results to the gravimetric measurements of the
10 GRACE satellites. This comparison allowed them to validate the satellite data and to
11 improve the outputs of isostatic adjustment models, which use the satellite's
12 measurements as input data. Without the ice thickness information recorded in
13 Quaternary trimlines, it would not be possible to carry out this kind of empirical
14 validation of GRACE isostasy measurements.

15 Historic 3D reconstructions can be produced to a higher resolution, both spatially and
16 temporally, than is possible for Quaternary reconstructions. The higher accuracy and
17 resolution of historic reconstructions mean that they may be used with greater
18 confidence for the same applications as Quaternary reconstructions. This includes
19 testing numerical ice sheet models; although historic reconstructions may not cover a
20 long enough time period to test models of lower temporal resolution or to constrain
21 longer-term experiments.

22 Where multiple historic ice margin positions are dated, from a series of glacial trimlines
23 or from documentary evidence, it is possible to calculate rates of surface-lowering
24 between ice margin positions (e.g. Figure 6; Kohler *et al.* 2007). The extent and rate
25 of surface-lowering can be compared with climate records to infer the response rate
26 and retreat style of the glacier (e.g. Navarro *et al.* 2005; Kohler *et al.* 2007). Estimates
27 of glacier response times are particularly significant for predicting local- and regional-
28 scale changes to the cryosphere in response to on-going global climate warming (Raper
29 and Braithwaite 2009). It is also possible to conduct comparison of historic volume
30 change estimates with sea level measurements at high resolutions and to use this
31 information to inform sea level forecasts (e.g. Nuth *et al.* 2007; Kjeldsen *et al.* 2015).

32 **5. Debates and issues in trimline research**

1 The early use of trimlines was for addressing the glacial refugia debate, assessing
2 whether ice free summits might have acted as refuge for flora and fauna during
3 glaciations (e.g. Ives *et al.* 1976). Trimlines were used to locate palaeo nunataks. This
4 interpretation was supported by field investigations on the relative degree of weathering
5 above and below British, Irish and Scandinavian trimlines (e.g. McCarroll *et al.* 1995;
6 Dahl, S.-O. *et al.* 1996; Ballantyne 1997; Ballantyne *et al.* 1997/ 1998a/b; Ballantyne
7 1998; Lamb and Ballantyne 1998; Stone *et al.* 1998; McCarroll and Ballantyne 2000;
8 Ballantyne and Hallam 2001; Rae *et al.* 2004; Ballantyne *et al.* 2006; Ballantyne *et al.*
9 2007; Nesje *et al.* 2007; Ballantyne *et al.* 2008; Ballantyne *et al.* 2011). These
10 investigations were used to rule out alternative hypotheses of trimline formation,
11 particularly that the trimlines represented changes in weathering conditions as ice
12 surfaces lowered during deglaciation (Ballantyne 1998). However, the relative degree
13 of weathering across a trimline was insufficient to discard a subglacial theory of trimline
14 formation; that trimlines can form at the boundary between areas of erosive warm-
15 based ice and areas of cold-based ice. To rule out the subglacial formation at thermal
16 boundaries, researchers considered the morphology of the trimlines and tended to
17 conclude in favour of an ice marginal origin. This conclusion was reached for three
18 reasons: 1) the trimlines were deemed to be too sharp to be thermal; 2) the lack of
19 an increase in trimline altitude on the stoss side of mountains compared to a decreased
20 altitude, or 'pressure shadow', on the lee side, which would have indicated the high
21 glacial velocities associated with warm-based ice; and 3) the regular decline of trimline
22 altitudes along former flow lines was thought to be diagnostic of ice marginal formation
23 (Ballantyne *et al.* 1997; Ballantyne *et al.* 1998a). The results of early cosmogenic
24 nuclide dating studies were also supportive of the ice marginal hypothesis (e.g. Stone
25 *et al.* 1998), although it was not possible to completely exclude a thermal origin.

26 The ice marginal interpretation of glacial trimlines found particular favour within the
27 community of 'small British-Irish Ice Sheet (BIIS)' proponents, who concluded that at
28 the LGM ice did not extend out to the continental shelf break (e.g. Bowen *et al.* 1986;
29 Bowen *et al.* 2002). This reconstruction required relatively thin ice cover in Scotland,
30 which would mean that many mountains remained above the ice surface as nunataks
31 (Stone *et al.* 1998). The abundance of trimlines in the west and north of Scotland
32 was taken to support the 'small BIIS' reconstruction because these features were
33 interpreted as ice marginal and therefore thought to indicate a large number of palaeo
34 nunataks (e.g. Ballantyne *et al.* 1997; Ballantyne *et al.* 1998a; Lamb and Ballantyne
35 1998).

1 Early numerical ice sheet modelling had suggested a larger BIIS, with fully submerged
2 mountains in Scotland (e.g. Boulton *et al.* 1977), indicating that the trimlines of this
3 area were of thermal origin. Later modelling utilised new understandings of the
4 deformation of sediments beneath ice sheets, which was thought to provide lower basal
5 resistance to flow and generate faster ice velocities. Increased flow rates in the new
6 models yielded a thinner ice sheet and suggested the existence of nunataks, supporting
7 the ice marginal interpretation of Scottish trimlines (Boulton *et al.* 1991; Lambeck 1993;
8 Lambeck 1995). By the 1990s empirical and modelling studies had converged in
9 support of the small BIIS theory and the interpretation of BIIS trimlines as ice marginal
10 landforms (Ballantyne 2010).

11 Meanwhile, offshore geomorphological mapping and sedimentological studies were
12 leading some authors to challenge the 'small BIIS' reconstruction and suggest that the
13 last BIIS glaciation did reach the continental shelf break (e.g. Sejrup *et al.* 2005;
14 Bradwell *et al.* 2008). This contrasting 'large BIIS' theory has been supported by a
15 new phase of trimline dating that has favoured a thermal origin for many glacial
16 trimlines, indicating a thicker and more spatially extensive ice sheet. Ballantyne and
17 Hall (2008) demonstrate this shift in trimline interpretations with their reconstruction of
18 the ice thickness in Caithness and east Sutherland, northern Scotland, using
19 cosmogenically dated trimlines. Their dates and geomorphological evidence led them
20 to identify a thermal origin for these trimlines and to suggest that the presence of
21 nunataks in the area during the LGM was unlikely. Other studies in north-west Scotland
22 have also supported the 'large BIIS' reconstruction and identified examples of thermal
23 trimlines (e.g. McCormack *et al.* 2011; Fabel *et al.* 2012).

24 Recent numerical ice sheet modelling studies have also supported the 'large BIIS'
25 theory (Boulton and Hagdorn 2006; Hubbard *et al.* 2009; Edwards *et al.* 2017). Both
26 Boulton and Hagdorn (2006) and Hubbard *et al.* (2009) modelled the entire BIIS at
27 the LGM and both studies considered the trimline evidence of western Scotland, as
28 presented by Ballantyne *et al.* (1998a), to be of vital importance in constraining the
29 accumulation area ice thickness. However, both noted that a thermal origin for these
30 trimlines was possible and neither were able to force their models to conform to the
31 ice thickness estimates produced from Scottish trimlines by Ballantyne *et al.* (1998a).
32 These modelling studies therefore concluded that Scottish trimlines in most mainland
33 locations represented palaeo thermal boundaries and were not ice marginal features.

34 Application of cosmogenic dating to new study areas has led to the identification of
35 thermal trimlines in other regions of the BIIS. For example, in Ireland (Ballantyne *et*

1 *al.* 2008; Ballantyne *et al.* 2011; Stone and Ballantyne 2015), Wales (Glasser *et al.*
2 2012) and the Lake District (Ballantyne *et al.* 2009). The thermal theory is now
3 recognised to have been the dominant process of trimline formation beneath central
4 areas of the BIIS during the LGM (Ballantyne 2010). However, trimlines associated
5 with the Younger Dryas in Britain and Ireland are still thought to be ice marginal
6 features (e.g. Stone and Ballantyne 2006) and debate continues about the correct
7 interpretation of some trimlines in areas of rugged terrain (McCarroll 2016; Clark, C.D.
8 *et al.* 2018; e.g. Barth *et al.* 2016).

9 The example of the debate surrounding BIIS trimline interpretation illustrates that both
10 ice marginal and thermal trimlines are possible and can exist within the same ice
11 mass (Ballantyne 2010). This indicates that trimlines in Quaternary settings can no
12 longer be assumed to be ice marginal features. Outside the British Isles, there has
13 been less extensive application of cosmogenic nuclide dating to Quaternary trimlines
14 and there are few areas where trimline-based reconstructions and ice sheet modelling
15 have been conducted in such close association, the European Alps being a notable
16 exception (Seguinot *et al.* 2018). However, the conclusions of BIIS trimline research
17 suggest that care must be taken when interpreting Quaternary trimlines associated with
18 the accumulation areas of ice sheets or ice caps, where the thick ice can include
19 areas of differing thermal regime.

20 At present, specific modes of trimline expression have not been demonstrated to be
21 associated with either ice marginal or thermal trimline formation. However, there may
22 be links between trimline expression and the processes of trimline formation; for
23 example, all vegetation trimlines studied so far have been identified as ice marginal
24 (e.g. Wolken *et al.* 2005; McKinzey *et al.* 2004; Kelley *et al.* 2012;). Weathering limits,
25 on the other hand, have been identified as both ice marginal (e.g. Ballantyne *et al.*
26 1997; Ballantyne *et al.* 1998a; Stone *et al.* 1998) and thermal (e.g. McCormack *et al.*
27 2011; Fabel *et al.* 2012), which perhaps indicates that these are not diagnostics of a
28 particular process of trimline formation. Further research into the factors affecting trimline
29 formation may help to explain the links between the mode of their expression and the
30 process of formation, which would assist in the distinguishing ice marginal from
31 subglacial trimlines.

32 The preservation potential of glacial trimlines has received little attention in the literature
33 but this is a factor that may be related to processes of trimline formation and could
34 influence the interpretation of glacial trimlines. It is common for the relative sharpness
35 of trimlines to be described; although this is most often used to suggest that sharper

1 trimlines are ice marginal (e.g. Ballantyne *et al.* 1997; Ballantyne *et al.* 1998a) and
2 not generally to considered to be linked to post-glacial trimline modification. Few papers
3 go into detailed discussion of the factors affecting trimline preservation in their study
4 area or into description of the relative preservation of the different modes of trimline
5 expression. A rare exception is Kelly *et al.*'s (2004) Quaternary trimline mapping in the
6 European Alps. They found that erosional trimlines were best preserved where the
7 bedrock resists weathering and that preservation is poor where bedrock is easily
8 weathered and particularly where the bedrock is layered. This finding caused them to
9 research the geology of their study area in greater detail and to use this information
10 to aide in the interpretation of their trimlines. Further research along these lines may
11 highlight other variables that affect trimline preservation and may aide in the
12 interpretation of different modes of trimline expression.

13 Research has yet to consider the possibility of trimline preservation beneath overriding
14 ice cover. However, the fact that trimlines are common components of palimpsest
15 glacial landscapes, comprising landforms from multiple glaciations, suggests that study
16 of the impact of overriding ice on trimlines may aide in the relative dating and
17 interpretation of these features.

18 It is possible that the distribution of different trimline expressions could be indicative
19 of trimline preservation potential in different climates, glaciological settings (ice marginal
20 vs subglacial) or lithologies. If patterns of different trimline expressions could be linked
21 to the period of time they have been exposed to weathering, this may allow for relative
22 dating of trimline features. Further study into trimline preservation and expression in
23 different climatic and geological settings is required to improve understandings of the
24 way that trimline expression changes through time.

25 No study has so far presented any attempt to catalogue all observable modes of
26 trimline expression or to explore patterns in the distribution of different types of glacial
27 trimline. Some existing terminology exists to describe the expression of trimlines, such
28 as 'vegetation trimline' or 'weathering limit', but many observable modes of trimline
29 expression have no specific terms and have not been considered in the literature. This
30 lack of a descriptive terminology may be hampering research into trimline distribution,
31 formation, and preservation and could be leading to an artificial focusing of work on
32 modes of trimline expression that are already well-described and associated with an
33 established terminology.

1 Establishing synchronicity between trimline features and between trimlines and other
2 associated glacial features is another proven area of difficulty. Even in a small group
3 of valleys there may be multiple separate trimlines and it is often not clear which
4 trimlines formed at the same time. On a regional scale, attempts have been made to
5 link together trimlines of assumed synchronous ages in order to reconstruct regional
6 glaciation or equilibrium line altitude positions (e.g. Kelly *et al.* 2004). However, at
7 present there is no standardised method for establishing trimline synchronicity and
8 researchers have largely relied on morphological or altitudinal similarities (Kelly *et al.*
9 2004). Studies using cosmogenic nuclide dating have linked trimlines of similar ages
10 (e.g. Ballantyne *et al.* 2007; Fabel *et al.* 2012), but the error in the dating method is
11 often too large to do this with any confidence.

12 Whilst interpreting trimline expression and problems of establishing trimline
13 synchronicity are significant, arguably the most important problems lie with the
14 underlying identification and mapping of the trimlines. There are some published
15 methods for the identification and mapping of trimlines (e.g. Thorp 1981; 1986; 1987;
16 Csatho *et al.* 2005) but these are specific to their study areas and there exists no
17 generalised guidance for good-practice in trimline mapping. Also, trimlines are often very
18 faintly expressed and can be easily confused with non-glaciogenic linear features. In
19 particular, geological strata and palaeo lake or marine shorelines can appear very
20 similar to trimlines in remotely sensed imagery and even in the field. Furthermore, the
21 limited study of the preservation potential of trimlines means that little is known about
22 how trimline expression may change through time. We suspect that many trimlines
23 may be being overlooked where they are subdued or otherwise expressed in an
24 atypical manner for their location. Better understanding of trimline formation and
25 improved mapping methods including the use of secondary data, such as geological
26 maps, alongside field validation and cosmogenic dating may allow for more confident
27 identification of glacial trimlines, particularly distinguishing them from non-glaciogenic
28 features in remotely sensed imagery, and improve the accuracy of trimline mapping.

29 In many cases, the presentation of a geomorphological map is the only clear description
30 given of individual trimlines with many not providing detailed trimline mapping, but
31 rather just marking their locations using a generic symbol (e.g. Kelly *et al.* 2004 used
32 single spots to mark individual trimline locations). Some studies present field
33 photographs of key trimlines (e.g. Kelly *et al.* 2004; Nesje *et al.* 2007; Forman *et al.*
34 2007; Glasser *et al.* 2011), but this is not standard practice. The shape and deflection
35 of trimlines in relation to local topography might contain information about the processes

1 of trimline formation and permit correlation across valleys. We suggest that good
2 practice in trimline research would be for more detailed mapping of trimlines (e.g.
3 Figure 8), and this information being presented in publications in order to aid growth
4 in knowledge of their shape and spatial properties rather than just their existence and
5 elevation.

6 The one aspect of individual trimline morphology to have been widely discussed is the
7 slope of ice marginal trimlines, which is considered when establishing trimline
8 synchronicity to reconstruct the ice surfaces across several valleys or massifs (e.g.
9 Ballantyne *et al.* 1997; Ballantyne *et al.* 1998b). Additionally, the record of ice thickness
10 gradients preserved in patterns of trimline slope has been used to deduce palaeo
11 precipitation gradients and to estimate palaeo ELA (e.g. Glasser *et al.* 2008).

12 Relative to the likely widespread distribution of trimlines (e.g. peruse Google Earth
13 images say in the Karakorum, Torngat Mountains, or around Greenland) it is obvious
14 that they have been under-studied given the limited distribution of trimlines reported in
15 the literature (Figure 7). At a regional scale, topography and geology are likely to
16 influence the distribution of trimlines due to the significant impact of these factors on
17 patterns of glacial erosion and deposition. Some authors have mentioned the impact
18 of geology on trimline expression (e.g. McCarroll *et al.* 1995; Kelly *et al.* 2004) but
19 discussion of the impact on trimline distribution tends to be limited and the impact of
20 topography has been similarly overlooked. Barring brief mention of the concentration
21 of trimlines on spurs by Thorp (1981), hardly any papers have discussed the relationship
22 between topography and trimline distribution within a study area. If further research
23 can better determine the impact of topography and geology on trimline distribution, this
24 information may be significant for the identification and mapping.

25 In summary, previous research has been largely focused on identifying, mapping and
26 interpreting glacial trimlines with a view to use these features in ice surface morphology
27 and ice thickness reconstructions. This narrow focus has led to several under-researched
28 areas, particularly: processes of trimline formation (beyond the ice marginal or thermal
29 debate); the expression of glacial trimlines; the preservation of trimline features; the
30 morphology or shape of individual trimlines; and the wider distribution of glacial trimlines.
31 These areas of research have the potential to resolve issues with identifying and
32 mapping trimlines and could also help to establish synchronicity between groups of
33 trimlines and between trimlines and other glacial features.

34

1

2 **6. A scheme for trimline definition and classification**

3 The terminology surrounding glacial trimlines is complex and non-standardised. This
4 confusion leads to a lack of clarity in their discussion and in particular the blurred
5 distinction between the description of an observable feature (trimline) and its
6 interpretation, say as an ice-marginal trimline, is not helpful. Also, the existing
7 terminology is insufficient to describe different modes of trimline expression. To mitigate
8 the above points, a new and more precise definition for the term 'glacial trimline' is
9 here suggested:

10 "Glacial trimlines are glaciogenic features expressed as a break or transition in the vegetation,
11 weathered material, erosion pattern, deposited material, or truncated slope landforms (e.g.
12 talus cones, gullies) on the slopes of a glacierised or glaciated valley."

13 The above definition of 'glacial trimline' allows room for both the concept of trimlines
14 as linear features and as areas of transition between two landsurface zones. The
15 definition also allows for both lateral and frontal trimline features – 'valley slopes' need
16 not necessarily be lateral but can also refer to the valley floor in front of a glacier or
17 former glacier. Using the above definition, a 'glacial trimline' can be of either ice
18 marginal or thermal origin; both of these processes of trimline formation are glaciogenic
19 so both can be described as 'glacial trimlines' (Figure 9).

20 However, the above definition implies a degree of interpretation to suggest that a given
21 trimline feature is glaciogenic. In order to ensure adequate separation of pure description
22 from any interpretation, the term 'apparent trimline' is suggested for a linear trace or
23 transition on the side of a glacierised or glaciated valley of unknown origin (Figure 9).

24 By distinguishing between 'apparent trimlines' and 'glacial trimlines' it is hoped that a
25 better separation between description and interpretation of trimline features can be
26 achieved. Once an apparent trimline is determined to be of glacial origin, further
27 interpretation steps can be used to identify it as an 'ice marginal trimline' or a 'thermal
28 trimline'. These terms are preferred to the various alternatives used in the literature
29 (Table 1) because their meaning is clear and their usage will provide greater
30 standardisation and clarity.

31 Glacial trimline expressions vary and have been called by a wide range of terms in
32 the literature (Table 1). In Figure 10a an attempt at summarising the observable modes

1 of glacial trimline expression is presented, alongside specific terms for each of these
2 types. Associated ice marginal features, such as lateral moraines and kame terraces, are
3 also mentioned. These features have different processes of formation to glacial trimlines
4 but their interpretation as ice marginal features and their uses in reconstructions are very
5 similar to those of glacial trimlines, so it is important that these features are kept in mind when
6 mapping and classifying trimlines.

7 By having individual terms for specific modes of glacial trimline expression it will be
8 easier to clearly describe a given trimline feature and to distinguish and compare
9 multiple glacial trimlines, as well as to use trimlines in conjunction with associated ice
10 marginal features. The classification in Figure 10a has undergone a test application to
11 the trimlines of central western Spitsbergen and was found to be both easily usable
12 and a complete classification, covering all of the observable modes of trimline expression
13 in the study area (Rootes 2018; Chapter 4). By presenting this initial classification here,
14 it is hoped further research will be stimulated that will ultimately lead to a more robust
15 and transparent terminology for glacial trimline expression.

16 **7. Conclusions**

17 Glacial trimlines are glaciogenic features expressed as a break or transition in the
18 vegetation, weathered material, erosion pattern, deposited material, or slope features
19 on the slopes of a glacierised or glaciated valley. We suggest this is a useful general
20 definition, and from our literature review have compiled a terminology that is appropriate
21 for describing different type of trimlines (Figure 10). These terms have been trialled
22 and found to work adequately in an investigation of trimlines in Svalbard (Rootes 2018;
23 Chapter 4). We suggest that adoption of a clear and standardised terminology for
24 glacial trimlines will help future research investigations and in particular, a clear
25 distinction is advisable between pure description and terms implying a degree of
26 interpretation.

27 Glacial trimlines are under-studied compared to other types of glacial geomorphological
28 features, despite their abundance and significance for the production of 3D
29 palaeoglaciological reconstructions. Trimlines are particularly important because they
30 record both the ice margin position and a measure of the ice thickness at their time
31 of formation, making them valuable empirical constraints on ice volume changes. Three-
32 dimensional reconstructions are an increasingly important output of palaeoglaciology
33 because they can be used for testing and refining numerical glacial models and they
34 can also be used to estimate the palaeo Equilibrium Line Altitude (ELA), permitting

1 inference of climate changes. Better use of glacial trimlines, therefore, has the potential
2 to improve understanding of the geomorphological signature left by glaciers in rugged
3 terrain and to increase the accuracy and confidence of 3D palaeoglacial reconstructions
4 based on this empirical evidence.

5 Overall, there has been a paucity of research into trimline features themselves,
6 particularly their formation, expression, preservation, morphology and distribution. The
7 limited picture that we have of glacial trimlines is potentially leading to inaccurate
8 interpretations of Quaternary and historic trimline features. Additionally, the narrow focus
9 of trimline research in space and time, as well as the limited range of trimline
10 expressions that have been studied, suggests that expanding the scope of trimline
11 research may be fruitful.

12 There is a large potential for further research into glacial trimlines, particularly given
13 the marked clustering of trimline research in North-West Europe and North America
14 and the lack of detailed studies in other areas (Figure 7). Examples of previously
15 unidentified trimlines in new areas are easy to find using readily available tools, such
16 as Google Earth, and some examples are given in Figure 11. Suggestions for potentially
17 fruitful study areas for future trimline research include but are not limited to: the
18 Younger Dryas in Scotland; LGM in the European Alps; LGM in the Torngat mountains
19 of Canada; and recent ice margin fluctuations in the Karakorum (e.g. Figure 11).

20

21 **Acknowledgements**

22 CMR carried out this work whilst in receipt of a PhD scholarship awarded to her by the Faculty
23 of Social Sciences at the University of Sheffield and she gratefully acknowledges this support.
24 We acknowledge helpful and constructive comments from Phillip Hughes and an
25 anonymous reviewer.

1 **Bibliography**

- 2 Aa, A.R. & Sønstegaard, E., 2019. Early-Holocene glacier fluctuations of
3 northern Grovabreen, western Norway. *The Holocene*, 29(2), pp.187–196.
- 4 Ackert, R.P. et al., 2007. Ice elevation near the West Antarctic Ice Sheet
5 divide during the last glaciation. *Geophysical Research Letters*, 34(21).
- 6 Ackert, R.P. et al., 2011. West Antarctic Ice Sheet elevations in the Ohio
7 Range: Geologic constraints and ice sheet modeling prior to the last
8 highstand. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 307(1), pp.83–93.
- 9 Ahlmann, H.W., 1919. *Geomorphological studies in Norway*, Svenska sällskapet
10 för antropologi och geografi.
- 11 Anderson, F.W. & Dunham, K.C., 1966. *The Geology of Northern Skye*:
12 FW Anderson and KC Dunham, HM Stationery Office.
- 13 Anderson, R.S., 2002. Modeling the tor-dotted crests, bedrock edges, and
14 parabolic profiles of high alpine surfaces of the Wind River Range,
15 Wyoming. *Geomorphology*, 46(1), pp.35–58.
- 16 Armienti, P. & Baroni, C., 1999. Cenozoic climatic change in Antarctica
17 recorded by volcanic activity and landscape evolution. *Geology*, 27(7), pp.617–
18 620.
- 19 Astakhov, V.I., 2018. Late Quaternary glaciation of the northern Urals: a
20 review and new observations. *Boreas*, 47(2), pp.379–389.
- 21 Aylsworth, J. & Shilts, W., 1989. Bedforms of the Keewatin ice sheet,
22 Canada. *Sedimentary Geology*, 62(2), pp.407–428.
- 23 Aylsworth, J.M. & Shilts, W.W., 1989. Glacial features around the Keewatin
24 ice divide: districts of Mackenzie and Keewatin.
- 25 Badino, F. et al., 2018. 8800 years of high-altitude vegetation and climate
26 history at the Rutor Glacier forefield, Italian Alps. Evidence of middle
27 Holocene timberline rise and glacier contraction. *Quaternary Science Reviews*,
28 185, pp.41–68.
- 29 Ballantyne, C., 1987. *Wester Ross: Field Guide*. In *Quaternary Research*
30 *Association*.
- 31 Ballantyne, C. & Gray, J., 1984. The Quaternary geomorphology of Scotland:
32 the research contribution of JB Sissons. *Quaternary science reviews*, 3(4),
33 pp.259–289.

- 1 Ballantyne, C.K., 1999a. A late Devensian Nunatak on the Knoydart
2 peninsula, NW Scotland: Implications for ice-sheet reconstruction. *The Scottish*
3 *Geographical Magazine*, 115(4), pp.319–328.
- 4 Ballantyne, C.K., 1998. Age and significance of mountain-top detritus.
5 *Permafrost and Periglacial Processes*, 9(4), pp.327–345.
- 6 Ballantyne, C.K., 1999b. An Teallach: a Late Devensian nunatak in Wester
7 Ross. *The Scottish Geographical Magazine*, 115(3), pp.249–259.
- 8 Ballantyne, C.K., 2010. Extent and deglacial chronology of the last British-
9 Irish Ice Sheet: implications of exposure dating using cosmogenic isotopes.
10 *Journal of Quaternary Science*, 25(4), pp.515–534.
- 11 Ballantyne, C.K., 1994a. Gibbsitic soils on former nunataks: implications for
12 ice sheet reconstruction. *Journal of Quaternary Science*, 9(1), pp.73–80.
- 13 Ballantyne, C.K., McCarroll, D., Nesje, A., Dahl, S.O., Stone, J.O., et al.,
14 1998. High-resolution reconstruction of the last ice sheet in NW Scotland.
15 *Terra Nova*, 10, pp.63–67.
- 16 Ballantyne, C.K., 2007. Loch Lomond Stadial glaciers in North Harris, Outer
17 Hebrides, north-west Scotland: glacier reconstruction and palaeoclimatic
18 implications. *Quaternary Science Reviews*, 26(25), pp.3134–3149.
- 19 Ballantyne, C.K., 1997. Periglacial trimlines in the Scottish Highlands.
20 *Quaternary International*, 38, pp.119–136.
- 21 Ballantyne, C.K. et al., 1997. Periglacial trimlines, former nunataks and the
22 altitude of the last ice sheet in Wester Ross, northwest Scotland. *Journal*
23 *of Quaternary Science*, 12(3), pp.225–238.
- 24 Ballantyne, C.K., 1994b. Scottish landform examples—10: the tors of the
25 Cairngorms. *The Scottish Geographical Magazine*, 110(1), pp.54–59.
- 26 Ballantyne, C.K., McCarroll, D., Nesje, A., Dahl, S.O. & Stone, J.O., 1998.
27 The last ice sheet in north-west Scotland: reconstruction and implications.
28 *Quaternary Science Reviews*, 17(12), pp.1149–1184.
- 29 Ballantyne, C.K., 1990. The Late Quaternary glacial history of the Trotternish
30 Escarpment, Isle of Skye, Scotland, and its implications for ice-sheet
31 reconstruction. *Proceedings of the Geologists' Association*, 101(3), pp.171–186.
- 32 Ballantyne, C.K., 1989. The Loch Lomond Readvance on the Isle of Skye,
33 Scotland: glacier reconstruction and palaeoclimatic implications. *Journal of*
34 *Quaternary Science*, 4(2), pp.95–108.

- 1 Ballantyne, C.K. & Hall, A.M., 2008. The altitude of the last ice sheet
2 in Caithness and east Sutherland, northern Scotland. *Scottish Journal of*
3 *Geology*, 44(2), p.169.
- 4 Ballantyne, C.K. & Hallam, G.E., 2001. Maximum altitude of late Devensian
5 glaciation on South Uist, outer Hebrides, Scotland. *Proceedings of the*
6 *Geologists' Association*, 112(2), pp.155–167.
- 7 Ballantyne, C.K. & McCarroll, D., 1997. Maximum altitude of the Late
8 Devensian ice sheet on the Isle of Rum. *Scottish Journal of Geology*,
9 33(2), pp.183–186.
- 10 Ballantyne, C.K., McCarroll, D. & Stone, J.O., 2011. Periglacial trimlines and
11 the extent of the Kerry-Cork Ice Cap, SW Ireland. *Quaternary Science*
12 *Reviews*, 30(27), pp.3834–3845.
- 13 Ballantyne, C.K., McCarroll, D. & Stone, J.O., 2007. The Donegal ice
14 dome, northwest Ireland: dimensions and chronology. *Journal of Quaternary*
15 *Science*, 22(8), pp.773–783.
- 16 Ballantyne, C.K., McCarroll, D. & Stone, J.O., 2006. Vertical dimensions
17 and age of the Wicklow Mountains ice dome, Eastern Ireland, and
18 implications for the extent of the last Irish ice sheet. *Quaternary Science*
19 *Reviews*, 25(17), pp.2048–2058.
- 20 Ballantyne, C.K. & Stone, J.O., 2015. Trimlines, blockfields and the vertical
21 extent of the last ice sheet in southern Ireland. *Boreas*.
- 22 Ballantyne, C.K., Stone, J.O. & Fifield, L.K., 2009. Glaciation and deglaciation
23 of the SW Lake District, England: implications of cosmogenic ^{36}Cl exposure
24 dating. *Proceedings of the Geologists' Association*, 120(2), pp.139–144.
- 25 Ballantyne, C.K., Stone, J.O. & McCarroll, D., 2008. Dimensions and
26 chronology of the last ice sheet in Western Ireland. *Quaternary Science*
27 *Reviews*, 27(3), pp.185–200.
- 28 Baroni, C. et al., 2018. Last glacial maximum glaciers in the Northern
29 Apennines reflect primarily the influence of southerly storm-tracks in the
30 western Mediterranean. *Quaternary Science Reviews*, 197, pp.352–367.
- 31 Baroni, C. et al., 2008. The Ricker Hills tillite provides evidence of
32 Oligocene warm-based glaciation in Victoria Land, Antarctica. *Global and*
33 *Planetary Change*, 60(3), pp.457–470.

- 1 Barth, A.M. et al., 2016. Last Glacial Maximum cirque glaciation in Ireland
2 and implications for reconstructions of the Irish Ice Sheet. *Quaternary*
3 *Science Reviews*, 141, pp.85–93.
- 4 Bayrakdar, C., Çilgin, Z. & Keserci, F., 2020. Traces of late quaternary glaciations and
5 paleoclimatic interpretation of Mount Akdağ (Alanya, 2451 m), Southwest Turkey. *Med.*
6 *Geosc. Rev.* 2, pp.135–151.
- 7 Van der Beek, P. & Bourbon, P., 2008. A quantification of the glacial
8 imprint on relief development in the French western Alps. *Geomorphology*,
9 97(1), pp.52–72.
- 10 Benn, D.I. & Evans, D.J., 2010. *Glaciers and glaciation.*, Hodder Education.
- 11 Benn, D.I. & Hulton, N.R., 2010. An Excel™ spreadsheet program for
12 reconstructing the surface profile of former mountain glaciers and ice caps.
13 *Computers & Geosciences*, 36(5), pp.605–610.
- 14 Bennett, M.R., 1994. Morphological evidence as a guide to deglaciation
15 following the Loch Lomond Readvance: a review of research approaches
16 and models. *The Scottish Geographical Magazine*, 110(1), pp.24–32.
- 17 Bentley, M.J. et al., 2006. Geomorphological evidence and cosmogenic
18 ¹⁰Be/²⁶Al exposure ages for the Last Glacial Maximum and deglaciation of
19 the Antarctic Peninsula Ice Sheet. *Geological Society of America Bulletin*,
20 118(9-10), pp.1149–1159.
- 21 Bickerdike, H. et al., 2018. The glacial geomorphology of the Loch Lomond
22 (Younger Dryas) Stadial in Britain: a review. *Journal of Quaternary Science*,
23 33(1), pp.1–54.
- 24 Bickerdike, H. et al., 2016. The glacial geomorphology of the Loch Lomond
25 Stadial in Britain: a map and geographic information system resource of
26 published evidence. *Journal of Maps*, 12(5), pp.1178–1186.
- 27 Bickerdike, H.L. et al., 2018. Glacial landsystems, retreat dynamics and
28 controls on Loch Lomond Stadial (Younger Dryas) glaciation in Britain.
29 *Boreas*, 47(1), pp.202–224.
- 30 Bierman, P.R. et al., 2015. Cold-based Laurentide ice covered New England's
31 highest summits during the Last Glacial Maximum. *Geology*, 43(12), pp.1059–
32 1062.

- 1 Bierman, P.R. et al., 1999. Mid-Pleistocene cosmogenic minimum-age limits
2 for pre-Wisconsinan glacial surfaces in southwestern Minnesota and southern
3 Baffin Island: a multiple nuclide approach. *Geomorphology*, 27(1), pp.25–39.
- 4 Bini, A., Buoncristiani, J.F., Couterrand, S., Ellwanger, D., Felber, M., Florineth, D., Graf, H.R.,
5 Keller, O., Kelly, M., Schlüchter, C., Schöneich, P. 2009. Die Schweiz während des
6 letzteiszeitlichen Maximums (LGM), karte 1:500 000. Federal Office of Topography swisstopo,
7 Wabern, Switzerland.
- 8 Bjørk, A. et al., 2018. Holocene history of the Helheim Glacier, southeast
9 Greenland. *Quaternary Science Reviews*, 193, pp.145–158.
- 10 Blomdin, R. et al., 2016. Glacial geomorphology of the Altai and Western
11 Sayan Mountains, Central Asia. *Journal of Maps*, 12(1), pp.123–136.
- 12 Blytt, A., 1876. Immigration of the Norwegian flora. *Alb. Cammermeyer*,
13 Christiania.
- 14 Boulton, G. et al., 1977. A British ice-sheet model and patterns of glacial
15 erosion and deposition in Britain. *British Quaternary Studies*, pp.231–246.
- 16 Boulton, G. & Hagdorn, M., 2006. Glaciology of the British Isles Ice
17 Sheet during the last glacial cycle: form, flow, streams and lobes. *Quaternary*
18 *Science Reviews*, 25(23), pp.3359–3390.
- 19 Boulton, G., Peacock, J. & Sutherland, D., 1991. Quaternary. *Geology of*
20 *Scotland*, 3, pp.503–543.
- 21 Bowen, D. et al., 1986. Correlation of quaternary glaciations in England,
22 Ireland, Scotland and Wales. *Quaternary Science Reviews*, 5, pp.299–340.
- 23 Bowen, D. et al., 2002. New data for the last glacial maximum in Great
24 Britain and Ireland. *Quaternary Science Reviews*, 21(1), pp.89–101.
- 25 Boyer, S.J. & Pheasant, D.R., 1974. Delimitation of weathering zones in
26 the fiord area of eastern Baffin Island, Canada. *Geological Society of*
27 *America Bulletin*, 85(5), pp.805–810.
- 28 Bradwell, T. et al., 2008. The northern sector of the last British Ice
29 Sheet: maximum extent and demise. *Earth Science Reviews*, 88(3), pp.207–
30 226.
- 31 Briner, J. et al., 2003. Last Glacial Maximum ice sheet dynamics in Arctic
32 Canada inferred from young erratics perched on ancient tors. *Quaternary*
33 *Science Reviews*, 22(5), pp.437–444.

- 1 Briner, J.P. et al., 2005. Cosmogenic exposure dating in arctic glacial
2 landscapes: implications for the glacial history of northeastern Baffin Island,
3 Arctic Canada. *Canadian Journal of Earth Sciences*, 42(1), pp.67–84.
- 4 Briner, J.P., Miller, G.H., et al., 2006. Cosmogenic radionuclides from fiord
5 landscapes support differential erosion by overriding ice sheets. *Geological
6 Society of America Bulletin*, 118(3-4), pp.406–420.
- 7 Briner, J.P., Gosse, J.C. & Bierman, P.R., 2006. Applications of cosmogenic
8 nuclides to Laurentide Ice Sheet history and dynamics. *Geological Society
9 of America Special Papers*, 415, pp.29–41.
- 10 Briner, J.P. & Swanson, T.W., 1998. Using inherited cosmogenic ^{36}Cl to
11 constrain glacial erosion rates of the Cordilleran ice sheet. *Geology*, 26(1),
12 pp.3–6.
- 13 Brook, E.J. et al., 1996. Cosmogenic nuclide exposure ages along a
14 vertical transect in western Norway: implications for the height of the
15 Fennoscandian ice sheet. *Geology*, 24(3), pp.207–210.
- 16 Brooks, A.J. et al., 2008. Postglacial relative sea-level observations from
17 Ireland and their role in glacial rebound modelling. *Journal of Quaternary
18 Science*, 23(2), pp.175–192.
- 19 Bruno, L.A. et al., 1997. Dating of Sirius Group tillites in the Antarctic
20 dry valleys with cosmogenic ^3He and ^{21}Ne . *Earth and Planetary
21 Science Letters*, 147(1), pp.37–54.
- 22 Brunsden, D., 1993. The persistence of landforms. *Zeitschrift für
23 Geomorphologie*, 93, pp.13–28.
- 24 Brynjólfsson, S.S.A. & Ingólfsson, Ó., 2014. Geomorphology and the Little
25 Ice Age extent of the Drangajökull ice cap, NW Iceland, with focus on
26 its three surge-type outlets. *Geomorphology*, 213, pp.292–304.
- 27 Campos, N., Tanarro, L.M. & Palacios, D., 2018. Geomorphology of glaciated
28 gorges in a granitic massif (Gredos range, central Spain). *Journal of Maps*,
29 14(2), pp.321–329.
- 30 Carrivick, J.L. et al., 2019. Accelerated volume loss in glacier ablation
31 zones of NE Greenland, Little Ice Age to present. *Geophysical Research
32 Letters*, 46(3), pp.1476–1484.

- 1 Carrivick, J.L. et al., 2012. Late-Holocene changes in character and behaviour
2 of land-terminating glaciers on James Ross Island, Antarctica. *Journal of*
3 *Glaciology*, 58(212), pp.1176–1190.
- 4 Chandler, B.M. et al., 2018. Glacial geomorphological mapping: A review of
5 approaches and frameworks for best practice. *Earth-Science Reviews*, 185,
6 pp.806–846.
- 7 Charalampidis, C. et al., 2018. Mass-budget anomalies and geometry signals
8 of three Austrian glaciers. *Frontiers in Earth Science*, 6, p.218.
- 9 Chiverrell, R.C. & Thomas, G.S., 2010. Extent and timing of the Last
10 Glacial Maximum (LGM) in Britain and Ireland: a review. *Journal of*
11 *Quaternary Science*, 25(4), pp.535–549.
- 12 Christoffersen, P., Piotrowski, J.A. & Larsen, N.K., 2005. Basal processes
13 beneath an Arctic glacier and their geomorphic imprint after a surge,
14 Elisebreen, Svalbard. *Quaternary Research*, 64(2), pp.125–137.
- 15 Clarhäll, A. & Kleman, J., 1999. Distribution and glaciological implications
16 of relict surfaces on the Ultevis plateau, northwestern Sweden. *Annals of*
17 *Glaciology*, 28(1), pp.202–208.
- 18 Clark, C.D. et al., 2018. BRITICE Glacial Map, version 2: a map and
19 GIS database of glacial landforms of the last British-Irish Ice Sheet. *Boreas*,
20 47(1), pp.11–e8.
- 21 Clark, C.D. et al., 2004. Map and GIS database of glacial landforms and
22 features related to the last British Ice Sheet. *Boreas*, 33(4), pp.359–375.
- 23 Clark, C.D. et al., 2012. Pattern and timing of retreat of the last British-
24 Irish Ice Sheet. *Quaternary Science Reviews*, 44, pp.112–146.
- 25 Clark, P.U. et al., 2003. Cosmogenic ^{10}Be ages of the Saglek moraines,
26 Torngat mountains, Labrador. *Geology*, 31(7), pp.617–620.
- 27 Clark, P.U., 1988. Glacial geology of the Torngat Mountains, Labrador.
28 *Canadian Journal of Earth Sciences*, 25(8), pp.1184–1198.
- 29 Clark, P.U., 1991. Landscapes of glacial erosion, Torngat Mountains, northern
30 Labrador/Ungava. *The Canadian Geographer/Le Géographe canadien*, 35(2),
31 pp.208–213.
- 32 Cockburn, H.A. & Summerfield, M.A., 2004. Geomorphological applications of
33 cosmogenic isotope analysis. *Progress in Physical Geography*, 28(1), pp.1–
34 42.

- 1 Cohen, D. et al., 2018. Numerical reconstructions of the flow and basal
2 conditions of the Rhine glacier, European Central Alps, at the Last Glacial
3 Maximum. *The Cryosphere*, 12(8), pp.2515–2544.
- 4 Csatho, B. et al., 2008. Intermittent thinning of Jakobshavn Isbrae, West
5 Greenland, since the little ice age. *Journal of Glaciology*, 54(184), pp.131–
6 144.
- 7 Csatho, B.M., Van Der Veen, C.J. & Tremper, C.M., 2005. Trimline
8 mapping from multispectral Landsat ETM+ imagery. *Géographie physique et*
9 *Quaternaire*, 59(1), pp.49–62.
- 10 Dahl, E., 1955. Biographic and geological indications of unglaciated areas
11 in Scandinavia during the glacial ages. *Bulletin of the Geological Society*
12 *of America*, 66(12), pp.1499–1520.
- 13 Dahl, E., 1992. Nunatakkeori: IV. Hvor fantes isfrie områder og hva slags
14 planter kunne leve på dem. *Blyttia*, 50, pp.23–35.
- 15 Dahl, E., 1961. Refugieproblemet og de kvartaergeologiske metodene. *Svensk*
16 *Naturvetenskap*, 14, pp.81–96.
- 17 Dahl, E., 1948. Studier over forvitringstyper i strøket Nordfjord-Sunnmøre, og
18 deres relasjon til istidene. *Norsk Geologisk Tidsskrift*, 27, pp.242–244.
- 19 Dahl, E., 1987. The nunatak theory reconsidered. *Ecological bulletins*, pp.77–
20 94.
- 21 Dahl, R., 1966a. Block fields and other weathering forms in the Narvik
22 Mountains. *Geografiska Annaler. Series A, Physical Geography*, 48(4), pp.224–
23 227.
- 24 Dahl, R., 1966b. Block fields, weathering pits and tor-like forms in the
25 Narvik Mountains, Nordland, Norway. *Geografiska Annaler. Series A. Physical*
26 *Geography*, pp.55–85.
- 27 Dahl, S.-O. et al., 1996. Maximum altitude of Devensian glaciation on the
28 Isle of Skye. *Scottish Journal of Geology*, 32, pp.107–116.
- 29 Deswal, S. et al., 2017. Late Holocene Glacier Dynamics in the Miyar
30 Basin, Lahaul Himalaya, India. *Geosciences*, 7(3), p.64.
- 31 Dyke, A.S., 1979. Glacial and sea-level history of southwestern Cumberland
32 Peninsula, Baffin Island, NWT, Canada. *Arctic and Alpine Research*, 11(2),
33 pp.179–202.

- 1 Dyke, A.S. & Prest, V.K., 1987. Late Wisconsinan and Holocene history
2 of the Laurentide ice sheet. *Géographie physique et Quaternaire*, 41(2),
3 pp.237–263.
- 4 Edwards, R. et al., 2017. Resolving discrepancies between field and modelled
5 relative sea-level data: lessons from western Ireland. *Journal of Quaternary*
6 *Science*, 32(7), pp.957–975.
- 7 Evans, D.J., 2016. Landscapes at the periphery of glacierization-Retrospect
8 and prospect. *Scottish Geographical Journal*, 132(2), pp.140–163.
- 9 Evans, D.J., Clark, C.D. & Mitchell, W.A., 2005. The last British Ice
10 Sheet: A review of the evidence utilised in the compilation of the Glacial
11 Map of Britain. *Earth Science Reviews*, 70(3), pp.253–312.
- 12 Fabel, D. et al., 2002. Landscape preservation under Fennoscandian ice
13 sheets determined from in situ produced ^{10}Be and ^{26}Al . *Earth and*
14 *Planetary Science Letters*, 201(2), pp.397–406.
- 15 Fabel, D., Ballantyne, C.K. & Xu, S., 2012. Trimlines, blockfields, mountain-
16 top erratics and the vertical dimensions of the last British-Irish Ice Sheet
17 in NW Scotland. *Quaternary Science Reviews*, 55, pp.91–102.
- 18 Fearnside, W.G. 1905. On the geology of Arenig Fawr and Moel Llyfnant. *Quarterly Journal of*
19 *the Geological Society*, 61, pp. 608-640.
- 20 Fiebig, M., Pacher, M. & Saemann, S., 2005. Trimlines and fauna in the
21 eastern Alps during the last glacial cycle. *Abhandlung Naturhistorische*
22 *Gesellschaft Nuernberg*, 45, pp.105–109.
- 23 Fjellanger, J. et al., 2006. Glacial survival of blockfields on the Varanger
24 Peninsula, northern Norway. *Geomorphology*, 82(3), pp.255–272.
- 25 Florineth, D., 1998. Surface geometry of the Last Glacial Maximum (LGM)
26 in the southeastern Swiss Alps (Graubünden) and its paleoclimatological
27 significance., 48, pp.23–37.
- 28 Florineth, D. & Schluchter, C., 1998. Reconstructing the Last Glacial
29 Maximum (LGM) ice surface geometry and flowlines in the Central Swiss
30 Alps. *Eclogae Geologicae Helvetiae*, 91(3), pp.391–407.
- 31 Forman, S.L. et al., 2007. Little ice age and neoglacial landforms at the
32 Inland Ice margin, Isunguata Sermia, Kangerlussuaq, west Greenland. *Boreas*,
33 36(4), pp.341–351.

- 1 French, H. & Guglielmin, M., 2002. Cryogenic grooves on a granite
2 nunatak, Northern Victoria Land, Antarctica. *Norsk Geografisk Tidsskrift-*
3 *Norwegian Journal of Geography*, 56(2), pp.112–116.
- 4 Fretwell, P., Smith, D. & Harrison, S., 2008. The last glacial maximum
5 British-Irish ice sheet: a reconstruction using digital terrain mapping. *Journal*
6 *of Quaternary Science*, 23(3), pp.241–248.
- 7 Fu, P. et al., 2013. Glacial geomorphology and paleoglaciation patterns in
8 Shaluli Shan, the southeastern Tibetan Plateau—Evidence for polythermal ice
9 cap glaciation. *Geomorphology*, 182, pp.66–78.
- 10 Fu, P. et al., 2019. Ice cap erosion patterns from bedrock ^{10}Be and
11 ^{26}Al , southeastern Tibetan Plateau. *Earth Surface Processes and Landforms*,
12 44(4), pp.918–932.
- 13 Geikie, J., 1873. On the glacial phenomena of the Long Island or Outer
14 Hebrides. First Paper. *Quarterly Journal of the Geological Society*, 29(1-2),
15 pp.532–545.
- 16 Geikie, J., 1878. On the Glacial Phenomena of the Long Island, or Outer
17 Hebrides. Second Paper. *Quarterly Journal of the Geological Society*, 34(1-
18 4), pp.819–870.
- 19 Geikie, J., 1874. *The Great Ice Age and Its Relation to the Antiquity*
20 *of Man*. New York: Appleton. Available at:
21 <http://ebooks.cambridge.org.eresources.shef.ac.uk/ebook.jsf?bid=CBO9781139236560>.
- 22 Gjærevoll, O., 1963. Survival of plants on nunataks in Norway during the
23 Pleistocene glaciation. In Löve, Áskell and Löve, Doris, ed. *North Atlantic*
24 *biota and their history*. Macmillian.
- 25 Gjærevoll, O. & Ryvarden, L., 1978. Botanical investigations on JAD Jensens
26 nunatakker in Greenland. *Kong. Norske Vidensk. Selsk. Skr*, (4).
- 27 Gjessing, J., 1967. Norway's paleic surface.
- 28 Glasser, N.F. et al., 2012. ^{10}Be and ^{26}Al exposure-age dating of bedrock
29 surfaces on the Aran ridge, Wales: evidence for a thick Welsh Ice Cap
30 at the Last Glacial Maximum. *Journal of Quaternary Science*, 27(1), pp.97–
31 104.
- 32 Glasser, N.F. et al., 2005. Geomorphological evidence for variations of the
33 North Patagonian Icefield during the Holocene. *Geomorphology*, 71(3), pp.263–
34 277.

- 1 Glasser, N.F. et al., 2011. Global sea-level contribution from the Patagonian
2 Icefields since the Little Ice Age maximum. *Nature Geoscience*, 4(5), pp.303–
3 307.
- 4 Glasser, N.F., 1995. Modelling the effect of topography on ice sheet
5 erosion, Scotland. *Geografiska Annaler. Series A. Physical Geography*, pp.67–
6 82.
- 7 Glasser, N.F. et al., 2008. The glacial geomorphology and Pleistocene
8 history of South America between 38 S and 56 S. *Quaternary Science*
9 *Reviews*, 27(3), pp.365–390.
- 10 Godard, A., 1965. Recherches de géomorphologie en Écosse du Nord-Ouest,
11 Publications de la Faculté des lettres de l'Université de Strasbourg.
- 12 Goehring, B.M. et al., 2008. Beryllium-10 exposure ages of erratic boulders
13 in southern Norway and implications for the history of the Fennoscandian
14 Ice Sheet. *Quaternary Science Reviews*, 27(3), pp.320–336.
- 15 Goodfellow, B., 2007. Relict non-glacial surfaces in formerly glaciated
16 landscapes. *Earth-Science Reviews*, 80(1), pp.47–73.
- 17 Gordon, J.E., 1979. Reconstructed Pleistocene ice-sheet temperatures and
18 glacial erosion in northern Scotland. *Journal of Glaciology*, 22, pp.331–344.
- 19 Gosse, J. et al., 2006. Using cosmogenic isotopes to interpret the landscape
20 record of glaciation: Nunataks in Newfoundland? *Glacier science and*
21 *environmental change*, pp.442–446.
- 22 Gourronc, M. et al., 2014. One million cubic kilometers of fossil ice in
23 Valles Marineris: Relicts of a 3.5 Gy old glacial landsystem along the
24 Martian equator. *Geomorphology*, 204, pp.235–255.
- 25 Grant, D.R., 1977. Altitudinal weathering zones and glacial limits in western
26 Newfoundland, with particular reference to Gros Morne National Park.
27 *Geological Survey of Canada Paper*, 77, pp.455–463.
- 28 Grønlie, A., 1953. Litt om Trollheimen under siste istid. *Nor. Geol. Tidsskr*,
29 32, pp.168–190.
- 30 Hall, A., 1985. Cenozoic weathering covers in Buchan, Scotland and their
31 significance. *Nature*, 315(6018), pp.392–395.
- 32 Hall, A.M. & Sugden, D.E., 1987. Limited modification of mid-latitude
33 landscapes by ice sheets: The case of northeast Scotland. *Earth surface*
34 *processes and landforms*, 12(5), pp.531–542.

- 1 Hannah, G., Hughes, P.D., Gibbard, P.L. 2017. Pleistocene plateau ice fields in the High Atlas,
2 Morocco. In: Hughes, P.D., Woodward, J.C. (Eds.) Quaternary glaciation in the Mediterranean
3 Mountains. Geological Society of London Special Publications 433. pp.25-53.
- 4 Hannesdóttir, H. et al., 2015. Variations of southeast Vatnajökull ice cap
5 (Iceland) 1650-1900 and reconstruction of the glacier surface geometry at
6 the Little Ice Age maximum. *Geografiska Annaler: Series A, Physical
7 Geography*, 97(2), pp.237–264.
- 8 Harrison, S., Winchester, V. & Glasser, N., 2007. The timing and nature
9 of recession of outlet glaciers of Hielo Patagónico Norte, Chile, from their
10 Neoglacial IV (Little Ice Age) maximum positions. *Global and Planetary
11 Change*, 59(1), pp.67–78.
- 12 Hättestrand, C. & Stroeven, A.P., 2002. A relict landscape in the centre
13 of Fennoscandian glaciation: Geomorphological evidence of minimal Quaternary
14 glacial erosion. *Geomorphology*, 44(1), pp.127–143.
- 15 Haubner, K. et al., 2018. Simulating ice thickness and velocity evolution
16 of Upernavik Isstrom 1849-2012 by forcing prescribed terminus positions in
17 ISSM. *Cryosphere*, 12(4), pp.1511–1522.
- 18 Henriksen, M. et al., 2014. Dynamics and retreat of the Late Weichselian
19 Kongsfjorden ice stream, NW Svalbard. *Quaternary Science Reviews*.
- 20 Heusser, C.J., Schuster, R.L. & Gilkey, A.K., 1954. Geobotanical studies on
21 the Taku Glacier anomaly. *Geographical Review*, 44(2), pp.224–239.
- 22 Hormes, A. et al., 2008. 10 Be exposure ages of a rock avalanche and
23 a late glacial moraine in Alta Valtellina, Italian Alps. *Quaternary International*,
24 190(1), pp.136–145.
- 25 Hubbard, A. et al., 2006. A modelling insight into the Icelandic Last
26 Glacial Maximum ice sheet. *Quaternary Science Reviews*, 25(17), pp.2283–
27 2296.
- 28 Hubbard, A. et al., 2009. Dynamic cycles, ice streams and their impact
29 on the extent, chronology and deglaciation of the British-Irish ice sheet.
30 *Quaternary Science Reviews*, 28(7), pp.758–776.
- 31 Huber, N.K., 1987. The geologic story of Yosemite national Park,
32 Hughes, P.D., 2002. Loch Lomond Stadial glaciers in the Aran and Arenig
33 Mountains, North Wales, Great Britain. *Geological Journal*, 37(1), pp.9–15.

- 1 Hughes, P.D., Woodward, J.C., Gibbard, P.L., Macklin, M.G., Gilmour, M.A., Smith G.R. 2006.
2 The glacial history of the Pindus Mountains, Greece. *Journal of Geology* 114, pp.413-434.
- 3 Hughes, P.D., Woodward, J.C., van Calsteren, P.C., Thomas, L.E., Adamson, K. 2010.
4 Pleistocene ice caps on the coastal mountains of the Adriatic Sea: palaeoclimatic and wider
5 palaeoenvironmental implications. *Quaternary Science Reviews* 29, pp.3690-3708.
- 6 Hughes, P.D. et al., 2012. Two Younger Dryas glacier phases in the
7 English Lake District: geomorphological evidence and preliminary ^{10}Be exposure
8 ages. *North West Geography*, 12(1), pp.10–19.
- 9 Hughes, P.D., Tomkins, M.D., Stimson, A.G., 2019. Late-glacial glaciers in the English Lake
10 District: a new analysis using ^{10}Be and Schmidt hammer exposure dating. *Northwest
11 Geography* 19(2), pp.8–20
- 12 Iturrizaga, L., 2018. Glacial landform assemblages and pedestal moraines in
13 the Cordillera Blanca (Peru). *Geomorphology*, 318, pp.283–302.
- 14 Ives, J., 1974. Biological refugia and the nunatak hypothesis. *Arctic and
15 alpine environments*, pp.605–636.
- 16 Ives, J., 1958a. Glacial geomorphology of the Torngat Mountains, northern
17 Labrador. *Geographical Bulletin*, 12, pp.47–75.
- 18 Ives, J., 1957. Glaciation of the Torngat mountains, northern Labrador.
19 *Arctic*, 10(2), pp.66–87.
- 20 Ives, J., 1958b. Mountain-top detritus and the extent of the last glaciation
21 in Northeastern Labrador-Ungava. *The Canadian Geographer/Le Géographe
22 canadien*, 3(12), pp.25–31.
- 23 Ives, J.D., 1975. Delimitation of surface weathering zones in eastern Baffin
24 Island, northern Labrador and arctic Norway: A discussion. *Geological Society
25 of America Bulletin*, 86(8), pp.1096–1100.
- 26 Ives, J.D., 1977. Late- and Postglacial Glacier Fluctuations and Sea Level
27 Changes in Arctic Canada. *Geografiska Annaler. Series A. Physical Geography*,
28 pp.253–256.
- 29 Ives, J.D., 1978. The maximum extent of the Laurentide Ice Sheet along
30 the east coast of North America during the last glaciation. *Arctic*, pp.24–
31 53.
- 32 Ives, J.D., 1976. The Saglek moraines of northern Labrador: a commentary.
33 *Arctic and Alpine Research*, pp.403–408.

- 1 Ives, J.D., Nichols, H. & Short, S., 1976. Glacial history and palaeoecology
2 of northeastern Nouveau-Quebec and northern Labrador. *Arctic*, 29(1), pp.48–
3 52.
- 4 Izagirre, E. et al., 2018. Glacial geomorphology of the Marinelli and
5 Pigafetta glaciers, Cordillera Darwin Icefield, southernmost Chile. *Journal of*
6 *Maps*, 14(2), pp.269–281.
- 7 Jansson, K.N., 2005. Map of the glacial geomorphology of north-central
8 Québec-Labrador, Canada. *Journal of Maps*, 1(1), pp.46–55.
- 9 Jansson, K.N. & Glasser, N.F., 2005. Palaeoglaciology of the Welsh sector
10 of the British-Irish Ice sheet. *Journal of the Geological Society*, 162(1),
11 pp.25–37.
- 12 Kaitanen, V., 1969. A geographical study of the morphogenesis of northern
13 Lapland,
- 14 Kaplan, M., Miller, G. & Steig, E., 2001. Low-gradient outlet glaciers (ice
15 streams?) drained the Laurentide ice sheet. *Geology*, 29(4), pp.343–346.
- 16 Kelley, S.E. et al., 2012. Maximum late Holocene extent of the western
17 Greenland Ice Sheet during the late 20th century. *Quaternary Science*
18 *Reviews*, 56, pp.89–98.
- 19 Kelley, S.E., Briner, J.P. & O'Hara, S.L., 2018. Assessing ice margin
20 fluctuations on differing timescales: Chronological constraints from Sermeq
21 Kujatdleq and Nordenskiöld Gletscher, central West Greenland. *The Holocene*,
22 28(7), pp.1160–1172.
- 23 Kelly, M. et al., 2002. Surface exposure ages of high elevation glacial
24 erosion forms: an attempt to date deglaciation of the Last Glacial Maximum
25 ice cap in the western Swiss Alps. In *Geochimica et cosmochimica acta*.
26 pp. A392–A392.
- 27 Kelly, M.A., Buoncristiani, J.-F. & Schlüchter, C., 2004. A reconstruction of
28 the last glacial maximum (LGM) ice-surface geometry in the western Swiss
29 Alps and contiguous Alpine regions in Italy and France. *Eclogae Geologicae*
30 *Helvetiae*, 97(1), pp.57–75.
- 31 Kissick, L.E. & Carbonneau, P.E., 2019. The case against vast glaciation
32 in Valles Marineris, Mars. *Icarus*, 321, pp.803–823.

- 1 Kjeldsen, K.K. et al., 2015. Spatial and temporal distribution of mass loss
2 from the Greenland Ice Sheet since AD 1900. *Nature*, 528(7582), pp.396–
3 400.
- 4 Kleman, J., 1994. Preservation of landforms under ice sheets and ice
5 caps. *Geomorphology*, 9(1), pp.19–32.
- 6 Kleman, J., 1992. The palimpsest glacial landscape in northwestern Sweden.
7 Late Weichselian deglaciation landforms and traces of older west-centered
8 ice sheets. *Geografiska Annaler. Series A. Physical Geography*, pp.305–325.
- 9 Kleman, J. & Borgström, I., 1996. Reconstruction of palaeo-ice sheets: the
10 use of geomorphological data. *Earth surface processes and landforms*, 21(10),
11 pp.893–909.
- 12 Kleman, J. & Borgström, I., 1990. The boulder fields of Mt. Fulufjället,
13 west-central Sweden-Late Weichselian boulder blankets and interstadial periglacial
14 phenomena. *Geografiska Annaler. Series A. Physical Geography*, pp.63–78.
- 15 Kleman, J. & Glasser, N.F., 2007. The subglacial thermal organisation (STO)
16 of ice sheets. *Quaternary Science Reviews*, 26(5), pp.585–597.
- 17 Kleman, J., Hättstrand, C. & Clarhäll, A., 1999. Zooming in on frozen-
18 bed patches: scale-dependent controls on Fennoscandian ice sheet basal
19 thermal zonation. *Annals of Glaciology*, 28(1), pp.189–194.
- 20 Kleman, J. & Stroeven, A.P., 1997. Preglacial surface remnants and
21 Quaternary glacial regimes in northwestern Sweden. *Geomorphology*, 19(1),
22 pp.35–54.
- 23 Knight, P., Weaver, R. & Sugden, D., 1987. Technical note. Using
24 LANDSAT MSS data for measuring ice sheet retreat. *International Journal*
25 *of Remote Sensing*, 8(7), pp.1069–1074.
- 26 Kohler, J. et al., 2007. Acceleration in thinning rate on western Svalbard
27 glaciers. *Geophysical Research Letters*, 34(18).
- 28 Kozamernik, E. et al., 2018. Spatial and climatic characterization of three
29 glacial stages in the Upper Krnica Valley, SE European Alps. *Quaternary*
30 *international*, 470, pp.67–81.
- 31 Kuchar, J. et al., 2012. Evaluation of a numerical model of the British-
32 Irish ice sheet using relative sea-level data: implications for the interpretation
33 of trimline observations. *Journal of Quaternary Science*, 27(6), pp.597–605.

- 1 Kuhlemann, J., Frisch, W., Székely, B., Dunkl, I., Danišík, M. and Krumei, I. (2005) Würmian
2 maximum glaciation in Corsica. *Austrian Journal of Earth Sciences* 97. pp.68–81.
- 3 Kverndal, A.-I. & Sollid, J.L., 1993. Late Weichselian glaciation and
4 deglaciation in northeastern Troms, northern Norway.
- 5 Lagerbäck, R., 1988a. Periglacial phenomena in the wooded areas of
6 Northern Sweden-relicts from the Tändö Interstadial. *Boreas*, 17(4), pp.487–
7 499.
- 8 Lagerbäck, R., 1988b. The Veiki moraines in northern Sweden-widespread
9 evidence of an Early Weichselian deglaciation. *Boreas*, 17(4), pp.469–486.
- 10 Lamb, A.L. & Ballantyne, C.K., 1998. Palaeonunataks and the altitude of
11 the last ice sheet in the SW Lake District, England. *Proceedings of the*
12 *Geologists' Association*, 109(4), pp.305–316.
- 13 Lambeck, K., 1993. Glacial rebound of the British Isles—II. A high-resolution,
14 high-precision model. *Geophysical Journal International*, 115(3), pp.960–990.
- 15 Lambeck, K., 1995. Late Devensian and Holocene shorelines of the British
16 Isles and North Sea from models of glacio-hydro-isostatic rebound. *Journal*
17 *of the Geological Society*, 152(3), pp.437–448.
- 18 Larsen, E. et al., 2014. Subglacial sediment, proglacial lake-level and
19 topographic controls on ice extent and lobe geometries during the Last
20 Glacial Maximum in NW Russia. *Quaternary Science Reviews*, 92, pp.369–
21 387.
- 22 Lawrence, D.B., 1950a. Estimating dates of recent glacier advances and
23 recession rates by studying tree growth layers. *Eos, Transactions American*
24 *Geophysical Union*, 31(2), pp.243–248.
- 25 Lawrence, D.B., 1950b. Glacier fluctuation for six centuries in southeastern
26 Alaska and its relation to solar activity. *Geographical Review*, 40(2), pp.191–
27 223.
- 28 Lawson, T., 1990. Former ice movement in Assynt, Sutherland, as shown
29 by the distribution of glacial erratics. *Scottish Journal of Geology*, 26(1),
30 pp.25–32.
- 31 Leiber, O.M., 1861. US Coast Survey Reoprt for 1860.
- 32 Levy, L.B. et al., 2018. Middle to late Holocene chronology of the western
33 margin of the Greenland Ice Sheet: A comparison with Holocene temperature

1 and precipitation records. *Arctic, Antarctic, and Alpine Research*, 50(1),
2 p.S100004.

3 Li, Y. & Li, Y., 2014. Topographic and geometric controls on glacier
4 changes in the central Tien Shan, China, since the Little Ice Age. *Annals*
5 *of Glaciology*, 55(66), p.177.

6 Lidmar-Bergström, K., Ollier, C. & Sulebak, J., 2000. Landforms and uplift
7 history of southern Norway. *Global and Planetary Change*, 24(3), pp.211–
8 231.

9 Linge, H. et al., 2006. In situ ¹⁰Be exposure ages from southeastern
10 Norway: implications for the geometry of the Weichselian Scandinavian ice
11 sheet. *Quaternary Science Reviews*, 25(9), pp.1097–1109.

12 Linton, D.L., 1955. The problem of tors. *The Geographical Journal*, 121(4),
13 pp.470–487.

14 Linton, D.L., 1949. Unglaciaded areas in Scandinavia and great Britain. *Irish*
15 *Geography*, 2(1), pp.25–33.

16 Linton, D.L., 1950. Unglaciaded enclaves in glaciaded regions. *Journal of*
17 *Glaciology*, 1, pp.451–452.

18 Locke, W.W., 1995. Modelling of icecap glaciation of the northern Rocky
19 Mountains of Montana. *Geomorphology*, 14(2), pp.123–130.

20 Loibl, D., Lehmkuhl, F. & Grießinger, J., 2014. Reconstructing glacier retreat
21 since the Little Ice Age in SE Tibet by glacier mapping. *Geomorphology*,
22 214, pp.22–39.

23 Løken, O., 1962. On the vertical extent of glaciation in north-eastern
24 Labrador-Ungava. *The Canadian Geographer/Le Géographe canadien*, 6(3-4),
25 pp.106–115.

26 Lowe, J.J. & Walker, M.J., 1997. Reconstructing quaternary environments,
27 Longman Londres.

28 Mackintosh, A. et al., 2007. Exposure ages from mountain dipsticks in
29 Mac. Robertson Land, East Antarctica, indicate little change in ice-sheet
30 thickness since the Last Glacial Maximum. *Geology*, 35(6), pp.551–554.

31 Mahaney, W., 1991. Holocene glacial sequence and soils of stratigraphic
32 important, Mer de Glace, Western Alps, France . *Zeitschrift fur Geomorphologie*,
33 35(2), pp.225–237.

- 1 Mahaney, W., 1987. Lichen trimlines and weathering features as indicators
2 of mass balance changes and successive retreat stages of the Mer de
3 Glace in the Western Alps. *Zeitschrift für Geomorphologie*, 31(4), pp.411–
4 418.
- 5 Makos, M. et al., 2018. Last Glacial Maximum and Lateglacial in the
6 Polish High Tatra Mountains-Revised deglaciation chronology based on the
7 ¹⁰Be exposure age dating. *Quaternary Science Reviews*, 187, pp.130–156.
- 8 Makos, M. & Nitychoruk, J., 2011. Last glacial maximum climatic conditions
9 in the Polish part of the high Tatra Mountains (Western Carpathians).
10 *Geological Quarterly*, 55(3), pp.253–268.
- 11 Makos, M., Nitychoruk, J. & Zreda, M., 2013. Deglaciation chronology and
12 paleoclimate of the Pięciu Stawów Polskich/Roztoki Valley, high Tatra
13 Mountains, Western Carpathians, since the Last Glacial Maximum, inferred
14 from ³⁶Cl exposure dating and glacier-climate modelling. *Quaternary International*,
15 293, pp.63–78.
- 16 Mangerud, J. et al., 1979. Glacial history of western Norway 15,000-10,000
17 BP. *Boreas*, 8(2), pp.179–187.
- 18 Mangerud, J., 1973. Istrie refugier i Norge under istidene, Universitetsforlaget.
- 19 Marquette, G.C. et al., 2004. Felsenmeer persistence under non-erosive ice
20 in the Torngat and Kaumajet mountains, Quebec and Labrador, as determined
21 by soil weathering and cosmogenic nuclide exposure dating. *Canadian Journal*
22 *of Earth Sciences*, 41(1), pp.19–38.
- 23 Marr, P., Winkler, S. & Löffler, J., 2018. Investigations on blockfields and
24 related landforms at Blåhø (Southern Norway) using Schmidt-hammer exposure-
25 age dating: palaeoclimatic and morphodynamic implications. *Geografiska Annaler:*
26 *Series A, Physical Geography*, 100(3), pp.285–306.
- 27 Marrero, S.M. et al., 2018. Controls on subaerial erosion rates in Antarctica.
28 *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 501, pp.56–66.
- 29 Mathews, W., 1951. Historic and prehistoric fluctuations of alpine glaciers
30 in the Mount Garibaldi map-area, southwestern British Columbia. *The Journal*
31 *of Geology*, pp.357–380.
- 32 McCarroll, D. et al., 1995. Nunataks of the last ice sheet in northwest
33 Scotland. *Boreas*, 24(4), pp.305–323.

- 1 McCarroll, D., 2016. Trimline trauma: the wider implications of a paradigm
2 shift in recognising and interpreting glacial limits. *Scottish Geographical*
3 *Journal*, 132(2), pp.130–139.
- 4 McCarroll, D. & Ballantyne, C.K., 2000. The last ice sheet in Snowdonia.
5 *Journal of Quaternary Science*, 15(8), pp.765–778.
- 6 McCarroll, D. & Nesje, A., 1993. The vertical extent of ice sheets in
7 Nordfjord, western Norway: measuring degree of rock surface weathering.
8 *Boreas*, 22(3), pp.255–265.
- 9 McCormack, D.C. et al., 2011. Cosmogenic ^{10}Be insights into the extent
10 and chronology of the last deglaciation in Wester Ross, northwest Scotland.
11 *Journal of Quaternary Science*, 26(1), pp.97–108.
- 12 McKinzey, K.M. et al., 2004. A revised Little Ice Age chronology of the
13 Franz Josef Glacier, Westland, New Zealand. *Journal of the Royal Society*
14 *of New Zealand*, 34(4), pp.381–394.
- 15 Meier, W.J.-H. et al., 2018. An updated multi-temporal glacier inventory for
16 the Patagonian Andes with changes between the Little Ice Age and 2016.
17 *Frontiers in Earth Science*, 6, p.62.
- 18 Merritt, J.W. et al., 2019. Early and Middle Pleistocene environments,
19 landforms and sediments in Scotland. *Earth and Environmental Science*
20 *Transactions of the Royal Society of Edinburgh*, 110(1-2), pp.5–37.
- 21 Migoñ, P. & Goudie, A., 2001. Inherited landscapes of Britain-Possible
22 reasons for survival. *Zeitschrift für Geomorphologie*, pp.417–441.
- 23 Munroe, J.S., 2006. Investigating the spatial distribution of summit flats in
24 the Uinta Mountains of northeastern Utah, USA. *Geomorphology*, 75(3),
25 pp.437–449.
- 26 Möller, P. et al., 2010. Late Quaternary glaciation history of Isla de los
27 Estados, southeasternmost South America. *Quaternary Research*, 73(3), pp.521–
28 534.
- 29 Navarro, F. et al., 2005. Ice-volume changes (1936-1990) and structure of
30 Aldegondabreen, Spitsbergen. *Annals of Glaciology*, 42(1), pp.158–162.
- 31 Nesje, A. et al., 1988. Block fields in southern Norway: Significance for
32 the Late Weichselian ice sheet. *Norsk Geologisk Tidsskrift*, 68(3), pp.149–
33 169.

- 1 Nesje, A., 1989. The geographical and altitudinal distribution of blockfields
2 in southern Norway and its significance to the Pleistocene ice sheets.
3 *Zeitschrift für Geomorphologie*, 72, pp.41–53.
- 4 Nesje, A. et al., 2007. The surface geometry of the Last Glacial Maximum
5 ice sheet in the Andøya-Skånland region, northern Norway, constrained by
6 surface exposure dating and clay mineralogy. *BOREAS-OSLO*, 36(3), p.227.
- 7 Nesje, A. et al., 1987. The vertical extent of the Late Weichselian ice
8 sheet in the Nordfjord-Møre area, western Norway. *Norsk Geologisk Tidsskrift*,
9 67(2), pp.125–141.
- 10 Nesje, A. & Dahl, S.O., 1990. Autochthonous block fields in southern
11 Norway: implications for the geometry, thickness, and isostatic loading of
12 the Late Weichselian Scandinavian ice sheet. *Journal of Quaternary Science*,
13 5(3), pp.225–234.
- 14 Nesje, A., McCarroll, D. & Dahl, S.O., 1994. Degree of rock surface
15 weathering as an indicator of ice-sheet thickness along an east–west
16 transect across southern Norway. *Journal of Quaternary Science*, 9(4), pp.337–
17 347.
- 18 Nesje, A. & Sejrup, H.P., 1988. Late Weichselian/Devensian ice sheets in
19 the North Sea and adjacent land areas. *Boreas*, 17(3), pp.371–384.
- 20 Nichols, R.L. & Miller, M.M., 1951. Glacial geology of Ameghino Valley,
21 Lago Argentino, Patagonia. *Geographical Review*, 41(2), pp.274–294.
- 22 Nixon, F.C. & England, J.H., 2014. Expanded Late Wisconsinan ice cap
23 and ice sheet margins in the western Queen Elizabeth Islands, Arctic
24 Canada. *Quaternary Science Reviews*.
- 25 Norðdahl, H., 1991. A review of the glaciation maximum concept and the
26 deglaciation of Eyjafjörður, North Iceland. In *Environmental change in Iceland:
27 past and present*. Springer, pp. 31–47.
- 28 Norðdahl, H., 1983. Late Quaternary stratigraphy of Fnjóskadalur, central
29 north Iceland: a study of sediments, ice-lake strandlines, glacial isostasy
30 and ice-free areas. *Lunqua*, 12, p.78.
- 31 Nordhagen, R., 1963. Recent discoveries in the south Norwegian flora and
32 their significance for the understanding of the history of the Scandinavian
33 mountain flora during and after the last glaciation. In Löve, Áskell and
34 Löve, Doris, ed. *North Atlantic biota and their history*. Macmillan.

- 1 Nordhagen, R., 1936. Skandinavias fjellflora og dens relasjoner til den siste
2 istid,
- 3 Nussbaumer, S.U., Zumbühl, H.J. & Steiner, D., 2007. Fluctuations of the“
4 Mer de Glace”(Mont Blanc area, France) AD 1500-2050: an interdisciplinary
5 approach using new historical data and neural network simulations,
6 Universitätsverlag Wagner.
- 7 Nuth, C. et al., 2007. Glacier geometry and elevation changes on Svalbard
8 (1936-90): a baseline dataset. *Annals of Glaciology*, 46(1), pp.106–116.
- 9 Ó Cofaigh, C., Evans, D. & England, J., 2003. Ice-marginal terrestrial
10 landsystems: sub-polar glacier margins of the Canadian and Greenland High
11 Arctic. In *Glacial Landsystems*. London: Arnold, pp. 45–64.
- 12 Oberholzer, P. et al., 2008. Dating late Cenozoic erosional surfaces in
13 Victoria Land, Antarctica, with cosmogenic neon in pyroxenes. *Antarctic
14 Science*, 20(01), pp.89–98.
- 15 Orombelli, G.B.C. & Denton, G.H., 1990. Late Cenozoic glacial history of
16 the Terra Nova Bay region, northern Victoria land, Antarctica. *Geografia
17 fisica e dinamica Quaternaria* , pp.139–163.
- 18 Pearce, D.M. et al., 2018. The glacial geomorphology of upper Godthåbsfjord
19 (Nuup Kangerlua) in southwest Greenland. *Journal of Maps*, 14(2), pp.45–
20 55.
- 21 Philipps, W. et al., 2018. Earliest Holocene deglaciation of the central
22 Uummanaq Fjord system, West Greenland. *Boreas*, 47(1), pp.311–325.
- 23 Phillips, W.M. et al., 2006. Cosmogenic ^{10}Be and ^{26}Al exposure ages
24 of tors and erratics, Cairngorm Mountains, Scotland: timescales for the
25 development of a classic landscape of selective linear glacial erosion.
26 *Geomorphology*, 73(3), pp.222–245.
- 27 Phillips, W.M. et al., 2008. Extent of the last ice sheet in northern
28 Scotland tested with cosmogenic ^{10}Be exposure ages. *Journal of Quaternary
29 Science*, 23(2), pp.101–107.
- 30 Pierce, K.L., 1982. History and dynamics of glaciation in the northern
31 Yellowstone National Park area.
- 32 Pollard, D. & DeConto, R.M., 2009. Modelling West Antarctic ice sheet
33 growth and collapse through the past five million years. *Nature*, 458(7236),
34 pp.329–332.

- 1 Rae, A.C. et al., 2004. Periglacial trimlines and nunataks of the Last
2 Glacial Maximum: the Gap of Dunloe, southwest Ireland. *Journal of*
3 *Quaternary Science*, 19(1), pp.87–97.
- 4 Ragg, J. & Bibby, J., 1966. Frost weathering and solifluction products in
5 southern Scotland. *Geografiska Annaler. Series A, Physical Geography*, 48(1),
6 pp.12–23.
- 7 Raper, S.C. & Braithwaite, R.J., 2009. Glacier volume response time and
8 its links to climate and topography based on a conceptual model of
9 glacier hypsometry. *The Cryosphere*, 3(2), pp.183–194.
- 10 Rea, B.R. et al., 1996. Blockfields, old or new? Evidence and implications
11 from some plateaus in northern Norway. *Geomorphology*, 15(2), pp.109–121.
- 12 Reed, W.J., 1989. The vertical dimensions of the last ice sheet and late
13 quaternary events in northern Ross-shire, Scotland.
- 14 Reusch, H., 1901. Nogle bidrag til forstaaelsen af hvorledes Norges dale
15 og fjelde er blevne til. *Norges geologiske undersøkelse*, 32, pp.124–263.
- 16 Reuther, A. et al., 2004. Determining the glacial equilibrium line altitude
17 (ELA) for the Northern Retezat Mountains, Southern Carpathians and resulting
18 paleoclimatic implications for the last glacial cycle. *Analele UniversitãTii de*
19 *Vest din Timișoara, Seria Geografie*, 14, pp.11–34.
- 20 Reuther, A.U. et al., 2007. Late Pleistocene glacial chronology of the
21 Pietrele Valley, Retezat Mountains, Southern Carpathians constrained by 10
22 Be exposure ages and pedological investigations. *Quaternary International*,
23 164, pp.151–169.
- 24 Ribolini, A., Bini, M., Isola, I., Spagnolo, M., Zanchetta, G., Pellitero, R., Mechernich, S.,
25 Gromig, R., Dunai, T., Wagner, B., Milevski, I., 2017. An Oldest Dryas glacier expansion on
26 Mount Pelister (Former Yugoslavian Republic of Macedonia) according to 10Be cosmogenic
27 dating. *Journal of the Geological Society, London* 175, pp.100-110.
- 28 Roaldset, E. et al., 1982. Remnants of preglacial weathering in western
29 Norway. *Norsk geologisk tidsskrift*, 62(3), pp.169–178.
- 30 Romans, J., Stevens, J. & Robertson, L., 1966. Alpine Soils of North-East
31 Scotland. *Journal of Soil Science*, 17(2), pp.184–199.
- 32 Rootes, C.M., 2018. The nature and use of trimlines for analysing 3-
33 dimensional glacier change in rugged terrain. PhD thesis, University of Sheffield.

- 1 Rye, N. et al., 1987. The Late Weichselian ice sheet in the Nordfjord-
2 Sunnmøre area and deglaciation chronology for Nordfjord, western Norway.
- 3 Schweinsberg, A.D. et al., 2019. Multiple independent records of local glacier
4 variability on Nuussuaq, West Greenland, during the Holocene. *Quaternary*
5 *Science Reviews*, 215, pp.253–271.
- 6 Seguinot, J. et al., 2018. Modelling last glacial cycle ice dynamics in the
7 Alps. *The Cryosphere*, 12(10), pp.3265–3285.
- 8 Sejrup, H.P. et al., 2005. Pleistocene glacial history of the NW European
9 continental margin. *Marine and Petroleum Geology*, 22(9), pp.1111–1129.
- 10 Sernander, R., 1896. Några ord med anledning af Gunnar Andersson,
11 Svenska Växtvärldens historia. *Botaniska notiser*, 1896, pp.114–128.
- 12 Serrano, E. et al., 2018. Post-little ice age paraglacial processes and
13 landforms in the high Iberian mountains: A review. *Land Degradation &*
14 *Development*, 29(11), pp.4186–4208.
- 15 Sharma, S. et al., 2018. Geomorphic investigation of the Late-Quaternary
16 landforms in the southern Zaskar Valley, NW Himalaya. *Journal of Earth*
17 *System Science*, 127(1), p.9.
- 18 Sharma, S. & Shukla, A.D., 2018. Factors governing the pattern of glacier
19 advances since the Last Glacial Maxima in the transitional climate zone
20 of the Southern Zaskar Ranges, NW Himalaya. *Quaternary Science Reviews*,
21 201, pp.223–240.
- 22 Shennan, I., Bradley, S.L. & Edwards, R., 2018. Relative sea-level changes
23 and crustal movements in Britain and Ireland since the Last Glacial
24 Maximum. *Quaternary Science Reviews*, 188, pp.143–159.
- 25 Sissons, J., 1974. A Late-glacial ice cap in the central Grampians, Scotland.
26 *Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers*, pp.95–114.
- 27 Sissons, J.B., 1967. *The evolution of Scotland's scenery*, Archon Books.
- 28 Sollid, J. & Reite, A., 1983. The last glaciation and deglaciation of Central
29 Norway. In *Glacial deposits in north-west Europe*. AA Balkema Rotterdam,
30 pp. 41–60.
- 31 Sollid, J.L. & Sørbel, L., 1979. Deglaciation of western Central Norway.
32 *Boreas*, 8(2), pp.233–239.

- 1 Sørensen, N., 1949. Gjevilvasskammene-nunatakker i Trollheimens midte.
2 Naturen, 73, pp.65–81.
- 3 Stevens, J. & Wilson, M., 1970. Alpine podzol soils on the Ben Lawers
4 Massif Perthshire. *Journal of Soil Science*, 21(1), pp.85–95.
- 5 Stokes, C.R. et al., 2018. Widespread and accelerating glacier retreat on
6 the Lyngen Peninsula, northern Norway, since their “Little Ice Age” maximum.
7 *Journal of Glaciology*, 64(243), pp.100–118.
- 8 Stone, J.O. & Ballantyne, C.K., 2006. Dimensions and deglacial chronology
9 of the Outer Hebrides Ice Cap, northwest Scotland: implications of cosmic
10 ray exposure dating. *Journal of Quaternary Science*, 21(1), pp.75–84.
- 11 Stone, J.O., Ballantyne, C.K. & Fifield, L.K., 1998. Exposure dating and
12 validation of periglacial weathering limits, northwest Scotland. *Geology*, 26(7),
13 pp.587–590.
- 14 Stroeven, A.P. et al., 2002. A relict landscape in the centre of
15 Fennoscandian glaciation: cosmogenic radionuclide evidence of tors preserved
16 through multiple glacial cycles. *Geomorphology*, 44(1), pp.145–154.
- 17 Stroeven, A.P. & Kleman, J., 1999. Age of Sirius Group on Mount
18 Feather, McMurdo Dry Valleys, Antarctica, based on glaciological inferences
19 from the overridden mountain range of Scandinavia. *Global and Planetary
20 Change*, 23(1), pp.231–247.
- 21 Sugden, D., 1978. Glacial erosion by the Laurentide ice sheet. *Journal of
22 Glaciology*, 20(83), pp.367–391.
- 23 Sugden, D., 1989. Modification of old land surfaces by ice sheets. *Zeitschrift
24 für Geomorphologie*, 72, pp.163–172.
- 25 Sugden, D., 1977. Reconstruction of the morphology, dynamics, and thermal
26 characteristics of the Laurentide Ice Sheet at its maximum. *Arctic and
27 Alpine Research*, pp.21–47.
- 28 Sugden, D., 1968. The selectivity of glacial erosion in the Cairngorm
29 Mountains, Scotland. *Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers*,
30 pp.79–92.
- 31 Sugden, D.E., 1970. Landforms of deglaciation in the Cairngorm Mountains,
32 Scotland. *Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers*, pp.201–219.
- 33 Sugden, D.E., 1974. Landscapes of glacial erosion in Greenland and their
34 relationship to ice, topographic and bedrock conditions,

- 1 Sugden, D.E. et al., 2005. Selective glacial erosion and weathering zones
2 in the coastal mountains of Marie Byrd Land, Antarctica. *Geomorphology*,
3 67(3), pp.317–334.
- 4 Sugden, D.E. et al., 2017. The million-year evolution of the glacial trimline
5 in the southernmost Ellsworth Mountains, Antarctica. *Earth and Planetary*
6 *Science Letters*, 469, pp.42–52.
- 7 Sugden, D.E. & John, B.S., 1976. *Glaciers and landscape: a geomorphological*
8 *approach*, Edward Arnold London.
- 9 Sugden, D.E. & Watts, S., 1977. Tors, felsenmeer, and glaciation in
10 northern Cumberland Peninsula, Baffin Island. *Canadian Journal of Earth*
11 *Sciences*, 14(12), pp.2817–2823.
- 12 Svendsen, J.I. et al., 2019. Glacial and environmental changes over the
13 last 60 000 years in the Polar Ural Mountains, Arctic Russia, inferred
14 from a high-resolution lake record and other observations from adjacent
15 areas. *Boreas*, 48(2), pp.407–431.
- 16 Tantardini, D., Riganti, N., Taglieri, P., De Finis, E., Bini, A. 2013. Glacier dynamics in San
17 Giacomo Valley (Central Alps, Sondrio, Italy). *Alpine and Mediterranean Quaternary*, 26 (1),
18 pp.77-94.
- 19 Temovski, M. et al., 2018. Glacial geomorphology and Preliminary glacier
20 reconstruction in the Jablanica mountain, Macedonia, central Balkan peninsula.
21 *Geosciences*, 8(7), p.270.
- 22 Thomsen, H.H. & Winding, O., 1988. Margin of the Inland Ice north-east
23 of Jakobshavn (Paakitsup Akuliarusersua 1985) glacier hydrological map, 1:
24 75 000,
- 25 Thorp, P., 1981. A trimline method for defining the upper limit of Loch
26 Lomond Advance glaciers: examples from the Loch Leven and Glen Coe
27 areas. *Scottish Journal of Geology*, 17(1), pp.49–64.
- 28 Thorp, P.W., 1986. A mountain icefield of Loch Lomond Stadial age,
29 western Grampians, Scotland. *Boreas*, 15(1), pp.83–97.
- 30 Thorp, P.W., 1987. Late Devensian ice sheet in the western Grampians,
31 Scotland. *Journal of Quaternary Science*, 2(2), pp.103–112.
- 32 Traczyk, A. & Migoñ, P., 2003. Cold-climate landform patterns in the
33 Sudetes. Effects of lithology, relief and glacial history. *Acta Universitatis*
34 *Carolinae, Geographica*, 35, pp.185–210.

- 1 Van der Veen, C.J. & Csatho, B.M., 2005. Spectral characteristics of
2 Greenland lichens. *Géographie physique et Quaternaire*, 59(1), pp.63–73.
- 3 Walden, J. & Ballantyne, C.K., 2002. Use of environmental magnetic
4 measurements to validate the vertical extent of ice masses at the Last
5 Glacial Maximum. *Journal of Quaternary Science*, 17(3), pp.193–200.
- 6 Weidick, A., 1968. Landscapes of glacial erosion in Greenland and their
7 Observations on some Holocene glacier fluctuations in West Greenland
8 relationship to ice, topographic and bedrock conditions. *Bulletin Grønlands*
9 *Geologiske Under.*
- 10 Weidick, A., 1995. Satellite image atlas of glaciers of the world. In
11 Williams, Richard S and Ferrigno, Jane G, ed. US Government Printing
12 Office.
- 13 Weidick, A., 1969. The periglacial environment: past and present. In Péwé,
14 Troy L., ed. Montreal: McGill–Queens University Press, pp. 249–262.
- 15 Weidick, A., Bøggild, C.E. & Knudsen, N., 1992. Glacier inventory and
16 atlas of West Greenland, *Grønlands geologiske undersøgelse*.
- 17 Whalley, W.B. et al., 1997. Rock weathering in blockfields: some preliminary
18 data from mountain plateaus in North Norway. *Geological Society, London,*
19 *Special Publications*, 120(1), pp.133–145.
- 20 Whalley, W.B., Rea, B.R. & Rainey, M.M., 2004. Weathering, blockfields,
21 and fracture systems and the implications for long-term landscape formation:
22 some evidence from Lyngen and Oksfordjøkelen areas in north Norway.
23 *Polar Geography*, 28(2), pp.93–119.
- 24 White, D.A. & Fink, D., 2014. Late Quaternary glacial history constrains
25 glacio-isostatic rebound in Enderby Land, East Antarctica. *Journal of*
26 *Geophysical Research: Earth Surface*, 119(3), pp.401–413.
- 27 Wirsig, C., Zasadni, J., Ivy-Ochs, S., et al., 2016. A deglaciation model
28 of the Oberhasli, Switzerland. *Journal of Quaternary Science*, 31(1), pp.46–
29 59.
- 30 Wirsig, C., Zasadni, J., Christl, M., et al., 2016. Dating the onset of
31 LGM ice surface lowering in the High Alps. *Quaternary Science Reviews*,
32 143, pp.37–50.

- 1 Wolken, G.J., England, J.H. & Dyke, A.S., 2005. Re-evaluating the relevance
2 of vegetation trimlines in the Canadian Arctic as an indicator of Little Ice
3 Age paleoenvironments. *Arctic*, pp.341–353.
- 4 Wråk, W.O.O., 1908. *Bidrag till Skandinaviens reliefkronologi...*, Centraltryckeriet.
- 5 Yde, J.C. et al., 2019. Kuannersuit Glacier revisited: Constraining ice
6 dynamics, landform formations and glaciomorphological changes in the early
7 quiescent phase following the 1995-98 surge event. *Geomorphology*, 330,
8 pp.89–99.
- 9 Zasadni, J. & Kłapyta, P., 2014. The Tatra Mountains during the Last
10 Glacial Maximum. *Journal of Maps*, 10(3), pp.440–456.
- 11 Zumbühl, H., Steiner, D. & Nussbaumer, S., 2008. 19th century glacier
12 representations and fluctuations in the central and western European Alps:
13 An interdisciplinary approach. *Global and Planetary Change*, 60(1), pp.42–57.

14

15

16 **Table 1 (next page) – terms used to describe glacial trimlines**

17

Term group	Term	Definition	Papers using this term
Generic linear	Trimline, (Trim-line) (Trim line)	<p>Glasser <i>et al.</i> (2005) provide a rare definition: "Sub-horizontal lines on valley sides separating areas of non-vegetated and vegetated land or areas covered by different types of vegetation" (pp.266). More often this term is undefined. Generally, a more specific term is used initially before resorting to just 'trimline' for the core of the paper. Commonly more specific terms are returned to in the discussion and conclusion. Also, it is quite common for a paragraph to start with a more specific term and then transition to using just 'trimline'.</p> <p>Indirectly defined by Cockburn and Summerfield (2004, pp.18): "Geomorphic indicators of previous ice levels range from clearly defined trim lines to more equivocal weathering limits which may reflect other zones of process transition, such as postglacial differential weathering or englacial boundaries between wet-based eroding ice and non eroding frozen-bed ice"</p>	<p>Lawrence (1950a); Lawrence (1950b); Nicols and Miller (1951); Heusser <i>et al.</i> (1954); Thorp (1981); Thorp (1986); Nesje <i>et al.</i> (1987); Nesje <i>et al.</i> (1988); Thomsen and Winding (1988); Huber (1989); Reed (1989); Ballantyne (1990); Lawson (1990); Nesje and Dahl, S.-O. (1990); Orombelli <i>et al.</i> (1990); MacCarroll and Nesje (1993); Kleman (1994); Ballantyne (1994a/b); Ballantyne and Harris (1994); Locke (1995); McCarroll <i>et al.</i> (1995); Brook <i>et al.</i> (1996); Dahl, S.-O. <i>et al.</i> (1996a/b); Ballantyne (1997); Ballantyne <i>et al.</i> (1997); Lowe and Walker (1997); Ballantyne (1998); Ballantyne <i>et al.</i> (1998a/b); Florineth (1998); Florineth and Schluchter (1998); Lamb and Ballantyne (1998); Stone <i>et al.</i> (1998); Armienti and Baroni (1999); McCarroll and Ballantyne (2000); Ballantyne and Hallam (2001); Kaplan <i>et al.</i> (2001); Walden and Ballantyne (2002); Traczyk and Migoñ (2003); Clark, C.D. <i>et al.</i> (2004); Cockburn and Summerfield (2004); Kelly <i>et al.</i> (2004); McKinzey <i>et al.</i> (2004); Cockburn and Summerfield (2004); Rae <i>et al.</i> (2004); Reuther <i>et al.</i> (2004); Csatho <i>et al.</i> (2005); Evans <i>et al.</i> (2005); Fiebig <i>et al.</i> (2005); Glasser <i>et al.</i> (2005); Kuhlemann <i>et al.</i> (2005); Wolken <i>et al.</i> (2005); van der Veen and Csatho (2005); Boulton and Hagdorn (2006); Fjellanger <i>et al.</i> (2006); Gosse <i>et al.</i> (2006); Hubbard <i>et al.</i> (2006); Linge <i>et al.</i> (2006); Stone and Ballantyne (2006); Ackert <i>et al.</i> (2007); Ballantyne (2007); Ballantyne <i>et al.</i> (2007); Forman <i>et al.</i> (2007); Goodfellow (2007); Harrison <i>et al.</i> (2007); Nesje <i>et al.</i> (2007); Reuther <i>et al.</i> (2007); Ballantyne <i>et al.</i> (2008); Ballantyne and Hall (2008); Baroni <i>et al.</i> (2008); Brooks <i>et al.</i> (2008); Castho <i>et al.</i> (2008); Fretwell <i>et al.</i> (2008); Glasser <i>et al.</i> (2008); Goehring <i>et al.</i> (2008); Hormes <i>et al.</i> (2008); Van der Beek and Bourbon (2008); Ballantyne <i>et al.</i> (2009); Ballantyne (2010); Benn and Evans (2010); Benn and Hulton (2010); Chiverrell and Thomas (2010); Hughes <i>et al.</i> (2010); Möller <i>et al.</i> (2010); Ackert <i>et al.</i> (2011); Ballantyne <i>et al.</i> (2011); Glasser <i>et al.</i> (2011); McCormack <i>et al.</i> (2011); Glasser <i>et al.</i> (2012); Fabel <i>et al.</i> (2012); Kelley <i>et al.</i> (2012); Kuchar <i>et al.</i> (2012); Tantardini <i>et al.</i> (2013); Gourronc <i>et al.</i> (2014); Lee <i>et al.</i> (2014); Loibl <i>et al.</i> (2014); Nixon and England (2014); White and Fink (2014); Ballantyne and Stone (2015); Hannesdóttir <i>et al.</i> (2015); Kjeldsen <i>et al.</i> (2015); Barth <i>et al.</i> (2016); Bickerdike <i>et al.</i> (2016); Evans (2016); McCarroll (2016); Edwards <i>et al.</i> (2017); Deswal <i>et al.</i> (2017); Hannah <i>et al.</i> (2017) Sugden <i>et al.</i> (2017); Badino <i>et al.</i> (2018); Baroni <i>et al.</i> (2018); Bjørk <i>et al.</i> (2018); Campos <i>et al.</i> (2018); Charalampidis <i>et al.</i> (2018); Clark, C.D. <i>et al.</i> (2018); Haubner <i>et al.</i> (2018); Iturrizaga (2018); Izagirre <i>et al.</i> (2018); Kelley <i>et al.</i> (2018); Sharma <i>et al.</i> (2018); Kozamernik <i>et al.</i> (2018); Levy <i>et al.</i> (2018); Makos <i>et al.</i> (2018); Marr <i>et al.</i> (2018);</p>

			Marrero <i>et al.</i> (2018); Meier <i>et al.</i> (2018); Pearce <i>et al.</i> (2018); Philipps <i>et al.</i> (2018); Bjørk <i>et al.</i> (2018); Seguinot <i>et al.</i> (2018); Serrano <i>et al.</i> (2018); Sharma and Shukla (2018); Shennan <i>et al.</i> (2018); Temovski <i>et al.</i> (2018); Aa and Sønstegaard (2019); Carrivick <i>et al.</i> (2019); Kissick and Carbonneau (2019); Merritt <i>et al.</i> (2019); Schweinsberg <i>et al.</i> (2019); Yde <i>et al.</i> (2019); Bayrakdar <i>et al.</i> (2020)
	Glacial trimline	Undefined. Can be used to refer to an erosional feature that is presumed to approximate the palaeo ice margin (e.g. Kelly <i>et al.</i> 2004 p.61).	Kelly <i>et al.</i> (2004); Sugden <i>et al.</i> (2005); Nesje <i>et al.</i> (2007); Hormes <i>et al.</i> (2008); Oberholzer <i>et al.</i> (2008); Van der Beek and Bourbon (2008); Gourronc <i>et al.</i> (2014); Larsen <i>et al.</i> (2014); Lee <i>et al.</i> (2014); Makos and Niychoruk (2011); Makos <i>et al.</i> (2013); Zasadni and Klapyta (2014); Wirsig <i>et al.</i> (2016a/b); Sugden <i>et al.</i> (2017); Makos <i>et al.</i> (2018); Kissick and Carbonneau (2019)
Generic zonal	Trimzone/trimline zone	Terms used interchangeably to refer to the area between the trimline and the modern ice margin.	Thomsen and Winding (1988); Reed (1989); Csatho <i>et al.</i> (2005); Csaho <i>et al.</i> (2008); Forman <i>et al.</i> (2007); Zasadni and Klapyta (2014); Wirsig <i>et al.</i> (2016a); Philipps <i>et al.</i> (2018)
Ice mass	Glacier trimline	Undefined. Trimline associated with a glacier.	Csatho <i>et al.</i> (2005); van der Veen and Csatho (2005)
	Ice sheet trimline	Undefined. Trimline associated with a palaeo ice sheet (see Ballantyne <i>et al.</i> 1998b, pp.65).	Lawson (1990); Ballantyne (1994b); McCarroll <i>et al.</i> (1995); Ballantyne (1997); Ballantyne <i>et al.</i> (1997); Ballantyne (1998); Ballantyne <i>et al.</i> (1998a/b); Lamb and Ballantyne (1998)
	Ice-cap trimlines	Undefined. Trimline associated with palaeo ice caps.	Wolken <i>et al.</i> (2005)
Age	Palaeo-trimline	Undefined. Trimlines associated with Quaternary ice masses.	Hubbard <i>et al.</i> (2009)
	Historical trimline	Undefined. Trimlines associated with Holocene glacial fluctuations.	Levy <i>et al.</i> (2018)
Study area significance	Regional trimline	Undefined. Used by Nesje <i>et al.</i> (2007, pp.234) for the average trimline altitude across their study area.	Nesje <i>et al.</i> (2007)
Ice marginal interpretation	Ice-marginal trimline	Undefined but used to distinguish the feature in question from englacial/subglacial thermal boundaries (Nesje <i>et al.</i> 2007, pp.228).	Nesje <i>et al.</i> (2007)
	Periglacial trimline	Defined as marking "the maximum level to which glacier ice has eroded or 'trimmed' a pre-existing zone of frost-weathered rock or debris on mountain slopes" (Ballantyne and Harris 1994, p.182. Re-stated by Ballantyne <i>et al.</i> (1997, pp.227; 2011,	Reed (1989); Ballantyne (1990); Ballantyne (1994a); Ballantyne and Harris (1994); Bennett (1994); McCarroll <i>et al.</i> (1995); Dahl, S.-O. <i>et al.</i> (1996a/b); Ballantyne (1997); Ballantyne <i>et al.</i> (1997); Ballantyne (1998); Ballantyne <i>et al.</i> (1998b); Lamb and Ballantyne (1998); Stone <i>et al.</i> (1998); Ballantyne (1999a/b); McCarroll and Ballantyne (2000); Ballantyne and Hallam (2001); Hughes (2002); Walden and Ballantyne (2002); Rae <i>et al.</i> (2004); Evans <i>et al.</i> (2005); Sugden <i>et al.</i> (2005); Ballantyne <i>et al.</i> (2006); Ballantyne <i>et al.</i> (2006); Hughes

		pp.3834) and Ballantyne (2010, pp.524)). See list of identifying features in Benn and Evans (2010, pp.620).	<i>et al.</i> (2006); Stone and Ballantyne (2006); Ballantyne (2007); Ballantyne <i>et al.</i> (2007); Nesje <i>et al.</i> (2007); Ballantyne <i>et al.</i> (2009); Ballantyne (2010); Benn and Evans (2010, pp.619-620); Ballantyne <i>et al.</i> (2011); Fabel <i>et al.</i> (2012); Bickerdike <i>et al.</i> (2016); Evans (2016); McCarroll (2016); Wirsig <i>et al.</i> (2016b); Marr <i>et al.</i> (2018)
	Glacier limit/ glacial limit/ limit of glaciation	Undefined. Location of the palaeo ice margin as recorded by a trimline.	Sissons (1974); Grant (1977); Traczyk and Migoń (2003); Reuther <i>et al.</i> (2004); Gosse <i>et al.</i> (2006); Reuther <i>et al.</i> (2007); Benn and Evans (2010, pp.619); Hughes <i>et al.</i> (2012); Iturrizaga (2018); Izagirre <i>et al.</i> (2018); Merritt <i>et al.</i> (2019); Hughes <i>et al.</i> (2019)
	Ice sheet limit	Undefined. Used to refer to both the lateral and vertical dimensions of the palaeo ice sheet.	Brook <i>et al.</i> (1996); Fretwell <i>et al.</i> (2008); Chandler <i>et al.</i> (2018)
	Periglacial zone	Undefined. Used to refer to areas with evidence of periglacial weathering.	Ballantyne (1998); Marr <i>et al.</i> (2018)
Glacial surging interpretation	Surge trimline	Defined as being: "distinguished from traditional trimlines by being located further down-glacier and higher on the valley walls than is expected from a traditional glacier advance" (Yde <i>et al.</i> 2019, pp.94).	Yde <i>et al.</i> (2019)
	Englacial trimline	Defined as "marking the approximate upper boundary of warm-based ice" (Ballantyne 2010, pp.525).	Ballantyne (2010)
Subglacial or thermal interpretation	Subglacial zone	Undefined but used to describe areas with subglacial landforms. Often used alongside 'nonglacial zone', which describes the area with weathering or periglacial landforms.	Hattestrand and Stroeven (2002)
	Thermal trimline	Defined as representing a "thermal boundary between cold-based and wet-based ice below an ice sheet, rather than a former ice surface" (Benn and Evans 2010, pp.620).	Benn and Evans (2010, pp.620); Zasadni and Kłapyta (2014)
Type of trimline expression	Vegetation trimline	Defined as "light-toned, barely vegetated terrains displaying abrupt outer margins extend back to modern glaciers and ice caps" by Wolken <i>et al.</i> (2005, pp.343).	Knight <i>et al.</i> (1987); Wolken <i>et al.</i> (2005); Harrison <i>et al.</i> (2007); Benn and Evans (2010, pp.619); Kelley <i>et al.</i> (2012); Meier <i>et al.</i> (2018); Stokes <i>et al.</i> (2018)
	Forest trimline	Early equivalent to 'vegetation trimline'. Defined by Lawrence (1950a, pp.243) "the line representing	Lawrence (1950a); Lawrence (1950b); Mathews (1951); Nicols and Miller (1951)

	the maximum position attained by the ice front, where the forest was sheared off by the ice”	
Lichen trimline	Undefined, but expressed solely through a contrast in lichen cover.	Mahaney (1987); Mahaney (1991)
Vegetation-free zone/ lichen-free zone	Undefined. Used by Wolken <i>et al.</i> (2005) to describe the areas within their vegetation trimlines.	Wolken <i>et al.</i> (2005)
Weathering trimline/ limit/ boundary/ contrast	Defined by Boulton and Hagdorn (2006, pp.3361) as being "where glacially eroded surfaces at lower elevations gave way to weathered rock surfaces and “frost debris” at higher elevations" and by Ballantyne and Harris (1994, pp.182) as "the boundaries between [weathering] zones". Used interchangeably with 'periglacial trimline' by Ballantyne <i>et al.</i> (1997; 2009).	Ballantyne <i>et al.</i> (1987); Nesje <i>et al.</i> (1987); Ballantyne (1990); Nesje and Dahl, S.-O. (1990); Ballantyne (1994a); McCarroll <i>et al.</i> (1995); Brook <i>et al.</i> (1996); Ballantyne <i>et al.</i> (1997); Ballantyne <i>et al.</i> (1998b); Lamb and Ballantyne (1998); Stone <i>et al.</i> (1998); Walden and Ballantyne (2002); Cockburn and Summerfield (2004); Marquette <i>et al.</i> (2004); Rae <i>et al.</i> (2004); Evans <i>et al.</i> (2005); Ballantyne <i>et al.</i> (2006); Boulton and Hagdorn (2006); Fjellanger <i>et al.</i> (2006); Ballantyne <i>et al.</i> (2009); Marr <i>et al.</i> (2018); Kissick and Carbonneau (2019)
Weathering zone/ frost-weathered zone/ zone of frost-weathering/ weathered zone	Defined by Ballantyne (1994a, pp.182): "A related concept is that of weathering zones: as successive trimlines delimit altitudinal zones that have been exposed to weathering processes for different lengths of time, then the degree of rock weathering and soil development should be more advanced in the zone above any trimline than in the zone below." Also, by Clark, P.U. <i>et al.</i> (2003, pp.617) as "units of the land surface that are identified by distinct weathering features".	Løken (1962) [in French]; Boyer and Pheasant (1974); Ives (1975); Ives (1976); Ives <i>et al.</i> (1976); Grant (1977); Ives (1978); Dyke (1979); Reed (1989); Nesje and Dahl, S.-O. (1990); Ballantyne (1994a); Kleman (1994); MacCarroll <i>et al.</i> (1995); Ballantyne (1997); Ballantyne <i>et al.</i> (1997); Ballantyne (1998); Ballantyne <i>et al.</i> (1998a/b); Briner <i>et al.</i> (2003); Clark, P.U. <i>et al.</i> (2003); Rae <i>et al.</i> (2004); Sugden <i>et al.</i> (2005); Fjellanger <i>et al.</i> (2006); Gosse <i>et al.</i> (2006); Goodfellow (2007); Goehring <i>et al.</i> (2008)
Weathering surface	Undefined. Meaning appears to be similar to 'weathering zone'.	Kverndal and Sollid (1993)
Blockfield boundary/ block-field boundary	The margin of a periglacial blockfield. Defined by Goehring <i>et al.</i> (2008, pp.333): "represents an englacial thermal boundary between frozen bed nonerosive ice above and a wet-bed region below	Dahl, R. (1966b); Brook <i>et al.</i> (1996); Goehring <i>et al.</i> (2008)

that was progressively more erosive with increasing ice thickness."

1

Erosional trimline/ limit/ boundary	Undefined but generally used interchangeably with 'periglacial trimline' or 'trimline'.	Nesje and Dahl, S.-O. (1990); Orombelli <i>et al.</i> (1990); Ballantyne (1998); Ballantyne <i>et al.</i> (1998a/b); Kaplan <i>et al.</i> (2001); Walden and Ballantyne (2002); Ballantyne (2007); Oberholzer <i>et al.</i> (2008); Möller <i>et al.</i> (2010); Sugden <i>et al.</i> (2017); Levy <i>et al.</i> (2018)
Erosional zone/ scoured zone/ limit of effective glacial erosion	Undefined. Used to refer to areas with clear evidence of flowing warm-based ice.	Ballantyne (1997); Ballantyne <i>et al.</i> (1998a/b); Hattestrand and Stroeven (2002); Linge <i>et al.</i> (2006); Goodfellow (2007); Nesje <i>et al.</i> (2007); Fu <i>et al.</i> (2013); Fu <i>et al.</i> (2019); Merritt <i>et al.</i> (2019)
Ice-scoured trimline	Undefined. Presumably similar to an erosional trimline.	Harrison <i>et al.</i> (2007)
Trimline moraine	Pictorially defined as a terminal or lateral-frontal moraine system that outlines the former ice margin position (Benn and Evans 2010, pp.513).	O'Cofaigh <i>et al.</i> (2003); Benn and Evans (2010, pp.513)
Boulder limit/ limit of glacial erratics	Undefined. Used to describe the upper bound of glacial erratic distributions. Suggested to indicate a thermal or ice flow boundary.	Mackintosh <i>et al.</i> (2007)
Depositional trimline	Undefined. Used to describe limits of glacial erratics and other deposition.	Marrero <i>et al.</i> (2018)

54

2

3

1

2 **Table 2 (next page) – locations of research into glacial trimlines**

Region	Location	Sub-location	Paper count	References
			24	Geikie (1874); Linton (1949); Boulton <i>et al.</i> (1977); Bowen <i>et al.</i> (1986); Nesje and Sjerup (1988); Lambeck (1993); Ballantyne (1994b); Lambeck (1995); Migoñ and Goudie (2001); Bowen <i>et al.</i> (2002); Clark, C.D. <i>et al.</i> (2004); Evans <i>et al.</i> (2005); Boulton & Hagdorn (2006); Fretwell <i>et al.</i> (2008); Hubbard <i>et al.</i> (2009); Ballantyne (2010); Chiverrell & Thomas (2010); Clark, C.D. <i>et al.</i> (2012); Kuchar <i>et al.</i> (2012); Bickerdike <i>et al.</i> (2016); Bickerdike <i>et al.</i> (2018a/b); Clark, C.D. <i>et al.</i> (2018); Shennan <i>et al.</i> (2018)
	British Isles	All	2	Ballantyne & Stone (2015); Shennan <i>et al.</i> (2018)
		North-West	1	Ballantyne <i>et al.</i> (2007)
		West	2	Ballantyne <i>et al.</i> (2008); Edwards <i>et al.</i> (2017)
		South-West	2	Ballantyne <i>et al.</i> (2011); Barth <i>et al.</i> (2016)
		East	1	Ballantyne <i>et al.</i> (2006)
	Ireland	All	7	Sissons (1967); Ballantyne (1984); Boulton <i>et al.</i> (1991); Bennett (1994); Ballantyne (1997); Ballantyne (1998); Merritt <i>et al.</i> (2019)
		Grampians	5	Stevens and Wilson (1970); Sissons (1974); Thorp (1981); Thorp (1986); Thorp (1987)
		Cairngorms	4	Sugden (1968); Sugden (1970); Ballantyne (1994b); Phillips <i>et al.</i> (2006)
		North-West; including Wester Ross	16	Gordon (1979); Ballantyne (1987); Reed (1989); Lawson (1990); McCarroll <i>et al.</i> (1995); Ballantyne <i>et al.</i> (1997); Ballantyne <i>et al.</i> (1998a/b); Stone <i>et al.</i> (1998); Ballantyne (1999a/b); Walden and Ballantyne (2002); Ballantyne & Hall (2008); Phillips <i>et al.</i> (2008); McCormack <i>et al.</i> (2011); Fabel <i>et al.</i> (2012)
	Scotland	North-East	5	Godard (1965); Romans <i>et al.</i> (1966); Hall (1985); Hall and Sugden (1987); Glasser (1995)
		Southern	1	Ragg and Bibby (1966)
		Outer Hebrides	6	Geikie (1873); Geikie (1878); Ballantyne and Hallam (2001); Ballantyne <i>et al.</i> (2006); Stone and Ballantyne (2006); Ballantyne (2007)
		Inner Hebrides	7	Anderson and Dunham (1966); Ballantyne (1989); Ballantyne (1990); Ballantyne (1994); Dahl, S.-O. <i>et al.</i> (1996); Ballantyne <i>et al.</i> (1997); Stone <i>et al.</i> (1998)
		Britain and Ireland		

Britain and Ireland	Wales	All	2	Jansson and Glasser (2005); Glasser <i>et al.</i> (2012)
		Snowdonia	3	Fearnside (1905); McCarroll and Ballantyne (2000); Hughes (2002)
	England	Dartmoor	1	Linton (1955)
		Lake District	4	Lamb and Ballantyne (1998); Ballantyne <i>et al.</i> (2009); Hughes <i>et al.</i> (2012); Hughes <i>et al.</i> (2019)
Central Europe		All	2	Wirsig <i>et al.</i> (2016b); Seguinot <i>et al.</i> (2018)
		Central	1	Cohen <i>et al.</i> (2018)
	The Alps	Swiss	5	Florineth (1998); Florineth & Schluchter (1998); Kelly <i>et al.</i> (2002); Kelly <i>et al.</i> (2004); Bini <i>et al.</i> (2009); Wirsig <i>et al.</i> (2016a)
		Austrian	1	<i>Charalampidis et al.</i> (2018)
		French	3	Mahaney (1987); Mahaney (1991); van der Beek & Bourbon (2008)
		Italian	3	Hormes <i>et al.</i> (2008); Tantardini <i>et al.</i> (2013); <i>Badino, et al.</i> (2018)
		Eastern/South-eastern	2	Fiebig <i>et al.</i> (2005); Kozamernik <i>et al.</i> (2018)
	The Carpathians	5	Reuther <i>et al.</i> (2004); Reuther <i>et al.</i> (2007); Makos and Nitychoruk (2011); Makos <i>et al.</i> (2013); Zasadni & Kłapyta (2014)	
	The Sudetes	1	Traczyk and Migoñ (2003)	
	Southern Europe	Iberian Peninsula	2	Campos <i>et al.</i> (2018); <i>Serrano et al.</i> (2018)
The Apennines		1	Baroni <i>et al.</i> (2018)	
Balkans		4	Hughes <i>et al.</i> (2006); Hughes <i>et al.</i> (2010); Ribolini <i>et al.</i> (2017); Temovski <i>et al.</i> (2018)	
Corsica		1	Kuhlemann <i>et al.</i> (2005)	
Eastern Europe	The Urals	2	Astakhov (2018); Svendsen <i>et al.</i> (2019)	
	The Tatras	1	Makos <i>et al.</i> (2018)	

	All	2	Kleman <i>et al.</i> (1999); Fabel <i>et al.</i> (2002)		
	Scandinavia	7	Wråk (1905); Linton (1949); Dahl, E. (1955); Dahl, E. (1961); Kleman (1994); Stroeven and Kleman (1999); Linge <i>et al.</i> (2006)		
Fennoscandia	Norway	All	9	Blytt (1876); Reusch (190); Ahlmann (1919); Nordhagen (1936); Gjærevoll (1963); Nordhagen (1963); Gjessing (1967); Mangerud (1973)	
		North	11	Sørensen (1949); Grønlie (1953); Dahl, R. (1966a/b); Kverndal and Sollid (1993); Rea <i>et al.</i> (1996b); Whalley <i>et al.</i> (1997); Whalley <i>et al.</i> (2004); Fjellanger <i>et al.</i> (2006); Nesje <i>et al.</i> (2007); Stokes <i>et al.</i> (2018)	
		South	7	Nesje <i>et al.</i> (1988); Nesje (1989); Nesje and Dahl, S.-O. (1990); Nesje <i>et al.</i> (1994); Lidmar-Bergström <i>et al.</i> (2000); Goehring <i>et al.</i> (2008); Marr <i>et al.</i> (2018)	
		Central	2	Sollid and Sørbel (1979); Sollid and Reite (1983)	
		Western	9	Dahl, E. (1948); Mangerud <i>et al.</i> (1979); Sollid and Sørbel (1979); Roaldset (1982); Nesje <i>et al.</i> (1987); Rye <i>et al.</i> (1987); McCarroll and Nesje (1993); Brook <i>et al.</i> (1996); Aa & Sønstegaard (2019)	
		Svalbard	2	Henriksen <i>et al.</i> (2014); Rootes (2018)	
		Sweden	North-West	6	Sernander (1896); Lagerbäck (1988a/b); Kleman (1992); Kleman and Stroeven (1997); Clarhäll and Kleman (1999)
			North-East	2	Hättestrand and Stroeven (2002); Stroeven <i>et al.</i> (2002)
			Southern	1	Kleman and Borgström (1990)
		Finland	Lapland	1	Kaitanen (1969)
	NW Russia	Around the White Sea	1	Larsen <i>et al.</i> (2014)	

	Faroe Islands		1	Walden and Ballantyne (2002)
		All	2	Norðdahl (1991); Hubbard <i>et al.</i> (2006)
	Iceland	North	2	Norðdahl (1983); Brynjólfsson <i>et al.</i> (2014)
		Vatnajökull	1	Hannesdóttir <i>et al.</i> (2015)
North Atlantic		All	5	Gjærevoll and Ryvarden (1978); Weidick (1955); Sugden (1974); Ó Cofaigh <i>et al.</i> (2003); Kjeldsen <i>et al.</i> (2015)
		West or South-West	11	Weidick (1968); Weidick (1969); Weidick (1992); Kelley <i>et al.</i> (2012); Haubner <i>et al.</i> (2018); Kelley <i>et al.</i> (2018); Levy <i>et al.</i> (2018); Pearce <i>et al.</i> (2018); Philipps <i>et al.</i> (2018); Schweinsberg <i>et al.</i> (2019); Yde <i>et al.</i> (2019)
	Greenland	North-East	1	Carrivick <i>et al.</i> (2019)
		Jakobshavn	5	Knight <i>et al.</i> (1987); Thomsen and Winding (1988); Csatho <i>et al.</i> (2005); van der Veen and Csatho (2005); Csatho <i>et al.</i> (2008)
		Kangerlussuaq	1	Forman <i>et al.</i> (2007)
		Helheim	1	Bjørk <i>et al.</i> (2018)
Asia	Western Asia	Turkey	1	Bayrakdar <i>et al.</i> (2020)
		Tibet	2	Fu <i>et al.</i> (2013); Loibl <i>et al.</i> (2014); Fu <i>et al.</i> (2019)
		Tian Shan	1	Li and Li (2014)
		Altai-Sayan	1	Blomdin <i>et al.</i> (2016)
		NW India	4	Lee <i>et al.</i> (2014); Deswal <i>et al.</i> (2017); Sharma <i>et al.</i> (2018); Sharma and Shukla (2018)
Africa	Morocco	High Atlas	1	Hannah <i>et al.</i> (2017)
New Zealand	South Island	Frans Josef Glacier	1	McKinzey <i>et al.</i> (2004)
South America		All	3	Glasser <i>et al.</i> (2008); Glasser <i>et al.</i> (2011); Meier <i>et al.</i> (2018)
	Patagonia	North	2	Glasser <i>et al.</i> (2005); Harrison <i>et al.</i> (2007)
		South	1	Nicols and Miller (1951)
		Cordillera Blanca	1	Iturrizaga (2018)
		Tierra del Fuego	2	Möller <i>et al.</i> (2010); Izagirre <i>et al.</i> (2018)

	All	6	Ives (1978); Sugden (1977); Sugden (1978); Dyke and Prest (1987); Kleman (1994); Briner <i>et al.</i> (2006b)
	All	1	O Cofaigh <i>et al.</i> (2003)
	Arctic Canada	9	Boyer and Pheasant (1974); Ives (1975); Ives (1977); Sugden and Watts (1977); Dyke (1979); Bierman <i>et al.</i> (1999); Kaplan <i>et al.</i> (2001); Briner <i>et al.</i> (2005); Briner <i>et al.</i> (2006a)
	Queen Elizabeth Islands	2	Wolken <i>et al.</i> (2005); Nixon and England (2014)
	Eastern Canada	8	Ives (1957); Ives (1958a); Ives (1976); Ives <i>et al.</i> (1976); Clark, P.U (1988); Clark, P.U (1991); Clark, P.U <i>et al.</i> (2003); Marquette <i>et al.</i> (2004)
	Newfoundland	2	Grant (1977); Gosse <i>et al.</i> (2006)
	Labrador/ Québec	4	Leiber (1861); Ives (1958b); Løken (1962); Jansson (2005)
North America	Western Canada	2	Aylesworth and Shilts (1989a); Aylesworth and Shilts (1989b)
	British Columbia	1	Mathews (1951)
	Pacific North- West	1	Lawrence (1950a)
	New England	1	Bierman <i>et al.</i> (2015)
	Alaska	2	Heusser <i>et al.</i> (1954); Lawrence (1950b)
	Minnesota	1	Bierman <i>et al.</i> (1999)
	Northern USA	1	Briner and Swanson (1998)
	Washington	1	Anderson (2002)
	Wyoming	1	Locke (1995)
	Montana	1	Munroe (2006)
	Utah	1	Pierce (1979)
	Yellowstone	1	Huber (1989)
	Yosemite	1	

	All		1	<i>Marrero et al. (2018)</i>
		All	1	Pollard and DeConto (2009)
		Peninsula	2	Bentley <i>et al.</i> (2006); Carrivick <i>et al.</i> (2012)
	West	Marie Byrd Land; including the Ohio Range	3	Sugden <i>et al.</i> (2005); Ackert <i>et al.</i> (2007); Ackert <i>et al.</i> (2011)
		Ellsworth Mountains	1	Sugden <i>et al.</i> (2017)
Antarctica		Enderby Land	1	White and Fink (2014)
		Victoria Land	4	Orombelli <i>et al.</i> (1990); Armienti and Baroni (1999); French and Guglielmin (2002); Baroni <i>et al.</i> (2008);
	East	Mac. Robertson Land	1	Mackintosh <i>et al.</i> (2007)
		McMurdo Dry Valleys	3	Bruno <i>et al.</i> (1997); Stroeven and Kleman (1999); Oberholzer <i>et al.</i> (2008)
	Conceptual/ Review/ Methods	[i.e. papers with no specific location]	16	Linton (1950); Ives (1974); Boulton (1979); Dahl, E. (1987); Sugden (1989); Dahl, E. (1992); Brunsden (1993); Kleman (1994); Cockburn & Summerfield (2004); Goodfellow (2007); Kleman & Glasser (2007); Benn and Hulton (2010); Evans (2016); McCarroll (2016); Rootes (2018); Ely <i>et al.</i> (2019)
	Extra-terrestrial	Mars Valles Marineris	2	Gourronc <i>et al.</i> (2014); Kissick <i>et al.</i> (2019)

1

2

1

2 Table captions

3 **Table 1** – Terminologies used in the literature to refer to trimline features or zones.
4 The wide range of terminology and the number of terms that lack a formal definition
5 might be hampering discussion of glacial trimlines and limiting the progress of
6 research.

7

8 **Table 2** – Full list of the papers used to produce this literature review, grouped by
9 study location. Both Quaternary or older (normal text) and historic (italics) papers are
10 listed. From this table, and the maps in Figure 7, it is clear that there has been
11 significant clustering of trimline studies in certain locations. It is also obvious from
12 this table that the majority of trimline papers are solely Quaternary studies. This is
13 particularly true because many of the highlighted historic papers also include some
14 study of Quaternary glaciations, which is rarely true in reverse.

15

16 Figure captions

17 **Figure 1** – Example of a glacial trimline (white dashed) recording a former margin
18 position of the Mer de Glace in the Mont Blanc area, France. This trimline is an
19 example of a vegetation and slope process contrast that records both the lateral ice
20 margin position and the ice thickness at the time of trimline formation. The largely
21 vegetation-free area between the modern ice margin (solid) and the trimline (white
22 dashed) is termed the 'trimzone' (arrow). The date of the trimline is known from
23 historical artwork and written documents. From these two dated ice margin positions
24 it is possible to calculate rates of volume loss since the Little Ice Age, which
25 peaked in this area at around the time of trimline formation.

26

27 **Figure 2** – The trimzone surrounding Jakobshavn Isfjord in western Greenland.
28 Csatho et al. (2008) identified the trimzone (orange) using analysis of the spectral
29 reflectance of different land surfaces. In this case the trimzone is differentiated by a
30 reduced lichen density compared to the surrounding area. They dated the outer edge
31 of the trimzone, which could be considered to be a trimline, to the Little Ice Age.

32

33 **Figure 3** – The main groups of trimline terms from Table 1 are graphed according
34 to the decade of publication of the studies using these terms, clearly showing both
35 an increase in the popularity of trimlines research as well as an increase in the
36 diversity of different types of terms used to describe trimline features. This has led
37 to an increasingly confusing literature with a terminology that is difficult to use
38 consistently.

39

40 **Figure 4** – Thorp's method for identifying trimlines relies on mapping zones of
41 glacial erosion and contrasting zones of frost weathering and periglacial slope
42 processes. He found that clear trimline features were visible on spurs in his study

1 area but that the boundary between the two landsurface zones was more diffuse on
2 the majority of valley slopes. Therefore, he used aerial imagery and fieldwork to map
3 the lower limit of frost weathering and the upper limit of glacial erosion, giving an
4 upper and lower bound for the trimline location. a) This schematic diagram illustrates
5 the key features that Thorp used to identify the two landsurface zones and the
6 dotted lines represent the upper and lower bounds of trimline elevation (reproduced
7 from Thorp 1981). b) Once the upper and lower bounds had been identified, Thorp
8 was able to calculate the mean elevation of the trimline on each mountain or spur.
9 By comparing mean trimline elevations between mountains, he was able to draw in
10 the mean trimline and determine the morphology of the former ice surface as well
11 as the ice thickness (reproduced with permission from Thorp 1986).

12

13 **Figure 5** – Two possible explanations for British-Irish Ice Sheet trimlines were tested
14 via the application of cosmogenic nuclide dating: (a) that the glacial trimlines
15 represent the upper limit of glaciation during the LGM, i.e. the trimlines were formed
16 at the ice margin; (b) that the glacial trimlines represent an englacial thermal
17 boundary between warm-based, flowing and erosive ice in the valleys and cold-based
18 static ice on the mountain tops, which preserved the frost weathering regolith from
19 preceding interglacials. Research in Britain and Scandinavia using cosmogenic nuclide
20 dating eventually found that both of these scenarios are possible, meaning that
21 trimlines cannot be assumed to be ice marginal without further supporting evidence.

22

23 **Figure 6** – This schematic illustrates the trimlines and other features in two adjacent
24 valleys. Some trimlines are clearly linked to the modern glaciers, showing patterns of
25 historic recession and linking to recent moraines. These historic trimlines can be
26 used to produce 3D palaeoglacial reconstructions and to estimate rates of glacier
27 thinning or ice volume loss. Other trimlines, more distant from glaciers or in places that
28 no longer contain glaciers often record much larger ice masses. These older Quaternary
29 trimlines are typically less clearly expressed than the historic trimlines and when
30 pieced together they reveal useful information of on former ice cap or ice sheet extents and
31 thicknesses, points of confluence between different valleys' ice flows and the
32 identification of palaeo nunataks. Quaternary trimlines may also indicate the position
33 of thermal boundaries at the bed of palaeo ice sheets.

34

35 **Figure 7** – The distribution of trimline research, with Quaternary studies in red and
36 historic in blue. The size of the circles relates to the percentage of published studies
37 located in each area. The global distribution of Quaternary (a) and historic (b)
38 studies show that trimlines can be found in a wide range of glacial environments
39 and are not limited to specific glaciological, climatic or geological conditions. It is
40 also clear that trimline research has been highly clustered, with higher densities in
41 North America (c) and Europe (d) than other locations, likely to be a bias towards
42 locations that are easily accessible and generally well-researched. The regional
43 distribution of trimline research in North America (c) shows a clustering around
44 mountainous areas of on-going glaciation or at the fringes of the former Laurentide
45 and Cordilleran Ice Sheets. In Europe (d) research has similarly been focused in
46 rugged topography but trimlines have also been found in the central areas of former
47 ice sheets, for example associated with the Fennoscandian Ice Sheet in Northern

1 Sweden and Northern Norway. However there has been relatively little research into
2 historic trimlines in Europe, despite clearly visible Little Ice Age trimlines associated
3 with many glaciers in Scandinavia and the Alps (e.g. Figure 1). (Background map
4 from Wikipedia Commons. File name: BlankMap-World6.svg)

5

6 **Figure 8** – Geomorphological map of trimlines (red) in central western Spitsbergen,
7 Svalbard and their parent existing ice masses (blue), from Rootes (2018). The
8 position and shape of individual trimlines are shown in full detail, aiding visual
9 identification of possibly synchronous trimlines on opposite sides of a glacier,
10 sequences of trimlines that indicate downwasting (e.g. in the forefield of Bullbreen),
11 possible palaeo glacier confluences, and trimlines that are not linked to any modern
12 glacier. This wealth of information is not obvious in maps that just mark trimlines as
13 a single point/symbol.

14

15 **Figure 9** – Suggested decision tree for glacial trimline terminology. When a linear
16 feature on the slopes of a glacierised or formerly glaciated valley is identified it is
17 termed an ‘apparent trimline’, which is a purely descriptive term. The initial
18 interpretation of the feature ascertains whether it is of glacial origin or not. If it is
19 found to be glacial then it is termed a ‘glacial trimline’ and can be classified
20 according to its expression (Figure 10a). Further analysis of the trimline’s expression,
21 morphology, preservation, location and age, if known, may allow the formation of the
22 trimline to be determined as either ice marginal or thermal.

23

64

24 **Figure 10** – a) Observable means of trimline expression as documented in the
25 literature and from investigation of Svalbard trimlines in Rootes (2018), including
26 associated ice marginal features that are often used in conjunction with glacial
27 trimlines. The suggested categorisation and terminology that has undergone initial
28 testing in central western Spitsbergen (Rootes 2018; Chapter 4) but requires further
29 application to a wider range of glacial environments. Figures 9b)-9f) show some
30 examples the different modes of trimline expression. b) A trimline (white dashed line)
31 expressed by a discontinuity in a slope landforms or processes, in this case
32 depositional talus cones and erosional gullies above Conwaybreen in Svalbard
33 (TopoSvalbard; imagery from Norwegian Polar Institute). In this example the trimline
34 is also expressed as the limit of glacially deposited drift. c) A series of a lateral
35 moraine trimlines (white dashed lines) on the Pasu Glacier in the Karakorum (Google
36 Earth; imagery from Landsat). d) An example of an erosional imprint limit in the
37 Grimsel Pass area, European Alps (Kelly *et al.* 2004). e) An example of a truncated
38 spur, marked with an arrow, near the snout of Nigardsbreen, Norway (C.M. Rootes
39 June 2011). f) A vegetation trimline associated with an unnamed glacier flowing
40 down from Icemaker Mountain in British Columbia, Canada (Google Earth; imagery
41 from Landsat).

42

43 **Figure 11** – These images contain examples of previously unrecognised trimlines
44 (marked by red arrows) that are not known to have been included in any published
45 study. a) and b) are trimlines associated with the debris-covered Pasu glacier in the
46 Karakorum, Pakistan. The trimline in a) appears to be a surface aging contrast,

1 marked by a distinction in the vegetation cover, whilst b) could be a contrast in
2 glacier deposition, with some sections that appear to be lateral moraines, but could
3 also be an erosional step. In c) an unnamed glacier in Alaska (Lat. 57.6224° Long.
4 -132.9562°) has a surface aging/erosional contrast trimline along the main trunk
5 glacier, with a nearby smaller glacier's former ice margin marked by an almost
6 continuous surface aging trimline (red dotted line). d) shows a clear lateral moraine
7 trimline along the side of the Tasman Glacier, New Zealand. There is also a smaller
8 surface aging/ erosional contrast on the opposite side of the glacier. Like the Pasu
9 glacier (a and b), the Tasman glacier (d) is debris-covered and the glacial trimlines
10 of this type of glacier have received little or no detailed study in the literature to
11 date. All images from Google Earth and sourced from: a) Landsat/ Copernicus
12 ©CNES/ Airbus; b) Landsat/ Copernicus ©CNES/ Airbus and ©DigitalGlobe; c)
13 ©DigitalGlobe; d) Landsat/ Copernicus ©CNES/ Airbus and ©DigitalGlobe.

14