Horizontal gene transfer and shifts in linked bacterial community composition are associated with maintenance of antibiotic resistance genes during food waste composting

Authors: Hanpeng Liao¹, Ville-Petri Friman², Stefan Geisen³, Qian Zhao¹, Peng Cui¹, Xiaomei Lu¹, Zhi Chen¹, Zhen Yu⁴, Shungui Zhou^{*1}

Author affiliation:

¹ Fujian Provincial Key Laboratory of Soil Environmental Health and Regulation, College of Resources and Environment, Fuzhou 350002, China;

² Department of Biology, Wentworth Way, YO10 5DD, University of York, York, UK;

³ Department of Terrestrial Ecology, Netherlands Institute of Ecology, Wageningen, Netherlands;

⁴ Guangdong Key Laboratory of Integrated Agro-environmental Pollution Control and Management, Guangdong Institute of Eco-environmental Science & Technology, Guangzhou 510650, China;

*Corresponding author: Prof. Shungui Zhou

Email: <u>sgzhou@soil.gd.cn</u>, Phone: +86-590-86398509, Fax: +86-590-86398509.

1 Horizontal gene transfer and shifts in linked bacterial community composition

2 are associated with maintenance of antibiotic resistance genes during food waste

- 3 composting
- 4

5 Abstract

6 About 1.3 billion tons of food waste (FW) is annually produced at a global scale. A major fraction of FW is deposited into landfills thereby contributing to environmental 7 pollution and emission of greenhouse gasses. While increasing amounts of FW are 8 recycled more sustainably into fertilizers in industrial-scale composting, very little is 9 10 known about the antibiotic resistance genes (ARGs) present in FW and how their abundance is affected by composting. To study this, we quantified the diversity and 11 abundance of ARGs, mobile genetic elements (MGEs) and bacterial communities in 12 13 the beginning, during and at the end of the FW composting. All targeted 27 ARGs and 5 MGEs were detected in every sample suggesting that composted FW remains a 14 reservoir of ARGs and MGEs. While the composting drastically changed the 15 abundance, composition and diversity of bacterial communities, an increase in total 16 ARG and MGE abundances was observed. Changes in ARGs were linked with shifts 17 18 in the composition of bacterial communities as revealed by a Procrustes analysis (P < P0.01). Crucially, even though the high composting temperatures reduced the 19 abundance and diversity of initially ARG-associated bacterial taxa, ARG abundances 20 21 were maintained in other associated bacterial taxa. This was likely driven by horizontal gene transfer and physicochemical composting properties as revealed by a 22 clear positive correlation between ARGs, MGEs, pH, NO3⁻ and moisture. Together 23 24 our findings suggest that traditional composting is not efficient at removing ARGs and MGEs from FW. More effective composting strategies are thus needed to 25

26 minimize ARG release from composted FW into agricultural environments.

Keywords: Antibiotic resistance genes, Municipal solid waste, Mobile genetic
elements, Bacterial community composition, Composting physicochemical
parameters

30

31 **1. Introduction**

A significant portion of food ends up as unused waste resulting in more than 1.3 32 billion tons of food waste (FW) annually at the global scale (Gustavsson et al., 2011). 33 In China and in the U.S. about 90% of FW ends up in landfills (Breunig et al., 2017; 34 35 Yong et al., 2015). However, landfilling FW is unsustainable leading to increased greenhouse gas emissions and prevents the required land from being used for other 36 purposes (Zhang et al., 2014). Composting FW into organic fertilizers provides an 37 38 environmentally friendly alternative to FW landfilling and is increasingly used around the world (Cerda et al., 2018; Li et al., 2013; Wang et al., 2017b). However, there 39 exists only little information about composting of FW. One potential risk could be 40 human-associated pathogens and bacteria-associated antibiotic resistance genes that 41 could potentially get enriched during the composting process (ADD REF). Antibiotic 42 43 resistance is recognized as a major threat to public health worldwide and antibiotic resistant bacteria and antibiotic resistance genes (ARGs) are widely found in the 44 natural environments, wastewater, manure, and sewage sludge (Lekunberri et al., 45 2017; Ma et al., 2015; Su et al., 2017b). Previous studies have shown that ARGs are 46 found in various foods such as pork, beef, raw fruits and fresh vegetables (Rolain, 47 2013; Ruimy et al., 2010). However, the identity and composition of ARGs and 48 49 MGEs in FW remains unknown. Many antibiotic-resistant microbes, including both foodborne pathogenic and commensal bacteria, are also found in food chains ranging 50

51 from manufacturing to commercial products (Wang et al., 2012) and numerous studies support the link between the use of antibiotics and enrichment of ARGs during 52 agricultural production. Food waste could thus serve as an important source of ARGs 53 and MGEs similar to other types of organic wastes such as sewage sludge (Su et al., 54 2017a) and animal manure (Wang et al., 2017a). Hence, it is important to understand 55 how FW composting impacts the abundance, mobility and diversity of ARGs to 56 57 minimize the potential spread of ARGs to agricultural environments along the final composting products. 58

59 Agricultural application of composted organic waste introduces high loads of bacteria that often carry ARGs into the soil (Xie et al., 2016). In the soil, ARGs 60 propagate along with their bacterial hosts and can disseminate via horizontal gene 61 transfer between different bacterial species, including many human pathogenic 62 bacteria (Forsberg et al., 2014). Mobile genetic elements (MGEs), such as plasmids, 63 64 integrons and transposons are often linked with ARGs and their horizontal dissemination (Bengtsson-Palme et al., 2018; Gillings, 2017) and they often confer 65 resistance to multiple antibiotics (Pehrsson et al., 2016). If ARGs enter humans via 66 the food chain, the efficiency of antibiotics could be reduced. While the diversity and 67 abundance of ARGs and MGEs has been studied largely in the process of manure and 68 sewage sludge composting (Ma et al., 2015; Su et al., 2017b; Wu et al., 2017), there 69 70 are no studies investigating ARG and MGE dynamics during FW composting. Even though most food products do not normally contain antibiotics, the emergence of 71 abundant ARGs have been found in some food products such as meat and dairy 72 products (Wang et al., 2012). It is thus important to understand the abundance and 73 distribution of ARGs and MGEs in FW, if these genes are mobile or associated with 74 75 certain bacterial hosts, and crucially, whether composting can be used to remove or

considerably reduce their abundance resulting in safe composting end product (Liao etal., 2018).

FW has many specific physical and chemical characteristics that separates it 78 from other organic wastes including high organic matter content, high salt, oil and 79 protein content and low pH (Cerda et al., 2018). It is known that these properties have 80 a strong effect for the transmission of ARGs (Bengtsson-Palme et al., 2018). For 81 example, Liu *et al.* found that salinity can improve the removal of antibiotic resistance 82 genes in wastewater treatment bioreactors (Liu et al., 2018). However, it is unclear 83 how the specific physicochemical properties of FW affect the dynamics of ARGs 84 during composting. Composting is a complex fermentation process that induces 85 dynamic changes in biotic components such as the microbial community structure and 86 87 abiotic factors including physicochemical properties of compost (Su et al., 2015; Zhang et al., 2016). These could potentially drive the abundance and composition of 88 89 ARGs and MGEs directly or have indirect effects on their bacterial hosts. For example, composting temperature has been shown to play an important role in 90 91 removing ARGs via effects on MGEs and on the bacterial community composition 92 (Liao et al., 2018).

Here we investigated the impact of FW composting on the abundance of ARGs, 93 MGEs and soil bacterial community composition, diversity and densities at an 94 95 industrial scale. The objectives of our study were: (1) to investigate the abundance and diversity of ARGs and MGEs during FW composting; (2) to determine potential 96 97 bacterial carriers of ARGs and MGEs (3) to understand the relative importance of various biotic and abiotic factors (composting properties, bacterial community 98 diversity, bacterial community composition and MGE abundances) on the dynamics 99 100 and abundance of ARGs during FW composting. To this end, we used temporal

⁴

101 sampling followed by quantitative PCR (qPCR) to determine the abundances of 27
102 ARGs and 5 MGEs in a full-scale FW composting experiment. Furthermore, we
103 applied Illumina Hiseq sequencing of the bacterial 16S rRNA genes to determine the
104 composition of the ARG and MGE-associated bacterial communities.

105 2. Materials and methods

106 2.1 Full-scale experimental setup for food waste composting

FW composting experiments were conducted in a full-scale aerobic composting plant 107 located in Jinshui district, Zhengzhou, China. The aerobic composting process has 108 previously been described by Liao et al. (2018) and the same methods were used in 109 this experiment with some modifications. Briefly, raw composting materials consisted 110 of deoiled FW (with 78% water content, provided by Xinmi food waste processing 111 112 factory) and tobacco powder (with 20% water content, provided by Zhengzhou cigarette factory). Tobacco powder was used as a composting amendment as it is an 113 abundant and accessible waste produced locally near the composting plant. 114 Approximately 80 tons of composting material was created by mixing FW and 115 tobacco powder in a ratio of 3:1 (v/v), respectively. The final composting material had 116 approximately 58% water content. The composting mixture was loaded into three 117 independent replicate piles (8 m length, 6 m width, and 3 m height) at 2.2 m bulk 118 height. Forced aeration was supplied from the bottom to the top of the pile according 119 to aeration needs during different phases of composting (Liao et al., 2018). To mix the 120 compost substrate well and to reduce pile-edge effects, mechanical turning of the 121 composting material was performed every seven days using pile-specific forklifts to 122 prevent cross-contamination between replicate piles. 123

124

125 **2.2 Sample collection and DNA extraction**

5

Samples were collected at 0, 5, 10, 13, 24, 30, 41, and 50 days after start of the 126 composting, which allowed us to follow changes during various temperature stages 127 during the composting process. The sampling process followed a previously described 128 protocol by Liao et al. (2018) with some minor modifications. Briefly, to obtain 129 representative samples at each sampling time point, each pile was diagonally divided 130 into five domains, and each domain was sub-sampled (5000 g) from three different 131 depths from the top of the pile: 40-50 cm (top), 90-100 cm (middle) and 150-160 cm 132 (bottom). All sub-samples per sampled domain were pooled to obtain a final sample 133 134 (5 samples per replicate pile totaling 15 total samples per sampling time point), homogenized and further divided into two 400 g aliquots of which one was stored in 135 liquid nitrogen for biological analyses and the other one was stored at 4 °C for 136 physicochemical analyses. This sampling approach was chosen to reduce the potential 137 bias caused by the heterogeneity of the original composting substrate in each replicate 138 pile. The ALFA-SEQ Advanced Soil Kit (mCHIP, Guangzhou, China) was used to 139 extract genomic DNA from freeze-dried samples (200 mg) according to the 140 manufacturer's instructions. DNA extraction was conducted three times per sample 141 and purified DNA samples were pooled for sequencing and genetic analysis. The 142 quality of DNA was quantified with NanoDrop ND-2000 (Thermo Fisher Scientific, 143 Wilmington, USA) spectrophotometric analysis and visualized on a 1% agarose gel 144 145 and normalized to equal concentrations before downstream qPCR processing.

146

147 **2.3 Determination of physicochemical parameters during composting**

We used previously described methods (Liao et al., 2018) to measure physicochemical properties during the composting: pH, temperature (Temp), water content (WC), total nitrogen content (TN), total carbon content (TC), total organic

carbon content (TOC), oil content (OIC), inorganic carbon content (IC) and 151 ammonium (NH₄⁺), sodium (NC) and nitrate (NO₃⁻) concentrations. Briefly, TOC and 152 IC were measured using an automatic TOC analyzer for liquid samples (Shimadzu 153 TOC-L CPH, Kyoto, Japan). TN and TC were determined in an Elementar instrument 154 (Vario MAX cube, Hanau, Germany) using dry combustion. OIC was measured using 155 Soxhlet extractor method as described previously (Wang et al., 2017b). NC analysis 156 was carried out with flame spectrophotometry. EC and pH were determined using a 157 conductivity meter (Radiometer, model CDM210) and a pH meter (PB-10, Sartorius, 158 Germany), respectively. NH_4^+ and NO_3^- were measured by a continuous-flow 159 autoanalyser (FlowSys, Systea, Rome, Italy). WC was determined as the weight loss 160 upon drying in an oven at 105 °C for 24 h. Daily monitoring of the composting 161 temperature was measured with automatic thermometers placed at different depths of 162 composting piles. 163

164

165 2.4 Measuring changes in ARG and MGE abundances with quantitative PCR 166 (qPCR)

It has previously been shown that tetracycline, macrolide, aminoglycoside and 167 sulfonamide resistance genes are the most common ARGs in organic waste (Su et al., 168 2015; Wang et al., 2017a). Therefore, we decided to study the abundance of these 169 170 ARGs during FW composting by choosing ten tetracycline resistance genes (*tetA*, *tetB*, tetC, tetG, tetL, tetM, tetQ, tetO, tetW, and tetX), seven macrolide resistance genes 171 (ermB, ermF, ermM, ermT, ermX, mefA, and ereA), seven aminoglycoside resistance 172 genes (aacA4, aadA, aadB, aadE, aphA1, strA, and strB), and three sulfonamide 173 resistance genes (sul1, sul2, and sul3) totaling 27 different ARGs. To investigate 174 potential changes in the abundance of mobile genetic elements (MGEs), we measured 175

abundances of two integrase genes (*int11*, *int12*), two plasmid genes (*ISCR1*, *IncQ*) 176 and one transposon (Tn916/1545, abbreviated as Tn916) gene that have often been 177 connected with the movement of ARGs in the environment (Ma et al., 2017; Zhang et 178 al., 2016). The bacterial abundance was measured as 16S rRNA gene copy numbers 179 using SYBR-Green qPCR. All information about primers, annealing temperatures and 180 amplification sizes used for all target genes are listed in Table S1. The qPCR reactions 181 were carried out in a LightCycler 96 System (Roche, Mannheim, Germany) using 182 96-well plates. After amplification, a melting curve analysis with a temperature 183 184 gradient ranging from 0.1 °C/s to 70 °C and to 95 °C was performed to confirm that only specific products were amplified. Standards were created using plasmids 185 carrying target genes with TA cloning and extracted using a TIAN pure Mini Plasmid 186 187 kit (Tiangen, Beijing, China). Concentrations of the standard plasmids (ng/µL) were determined using Nanodrop ND-2000 (Thermo Fisher Scientific, Wilmington, USA) 188 to calculate copy number concentrations (copies/mL). Each qPCR reaction contained 189 10 µL GoTag qPCR Master Mix (Promega, Madison, USA), 1.5 µL of each forward 190 and reverse primers (4 mmol/L), 1 µL of template genomic DNA (approximately 10 191 ng), and 6 µL of nuclease-free water. Amplification conditions were 95 °C for 2 min, 192 followed by 40 cycles of denaturation at 95 °C for 30s per cycle, annealing for 30 to 193 45s according to the amplicon length at the primer-specific annealing temperature 194 (detail in Table S1), and extension for 30s at 72 °C. The amplification efficiencies of 195 all qPCR products ranged from 90% to 110% with linear coefficient (R^2) values above 196 0.99 for all standard curves. Each reaction was run in triplicate alongside negative 197 198 controls including DNA-free water instead of template genomic DNA. Absolute abundances of target genes are presented as gene copy numbers per gram of dry 199 compost sample, while the relative abundances of target genes are shown as target 200

201 genes per 16S rRNA gene copy numbers.

202

203 **2.5** Sequencing and bioinformatic analyses of the bacterial community 204 composition during composting

We used 16S rRNA amplicon sequencing to determine changes in bacterial 205 community diversity and composition during composting. The V4 region of the 206 16S 207 bacterial rRNA gene was amplified using 515F (GTGCCAGCMGCCGCGGTAA)/806R (GGACTACHVGGGTWTCTAAT) primers 208 209 and sequenced with the Illumina Hiseq 2500 platform and paired-end sequencing (2 \times 150 bp) (Biddle et al., 2008). DNA libraries were prepared with an Illumina Hiseq 210 Nextera library preparation kit following the manufacturer's protocol. The reverse 211 212 primer contained a unique barcode for each sample and DNA was amplified in triplicate before sequencing. The amplification was initiated at 94 °C for 5 min and 213 followed by 31 amplification rounds (94 °C for 30s, 52 °C for 30s, 72 °C for 45s and 214 215 72 °C for 10 min). Raw Illumina sequence data was processed with a pipeline coupling Trimmomatic (v 0.33) and QIIME (v 1.9.1) (Caporaso et al., 2010). Briefly, 216 the raw sequences with low-quality reads that contained ambiguous nucleotides, 217 mismatches in primer regions, or a length shorter than 100 bp were removed (An et al., 218 2018). Sequences were clustered into operational taxonomic units (OTUs) with 219 220 UCLUST (version) at 97% sequence similarity (Edgar, 2010). Taxonomic OTU assignment was performed up to an 80% threshold using a Ribosome Database 221 Project Classifier as described previously using the Greengenes database (McDonald 222 223 et al., 2012). The normalization of the quality-curated sequences was conducted by subsampling to 10,759 sequences from each sample data set. Alpha-diversity was 224 estimated using OTU richness based on the number of OTUs, phylogenetic diversity, 225

Dominance, Chao1, Shannon and Simpson diversity indices. Differences between
microbial communities (beta-diversity) and principal coordinate analysis (PCoA)
were analyzed based on the weighted Unifrac distances. All sequences were deposited
in the National Center for Biotechnology Information Sequence Read Archive under
the accession number SRP156265.

231

232 **2.6** Analyzing and visualizing bacterial, ARG and MGE co-occurrence networks

Co-occurrence network analysis was used to explore pairwise correlations between 233 234 bacterial taxa and different ARGs and MGEs during FW composting. Several previous reports have demonstrated that the non-random co-occurrence patterns could 235 provide indirect evidence for potential host bacteria of ARGs and MGEs (Liao et al., 236 2018; Su et al., 2017b). Pairwise correlations were determined using Pearson and 237 Spearman correlations as described previously (Hu et al., 2017). Only relatively large 238 correlation coefficients ($\rho > 0.8$ and P < 0.01) detected with both methods (Pearson 239 and Spearman) were included into network analyses to minimize false-positive 240 correlations. Furthermore, the Benjamini-Hochberg procedure (q-value, q < 0.01) was 241 performed to adjust P-values of all correlations to control false-discovery rate. The 242 remaining significant interactions between ARGs, MGEs and bacteria were visualized 243 as a network in Cytoscape v3.4.0, and network statistics were analyzed with Network 244 Analyzer as undirected networks using default settings (Cline et al., 2007). 245

246

247 **2.7 Statistical analyses**

Data were analyzed using repeated measures ANOVA (ARG and MGE density
dynamics), PCoA, redundancy analysis (RDA), PERMANOVA test, and Procrustes
test for correlation analysis between ARGs and bacterial community composition with

the vegan package v2.4-3 in R 3.3.2. Heat maps represent log-transformed relative 251 abundances of ARGs and MGEs and were drawn with ggplot2 package in R 3.3.2. 252 Linear Discriminant Analysis Effect Size analysis (LEfSe) was used to determine 253 differentially abundant taxa between different stages of composting following 254 methods by Segata et al. (2011). Finally, a partial least squares path modeling 255 (PLS-PM) was used to explore relationships between physicochemical composting 256 properties (Temp, WC, pH, IC, TN, TC, TOC, NH₄⁺, NO₃⁻, OC, and NC), bacterial 257 alpha-diversity (based on OTU numbers, phylogenetic diversity, Dominance, Chao1, 258 259 Shannon and Simpson diversity indices), bacterial community composition (based on relative OTU abundances), MGEs (relative abundances), and ARGs (relative 260 abundances). PLS-PM is a powerful statistical method to study interactive 261 262 relationships among observed and latent variables (Wagg et al., 2014) and is widely applied to explain and predict relationships in multivariate data sets (Puech et al., 263 2015). Path coefficients (i.e. standardized partial regression coefficients) represent the 264 direction and strength of the linear relationships between variables (direct effects). 265 Indirect effects are the multiplied path coefficients between a predictor and a response 266 variable, adding the product of all possible paths excluding the direct effect. Models 267 with different structures were evaluated using the Goodness of Fit (GoF) statistic, a 268 measure of their overall predictive power. The R package plspm (v 0.4.7) was used to 269 270 construct the final PLS-PM model.

271

272 **3. Results and Discussion**

273 **3.1 Tracing ARG and MGE abundances and diversity throughout composting**

The total concentrations of ARGs and MGEs in the initial raw FW were approximately 1.5×10^{10} and 2.0×10^{9} gene copies per gram (dry weight) of FW,

respectively (Figure S1). In contrast, the initial tobacco powder contained very low 276 amounts of ARGs (0.45% of ARGs observed in FW) and was not thus included in our 277 analysis of initial ARG and MGE composition. The tetracycline and macrolide 278 resistance genes were the most dominant genes accounting for 84.3% of total ARGs 279 while the transposon Tn916 gene was the most dominant MGE in the initial FW 280 accounting for 94.2% of all MGEs (Figure S1). We also detected all targeted 27 281 ARGs and 5 MGEs that were initially present in the FW samples in the end of the 282 composting (Figure S2). Surprisingly, the total abundances of all ARGs and MGEs 283 284 significantly increased during the 50 days of FW composting (P < 0.01, Figure 1a). In particular, the abundances of tetL, sul2, strA, ermB, ISCR1 and intI1 were enriched by 285 9.5, 10.7, 10.7, 377.2, 69.4, and 48.0 times, respectively (Figure 1c). This result is in 286 287 line with previous studies showing that abundances of *tetL*, *sul2*, *ermB* can be found in reasonably high abundances after composting (Qian et al., 2016; Zhang et al., 2016). 288 One explanation could be that these ARGs were located in bacteria that were tolerant 289 to high temperatures. Alternatively, ARGs could have been located in MGEs that 290 could have been able to relocate to thermophilic bacteria during composting. We 291 found support for the both hypotheses in terms of predictable changes in bacterial 292 community composition and positive correlation between the abundances of plasmid 293 294 (ISCR1) and mobile integron (int11) genes with the increase in ARGs during composting (Figure S3, P < 0.001). Together these results suggest that traditional 295 composting is not efficient enough to remove ARGs and MGEs from FW 296 (mechanisms discussed in more detail later). Instead, we observed that FW contained 297 298 a wide diversity and abundance of ARGs and MGEs that even increased during composting. Our results thus suggest that FW could be an important but often 299 neglected source of ARGs which could also potentially serve as a transfer route for 300

ARGs between agricultural environments, food manufacturing processes and consumers (Berendonk et al., 2015; Verraes et al., 2013; Wang et al., 2012). Great caution should thus be taken in using FW as composting raw material. However, we also want to note that only one type of FW was investigated in this study, and hence, other FW types should be examined in future studies to explore the generality of our results.

To investigate the dynamics of ARGs during composting, we focused on the link 307 between the abundances of bacteria, ARGs and MGEs during composting in more 308 309 detail. We found that total bacterial abundances based on 16S rRNA gene copy numbers increased during composting (Figure 1a). This is in line with previous results 310 (Wang et al., 2017b) and can be explained by the increased amount of nutrients that 311 become available for microbial growth during composting (Adhikari et al., 2009). 312 Crucially, the increase in the total bacteria abundances was relatively higher than the 313 increase in ARGs, and as a result, the relative abundance of ARGs per number of 314 bacterial cells decreased during the composting (Figure 1b and d, P < 0.01). 315 Particularly, tetracycline, macrolide, aminoglycoside and sulfonamide resistance 316 genes showed clear decreases in their relative abundance, while a significant but less 317 drastic decrease in the relative abundance of MGEs was observed (Figure 1b and d, P 318 < 0.01). Together, these results suggest that even though the absolute abundances of 319 320 ARGs and MGEs increased during composting, their relative abundances decreased and fewer bacteria carried ARGs and MGEs at the end of composting. This could 321 have been due to because composting conditions favored non-ARG carrying bacteria, 322 323 because carrying ARGs incurred fitness costs reducing bacterial competitive ability (Durão et al., 2018) or because bacteria that were less susceptible to MGEs became 324 more abundant (Youngquist et al., 2016). While all these hypotheses should be tested 325

in the future experiments to better understand the mobilization of ARGs during composting, our study suggest that concentrating both absolute and relative ARG abundances is important for predicting the risk of ARG movement across different environmental compartments.

330

Figure 1

332

333 **3.2** Changes in the bacterial community composition during FW composting

The composting process significantly influenced the composition of bacterial 334 communities as shown in the non-metric multidimensional scaling plot based on 335 weighted Unifrac distances (PERMANOVA test, $R^2=0.8571$, P < 0.01, Figure 2a). 336 The bacterial community composition showed also a distinct clustering at different 337 phases of composting based on Unweighted Pair-group Method with Arithmetic Mean 338 339 (UPGMA) clustering (Figure S4). This result was further confirmed in a PCoA based on the weighted UniFrac distances (Figure S5) and LEfSe (Figure S6). These results 340 are similar to previous studies and demonstrate that distinct changes in the bacterial 341 342 community occur throughout composting (Su et al., 2015; Zainudin et al., 2017) and this is probably due to changes in temperature, physicochemical composting 343 properties and a natural succession of microbial communities. Alpha-diversity of the 344 bacterial community varied significantly during composting (Table S2). In particular, 345 OTU richness slightly increased until 24 days then decreased significantly compared 346 to the initial FW (Figure 2b, P < 0.01). This was likely due to a removal of 347 thermolabile bacteria by the high composting temperature (approximately 65 °C) and 348 an increased abundance of thermotolerant bacteria. In support of this, the composition 349 of bacterial communities measured at the phylum level displayed clear temporal 350

dynamics during 50 days of composting (Figure 2c). More specifically, the relative 351 abundance of Acidobacteria, Proteobacteria, and Bacteroidetes decreased from 21.59% 352 to 7.12%, from 7.70% to 0.57%, and from 2.46% to 0.024%, respectively. 353 Correspondingly, Firmicutes (principally consisting of the family Staphylococcaceae 354 and Bacillaceae) increased from 67.95% to 91.90%. The majority of Bacillaceae form 355 heat-resistant spores that provide a competitive advantage over thermolabile bacteria 356 at elevated temperatures during composting (Liao et al., 2018; Zhang et al., 2015). 357 Interestingly, the increase in Staphylococcaceae abundance from 0.8% to 22.0% 358 359 towards the end of composting correlated positively with the increase in total ARG and MGE abundances (Figure S7, P < 0.01). Staphylococcaceae includes several 360 food-related, often antibiotic resistant pathogens that often naturally carry various 361 ARGs and MGEs (Ravcheev and Rodionov, 2011). Specifically, the foodborne 362 bacterial genera Jeotgalicoccus and Staphylococcus (Deák, 2011) (both within 363 Staphylococcaceae) increased in abundance during composting and replaced various 364 initially dominant genera in the FW: Bacillus (22.43%), Oceanobacillus (21.95%), 365 and Corynebacterium (12.92%) (Figures 2d and Figure S8). It has been shown 366 previously that incubation at 80 °C for 60 min is required to completely kill 367 Staphylococcus aureus (Yang et al., 2008). Therefore, it is likely that the maximum 368 temperature of 65 °C was not high enough to eradicate these bacteria. This is in line 369 370 with previous studies showing that most foodborne pathogens such as *Staphylococcus* spp. and *Enterococcus* spp. persist during composting (Awasthi et al., 2018). Together, 371 these results suggest that composting can predictably change the composition of 372 bacterial communities potentially favouring bacteria that can resist periodically high 373 temperatures, and hence, be also responsible for carrying and disseminating ARGs 374 and MGEs during FW composting. 375

376

Figure 2 377

378

379 **3.3 Relationships between ARGs and MGEs with different taxa in bacterial**

380 communities

A Procrustes analysis based on bacterial OTUs and ARG abundances showed that 381 ARGs significantly correlated with the bacterial community composition (Figure S9, 382 M^2 = 0.5675, R = 0.7407, P < 0.0001, 9999 permutations). Similarly, the relative and 383 total MGE abundances correlated positively with total ARG abundances (P < 0.001, 384 Figure S10a) and this finding was further confirmed by nonrandom co-occurrence 385 patterns between individual ARGs and MGEs (Table 1 and Figure S10b). These 386 results indicate that MGEs likely played an important role in the dissemination of 387 ARGs during FW composting, which is consistent with previous findings on ARG 388 movement in general (Bengtsson-Palme et al., 2018; Gillings, 2017; Zhu et al., 2017). 389 The relationships between individual ARGs, MGEs and abundances of different 390 391 bacterial taxa were further explored using correlation-based network analyses. We found that most ARGs and MGEs (87%) correlated positively (P < 0.01) with 18 392 bacterial genera. All these ARG-associated genera belonged to four phyla: Firmicutes, 393 Acidobacteria, Proteobacteria, and Bacteroidetes (Figure 3a). Consistent with 394 previous finding (Liao et al., 2018), more than 65% of ARG- and MGE-associated 395 bacteria belonged to Proteobacteria and Firmicutes (Figure S11), which were the 396 dominant phyla in the initial FW material. Together these results further suggest that 397 MGEs and ARGs are strongly linked with certain bacterial taxa in FW. 398

Many bacteria frequently carry multiple ARGs and/or MGEs at the same time in their plasmids, which are considered as the main vehicle for horizontal transfer of

genetic material (Zhang et al., 2011). In support of this, we found that for example the 401 genus Acinetobacter was significantly associated with 22 different resistance genes, 402 while Sphingobacterium and Lactobacillus had significant associations with 20 and 9 403 different resistance genes, respectively. Certain Acinetobacter 404 spp. are multidrug-resistant and act as major infection agents in debilitated patients (Towner, 405 2009). Similarly, Lactococcus lactis has been shown to carry genes conferring 406 resistance to tetracycline, erythromycin, and vancomycin (Mathur and Singh, 2005). 407 We also found that Acinetobacter, Alcaligenes, and Ignatzschineria correlated with 408 409 three MGEs (IncQ, intI2, and Tn916) and multiple ARGs (Figure S12), suggesting that these bacterial genera might act as hubs for horizontal transfer of ARGs. Our 410 results thus suggest that ARGs could have been maintained as multi-drug resistance 411 plasmids or transposons in bacterial community and be potentially transferred by a 412 certain key group of bacteria. However, we have to note that our DNA-based 413 approach cannot fully address whether microorganisms were viable. Therefore, 414 cultivation-based approaches are needed to confirm that ARG-carrying 415 microorganisms in the compost are active. Furthermore, subsequent genome 416 sequencing would allow to detect the exact number and diversity of ARGs within 417 individual species and if ARGs are located in the bacterial chromosome or plasmids. 418

We next explored the dynamics of ARG and/or MGE-associated bacteria during composting. In the initial FW material, *Bacillus* (22.4%), *Oceanobacillus* (21.9%), *Corynebacterium* (12.9%), *Saccharomonospora* (6.8%), and *Ignatzschineria* (5.7%) were the main ARG/MGE-associated bacteria (67.0% of total 16S rRNA gene sequences). The abundance of these genera gradually decreased to 23.3% during 50 days of composting (Figure 3b), and at the same time, the relative abundance of the genera (*Jeotgalicoccus, Staphylococcus*, and *Sporosarcina*) increased by 123.9, 11.6,

and 6.3 times, respectively. This gives more support to the idea that ARG and 426 MGE-associated taxa increased during the composting likely due to the high 427 composting temperature (Burch et al., 2017; Su et al., 2015). Although the maximum 428 temperature during composting reached up to 65 °C (>55 °C for approximately 7 days, 429 Figure S13), most bacterial genera still persisted and some genera even increased in 430 their relative abundance over time (Figure 3b). While this shift could have been 431 432 driven by horizontal gene transfer between heat-susceptible and tolerant bacteria in the beginning of the experiment, it is also possible that ARGs and MGEs survived at 433 434 elevated composting temperatures as a cell-free DNA and were picked up by other bacteria later during composting. For example, a previous laboratory study has shown 435 that cell-free DNA is stable even at temperatures up to 70 °C (Zhang and Wu, 2005) 436 437 and that cell-free DNA or plasmids originating from lysed bacterial cells at high temperature can contain ARGs and/or MGEs (Nielsen et al., 2007). Together these 438 results suggest that FW contains several bacterial taxa that may disseminate ARGs to 439 other bacterial hosts through horizontal gene transfer and due to their survival at high 440 temperatures. In addition to plasmids, alternative carriers of ARGs or MGEs, such as 441 bacteriophages (Lekunberri et al., 2017; Wang et al., 2018), which were not 442 investigated here, should be included in future studies. 443

444

445 **Figure 3**

446 **Table 1**

447

3.4 Determining the relative importance of bacterial community composition and
 diversity, MGEs and physicochemical properties for ARG abundances during
 composting

The results from the RDA analysis showed that selected variables (including 451 physicochemical compositing properties, bacterial community composition and MGE 452 abundances) could explain 74% of the total variance of ARG abundance dynamics 453 during composting (Figure S14). To further study how ARGs were affected by biotic 454 and abiotic factors during composting, we built a Partial Least Squares Path Model 455 (PLS-PM) describing direct and indirect relationships between different variables. We 456 found that both physicochemical composting properties and MGE abundances had 457 equally strong direct positive effects on ARG abundances, while bacterial community 458 459 diversity or composition had no statistically significant effect (Figure 4). This result is in contrast with a previous finding showing that the bacterial community composition 460 is the main factor driving changes in ARG abundances in a mariculture sediment (Han 461 et al., 2017). However, it is consistent with another study, where environmental 462 factors rather than bacterial community composition were more important in driving 463 changes in ARG abundances during composting (Liao et al., 2018). Composting 464 properties also had direct positive effects on bacterial community composition and 465 alpha-diversity, and indirect positive effects on MGE abundances via bacterial 466 community composition. MGEs have recently been proposed to have a more 467 important role in the spread of ARGs than the microbial community composition or 468 microbial diversity (Ma et al., 2017; Wu et al., 2017). One possible reason may be 469 that MGEs are very successful at mobilizing ARGs in environmental microbial 470 communities via horizontal gene transfer (Wang et al., 2017a). Additionally, 471 resistance genes are often clustered for example in multi-drug resistance plasmids. 472 473 Together with the PLS-PM analysis (Figure 4b), our results provide more support to the idea that changes in ARG abundances were likely driven by horizontal gene 474 transfer (MGEs), which itself was strongly affected by the bacterial community 475

composition. While previous research has connected the microbial community 476 structure with predictable changes in ARG abundances in various environments (Su et 477 al., 2015; Wu et al., 2017), our results suggest that also physicochemical composting 478 properties can directly and indirectly change ARG abundances during FW composting. 479 This could be specifically explained by certain properties, such as temperature and pH, 480 that can have direct positive effects on ARG- and MGE-associated bacterial growth 481 during composting (Awasthi et al., 2018). For example, high temperature will 482 decompose polymeric substances present in the FW increasing nutrient availability 483 484 (Li et al., 2013).

To better understand the specific composting properties influencing ARG 485 abundances, we used variance partitioning to analyze our data in more detail (VPA). 486 487 We found that pH, NO_3^{-1} concentration and water content (WC) alone explained 9.1%, 12.9%, and 9.1% of total variation of ARG abundances, respectively (Figure 4c). 488 Interestingly, interactive effects between pH and WC and pH, WC and NO₃⁻ 489 explained 35.2 % and 12.6% of the total variation of ARG abundances, respectively 490 (Figure 4c). The initially low pH (4.4) remained below 5.5 during the first 30 days of 491 492 composting (Figure S13). This likely resulted from the acidification of FW that contained organic acids and some low-molecular-weight volatiles produced by 493 microbes (Yu and Huang, 2009), which could have prevented the growth of 494 indigenous bacteria (Awasthi et al., 2018) and constrained the horizontal transfer of 495 ARGs via less frequent encounter rates during composting (Ma et al., 2015). In 496 addition, moisture content played an important role alone and interactively with the 497 pH. Moisture content is known to influence microbial activity, free airspace, 498 temperature and aeration during composting (Awasthi et al., 2018) and could thus 499 500 affect the connectivity and MGE-induced horizontal transfer of ARGs between

bacterial sub-populations. However, further work is needed to better understand how
physicochemical properties and horizontal gene transfer might interactively drive
ARG dynamics during composting.

504

505 Figure 4

506

507 4. Conclusions

Our study shows that FW is an important reservoir of ARGs and MGEs and that 508 traditional composting is inefficient in removing the ARGs despite a clear decrease 509 in relative abundances of ARGs. Moreover, our study supports the idea that 510 horizontal gene transfer and physicochemical composting properties, such as 511 512 temperature, pH and moisture, are important for disseminating and maintaining ARGs during FW composting. As a result, even though high composting 513 temperatures reduced the number of initial ARG-associated bacterial taxa, ARGs 514 515 were likely maintained in other bacterial taxa potentially due to horizontal gene transfer as indicated by strong positive correlations between ARGs and MGEs. These 516 findings suggest that new composting methods are needed for removal of ARGs 517 during composting to reduce the risk of disseminating ARGs to agricultural 518 519 environments.

520

521 Acknowledgements

This work was supported by the National Key Research and Development Program of
China (2017YFD0800203), National Natural Science Foundation of China
(31601831), the National Key Technologies R&D Program of Fujian

21

(2017NZ0001-1). Fujian Agriculture and Forestry University Program for 525 Distinguished Young Scholar (No. XJO2017001). Ville-Petri Friman is supported by 526 the Wellcome Trust [ref: 105624] through the Centre for Chronic Diseases and 527 Disorders (C2D2) and Royal Society Research Grant (RSG\R1\180213) at the 528 University of York. Stefan Geisen is supported by a NWO-VENI grant from the 529 Netherlands Organization for Scientific Research (016.Veni.181.078). We would like 530 531 to thank Beijing Geogreen Innotech Co., Ltd for offering the experimental condition and Huan Liu for help in sampling. 532

533

534 Appendix A. Supplementary data

535 Supplementary data related to this article can be found online.

536 **References**

- 537 Adhikari BK, Barrington S, Martinez J, King S. Effectiveness of three bulking agents for food waste
- 538 composting. Waste Manage. 2009; 29: 197-203.
- 539 An XL, Su JQ, Li B, Ouyang WY, Zhao Y, Chen QL, et al. Tracking antibiotic resistome during
- 540 wastewater treatment using high throughput quantitative PCR. Environ. Int. 2018; 117: 146-153.
- 541 Awasthi SK, Wong JWC, Li J, Wang Q, Zhang Z, Kumar S, et al. Evaluation of microbial dynamics
- 542 during post-consumption food waste composting. Bioresource. Technol. 2018; 251: 181-188.
- 543 Bengtsson-Palme J, Kristiansson E, Larsson DGJ. Environmental factors influencing the development
- and spread of antibiotic resistance. Fems Microbiol. Rev. 2018; 42: 68-80.
- 545 Berendonk TU, Manaia CM, Merlin C, Fatta-Kassinos D, Cytryn E, Walsh F, et al. Tackling antibiotic
- resistance: the environmental framework. Nat. Rev. Microbiol. 2015; 13: 310-317.
- 547 Biddle JF, Fitz-Gibbon S, Schuster SC, Brenchley JE, House CH. Metagenomic signatures of the Peru
- 548 Margin subseafloor biosphere show a genetically distinct environment. Proc. Nat. Acad. Sci. U.S.A.
- **549** 2008; 105: 10583-10588.
- 550 Breunig HM, Jin L, Robinson A, Scown CD. Bioenergy potential from food waste in California.
- 551 Environ. Sci. Technol. 2017; 51: 1120-1128.

- 552 Burch T, Sadowsky MJ, LaPara TM. The effect of different treatment technologies on the fate of
- antibiotic resistance genes and class 1 integrons when residual municipal wastewater solids are applied
- to soil. Environ. Sci. Technol. 2017; 51: 14225–14232.
- 555 Caporaso JG, Kuczynski J, Stombaugh J, Bittinger K, Bushman FD, Costello EK, et al. QIIME allows
- analysis of high-throughput community sequencing data. Nat. Methods 2010; 7: 335.
- 557 Cerda A, Artola A, Font X, Barrena R, Gea T, Sánchez A. Composting of food wastes: Status and
- challenges. Bioresource. Technol. 2018; 248: 57-67.
- 559 Cline MS, Smoot M, Cerami E, Kuchinsky A, Landys N, Workman C, et al. Integration of biological
- networks and gene expression data using Cytoscape. Nat. Protoc. 2007; 2: 2366.
- 561 Deák T. A survey of current taxonomy of common foodborne bacteria. Acta Aliment. Hung. 2011; 40:
 562 95-116.
- 563 Durão P, Balbontín R, Gordo I. Evolutionary Mechanisms Shaping the Maintenance of Antibiotic
- Resistance. Trends Microbiol. 2018; 26: 677-691.
- Edgar RC. Search and clustering orders of magnitude faster than BLAST. Bioinformatics 2010; 26:
 2460-2461.
- 567 Forsberg KJ, Patel S, Gibson MK, Lauber CL, Knight R, Fierer N, et al. Bacterial phylogeny structures
- soil resistomes across habitats. Nature 2014; 509: 612.
- 569 Gillings MR. Class 1 integrons as invasive species. Curr. Opin. Biotech. 2017; 38: 10-15.
- 570 Gustavsson J, Cederberg C, Sonesson U, van Otterdijk R, Meybeck A. Global food losses and food
- 571 waste: extent, causes and prevention. FAO, Rome. Food and Agriculture Organization of the United
- 572 Nations 2011; <u>http://www.fao.org/docrep/014/mb060e/mb060e00.pdf</u>.
- 573 Han Y, Wang J, Zhao Z, Chen J, Lu H, Liu G. Fishmeal application induces antibiotic resistance gene
- 574 propagation in mariculture sediment. Environ. Sci. Technol. 2017; 51: 10850–10860.
- 575 Hu H, Wang J-T, Li J, Shi X, Ma Y, Chen D, et al. Long-term nickel contamination increases the
- 576 occurrence of antibiotic resistance genes in agricultural soils. Environ. Sci. Technol. 2017; 51: 790-800.
- 577 Lekunberri I, Villagrasa M, Balcázar JL, Borrego CM. Contribution of bacteriophage and plasmid DNA
- 578 to the mobilization of antibiotic resistance genes in a river receiving treated wastewater discharges. Sci.
- 579 Total. Environ. 2017; 601-602: 206-209.
- 580 Li Z, Lu H, Ren L, He L. Experimental and modeling approaches for food waste composting: A review.
- 581 Chemosphere 2013; 93: 1247-1257.

- 582 Liao H, Lu X, Rensing C, Friman VP, Geisen S, Chen Z, et al. Hyperthermophilic composting
- 583 accelerates the removal of antibiotic resistance genes and mobile genetic elements in sewage sludge.
- 584 Environ. Sci. Technol. 2018; 52: 266-276.
- 585 Liu M, Li Q, Sun H, Jia S, He X, Li M, et al. Impact of salinity on antibiotic resistance genes in
- wastewater treatment bioreactors. Chem. Eng. J. 2018; 338: 557-563.
- 587 Ma L, Li A-d, Yin X-L, Zhang T. The prevalence of integrons as the carrier of antibiotic resistance
- genes in natural and man-made environments. Environ. Sci. Technol. 2017; 51: 2720-5728.
- 589 Ma L, Xia Y, Li B, Yang Y, Li L-G, Tiedje JM, et al. Metagenomic assembly reveals hosts of antibiotic
- resistance genes and the shared resistome in pig, chicken and human feces. Environ. Sci. Technol. 2015;
- 591 50: 420-427.
- 592 Mathur S, Singh R. Antibiotic resistance in food lactic acid bacteria—a review. Int. J. Food Microbiol
 593 2005; 105: 281-295.
- 594 McDonald D, Price MN, Goodrich J, Nawrocki EP, DeSantis TZ, Probst A, et al. An improved
- 595 Greengenes taxonomy with explicit ranks for ecological and evolutionary analyses of bacteria and
- 596 archaea. ISME J 2012; 6: 610-618.
- 597 Nielsen KM, Johnsen PJ, Bensasson D, Daffonchio D. Release and persistence of extracellular DNA in
- the environment. Environ. Biosaf. Res. 2007; 6: 37-53.
- 599 Pehrsson EC, Tsukayama P, Patel S, Mejía-Bautista M, Sosa-Soto G, Navarrete KM, et al.
- 600 Interconnected microbiomes and resistomes in low-income human habitats. Nature 2016; 533:
- 601 212-216.
- 602 Puech C, Poggi S, Baudry J, Aviron S. Do farming practices affect natural enemies at the landscape
- 603 scale? Landscape. Ecol. 2015; 30: 125-140.
- 604 Qian X, Sun W, Gu J, Wang X-J, Sun J-J, Yin Y-N, et al. Variable effects of oxytetracycline on
- antibiotic resistance gene abundance and the bacterial community during aerobic composting of cow
- 606 manure. J. Hazard. Mater. 2016; 315: 61-69.
- 607 Ravcheev D, Rodionov D. Comparative genomics based reconstruction of transcription regulation
- 608 network in Staphylococcaceae. Moscow Conference on Computational Molecular Biology 2011; 305:
- 609 21-24.
- 610 Rolain JM. Food and human gut as reservoirs of transferable antibiotic resistance encoding genes.
- 611 Front. Microbiol. 2013; 4: 173.

- 612 Ruimy R, Brisabois A, Bernede C, Skurnik D, Barnat S, Arlet G, et al. Organic and conventional fruits
- and vegetables contain equivalent counts of Gram-negative bacteria expressing resistance to
- 614 antibacterial agents. Environ. Microbiol. 2010; 12: 608-615.
- 615 Segata N, Izard J, Waldron L, Gevers D, Miropolsky L, Garrett WS, et al. Metagenomic biomarker
- discovery and explanation. Genome. Biol. 2011; 12: R60.
- 617 Su J-Q, An X-L, Li B, Chen Q-L, Gillings MR, Chen H, et al. Metagenomics of urban sewage
- 618 identifies an extensively shared antibiotic resistome in China. Microbiome 2017a; 5: 84.
- 619 Su J-Q, Wei B, Ou-Yang W-Y, Huang F-Y, Zhao Y, Xu H-J, et al. Antibiotic resistome and its
- association with bacterial communities during sewage sludge composting. Environ. Sci. Technol. 2015;
- **621** 49: 7356-7363.
- 622 Su JQ, Cui L, Chen QL, An XL, Zhu YG. Application of genomic technologies to measure and monitor
- antibiotic resistance in animals. Ann. Ny. Acad. Sci. 2017b; 1388: 121-135.
- Towner KJ. Acinetobacter: an old friend, but a new enemy. J. Hosp. Infect. 2009; 73: 355-363.
- 625 Verraes C, Van Boxstael S, Van Meervenne E, Van Coillie E, Butaye P, Catry B, et al. Antimicrobial
- resistance in the food chain: a review. Int. J. Env, Res, Pub, He, 2013; 10: 2643.
- 627 Wagg C, Bender SF, Widmer F, van der Heijden MG. Soil biodiversity and soil community
- 628 composition determine ecosystem multifunctionality. Proc. Nat. Acad. Sci. U.S.A. 2014; 111:
- **629** 5266-5270.
- 630 Wang H, McEntire JC, Zhang L, Li X, Doyle M. The transfer of antibiotic resistance from food to
- humans_facts, implications and future directions. Rev. sci. tech. Off. int. Epiz 2012; 31: 249.
- 632 Wang H, Sangwan N, Li H-Y, Su J-Q, Oyang W-Y, Zhang Z-J, et al. The antibiotic resistome of swine
- 633 manure is significantly altered by association with the Musca domestica larvae gut microbiome. ISME.
- 634 J 2017a; 11: 100-111.
- 635 Wang M, Liu P, Zhou Q, Tao W, Sun Y, Zeng Z. Estimating the contribution of bacteriophage to the
- dissemination of antibiotic resistance genes in pig feces. Environ. Pollut. 2018; 238: 291-298.
- 637 Wang X, Pan S, Zhang Z, Lin X, Zhang Y, Chen S. Effects of the feeding ratio of food waste on
- 638 fed-batch aerobic composting and its microbial community. Bioresource. Technol. 2017b; 224:
- **639** 397-404.
- 640 Wu D, Huang X-H, Sun J-Z, Graham DW, Xie B. Antibiotic resistance genes and associated microbial
- 641 community conditions in aging landfill systems. Environ. Sci. Technol. 2017; 21: 12859–12867.

- 642 Xie W-Y, Mcgrath SP, Su J, Hirsch PR, Clark IM, Shen Q, et al. Long-term impact of field applications
- of sewage sludge on soil antibiotic resistome. Environ. Sci. Technol. 2016; 50: 12602-12611.
- 44 Yang W, Zerbe H, Petzl W, Brunner RM, Günther J, Draing C, et al. Bovine TLR2 and TLR4 properly
- 645 transduce signals from Staphylococcus aureus and E. coli, but S. aureus fails to both activate NF-κB in
- 646 mammary epithelial cells and to quickly induce $TNF\alpha$ and interleukin-8 (CXCL8) expression in the
- 647 udder. Mol. Immunol. 2008; 45: 1385-1397.
- 648 Yong Z, Dong Y, Zhang X, Tan T. Anaerobic co-digestion of food waste and straw for biogas
- 649 production. Renew. Energ. 2015; 78: 527-530.
- 650 Youngquist CP, Mitchell SM, Cogger CG. Fate of antibiotics and antibiotic resistance during digestion
- and composting: A review. J. Environ. Qual. 2016; 45: 537-545.
- 652 Yu H, Huang GH. Effects of sodium acetate as a pH control amendment on the composting of food
- 653 waste. Bioresource. Technol. 2009; 100: 2005-2011.
- 654 Zainudin MHM, Ramli N, Hassan MA, Shirai Y, Tashiro K, Sakai K, et al. Bacterial community shift
- for monitoring the co-composting of oil palm empty fruit bunch and palm oil mill effluent anaerobic
- 656 sludge. J. Ind. Microbiol. Biot 2017; 44: 869-877.
- 657 Zhang C, Su H, Baeyens J, Tan T. Reviewing the anaerobic digestion of food waste for biogas
- 658 production. Renew. Sust. Energ. Rev. 2014; 38: 383-392.
- 259 Zhang J, Sui Q, Tong J, Buhe C, Wang R, Chen M, et al. Sludge bio-drying: Effective to reduce both
- antibiotic resistance genes and mobile genetic elements. Water Res. 2016; 106: 62-70.
- 661 Zhang L, Ma H, Zhang H, Xun L, Chen G, Wang L. Thermomyces lanuginosus is the dominant fungus
- in maize straw composts. Bioresource. Technol. 2015; 197: 266-275.
- 563 Zhang L, Wu Q. Single gene retrieval from thermally degraded DNA. J. Bioscience. 2005; 30:
- **664** 599-604.
- 665 Zhang T, Zhang X-X, Ye L. Plasmid Metagenome Reveals High Levels of Antibiotic Resistance Genes
- and Mobile Genetic Elements in Activated Sludge. PLOS ONE 2011; 6: e26041.
- 667 Zhu Y, Zhao Y, Li B, Huang C, Zhang S, Yu S, et al. Continental-scale pollution of estuaries with
- antibiotic resistance genes. Nat. Microbiol. 2017; 2: 16270.
- 669

670

671	
672	
673	
674	
675	
676	
677	
678	
679	
680	
681	
682	Figure captions
683	Figure 1. The dynamics of total ARG, MGE and bacterial abundances (16S rRNA gene
684	copies) during FW composting. Panel (a-b): Changes in target gene (ARGs, MGEs and 16S
685	rRNA) abundances during composting presented as the sum of target genes based on absolute (a)
686	and relative gene abundances (b). Panel (c-d): Heat maps showing changes in the density of
687	individual ARG and MGE gene abundances based on absolute (c) and relative abundance (d)
688	during FW composting. Bars denote for mean \pm standard error. Significance levels are indicated by

689 690 * (P < 0.05), ** (P < 0.01) levels.

Figure 2. Changes in bacterial community composition and diversity during FW composting.
Panel (a): Overall distribution pattern of OTU-based bacterial community dissimilarity during
composting (non-metric multidimensional scaling (NMDS); ordination derived from
weighted-UniFrac distances). Symbols with different colors denote for different sampling days.
Panel (b): Changes in observed OTU number during composting. An asterisk (*) and two asterisks

(**) indicate significant differences at 0.05 and 0.01 significance levels, respectively. Panel (c):
Relative abundance of different bacterial phyla during composting. (d): Ternary plot depicting the
distribution of bacterial taxa (at genus level, relative abundance > 1%) at different stages of
composting (D0 presents the control (day 0), D13 the thermophilic phase (day 13) and D50 the
maturation phase (day 50))

701

702 Figure 3. Co-occurrence network showing positive associations between ARGs, MGEs and 703 different bacterial taxa. Panel (a): Nodes coded with different colors and shapes represent 704 different ARGs, MGEs and bacterial phyla, and the edges correspond to strong and significant 705 correlations between nodes (P < 0.01). Node sizes represent the relative abundances of ARGs, 706 MGEs, and bacterial phyla during FW composting. Panel (b): Distribution profiles showing the 707 relative abundance of ARG- and MGE-associated bacteria at genus level during FW composting. 708 The legend on the right side of the panel denote for relative abundances (%) of total 16S rRNA 709 gene sequences for each presented bacterial taxon.

710

711 Figure 4. Partial least squares path model (PLS-PM) showing direct and indirect effects of 712 different factors on ARG abundances. Panel (a): PLS-PM describing the relationships between composting properties, bacterial diversity, bacterial community composition (at phylum level) and 713 mobile genetic elements (MGEs) on ARG abundances. Arrow widths describe the magnitude of 714 the path coefficients, and blue and red colors indicate for positive and negative effects, 715 respectively. Path coefficients and coefficients of determination (R^2) were calculated after 999 716 bootstrap replicates and significance levels are indicated by * (P < 0.05), ** (P < 0.01) and *** (P717 718 < 0.001) levels. (b): Standardized effects (direct and indirect effects) derived from the partial least 719 squares path models. (c): Variation partitioning analysis (VPA) comparing the effects of different composting properties including pH, NO3, and WC on the ARGs abundances. The explanatory 720 721 factor with values less than 0.01 (explained < 1% of total ARGs variations) was removed from 722 VPA results. WC: water content, NO₃-N: nitrate concentration. Relative abundance data was used 723 to analyze PLS-PM.

Table 1 Spearman's correlations between the relative abundance of ARGs and
MGEs during food waste composting

Table 1 Spearman's correlations between the relative abundance of ARGs and

	Relative abundance of MGEs					
AKGS	int[]	intI2	Tn916	ISR1	IncQ	Total MGEs
tetA	0.414*	0.918**	0.885**	0.285	0.887**	0.901**
tetB	0.339	0.842**	0.888**	0.214	0.921**	0.888**
tetC	0.795**	0.554**	0.42*	0.589**	0.338	0.448*
tetG	0.797**	0.503*	0.645**	0.619**	0.55**	0.666**
tetL	0.204	0.643**	0.735**	0.055	0.806	0.73**
tetM	-0.296	0.17	0.341	-0.456*	0.517**	0.345
tetQ	0.807**	0.531**	0.432*	0.593**	0.344	0.465*
tetO	0.582**	0.69**	0.698**	0.255	0.675**	0.723**
tetW	0.505*	0.497*	0.659**	0.274	0.624**	0.675**
tetX	0.609**	0.558**	0.593**	0.456*	0.505**	0.59**
sul1	0.85**	0.561**	0.538**	0.651**	0.45*	0.572**
sul2	0.577**	0.884**	0.663**	0.51*	0.601**	0.705**
sul3	0.428*	0.823**	0.813**	0.376	0.781**	0.81**
strA	0.439*	0.77**	0.593**	0.289	0.529**	0.635**
strB	0.517**	0.744**	0.843**	0.37	0.815**	0.861**
aacA4	0.256	0.238	0.058	0.056	-0.034	0.090
aadA	0.453*	0.905**	0.771**	0.33	0.728**	0.808**
aadB	0.658**	0.53**	0.396	0.716**	0.227	0.429*
aadE	0.322	0.843**	0.846**	0.158	0.906**	0.843**
aphA1	0.237	0.147	-0.155	0.37	-0.154	-0.127
ermB	-0.269	-0.209	-0.283	-0.421*	-0.268	-0.268
ermF	0.497*	0.917**	0.871**	0.468*	0.812**	0.887**
ermM	0.11	0.492*	0.643**	-0.095	0.79**	0.62**
ermT	0.657**	0.579**	0.63**	0.524**	0.542**	0.663**
ermX	0.486*	0.035	-0.09	0.338	-0.215	-0.055
mefA	0.298	0.72**	0.677**	0.025	0.763**	0.682**
ereA	0.547**	0.61**	0.414*	0.261	0.44*	0.449*
Total ARGs	0.28	0.792**	0.895**	0.106	0.938**	0.904**

MGEs during food waste composting

**Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed). *Correlation is significant at the 0.05 level (2-tailed).

Figure Click here to download Figure: Figure-1201.docx



Figure 1



Figure 2



Figure 3



Figure 4

Supplementary material for on-line publication only Click here to download Supplementary material for on-line publication only: Supplementary files_1201.docx