



UNIVERSITY OF LEEDS

This is a repository copy of *Paleo-leaf economics reveal a dramatic shift in ecosystem function associated with the end-Triassic mass extinction event*.

White Rose Research Online URL for this paper:  
<http://eprints.whiterose.ac.uk/120959/>

Version: Accepted Version

---

**Article:**

Soh, WK, Wright, IJ, Bacon, K [orcid.org/0000-0002-8944-5107](https://orcid.org/0000-0002-8944-5107) et al. (4 more authors)  
(2017) Paleo-leaf economics reveal a dramatic shift in ecosystem function associated with the end-Triassic mass extinction event. *Nature Plants*, 3. 17104. ISSN 2055-026X

<https://doi.org/10.1038/nplants.2017.104>

---

© 2017 Macmillan Publishers Limited, part of Springer Nature. This is an author produced version of a paper published in *Nature Plants*. Uploaded in accordance with the publisher's self-archiving policy.

**Reuse**

Items deposited in White Rose Research Online are protected by copyright, with all rights reserved unless indicated otherwise. They may be downloaded and/or printed for private study, or other acts as permitted by national copyright laws. The publisher or other rights holders may allow further reproduction and re-use of the full text version. This is indicated by the licence information on the White Rose Research Online record for the item.

**Takedown**

If you consider content in White Rose Research Online to be in breach of UK law, please notify us by emailing [eprints@whiterose.ac.uk](mailto:eprints@whiterose.ac.uk) including the URL of the record and the reason for the withdrawal request.



[eprints@whiterose.ac.uk](mailto:eprints@whiterose.ac.uk)  
<https://eprints.whiterose.ac.uk/>



UNIVERSITY OF LEEDS

This is a repository copy of *Paleo-leaf economics reveal a dramatic shift in ecosystem function associated with the end-Triassic mass extinction event*.

White Rose Research Online URL for this paper:  
<http://eprints.whiterose.ac.uk/120959/>

Version: Accepted Version

---

**Article:**

Soh, WK, Wright, IJ, Bacon, K [orcid.org/0000-0002-8944-5107](https://orcid.org/0000-0002-8944-5107) et al. (4 more authors)  
(2017) Paleo-leaf economics reveal a dramatic shift in ecosystem function associated with the end-Triassic mass extinction event. *Nature Plants*, 3. 17104. ISSN 2055-026X

<https://doi.org/10.1038/nplants.2017.104>

---

© 2017 Macmillan Publishers Limited, part of Springer Nature. This is an author produced version of a paper published in *Nature Plants*. Uploaded in accordance with the publisher's self-archiving policy.

**Reuse**

Unless indicated otherwise, fulltext items are protected by copyright with all rights reserved. The copyright exception in section 29 of the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988 allows the making of a single copy solely for the purpose of non-commercial research or private study within the limits of fair dealing. The publisher or other rights-holder may allow further reproduction and re-use of this version - refer to the White Rose Research Online record for this item. Where records identify the publisher as the copyright holder, users can verify any specific terms of use on the publisher's website.

**Takedown**

If you consider content in White Rose Research Online to be in breach of UK law, please notify us by emailing [eprints@whiterose.ac.uk](mailto:eprints@whiterose.ac.uk) including the URL of the record and the reason for the withdrawal request.



[eprints@whiterose.ac.uk](mailto:eprints@whiterose.ac.uk)  
<https://eprints.whiterose.ac.uk/>

1 **Paleo-leaf economics reveal a dramatic shift in ecosystem function associated with the**  
2 **end-Triassic mass extinction event**

3

4 Soh, W.K.<sup>1</sup>, Wright, I.J.<sup>2</sup>, Bacon, K.L.<sup>3</sup>, Lenz, T.I.<sup>2</sup>, Steinhorsdottir, M.<sup>4</sup>, Parnell, A. C.<sup>5</sup> and  
5 McElwain, J.C.<sup>1</sup>

6

7 <sup>1</sup> School of Biology and Environmental Science, Earth Institute, University College Dublin,  
8 Belfield, Dublin, Ireland; <sup>2</sup> Department of Biological Sciences, Macquarie University, NSW  
9 2109 Australia; <sup>3</sup> School of Geography, University of Leeds, LS2 9JT, United Kingdom; <sup>4</sup>  
10 Department of Geological Sciences and Bolin Centre for Climate Research, Stockholm  
11 University, SE 109 61 Stockholm, Sweden; <sup>5</sup>School of Mathematics & Statistics, Insight  
12 Centre for Data Analytics, University College Dublin, Belfield, Dublin, Ireland

13

14 Climate change has likely altered the ecological functioning of past ecosystems, and likely  
15 will alter functioning in the future; however, the magnitude and direction of such changes are  
16 difficult to predict. Here we use a deep-time case study to evaluate the impact of a well  
17 constrained CO<sub>2</sub>-induced global warming event on the ecological functioning of dominant  
18 plant communities. We use leaf mass per area (LMA), a widely used trait in modern plant  
19 ecology, to infer the paleoecological strategy of fossil plant taxa. We show that paleo-LMA  
20 can be inferred from fossil leaf cuticles based on a tight relationship between LMA and  
21 cuticle thickness (CT) observed among extant gymnosperms. Application of this new paleo-  
22 LMA proxy to fossil gymnosperms from East Greenland reveals significant shifts in the  
23 dominant ecological strategies of vegetation found across the Triassic-Jurassic (Tr-J)  
24 transition. Late Triassic forests, dominated by low LMA taxa with inferred high transpiration  
25 rates and short leaf life spans, were replaced in the Early Jurassic by forests dominated by  
26 high LMA taxa that likely had slower metabolic rates. We suggest that extreme CO<sub>2</sub>-induced  
27 global warming selected for taxa with high LMA associated with a stress-tolerant strategy

28 and that adaptive plasticity in leaf functional traits such as LMA contributed to post-warming  
29 ecological success.

30

## 31 **Introduction**

32 The functioning of modern terrestrial ecosystems is determined largely by the ecological  
33 strategies of dominant plant taxa as these influence the rate at which elements and energy are  
34 moved through the whole system<sup>1</sup>. Theoretical, experimental and modelling studies have all  
35 forecasted that rising CO<sub>2</sub> will alter the ecological composition of future plant communities<sup>2,3</sup>  
36 but the direction and functional implications of these changes in the long-term remain  
37 unclear. One promising way forward is to study how ecosystem properties changed in  
38 response to analogous climate change – global warming events in the deep past. Here we  
39 investigate whether increased atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub><sup>4-6</sup> and global warming<sup>7</sup> resulted in a shift in  
40 ecosystem-scale ecological strategy and function across the Tr–J boundary (201.36 ± 0.17  
41 Ma<sup>8</sup>). To do this we estimated the LMA of 109 fossil taxa from Astartekløft in East  
42 Greenland (Bennettitales and Ginkgoales) across Tr–J transition<sup>9-11</sup>, and analysed these data  
43 together with information on changes in the relative abundance of these taxa<sup>12</sup>, and other  
44 paleoecological and climatological data<sup>4,11,13,14</sup>. The Astartekløft locality provides evidence  
45 for an extreme CO<sub>2</sub>-induced global warming event, an abrupt decline in plant diversity,  
46 regional turnover of dominant taxa and ultimately to alteration in species composition and  
47 vegetation structure<sup>5,12,15</sup>. Palynological evidence has shown that the floral turnover at  
48 Astartekløft coincides with the end-Triassic marine mass extinction event (ETE) in St.  
49 Audrie’s Bay, UK<sup>10</sup> and was broadly contemporaneous with a major decline in conifers and  
50 woody taxa in other global localities<sup>9,16</sup>. A rapid doubling of atmospheric carbon dioxide to c.  
51 2000-2500 ppm<sup>4</sup> (Fig. S1) was accompanied by emissions of SO<sub>2</sub> and other volcanic  
52 gases<sup>17,18</sup>, and mean global temperature increased by up to 4° C<sup>7</sup>. Our study taxa, Ginkgoales

53 and Bennettitales (an extinct group of “seed ferns”), showed contrasting ecological fates: the  
54 former predominated in the post-Tr–J warming interval following near extirpation in East  
55 Greenland, and the latter were common in the Late Triassic but underwent sharp ecological  
56 decline across the Tr–J transition, and eventually becoming locally extinct in the post-  
57 warming interval<sup>12</sup>.

58

59 Leaf mass per area, LMA, is a key trait in the measurement and categorization of plant  
60 ecological strategies<sup>19,20</sup>. It represents the dry mass and nutrient construction costs per unit  
61 leaf area, and is tightly correlated with many important functional attributes of a leaf  
62 including its life span, nitrogen concentration, maximum potential photosynthetic rate and  
63 defence chemistry<sup>21,22</sup>.

64

## 65 **Results**

66 **Paleo-LMA proxy development.** To investigate ecological change across the Astartekløft  
67 Tr–J transition, we developed a paleo-LMA proxy by quantifying a tight linear scaling  
68 relationship between cuticle thickness and LMA among 20 species of extant flat-leaved  
69 gymnosperms (Fig. 1a). The positive relationship between LMA and leaf life span underpins  
70 a leaf economic spectrum that runs from slow-return species with high LMA, long leaf life  
71 spans, low nutrient concentrations and slow physiological rates, to low-LMA fast-return  
72 species with short leaf life spans and high nutrient concentrations and physiological rates<sup>21-23</sup>.  
73 Similarly, leaf cuticle has many intrinsically linked functions of ecological significance such  
74 as defence, protection against harsh environments, water repellence and mechanical support  
75 <sup>24</sup>. Ultimately, the cuticle protects the costly biological mass within leaves. For these reasons,  
76 and also because cuticle material is relatively dense and constitutes a substantial proportion  
77 of leaf mass (average of 15.35% , 13 species)<sup>25</sup>, LMA and cuticle thickness are expected to

78 be tightly correlated among flat-leaved taxa independent of their phylogenetic history as  
79 demonstrated in Fig. S2 (see Supplementary Information Section 1).

80 The presence of well-preserved cuticle in all fossil leaf material investigated was  
81 confirmed firstly by auto-fluorescence of the cuticular membranes under epifluorescence  
82 microscopy (appearing red using green excitation fluorescence filter, 510–560 nm) and  
83 secondly by the presence of the outermost plant cuticle layer, that is, the lamellate cuticle  
84 proper followed by cuticle layer in Transmission Electron Microscopy (TEM) sections (Fig.  
85 1b–f) (see Supplementary Information Section 1 and Dataset 1). Subsequently, we inferred  
86 paleo-LMA for each of the 109 Tr–J fossil leaves for which we measured cuticle thickness,  
87 based on the extant gymnosperm cuticle thickness-LMA relationship (Fig. 1a). To support the  
88 results of the cuticle-based LMA proxy (hereafter “cuticle-LMA”), we compared the paleo-  
89 LMA of Ginkgoales with two independent paleo-LMA proxy methods. The first is based on  
90 relationships between petiole width and leaf blade area (hereafter “petiole-LMA”) shown for  
91 woody dicots<sup>26</sup>, gymnosperms<sup>27</sup> and *Ginkgo biloba*<sup>28</sup>. The second is based on a relationship  
92 between LMA and the density of adaxial epidermal cells (hereafter “epidermal-LMA”),  
93 which has been demonstrated on extant *Ginkgo biloba*<sup>28</sup> only (see section ‘Paleo-LMA trend  
94 across geologic time’).

95

96 **Bennettitales and Ginkgoales functional groups.** Paleo-LMA estimates of all 109 fossil  
97 cuticles (Dataset 2) were used to deduce their likely functional grouping by comparison with  
98 LMA values of extant plant functional groups. The mean LMA of Tr–J Ginkgoales ( $95.3 \text{ gm}^{-2}$ ,  
99  $95\%$  prediction interval,  $\text{PI}_{95\%}$ : 86.0, 105.2) is considerably higher than Bennettitales,  $65.4$   
100 ( $\text{PI}_{95\%}$  : 56.8, 75.0)  $\text{gm}^{-2}$  (Fig. 2a, Table S1) (probability,  $P(\text{LMA}_{\text{Ginkgoales}} > \text{LMA}_{\text{Bennettitales}}) \approx$   
101 1, see Methods for details). The median LMA of Tr–J Ginkgoales ( $94 \text{ gm}^{-2}$ ) lies between  
102 those of extant deciduous trees ( $75 \text{ gm}^{-2}$ ) and evergreen angiosperm trees ( $106 \text{ gm}^{-2}$ ), while

103 the median LMA of Bennettitales ( $60 \text{ gm}^{-2}$ ) is lower than values of all extant woody groups  
104 (Fig. 2b). Our paleo-LMA data therefore support the proposition that Bennettitales and  
105 Ginkgoales were likely distinctly different functional groups within the Astartekløft  
106 ecosystem. The lower LMA of Bennettitales suggests that their ecological strategies were  
107 further towards the fast-return end of the leaf economic spectrum than those of Ginkgoales,  
108 and that their leaves typically had higher leaf N concentrations, higher maximum  
109 photosynthetic rates and faster leaf turnover (shorter leaf life spans)<sup>20,21,23</sup>. This is  
110 independently corroborated by the observation (based on stomatal morphology<sup>11</sup>) that  
111 maximum estimated stomatal and canopy transpiration rates of Bennettitales at Astartekløft  
112 were on average 40% higher than Ginkgoales in all Tr–J beds, as would be expected for a  
113 lower LMA taxon. The corollary is that Bennettitales would likely have required greater N  
114 and H<sub>2</sub>O inputs than coeval Ginkgoales to maintain their higher photosynthetic rates. Perhaps  
115 these Bennettitales were understory and/or open floodplains taxa while Ginkgoales studied  
116 here were overstory trees<sup>12</sup>, since understory vegetation is generally more nitrogen-  
117 demanding than overstory<sup>29</sup>. In this context, accumulations of bennettite leaves into fossil leaf  
118 mats, which are common in the Tr beds at Astartekløft, likely represent rapid burial of low  
119 LMA deciduous leaf litter rather than longer term accumulation of high LMA evergreen litter  
120 with slow decomposition rates. These new ecological inferences (Fig. 2a-b) provide a new  
121 insight on the functional groupings of the dominant plants in the Astartekloft assemblages<sup>12</sup>.

122

123 **Paleo-LMA trends across geologic time.** Temporal trends in the LMA of Bennettitales and  
124 Ginkgoales were estimated across the Tr–J transition in order to examine long-term (geologic  
125 scale) trends in leaf economic traits (Fig. 2c–d, Fig 3a–b, Table S2–S4). For these analyses  
126 data were pooled into pre-warming (Beds 1–4), peak warming (Beds 5–6) and post-warming  
127 periods (Beds 7–8) (Fig. 2c–d); this arrangement best corresponds to the prevailing

128 paleoatmospheric carbon dioxide concentrations (Fig. 3a). Although initial warming at  
129 Astartekloft started at Bed 4, Mander et al.<sup>10</sup> suggested a possibility of a hiatus between Bed  
130 4 and 5, which is an additional reason for our chosen grouping. For Bennettitales, average  
131 LMA increased 55% from the pre-warming (59.4 gm<sup>-2</sup>, PI<sub>95%</sub>: 51.0, 69.3) to the peak  
132 warming period (92.2 gm<sup>-2</sup>, PI<sub>95%</sub>: 77.0, 109.9) ( $P(\text{LMA}_{\text{peak-warming}} > \text{LMA}_{\text{pre-warming}}) \approx 1$ ) (Fig.  
133 2c): this is interesting because considering that the average Bennettitales LMA is lower than  
134 Ginkgoales, the high mean LMA seen during the peak-warming period was within the range  
135 more typical of Ginkgoales (Fig. 2c-d, Table S3-4). Only one specimen was measured during  
136 the post-warming, from Bed 7 with LMA value of 66.5 gm<sup>-2</sup> (PI<sub>95%</sub>: 40.4, 103.4), which more  
137 or less corresponds to the average values obtained during the pre-warming–warming period  
138 ( $P(\text{LMA}_{\text{post-warming}} > \text{LMA}_{\text{pre-warming}}) = 0.64$ ). Therefore, we cannot confidently describe this as  
139 a meaningful shift to either the pre- or peak-warming periods ( $P(\text{LMA}_{\text{post-warming}} > \text{LMA}_{\text{peak}}$   
140  $\text{warming}) = 0.08$ ). In Ginkgoales, LMA increases from the pre-warming (88.0 gm<sup>-2</sup>, PI<sub>95%</sub>: 77.4,  
141 99.9) to the post-warming period (101.8 gm<sup>-2</sup>, PI<sub>95%</sub>: 90.9, 114.2) ( $P(\text{LMA}_{\text{post-warming}} >$   
142  $\text{LMA}_{\text{pre-warming}}) = 0.98$ ). The prediction intervals surrounding the estimate of peak-warming  
143 LMA (81.6 gm<sup>-2</sup>, PI<sub>95%</sub>: 55.9, 115.8) were sufficiently wide due to small sample size, that we  
144 could not distinguish any meaningful trend in relation to either the pre- or post-warming  
145 periods (Fig. 2d, Table S4).

146  
147 Paleo-LMA values derived from the petiole-LMA and epidermal-LMA proxies, strongly  
148 corroborate the LMA trends for Ginkgoales and Bennettitales (Fig. S3) inferred using cuticle  
149 thickness, despite yielding somewhat different absolute LMA values (Fig. 2e, Table S5)  
150 when applied to the same fossil leaf specimens, or different specimens from the same plant  
151 beds. LMAs inferred from the petiole-LMA (woody dicot) and epidermal-LMA proxies are  
152 systematically c. 40% and c. 10% higher, respectively than cuticle-LMA derived values (Fig.

153 2e). However, using the gymnosperm and *Ginkgo biloba* calibrations of the petiole-based  
154 LMA proxy resulted in substantially higher LMA estimates (by c. 70% and c. 105%,  
155 respectively) compared to the cuticle-LMA proxy (Fig 2e) (See discussion in Supplementary  
156 Information Section 1). Importantly, differences in absolute LMA values derived using  
157 alternative LMA proxies (Fig 2e) do not compromise the interpretability of our results  
158 because we find that LMA trends over time are robust to the choice of proxy (Fig S3).

159

160 **Selection for stress-tolerance.** Considering all taxa together and on a bed-by-bed basis,  
161 average LMA increased across the Tr–J transition (Fig. 2f, Table S6). We suggest that this  
162 trend can be attributed to both direct and indirect effects of elevated atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub>.  
163 Atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> directly increases LMA in the short term via acclimation, by increasing the  
164 total non-structural carbohydrate content of leaves (i.e., starch accumulation)<sup>30, 20</sup>. Indirect  
165 and long-term effects on LMA include CO<sub>2</sub>-induced environmental stress at Astartekløft,  
166 such as increasing atmospheric temperature<sup>31</sup> and through reduced soil nutrient status caused  
167 by increasing terrestrial runoff and erosion<sup>11</sup>. Other possible abiotic factors such as salinity,  
168 water availability and light intensity that could potentially affect LMA in general, but are not  
169 applicable at Astartekløft, are discussed in Supplementary Information Section 2. The  
170 abovementioned short-term CO<sub>2</sub> effect on LMA is further supported by simulated  
171 paleoatmosphere experiments<sup>32</sup> that showed extant plants from ancient lineages (cycad, tree  
172 fern, ginkgo) exhibiting 40% higher mean LMA when grown at 1500 vs. 380 ppm CO<sub>2</sub> (p-  
173 value < 0.05; Fig. S4). This demonstrates that extant tree ferns, ginkgos and cycads have the  
174 capacity to acclimate their leaf economics in elevated CO<sub>2</sub>. Notably, the addition of high CO<sub>2</sub>  
175 to a low O<sub>2</sub> treatment always significantly increased LMA compared to an exclusively low O<sub>2</sub>  
176 treatment<sup>32</sup>. Although low atmospheric O<sub>2</sub> (< 21%) is likely to have been a feature of much of  
177 the Mesozoic<sup>33,34</sup>, paleoatmosphere experiments convincingly rule out < 21% atmospheric O<sub>2</sub>

178 as a primary driver of increased LMA without a stronger over-riding influence of elevated  
179 CO<sub>2</sub><sup>35</sup>. In addition to CO<sub>2</sub>, Central Atlantic magmatic province (CAMP) volcanic SO<sub>2</sub>  
180 emissions are also likely to have caused biotic stress during the ETE<sup>17,36</sup>.

181 At Astartekløft, Bacon et al.<sup>37</sup> identified a significant change in fossil leaf shape  
182 (increased roundness) associated with likely elevated SO<sub>2</sub> in beds 2 to 6 and particularly beds  
183 4 and 5. The same study identified a similar increase in leaf roundness in controlled  
184 environment experiments when nearest living equivalent taxa were exposed to SO<sub>2</sub>,  
185 supporting the detection of elevated SO<sub>2</sub> likely related to CAMP-volcanic activity at  
186 Astartekløft. Furthermore, the same experiments<sup>38</sup> demonstrated a trend of decreasing LMA  
187 for *Agathis australis* (D.Don) Lindl., *Lepidozamia hopei* (W.Hill) Regel, *Lepidozamia*  
188 *peroffskyana* Regel, *Nageia nagi* (Thunb.) Kuntze and *Ginkgo biloba* in response to SO<sub>2</sub>  
189 fumigation (2000 ppb) relative to control treatment (380 ppm CO<sub>2</sub>, no SO<sub>2</sub>) (Figure S5).  
190 Other independent studies on the responses of LMA to SO<sub>2</sub> reveal species-specific trends;  
191 Garsed et al.<sup>39</sup> reported no change in LMA of three flowering tree species and an increase in  
192 one; Temple et al.<sup>40</sup> reported decreased LMA in *Phaseolus vulgaris* L.; Whitmore and  
193 Mansfield<sup>41</sup>; Jones and Mansfield<sup>42</sup> and Bell et al.<sup>43</sup> all reported decreased LMA in several  
194 grass species. However, when different species are exposed to a combined elevated SO<sub>2</sub>  
195 (2000 ppb) and elevated CO<sub>2</sub> treatment (2000 ppm), mimicking those of the ETE, a  
196 consistent increase in LMA is observed in all taxa but no significant change in *G. biloba*<sup>35</sup>  
197 (Figure S5). Based on these experimental results we conclude that although SO<sub>2</sub> likely played  
198 an important role in the biotic extinction across the ETE<sup>17,36</sup>, elevated atmospheric SO<sub>2</sub>  
199 cannot account for rising LMA observed in the plant taxa which survived the ETE at  
200 Astartekløft. We propose therefore that high CO<sub>2</sub> was among the primary drivers of  
201 increasing LMA across the Tr–J in the short-term via direct effects of acclimation, and in the  
202 long-term by honing selection for higher-LMA, stress-tolerant taxa<sup>19</sup> to emerge.

203

204 Theory suggests that stress-tolerant strategies with slow leaf turnover (longer leaf life  
205 spans) and higher LMA enable species to persist under the continuously low-productivity  
206 conditions that arise from environmental stress and resource depletion<sup>19</sup>. In the case of  
207 Bennettitales, the observed shift in ecological strategy from low to high LMA was not  
208 apparently sufficient to confer ecological resilience compared with competing plant taxa  
209 because the group underwent near local extinction in Beds 5 and 6 when CO<sub>2</sub> concentration  
210 and associated environmental change reached peak levels (Fig. 3c). The higher LMA  
211 reconstructions for Ginkgoales than Bennettitales, suggests that Ginkgoales had lower N-  
212 requirements and generally lower ecophysiological rates, aiding them in surviving peak  
213 environmental upheaval and allowing them to flourish in the post-warming interval  
214 represented by Beds 7 and 8 (Fig. 3c).

215

216 **Phenotypic plasticity in paleo-LMA.** Considering the entire LMA dataset, Ginkgoales show  
217 higher LMA variation than Bennettitales with pooled coefficient of variation (CV) in Beds 1–  
218 4 of 0.31 (PI<sub>95%</sub>: 0.22, 0.41) versus Bennettitales pooled CV of 0.26 (PI<sub>95%</sub>: 0.19, 0.35)  
219 ( $P(CV_{\text{Ginkgoales}} > CV_{\text{Bennettitales}}) = 0.78$ ). Pooled Ginkgoales CV in Triassic Beds 1–4 (CV =  
220 0.31 (PI<sub>95%</sub>: 0.22, 0.41) was higher than that of Jurassic Beds 7–8 (CV = 0.28, PI<sub>95%</sub>: 0.21,  
221 0.31) with the probability,  $P(CV_{\text{Beds 1-4}} > CV_{\text{Beds 7-8}}) = 0.64$ . The wider variation in  
222 Ginkgoales LMA, both within the same sampling bed and across evolutionary time, suggests  
223 that there was higher functional diversity in leaf economic traits within this group than in the  
224 Bennettitales, and perhaps also greater adaptive phenotypic plasticity (i.e. plasticity that  
225 enhances fitness of the genotype). Adaptive phenotypic plasticity, when occurring in  
226 functional traits, is expected to facilitate rapid adaptation to new environments<sup>44</sup> and to  
227 improve persistence thus enabling subsequent adaptive evolution<sup>45</sup>. This plasticity could

228 have positively contributed to the recovery of Ginkgoales in the post-warming interval as the  
229 potential for the diversification of taxa with more stress-tolerant ecological strategies  
230 (indicated by relatively higher LMAs), was already present. Supporting evidence for high  
231 ecological adaptability in Ginkgoales can be found in the recent and Cretaceous–Miocene  
232 epoch where Ginkgo was able to adapt to highly disturbed habitats by adopting a competitive-  
233 ruderal strategy despite having life-history traits that are not classically associated with such  
234 habitats<sup>46,47</sup>.

235

236 **Dramatic shift in community-mean paleo-LMA.** Overall, our findings show that the most  
237 dominant plant group of the Late Triassic plant community, changed in response to CO<sub>2</sub>-  
238 induced global warming. Pre-warming, the ecological strategies of the most dominant plant  
239 group were ‘fast-return’, characterised by low LMA taxa such as Bennettitales (> 38%  
240 relative abundance, Beds 1–5<sup>12</sup>). During peak and post-warming periods, there was a shift to  
241 dominance by ‘slow-return’ strategies characterised by high LMA taxa such as Ginkgoales (>  
242 37% relative abundance, Beds 6–8<sup>12</sup>). Average community-mean LMA (average LMA values  
243 weighted by taxon abundance) increased by 36% from the pre- to the peak-warming period  
244 (61.6 gm<sup>-2</sup>, PI<sub>95%</sub>: 53.2, 71.0; vs. 83.9 gm<sup>-2</sup>, PI<sub>95%</sub>: 69.7, 100.3 respectively), and from there a  
245 further 21% to the post-warming period (101.7 gm<sup>-2</sup>, PI<sub>95%</sub>: 90.5, 114.2) (Fig. 3d, Table S7,  
246 See supplementary Fig. S6 and Table S8 for bed-by-bed community-mean LMA). To the best  
247 of our knowledge, this study represents the first time that shifts in community-LMA have  
248 been estimated across the Tr–J transition, but not the first quantification of LMA-shifts across  
249 geological warming/cooling events. Using the petiole-based proxy described above, Currano  
250 et al.<sup>48</sup> estimated angiosperm LMAs across the Paleocene–Eocene Thermal Maximum global  
251 warming event (PETM; ca. 55 Ma), finding no general trend. That study has special  
252 relevance because, like the Tr–J event, the PETM included rapid increases in both

253 atmospheric temperature and CO<sub>2</sub>. Using the same petiole-based proxy, Blonder et al.<sup>49</sup> found  
254 a decrease in mean LMA and its variance among taxa during and after the dramatic global  
255 cooling associated with the Cretaceous–Paleogene boundary (KPB; ca. 66 Ma): post-KPB is  
256 similar in trend to post-Tr–J event in showing a decline in LMA CV (0.29 at pre-KPB to 0.2  
257 at post-KPB). Put together with our results there are still too few examples to make any  
258 claims for or against generality of LMA-shifts in response to major perturbances in global  
259 temperature and atmospheric composition. Certainly, we encourage future studies to take into  
260 account information on taxon relative abundance, rather than treating all fossil taxon  
261 occurrences with equal weight. Here, for example, this led to a clearer picture of landscape-  
262 level trends in LMA (e.g. in our own study, see the contrasting LMA trends between Fig 3b  
263 and 3d).

264

### 265 **Future outlook for a high CO<sub>2</sub> world**

266 A substantial increase in community-mean LMA across the Tr–J transition is likely to have  
267 had significant feedback effects on ecosystem functioning such as potential decreases in  
268 insect herbivory<sup>20,26,48</sup> and reduction in litter decomposition rate<sup>50</sup>, with follow-on effects to  
269 the rate at which nutrients were re-cycled through ecosystems. Although no evidence of  
270 insect herbivory on the fossil samples in Astartekløft has been found in this study (see  
271 Dataset 2), we can deduce from the LMA trend that high paleoatmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> incurred an  
272 irreversible ecological change to the dominant plant communities with probable indirect  
273 consequences on the local ecosystems across the Tr–J transition.

274

275 Our study highlights that the Tr–J global warming event created a very strong ecological  
276 filter whereby only plants with more conservative, stress-tolerant strategies were able to  
277 persist and this included many of the Ginkgoales and only the highest-LMA Bennettitales.

278 However, our results also suggest that recovery success following this extreme global  
279 warming event of the Tr–J favoured plant orders with high adaptive plasticity in functional  
280 traits such as LMA. Selection for high LMA taxa associated with a stress-tolerant strategy  
281 could in part explain the worldwide proliferation of Cheirolepidiaceae, a high LMA conifer,  
282 in many global localities during the Hettangian following the end-Triassic extinction event  
283 <sup>36,51</sup> but this supposition requires further study. Ecophysiological investigations of extant taxa  
284 predict future elevated atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> will favour plants with high mesophyll resistance,  
285 hence robust and high LMA plants such as gymnosperm and evergreen angiosperms<sup>2,52</sup>. This  
286 concurs with the geographical expansion of evergreen angiosperms during the Eocene<sup>53</sup> – a  
287 time of high CO<sub>2</sub> induced global warmth, and with this study across the Tr–J transition . Our  
288 findings allow us to examine how past global warming episodes influenced plant taxa with  
289 contrasting functional strategies and functional trait dynamics. If the same trend can be  
290 observed to hold true for other past global warming events then we can conclude that a  
291 similar ecological dynamic may apply under a future global warming scenario where plants  
292 with a more conservative resource use strategy with high LMA will be favoured. Such  
293 ecological shifts would have significant consequences for the rate at which important societal  
294 resources such as water, carbon and nitrogen will flow through terrestrial ecosystems.

295

## 296 **Materials and Methods**

297

298 **Modern gymnosperm samples, sites and LMA.** LMA and leaf cuticle thickness were  
299 quantified for 57 leaf samples from 20 species (15 genera and 8 families) of flat-leaved  
300 gymnosperms growing at Macquarie University, Sydney Royal Botanic Gardens, University  
301 College Dublin and the National Botanic Gardens, Ireland (see Dataset 1). Healthy and fully-  
302 expanded leaves were sampled from outer-canopy shoots because they are taphonomically

303 more likely to be fossilized than shade leaves <sup>54</sup>. A small section of each leaf lamina was  
304 excised and fixed with 4% paraformaldehyde for measurements of cuticle properties. Leaves  
305 were digitally scanned and area was calculated using ImageJ software <sup>55</sup>. Leaves were then  
306 dried at 70°C to constant weight, for determination of leaf dry mass and LMA (dry mass  
307 divided by surface area in g m<sup>-2</sup>).

308

309 **Fossil cuticle samples and site.** Astartekløft, East Greenland, harbours nine fossil plant beds  
310 within the Kap Stewart Group spanning the Late Triassic (Mid to Late Rhaetian age: Beds 1,  
311 1.5, 2, 3 and 4), latest Late Rhaetian (Bed 5) and Early Jurassic (Hettangian age: Bed 6, 7  
312 and 8) <sup>10</sup>. The first six beds are crevasse splay deposits, Bed 6 is a poorly developed coal  
313 swamp and Bed 7 and 8 are abandoned channels <sup>12</sup>. Fossil materials from 51 Bennettitales  
314 (Anomozamites and Pterophyllum) and 58 Ginkgoales (Baiera, Ginkgoites and Sphenobaiera)  
315 (Dataset 2) used here were collected and identified to order-level or generic-level in a  
316 previous study by McElwain, et al. <sup>12</sup> (detailed collections and method therein). Ginkgoales  
317 fossil samples were low or absent in some plant beds but this was not caused by inadequate  
318 sampling protocol (See Supplementary Information Section 3 for detail). Fossil cuticles were  
319 handpicked coalified compression fragments or macerated bulk rock mesofossils. The leaf  
320 cuticles in Bed 5 are fragmentary and therefore cuticle traits alone were used to identify  
321 specimens to order level: identification to morphogeneric level within Bennettitales requires  
322 intact leaflets (whole macrofossils) where Anomozamites is differentiated from Pterophyllum  
323 based on width-length ratio <sup>13</sup>.

324

325 **Microscopy.** Leaf samples were dehydrated using a graded series of ethanol and then  
326 gradually infiltrated with LR White Resin before being embedded into a block. The  
327 procedure for generating thin cross-sections of extant gymnosperm lamina and fossil cuticle

328 are the same except for the duration of infiltration with LR White Resin: fossil cuticles were  
329 left for two weeks at the last stage of 100% resin concentration while modern gymnosperm  
330 lamina only required an overnight infiltration. Following embedding, thin sections (0.7 – 0.9  
331  $\mu\text{m}$ ) were cut with a Leica EM UC7 ultramicrotome, mounted and stained with Methylene  
332 Blue. Images of the sections were taken with a Scion CFW-1310C camera at 60x –100x  
333 magnification. Samples were also examined using an epifluorescence microscope to detect  
334 cuticle autofluorescence. One sample (*Pterophyllum*, sample ID 47154) was prepared for  
335 TEM following Dykstra (1993) <sup>56</sup>.

336

337 **Cuticle thickness measurements.** For modern samples, cuticle thickness was measured ten  
338 times for each abaxial and adaxial side using ImageJ and the total 20 measurements were  
339 then averaged. For fossil samples, cuticle thickness was measured ten times on each side in  
340 the parts of the cuticle cross section that showed no obvious folds, compression or damage,  
341 and the total averaged (see Supplementary Information Section 1).

342

343 **Comparison of Ginkgoales cuticle-LMA with other independent paleo-LMA proxies.**

344 Petiole-LMA <sup>26</sup> and epidermal cell-LMA <sup>28</sup> proxies were applied to Ginkgoales fossil leaves  
345 from the same plant beds, using a combination of different or the exact same fossil samples  
346 (Datasets 3 and 4). Due to having a limited number of Astartekløft macrofossil samples with  
347 sufficiently well preserved and intact petioles and unfragmented leaf blades (Bennettitales  
348 and Ginkgoales), we only applied the petiole-LMA proxy to 32 Ginkgoales fossil samples  
349 from Baiera (Bed 1 and 3) and Ginkgoites (Bed 1, 2 and 7), excluding Sphenobaiera.  
350 Bennettitales were excluded in this comparative study because firstly, there were limited  
351 macrofossils available with sufficiently well-preserved petioles and secondly, the Ginkgo  
352 biloba cell-LMA proxy cannot be used to infer Bennettitales LMA. Paleo-LMA proxy

353 comparison was made at plant beds where the respective morphogenera were found and when  
354 two or three proxies could be used. The macrofossils were photographed and the resulting  
355 digital images were analysed using ImageJ for blade area (A) and petiole thickness (PW)<sup>37</sup>.  
356 For the epidermal cell-LMA proxy, adaxial surfaces of 47 fossil cuticle samples of *Baiera*  
357 (Bed 1 and 3), *Ginkgoites* (Bed 1, 2 and 7) and *Sphenobaiera* (Bed 3, 7 and 8) of mostly the  
358 same samples that were used in cuticle-LMA proxy were imaged using epifluorescence  
359 microscopy (Leica DM5500B). Adaxial epidermal cell density (CD) from each fossil sample  
360 was obtained from an average of three to four 0.09 mm<sup>2</sup> grid counts, made using ImageJ (see  
361 Supplementary Dataset). The training datasets used here were from petiole-LMA  
362 (gymnosperm<sup>27</sup>,  $\log_{10}\text{LMA} = 0.3076\log_{10}(\text{PW}^2/\text{A}) + 3.015$ ,  $n = 93$ ,  $R^2 = 0.44$ ; *Ginkgo biloba*  
363 <sup>28</sup>,  $\log_{10}\text{LMA} = 0.2851\log_{10}(\text{PW}^2/\text{A}) + 2.8832$ ,  $n = 36$ ,  $R^2 = 0.21$ ), and epidermal-LMA<sup>28</sup>  
364 (*Ginkgo biloba*,  $\log_{10}\text{LMA} = 1.4064\log_{10}\text{CD} - 1.8986$ ,  $n = 36$ ,  $R^2 = 0.66$ ) proxies. These  
365 training datasets together with fossil blade-petiole and fossil adaxial epidermal cell density  
366 were used in Bayesian linear regressions to obtain grouped mean and 95% prediction interval  
367 (PI) values (see ‘Analyses’ section). Fossil LMAs inferred from woody dicot petiole-LMA  
368 relationship were calculated from equations in Royer et al.<sup>26</sup> ( $\log_{10}\text{LMA} =$   
369  $0.3820\log_{10}(\text{PW}^2/\text{A}) + 3.070$ ,  $n = 667$ ,  $R^2 = 0.55$ ). All LMA estimates were made using log<sub>10</sub>-  
370 transformed data, then back-transformed so as to be reported in the original units.

371

372 **Analyses.** Generally, there was a large overlap among the LMA of morphogenera within the  
373 same order-level compared to between different orders (Fig. S7). These observations justify  
374 the pooling of LMA values to the taxonomic rank of order in subsequent analyses. All  
375 statistical analyses were undertaken using JAGS 4.1.0.<sup>57</sup> and R statistical software<sup>58</sup> on  
376 Supplementary Information Dataset. Linear least square regression on the training dataset  
377 ( $\log_{10}\text{LMA}$  as dependent variable and  $\log_{10}$ leaf cuticle thickness and/or  $\log_{10}$ tissue thickness

378 as independent variables) was performed using the lm function in R. Additionally, Bayesian  
379 linear regression using JAGS, through the R package rjags<sup>59</sup> interface, on the same variables  
380 yield similar results: inference of each parameter was made from Markov Chain Monte Carlo  
381 (MCMC) sampling from 6,000 samples of the posterior distribution from three chains, each  
382 with 10,000 iterations with a burn-in of 2,000 and thin rate of 4<sup>60</sup>. Normal distribution priors  
383 with mean zero and variance 100 were used for intercept and slope parameters while a  
384 uniform (0, 10) prior was used for the standard deviation on the variance terms. Convergence  
385 was checked by visual assessment of MCMC chains and using the Gelman-Rubin statistic<sup>60</sup>.  
386 95% credible intervals of parameter estimates were calculated as the 2.5% and 97.5%  
387 quantile of the posterior distributions. Predicted fossil LMAs and their 95% PI were obtained  
388 from sample predictive distributions by inputting the fossil cuticle thickness values into the  
389 model, running MCMC and antilog of the sampled posterior distribution values. Grouped  
390 mean, CV and average community-mean LMA together with their 95%PI were all calculated  
391 from posterior distribution values of fossil samples: statistical comparisons between groups  
392 were made by calculating the probability of grouped differences bigger than or smaller than  
393 zero<sup>61</sup>. E.g., 'P(x > y) = z' denote the probability of variable 'x' bigger than variable 'y',  
394 given the data, is 'z'. Community-mean LMA was estimated for each plant bed based on  
395 mean LMA data for each morphogenus and available relative abundance data<sup>12</sup> (See details  
396 in Supplementary Information Section 4). Phylogenetic independence contrast analysis was  
397 conducted using R package ape and phylogenetic tree was constructed using Phylomatic  
398 website<sup>62</sup> and Phylocom<sup>63</sup> software (see Supplementary Information Section 1) . Extant  
399 Ginkgo biloba data in Fig. 2a and 2e were taken from Christianson and Niklas<sup>64</sup>, and  
400 Haworth et al.<sup>28</sup>.

401

402 **Data availability.** Data supporting the findings of this study are available within the article  
403 and its Supplementary Information files.

404

## 405 **References**

- 406 1 Grime, J. P. Benefits of Plant Diversity to Ecosystems: Immediate, Filter and Founder Effects.  
407 *Journal of Ecology* **86**, 902-910 (1998).
- 408 2 Niinemets, Ü., Flexas, J. & Peñuelas, J. Evergreens favored by higher responsiveness to  
409 increased CO<sub>2</sub>. *Trends in Ecology & Evolution* **26**, 136-142,  
410 doi:<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.tree.2010.12.012> (2011).
- 411 3 Ainsworth, E. A. & Long, S. P. What have we learned from 15 years of free-air CO<sub>2</sub> enrichment  
412 (FACE)? A meta-analytic review of the responses of photosynthesis, canopy. *New Phytologist*  
413 **165**, 351-371, doi:10.1111/j.1469-8137.2004.01224.x (2005).
- 414 4 Steinhorsdottir, M., Jeram, A. J. & McElwain, J. C. Extremely elevated CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations at  
415 the Triassic/Jurassic boundary. *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology* **308**,  
416 418-432, doi:<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.palaeo.2011.05.050> (2011).
- 417 5 Bonis, N. R., Van Konijnenburg-Van Cittert, J. H. A. & Kürschner, W. M. Changing CO<sub>2</sub>  
418 conditions during the end-Triassic inferred from stomatal frequency analysis on *Lepidopteris*  
419 *ottonis* (Goepfert) Schimper and *Ginkgoites taeniatus* (Braun) Harris. *Palaeogeography,*  
420 *Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology* **295**, 146-161,  
421 doi:<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.palaeo.2010.05.034> (2010).
- 422 6 Schaller, M. F., Wright, J. D. & Kent, D. V. Atmospheric <em>P</em></span>  
423 class="sc">co</span></sub></sub> Perturbations  
424 Associated with the Central Atlantic Magmatic Province. *Science* **331**, 1404 (2011).
- 425 7 McElwain, J. C., Beerling, D. J. & Woodward, F. I. Fossil plants and global warming at the  
426 Triassic-Jurassic boundary. *Science* **285**, 1386-1390 (1999).
- 427 8 Wotzlaw, J.-F. *et al.* Towards accurate numerical calibration of the Late Triassic: High-precision  
428 U-Pb geochronology constraints on the duration of the Rhaetian. *Geology*,  
429 doi:10.1130/g35612.1 (2014).
- 430 9 Lindström, S. *et al.* A new correlation of Triassic–Jurassic boundary successions in NW Europe,  
431 Nevada and Peru, and the Central Atlantic Magmatic Province: A time-line for the end-Triassic  
432 mass extinction. *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology* **478**, 80-102,  
433 doi:<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.palaeo.2016.12.025> (2017).
- 434 10 Mander, L., Kürschner, W. M. & McElwain, J. Palynostratigraphy and vegetation history of the  
435 Triassic–Jurassic transition in East Greenland. *Journal of the Geological Society* **170**, 37-46  
436 (2013).
- 437 11 Steinhorsdottir, M., Woodward, F. I., Surlyk, F. & McElwain, J. C. Deep-time evidence of a link  
438 between elevated CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations and perturbations in the hydrological cycle via drop in  
439 plant transpiration. *Geology* **40**, 815-818, doi:10.1130/g33334.1 (2012).
- 440 12 McElwain, J. C., Popa, M. E., Hesselbo, S. P., Haworth, D. M. & Surlyk, F. Macroecological  
441 responses of terrestrial vegetation to climatic and atmospheric change across the  
442 Triassic/Jurassic boundary in East Greenland. *Paleobiology* **33**, 547-573 (2007).
- 443 13 Steinhorsdottir, M., Bacon, K. L., Popa, M. E., Bochner, L. & McElwain, J. C. Bennettitalean  
444 leaf cuticle fragments (here Anomozamites and Pterophyllum) can be used interchangeably in  
445 stomatal frequency-based palaeo-CO<sub>2</sub> reconstructions. *Palaeontology* **54**, 867-882,  
446 doi:10.1111/j.1475-4983.2011.01060.x (2011).

- 447 14 Bacon, K. L., Belcher, C. M., Hesselbo, S. P. & McElwain, J. C. The Triassic-Jurassic boundary  
448 carbon-isotope excursions expressed in taxonomically identified leaf cuticles. *Palaios* **26**, 461-  
449 469, doi:10.2110/palo.2010.p10-120r (2011).
- 450 15 McElwain, J. C., Wagner, P. J. & Hesselbo, S. P. Fossil plant relative abundances indicate  
451 sudden loss of Late Triassic biodiversity in East Greenland. *Science* **324**, 1554-1556,  
452 doi:10.1126/science.1171706 (2009).
- 453 16 Lindström, S. Palynofloral patterns of terrestrial ecosystem change during the end-Triassic  
454 event – a review. *Geological Magazine* **153**, 223-251, doi:10.1017/S0016756815000552  
455 (2016).
- 456 17 Lindström, S. *et al.* Intense and widespread seismicity during the end-Triassic mass extinction  
457 due to emplacement of a large igneous province. *Geology*, doi:10.1130/g36444.1 (2015).
- 458 18 Callegaro, S. *et al.* Microanalyses link sulfur from large igneous provinces and Mesozoic mass  
459 extinctions. *Geology*, doi:10.1130/g35983.1 (2014).
- 460 19 Grime, J. P. Evidence for the existence of three primary strategies in plants and its relevance  
461 to ecological and evolutionary theory. *The American Naturalist* **111**, 1169-1194 (1977).
- 462 20 Westoby, M., Falster, D. S., Moles, A. T., Vesk, P. A. & Wright, I. J. Plant ecological strategies:  
463 Some leading dimensions of variation between species. *Annual Review of Ecology and*  
464 *Systematics* **33**, 125-159, doi:10.1146/annurev.ecolsys.33.010802.150452 (2002).
- 465 21 Wright, I. J. *et al.* The worldwide leaf economics spectrum. *Nature* **428**, 821-827 (2004).
- 466 22 Wright, I. J. & Westoby, M. Leaves at low versus high rainfall: coordination of structure,  
467 lifespan and physiology. *New Phytologist* **155**, 403-416 (2002).
- 468 23 Reich, P. B., Walters, M. B. & Ellsworth, D. S. From tropics to tundra: Global convergence in  
469 plant functioning. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* **94**, 13730-13734 (1997).
- 470 24 Riederer, M. in *Annual Plant Reviews: Biology of the Plant Cuticle* Vol. 23 (eds M. Riederer &  
471 C. Muller) 1-10 (Blackwell, 2006).
- 472 25 Onoda, Y., Richards, L. & Westoby, M. The importance of leaf cuticle for carbon economy and  
473 mechanical strength. *New Phytologist* **196**, 441-447, doi:10.1111/j.1469-8137.2012.04263.x  
474 (2012).
- 475 26 Royer, D. L. *et al.* Fossil leaf economics quantified: calibration, Eocene case study, and  
476 implications. *Paleobiology* **33**, 574-589 (2007).
- 477 27 Royer, D. L., Miller, I. M., Peppe, D. J. & Hickey, L. J. Leaf economic traits from fossils support  
478 a weedy habit for early angiosperms. *American Journal of Botany* **97**, 438-445,  
479 doi:10.3732/ajb.0900290 (2010).
- 480 28 Haworth, M. & Raschi, A. An assessment of the use of epidermal micro-morphological features  
481 to estimate leaf economics of Late Triassic – Early Jurassic fossil Ginkgoales. *Review of*  
482 *Palaeobotany and Palynology*, doi:doi: 10.1016/j.revpalbo.2014.02.007 (2014).
- 483 29 Moore, P., Van Miegroet, H. & Nicholas, N. Relative role of understory and overstory in carbon  
484 and nitrogen cycling in a southern Appalachian spruce–fir forest AES Publication 7863. Utah  
485 Agricultural Experiment Station, Utah State University, Logan, Utah. *Canadian Journal of*  
486 *Forest Research* **37**, 2689-2700 (2007).
- 487 30 Poorter, H., Niinemets, U., Poorter, L., Wright, I. J. & Villar, R. Causes and consequences of  
488 variation in leaf mass per area (LMA): a meta-analysis. *New Phytologist* **182**, 565-588,  
489 doi:10.1111/j.1469-8137.2009.02830.x (2009).
- 490 31 Huynh, T. & Poulsen, C. Rising atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> as a possible trigger for the end-Triassic mass  
491 extinction. *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology* **217**, 223-242 (2005).
- 492 32 Bacon, K. L., Haworth, M., Conroy, E. & McElwain, J. C. Can atmospheric composition influence  
493 plant fossil preservation potential via changes in leaf mass per area? A new hypothesis based  
494 on simulated palaeoatmosphere experiments. *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology,*  
495 *Palaeoecology* **464**, 51-64, doi:<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.palaeo.2015.12.006> (2016).
- 496 33 Berner, R. A., and Kothavala, Z. GEOCARB III: A revised model of atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> over  
497 Phanerozoic time. *Science* **301**, 182-204 (2001).

- 498 34 Glasspool, I. J. & Scott, A. C. Phanerozoic concentrations of atmospheric oxygen reconstructed  
499 from sedimentary charcoal. *Nature Geosci* **3**, 627-630,  
500 doi:[http://www.nature.com/ngeo/journal/v3/n9/supinfo/ngeo923\\_S1.html](http://www.nature.com/ngeo/journal/v3/n9/supinfo/ngeo923_S1.html) (2010).
- 501 35 Bacon, K. L., Haworth, M., Conroy, E. & McElwain, J. C. Can atmospheric composition influence  
502 plant fossil preservation potential via changes in leaf mass per area? A new hypothesis based  
503 on simulated palaeoatmosphere experiments. *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology,*  
504 *Palaeoecology*, doi:<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.palaeo.2015.12.006>.
- 505 36 van de Schootbrugge, B. *et al.* Floral changes across the Triassic/Jurassic boundary linked to  
506 flood basalt volcanism. *Nature Geosci* **2**, 589-594,  
507 doi:[http://www.nature.com/ngeo/journal/v2/n8/supinfo/ngeo577\\_S1.html](http://www.nature.com/ngeo/journal/v2/n8/supinfo/ngeo577_S1.html) (2009).
- 508 37 Bacon, K. L., Belcher, C. M., Haworth, M. & McElwain, J. C. Increased atmospheric SO<sub>2</sub> detected  
509 from changes in leaf physiognomy across the Triassic–Jurassic boundary interval of East  
510 Greenland. *PLoS ONE* **8**, e60614, doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0060614 (2013).
- 511 38 Bacon, K. L. *Tracking and interpreting leaf physiognomy and stable carbon isotopic*  
512 *composition across the Triassic-Jurassic boundary* Ph.D. thesis, University College Dublin,  
513 (2012).
- 514 39 Garsed, S. G., Farrar, J. F. & Rutter, A. J. The Effects of Low Concentrations of Sulphur Dioxide  
515 on the Growth of Four Broadleaved Tree Species. *Journal of Applied Ecology* **16**, 217-226,  
516 doi:10.2307/2402741 (1979).
- 517 40 Temple, P. J., Fa, C. H. & Taylor, O. C. Effects of SO<sub>2</sub> on stomatal conductance and growth of  
518 *Phaseolus vulgaris*. *Environmental Pollution Series A, Ecological and Biological* **37**, 267-279,  
519 doi:[http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/0143-1471\(85\)90046-7](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/0143-1471(85)90046-7) (1985).
- 520 41 Whitmore, M. E. & Mansfield, T. A. Effects of long-term exposures to SO<sub>2</sub> and NO<sub>2</sub> on *Poa*  
521 *pratensis* and other grasses. *Environmental Pollution Series A, Ecological and Biological* **31**,  
522 217-235, doi:[http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/0143-1471\(83\)90078-8](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/0143-1471(83)90078-8) (1983).
- 523 42 Jones, T. & Mansfield, T. A. The effect of SO<sub>2</sub> on growth and development of seedlings of  
524 *Phleum pratense* under different light and temperature environments. *Environmental*  
525 *Pollution Series A, Ecological and Biological* **27**, 57-71, doi:[http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/0143-](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/0143-1471(82)90063-0)  
526 [1471\(82\)90063-0](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/0143-1471(82)90063-0) (1982).
- 527 43 Bell, J. N. B., Rutter, A. J. & Relton, J. STUDIES ON THE EFFECTS OF LOW LEVELS OF SULPHUR  
528 DIOXIDE ON THE GROWTH OF *LOLIUM PERENNE* L. *New Phytologist* **83**, 627-643,  
529 doi:10.1111/j.1469-8137.1979.tb02295.x (1979).
- 530 44 Nicotra, A. B. *et al.* Plant phenotypic plasticity in a changing climate. *Trends in Plant Science*  
531 **15**, 684-692, doi:<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.tplants.2010.09.008> (2010).
- 532 45 Ghalambor, C. K., McKay, J. K., Carroll, S. P. & Reznick, D. N. Adaptive versus non-adaptive  
533 phenotypic plasticity and the potential for contemporary adaptation in new environments.  
534 *Functional Ecology* **21**, 394-407, doi:10.1111/j.1365-2435.2007.01283.x (2007).
- 535 46 Del Tredici, P. The Ginkgos of Tian Mu Shan. *Conservation Biology* **6**, 202-209 (1992).
- 536 47 Royer, D. L., Hickey, L. J. & Wing, S. L. Ecological conservatism in the "living fossil" Ginkgo.  
537 *Paleobiology* **29**, 84-104 (2003).
- 538 48 Currano, E. D. *et al.* Sharply increased insect herbivory during the Paleocene–Eocene Thermal  
539 Maximum. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* **105**, 1960-1964,  
540 doi:10.1073/pnas.0708646105 (2008).
- 541 49 Blonder, B., Royer, D. L., Johnson, K. R., Miller, I. & Enquist, B. J. Plant Ecological Strategies  
542 Shift Across the Cretaceous–Paleogene Boundary. *PLoS Biol* **12**, e1001949,  
543 doi:10.1371/journal.pbio.1001949 (2014).
- 544 50 Cornwell, W. K., Godoy, Ó. & Westoby, M. The leaf economic spectrum drives litter  
545 decomposition within regional floras worldwide. *Ecology Letters* **1071**, 1065-1071 (2008).
- 546 51 Bonis, N. R. & Kürschner, W. M. Vegetation history, diversity patterns, and climate change  
547 across the Triassic/Jurassic boundary. *Paleobiology* **38**, 240-264, doi:10.1666/09071.1 (2012).

- 548 52 McElwain, J. C., Yiotis, C. & Lawson, T. Using modern plant trait relationships between  
549 observed and theoretical maximum stomatal conductance and vein density to examine  
550 patterns of plant macroevolution. *New Phytologist*, n/a-n/a, doi:10.1111/nph.13579 (2015).
- 551 53 Utescher, T. & Mosbrugger, V. Eocene vegetation patterns reconstructed from plant diversity  
552 — A global perspective. *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology* **247**, 243-271,  
553 doi:<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.palaeo.2006.10.022> (2007).
- 554 54 Spicer, R. A. The Formation and Interpretation of Plant Fossil Assemblages. *Advances in*  
555 *Botanical Research Incorporating Advances in Plant Pathology* **16**, 95-191 (1989).
- 556 55 Schneider, C. A., Rasband, W. S. & Eliceiri, K. W. NIH Image to ImageJ: 25 years of image  
557 analysis. *Nature Methods* **9**, 671-675 (2012).
- 558 56 Dykstra, M. J. *A manual of applied techniques for biological electron microscopy*. (Plenum  
559 Press, 1993).
- 560 57 Plummer, M. in *Proceedings of the 3rd International Workshop on Distributed Statistical*  
561 *Computing (DSC 2003)*.
- 562 58 R: A language and environment for statistical computing (R Foundation for Statistical  
563 Computing. Retrieved from <http://www.R-project.org/>, Vienna, Austria, 2012).
- 564 59 Plummer, M. rjags: Bayesian Graphical Models using MCMC. (2016). <[http://CRAN.R-](http://CRAN.R-project.org/package=rjags)  
565 [project.org/package=rjags](http://CRAN.R-project.org/package=rjags)>.
- 566 60 Gelman, A. & Hill, J. *Data analysis using regression and multi-level/hierarchical models*. 625  
567 (Cambridge University Press, 2007).
- 568 61 Parnell, A. C., Haslett, J., Allen, J. R. M., Buck, C. E. & Huntley, B. A flexible approach to  
569 assessing synchronicity of past events using Bayesian reconstructions of sedimentation  
570 history. *Quaternary Science Reviews* **27**, 1872-1885,  
571 doi:<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.quascirev.2008.07.009> (2008).
- 572 62 Webb, C. O. & Donoghue, M. J. Phylomatic: tree assembly for applied phylogenetics.  
573 *Molecular Ecology Notes* **5**, 181-183, doi:10.1111/j.1471-8286.2004.00829.x (2005).
- 574 63 Webb, C. O., Ackerly, D. D. & Kembel, S. W. Phylocom: software for the analysis of  
575 phylogenetic community structure and trait evolution. *Bioinformatics* **24**, 2098-2100,  
576 doi:10.1093/bioinformatics/btn358 (2008).
- 577 64 Christianson, M. L. & Niklas, K. J. Patterns of diversity in leaves from canopies of *Ginkgo biloba*  
578 are revealed using Specific Leaf Area as a morphological character. *American Journal of Botany*  
579 **98**, 1068-1076, doi:10.3732/ajb.1000452 (2011).
- 580 65 Hesselbo, S. P., Robinson, S. A., Surlyk, F. & Piasecki, S. Terrestrial and marine extinction at the  
581 Triassic–Jurassic boundary synchronized with major carbon-cycle perturbation: A link to  
582 initiation of massive volcanism? *Geology* **30**, 251–254 (2002).
- 583

584 **Supplementary Information** is available in the online version of the paper.

585 Correspondence and requests for materials should be addressed to W.K.S. (email:  
586 [wuu.soh@ucd.ie](mailto:wuu.soh@ucd.ie)).  
587

588 **Acknowledgements.** We are grateful to Debra Birch and Nicole Vella for microscopy  
589 assistance at Macquarie University Microscopy Unit. We also thank staffs at the Sydney  
590 Royal Botanic Gardens (Frances Jackson, David Bidwell and Paul Nicolson) and National  
591 Botanic Gardens, Ireland (Matthew Jebb and Colin Kelleher) for permission to sample leaf  
592 material. Kasia Ziemińska and Tiina Tosens helped with queries on plant anatomy. We thank  
593 Dana Royer and Sofie Lindström for their comments. We thank Liam Furlong for the

594 graphics and Johan Elkind for statistical advice. This research is funded by Science  
595 Foundation Ireland PI grant (11/P1/1103) (J.M.C., W.K.S., K.L.B, I.J.W.), University  
596 College Dublin (SF1036) (W.K.S.), Royal Irish Academy (W.K.S.), Australian Research  
597 Council (FT100100910) (I.J.W.) and Macquarie University (I.J.W., T.I.L.).  
598

599 **Author contributions**

600 W.K.S., I.J.W. and J.M.C. designed the study, interpreted the data and wrote the paper with  
601 feedback from all authors; W.K.S. and A.C.P. performed the statistical analyses; W.K.S. and  
602 T.I.L. conducted the microscopy work; W.K.S. contributed to the cell-LMA proxy data;  
603 K.L.B contributed to the paleoatmosphere experiment and petiole-LMA proxy results; M.S.  
604 contributed to the macrofossil morphotype and herbivory data.  
605

606

607 **Figure legends**

608 Fig. 1. Paleo-LMA proxy development. **a.** Relationship between LMA and cuticle thickness  
609 (CT) among extant gymnosperms:  $\log_{10}\text{LMA} = 0.601\log_{10}\text{CT} + 1.744$ ;  $R^2 = 0.78$ ,  $n = 57$ ,  
610 shaded area is 95% confidence interval band. **b.** TEM cross section of *Pterophyllum* (ID  
611 47154), showing a lamellate cuticle proper (I and inset, bar = 100 nm), cuticle layer (II) and  
612 coalified ‘mesophyll’ layer (III); bar = 500 nm. **c.** *Ginkgoites* (ID 47103a), cuticle cross  
613 section autofluorescing in bright red; bar = 10  $\mu\text{m}$ . **d.** *Baiera* (ID 47200a), cuticle cross  
614 section, ‘cell-like’ structure represents chattering effect, white line across cuticle is measured  
615 thickness; bar = 10  $\mu\text{m}$ . **e.** *Ginkgoites*, sample ID 47103a, cuticle cross section, white line  
616 across cuticle is measured thickness, bar = 10  $\mu\text{m}$ . **f.** extant *Ginkgo biloba* (ID 11-84),  
617 showing uncompressed leaf cross section with mesophyll tissue; bar = 10  $\mu\text{m}$ .

618

619 Fig. 2. Leaf mass per area (LMA) of fossil plant species from Astartekløft in East Greenland,  
620 pooled by plant groups and plant beds: dotplots represent mean value, whiskers indicate 95%  
621 prediction intervals except for *Ginkgo biloba*, of which whiskers show the 95% confident  
622 interval. Number of samples are given in brackets. Prediction interval indicates the level of  
623 uncertainty in the inferred LMA values which in turn depends on the sample size and proxy  
624 calibration. **a.** Comparison of LMA estimates for Tr–J Bennettiales, Tr–J Ginkgoales and  
625 extant *Ginkgo biloba*. **b.** Boxplots showing a comparison of Bennettiales (green) and Tr–J  
626 Ginkgoales (red) LMAs with LMAs of modern plant functional groups from Poorter et al.<sup>30</sup>  
627 in ascending order of median values. Numbers above boxplots are median LMAs. Boxes  
628 represent the interquartile range (IQR), horizontal lines within the boxes represent medians,  
629 and whiskers are the 10th and the 90th percentile. **c.** Comparison of LMA estimates for  
630 Bennettiales pooled across Beds 1–4, Beds 5–6 and Bed 7. **d.** Comparison of LMA estimates

631 for Ginkgoales pooled across Beds 1–4, Beds 5–6 and Beds 7–8, for sample size less than 5,  
632 individual sample values are indicated by black dots. **e**, Comparison of LMA estimates for  
633 Triassic-Jurassic (Tr–J) Ginkgoales made with three independent proxies: cuticle thickness  
634 (cuticle-LMA), petiole width-blade area (petiole-LMA<sup>26,27</sup>), and adaxial epidermal cell  
635 density (epidermal cell-LMA<sup>28</sup>). Three version of the petiole-LMA approach were used  
636 (calibrations made for woody dicots, gymnosperms, and Ginkgo biloba). Mean LMA and  
637 95% prediction interval (PI<sub>95%</sub>) of Tr–J Ginkgoales inferred using the cuticle-LMA proxy  
638 (95.3 gm<sup>-2</sup>, PI<sub>95%</sub>: 86.0, 105.2) and the epidermal cell-LMA proxy (104.5 gm<sup>-2</sup>, PI<sub>95%</sub>: 96.0,  
639 113.8) overlap with the LMA of extant Ginkgo biloba (98.1 gm<sup>-2</sup>, 95% confidence interval:  
640 95.5, 100.6). **f**, LMA trend across fossil beds. Plot illustrating the relationship between mean  
641 LMA inferred from cuticle-LMA proxy and bed height ( $LMA = 0.50\text{Bed depth} + 54.93$ ;  $R^2 =$   
642 0.55) indicated by red regression line, shaded area is 95% confidence interval band, plant bed  
643 numbers are indicated below plots.

644

645 Fig. 3. Ecological traits of Bennettitales and Ginkgoales plotted against Triassic-Jurassic (Tr–  
646 J) geologic time scale, indicated by plant sporomorph zonation<sup>10</sup> and global warming period.  
647 **a**, Simplified schematic log of the Astartekløft section showing the position of plant beds and  
648 the depositional setting of each bed<sup>65</sup>, and estimated atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> concentration<sup>4</sup>. **b**,  
649 Temporal trends in mean leaf mass per area (LMA) for Bennettitales and Ginkgoales, with  
650 95% prediction interval whiskers. **c**, Relative abundance of Bennettitales and Ginkgoales<sup>12</sup>.  
651 **d**, Temporal trends in community-mean LMA of Beds 1–4, Beds 5–6 and Bed 7–8 for  
652 combined Ginkgoales and Bennettitales, with 95% prediction interval whiskers, and sample  
653 numbers in brackets.