



Deposited via The University of Leeds.

White Rose Research Online URL for this paper:

<https://eprints.whiterose.ac.uk/id/eprint/118451/>

Version: Accepted Version

Article:

Barrett, BJ, Huws, DG, Booth, AD et al. (2017) Tuning, interference and false shallow gas signatures in geohazard interpretations: Beyond the ' $\lambda/4$ ' rule. *Near Surface Geophysics*, 15 (4). pp. 359-366. ISSN: 1873-0604

<https://doi.org/10.3997/1873-0604.2017023>

This is an author produced version of a paper published in *Near Surface Geophysics*.
Uploaded in accordance with the publisher's self-archiving policy.

Reuse

Items deposited in White Rose Research Online are protected by copyright, with all rights reserved unless indicated otherwise. They may be downloaded and/or printed for private study, or other acts as permitted by national copyright laws. The publisher or other rights holders may allow further reproduction and re-use of the full text version. This is indicated by the licence information on the White Rose Research Online record for the item.

Takedown

If you consider content in White Rose Research Online to be in breach of UK law, please notify us by emailing eprints@whiterose.ac.uk including the URL of the record and the reason for the withdrawal request.

- 1 TUNING, INTERFERENCE AND FALSE SHALLOW GAS SIGNATURES IN
2 GEOHAZARD INTERPRETATIONS: BEYOND THE 'λ/4' RULE
3 2017
4
5 Bonita J. Barrett
6 *School of Earth and Environment, University of Leeds, Leeds, UK*
7 Dei G. Huws
8 *School of Ocean Sciences, Bangor University, UK.*
9 Adam D. Booth
10 *School of Earth and Environment, University of Leeds, Leeds, UK.*
11 Øystein Wergeland
12 *Statoil ASA, Harstad, Norway.*
13 J.A. Mattias Green
14 *School of Ocean Sciences, Bangor University, UK.*
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23

24 **ABSTRACT**

25 Shallow gas presents a significant geohazard for drilling operations, with implications
26 for costly well deviations and inherent blow-out risks. The archetypal seismic signature
27 of shallow gas – a ‘bright spot’ – can be falsely induced by tuning, whereby reflections
28 from closely-separated horizons stack and constructively interfere. According to
29 established guidelines, maximum constructive interference is typically expected where
30 horizons are separated by one-quarter wavelength ($\lambda/4$) of the seismic wavelet. Here,
31 we test the circumstances in which false gas signatures can be induced from tuning, and
32 the conditions in which the ‘ $\lambda/4$ ’ guidelines for interference become problematic. We
33 simulate normal-incidence seismic data for a variety of reflectivity models,
34 incorporating different contrasts in reflectivity magnitude and polarity. We simulate
35 acoustic impedance by supplying initial geological parameters to Gassmann’s rock
36 physics equations, allowing bulk density and compressional (P-) wave velocity to vary
37 between $\sim 1200\text{-}2100\text{ kg/m}^3$ and $\sim 1460\text{-}1670\text{ m/s}$, respectively for non-gassy sediments
38 and 1160 kg/m^3 and $170\text{-}200\text{ m/s}$ for gassy sediments. Tuning is considered for a
39 Ricker wavelet source pulse, having both peak frequency and effective bandwidth of 60
40 Hz. Tuning effects are able to mask a gas pocket, corresponding to a ‘false negative’
41 signature which represents a significant hazard for drilling operations. Furthermore, the
42 widely adopted ‘ $\lambda/4$ ’ assumption for constructive interference is not always valid, as the
43 brightest seismic responses can appear for thicker ($< \lambda/2$) and thinner ($> \lambda/16$) beds,
44 depending upon the stratigraphy. Similar observations are made both qualitatively and
45 quantitatively for real seismic responses, in which reflections from a series of dipping
46 clinoforms interfere with those from an overlying unconformity. We conclude that
47 greater attention should be paid to the interpretation of shallow gas risk; specifically, the

48 effect of reflector geometries should not be overlooked as a means of producing or
49 masking seismic amplitudes that could be indicative of a hazardous gas accumulation.

50

51

52 **INTRODUCTION**

53 Gas is widely distributed as a pore fluid in the shallow sediment layers of most of the
54 world's basins. In hydrocarbon exploration, the presence of shallow gas can be a useful
55 indicator of deeper economic reserve of gas, or it can be present as a significant gas
56 reservoir in its own right (e.g. the Peon gas field in the North Sea). For most purposes,
57 however, it is considered as an engineering hazard, and presents a significant risk in
58 hydrocarbon production and sea-bed engineering. Blow-outs from drilling into a
59 pressurised gas pocket are of particular concern, and the West Vanguard blowout that
60 occurred at 523m RKB on the Halten Bank, Norwegian Sea serves as a prime example
61 of the tragic consequences (human, economic and environmental) that can arise from
62 such an event (Nørstebø et al., 1986; Grinrod, Haaland & Ellingsen, 1988).

63

64 The risk posed by shallow gas can be mitigated by undertaking a risk assessment prior
65 to the commencement of drilling operations, whereby the analysis of shallow seismic
66 data is a key component. In such data, shallow accumulations of gas are often clearly
67 visible as a high-amplitude anomaly (Judd and Hovland, 1992). Gas-charged sediment
68 typically has a high acoustic impedance contrast with overlying and underlying strata,
69 since seismic velocity is significantly reduced in the presence of small gas
70 concentrations (Gardner, 1988), whilst the bulk density is much less affected. The

71 undrained strength of sediment is reduced by 25% with a total gas volume of only 1-2%
72 (Thomas, 1987; Sham, 1989).

73

74 Mapping the location of shallow amplitude anomalies is an effective means of
75 constructing a risk map, to mitigate against disastrous blow-outs. However, a significant
76 fraction of anomalies may present as ‘false positives’ or ‘false negatives’. In the former
77 case, seismic amplitudes may exceed some critical threshold for a gas anomaly, but no
78 gas is encountered upon drilling. The consequence is that optimal drilling strategies are
79 unnecessarily ruled out. Less common, although more hazardous, are false negative gas
80 signatures - where no evidence of gas is perceived in the seismic record but a gas
81 accumulation is observed upon drilling. With no warning from the seismic hazard map,
82 a hidden anomaly of this kind could be disastrous. A comprehensive seismic hazard
83 map, therefore, not only delineates the extent of amplitude anomalies, but also
84 incorporates the potential origins of the amplitude anomaly. False gas signatures,
85 whether positive or negative, can arise because of tuning effects that are caused by
86 interference between reflected wavelets. Understanding the origins of such responses is
87 the key focus of this paper.

88

89 Tuning phenomena are commonplace in the shallow section of seismic data, particularly
90 in the previously glaciated regions of the North Sea and Norwegian Sea, since the
91 glacial deposits are often dominated by thin sediment beds, with inherently closely-
92 spaced horizons (Van der Meer, Menzies and Rose, 2003). Wavelet interference is
93 therefore widespread although seldom predictable; constructive interference causes an

94 anomalously high amplitude response that resembles shallow gas, whereas destructive
95 interference may mask a genuine gas response. Similar interpretative dilemmas are, of
96 course, encountered in seismic reservoir characterisation, but the availability of
97 borehole logs removes much of the ambiguity from the analysis of the seismic response.
98 However, such datasets are seldom available for the shallow marine case, and the extent
99 to which the risk of false signature misinterpretation of shallow gas are appreciated in
100 the geotechnical industry is unclear.

101

102 To generalise tuning effects, a ‘rule-of-thumb’ has arisen that implies that maximum
103 constructive interference occurs where horizons are separated by $\frac{1}{4}$ of the incident
104 wavelength ($\lambda/4$). This generalisation follows from the seminal work of Widess (1973),
105 who model-tested the tuning response of a single thin bed surrounded by homogenous
106 sediment (using two equal but opposite-polarity reflection coefficients as top and basal
107 reflection interfaces). The study established the limit of vertical resolution as $\lambda/8$ in
108 noise-free data, but $\lambda/4$ as a realistic threshold – a conclusion that has since been widely
109 reported (Ashcroft, 2011; Avseth, Mukerji, and Mavko, 2005; Chopra and Marfurt,
110 2007; Li et al., 2015) regardless of the match between the genuine subsurface
111 reflectivity and the simplified Widess (1973) model.

112

113 Modest variations to this simple ground model can yield significant deviations from the
114 ‘ $\lambda/4$ rule’. Chung and Lawton (1990) considered the resolution of reflectivity models
115 that had unequal, yet opposite-polarity reflection coefficients. They showed that the
116 maximum amplitude of the composite waveform resulting from the two interfaces

117 increases linearly with layer thickness for equal and opposite reflection coefficients up
118 to $\lambda/4$, but that there is a non-linear relationship between thickness and amplitude for
119 unequal reflection coefficients. Additional to the underlying reflectivity, wavelet shape
120 also plays a complicating role in resolution and interference. The observations of
121 Widess (1973) were defined for a zero-phase wavelet. Lee et al. (2009) developed this
122 by considering both the resolution characteristics of not only zero-phase, but also
123 minimum-phase Ormsby wavelets. They concluded that the nominal tuning thickness
124 can be less than $\lambda/4$ in both cases. While minimum-phase wavelets would unlikely to
125 be used in shallow hazard assessment, the scope for deviation from the $\lambda/4$ assumption
126 is noteworthy.

127

128 In this paper, we conduct an investigation of the circumstances in which seismic
129 amplitude anomalies may specifically be falsely interpreted in terms of the presence or
130 absence of shallow gas accumulations. We show situations arising from reasonable
131 variations in stratigraphy alone which, when treated simply with the ' $\lambda/4$ rule', would be
132 vulnerable to misinterpretation. We conduct tests to assess the variability of tuning
133 responses with varying geological sequences, using a synthetic seismic model and real
134 data from the Norwegian Sea, and show that each ground model has a unique tuning
135 response. In addition, we show that in cases where gas is present in the stratigraphy,
136 there is the potential to mask the amplitude anomaly from the destructive effects of
137 tuning.

138

139

140

141 **METHODS**142 **Synthetic Modelling**

143 Tuning effects were studied using 1D models of normal-incidence seismic reflection
144 data. These models are derived by supplying representative values of sediment and fluid
145 properties into Gassman's equations (1951), a set of relationships used to derive the
146 compressional (P-) wave velocity (and bulk density) from fluid and matrix components.
147 Modelled quantities are validated against literature values (Anderson and Hampton,
148 1980) of bulk modulus, bulk density and P-wave velocity. The capacity of a model to
149 produce a 'gas-like' anomaly is validated against seismic data from the Peon gas field,
150 North Sea. On defining bulk density and P-wave velocity, models are converted to
151 acoustic impedance and, thereafter, to reflection coefficient. Representative seismic
152 traces are then produced by convolving the reflectivity series with a Ricker wavelet; the
153 convolutional model incorporates reflection and transmission losses across each
154 interface, but neither noise nor the effects of noise-suppression algorithms are
155 considered. The following sections describe the detail of our simulation approach.

156

157 *Model inputs*

158 Gassmann's equations (1951) use simple mixing models for sediment components to
159 derive a compressional velocity and bulk density of each sediment layer. The use of
160 Gassmann's equations to calculate the effect of saturating fluids on the compressional
161 velocity in unconsolidated sediments is supported by Gardner, Gardner and Gregory
162 (1974). It is assumed that each layer is composed of three principal components: the

163 frame (dry framework drained of pore fluid), matrix (grains) and pore space
 164 constituents. These components are characterised by individual properties of density,
 165 velocity, water saturation and elastic moduli, here assigned using values established in
 166 previous studies (Table 1; Stoll and Bryan, 1970; Stoll, 2001; Al-Khateb, 2013). The
 167 equations assume that *i*) the sediment is homogeneous, elastic and isotropic, *ii*) the
 168 porosity is constant and in pressure equilibrium, *iii*) there is no movement of pore fluid
 169 across boundaries, and *iv*) there are no chemical reactions between the fluids and the
 170 grains, i.e. shear modulus is constant (Al-Khateb, 2013).

171

172 Since we simulate normal incidence reflections, only the P-wave velocity, v_p , is derived
 173 as:

$$174 \quad v_p = \sqrt{\frac{K + \frac{4}{3}\mu}{\rho_B}} \quad (1)$$

175 where K is sediment bulk modulus (Pa), μ is shear modulus (Pa) and ρ_B is bulk density
 176 (kg/m^3). Compressional velocities between ~1460-1670 m/s and bulk densities of
 177 ~1200-2100 kg/m^3 are calculated for sediments with varying proportions of clay and
 178 sand.

179

180 Bulk density is a composite of grain density (ρ_g), pore fluid density (ρ_{fl}) and the porosity
 181 (ϕ) of the sediment (using the proportional average of the sand and clay fractions), given
 182 by:

$$183 \quad \rho_B = \rho_g(1 - \phi) + \rho_{fl}\phi. \quad (2)$$

184 Fluid density is given by:

$$185 \quad \rho_{fl} = S_w \rho_w + (1 - S_w) \rho_{hc} \quad (3)$$

186 where S_w is fractional water saturation, and ρ_w and ρ_{hc} are densities of the water and
 187 hydrocarbon (here, gas) fractions respectively. A value of $S_w = 0.7$ implies that 70% of
 188 pore space is occupied by water, the remainder by gas.

189

190 We fix porosity at 0.34 and 0.61 for unconsolidated sand and clay respectively
 191 (following Terzhagi and Peck, 1967). Void ratio (e) is established in order to calculate
 192 porosity (ϕ) using:

$$193 \quad e = \frac{G_s \rho_w - \rho_{sat}}{\rho_{sat} - \rho_w} \quad (4)$$

$$194 \quad \phi = \frac{e}{1+e} \times 100 \quad (5)$$

195 where G_s is specific gravity and ρ_{sat} is the saturated bulk density (kg/m^3).

196

197 For small additions of gas, v_p drops significantly (Anderson and Hampton, 1980), due
 198 mostly to the effect of gas on the bulk compressibility of the sediment volume. Velocity
 199 values of ~170-200 m/s are calculated with the addition of gas, consistent with
 200 Anderson and Hampton (1980) for gas saturations greater than 1%, and Konstanaki et
 201 al. (2016) and Angioni et al. (2013) at shallow onshore sites. Of course, higher
 202 velocities than this are plausible, attributable (Wilkins and Richardson, 1998) to local
 203 velocity averaging in gassy and non-gassy sediment, and/or a prevalence of smaller-
 204 sized bubbles in the total gas volume. However, by including the slower velocities, our

205 models simulate the strongest likely reflectivity – the motivation being that if the
206 potential exists for geometric effects to mask strong reflectivity, it also exists for weaker
207 contrasts.

208

209 A fundamental concept in Gassmann's equation is that the bulk modulus is affected by
210 fluid substitution, but the shear modulus is not. The gas presence will inherently reduce
211 sediment density too (to ~1160 kg/m³ in sand) but a reduced density, of itself, would
212 increase the velocity (Equation 1); it is the effect on bulk modulus reduction that is the
213 main cause of the velocity drop (Lee, 2004).

214

215 Densities and velocities are combined to define acoustic impedance ($Z, = \rho_{BVP}$), and a
216 reflection coefficient series. The normal incidence reflectivity, R , of each interface is

217
$$R = \frac{Z_2 - Z_1}{Z_2 + Z_1} \quad (6)$$

218 where subscripts 1 and 2 respectively denote material properties above and below the
219 interface. The reflectivity series is convolved with a broadband Ricker wavelet (Figure
220 1) of 60 Hz peak frequency, with effective bandwidth (i.e., bandwidth measured at the
221 50% amplitude threshold) spanning 30-95 Hz. This frequency conforms with the
222 recommendation of Bulat & Long (2006), who suggest 60 Hz as the lowest frequency
223 that would make exploration data suitable for site investigation purposes. While they
224 also concede 60 Hz is somewhat high for typical exploration data, our study highlights
225 the range of tuning responses that could be anticipated if the guidance of Bulat & Long
226 (2006) was followed.

227

228

229 *Transmission loss and amplitude gain*

230 At each interface, a certain proportion of wavelet amplitude energy is reflected back to
231 the surface, implying that a reduced fraction is transmitted. The available wavelet
232 amplitude therefore decreases with depth, irrespective of interference effects. Such
233 transmission losses are included in the model, but loss due to scattering and/or
234 absorption is omitted (their effects are in any case negligible for the short intervals we
235 consider). Other authors neglect interface transmissivity (e.g. Lee, Lee and Kim, 2009;
236 Chung & Lawton, 1995), but we consider it sufficiently important to include because it
237 will materially affect the results of a study such as this, in which closely spaced reflector
238 responses are interfering with each other.

239

240

241 **RESULTS**

242 **Synthetic Results**

243 *Tuning with horizon couplets*

244 Twelve different reflectivity models with two successive horizons of varying polarities
245 and magnitudes, were simulated to test tuning responses (Figure 2). The layer thickness
246 is reduced in each test from 1λ to $\lambda/24$ and the leading trough amplitude (maximum
247 negative amplitude) is measured. This attribute is used since strong negative amplitudes
248 would often be considered to be the least ambiguous diagnostic of a shallow gas

249 accumulation. While it should be noted that not all of our layer configurations are able
250 to trap gas (i.e., a potential physical seal is absent), these hypothetical layer
251 configurations are simply synthetic models to show the range of tuning characteristics
252 that they could produce.

253

254 Figure 3 shows the maximum negative amplitude attribute for the all reflectivity models
255 considered. Reflectivity models that exhibit a large amplitude change are of interest as
256 these could represent constructive or destructive interference of a potential gas
257 signature. Note that tuning responses for beds thinner than $\lambda/8$ are not resolved in real
258 data, therefore Figure 3 emphasises thicknesses in the range of $\lambda/2$ and $\lambda/8$. Test 4
259 represents a validation model since its equal-and-opposite reflectivity conforms with the
260 configuration defined by Widess (1973). For this case, the ' $\lambda/4$ ' characteristic is
261 evidently valid; however, it is immediately obvious that the ' $\lambda/4$ ' does not describe
262 tuning for other cases, thereby highlighting the need for cautious interpretation.

263 Maximum constructive interference occurs at $\lambda/4$ for six of the twelve tests (4, 5, 6, 7, 8
264 and 12) and, of these, only three construct by greater than 20% (Tests 4, 5 and 12). Test
265 4 is an 'equal and opposite' scenario with a positive reflection preceding the negative
266 reflection and Test 12 is the opposite. Test 5 is a small negative reflection coefficient
267 followed by a large positive reflection coefficient. In these examples, the $\lambda/4$ rule may
268 be valid. Otherwise, the remaining tests reveal maximum constructive interference at
269 bed thickness other than $\lambda/4$. Tests 1, 2 and 3 comprise positive reflection coefficient
270 combinations and reveal maximum constructive interference at $\lambda/2$. The remaining

271 reflection coefficient patterns (9, 10 and 11) reveal maximum constructive interference
272 at bed thicknesses $< \lambda/8$, unlikely to be resolved in real seismic data (Widess, 1973).

273 Amplitude destruction is encountered at $\lambda/4$ in Tests 9, 10 and 11 of 49%, 15% and 7%,
274 respectively. Test 9 consists of two equal negative reflection coefficients and reveals
275 maximum destructive interference at $\lambda/4$ when the negative peak of the first reflection is
276 suppressed by the leading positive trough of the second. In this scenario, if there is no
277 gas in the ground model and the negative reflection coefficients represent a simple
278 transition into sediments of lower acoustic impedance (e.g. sand to silt, clay), false
279 positive gas signatures are induced at bed thicknesses of $\lambda/8$ and thinner. If the negative
280 reflection coefficients are a result of gas, the gas response is visible at $\lambda/8$ (but likely to
281 be below seismic resolution) and where we would expect it according to the $\lambda/4$ rule of
282 thumb, the gas signature becomes hidden. This could lead to a false negative
283 interpretation of shallow gas.

284

285 *Tuning with multiple thin beds*

286 The more likely scenario for a real case is that the observed reflectivity is the result of
287 interference across several closely-separated horizons. When a ground model of
288 alternating sand and clay layers of the same thickness is tested, maximum constructive
289 interference indeed occurs at $\lambda/4$ and a false positive gas signature is induced. A typical
290 example of beds thinning in this manner is the pinch-out of sediment infill onto the
291 margin of a channel or of a syn-rift depositional wedge. However, when gas was
292 introduced into the third layer (sand) of the same model, the interference pattern is very
293 different (Figure 4). The ‘gassy’ signature is of a similar amplitude to the seabed

294 reflection. The leading trough of the gas trace constructs at a bed thickness of $\lambda/2$ by
295 38%. Crucially, at bed thickness of $\lambda/4$, the gas signature is hidden (deconstructed by
296 233%) and a false negative gas signature is induced. For a 60 Hz wavelet and a velocity
297 of 2000 m/s, $\lambda/4$ implies that 10 m thick layers are vulnerable to this effect. For the
298 higher frequencies (e.g., 120 Hz; Atkins, 2004) typical of dedicated site-survey data, $\lambda/4$
299 may be closer to 4 m, hence gassy beds of this thickness are vulnerable to being hidden.

300

301 It is also worth noting that variations in gas saturation above 3% cause relatively little
302 change in v_p (Domenico, 1977; Murphy, 1984; Lee, 2004). As such, tuning effects can
303 mask a layer even with very high gas saturation.

304

305

306 **DISCUSSION**

307 *Gas signatures in real data*

308 Figures 5 and 6 highlight interference effects in real data, from 3D seismic data from the
309 Norwegian continental shelf. The Naust Formation is a Late Pliocene (3.60-2.58 Ma)
310 unit, in which the high amplitude Upper Regional Unconformity (URU) truncates a
311 series of clinoform wedges. A clinoform is a depositional surface expressed in seismic
312 with a sloping morphology (Mitchum et al., 1977). The URU truncates the clinoforms
313 such that only the foresets are apparent and it separates them from flat-lying till units
314 above. Unfortunately, there are no wells that penetrate these particular clinoforms, but
315 local wells penetrating through others within the Naust Formation reveal sand with

316 hemipelagic mud between. Different interference patterns are anticipated between the
317 URU and the underlying clinoforms, given the change in the vertical separation of
318 reflectivity as the clinoforms converge on the URU. Figure 5 shows a seismic cross-
319 section through a series of clinoforms, extracted along the profile included in Figure 6.
320 Figure 6 itself is a plan-view image of URU reflectivity, shown as a combined variance
321 (i.e. trace-to-trace variability over a given sample interval) and minimum amplitude
322 map.

323

324 The amplitudes in Figure 6 show a characteristic tuning response, in which the
325 maximum negative amplitude brightens (yellow) and then dims (grey) towards the
326 truncation of a clinoform. It is evident that each clinoform truncation expresses this
327 response in a unique manner, with some producing brighter amplitudes over a larger
328 distance than others. For example, the approach of clinoforms 4 and 5 (upper row of
329 Figure 5) to the truncation are not as bright as those of clinoforms 6 and 7 (lower row of
330 Figure 5), i.e. the degree of constructive interference is reduced. Since this dataset is
331 acquired and processed to maintain a consistent waveform, and each clinoform
332 converges on the URU at a similar angle, the differing tuning responses can be
333 attributed only to the different lithology of each specific clinoform.

334

335 The relationships we simulated in our synthetic analysis, where only lithology was
336 varied, are therefore likely to be appropriate for this real dataset. Furthermore, it is
337 possible that the quantitative relationships we observed between amplitude and layer
338 thickness could be replicated for this real data setting. Figure 7 shows the detail of

339 clinoform 7 (lower row, Figure 5), showing the seismic profile as wiggle traces, with
340 ‘red-blue-red’ (trough-peak-trough) polarity giving a ‘hard’ response (i.e., the response
341 generated at an interface across which there is an increase in acoustic impedance, such
342 as clay to sand). Both the URU and the clinoform exhibit hard responses and hence
343 show positive reflection coefficients that are similar in magnitude. Our modelling
344 suggests that this combination of reflectivity experiences maximum constructive
345 interference at $\lambda/2$, which is consistent with the results observed in synthetic Test 1
346 (Figure 3). The bed thickness (time between peaks) and amplitude curve (of the leading
347 trough of the clinoform reflection) are presented above the seismic cross-section. Bed
348 thickness decreases from left to right and maximum constructive interference occurs
349 when the bed thickness is 20 ms. Here, wavelet period is a suitable proxy for
350 wavelength as we do not expect large lateral contrasts in velocity. We measure wavelet
351 period at 35 ms (28 Hz dominant frequency) hence it appears that maximum
352 constructive interference occurs at approximately $\lambda/2$ (i.e., one half-period). In addition,
353 models suggested amplitude boosting of 70%, comparable to the observed increase of
354 73%.

355

356 *Current industrial practice*

357 While the effects of interference may be familiar with regards to their potential for
358 producing false-positive gas anomalies, there is less recognition that interference can
359 obscure a genuine gas signature. We have shown a range of geological models for
360 which this is possible.

361

362 The hydrocarbon industry uses a rigorous procedure for shallow gas assessment in order
363 to avoid gas in drilling activity, using both quantitative (seismic amplitude) and
364 qualitative (contextual geological and previous experience) evidence. Commonly, a risk
365 matrix will be used that incorporates amplitude and the type of evidence (i.e. bright
366 spot, turbidity, blanking, in some cases AVO class), although such matrices vary
367 between companies. Furthermore, the nature of the assessment is subtle and a whole
368 variety of evidence accompanies each anomaly, hence the classification is very
369 subjective: effective communication is required to integrate the opinions of the
370 contractor, consultant and operator.

371

372 AVO (amplitude *vs.* offset) analysis has been considered to aid this assessment,
373 combining acoustic impedance with the shear wave velocity of sediments. As such, a
374 richer set of quantities (e.g. Poisson's ratio) can be obtained to describe sea bed
375 sediments. The added value can be used to distinguish, for example, a shallow gas
376 accumulation from a shallow coal layer; both of these would give strongly negative
377 reflections in normal-incidence seismic data, but would be distinct in AVO given the
378 different shear wave velocities and resulting Poisson's ratios (Thore and Spindler,
379 2013).

380

381 However, AVO analysis is vulnerable to poor data quality and normal seismic
382 processing (i.e., that prioritises imaging over amplitude preservation) can introduce
383 further false signatures (Paternoster and Des Vallières, 2008). In its usual application in
384 reservoir analysis, AVO requires multi-channel seismic data and offsets that are

385 sufficiently large to give incident angles up to 30 degrees. For a typical geotechnical
386 survey of an offshore target, the usual procedure is to acquire single-channel data for
387 geology less than 100 m below the seabed, therefore multi-channel requirement for
388 AVO characterisation is moot (IOGP, 2015). In any case, even where multi-channel
389 data are available, industry tests have shown that any AVO anomaly from a typical
390 geohazard is also present in full-stack amplitudes and as such, often is not pursued as a
391 useful method for characterizing gas hazards. Hence, normal-incidence seismic
392 amplitude and phase are still the main means of detecting shallow gas and the problem
393 of false positive and negative responses then remains an ambiguity that relies heavily on
394 experience and geological knowledge to ameliorate. As such, we emphasise caution in
395 interpretations where tuning is likely to be present and suggest consideration of tuning
396 scenarios beyond the ' $\lambda/4$ rule', whereby maximum constructive interference could
397 occur at alternative bed thicknesses. Where data are available, we suggest that AVO
398 should be considered to aid shallow gas assessment, particularly in regard to false
399 positive interpretations.

400

401

402 **CONCLUSIONS**

403 We demonstrate that wavelet interference and its tuning response is highly dependent on
404 the inherent geology and hence the nature of the reflection coefficients, as well as bed
405 thickness and wavelet shape. Although widespread, we emphasise that the ' $\lambda/4$ -rule'
406 should be applied cautiously, as constructive interference can peak at thicker ($\lambda/2$) and
407 thinner ($<\lambda/8$) bed separations. Real examples of tuning at clinoform truncations in the

408 Norwegian Sea support the lithological influence on tuning response. Significantly, the
409 tuning response has the capacity to hide gas as well as induce a gas-like signature, hence
410 careful consideration of thin beds and the tuning response during seismic interpretation
411 is suggested, which could include the support of AVO analysis.

412

413

414 **ACKNOWLEDGMENTS**

415 Statoil and PGS Exploration granted permission for the use of data. Technical advice of
416 Dag Lundqvist (Statoil) is greatly appreciated.

417

418

419 **REFERENCES**

420 Al-Khateb, N., 2013. A look into Gassmann's equations. Geoconvention 2013:
421 Integration, conference proceedings.

422 Anderson, A.L. and Hampton, L.D., 1980. Acoustics of gas-bearing sediments I.
423 Background. Journal of the Acoustical Society of America 67, 1865-1889.

424 Angioni, T., Rechten, R.D., Cardimona, S.J. and Luna, R., 2003. Crosshole seismic
425 tomography and borehole logging for engineering site characterization in Sikeston, MO,
426 USA. Tectonophysics 368, 119-137.

427 Ashcroft, W., 2011. A petroleum geologist's guide to seismic reflection. John Wiley &
428 Sons, Chichester, UK, p. 176.

- 429 Atkins, W.S. Consultants Ltd., 2004. Risk implications in site characterisation and
430 analysis for offshore engineering and design. HSE Research Report 286.
- 431 Avseth, P., Mukerji, T. and Mavko, G., 2005. Quantitative seismic interpretation.
432 Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, UK, p. 373.
- 433 Bulat, J. and Long, D., 2006. Use of 3D seismic data as a substitute for high-resolution
434 seismic surveys for site investigation. HSE Research Report 459.
- 435 Chopra, S. and Marfurt, K.J., 2007. Seismic attributes for prospect identification and
436 reservoir characterisation. SEG geophysical developments: no 11. Society of
437 Exploration Geophysicists, Tulsa, USA, p. 464.
- 438 Chung, H. and Lawton, D., 1990. Some properties of thin beds, CREWES Research
439 Report, 393-429.
- 440 Chung, H. and Lawton, D., 1995. Amplitude responses of thin beds: Sinusoidal
441 approximation versus Ricker approximation. Geophysics, 60, 223-230.
- 442 Domenico, S. N., 1977. Elastic properties of unconsolidated porous sand reservoirs.
443 Geophysics 42, 1339-1368.
- 444 Gardner, T.N., 1988. The acoustic properties of gassy soil. D. Phil. Thesis, Oxford
445 University, p. 251.
- 446 Gassmann, F., 1951. Über die elastizität poröser medien. Vierteljahrsschrift der
447 Naturforschenden Gesellschaft in Zurich 96, 1-23.
- 448 Grinrod, M., Haaland, O. and Ellingsen, B., 1988. A shallow gas research program.
449 Society of Petroleum Engineers, SPE/IADC Drilling Conference, 28 February-2 March,
450 Dalls, Texas.

- 451 IOGP. (2015). International Association of Oil & Gas Producers. Report no. 373-18-2.
452 London, UK.
- 453 Judd, A.G., Hovland, M., 1992. The evidence of shallow gas in marine sediments.
454 Continental Shelf Research 12, 1081-1095.
- 455 Konstantaki, L.A., Ghose, R., Draganov, D. and Heimovaara, T., 2016. Wet and gassy
456 zones in a municipal landfill from P- and S-wave velocity fields. Geophysics 81, EN75-
457 86.
- 458 Lee, G., Lee, K. and Kim, H., 2009. Tuning effects' impact on seismic. AAPG Search
459 and Discovery Article #40474.
- 460 Lee, M.W., 2004. Elastic properties of partially gas-saturated unconsolidated sediments.
461 Marine and Petroleum Geology 21, 641-650.
- 462 Li, J., Shillington, D.J., Bécel, A., Nedimović, M.R., Webb, S.C., Saffer, D.M.,
463 Keranen, K.M. and Kuehn, H., 2015. Downtip variations in seismic reflection
464 character: Implications for fault structure and seismogenic behavior in the Alaska
465 subduction zone. Journal of Geophysical Research: Solid Earth 120,
466 doi:10.1002/2015JB012338.
- 467 Mitchum, R.M., Vail, JR.P.R. and Sangree, J.B. Seismic stratigraphy and global
468 changes of sea level, part 6: stratigraphic interpretation of seismic reflection patterns in
469 depositional sequences. In: M 26: Seismic stratigraphy – applications to hydrocarbon
470 exploration, AAPG Special Volumes, 117-133.
- 471 Murphy, W. F., 1984. Acoustic measures of partial gas saturation in tight sandstones.
472 Journal of Geophysical Research 89, 549-559.

- 473 Nørstebø, O., Kleppe, J., Bjørness, H., Klavenes, T. and Fjellidal, T., 1986. Ukontrollert
474 utblåsing på boreplattformen West Vanguard 6 oktober 1985. NOU report 1986:16,
475 Justis og Politidepartementet, Oslo, Norway.
- 476 Paternoster, B. and Des Vallières, T., 2008. Robust use of AVO to geohazard
477 assessment. 70th EAGE Conference & Exhibition: Rome 2008, conference proceedings.
- 478 Sham, W.K., 1989. The undrained shear strength of soils containing large gas bubbles.
479 PhD thesis, Queen's University of Belfast.
- 480 Stoll, R.D., 2001. Velocity dispersion in water-saturated granular sediment. Journal of
481 the Acoustical Society of America 111, 785-793.
- 482 Stoll, R.D. and Bryan, G.M., 1970. Wave attenuation in saturated sediments. Journal of
483 the Acoustical Society of America 47, 1440-1447
- 484 Terzhagi, K. and Peck, R.B., 1967. Soil mechanics in engineering practice. John Wiley
485 & Sons, Oxford, UK, p. 729.
- 486 Thomas, S.D., 1987. The consolidation behaviour of gassy soil. D. Phil. Thesis, Oxford
487 University, UK, p. 264.
- 488 Thore, P. and Spindler, P., 2013. Breaking the limit of seismic resolution: a synthetic
489 example based on Tunu shallow gas development. The Leading Edge 32, 1318-1326.
- 490 Van der Meer, J.J.M., Menzies, J. and Rose, J., 2003. Subglacial till: the deforming
491 glacier bed. Quaternary Science Reviews, 22, 1659-1685.
- 492 Widess, M.B., 1973. How thin is a thin bed? Geophysics 38, 1176-1180.
- 493

494 **TABLES**495 *Table 1: Geological properties used in modeling, and their sources in the literature.*

Property	Value	Citation
Bulk modulus of frame (K^*)	26.3 GPa	Stoll (2001)
Bulk modulus of clay (K_{clay})	14.9 GPa	Al-Khateb (2013)
Bulk modulus of sand (K_{qtz})	36.0 GPa	Stoll (2001)
Bulk modulus of water (K_w)	2.27 GPa	Stoll (2001)
Density of sand (ρ_{sand})	2650 kg/m ³	Stoll (2001); Stoll and Bryan (1970)
Density of clay (ρ_{clay})	2300 kg/m ³	Stoll (2001); Stoll and Bryan (1970)
Density of water (ρ_w)	1026 kg/m ³	Stoll (2001)

496

497

498

499

500

501

502

503

504

505

506 **FIGURE CAPTIONS**

507 Figure 1. Source pulse utilised in model. Top: frequency spectrum with peak frequency
508 at 60Hz. Bottom: amplitude form with time.

509

510 Figure 2. Reflection coefficient couplet tests. Test number, description, example ground
511 model and schematic representation is included.

512

513 Figure 3. Tuning response as a percentage change of trough amplitude as bed thickness
514 is reduced, according to descriptions in Figure 2. Bed thicknesses thinner than $\lambda/8$ are
515 faded as these would be below seismic resolution.

516

517 Figure 4. Synthetic wedge model. A gas signature is masked as a result of tuning, giving
518 a false-negative seismic response.

519

520 Figure 5. Seismic profile to show clinoform truncations against URU. White boxes
521 correspond to clinoform truncations indicated on the map in Figure 5. Profile is split
522 into two rows for clarity.

523

524 Figure 6. Minimum amplitude map (with variance) of URU to show subcropping
525 clinoform truncations and corresponding seismic profile (indicated by yellow line).

526 White boxes on the map correspond to clinoform truncations indicated on the seismic

527 profile in Figure 4. The figure clearly reveals the typical tuning response of ‘brightening
528 (yellow) –dimming (grey)’ as each clinoform horizon tunes with URU horizon above.
529 Since the wavelet shape is uniform throughout and thickness changes similarly for each
530 clinoform, tuning differences at each truncation are attributed to lithology. This
531 highlights the sensitivity of tuning to specific geological sequences.

532

533 Figure 7. Tuning in real data. A: seismic profile revealing two clinoform truncations
534 against URU (‘6’ and ‘7’ from Figures 5 and 6). Black box indicates tuning truncation
535 of interest (‘7’) that is enlarged in ‘B’. B: Clinoform truncation with wiggle traces
536 (enlarged); the effect of interference on amplitude is clearly visible. A schematic
537 representation of the reflection coefficients of the tuning horizons is presented in red.
538 Graph above shows percentage change of trough amplitude (blue) and bed thickness
539 (orange). Guidelines are provided to indicate the positions of $1T$, $T/2$ and $T/4$ on the
540 seismic profile, where T is the time period for one wavelength. Maximum amplitude
541 constructive interference of 73% occurs at $\sim T/2$; consistent with our model results.

542

543