UNIVERSITY of York

This is a repository copy of *Evaluating the implementation related challenges of Shasthyo Suroksha Karmasuchi (health protection scheme) of the government of Bangladesh: a study protocol.*

White Rose Research Online URL for this paper: <u>https://eprints.whiterose.ac.uk/133168/</u>

Version: Published Version

Article:

Ahmed, Sayem, Hasan, Md. Zahid, Ahmed, Mohammad Wahid et al. (7 more authors) (Accepted: 2018) Evaluating the implementation related challenges of Shasthyo Suroksha Karmasuchi (health protection scheme) of the government of Bangladesh: a study protocol. BMC Health Services Research. ISSN 1472-6963 (In Press)

https://doi.org/10.1186/s12913-018-3337-x

Reuse

This article is distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY) licence. This licence allows you to distribute, remix, tweak, and build upon the work, even commercially, as long as you credit the authors for the original work. More information and the full terms of the licence here: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/

Takedown

If you consider content in White Rose Research Online to be in breach of UK law, please notify us by emailing eprints@whiterose.ac.uk including the URL of the record and the reason for the withdrawal request.



eprints@whiterose.ac.uk https://eprints.whiterose.ac.uk/ Dear Author,

Here are the final proofs of your article. Please check the proofs carefully.

All communications with regard to the proof should be sent to <u>bmcproductionteam2@spi-global.com</u>.

Please note that at this stage you should only be checking for errors introduced during the production process. Please pay particular attention to the following when checking the proof:

- Author names. Check that each author name is spelled correctly, and that names appear in the correct order of first name followed by family name. This will ensure that the names will be indexed correctly (for example if the author's name is 'Jane Patel', she will be cited as 'Patel, J.').

- Affiliations. Check that all authors are cited with the correct affiliations, that the author who will receive correspondence has been identified with an asterisk (*), and that all equal contributors have been identified with a dagger sign (†).

- Ensure that the main text is complete.
- Check that figures, tables and their legends are included and in the correct order.
- Look to see that queries that were raised during copy-editing or typesetting have been resolved.
- Confirm that all web links are correct and working.
- Ensure that special characters and equations are displaying correctly.
- Check that additional or supplementary files can be opened and are correct.

<u>Changes in scientific content cannot be made at this stage unless the request has already been</u> <u>approved.</u> This includes changes to title or authorship, new results, or corrected values.

How to return your corrections

Returning your corrections via online submission:

- Please provide details of your corrections in the online correction form. Always indicate the line number to which the correction refers.

Returning your corrections via email:

- Annotate the proof PDF with your corrections.
- Send it as an email attachment to: <u>bmcproductionteam2@spi-global.com</u>.

- Remember to include the journal title, manuscript number, and your name when sending your response via email.

After you have submitted your corrections, you will receive email notification from our production team that your article has been published in the final version. All changes at this stage are final. We will not be able to make any further changes after publication.

Kind regards,

BioMed Central Production Team 2

STUDY PROTOCOL

Open Access

Evaluating the implementation related challenges of Shasthyo Suraksha

- ³ challenges of *Shasthyo Suroksha*
- *Karmasuchi* (health protection scheme) of
- the government of Bangladesh: a study
- 6 protocol

Sayem Ahmed^{1,2*}, Md. Zahid Hasan¹, Mohammad Wahid Ahmed¹, Farzana Dorin¹, Marufa Sultana¹, Ziaul Islam¹,
 Andrew J. Mirelman³, Clas Rehnberg², Jahangir A. M. Khan^{2,4} and Mahbub Elahi Chowdhury¹

13 Abstract

Background: Rapidly increasing healthcare costs and the growing burden of non-communicable diseases have 14 increased the out-of-pocket (OOP) spending (63.3% of total health expenditure) in Bangladesh. This increasing OOP 15 spending for healthcare has catastrophic economic impact on households. To reduce this burden, the Health 16 Economics Unit (HEU) of the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare has developed the Shasthyo Surokhsha Karmasuchi 17 (SSK) health protection scheme for the below-poverty line (BPL) population. The key actors in the scheme are HEU, 18 contracted scheme operator and hospital. Under this scheme, each enrolled household is provided 50,000 BDT (620 19 USD) coverage per year for healthcare services against a government financed premium of 1000 BDT (12 USD). This 20 initiative faces some challenges e.g., delays in scheme activities, registering the targeted population, low utilization of 21 services, lack of motivation of the providers, and management related difficulties. It is also important to estimate the 22 23 financial requirement for nationwide scale-up of this project. We aim to identify these implementation-related challenges and provide feedback to the project personnel. 24

Methods: This is a concurrent process documentation using mixed-method approaches. It will be conducted in the 25 26 rural Kalihati Upazila where the SSK is being implemented. To validate the BPL population selection process, we will estimate the positive predictive value. A community survey will be conducted to assess the knowledge of the card 27 holders about SSK services. From the SSK information management system, numbers of different services utilized by 28 the card holders will be retrieved. Key-informant interviews with personnel from three key actors will be conducted to 29 understand the barriers in the implementation of the project as per plan and gather their suggestions. To estimate the 30 project costs, all inputs to be used will be identified, quantified and valued. The nationwide scale-up cost of the project 31 32 will be estimated by applying economic modeling.

(Continued on next page)

* Correspondence: sayemahmed@icddrb.org

¹Universal Health Coverage Programme, Health Systems and Population Studies Division, icddr,b, 68 Shahid Tajuddin Ahmed Sharani, Mohakhali,

Dhaka 1212, Bangladesh

Q3

²Department of Learning, Informatics, Management and Ethics (LIME), Karolinska Institutet, Stockholm, Sweden

Full list of author information is available at the end of the article



© The Author(s). 2018 **Open Access** This article is distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/), which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided you give appropriate credit to the original author(s) and the source, provide a link to the Creative Commons Public Domain Dedication waiver (http://creativecommons.org/publicdomain/zero/1.0/) applies to the data made available in this article, unless otherwise stated.

87

98

112

(Continued from previous page)

- 33 Discussion: SSK is the first ever government initiated health protection scheme in Bangladesh. The study findings will
- enable decision makers to gain a better understanding of the key challenges in implementation of such scheme and
 provide feedback towards the successful implementation of the program.

Keywords: Shasthyo Surokhsha Karmasuchi (SSK), Health protection scheme, Implementation challenges,
 Implementation research, Process documentation, Research protocol, Bangladesh

38 Background

39 Rapidly increasing healthcare cost and the growing burden of non-communicable diseases have increased 40 the out-of-pocket (OOP) spending (63.3% of total 41 health expenditure) in Bangladesh [1]. This increasing 42 OOP spending for healthcare has catastrophic eco-43 nomic impact on households, especially on the poor 44 [2-4]. The National Health Policy of 2011 acknowl-45 edged that health is a human right and to achieve 46 47 universal health coverage, it is necessary to ensure health services for the poor at an affordable cost [5]. 48 For achieving this, the high burden of OOP payment 49 must be decreased and financial protection for health-50 care should be ensured. The Government of 51 Bangladesh adopted the Health Care Financing Strat-52 egy 2012-2032 with a view to bringing all the citizens 53 54 under the financial protection for healthcare by 2032 [6]. To achieve this goal, the Health Economics Unit 55 (HEU), a wing of the Ministry of Health and Family 56 Welfare (MoHFW) of the Government of Bangladesh 57 has developed Shasthyo Surokhsha Karmasuchi (SSK), 58 59 a health protection scheme [6]. Although the SSK has a comprehensive plan to cover all population, initially 60 it is implementing targeting the below poverty line 61 (BPL) population only. 62

63 Shasthyo Surokhsha Karmasuchi (SSK)

The HEU of the MoHFW has developed the social 64 health protection scheme (SSK) with the support from 65 German Development Cooperation through KfW 66 (German Development Bank) and GFA Consulting 67 Group. Adopting the mechanism of health insurance 68 model, the scheme was developed over a three-year 69 period of extensive consultations with the experts. Cur-70 71 rently, the scheme is being implemented at rural Kalihati sub-district. The key actors in the scheme are HEU, 72 73 contracted scheme operator, and Kalihati Upazila Health Complex (UpHC) [7]. 74

75 The SSK cell

The SSK Cell (a group of personnel) has been formed by
the HEU to work as the key management body for
implementing the SSK project. The SSK Cell performs
like an insurance providing organization. It formulates
policy decisions and responsible for implementing the

scheme activities through engaging hospitals and a 81 Scheme Operator (SO). The SSK Cell performs administrative tasks, namely, project co-ordination, finance 83 management, target population management, benefit 84 package management, grievance process, and monitoring 85 and evaluation. 86

Scheme operator (SO)

The SSK Cell contracted an insurance agency for provid-88 ing SSK service management support to them at the 89 UpHC and Tangail District Hospital (DH). Currently, 90 the Green Delta insurance company has been contracted 91 as SO. The SO is responsible for visiting the BPL house-92 holds (enlisted based on selection criterion) to provide 93 health card. They also facilitate the UpHC in claim 94 reimbursement process, assist card holders in receiving 95 healthcare services from UpHC and DH, and monitor 96 the scheme activities. 97

SSK benefit package

Under the scheme, SSK members receive only inpatient 99 healthcare at the UpHC and structured referral care from 100 the DH. An electronic health card is provided to each en-101 rolled household ensuring 50,000 BDT per year equivalent 102 healthcare service coverage for 70 different disease groups 103 104 T1 (Table 1). The premium for this coverage is 1000 BDT per year that is financed by the government. Membership in 105 SSK has many advantages compared to the regular 106 patients in the public healthcare facility: free consultation 107 for outpatient care, free inpatient care, free referral care 108 from DH, access to a grievance authority for complaining 109 on the quality of the services, and free access to essential 110 drugs at UpHC and DH for inpatient care. 111

Claim management process

The hospitals (UpHC and DH) are reimbursed by SSK 113 Cell within 30 days for providing free healthcare services 114 to the SSK members based on verifiable patient records 115 (claims). Reimbursement follows a case and diagnosis based payment systems using a simplified Diagnosis Re-117 lated Groups (DRG) on 70 diseases. The hospitals submit 118 the claim documents to the SO. The SO checks and sends 119 these claim documents to the SSK Cell. The SSK Cell veri-120 fies the claims and invoice to the SO. Finally, the SO 121 makes payment to the hospitals. With the extra funds the 122

Q51.1 Table 1 SSK benefit package

t1.2	Premium	Health services				Coverage
t1.3 t1.4 t1.5	1000 BDT per household per year	Inpatient care: Inpatient care for 70 different diseases	Hospital bed and food: Provide hospital bed and food free of cost	Structured referral: Transportation cost for referral	Medicine and diagnostics: Free drugs and diagnostic	

123 UpHC have fiscal space to expand the service list and im-

124 prove the quality, so they can meet the quality criteria.

125 Information management system

The SSK Cell maintains a data warehouse with the help 126 of Management Information System (MIS) of Director-127 ate General of Health Services (DGHS). The SSK data 128 server is hosted at DGHS-MIS center with free of charge 129 and they provide general and maintenance support 130 services. The hospital is equipped with a computerized 131 hospital management system initially focusing on the 132 member management and inpatient management. The 133 system is based on customized software that includes 134 patient registration, diagnosis, treatment, referral, 135 discharge, and automated reporting which are useful for 136 claim management and fraud control. The SO managed 137 SSK booths at the hospitals maintain the membership 138 related information. These booths are responsible for 139 checking the membership status of SSK card holders be-140 fore seeking any treatment from the hospital. 141

Through informal discussion and anecdotal evidences, 142 many implementation-related challenges of the SSK pro-143 ject have been identified. These include delays in carrying 144 out the assigned activities, failure to register target popula-145 tion as per selection criteria, low level of utilization of 146 147 services by the SSK card holders, lack of motivation of the providers in dealing with the additional workload, 148 management and administrative difficulties in smoothly 149 operating all the activities for the SSK project. Therefore, 150 there is a need to systematically document these 151 implementation-related challenges of the SSK project and 152 provide timely feedback to the project personnel for ne-153

154 cessary refinement in the implementation.

155 General objectives and research questions

The overall objective of this study is to identify the implementation related challenges of the SSK project and provide timely feedback to the project personnel for necessary refinement. The specific objectives of this implementation research are:

- To review and validate the selection process of the
 BPL population for the SSK
- To assess knowledge of SSK BPL card holders about
 the benefit package of the SSK
- 165 3. To document the barriers in utilization of the SSK
- services by the card holders

- 4. To record the service utilization pattern at the health facilities by the SSK card holders 168
- To document the implementation related challenges 169 of the SSK project and gather possible suggestions 170 for addressing those challenges 171
- 6. To estimate the costs of scaling-up the SSK project 172 nationwide 173

Methods

Study setting

The study will be conducted in the Kalihati Upazila 176 under Tangail district where the SSK is currently being 177 implemented. A total of 89,351 households (including 178 35,740 BPL households) of the Upazila will be the study 179 population. The Kalihati Upazila Health Complex, the 180 first contact point of the SSK beneficiaries, and Tangail 181 District Hospital, the referral facility, will also be within 182 the jurisdiction of this study. 183

Design & Methods

This study will be a concurrent process documentation 185 using mixed-method approach that includes both quan-186 titative and qualitative assessments. The integrated ap-187 proaches will provide the flexibility to fill in gaps in the 188 available information, strengthen the validity of the 189 assessment and provide different perspectives on con-190 textual and multi-dimensional phenomena. The study 191 will have 6 different phases. The different research activ-192 ities planned to be implemented at different phases are 193 shown in Table 2. 194 T2

Review and validate the selection process of BPL population for SSK

195 196

206

174

175

184

To understand the pitfall in existing BPL population 197 identification we will review the method applied and 198 tools used in this process. In addition, the problems in 199 applying the selection criteria will be recorded through 200 process documentation and key-informant interviews of 201 the program personnel. Using appropriate quantitative 202 approach targeted beneficiaries' perspectives will also be 203 collected to record the challenges in selection of the 204 BPL population. 205

Validation study

To validate the selection process of BPL population, we 207 will estimate positive predictive value. Both SSK member 208 and non-member households will be interviewed. For 209 member household, a sampling frame will be collected 210

t2.1 Table 2 Study activities

12.1	Table 2 Study activities							
t2.2	Activities	P-I* (1-3 m**)	P-II (4-6 m)	P-III (7-9 m)	P-IV (10-12 m)	P-V (13-15 m)	P-VI (16-18 m)	Data sources
t2.3 t2.4 t2.5	Study protocol development and research review and ethical review committee approval	\checkmark						Not applicable
t2.6 t2.7	Review and validate the selection process of BPL population							Survey of member and non- member households
t2.8 t2.9 t2.10 t2.11	To assess knowledge of BPL card holders and document the barriers in utilization of the SSK services			\checkmark				Separate survey of member household (community survey) and focus group discussions (FGDs)
t2.12 t2.13 t2.14 t2.15	Review of service statistics at the health facilities to assess service utilization pattern among the card holders			\checkmark	\checkmark	\checkmark		Facility record review
t2.16 t2.17 t2.18	Process documentation to assess progress in project implementation and identify related barriers			\checkmark	\checkmark			Document review and synthesis of secondary data
t2.19 t2.20 t2.21 t2.22 t2.23	Key-informant interviews of the providers, managers, scheme operators to document implementation challenges and solutions		\checkmark		\checkmark		2	Key-informant interviews
t2.24	Cost-analysis				V	\mathbf{N}		Interviews with the SSK project and the hospital management personnel
t2.25 t2.26	Periodic feedback and follow up of the progress			\checkmark	\checkmark			Findings from the research activities
t2.27	Reporting and dissemination							Findings from the research activities
t2.28	^a P =Phase, ^b m = month							

from SSK project and from that frame the required 211 number of samples will be selected randomly. For 212 non-member, closest adjacent household of SSK member 213 will be selected. If the closest adjacent household is 214 found a member household of SSK project the next clos-215 est will be selected for interview. The heads of the 216 selected households will be interviewed with a struc-217 tured questionnaire on household characteristics, BPL 218 selection criteria of the SSK and detailed consumption 219 expenditure information. To identify the poor house-220 hold, the average monthly consumption expenditure of 221 each household will be compared with the poverty line 222 defined by Bangladesh Bureau of Statistics (BBS) for 223 Dhaka Division using cost-of-basic needs (CBN) ap-224 proach [8]. This poverty line will be used as a gold 225 standard for poverty identification in this study. 226

227 Community survey

The community survey will be conducted to assess the knowledge of the card holders about SSK services as well as to document the barriers in utilization of such services. From the sampling frame of the SSK card holders, the respondents will be randomly selected. In this survey, the card holders will be asked whether they know about the benefit package of the SSK. They will also be asked whether they face any difficulties while re- 235 ceiving SSK services such as negligence of provider, un-236 availability of listed services, shortage of prescribed 237 medicines, long waiting time, and unofficial tips. An in-238 strument for assessing knowledge level is developed to 239 gather this information which will be piloted before 240 finalization. Focus Group Discussions (FGD) will be ap- 241 plied for understanding the experience, perception of 242 beneficiaries about the SSK services and barrier to utilize 243 these services. Beneficiaries who utilized healthcare in 244 last 3 months will be included in FGDs. FGDs will be 245 held in an independent place away from the health facil-246 ity. In each FGD, 8–10 participants from same level will 247 participate. Initially, a number of 5 FGDs is planned. If 248 the research team feels that additional knowledge can be 249 extracted from more FGDs, then additional sessions will 250 be organized. 251

Facility record review for service utilization

From computer based record managed by the SSK project, numbers of different services utilized by the card 254 holders will be retrieved. Facility record review will be 255 done in 3 phases. In each phase, last 3 months records 256 will be gathered. Trend analysis will be done. Number of 257 patients treated by disease, types of diagnostic services 258

252

259 offered, type of drugs provided, and number of patient 260 referred by disease along with compliance will be 261 estimated.

262 Key-informant interviews (KIIs)

263 The rationale of choosing key-informant interviews (KIIs) for this study is to understand the systems that 264 affect barriers in implementation of SSK project activ-265 ities as per plan and gather their suggestions. This will 266 267 include delay in project implementation, problem in selection process of BPL population, availability of neces-268 sary equipment, drug, logistics for providing services, 269 scarcity of manpower, workload related issues, problem 270 in referrals, problem related to SSK fund management, 271 272 and barriers in claim management.

KIIs will be conducted face-to-face by experienced qualitative researchers. The interviewer would schedule a convenient time and place for the interview. The interview will be digitally recorded after having permission from the key-informant personnel. Another researcher will also take simultaneous verbatim notes. The duration of a KII will be at least 45 minutes to one-hour.

280 Process documentation

The process documentation will be undertaken for 281 reviewing the progress in SSK project implementation 282 activities, identify barriers for possible delays in imple-283 mentation, scheme operator's oversight and how well 284 the outputs of the SSK project are aligned to achieve 285 outcomes and impacts. The areas of process documenta-286 tion include services under benefit package, enrollment 287 of the beneficiaries, service provision steps, claim man-288 agement and payment process to the provider. Multiple 289 methods will be used for capturing information in 290 291 process documentation (e.g. document review and synthesis of secondary data). Through process documenta-292 tion timely feedback will be provided to the SSK project 293 personnel. 294

295 Cost analysis

The additional cost of scaling-up the SSK project at na-296 tional level will be estimated from program perspective. 297 Cost will be estimated for all parties involved with the 298 SSK project implementation namely, service delivery 299 cost for health facilities, overall monitoring and supervi-300 sion cost for HEU and scheme management cost for in-301 surance company. To estimate cost all inputs to be used 302 in SSK project will be identified, guantified and valued. 303 The project and the hospital management personnel will 304 be interviewed for collecting these cost related informa-305 tion. Semi-structured questionnaires will be used for this 306 interview. The inputs will be separated by capital (e.g. 307 Buildings) and recurrent costs (e.g. staff salary). The cap-308 ital costs will be annualized using their lifetime and 3% 309

discount rate [9, 10]. Total project cost will be estimated 310 by summing up the capital and recurrent costs. The 311 nationwide scale-up cost of the SSK project will be esti- 312 mated by applying economic modeling and projections 313 technique. The economic modeling of cost will be 314 performed considering the existing utilization of services 315 and unit cost of producing such services. For 316 nation-wide implementation, a hypothetical scenario for 317 cost input (e.g. number of healthcare facilities, additional 318 manpower required) will be prepared in consultation 319 with the experts (e.g. HEU, DGHS personnel and insur- 320 ance providers). The unit cost information collected 321 from the health facility will be used to estimate cost for 322 this scenario using OneHealth Tool software. A sensitiv- 323 ity analysis of nationwide scale-up cost will be per-324 formed considering 5 to 10% increase in utilization of 325 services to realize the situation during full implementa-326 tion of the project. 327

Sample size328Quantitative329We use the following formula for estimating sample size330to validate the selection process of BPL population and331assess knowledge level of SSK card holders,332Where,333

n = required sample size,

S = anticipated proportion (positive predictive value/ 335 BPL card holders are knowledgeable about the benefit 336 package). 337

 α = size of the critical region (1 – α is the confidence 338 level), 339

 $Z_{(1-\alpha)/2}$ = standard normal deviate corresponding to the 340 specified size of the critical region (α), 341

L = absolute precision desired on either side (half-width 342 of the confidence interval) of positive predictive value. 343

We used 95% confidence interval, 5% error level, and 344 10% non-response for estimating the sample size. There-345 fore, for validating the selection process of BPL popula-346 tion, an estimated 270 SSK card holders and an equal 347 number of non-card holders will be required to inter-348 view assuming positive predictive value at 80%. In total, 349 540 households (card holders and non card holders) will 350 be interviewed. Similarly, to assess knowledge level of 351 SSK card holders about benefit package, a minimum of 352 423 BPL card holders will be required to interview 353 assuming 50% of them are knowledgeable. 354

Qualitative

The key-informants will be selected from different level of 356 the project implementation, e.g. the SSK Cell members, 357 scheme operators and service providers. Semi-structured 358 guidelines will be developed based on informants' characteristics. In phase II and IV of the study, 7 to 9 360

355

334

435

446

key-informants will be interviewed. However, actual
number will be determined based on data saturation and
availability of informants.

364 Data analysis

365 Quantitative

Both descriptive and advance analysis will be performed 366 using quantitative data. The positive predictive value will 367 be estimated for validation of BPL population. A 2×2 368 369 table will be constructed for the poor and non-poor households and the SSK members and non-members 370 households by comparing the poverty line with the 371 household consumption expenditure data. From the 372 table, the probability that a 'poor' among those with the 373 374 BPL population are enrolled in the SSK project (positive predictive value) will be estimated [11]. 375

Factor analysis will be used for ranking the knowledge 376 level of the card holders. Earlier studies have used this 377 technique for assessment of knowledge level [12, 13]. 378 Principle component analysis will be performed to gen-379 erate the factor score. We will estimate one main factor 380 (namely, knowledge level for SSK benefit package) with 381 items loading on this factor [14]. Using the factor score 382 we will rank household from low to high level of know-383 ledge. Multivariate regression model will be used to as-384 sess the association of demographic and socioeconomic 385 characteristics of the respondent with their level of 386 knowledge. In this analysis, level of knowledge will be 387 the dependent variable and age, sex, education level and 388 monthly income will be the explanatory variables. 389

To understand the service utilization pattern trend 390 analysis will be performed using project record. Average 391 number of outpatient and inpatient services utilized per 392 1000 card holders will be estimated for three time points 393 (Table 2). This utilization information will be presented 394 by patient characteristics available in the project record 395 (e.g. age, sex) and cause of illness. This analysis will pro-396 vide evolving nature of healthcare utilization among the 397 SSK card holders. 398

Economic modeling and projections will be performed for nationwide cost estimation. Cost per service delivery and cost per beneficiary of SSK project will be estimated considering cost of all parties involved in the project. OneHealth Tool software will be used for nationwide implementation cost estimation.

405 Qualitative

After completion of a KII, a verbatim transcription and
translation will be performed immediately using the audiotapes and interview notes. A systematic framework
approach will be employed for systematic generation of
themes and codes and analyzing the qualitative data.
The Framework Method support thematic analysis in a
systematic manner for organization and mapping the

qualitative interview data which is appropriate for inter- 413 disciplinary and collaborative scheme projects [15]. The 414 research team will become familiar with the whole 415 interview by repeatedly listening the audio recording or 416 by reading the transcript for interpretation. After 417 familiarization with the interview, the researcher will 418 apply 'code' that illustrates the interpreted information 419 from the interview for systematic comparison with other 420 components of the dataset. By using the categories and 421 codes, the analytical framework will be applied by 422 indexing subsequent transcripts. For the analysis 423 process a framework matrix will be generated using 424 spreadsheet and data will be summarized and charting 425 into the matrix by category. Charting ensures data 426 summarization and careful explanation of participant's 427 own opinion and expressions prior to interpretation 428 by the research team. The interpreted findings under 429 each main theme or category will be presented for 430 the identification of key implementation barriers and 431 possible solution to overcome such barriers. Triangu-432 lation of information will be done for findings from 433 different sources. 434

Ethical assurance for protection of human rights

This study will involve human subjects hence ethical approval have been obtained from the Research Review 437 Committee and Ethical Review Committee of icddr,b. All 438 respondents of the study will be interviewed after giving 439 written informed consent. Their participation will be 440 voluntary. Efforts will be made to ensure that they are 441 properly informed about the study objectives and thoroughly understand what their participation in the study 443 involves. All collected information will be kept confidential and will be used only for research purposes. 445

Discussion

Many people in Bangladesh fall into poverty due to 447 OOP payments for healthcare [2-4]. The introduction of 448 the SSK project in the study Upazila of Bangladesh aims 449 to increase essential services utilization and stimulate 450 better quality of the services through reducing financial 451 burden. This article contains a comprehensive study 452 protocol with the objectives to validate the selection of 453 enrolled BPL population, their knowledge about the 454 scheme, service utilization pattern among them, barriers 455 in service utilization, implementation-related challenges, 456 and cost for scaling up the scheme. This study will pro-457 vide a comprehensive understanding about the existing 458 challenges of the SSK project to its successful implemen- 459 tation. Through this study, ongoing timely feedback will 460 be provided to the SSK implementer and policymakers 461 in order to have refinement in the implementation 462 strategy. 463

The rigorous design of the study protocol to capture 464 implementation related challenges of the project is one 465 of the important strengths. This study will collect 466 real-time qualitative and quantitative data over a period 467 468 of 1 year. The prolonged involvement of the study team will facilitate them to be close to the real implementa-469 tion scenarios and identify the challenges towards the 470 implementation. The research team will closely collabor-471 ate with the key decision makers from the SSK Cell and 472 473 relevant stakeholders to ensure that the research questions are relevant to the implementation of the project 474 and the evidence generated through the study will be 475 useful in their decision making. This collaboration will 476 not influence the independence of research. 477

478 We will start the study activities and share the plan through organizing workshop with the presence of key 479 personnel from the HEU, MoHFW and other relevant 480 organizations. We will share the study findings through 481 reports, policy briefs, and meetings with the local stake-482 holders. We will also share the learning in the inter-483 national conferences and publish research papers in the 484 international journals. 485

One important concern is that, the present study in-486 cludes the perceptions and strategies of the key stake-487 holders, implementers and decision makers in the 488 objectives. This may induce biases in their responses. 489 We will be cautious of such possibilities while conduct-490 ing their interview. We will verify the study findings 491 through comparing information from multiple sources 492 and using different methods of data collection. Another 493 limitation of this study is that the process documenta-494 tion will be conducted only in the scheme implementa-495 tion site, which may limit the generalizability of the 496 findings to other regions. 497

498 The evidence generated from the study will be useful to program managers for planning nation-wide scale-up 499 accordingly or to replicate such health insurance scheme 500 in similar low-income country settings. The findings will 501 be useful to address financing challenges of healthcare 502 in Bangladesh and for implementation of the healthcare 503 financing strategy developed by the MoHFW of 504 Bangladesh [6]. Methodological challenges of implemen-505 tation research on health financing schemes would be 506 useful for research communities. 507

508 Ultimately, the scientific evidence generated will be used 509 to ensure healthcare for vulnerable groups and subsequently 510 useful for achieving universal health coverage in low- and 511 middle-income countries, which is a global agenda.

512 Additional file

513

515

516 supplementary file consists two appendixes. APPENDINX-A consists

quantitative questionnaire for validation study and community survey.

Additional file 1: Survey questionnaires and interview guides. The

522

531

538

543

548

556

557

558

559

560

561

562

563

564

565

566 Q3

567

568 Q4

569

570 571

572

APPENDIX-B qualitative interview guides for Key-informant Interviews SSK service providers, insurance scheme management and Health Economics Unit personnel (PDF 195 kb).

Abbreviations

BBS: Bangladesh Bureau of Statistics; BPL: Below-Poverty-Line; CBN: Cost-of-523 basic needs; DGHS: Director General of Health Services; DH: District Hospital; 524 DRG: Diagnosis Related Groups; FGD: Focus Group Discussions; GFA: Gospel 525 for Asia; HCFS: Health Care Financing Strategy; HEU: Health Economics Unit; 526 icddr,b: International Centre for Diarrhoeal Disease Research; Klls: Key-Informant 527 Interviews; MIS: Management Information system; MoHFW: Ministry of Health 528 and Family Welfare; OOP: Out-of-pocket; SO: Scheme Operator; SSK: Shasthyo 529 Surokhsha Karmasuchi; UpHC: Upazila Health Complex 530

Acknowledgements

icddr,b acknowledges with gratitude the commitment of Swedish532International Development Cooperation Agency to its research efforts.533icddr,b is thankful to the Governments of Bangladesh, Canada, Sweden and534the UK for providing core/unrestricted support. We are grateful to Director535General Mr. Ashadul Islam, Director Research Md. Nuruzzaman, and Deputy536Director Dr. Md. Aminul Hasan of HEU for their support.537

Funding

The study was funded by Swedish International Development Cooperation539Agency –Sida (Grant #: GR-01455). The funding body was not involved in the
design of the study and will not be involved in collection, analysis, and inter-
pretation of data and in writing the manuscript.540542542

Authors' contributions

SA, ZH, MWA and MEC contributed to conceptualize the research idea, study
design, literature search, writing, revising, and finalizing the protocol with the
support from FD, MS, ZI, AJM, CR and JAMK. All authors read, revised, and
approved the final version of the study protocol.544

Ethics approval and consent to participate

This study was approved by the Research Review Committee and Ethical549Review Committee of the icddr,b (Protocol# PR-17047). All respondents of
the study will be interviewed after giving written informed consent. Their
participation will be voluntary. Efforts will be made to ensure that they are
properly informed about the study objectives and thoroughly understand
what their participation in the study involves. All collected information will
be kept confidential and will be used only for research purposes.551

Consent for publication

Not applicable.

Competing interests The authors declare that they have no competing interest.

Publisher's Note

Springer Nature remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

Author details

¹Universal Health Coverage Programme, Health Systems and Population Studies Division, icddr,b, 68 Shahid Tajuddin Ahmed Sharani, Mohakhali, Dhaka 1212, Bangladesh. ²Department of Learning, Informatics, Management and Ethics (LIME), Karolinska Institutet, Stockholm, Sweden. ³Centre for Health Economics, University of York, York, UK. ⁴Liverpool School of Tropical Medicine, Liverpool, UK.

Received: 22 August 2017 Accepted: 27 June 2018

References

- MoHFW. Bangladesh National Health Accounts 1997 2012. Dhaka: Ministry of Health and Family Welfare; 2015.
 Khan JAM Ahmed S Evans TG Catastrophic healthcare expenditure and 575
- Khan JAM, Ahmed S, Evans TG. Catastrophic healthcare expenditure and poverty related to out-of-pocket payments for healthcare in Bangladesh—an estimation of financial risk protection of universal health

Q6 517

- 578 coverage. Health Policy Plan. 2017;32:1-9. https://doi.org/10.1093/heapol/ 579 czx048
- 580 3. van Doorslaer E, O'Donnell O, Rannan-Eliya RP, Somanathan A, Adhikari SR, 581 Garg CC, et al. Catastrophic payments for health care in Asia. Health Econ. 582 2007;16:1159-84.
- 583 4. van Doorslaer E, O'Donnell O, Rannan-Eliya RP, Somanathan A, Adhikari SR, 584 Garg CC, et al. Effect of payments for health care on poverty estimates in 11 585 countries in Asia: an analysis of household survey data. Lancet. 2006;368: 586 1357-64.
- 587 5. MoHFW. The National Health Policy 2011. Dhaka: Ministry of Health and 588 Family Welfare; 2011.
- 589 Ministry of Health and Family Welfare. Expanding social protection for 6. 590 health: towards universal coverage, health care financing strategy 2012-591 2032. Dhaka: Ministry of Health and Family Welfare; 2012.
- 592 7. Health Economics Unit. Shasthro Surokhsha Karmasuchi (SSK): Concept Q7 593 Paper. Dhaka. www.sskcell.gov.bd
 - 594 8. BBS. Household income and expenditure survey 2010. Dhaka: Bangladesh 595 Bureau of Statistics: 2011.
 - 596 9. Drummond M, O'Brien B, Stoddart G, Torrance G. Methods for the 597 economic evaluation of health care. 3rd editio ed. Oxford: OXFORD 598 UNIVERSITY PRESS: 2005.
 - 599 10. WHO. WHO Guide to cost-effectiveness analysis. Geneva: World Health 600 Organization: 2003.
 - 601 11. Deepthi K, Srinivasan V, Vasanthakumar V, Rajiv S, Victoria J, Mahasampath GS, 602 et al. Measuring poverty in southern India: a comparison of socio-economic 603 scales evaluated against childhood stunting. PLoS One. 2016;11:1-13.
 - 604 12. Winzenberg TM, Oldenburg B, Frendin S, Jones G. The design of a valid and 605 reliable questionnaire to measure osteoporosis knowledge in women: the 606 osteoporosis knowledge assessment tool (OKAT). BMC Musculoskelet 607 Disord, 2003:4:17.
- Q8 608 13. Redman B. Measurement tools in patient education. New York; 1998.
 - 609 14. Tabachnick Barbara G, Fidell Linda S. Using multivariate statistics. New York:
 - 610 Harper & Row; 1989.
 - 611 Gale NK, Heath G, Cameron E, Rashid S, Redwood S. Using the framework 15. 612 method for the analysis of qualitative data in multi-disciplinary health
 - 613 research. BMC Med Res Methodol. 2013;13:117.
 - 614

Ready to submit your research? Choose BMC and benefit from:

- · fast, convenient online submission
- thorough peer review by experienced researchers in your field
- rapid publication on acceptance
- support for research data, including large and complex data types
- gold Open Access which fosters wider collaboration and increased citations
- maximum visibility for your research: over 100M website views per year

At BMC, research is always in progress.

Learn more biomedcentral.com/submissions



617

Journal: BMC Health Services Research

- Q1Title: Evaluating the implementation related challenges of Shasthyo Suroksha Karmasuchi
(health protection scheme) of the government of Bangladesh: a study protocol
- **Q2** Authors: Sayem Ahmed, Md. Zahid Hasan, Mohammad Wahid Ahmed, Farzana Dorin, Marufa Sultana, Ziaul Islam, Andrew J. Mirelman, Clas Rehnberg, Jahangir A. M. Khan, Mahbub Elahi Chowdhury

Article: 3337

Dear Authors,

During production of your paper, the following queries arose. Please respond to these by annotating your proofs with the necessary changes/additions. If you intend to annotate your proof electronically, please refer to the E-annotation guidelines. We recommend that you provide additional clarification of answers to queries by entering your answers on the query sheet, in addition to the text mark-up.

Query No.	Query	Remark
Q1	As per our journal style, article titles should not include capitalised letters unless these are proper nouns/acronyms. We have therefore used the article title 'Evaluating the implementation related challenges of Shasthyo Suroksha Karmasuchi (health protection scheme) of the government of Bangladesh: a study protocol' as opposed to 'Evaluating the implementation related challenges of Shasthyo Suroksha Karmasuchi (Health Protection Scheme) of the Government of Bangladesh: A Study Protocol' as given in the submission system. Please check if this is correct.	
Q2	Author names: Please confirm that the author names are presented accurately and in the correct sequence (given names/initials, family name). Author 1: Given name: Sayem Family name: Ahmed Author 2: Given name: Md. Given name: Zahid Family name: Hasan Author 3: Given name: Mohammad Given name: Mohammad Given name: Mahid Family name: Ahmed Author 4: Given name: Farzana Family name: Dorin Author 5: Given name: Marufa Family name: Sultana	

Query No.	Query	Remark
	Author 6: Given name: Ziaul Family name: Islam Author 7: Given name: Andrew Given name: J. Family name: Mirelman Author 8: Given name: Clas Family name: Rehnberg Author 9: Given name: Jahangir Given name: M. Family name: Khan Author 10: Given name: Elahi Family name: Chowdhury	
Q3	Please check if the affiliations are presented correctly.	
Q4	Journal instruction requires a city for affiliations; however, these is missing in affiliation 3. Please verify if the provided city is correct and amend if necessary.	
Q5	Figure [1] was received as a tabular material, thus, this was captured as Table [1] and the affected Tables and Figures were renumbered accordingly. Please confirm if action taken is appropriate.	
Q6	Additional file 1 was received; however, no citation was provided in the manuscript. Please provide the location of where to insert the citation in the main body of the text. Otherwise, kindly advise us on how to proceed.	
Q7	URL: Please check that the following URLs are working. If not, please provide alternatives: http://www.sskcell.gov.bd	
Q8	Citation details for Reference [7 and 13] are incomplete. Please supply the Publisher-name of this references. Otherwise, kindly advise us on how to proceed.	