

This is a repository copy of Spatial complexity of ice flow across the Antarctic Ice Sheet.

White Rose Research Online URL for this paper: http://eprints.whiterose.ac.uk/92053/

Version: Accepted Version

### Article:

Ng, F.S.L. (2015) Spatial complexity of ice flow across the Antarctic Ice Sheet. Nature Geoscience, 8. 847 -850. ISSN 1752-0894

https://doi.org/10.1038/ngeo2532

#### Reuse

Unless indicated otherwise, fulltext items are protected by copyright with all rights reserved. The copyright exception in section 29 of the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988 allows the making of a single copy solely for the purpose of non-commercial research or private study within the limits of fair dealing. The publisher or other rights-holder may allow further reproduction and re-use of this version - refer to the White Rose Research Online record for this item. Where records identify the publisher as the copyright holder, users can verify any specific terms of use on the publisher's website.

#### Takedown

If you consider content in White Rose Research Online to be in breach of UK law, please notify us by emailing eprints@whiterose.ac.uk including the URL of the record and the reason for the withdrawal request.



eprints@whiterose.ac.uk https://eprints.whiterose.ac.uk/

## Post print (reviewed, pre-copy-edited version) of :

Ng, F. S. L. (2015) Spatial complexity of ice flow across the Antarctic Ice Sheet. Nature Geoscience, 8(11), 847-850. doi:10.1038/ngeo2532

# Spatial complexity of ice flow across the Antarctic Ice

- 2 Sheet
- 3 Felix S. L. Ng<sup>1</sup>

<sup>4</sup> <sup>1</sup>Department of Geography, University of Sheffield, Sheffield S10 2TN, UK

- 5
- 6

7 Fast-flowing ice streams carry ice from the interior of the Antarctic Ice Sheet 8 toward the coast. Understanding how ice-stream tributaries operate and how 9 networks of them evolve is essential for developing reliable models of the ice sheet's response to climate change $^{1-6}$ . A particular challenge is to unravel the 10 11 spatial complexity of flow within and across tributary networks. Here I define a 12 measure of planimetric flow convergence, which can be calculated from satellite 13 measurements of the ice sheet's surface velocity, to explore this complexity. The 14 convergence map of Antarctica clarifies how tributaries draw ice from its interior. 15 The map also reveals curvilinear zones of convergence along lateral shear margins 16 of streaming, and abundant ripples associated with nonlinear ice rheology and 17 changes in bed topography and friction. Convergence on ice-stream tributaries 18 and their feeding zones is uneven and interspersed with divergence. For individual 19 drainage basins as well as the ice sheet as a whole, fast flow cannot converge or 20 diverge as much as slow flow. I therefore deduce that flow in the ice-stream 21 networks is subject to mechanical regulation that limits flow-orthonormal strain 22 rates. These findings provide targets for ice-sheet simulations and motivate more 23 research into the origin and dynamics of tributarization.

25 Ice streams have been studied by geomorphological analysis of their surface and bed forms<sup>7-9</sup>, radar and seismic imaging of their internal and basal properties<sup>9-13</sup>, 26 borehole measurements<sup>14</sup>, and thermomechanical modelling<sup>15-21</sup>. Models can mimic ice-27 stream flow in numerical simulations<sup>16–20</sup> but are still probing the uncertain physics of 28 basal-lubricated ice motion coupled with subglacial hydrology $^{16-18}$  and of shear-margin 29 30 development and migration<sup>21</sup>. That subglacial geology can influence the location of ice 31 streams, and major bed-topographic channels focus their flow, and in turn be shaped by it, is recognized<sup>11,22</sup>. But how networks of interacting ice-stream tributaries form, and 32 33 what controls their dendritic (sometimes anastomosing) pattern, remain enigmas. 34 Morphometric analysis of their flow field can shed light on these questions by 35 uncovering order behind its complexity.

36 The essence of any non-uniform flow pattern is its directional variability. 37 Tributarization of ice-sheet flow inherently involves flow merging and splitting, as evident from how flowlines converge/diverge, which is quantifiable as spatial rates of 38 39 change of flow direction. To investigate this amorphous geometry, I propose a novel 40 measure of planimetric flow convergence C, based on the surface ice-flow direction 41  $\theta(X, Y)$  (measured clockwise from the Y-axis in radian; X and Y are horizontal 42 coordinates), and compute a near-continuous visualization of C across Antarctica. Away from singular points at saddles and summits<sup>23</sup>,  $\theta$  is continuous and differentiable. I 43 44 define convergence as its rate of change across flow  $C = \partial \theta / \partial n$ , with *n* pointing leftperpendicular to flow; thus C > 0, < 0 and = 0, respectively, if the flow is locally 45 46 converging, diverging and parallel, whether or not it curves (Methods; Supplementary 47 Fig. 1). Notice 'divergence' herein means C < 0, not divergence of a vector field; and  $\partial \theta / \partial s$ , where s points along flow, quantifies flow curvature, not merging/splitting. 48 49 Locally, C equals the cross-flow compressive strain rate divided by flow speed U

50 (Methods) so it can sensitively detect convergence/divergence in slow flow. The *C*-51 values reported below for ice streams fall within  $\pm$  several km<sup>-1</sup>, about four orders of 52 magnitude less than *C* for a kitchen drain vortex.

I derived the  $\theta$ -field from the Interferometric Synthetic Aperture Radar-(INSAR-) based surface velocity map of Antarctica<sup>6</sup>. Then I computed *C* by a kriging procedure, which treats  $\theta$  as an intrinsic random field with auto-correlation properties obeying its variogram (Supplementary Fig. 2) and evaluates *C* as a linearly-unbiased estimate of the directional derivative of  $\theta$ , while suppressing effects of uncorrelated noise in  $\theta$  (Methods).

59 The convergence map (Fig. 1) bears an unmistakable imprint of ice-stream 60 networks and shows two distinct convergence textures (Figs 1b-f and 2) that broadly 61 occupy regions of different speeds. 'Chaos' texture, characterized by an intricate pattern 62 of intense convergence and divergence alternating over distances of several kilometres or less, dominates the interior, mountains, ice rises and ridges, where  $U \leq 20 \text{ m a}^{-1}$ . Its 63 64 convergence pattern is unreliable and neglected from analysis, because it inherits 65 abundant artefacts from the INSAR velocity and shows weak noise suppression 66 expected from the low flow speeds, which are comparable to errors in the INSAR velocity measurements (a few to 17 m  $a^{-1}$ ; ref. 6). 'Streaming' texture undulates gently 67 68 over longer distances and occurs on ice-stream tributaries/trunks, outlet glaciers and ice shelves, where  $U \ge 20$  m a<sup>-1</sup>. I call the respective regions 'chaos regions' and 69 70 'streaming regions'. Besides these textures, long curvilinear convergent or divergent 71 zones several kilometres wide commonly inhabit tributary/trunk shear margins and ice-72 rise/ridge boundaries, reflecting strong lateral compression or extension where flank 73 flow joins streaming flow. Some convergent zones merge and extend downstream at 74 tributary confluences.

75 The map evidences rich structures in the switch from deformation-dominated 76 slow flow to basal-slip dominated streaming flow, extending earlier inferences (from the velocity field)<sup>6</sup> that non-uniformities pervade ice-sheet flow. Notably, in slower-moving 77 78 areas of streaming regions, where ice flow feeding and within ice-stream tributaries is expected to merge overall as it accelerates<sup>13</sup>, convergence is markedly heterogeneous 79 (e.g. where  $20 \leq U \leq 200$  m a<sup>-1</sup> in Figs 1b–f). Here, sinuous ripples in C of both signs 80 are widespread, often with spacings of O(10) km and axes diagonal or sub-parallel to 81 82 flow; some ripples grade into the fine-scale chaos. The faster flow on ice-stream and 83 outlet-glacier trunks is smoother in texture, but not devoid of ripples.

Comparison of the convergence map with the ice sheet's basal topography from 84 the BEDMAP2 dataset<sup>24</sup> confirms that some ripples—notably neighbouring pairs signed 85 86 oppositely in C-record surface velocity perturbations associated with flow over subglacial peaks or ridges/steps<sup>25</sup> (Fig. 2; ellipses in Figs 1d,f). Ripples occurring far 87 88 from shear margins where the bed appears smooth are likely caused by ice-rheological 89 softening<sup>26</sup> (thus they may indicate failed or developing shear margins) or flow over 90 sticky/slippery spots<sup>25,27</sup>. The latter possibility is supported by ice-flow modelling for Pine Island Glacier and Thwaites Glacier<sup>28</sup>, which infers ribbed domains of high basal 91 92 friction with similar spacing and orientation as ripples (Supplementary Fig. 3). 93 Comparing the convergence in chaos regions with their bed roughness is not 94 undertaken, because it is error-prone and much of the interior is poorly resolved by BEDMAP2<sup>24</sup>. 95

Fundamental properties of Antarctic ice flow are revealed by the tower-shaped plot of speed U against convergence C (Fig. 3a). At each speed, C ranges positive and negative far from the theoretical small divergence for a radially-spreading ice sheet ( $C \approx$ -1/(60U) km<sup>-1</sup> for 3-km thick ice receiving 0.1 m a<sup>-1</sup> accumulation; Methods). This

bifurcation of *C* is a hallmark of flow within tributary networks, which converges in some areas and diverges in others. Except at speeds  $\geq 2,000 \text{ m a}^{-1}$ , where localized flow near ice-shelf edges and cracks causes a minor enhancement in convergence/divergence, the tower flanks indicate monotonic decay of the extreme values of *C* with *U*, and a maximum speed for flow converging/diverging at each rate. Blank regions outside the tower reflect the absence of strongly converging/diverging fast flow.

106 Furthermore, the C-values at each speed are concentrated in a histogram peak much narrower than their range (well within  $\pm 0.2 \text{ km}^{-1}$ ; thus the colours in Figs 1 and 107 108 2b portray most C-values of streaming texture and saturate mainly extreme values of 109 chaos texture), and the convergence and divergence at half-peak height,  $C_+$  and  $C_-$ , decay with U for  $U \leq 2,000 \text{ m a}^{-1}$  (Figs 3c,d). These decays and the tower flanks in Fig. 110 111 3a imply that slow flow can converge and diverge more than fast flow across the 112 grounded portion of the ice sheet. This macroscopic speed dependence of the C-value 113 distribution holds regardless of the convergence in chaos regions and accords with: (1) 114 observed relationships between convergence and velocity patterns (e.g. Fig. 2) and (2) 115 the expectation that basal obstacles and sticky/slippery spots disturb fast flow less 116 (bifurcate C less) than slow flow. However, since this 'tower dependence' holds across 117 different parts of the system (ice-stream trunks, tributaries, feeding zones, margins) and 118 two orders of magnitude in U, it must have a more general mechanical origin than 119 envisioned in (2)—as discussed shortly. The dependence is robust and universal. It is 120 corroborated by increasing smoothness of the  $\theta$ -field with speed (Supplementary Fig. 2) 121 and insensitive to rekriging with the flow-direction variogram of streaming regions 122 (Supplementary Figs 4b-d). Tower-shaped plots are also found for individual drainage 123 basins hosting different ice-stream networks (Fig. 3e). Although a spurious tower 124 dependence could arise from corruption of C in slower-flowing streaming regions by 125 INSAR-velocity errors, error analysis excludes this possibility (Methods; 126 Supplementary Fig. 5). As is consistent with overall capture of ice into tributaries, the 127 *C*-value distribution is asymmetric for  $20 \le U \le 200$  m a<sup>-1</sup> (Figs 3a,c,d); in this range, 128 which encompasses streaming onset and tributary feeding zones, the area of converging 129 flow exceeds that of diverging flow by 12.2%; the mean convergence is +0.012 km<sup>-1</sup>.

130 The tower dependence teaches us about the dynamics as well as latent geometry 131 of tributarized flow. Since C is flow-orthonormal compressive strain rate over U, the 132 ubiquitous tower shape may be due primarily to this 1/U-normalization (which enables 133 conversion between geometry and deformation), modulated by flow-orthonormal strain 134 rates. This interpretation is valid because the strain-rate distribution is weakly speeddependent for  $U \leq 2,000$  m a<sup>-1</sup> (Fig. 3b): at such speeds, the decay curves in Fig. 3c 135 follow  $U \propto |C_{\pm}|^{-1.4}$  approximately, so strain rates have the half-peak range  $U|C_{\pm}| \propto$ 136  $U^{0.29}$ . (The diffused tower flanks are harder to trace for curve fitting.) While these power 137 laws indicate deviation of the tower dependence from  $U \propto |C_{\pm}|^{-1}$  expected from the 138 139 normalization, the critical discovery here is that the dependence occurs because flow-140 orthonormal strain rates at vastly different speeds have similar distributional widths, with half-peak range  $\sim 10^{-2} a^{-1}$  (Fig. 3b). This behaviour points to concerted mechanical 141 142 regulation of the tributarized flow.

Deciphering the mechanisms behind the regulation is important for understanding the ice-stream networks because it underlies an entire hierarchy of tributarization structures. Indeed, any successful theory of the networks must explain the observed speed dependence of the distribution of C, or equivalently, of strain rate (as summarized by the power laws), which is a signature of their dynamical complexity. The mechanisms presumably involve ice rheology because non-zero C implies

149 deformation; strain rates may be limited by internal feedbacks on ice viscosity, e.g. via its temperature and strain-rate controls or anisotropy, as occur at shear margins<sup>15,21</sup>. But 150 151 local rheological descriptions (based on Glen's law) seem unable to predict the 152 dependence directly, because they relate stress to strain rates (velocity gradients), not 153 speed. The mechanisms must also involve the spatial connectedness of flow in the 154 networks, because regulation acts on the surface strain-rate tensor resolved in a flow-155 related direction. Glaciological theories have yet to address such non-local aspect of ice 156 streaming. The concept of flow routing in directions governed by surface slope in a mass-conserving manner, as used to compute 'balance velocities'<sup>29,1</sup> for the ice sheet 157 158 (velocities that keep its surface at steady state, given an accumulation-rate pattern), 159 offers a tantalizing clue to the mechanisms, because the plot of balance speeds against 160 convergence found from such routing forms a diffused tower, even though its details are 161 incorrect (Supplementary Fig. 6). Pinpointing the mechanisms will require deeper 162 theoretical analysis of three-dimensional ice flow with the convergence data. State-ofthe-art simulations<sup>16-19</sup> can aid this enquiry, but it is important to scrutinize how valid 163 164 are their parameterizations of basal processes for predicting migrating and branching ice 165 streams.

Future research should go beyond tuned numerical simulations to strive for holistic understanding of ice-stream systems, by exploiting tools for studying spatial networks (e.g. ref. 30) and measures beside convergence. Immediate extensions include mapping flow convergence for the Greenland Ice Sheet and smaller ice masses, resolving chaos regions with accurate velocity measurements, and tracking how convergence varies with time.

172

#### 174 **References**

- Bamber, J. L., Vaughan, D. G. & Joughin, I. Widespread complex flow in the interior
   of the Antarctic Ice Sheet. *Science* 287, 1248–1250 (2000).
- 177 2. Alley, R. B. & Bindschadler, R. A. in The West Antarctic Ice Sheet: Behavior and
- 178 Environment (eds Alley, R. B. & Bindschadler, R. A.) Antarctic Research Series
- 179 77, 1–11 (American Geophysical Union, Washington DC, 2001).
- 3. Bennett, M. R. Ice streams as the arteries of an ice sheet: their mechanics, stability
  and significance. *Earth-Sci. Rev.* 61, 309–339 (2003).
- 182 4. Hulbe, C. & Fahnestock, M. Century-scale discharge stagnation and reactivation of
- 183 the Ross ice streams, West Antarctica. J. Geophys. Res. 112, F03S27 (2007).
- 184 5. Joughin, I. & Alley, R. B. Stability of the West Antarctic ice sheet in a warming
  185 world. *Nature Geosci.* 4, 506–513 (2011).
- 186 6. Rignot, E., Mouginot, J. & Scheuchl, B. Ice flow of the Antarctic Ice Sheet. *Science*187 **333**, 1427–1430 (2011).
- 188 7. Glasser, N. F. & Gudmundsson, G. H. Longitudinal surface stuctures (flowstripes) on
- 189 Antarctic glaciers. *Cryosphere* **6**, 383–391, doi:10.5194/tc-6-383-2012 (2012).
- 190 8. Stokes, C. R. & Clark, C. D. Palaeo-ice streams. *Quat. Sci. Rev.* 20, 1437–1457
  191 (2001).
- 192 9. King, E. C., Woodward, J. & Smith, A. M. Seismic and radar observations of
- 193 subglacial bed forms beneath the onset zone of Rutford Ice Stream, Antarctica. J.
- 194 *Glaciol.* **53**, 665–672 (2007).
- 10. Alley, R. B., Blankenship, D. D., Bentley, C. R. & Rooney, S. T. Deformation of till
- beneath ice stream B, West Antarctica. *Nature* **322**, 57–59 (1986).

- 197 11. Anandakrishnan, S., Blankenship, D. D., Alley, R. B. & Stoffa, P. L. Influence of
  198 subglacial geology on the position of a West Antarctic ice stream from seismic
- 199 observations. *Nature* **394**, 62–65 (1998).
- 200 12. Raymond, C. F., Catania, G. A., Nereson, N. & Van der Veen, C. J. Bed radar
- reflectivity across the north margin of Whillans Ice Stream, West Antarctica, and
   implications for margin processes. J. Glaciol. 52, 3–10 (2006).
- 13. Ng, F. & Conway, H. Fast-flow signature in the stagnated Kamb Ice Stream, West
  Antarctica. *Geology* 32, 481–484 (2004).
- 205 14. Kamb, B. in *The West Antarctic Ice Sheet: Behavior and Environment* (eds Alley, R.
- B. & Bindschadler, R. A.) Antarctic Research Series 77, 157–199 (American
  Geophysical Union, Washington DC, 2001).
- 208 15. Raymond, C. F. Energy balance of ice streams. J. Glaciol. 46, 665–674 (2000).
- 209 16. Sayag, R. & Tziperman, E. Interaction and variability of ice streams under a triple-
- valued sliding law and non-Newtonian rheology. J. Geophys. Res. 116, F01009
  (2011).
- 17. Kyrke-Smith, T. M., Katz, R. F. & Fowler, A. C. Subglacial hydrology and the
  formation of ice streams. *Proc. R. Soc.* A470, 20130494 (2013).
- 214 18. Kleiner, T. & Humbert, A. Numerical simulations of major ice streams in western
- Dronning Maud Land, Antarctica, under wet and dry basal conditions. J. Glaciol.
  60, 215–232 (2014).
- 217 19. Joughin, I., Smith, B. E. & Medley, B. Marine ice sheet collapse potentially under
  218 way for the Thwaites Glacier Basin, West Antarctica. *Science* 344, 735–738
  219 (2014).

- 220 20. Robel, A. A., DeGiuli, E., Schoof, C. & Tziperman, E. Dynamics of ice stream
- temporal variability: Modes, scales, and hysteresis. J. Geophys. Res. F118,
  925–936 (2013).
- 223 21. Schoof, C. Thermally driven migration of ice-stream shear margins. *J. Fluid Mech.*224 712, 552–578 (2012).
- 22. Bingham, R. G. *et al.* Inland thinning of West Antarctic Ice Sheet steered along
  subglacial rifts. *Nature* 487, 468–471 (2012).
- 227 23. Nye, J. F. A topological approach to the strain-rate pattern of ice sheets. J. Glaciol.
- **39**, 10–14 (1993).
- 229 24. Fretwell, P. *et al.* BEDMAP2: improved ice bed, surface, and thickness datasets for
  230 Antarctica. *Cryosphere* 7, 375–393, doi:10.5194/tc-7-375-2013 (2013).
- 231 25. Gudmundsson, G. H. Transmission of basal variability to a glacier surface. J.
  232 *Geophys. Res.* 108(B5), 2253 (2003).
- 233 26. Hulbe, C. L. and Whillans, I. M. Weak bands within Ice Stream B, West Antarctica.
- 234 J. Glaciol. **43**, 377–386 (1997).
- 235 27. Stokes, C. R., Clark, C. D., Lian, O. B. & Tulaczyk, S. Ice stream sticky spots: A
- review of their identification and influence beneath contemporary and palaeo-ice
- 237 streams. *Earth-Sci. Rev.* **81**, 217–249 (2007).
- 238 28. Sergienko, O. V. & Hindmarsh, R. C. A. Regular patterns in frictional resistance of
  239 ice-stream beds seen by surface data inversion. *Science* 342, 1086–1089 (2013).
- 240 29. Budd, W. F. & Warner, R. C. A computer scheme for rapid calculations of balance-
- 241 flux distributions. Ann. Glaciol. 23, 21–27 (1996).
- 242 30. Dodds, P. S. & Rothman, D. H. Scaling, universality and geomorphology. Annu.
- 243 *Rev. Earth Planet. Sci.* **28**, 571–610 (2000).
- 244

245	
745	
<b>4</b> 7 <i>J</i>	

247	Correspondence and	l requests for materials	should be addressed to F.S.L.N.
-----	--------------------	--------------------------	---------------------------------

- Acknowledgements: I thank H. Conway, D.R. MacAyeal and D.J. Jerolmack for their
- comments on the manuscript and J.L. Bamber for providing balance-velocity data.

Author contributions: F.S.L.N. designed the study, computed and analyzed the convergence map, and wrote the paper.

Additional information: Methods and Supplementary Information are available in the 

- online version of the paper. Reprints and permissions information is available online at
- www.nature.com/reprints.
- Competing financial interests: The author declares no competing financial interests.

270 Figure 1. Ice-flow convergence across Antarctica. Grid resolution is 450 m. a, Full 271 map, with drainage basins (i-xviii) and divides. At this scale, streaming texture looks 272 bright, and the intricate chaos texture dark. Colour scale applies to all panels and is 273 optimal for rendering features within streaming texture. **b-f**, Sub-areas sampling the 274 interior, ice-stream networks and ice shelves. Ice-stream/glacier names and speed contours at 20 m  $a^{-1}$  (thin) and 200 m  $a^{-1}$  (thick curve) are given. Dashed ellipses mark 275 convergence ripples associated with bumps/steps in BEDMAP2 topography<sup>24</sup>; these 276 277 often pair together to show divergence followed by convergence along flow.

278

Figure 2. Convergence pattern in an area of Bindschadler Ice Stream overlying bumpy bed. See Fig. 1f for location. **a**, BEDMAP2 bed topography<sup>24</sup>, surface velocity vectors<sup>6</sup> and speed contours at 20 m a<sup>-1</sup> and 200 m a<sup>-1</sup>. **b**, Kriged convergence and unit vectors of kriged flow direction. Prominent convergence ripples descending across the plot's central part are caused by subglacial peaks at (-648,-690) and (-659,-667). The plot's top and central parts respectively illustrate chaos and streaming convergence textures.

286

Figure 3. Convergence, speed, and cross-flow strain rate distributions. a, U versus C. b, U versus UC (points, lower scale) and versus half-peak strain rates  $UC_+$  and  $UC_-$ (curves, upper scale). See d for definitions of  $C_+$  and  $C_-$ . c, Half-peak convergence  $C_+$ and  $C_-$  of histograms of C at different speeds;  $C_-$  reflected into C > 0 (dashed curve) highlights excess  $C_+$  at intermediate speeds. d, Unit-area histogram of C at U = 100 m  $a^{-1}$ . As at other speeds, the distribution is non-Gaussian and resembles the Laplace distribution. e, U versus C for individual drainage basins in Fig. 1a.

#### 294 Methods

#### 295 **Definition of convergence** *C***.**

Ice-flow convergence (or divergence) is mentioned but rarely quantified in glaciology. My definition  $C = \partial \theta / \partial n = \mathbf{n} \cdot \nabla \theta$  is purely geometrical (Supplementary Fig. 1a) and involves no forces nor conservation laws. Equivalently, *C* measures the local curvature of curves orthonormal to flow lines, with its sign positive when the curves are concave towards flow (Supplementary Fig. 1c). The curvature of flow lines is independent of *C* and does not quantify flow merging/splitting (as said in the text), but may be studied in future work for additional geometric properties of tributarized ice flow.

By considering how fast an ice element shortens laterally as it moves down flow at speed *U*, *C* can be linked to the cross-flow compressive strain rate (Supplementary Fig. 1b). Define a local coordinate system (x, y) centred at point P and the local velocity field as (u, v), with *x* and *u* oriented along flow, and *y* and *v* across, such that (u, v) = (U,0) at P, then  $C = -(\partial v / \partial v) / U$  there.

For a hypothetical circular ice sheet of constant thickness *h* spreading radially at steady state, receiving constant accumulation rate *a* and losing mass by calving only, geometry gives C = -1/r and mass conservation gives U = ar/2h at radius *r*. Eliminating *r* yields C = -a/2hU, as used in the text.

312 An estimate of *C* in a vortex above a drain hole of diameter *D* is, assuming 313 cylindrical symmetry for the flow, 2/D (=  $5 \times 10^4$  km<sup>-1</sup> if *D* = 4 cm).

314

#### 315 Estimating C from surface velocity.

316 INSAR measurements of Antarctic ice-surface velocity **v** on a 450-m polar 317 stereographic projection (*X*-*Y*) grid<sup>6,31</sup> with secant plane at 71°S were converted to  $\theta$  318 measuring clockwise from the Y-axis on the same grid. All of my results pertain to the 319 collection period of these measurements: 1996 to 2011. The projection is conformal. 320 The  $\theta$ -field inherits noise (measurement errors, artefacts), irregular boundaries (e.g. ice-321 sheet margin) and data voids from v. Convergence C is a gradient estimate of this field. To estimate C, I used kriging interpolation<sup>32,33</sup> because this geostatistical approach can 322 323 handle irregular-spaced input data, and, when yielding estimates, it accounts for spatial 324 autocorrelation of the input data (shown by their variogram) and filters and smoothes 325 them accordingly to extract signals. My method is elaborated below. In contrast, simple 326 finite differencing of the  $\theta$ -values would yield estimates of C more strongly dominated 327 by noise, and the choice of any subsequent spatial filtering to smooth C would be 328 difficult to justify. One could also find C via the lateral strain rate above, but then 329 kriging is needed several times for estimating (from v) both strain-rate components and 330 flow direction; the latter is needed for resolving the strain-rate components across flow.

As in most kriging practices, first the experimental variogram  $\gamma(h)$  for all  $\theta$ values, where *h* is separation distance, was compiled (Supplementary Fig. 2; filled circles). In calculating semivariance  $\gamma$ , mismatch between flow directions is quantified by the squared norm of the difference between their unit vectors to avoid problems with circular statistics<sup>34,35</sup>.  $\gamma(h)$  shows that flow directions on the ice sheet are well correlated at  $h \leq 4$  km (Supplementary Fig. 2; filled circles); this suggested the kriging range used below.

Next, assuming a fitted variogram model (solid curve, Supplementary Fig. 2) and 6 km as the range, Continuous-Part Kriging  $(CPK)^{33}$  was applied at each grid point to re-estimate  $\theta$  from the input data of  $\theta$  there and in the neighbourhood. For areas without voids, the interpolation uses > 500 neighbouring grid points. The non-zero nugget  $\gamma(0)$  represents uncorrelated noise in  $\theta$  due to measurement errors and sub-gridscale effects. Its use in CPK suppresses noise so that the re-estimated flow direction,  $\theta_{K}(X, Y)$ , is a smoothed version of the  $\theta$ -field and approximates its continuous (signal) part<sup>33</sup>. The fitted variogram model function is designed to be parabolic at h = 0 to make  $\theta_{K}$  continuous and differentiable<sup>33,35</sup>.

The final step computed C at each grid point as the gradient of  $\theta_{\rm K}$  in the 347 348 direction left-perpendicular to  $\theta_{\rm K}$ , by using a method where spatial differentiation is embedded in CPK<sup>36</sup>. The kriging system—the interpolation sum and equations for the 349 350 kriging weights and for the kriging standard derivation—is detailed in ref. 36. The same 351 variogram model and range as before were used. In both CPK steps, flow directions were treated vectorially, with the interpolation sum evaluated as the Fisher sum<sup>35,37</sup> of 352 353 direction cosines. The kriging standard deviation (a statistical error estimate for the 354 Fisher sum) was converted to  $\sigma_{\rm C}$ , the kriging standard deviation for C, by normalizing 355 its size by the sum magnitude. Throughout variogram compilation and kriging, true 356 geodetic distances found by correcting grid distances with the projection scale factor 357 were used.

The grid spacing imposes a theoretical maximum limit on the gradient of  $\theta$  that two neighbouring grid points can resolve, of  $\approx \pi/(450 \text{ m})$  or 6.98 km<sup>-1</sup>. Yet CPK can produce unrealistic values of |C| exceeding this limit because it uses many grid points in optimal estimation. Hence values in the output convergence grid were clipped to within ±6.98 km<sup>-1</sup>. Clipping occurred in chaos regions only.

The flow-speed and convergence data in Supplementary Fig. 6 derive from the Antarctic balance-velocity model of ref. 1 (updated velocities based on newer ice-sheet surface topography<sup>38</sup> after recalculation by J.L. Bamber). Convergence was estimated from flow direction by a kriging procedure like the one above.

#### 368 Error analysis and robustness of the tower dependence.

369  $\theta_{\rm K}(X, Y)$  was validated by checking that the residuals  $\theta_{\rm K} - \theta$  are unbiased and 370 uncorrelated, and  $\sigma_{\theta}^2$  (kriging variance for  $\theta_{\rm K}$ ) adequately accounts for their variance in 371 streaming regions. Typically,  $\sigma_{\theta} \approx 5^{\circ}$  in these regions.

372 In contrast, kriged estimates of C cannot be validated because independent 373 estimates of C based on direct strain-rate measurements rather than based on only 374 velocity measurements are unavailable. Although the kriging standard deviation  $\sigma_{\rm C}$  at 375 each grid point is known, it does not reflect the local variability of the C-field, so it 376 cannot be used to assess how errors in C impact the results in Figure 3 (see further 377 discussion below). Specifically, the kriging standard deviation is a global measure of 378 uncertainty that accounts only for the variogram and the configuration of kriging interpolation grid points (e.g. refs. 32, 33).  $\sigma_{\rm C}$  is near-uniform ( $\approx 0.13$  km<sup>-1</sup>) in 379 380 streaming regions; expectedly, it rises within a few grid spacings of boundaries and data 381 voids and fluctuates strongly in chaos regions, attesting the unreliability of the kriged 382 estimates of C in these areas.

383 As the text describes, in chaos regions, low flow speeds allow measurement 384 errors in v to corrupt  $\theta$  and obscure these regions' true convergence. To demonstrate 385 this effect, I conducted the experiment in Supplementary Fig. 7 where, in an otherwise 386 parallel flow, deliberate error in  $\theta$  was introduced to a grid point, causing a convergence 387 dipole. More errors in the neighbourhood can then produce the random-looking, short-388 scale convergence-divergence pattern in chaos regions. Comparing  $\theta_{\rm K}$  to  $\theta$  in chaos 389 regions confirms that  $\theta_{\rm K}$  has been smoothed to some extent by kriging, but kriging 390 cannot negate such errors to recover convergence reliably. Not surprisingly, weak traces 391 of chaos are visible in some slow parts of streaming regions (Fig. 1); their short length-392 scale precludes their being mistaken as convergence ripples.

393 Whether errors in U and C can upset my inference from Figure 3 of the tower-394 shaped speed dependence of the C-distribution needs consideration. Errors in  $U \leq 17$ 395 m  $a^{-1}$ )<sup>6</sup> are negligible in the large speed range of interest. To derive error estimates for 396 C. I use the knowledge that C-values in streaming regions portray spatially-coherent 397 features on the convergence map. Whether such feature is a convergence ripple, a 398 curvilinear shear-margin zone, or an area of near-parallel or uniformly 399 converging/diverging flow on an ice stream, a key characteristic of it is that C does not vary much across the feature. This idea motivates the calculation of the mean  $\overline{C}$  and 400 401 standard deviation  $\sigma$  of the C-values in separate 'block regions' across the ice sheet;  $\sigma$  is 402 then an error estimate of C for each block. The tower dependence is assured if some blocks with low U have convergence statistics  $(|\overline{C}| \pm \sigma)$  more extreme than the most 403 404 extreme block convergence/divergence estimates found at higher U. The results, in 405 Supplementary Figure 5, confirm these instances and the integrity of the dependence. 406 The block size in this analysis, 25 by 25 grid points, is chosen to be not too large 407 compared to the typical size of the features.

408

#### 409 **Removal of spurious data, and sensitivity to choice of variogram model.**

The raw plot of *U* versus *C* from my kriging calculation showed outliers from the tower (red points, Supplementary Fig. 4a). Examination of these outliers with the input velocity field **v** showed them to be false 'excursions' caused by: (i) isolated grid points—often on the edge of data voids—where **v** (thus also *U*) is anomalous compared to that in adjacent areas, or (ii) positions one or two grid spacings from ice-free areas (e.g. mountains) or data voids where kriging uncertainty ( $\sigma_c$ ) becomes high and *C* is anomalous compared to *C* in adjacent areas. Fig. 3a is the processed plot after results from these places and from all grid points within two grid spacings of boundaries andvoids have been excluded. The same processing preceded the making of Figs 3b–e.

419 Finally, my kriging procedure can be criticized for assuming a best-fit variogram 420 model for the whole ice sheet (including chaos regions), when ultimately, the C-values 421 in chaos regions are deemed unusable and excluded from analysis. To show that the 422 paper's conclusions are not hinged on this assumption. I repeated the kriging to compute 423 C in streaming regions, this time assuming the best-fit variogram model for regions where U > 20 m a<sup>-1</sup> (dashed curve, Supplementary Fig. 2). The resulting convergence 424 425 map looks practically the same as Figure 1 except it is less smoothed and conveys more 426 spatial details/noise, notably in slower areas of streaming regions. This is expected because the new model y, which is an average estimate for the speed range  $U > 20 \text{ m a}^{-1}$ 427 428 <sup>1</sup>, underestimates  $\gamma$  for ice flow at the lower end of this range. Crucially, while rekriging 429 changed all convergence estimates numerically, all essential mapped features (e.g. ripples) discussed in the text remain valid, and remaking of Figs 3a,c,d shows negligible 430 431 change in both the C-distribution and its speed dependence (Supplementary Figs 4b-d).

432

433 Data availability. Gridded data of the Antarctic Ice Sheet's flow convergence and
434 cross-flow strain rate are archived at <u>http://doi.pangaea.de/10.1594/PANGAEA.841137</u>.

435

436 Code availability. The code used to compute the variogram of flow direction and the
437 convergence values is available on request from Felix Ng (f.ng@sheffield.ac.uk).

438

439

440

#### 442 **References for the Methods**

- 443 31. Rignot, E., Mouginot, J. & Scheuchl, B. MEaSUREs InSAR-Based Antarctica Ice
- *Velocity Map.* Boulder, Colorado USA: NASA DAAC at the National Snow and
  Ice Data Center. http://dx.doi.org/10.5067/MEASURES/CRYOSPHERE/nsidc0484.001 (2011).
- 447 32. Isaaks, E. H. & Srivastava, R. M. *Applied Geostatistics* (Oxford Univ. Press, New
  448 York, 1989).
- 449 33. Kitanidis, P. K. Introduction to Geostatistics: Applications in Hydrogeology
  450 (Cambridge Univ. Press, Cambridge, 1997).
- 451 34. Young, D. S. Random vectors and spatial analysis by geostatistics for geotechnical
  452 applications. *Math. Geol.* 19, 467–479 (1987).
- 453 35. Gumiaux, C., Gapais, D. & Brun, J. P. Geostatistics applied to best-fit interpolation
  454 of orientation data. *Tectonophysics* 376, 241–259 (2003).
- 455 36. Philip, R. D. & Kitanidis, P. K. Geostatistical estimation of hydraulic head
  456 gradients. *Ground Water* 27, 855–865 (1989).
- 457 37. Fisher, N. I. *Statistical Analysis of Circular Data* (Cambridge Univ. Press,
  458 Cambridge, 1993).
- 459 38. Bamber, J. L., Gomez-Dans, J. L. & Griggs, J. A. A new 1 km digital elevation
  460 model of the Antarctic derived from combined satellite radar and laser data Part
- 461 1: Data and methods. *Cryosphere* **3**, 101–111, doi:10.5194/tc-3-101-2009 (2009).



Figure 1



Figure 2



# Figure 3

- 1 Supplementary Information for the paper 'Spatial complexity of ice flow across
- 2 the Antarctic Ice Sheet' by Felix S. L. Ng
- 3
- 4 This file contains Supplementary Figures 1 to 7 and their captions.
- 5
- 6



8 Supplementary Figure 1. Definition of convergence C for planimetric flow fields. a,

9 C as the local rate of change of flow direction  $\theta$  across flow. **b**, Relation between C,

10 flow speed U and lateral strain rate  $-\partial v/\partial y$ . **c**, The signs of C for archetypal flow fields.

11 Dashed lines are curves orthonormal to flow lines.



13 Supplementary Figure 2. Vectorial variogram for ice-flow directions on the 14 Antarctic Ice Sheet. Following ref. 34, empirical variogram data (symbols) for flow in different speed ranges were calculated by  $\gamma(h) = \sum |z(X,Y) - z(X+dX,Y+dY)|^2/(2N(h))$ , 15 where  $\gamma$  is semivariance, z is unit vector representing flow direction  $\theta$ , h is geodetic 16 distance between each pair of positions (X, Y) and (X+dX, Y+dY), and summation is 17 18 done over all non-repeating position pairs (N being their total number) falling in 19 different bins of h. Semivariance decreases with speed at all distances. Steep slope of 20 y(h) near the origin at low speeds indicates spatial non-smoothness of  $\theta$  in chaos 21 regions; its low slope at high speeds indicates smoothness of  $\theta$  in streaming regions. Solid curve is the fitted variogram model for the whole ice sheet:  $\gamma = A_0 + A_1(1 - 1)$ 22  $\exp(-((h^2+A_5^2)^{0.5}-A_5)/A_2)) + A_3(1 - \exp(-((h^2+A_5^2)^{0.5}-A_5)/A_4))$ , with parameters  $A_0 =$ 23 0.07 (nugget),  $A_1 = 0.133$ ,  $A_2 = 0.85$ ,  $A_3 = 0.24$ ,  $A_4 = 28$ ,  $A_5 = 2$ . Dashed curve is the 24 fitted variogram model for regions where U > 20 m a<sup>-1</sup> (thus, streaming regions mostly): 25  $\gamma = A_0 + A_1(1 - \exp(-((h^2 + A_3^2)^{0.5} - A_3)/A_2)))$ , with  $A_0 = 0.002$  (nugget),  $A_1 = 0.188$ ,  $A_2 = 0.188$ 26 27  $33, A_3 = 0.3$ .



Supplementary Figure 3. Flow convergence and basal shear stress on the trunk regions of Pine Island Glacier (a,b) and Thwaites Glacier (c,d). The region on each glacier is near the central part of the area enclosed by the 200 m  $a^{-1}$  contour in Fig. 1b. **a,c,** Modelled basal shear stress. Both panels are reproduced from ref. 28 with permission from AAAS. **b,d,** Convergence *C* from the present study. Basal shear stress

and *C* describe different aspects of the ice motion so their patterns are expected to
differ, but some correlation between them is notable. In c and d, many convergence
ripples and 'rib areas' of high stress (red) have similar positions, spacing and
orientation. In a and b, this is exemplified by the cross-like features near (-1590,-240).
Also, for both glaciers, areas exhibiting high-amplitude spatial variations in *C* tend to
have more ribs.









51

Supplementary Figure 5. Binned analysis of convergence and its errors for 52 contiguous block regions across the ice sheet. A block, measuring 25 grid points on a 53 54 side, is sampled if it has  $\leq 10\%$  void pixels and its speed range falls entirely within a speed bin.  $\overline{C}$  denotes the mean of C-values in the block, and  $\sigma$  their standard deviation. 55 56 In the figure, each bin gathers blocks with similar speeds U; grey bar indicates the range of  $\overline{C}$ ; white box indicates the expanded range from minimum  $\overline{C} - \sigma$  to maximum  $\overline{C} + \sigma$ . 57 Two sets of 'dot and whiskers' plot  $\overline{C}$  and  $\overline{C} \pm \sigma$  of the sample whose  $\overline{C} + \sigma$  is the least 58 (blue), and of the sample whose  $\overline{C} - \sigma$  is the greatest (red). That such samples in some 59 lower-speed bins lie outside the expanded range of some higher-speed bins confirms 60 61 that kriging uncertainty in C cannot nullify its 'tower dependence' on U.





63

64 Supplementary Figure 6. Ice-flow convergence and speed from the ice sheet's 65 balance-velocity field computed by ref. 1. a, Scatter plot of U versus C, showing a 66 tower shape less well defined than the one in Fig. 3a. b, The same scatter plot in log-10 67 speed scale, revealing a deficiency of convergent flow at speeds  $\leq 10^3$  m a<sup>-1</sup>. c, Half-68 peak convergence  $C_+$  and  $C_-$  of histograms of C at different speeds. d, Unit-area 69 histogram of C at U = 100 m a<sup>-1</sup>.



71 Supplementary Figure 7. Dipole convergence pattern in a kriging experiment.
72 Error in flow direction is imposed at one grid point of an otherwise parallel flow field to
73 simulate how errors in INSAR-measured velocity can cause the convergence pattern in
74 chaos regions. Arrows signify unit vectors of input flow-direction data. The colour scale
75 for convergence is the same as in Fig. 1.