

This is a repository copy of *Origination of the modern-style diversity gradient* 15 *million years ago.* 

White Rose Research Online URL for this paper: <u>https://eprints.whiterose.ac.uk/196724/</u>

Version: Accepted Version

### Article:

Fenton, IS, Aze, T orcid.org/0000-0002-4201-7105, Farnsworth, A et al. (2 more authors) (2023) Origination of the modern-style diversity gradient 15 million years ago. Nature, 614 (7949). pp. 708-712. ISSN 0028-0836

https://doi.org/10.1038/s41586-023-05712-6

© The Author(s), under exclusive licence to Springer Nature Limited 2023. This is an author produced version of an article published in Nature. Uploaded in accordance with the publisher's self-archiving policy.

#### Reuse

Items deposited in White Rose Research Online are protected by copyright, with all rights reserved unless indicated otherwise. They may be downloaded and/or printed for private study, or other acts as permitted by national copyright laws. The publisher or other rights holders may allow further reproduction and re-use of the full text version. This is indicated by the licence information on the White Rose Research Online record for the item.

#### Takedown

If you consider content in White Rose Research Online to be in breach of UK law, please notify us by emailing eprints@whiterose.ac.uk including the URL of the record and the reason for the withdrawal request.



eprints@whiterose.ac.uk https://eprints.whiterose.ac.uk/

### 1 Origination of the modern-style diversity gradient 15 million years ago

- 2 Isabel Fenton<sup>1</sup>, Tracy Aze<sup>2</sup>, Alexander Farnsworth<sup>3</sup>, Paul Valdes<sup>3</sup>, Erin E. Saupe<sup>\*1</sup>
- <sup>1</sup>Department of Earth Sciences, University of Oxford; 3 S Parks Road, Oxford, OX1
   3AN, UK
- <sup>2</sup>School of Earth and Environment, University of Leeds; Leeds, LS2 9JT, UK
- <sup>3</sup>School of Geographical Sciences, University of Bristol; University Road Bristol BS8
   1SS, UK
- 8 \*Corresponding author. Email: erin.saupe@earth.ox.ac.uk
- 9
- 10

### 11 Abstract

12 The latitudinal diversity gradient (LDG) is a prevalent feature of modern ecosystems across diverse clades<sup>1-4</sup>. Recognized for well over a century, the causal mechanisms for LDGs 13 remain disputed, in part because numerous putative drivers simultaneously covary with 14 latitude<sup>1,3,5</sup>. The past provides the opportunity to disentangle LDG mechanisms, because the 15 relationships among biodiversity, latitude, and possible causal factors have varied over time<sup>6-</sup> 16 17 <sup>9</sup>. We quantify the emergence of the LDG in planktonic foraminifera at high spatio-temporal 18 resolution over the last 40 million years, finding a modern-style gradient arose only 15 19 million years ago. Spatial and temporal models suggest LDGs for planktonic foraminifera 20 may be controlled by the physical structure of the water column. Steepening of the latitudinal 21 temperature gradient over the last 15 Ma, associated with increased vertical temperature 22 structure at low latitudes, may have enhanced niche partitioning and provided more 23 opportunities for speciation equatorially. Supporting this hypothesis, we find higher rates of 24 low latitude speciation steepened the diversity gradient, consistent with spatio-temporal 25 patterns of depth partitioning by planktonic foraminifera. Extirpation of species from high 26 latitudes also strengthened the LDG, but this effect tended to be weaker compared to 27 speciation. Our results provide a step change in understanding the evolution of marine LDGs 28 on long time scales.

- 29
- 30

31 The spatial structure of Earth's biodiversity has the potential to provide important insight on

32 evolutionary drivers. Today, species richness peaks at low latitudes in both marine<sup>10-12</sup> and

terrestrial<sup>1,4</sup> systems across diverse taxonomic groups, referred to as the 'latitudinal diversity

34 gradient' (LDG). Although first documented over 200 years ago, the causal mechanisms

responsible for elevated low-latitude richness are still disputed 1,3,4,13.

36 LDGs derive from differential rates of speciation, extinction, local extirpation, and

dispersal<sup>14,15</sup>, which themselves may be controlled by the dynamics of climate<sup>14,16-19</sup>, biotic

interactions<sup>20-23</sup>, energy/primary production<sup>24,25</sup>, or available surface area<sup>26</sup>. Identifying which

39 of these factors are key controls on rates of speciation, extinction, extirpation, and dispersal is

40 difficult, because most are collinear with each other today<sup>5</sup>. However, the relationship

41 between latitude and these hypothesized drivers has not been constant over Earth history, and

42 thus intervals of the geological past can provide insight on how biodiversity is generated and

43 maintained<sup>6,7,9</sup>.

44 In marine systems, previous work has suggested that diversity gradients were present for tens

45 of millions of years but varied in strength and shape<sup>4,6-9</sup>. However, limited fossil data has

46 prevented detailed examination of the emergence of modern-day LDGs for more than short

temporal intervals <sup>27-29</sup> or coarse spatio-temporal resolutions<sup>7,9,30</sup>, leaving key knowledge
 gaps<sup>31</sup>.

49 Here we utilize our recent compilation of planktonic foraminifera<sup>32</sup>, a group of

50 biomineralizing marine plankton, to study the establishment and maintenance of the modern-

51 style LDG at a previously unachieved spatio-temporal resolution. By examining spatial

52 diversity patterns across 40 million years, we provide fundamental insight on the co-

evolution of the biosphere and geosphere and test key hypotheses on LDG drivers  $^{12,33,34}$ .

54 We quantified temporal patterns in LDGs using 464,963 unique species-by-locality-by-time

records (Fig. 1A; Fig. S1-4). Records older than 40 Ma were excluded due to poor-quality

56 low-latitude data for earlier time intervals. LDGs were constructed using five subsampling

57 approaches that accounted for sampling biases (SI Methods, Fig. S5), all of which reveal

significant changes in the spatial distribution of species over the last 40 Ma (Fig. 1B,C; Figs. S(-10)). A modern style LDC because the among an dwelly beginning - 24 million upon age

S6-10). A modern-style LDG began to emerge gradually beginning ~34 million years ago,
coincident with the transition from warmhouse to coolhouse conditions, but remained shallow

61 until around  $\sim 15-10$  million years ago, contemporaneous with an increase in global cooling<sup>35</sup>.

62 Gradient (i.e., slope) estimates for richness steepened from virtually no gradient at 40 Ma

63 (Fig. 1C) and were insensitive to methodological choice (Figs. S11-24, Table S1). This

pattern supports previous suggestions that shallower diversity gradients occur during warmer,
 greenhouse intervals<sup>7,8,27</sup>

65 greenhouse intervals<sup>7,8,27</sup>.

66 Modern-day diversity for planktonic foraminifera is richest at mid-latitudes, with a slight 67 demonstrate  $\frac{28}{28}$  We fit linear and  $\frac{200}{20}$  order relevant of the scale of our 16

67 depression at the equator<sup>16,28</sup>. We fit linear and  $2^{nd}$  order polynomial models to each of our 16

LDGs to test whether they are better characterized as unimodal or bimodal; data for theNorthern and Southern Hemispheres were modelled together and individually (see SI

'Estimating LDG Gradients'). For all time periods other than the most recent (0–2.5 Ma), a

Providential for the periods other than the most recent (0-2.5 Ma), a
 linear model produced a better fit (Table S2). Peak richness for planktonic foraminifera

72 occurred at higher latitudes from 40–20 Ma, but with generally flatter gradients, after which

72 becauted at higher latitudes from 40-20 wild, but with generary flatter gradients, after when 73 peak richness shifted to  $\sim 10^{\circ}$  to  $20^{\circ}$  latitude, consistent with the diversity pattern observed

74 today<sup>16,28</sup> (Fig. 1B).

75 To identify potential drivers of LDG changes over the last 40 Ma, we investigated the

relationship between richness and climate both spatially within time bins and temporally

across time bins. In the first approach, we modelled richness as a function of mean annual sea

79 annual sea surface temperature (SST) using spatial autoregressive models within each of the 80 2.5 Ma time bins (Fig. S25-27). After correcting for multiple comparisons, only SST 81 exhibited a consistent and strong positive relationship with richness over time (Fig. 2). This 82 relationship persisted for at least the last 15 million years, and perhaps longer, but with 83 confidence intervals that overlap zero. Results are insensitive to permutations of the data 84 (Figs. S28-32). The temperature range of the thermocline is highly correlated with SST (Fig. 85 S26) and therefore could not be included in the multivariate model. When thermocline 86 temperature range was modelled separately, however, the strength of relationship was similar 87 to that of SST (Fig. S33). No other variables exhibited such a relationship (Fig. S33). 88 Richness was not linked to surface ocean area when species richness was modelled as a 89 function of area within 15° latitudinal bins (Fig. S34). 90 In the second model approach, we investigated the relationship between change in richness 91

surface salinity, mean annual mixed layer depth, mean annual thermocline extent, and mean

78

and change in climate variables at given locations on Earth. Change was examined over 2.5,
5, 7.5., 10, and 12.5 million-year intervals of time (Fig. S35 & S36). SST change was the
only significant predictor of change in richness across these five models, and results were
robust to permutations of the data (Table S3). No relationship was found when thermocline
temperature range was modelled separately (Table S4), but this could reflect the greater
uncertainty in estimating temperatures at depth with paleoclimate models, especially in deep
time.

- These results and previous work<sup>16,36,37</sup> suggest species richness for planktonic foraminifera 98 could be explained, at least in part, by steepening of the latitudinal temperature gradient and 99 associated increase in vertical temperature structure at low latitudes<sup>35,38</sup> over the last 15 Ma, 100 101 the latter of which may have enhanced niche-partitioning-mediated speciation in the tropics<sup>39,40</sup>. To further test this hypothesis, we examined the degree to which species of 102 103 planktonic foraminifera partition by depth within the water column over time and space. We 104 found that low-latitude assemblages of species today are more evenly distributed vertically 105 within the water column across the mixed layer, thermocline, and sub-thermocline than are 106 assemblages at high latitudes (Fig. 3). However, assemblages exhibited greater evenness of
- depth habitats (mixed layer, thermocline, and sub-thermocline) across latitudes when the
   gradient was shallower millions of years ago. This pattern implies that warmer waters at high
   latitudes supported a broader range of vertical temperature habitats within the water column
- from 40-15 Ma, and that these assemblages collapsed as the high latitudes cooled.

111 If changes to the vertical structure of the water column facilitated the formation of a modern-

style LDG, we would expect higher rates of speciation at low latitudes coincident with the

- steepening of the diversity gradient, and higher rates of either extirpation and/or extinction at
- high latitudes. We quantified differential rates of speciation, extinction, extirpation, and
- dispersal in low *versus* high latitudes, defined as within or exclusive of  $30^{\circ}$  latitude.

116 Low-latitude speciation began to exceed high latitude speciation after 30 Ma, suggesting the

- 117 modern-style LDG is possibly driven by higher rates of low-latitude origination (Fig. 4; Fig. S27, 42). There are the set of the
- 118 S37-43). These results are consistent with previous findings of higher speciation rates at low 119 latitudes for planktonic foraminifera<sup>15,41,42</sup>. In addition to low-latitude speciation, local
- extirpation at high latitudes also contributed to a modern LDG, but tended to have a smaller
- 121 effect size (Fig. 4; Figs. S37-S38, S40-43). In previous work, Yasuhara et al.<sup>29</sup> found that the
- redistribution of species' ranges, and not speciation, was important to LDG formation, but
- this was likely due to the short timescale of their study (i.e., last 3 Myrs).
- Steepening of the diversity gradient was not driven by extinction, because extinction was
  higher at low latitudes beginning ~20 Ma (Fig. 4; Figs. S37-S38, S40-43). This heightened

extinction dampened the effect of higher speciation in the tropics, but speciation still tended
to outpace extinction, adding to richness. Similarly, dispersal from high to low latitudes did
not contribute to the emergence of a modern-day LDG, as dispersal dynamics were reversed
(i.e., occurred predominantly from low to high latitudes) from at least the last 10 Ma (Fig. 4;
Figs. S37-S38, S40-43). Dispersal was usually rapid, with a mean wait time after speciation
of 1.7 Ma (+/- 2 Ma).

132 The relationship of temperature with richness was dampened for time periods older than 15

133 Ma. This weakened relationship may reflect climate model inaccuracies that inflate with time,

134 or the fact that richness and temperature do not vary significantly with latitude. In the latter

scenario of limited temperature variation, sensitivity analyses suggest no relationship would

be found between richness and temperature (Fig. S29). Scarcer data in deep time may also

make a relationship with temperature more difficult to obtain (Fig. S30), but LDGs

constructed with minimal data still return modern-style LDGs towards the present (Fig. S31).

Excluding sites potentially subject to dissolution only served to strengthen patterns (Fig. S32).

141 We were not able to test the relationship of richness with zooplankton biomass<sup>43</sup> or nutrient

142 availability<sup>44</sup>, because high-resolution spatial and temporal data for these variables at global

scale do not exist for the last 40 Ma. However, the regions with highest foraminiferal

richness, the nutrient-poor subtropical gyres<sup>45</sup>, are characterised by lowest population
densities of planktonic foraminifera<sup>46</sup>. The subtropical gyres have been incredibly stable over
10's of millions of years<sup>47</sup>, and may have accumulated their high diversity due to both niche
partitioning and reduced extirpation and extinction. It is possible that competition with

diatoms or other groups, especially when interacting with seasonal food availability at high
 latitudes, also structure the LDG for planktonic foraminifera, but seasonality was found to

150 correlate with SST and thermocline temperature range in many time bins and was therefore151 not included as a predictor in our models (Fig. S27).

Taken together, our results suggest the modern-day LDG for planktonic foraminifera is 152 153 controlled, at least in part, by high-latitude cooling that brought colder bottom waters to the 154 tropics, increasing both latitudinal temperature gradients and vertical temperature gradients at 155 low latitudes. The increased vertical temperature structure within the water column at low 156 latitudes may have enhanced niche partitioning, providing more opportunity for speciation over the last 30–15 Ma<sup>16,36,37</sup>. The cooler high-latitude water also served to extirpate regional 157 158 populations of species. Consistent with our hypothesis, the tropics today are richer than the 159 tropics of the Eocene and Miocene, potentially due to a stronger vertical temperature 160 structure that was weak-to-absent during these warmer time periods. Extreme warmth during 161 the Eocene may have also exceeded species' temperature tolerances equatorially, further 162 depressing diversity, an effect that may occur more in the future as the tropics continue to 163 warm<sup>33,48</sup>. Global diversity for planktonic foraminifera in the Eocene, however, was similar 164 to planktonic foraminiferal diversity today, since species were distributed more evenly across 165 latitudes 40 million years ago (Fig. 3).

166 Our analyses suggest a role for water column structure in facilitating niche partitioning and

167 therefore the emergence of the LDG in planktonic foraminifera. Other potential mechanisms

that may have elevated low-latitude diversity include the total amount of suitable area

169 vertically within the water column<sup>26</sup>, metabolic scaling<sup>42,49</sup>, or changes to the biological

170 carbon pump that redistributed nutrients at depth and opened new niches as climate cooled

171 over the last 15 Ma<sup>50,51</sup>. This latter mechanism of nutrient redistribution complements the

172 vertical temperature-driven niche separation proposed here.

- 173 To conclude, the establishment of the modern LDG is consistent with a cooling climate that
- allowed for elevated speciation via niche partition at low latitudes, whilst restructuring
- distributions and removing niches at high latitudes. By resolving how spatial patterns of
- biodiversity have varied through deep time, we provide valuable information on hypothesised
- 177 causes crucial for understanding how biodiversity is generated and maintained over
- 178 geological timescales, beyond the scope of modern-day ecological studies.
- 179

#### 180 **References**

- 181
- 182 1 Fine, P. V. Ecological and evolutionary drivers of geographic variation in species diversity. Annu. Rev. Ecol. Evol. Syst. 46, 369-392 (2015). 183 184 2 Hillebrand, H. On the generality of the latitudinal diversity gradient. The American 185 Naturalist 163, 192-211 (2004). 186 3 Mittelbach, G. G. et al. Evolution and the latitudinal diversity gradient: speciation, 187 extinction and biogeography. Ecology Letters 10, 315-331 (2007). 188 4 Willig, M. R., Kaufman, D. M. & Stevens, R. D. Latitudinal gradients of biodiversity: 189 pattern, process, scale, and synthesis. Annu. Rev. Ecol. Evol. Syst. 34, 273-309 (2003). 190 5 Pontarp, M. et al. The Latitudinal Diversity Gradient: Novel Understanding through 191 Mechanistic Eco-evolutionary Models. Trends in Ecology & Evolution 34, 211-223, 192 doi:https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tree.2018.11.009 (2019). 193 6 Crame, J. A. Taxonomic diversity gradients through geological time. Divers Distrib 7, 194 175-189 (2011). 195 7 Mannion, P. D., Upchurch, P., Benson, R. B. J. & Goswami, A. The latitudinal 196 biodiversity gradient through deep time. Trends in Ecology & Evolution 29, 42-50 197 (2014).8 Powell, M. G. Latitudinal diversity gradients for brachiopod genera during late 198 199 Palaeozoic time: links between climate, biogeography and evolutionary rates. Glob 200 Ecol Biogeogr 16, 519-528 (2007). 9 Powell, M. G., Beresford, V. P. & Colaianne, B. A. The latitudinal position of peak 201 202 marine diversity in living and fossil biotas. J Biogeogr 39, 1687-1694 (2012). 203 10 Hillebrand, H. Strength, slope and variability of marine latitudinal gradients. Marine 204 Ecology Progress Series 273, 251-267 (2004). 205 11 Beaugrand, G., Rombouts, I. & Kirby, R. R. Towards an understanding of the pattern of biodiversity in the oceans. Glob Ecol Biogeogr 22, 440-449 (2013). 206 207 12 Tittensor, D. P. et al. Global patterns and predictors of marine biodiversity across 208 taxa. Nature 466, 1098 (2010). 209 13 Pianka, E. R. Latitudinal gradients in species diversity: a review of concepts. Am Nat 210 100, 33-46 (1966). 211 14 Saupe, E. E. et al. Spatio-temporal climate change contributes to latitudinal diversity 212 gradients. Nature Ecology & Evolution 3, 1419-1429 (2019). Stehli, F. G., Douglas, R. G. & Newell, N. D. Generation and maintenance of 213 15 gradients in taxonomic diversity. Science 164, 947-949 (1969). 214 Rutherford, S., D'Hondt, S. & Prell, W. Environmental controls on the geographic 215 16 216 distribution of zooplankton diversity. Nature 4000, 749-752 (1999). Klopfer, P. H. Environmental determinants of faunal diversity. Am Nat 93, 337-342 217 17 218 (1959). 219 18 Haffer, J. & Prance, G. T. Climatic forcing of evolution in Amazonia during the 220 Cenozoic: on the refuge theory of biotic differentiation. Amazoniana 16, 579-607 221 (2001).

222	19	Dynesius, M. & Jansson, R. Evolutionary consequences of changes in species'
223		geographical distributions driven by Milankovitch climate oscillations. Proceedings
224		of the National Academy of Sciences 97, 9115-9120 (2000).
225	20	Dobzhansky, T. Evolution in the tropics. American Scientist 38, 209-221 (1950).
226	21	Williams, C. B. Patterns in the Balance of Nature. (Academic Press, 1964).
227	22	Paine, R. T. Food web complexity and species diversity. Am Nat 100, 65-75 (1966).
228	23	Schemske, D. W., Mittelbach, G. G., Cornell, H. V., Sobel, J. M. & Roy, K. Is there a
229		latitudinal gradient in the importance of biotic interactions? Annu. Rev. Ecol. Evol.
230		Syst. 40, 245-269 (2009).
231	24	Currie, D. J. Energy and large-scale patterns of animal and plant species richness. Am
232		Nat 137, 27-49 (1991).
233	25	Connell, J. H. & Orias, E. The ecological regulation of species diversity. Am Nat 98,
234		399-414 (1964).
235	26	Rosenzweig, M. L. Species Diversity in Space and Time. (Cambridge University
236		Press, 1995).
237	27	Fenton, I. S. et al. The impact of Cenozoic cooling on assemblage diversity in
238		planktonic foraminifera. Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society B:
239		Biological Sciences 371, 20150224, doi:doi:10.1098/rstb.2015.0224 (2016).
240	28	Yasuhara, M. et al. Past and future decline of tropical pelagic biodiversity.
241		Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences 117, 12891-12896,
242		doi:doi:10.1073/pnas.1916923117 (2020).
243	29	Yasuhara, M., Hunt, G., Dowsett, H. J., Robinson, M. M. & Stoll, D. K. Latitudinal
244		species diversity gradient of marine zooplankton for the last three million years.
245		<i>Écology Letters</i> <b>15</b> , 1174-1179 (2012).
246	30	Jablonski, D., Roy, K. & Valentine, J. W. Out of the tropics: evolutionary dynamics
247		of the latitudinal diversity gradient. Science <b>314</b> , 102-106 (2006).
248	31	Yasuhara, M., Tittensor, D. P., Hillebrand, H. & Worm, B. Combining marine
249		macroecology and palaeoecology in understanding biodiversity: microfossils as a
250		model. <i>Biological Reviews</i> <b>92</b> , 199-215, doi: <u>https://doi.org/10.1111/brv.12223</u> (2017).
251	32	Fenton, I. S. et al. Triton, a new species-level database of Cenozoic planktonic
252		foraminiferal occurrences. Scientific Data 8, 160, doi:10.1038/s41597-021-00942-7
253		(2021).
254	33	Yasuhara, M. & Deutsch, C. A. Paleobiology provides glimpses of future ocean.
255		Science 375, 25-26, doi:doi:10.1126/science.abn2384 (2022).
256	34	Yasuhara, M. et al. TIME MACHINE BIOLOGY
257	CROS	S-TIMESCALE INTEGRATION OF ECOLOGY, EVOLUTION, AND
258		OCEANOGRAPHY. Oceanography 33, 16-28 (2020).
259	35	Westerhold, T. et al. An astronomically dated record of Earth's climate and
260		its predictability over the last 66 million years. Science 369, 1383-1387,
261		doi:doi:10.1126/science.aba6853 (2020).
262	36	Al-Sabouni, N., Kucera, M. & Schmidt, D. N. Vertical niche separation control of
263		diversity and size disparity in planktonic foraminifera. Marine Micropaleontology 63,
264		75-90, doi:https://doi.org/10.1016/j.marmicro.2006.11.002 (2007).
265	37	Lowery, C. M., Bown, P. R., Fraass, A. J. & Hull, P. M. Ecological Response of
266		Plankton to Environmental Change: Thresholds for Extinction. Annual Review of
267		Earth and Planetary Sciences 48, 403-429, doi:10.1146/annurev-earth-081619-
268		052818 (2020).
269	38	Lear, C. H., Elderfield, H. & Wilson, P. A. Cenozoic Deep-Sea Temperatures and
270		Global Ice Volumes from Mg/Ca in Benthic Foraminiferal Calcite. Science 287, 269-
271		272, doi:doi:10.1126/science.287.5451.269 (2000).

272	39	Weiner, A., Aurahs, R., Kurasawa, A., Kitazato, H. & Kučera, M. Vertical niche
273		partitioning between cryptic sibling species of a cosmopolitan marine planktonic
274		protist. <i>Molecular Ecology</i> <b>21</b> , 4063-4073 (2012).
275	40	Schneider, E. & Kennett, J. P. Segregation and speciation in the Neogene planktonic
276		foraminiferal clade Globoconella. Paleobiology 25, 383-395 (1999).
277	41	Raja, N. B. & Kiessling, W. Out of the extratropics: the evolution of the latitudinal
278		diversity gradient of Cenozoic marine plankton. Proceedings of the Royal Society B:
279		Biological Sciences 288, 20210545, doi:doi:10.1098/rspb.2021.0545 (2021).
280	42	Allen, A. P. & Gillooly, J. F. Assessing latitudinal gradients in speciation rates and
281		biodiversity at the global scale. <i>Ecology Letters</i> 9, 947-954 (2006).
282	43	Irigoien, X., Huisman, J. & Harris, R. P. Global biodiversity patterns of marine
283		phytoplankton and zooplankton. <i>Nature</i> <b>429</b> , 863-886 (2004).
284	44	Schiebel, R. & Hemleben, C. Planktic Foraminifers in the Modern Ocean. 358
285		(Springer-Verlag, 2017).
286	45	Ruddimann, W. F. Recent planktonic foraminifera: dominance and diversity in North
287		Atlantic surface sediments. Science 164, 1164-1167 (1969).
288	46	Bé, A. W. H. & Tolderlund, D. S. in <i>Micropaleontology of Marine Bottom Sediments</i>
289		(eds B M Funnell & W K Riedel) (Cambridge University Press, 1971).
290	47	Sibert, E., Norris, R., Cuevas, J. & Graves, L. Eighty-five million years of Pacific
291		Ocean gyre ecosystem structure: long-term stability marked by punctuated change.
292		Proceedings of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences 283, 20160189,
293		doi:doi:10.1098/rspb.2016.0189 (2016).
294	48	Chaudhary, C., Richardson, A. J., Schoeman, D. S. & Costello, M. J. Global warming
295		is causing a more pronounced dip in marine species richness around the equator.
296		Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences <b>118</b> , e2015094118,
297		doi:doi:10.1073/pnas.2015094118 (2021).
298	49	Worm, B. & Tittensor, D. P. A Theory of Global Biodiversity. (Princeton University
299		Press, 2018).
300	50	Boscolo-Galazzo, F. et al. Temperature controls carbon cycling and biological
301		evolution in the ocean twilight zone. Science <b>371</b> , 1148-1152,
302		doi:doi:10.1126/science.abb6643 (2021).
303	51	Boscolo-Galazzo, F. et al. Late Neogene evolution of modern deep-dwelling
304		plankton. <i>Biogeosciences</i> <b>19</b> , 743-762, doi:10.5194/bg-19-743-2022 (2022).
305		
306		
307	Ackno	owledgments
308	We the	ank Adam Woodhouse, Gwen Antell, Pincelli Hull, Helen Johnson,
309	Heath	er Bouman, and Wolfgang Kiessling for informative discussions. We thank Moriaki

- 310 Yasuhara and two anonymous referees for constructive feedback that improved this
- 311 contribution. We also thank contributors to the Triton and Neptune Databases, from which
- 312 Triton heavily draws. EES was supported by Leverhulme Trust grant RPG-201170,
- the Leverhulme Prize, and the National Science Research Council grant NE/V011405/1.

#### 314

### 315 Data availability

316	All data to reproduce our analyses are provided in the following DOI:
317	https://doi.org/10.6084/m9.figshare.21355467. The spatio-temporal planktonic
318 319	for a miniferal occurrence data were derived from Triton, an open-source database (Fenton et al. 2021. <i>Scientific Data</i> ): <u>https://www.nature.com/articles/s41597-021-00942-7</u> .

320

321	Code availability		
322	All code to reproduce the analyses herein is provided in the following DOI:		
323	https://doi.org/10.6084/m9.figshare.21355467. Our custom code relied on the following F		
324	packages: HH R package v. 3.1-47, spatialreg R package v.1.2-3, geosphere R package,		
325	vegan R package v.2.5-7, and mapast R package v.0.1.		
326			
327			
328	Author contributions		
329	Conceptualization: EES		
330	Methodology: EES, IF		
331	Investigation: IF, EES, AF, PV		
332	Visualization: TA, IF, EES		
333	Funding acquisition: EES		
334	Project administration: EES		
335	Supervision: EES		
336	Writing – original draft: EES		
337	Writing – review & editing: EES, IF, TA, AF, PV		
338			
339	Competing interests		
340	The authors declare that they have no competing interests.		

341

### 342 Figure Captions

343 Fig. 1. The emergence of a modern-day latitudinal diversity gradient in planktonic 344 foraminifera over the last 40 Ma. (A) Data used to quantify LDGs. Points are colored by 345 the age of the sample. Distributional maps rotated to paleo-positions for 2.5 Ma intervals are 346 available in Fig. S1. (B) LDGs constructed using unique site-by-age richness estimates in 2.5 347 Ma time bins (the midpoint age is shown). To generate curves, point-level data were binned by 15° latitude and richness estimated using the 75<sup>th</sup> percentile of the samples in each 348 349 latitude-by-age bin. Results were robust to LDG construction method (Figs. S6-10) and show 350 the modern-day LDG emerged only ~15 Ma. (C) Estimates of the gradient (i.e., slope) for 351 LDGs over the last 40 Ma using the curves from (**B**). Gradients were insensitive to 352 methodological approach (Figs. S11-24) and show a steepening of the gradient towards the

353 present.

## Fig. 2. Spatial autoregressive model coefficients from analyses examining the

### 355 relationship between richness and four environmental predictors within 2.5 Ma time

# **bins.** The midpoint age for each bin is shown. Environmental variables include mean annual

# sea surface temperature, the log of mean annual mixed layer depth, the width of the

# $\frac{1}{358}$ thermocline, and the log of mean annual salinity. Coefficients are black if significant at an $\alpha$

- of 0.05 using the Bejamini & Hochberg (BH) correction for multiple comparisons. Results
- 360 are shown for data that was latitudinally restricted (within 55° latitude) but are consistent

with models that include all latitudinal data (Fig. S28). Error bars represent 95% confidenceintervals around the mean.

### **Fig. 3.** The dynamics of depth partitioning for planktonic foraminiferal assemblages

364 across space and time. (A) We quantified evenness of depth habitat within each unique site-365 by-age bin using Simpson's index. This metric determines how evenly spread species are 366 among the mixed layer, thermocline, and sub-thermocline for a given time and place within 367 the water column. Mean evenness estimates were taken for each 2.5 Ma and 15° latitude bin. 368 Analyses were performed only within 55° latitude, since data were limited at high latitudes earlier in the Cenozoic. (B) Mean evenness across latitudes for a given 2.5 Ma time bin, for 369 370 low latitudes (defined as within  $30^{\circ}$ ), high latitudes, and globally. Low-latitude assemblages 371 of species today are more evenly distributed across the mixed layer, thermocline, and sub-372 thermocline than are assemblages at high latitudes. However, assemblages exhibited greater 373 evenness across latitudes when the gradient was shallower millions of years ago. Current 374 knowledge of foraminiferal depth preferences only allowed for measurement of evenness 375 across three depths, but our assumption is the thermocline and subthermocline are subdivided 376 to contain multiple niches, with more niches present at low latitudes during the last 15 Ma, 377 and more niches present at higher latitudes during warmer intervals. For the raw evenness 378 data in each sample, see Fig. S44.

379 Fig. 4. Macroevolutionary processes structuring LDGs over the last 40 Ma. Panels show 380 the number of speciation, extinction, extirpation, and dispersal events in low-latitude 381 (tropical) and high-latitude (temperate) regions. Dispersal quantified the number of species moving from the tropics to temperate regions and vice versa. The steepening of the gradient 382 383 towards the recent coincides with enhanced rates of tropical speciation and with higher 384 extirpation from temperate regions. Temperate and tropical regions were defined by 30° 385 latitude for all time periods. Data show results for the approach including all site-by-age 386 records. For proportional patterns, bootstrap subsampling analyses, and results excluding 387 species present in both temperate and tropical regions within a given 2.5 Ma time bin, see 388 Figs. S36-43.

389

### 390

## 391 **1. Methods**

## 392 1.1. Choice of taxon

Planktonic foraminifera are a group of unicellular, bio-mineralising marine plankton that originated ~170 Ma in the Early to Middle Jurassic<sup>44</sup>. They are an important component of the plankton from the high latitudes to the equator in all ocean basins. Species of planktonic foraminifera occupy a range of ecological niches in the upper two kilometers of the open ocean: some live in the surface mixed-layer and host algal photo-symbionts, while others live within or below the thermocline and feed primarily on sinking phytodetritus<sup>44</sup>.

Due to their global abundance and preservation potential, planktonic foraminifera have
been demonstrated to have the best species-level fossil record of the last 66 million years<sup>52</sup>.
The quality of this fossil record permits an exceptionally high-resolution view into past
species distributions, ecologies, and life histories. Recent work compiling this information
into the single, harmonized Triton database<sup>32</sup> allows us to investigate the drivers and patterns
of LDGs at greater fidelity than possible before.

405

## 406 *1.2. Description and preparation of the data*

407 We quantified temporal patterns in LDGs using 464,963 unique species-by-locality-by-408 age records from the Triton database<sup>32</sup>, which represents the single largest dataset for any fossil group. Data were curated for taxonomic consistency, and all ages were converted to the 409 GTS 2020 timescale. Following Fenton et al<sup>32</sup>, occurrences significantly outside a species' 410 known age range were excluded, using a threshold of 2 Ma for the Neogene and 5 Ma for the 411 412 Paleogene: such records are likely to be taxonomic misidentifications or the result of 413 reworking. Spatial coordinates were rotated to their past position (paleo-coordinates) based 414 on Matthews et al<sup>53</sup>. Spatial imprecision in coordinates may occur due to error in the paleo-415 coordinate rotation plate model, and/or from ocean currents displacing foraminiferal tests as 416 the dead organisms sank to the seafloor. However, neither source of error is likely to have 417 large effects on the LDG patterns quantified herein, given the spatial resolution of our 418 analyses (usually 15° latitude bins, or roughly 1500 km, see section 3.1). For example, for 419 sites <1 km depth or for large foraminifera, the distance between where the organism died and where it settled is unlikely to be larger than  $\sim 100 \text{ km}^{54,55}$ . For depths of 2 km to 3.5 km, a 420 maximum displacement of 100 to 400 km is reasonable<sup>56,57</sup>. We limited analyses to the last 421 422 40 Ma because poor-quality data at low latitudes early in the Cenozoic made it challenging to 423 accurately calculate richness for these early intervals.

424

# 425 1.3. Quantifying temporal patterns for LDGs over 40 Ma

We estimated LDGs using percentiles from point-occurrence data and by calculating
central tendencies using three different subsampling methods, described below. All analyses
used the R v. 4.1.3 computing environment<sup>58</sup>.

### 430 1.3.1. Spatio-temporal bin selection

431 LDGs were constructed by calculating richness within spatio-temporal bins. 432 Numerous binning schemes were tested to evaluate the sensitivity of patterns to spatio-433 temporal resolution. Eight temporal bin durations were tested, from 2.5 Ma to 20 Ma, in 2.5 Ma increments. Temporal binning may inflate species counts<sup>59</sup>, and thus bin duration should 434 be narrower than the average duration of species<sup>60</sup>. For the planktonic foraminiferal species 435 436 studied here, median species' duration was 5.96 Ma, suggesting bin durations longer than this 437 will suffer from greater time averaging. We therefore focused analyses on the shortest 438 temporal duration (2.5 Ma) but present results for other schemes (Figs. S7-9, S14). Longer 439 temporal bins give steeper gradient estimates, but overall patterns remain consistent, as can 440 be seen when rescaling richness in each time bin (Fig. S14). The spatial distribution of data at 441 2.5 Ma resolution are shown in Figs. S1.

We tested eight latitudinal bin resolutions, from 2.5° to 20°, in steps of 2.5°. We aimed to use the highest spatial bin resolution, whilst ensuring sufficient data to calculate LDGs within 2.5 Ma time bins. Therefore, to choose an 'optimum', we eliminated binning schemes that resulted in an empty set (no data) for latitudinal bins in any 2.5 Ma time bin. We further eliminated any binning scheme with insufficient data (defined here as 15 samples, 5 sites, and 150 records) in at least five latitudinal bins for any time bin. This approach identified 15° latitude bins as the highest 'ideal' resolution for analyses.

Analyses focused on a spatio-temporal resolution of 2.5 Ma and 15° latitude (Figs.
S2-4), which was sufficiently sensitive to return the known, modern-day LDG with an
equatorial dip (Fig. 1B)<sup>16,28</sup>. Estimates of the LDG using other spatial binning schemes
produced similar results (Fig. S7-S9), and latitudinal resolution did not have a strong
influence on gradient estimates (Fig. S15).

454

### 455 1.3.2. Point-occurrence method for LDGs

LDGs were quantified using unique site-by-age richness estimates within each 2.5 Ma time bin. Analyses excluded samples where the aim of the study was to identify selected species only, or where preservation was marked as poor (<10% of the data).

459 To generate LDG curves, point-level data were binned by 15° latitude. Richness was 460 estimated using the 75<sup>th</sup> percentile of the samples in each latitude-by-age bin. Changes in the 461 LDG through time were not affected by choice of percentile (Fig. S6 & S12). Percentiles 462 were used to estimate LDGs because planktonic foraminiferal assemblages are more likely to 463 be characterized by low richness due to dissolution or incomplete community counts, rather 464 than high richness from time averaging, particularly given the short temporal bins used here. 465 Furthermore, modern diversity patterns are characterized by the most diverse sites in a given 466 latitude; for example, in many clades, the tropics today house both very low and very high 467 species richness dependent on the location and environment<sup>61</sup>. 468

### 469 **1.3.3.** Subsampling method for LDGs

To test whether point-level LDG patterns remained consistent when accounting for variation in data quantity, we estimated LDGs using three subsampling approaches. For each latitude-by-age combination, 1000 subsamples were drawn at random with replacement and the number of unique species counted. The mean of the 1000 subsamples served as the richness estimate for that latitude-by-age bin, with associated 95% confidence intervals.

475 Three different subsampling methods were employed: (i) by site, (ii) by sample, and 476 (iii) by record (Fig. S5). The 'by site' method divided the dataset based on locality (or site) 477 and selected a set number of sites for a given latitude-by-age bin. Richness was calculated 478 from all species at the selected sites within that bin, irrespective of their exact age. We varied 479 the number of sites selected from 3 to 20 (n = 3, 5, 10, 15, and 20). We focused on five sites 480 because it allowed for the maximum number of spatio-temporal bins and produced narrower 481 confidence intervals than when subsampling using three sites, but results were broadly 482 insensitive to site number (Fig. S9 & S18).

The 'by sample' method of subsampling divided the dataset based on both locality and age and selected a set number of unique site-by-age samples from a given latitude-by-age bin. Each sample therefore represents the foraminiferal assemblage alive at a given time. The richness was calculated from unique species in the selected assemblages. We varied the number of samples selected from 10 to 50 in increments of 5. We selected 15 samples based on the trade-off between maximum number of samples and narrowest confidence intervals (Fig. S7 & S19).

The 'by record' method of subsampling divided the dataset based on locality, age, and species and selected a set number of unique species records from any site or age within a given latitude-by-age bin. Each record represented one row in the Triton dataset. The richness was calculated as the number of unique species within the selected records. We selected from 100 to 500 records in intervals of 50. We focused on 150 records, but results were broadly insensitive to record number (Fig. S8 & S20).

496 In contrast to point-level LDG construction, we did not exclude data where the aim of 497 the study was to identify selected species, and where preservation was marked as poor, 498 because subsampling does not assume any one sample is representative. Comparisons of 499 point-level and subsampled LDG estimates show similar patterns (Fig. S10 & S23-S24), 500 although subsampling tended to suggest higher average species richness. Higher richness in 501 subsampled LDGs may reflect the influence of spatio-temporal averaging, which can inflate 502 richness estimates. Alternatively or additionally, incomplete sampling or dissolution might 503 lower richness in the point level estimates.

504

### 505 **1.3.4.** Estimating LDG gradients

The strength (or gradient) of LDGs was estimated using a linear model of richness as a function of latitude. For point-level data, richness estimates from the same site and time bin were characterized by the 50<sup>th</sup>, 60<sup>th</sup>, 75<sup>th</sup>, and 90<sup>th</sup> percentiles to avoid pseudo-replication. We focused on patterns using the 75<sup>th</sup> percentile, but results were insensitive to percentile choice (Figs. S6, S12, S13). To ensure gradient estimates were comparable over time, we calculated gradients only within 55° latitude, since older time periods were characterized by sparse high-latitude data. However, results were insensitive to latitudinal extent (Fig. S11).

513 Gradients were estimated individually for the Northern and Southern Hemispheres, 514 and for both hemispheres combined using absolute latitude. We tested whether a model with 515 separate slopes for each hemisphere provided a significantly better fit to data than a combined 516 model using AICc. For most time periods (n=11 of 16), a model that used data from both 517 hemispheres was preferred over a model with separate gradients (Table S1). Combining the 518 two hemispheres increases the data on which a gradient is calculated.

We calculated gradients on rescaled richness to investigate the influence of variation
in richness through time on gradient estimates (Fig. S11-S13). Richness was rescaled by
setting maximum richness within a time bin to one. Rescaling affected the steepness of the
latitudinal gradient but allowed for more direct comparisons of LDG shape across time.
LDGs with peak richness in equatorial regions will have a steeper rescaled gradient than
gradients where peak richness is in the mid-latitudes.

525 We compared gradients estimated from point-level LDGs to gradients estimated from subsampled LDGs. Gradients were calculated for each subsampling iteration and every 526 527 latitude-by-age bin combination (Fig. S16), from which we derived mean and 95% 528 confidence intervals (Figs. S14-S15, S18-S21). Using the median instead of the mean 529 produced almost identical results (Fig. S17). Latitude-by-time bin resolution influenced 530 gradient estimates but did not mask overall patterns (Figs. S14 & S15). Choice of age bin 531 exaggerated latitudinal differences because broader age bins tended to result in more time 532 averaging, but overall patterns were similar (Fig. S14). Similarly, choice of subsampling method had little effect, although the use of sites tended to produce broader confidence 533 534 intervals (Figs. S21, S23 & S24). The amount of subsampling affected the steepness of the 535 gradient, but not the overall shape, and rescaling removed this effect (Figs. S18-20). Visual 536 inspection of gradients suggested the slopes of the Northern and Southern Hemisphere, for all 537 time periods, were mirrored (Fig. S16).

Finally, we calculated and compared gradients from raw richness tallied directly from
species counts in each latitude-by-age bin (Fig. S22), finding similar overall patterns to the
subsampled and point-level gradients.

## 542 **1.3.5.** Estimating bimodality

543 Shallow gradients may indicate minimal differences in richness across latitudes or may 544 indicate that bimodality was more pronounced during these times. To distinguish between 545 these two possibilities, we compared a linear model with a second order polynomial model 546 using AICc (Table S2).

547

### 548 1.4. Identifying LDG drivers over the last 40 Ma

549 **1.4.1.** Diversity dataset

550 We investigated possible LDG drivers over the last 40 Ma by coupling atmosphereocean generalized circulation models (AOGCMs) to point-level richness estimates within 2.5 552 Ma time bins. To avoid pseudo-replication, a single, mean richness estimate was calculated 553 for each climatic grid cell.

- 554
- 555 **1.4.2.** Paleoclimate simulations

To explore whether paleoclimate influenced the biogeographic distribution of
planktonic foraminifera, we utilized a newly updated version of a state-of-the-art paleogeneral circulation model.

#### 560 **1.4.2.1. Paleoclimate model**

559

561 Paleoclimate model simulations were carried out using a recent version of the UK Met Office coupled Atmosphere-Ocean General Circulation Model (AOGCM), HadCM3, or 562 HadCM3L-M2.1D following the nomenclature of <sup>62</sup>. HadCM3L-M2.1D has a model 563 resolution of 3.75° longitude × 2.5° latitude in the atmosphere and ocean (~250 km grid 564 565 squares in the tropics), with 19 hybrid levels in the atmosphere and 20 vertical levels in the 566 ocean. Equations were solved on the Arakawa B-grid. As is common in all climate models, 567 sub-grid scale processes, such as cloud, convection, and oceanic eddies, were parameterized 568 because they cannot be resolved at the scales required (usually meters to several kilometers) 569 of the model resolution.

570 Due to scarce spatiotemporal data recording land-surface vegetation and soil 571 characteristics in deep time, we used modern-day vegetation expressions for broadleaf trees, 572 deciduous trees, shrubs, C3 and C4 grasses (five in total), and a globally-uniform distribution of medium loam soil characteristics in the model land surface scheme (MOSES 2.1)<sup>63</sup>. The 573 574 land surface scheme also included evaporation from sub-grid scale lakes, which were 575 prescribed as a lake fraction in each grid box at the start of the simulation. We used a version of the model that included the dynamical vegetation model, TRIFFID (Top-Down 576 577 Representation of Interactive Foliage and Flora Including Dynamics). TRIFFID predicts the 578 distribution and properties of global vegetation based on plant functional types (PFTs) in the 579 form of fractional coverage (and thus PFT co-existence) within a grid-cell, based on 580 competition equations using the climate tolerance of five plant functional types.

The model included a further update that modified cloud condensation nuclei density 581 and cloud droplet effective radius, following recent work<sup>64,65</sup>. This modification raised 582 temperatures at high latitudes, without significantly changing tropical temperatures, which 583 584 reduced the pole-to-equator temperature gradient in line with proxy observations. This update 585 was found to work under hot, cool, and icehouse conditions, as well as under pre-industrial 586 boundary conditions, making it appropriate for use across modern and deep time. The ocean model was based on the model of Cox et al.<sup>66</sup> and is a full primitive equation with 587 588 a three-dimensional model of the ocean. A second-order numerical scheme was used along 589 with centred advection to remove nonlinear instabilities. Flux adjustments-such as artificial 590 heat and salinity adjustments in the ocean component model<sup>67</sup> to prevent them from drifting 591 to unrealistic values—were not required in this model, which is a crucial feature for long paleoclimate simulations<sup>68</sup>. Sea-ice was calculated on a zero-layer model; partial sea ice 592 593 coverage was possible, with a consistent salinity assumed for ice.

Each simulation was initialised from an equilibrated pre-industrial state in the atmosphere and ocean. Surface vegetation was uniformly set as shrub everywhere and allowed to evolve via TRIFFID based on the evolution of the local climate.

597 The HadCM3 family of models has contributed extensively to the Coupled Model 598 Intercomparison Project (CMIP 1-5) experiments and the Paleoclimate Modelling 599 Intercomparison Project (PMIP 1-4), and has demonstrated skill at reproducing the modern-600 day climate<sup>62</sup> and paleoclimate in an array of experiments<sup>69-71</sup>. Paleoclimate experiments require hundreds of years to reach a near-surface equilibrium state but substantially longer 601 (many thousands of years) for the deep ocean<sup>68,69</sup>; even longer is required for true climate 602 603 equilibrium, due to the long period of adjustment of ocean circulation to applied forcings. 604 Lower resolution models are less computational expensive, allowing fully equilibrated

simulations of deep time climate, which would not be possible with higher resolution, morecomplex models.

607

### 608 1.4.2.2. Snapshot simulations, specific boundary conditions and spin-up

609 We ran nine 'snapshot' simulations over the last 40 Ma of the Cenozoic, with each 610 simulation having time-specific boundary conditions. Paleogeographic digital elevation 611 models (DEMs) were produced by the EarthByte group as part of the PALEOMAP project<sup>72</sup>. 612 Each stage and time-specific DEM were interpolated from a 1°x1° grid onto the HadCM3L 613 3.75°x2.5° grid. Similarly, land ice was transformed onto the model grid assuming a simple 614 parabolic shape to estimate ice sheet height (m). 'Realistic' pCO<sub>2</sub> concentrations for each simulation were based on Foster et al.<sup>73</sup>. Time-specific solar luminosity for each simulation 615 616 was based on Gough<sup>74</sup>. All other boundary conditions, such as orbital parameters, volcanic 617 aerosol concentrations, etc., were held constant at pre-industrial values.

618 To ensure each simulation had fully adjusted to the boundary conditions, we followed 619 a 3-stage spin-up protocol so that each simulation was fully equilibrated: i) The globally and 620 volume-integrated annual mean ocean temperature trend was less than 1°C per 1000 years; ii) 621 trends in surface air temperature were less than 0.3°C per 1000 years; and iii) net energy balance at the top of the atmosphere, averaged over a 100-year period at the end of the 622 623 simulation, was less than 0.25/W m2. In general, these simulations were run for over 9,000 624 model years to ensure full Earth system equilibrium. Climate means were produced from the 625 last 100 years of each simulation. 626

### 627 1.4.2.3. Spatiotemporal interpolation techniques

628 Using the climatic snapshot simulations, we interpolated model data and boundary 629 conditions over the last 40 Ma. First, the DEM (bathymetry & topography) was interpolated 630 linearly between each pair of snapshot simulations at 0.5 million-year-increments onto a 631 1°x1° longitude by latitude grid. Each increment was time weighted between the two 632 snapshot simulations using the DEMs. The land-sea mask was generated for each newly 633 generated DEM, where any grid box above 0 m was taken as land and any grid box below 0 634 m as ocean. Isolated ocean points were removed if six of the surrounding grid boxes were 635 land, with the corresponding topography set as the mean of the surrounding grid boxes.

The snapshot model data (e.g., sea surface temperature, sea surface salinity) was
interpolated using bicubic remapping for each variable onto the interpolated land-sea mask.
Environmental parameter fields (e.g., sea surface temperature, salinity) were extrapolated to
fill in grid boxes that were newly created using Poisson's equation (elliptic partial differential
equation) over the input domain.

641

## 642 1.4.2.4. Paleo-climate model uncertainties

643 Global-scale biodiversity data requires global-scale environmental datasets, such as 644 sea surface temperature. Global proxy databases with large spatiotemporal coverage are 645 available for past time periods, but proxy evidence is limited deeper in time and increasingly 646 less well-constrained, necessitating the use of paleoclimate models to provide these global 647 datasets. However, simulating paleoclimate is challenging. This challenge stems, in part, 648 from the many parameters that may be unconstrained for deeper time observations. 649 Uncertainties can be partitioned into two main sources: i) boundary condition uncertainty, 650 and ii) model uncertainty.

i) Boundary conditions are spatiotemporally varying parameters that are required by
climate models, but which cannot be calculated internally by the model and instead need to
be provided by the user. The most important boundary conditions for the model used here

655 (e) orbital configuration, and (e) greenhouse gas concentrations. 656 657 (a) A large source of uncertainty arises from paleogeographic reconstruction. DEMs, constrained by paleo-databases, provide topography, bathymetry, and land-sea 658 concentration. These DEMs are crucial for determining local, regional, and global 659 660 atmospheric and ocean circulation, and therefore the climate in the model. The deeper 661 in time, the less proxy data is available, which results in greater uncertainty in these 662 reconstructions. However, our understanding of plate tectonics, spreading ridges, 663 weathering rates, and basinal deposition allows for accurate first-order approximation of deep-time paleogeography, especially over the last 40 Ma. The largest uncertainties 664 665 usually result from the height and depth of topographic and bathymetric surfaces and their spatial coverage because of proxy uncertainty, e.g.<sup>75</sup>. 666 (b) Ice sheets (and associated sea-level height) can have a large impact on regional 667 climate and global climate, primarily due to changes in land surface area, planetary 668 albedo, and modification to ocean and atmospheric circulation. Currently, most 669 670 paleoclimate models prescribe the height and extent of ice sheets based on proxy 671 evidence. (c) Solar luminosity, which is the amount of energy received by a planetary body from its 672 parent star, is fairly well known. Gough (1981)<sup>74</sup> approximated the amount of energy 673 based on a simple model using the age of the parent star. Apart from the first 0.2 Gyr 674 675 of Earth history, this approximation is shown to agree well with observations<sup>76</sup>. 676 (d) Orbital configuration (the eccentricity, obliquity, and precession of the planet's orbit 677 around its parent star and rotation on its own axis) can have a substantial impact on 678 the seasonal and latitudinal climate signal, which, in turn, can lead to significant 679 changes in climate state (glacial to interglacial cycles). These effects are due to ice 680 sheet formation and associated changes in global atmospheric and oceanic response. For deep-time simulations, a modern orbital configuration is often imposed. There are 681 682 several reasons for this. First, chronological uncertainty in proxies that are used in model comparison will cover many orbital cycles, which may result in the proxy 683 684 being more representative of a mean orbital state (akin to the modern day). Second, using a modern configuration makes it easier to understand how different a deep-time 685 686 climate is compared to the modern climate. Orbital variation will have its largest impact on climate where ice sheets can grow, which is partly reflective of the amount 687 of  $pCO_2$  in the atmosphere and associated global temperature. 688 689 (e) Greenhouse gas concentrations, and more specifically  $pCO_2$  concentrations, are variable through the geologic past. Proxy type, age, techniques, and calibration 690 691 uncertainty when converting to a  $pCO_2$  estimate, as well as the number of records through the geologic past, can make constraining a deep time  $pCO_2$  concentration 692 problematic<sup>73</sup>. Furthermore, although a combination of multiple proxy sources can 693 improve the robustness of the estimated  $pCO_2$  estimates, it may prove problematic in 694 situations where the errors are combined to produce a mean  $pCO_2$  estimate. Time 695 averaging is also an issue. Although paleogeography changes on geological 696 timescales, pCO<sub>2</sub> concentrations can vary on hundreds to million-year timescales. 697 Here we were only interested in the long-term background signal (millions of years), 698 with scatter around the mean, typically  $\sim 400 \text{ppm}^{73}$ . 699 700 701 ii) Although all globally available paleoclimate models use the same well-known

are: (a) paleogeographic reconstructions, (b) ice sheet height and extent, (c) solar luminosity,

654

equations to simulate the large-scale behavior of the atmosphere and ocean, results from
 different models can vary, in particular at the local and regional scale. This variation is due to

704 the complexity of each model, resolution dependencies, spin-up and the applied initial state, 705 and parameterizations used to approximate processes such as cloud formation that cannot be 706 explicitly resolved at the grid-scale of all current paleoclimate models. In an ideal world, such 707 paleoclimate simulations would be run by multiple paleoclimate modelling groups, as is done 708 in the Climate Model Intercomparison Project (CMIP) for near-future climate change studies. 709 Unfortunately, such paleo-climate comparisons are not currently possible: for instance, these 710 simulations took over two years to complete on a high-performance supercomputer, and few 711 paleoclimate modelling groups have the capability to set up such deep time simulations. 712 However, confidence in the robustness of our results can be obtained by the fact that: (a) the 713 HadCM3 family of models, although 20 years older than many contemporaries, still 714 compares reasonably well with models form the previous IPCC Coupled CMIP fifth assessment models<sup>62</sup>. (b) HadCM3L-M2.1D has seen continued development<sup>62</sup>. Here we use 715 716 an updated version of the model that solves a persistent problem in the majority of 717 paleoclimate models known as the 'cold pole paradox', where simulated higher latitude 718 temperatures were previously much cooler than suggested by proxy-observations. (c) These 719 simulations have been run for over 9000 model years. Paleoclimate simulations usually are 720 run for only a couple of thousands of years due to computational costs. However, it can take upwards of 5,000 years to allow a model simulation to equilibrate to all the applied model 721 722 forcings, especially for the deep ocean, and, as such, for global ocean circulation to be fully 723 representative of the deep-time period. (d) Although model uncertainty is important to 724 constrain, it has been shown that scenario uncertainty (i.e., the applied boundary conditions) 725 is a larger source of error, at least for future climate simulations<sup>77</sup>.

726

#### 727 1.4.3. Climate drivers

#### 728 **1.4.3.1.** Environmental constraints on planktonic foraminifera

We investigated nine environmental variables previously posited to constrain the distributions of planktonic foraminifera<sup>44</sup>, including mean annual sea surface temperature, seasonal variation in sea surface temperature, mean annual mixed layer depth, seasonality of the mixed layer depth, mean annual sea surface salinity, seasonality of sea surface salinity, the width of the thermocline, the temperature range within the mixed layer, and the temperature range within the thermocline (Fig. S25-S27).

Sea surface temperature. Surface temperature estimates were calculated at 5 m
water depth. Temperatures within the water column were highly correlated with surface
temperatures and therefore not included in model comparisons. Temperature seasonality was
estimated as the standard deviation of monthly variations. HadCM3 estimates potential
temperatures (i.e., removing the effect of pressure). Planktonic foraminifera are more likely
to respond to actual temperature, but the difference between potential and actual temperature
is small (< than 1°C at 1000 m) and thus we did not correct for this effect.</li>

742 Surface salinity. Surface salinity was calculated at 5 m water depth. Salinity deeper 743 in the water column was highly correlated with surface salinity and therefore not included in 744 model comparisons. Seasonality in salinity was estimated as the standard deviation of the 745 monthly variations. Extremes of salinity, whether high or low, may exceed planktonic foraminiferal species' tolerances, whose salinity optimum sits around 35 PSU<sup>44</sup>. Therefore, 746 747 the expected relationship with salinity is thought to be polynomial on the original scale. 748 However, we have insufficient data to model polynomials for many of the time intervals, and 749 thus to model the effect of salinity, we calculated the absolute difference from this optimal 750 salinity value. By using an absolute difference from the optimum, we converted the 751 relationship to approximately linear, with high richness close to the optimum and low 752 richness at the extremes.

**Water column structure.** We estimated annual mean width of the mixed layer, seasonal variation in mixed layer depth, and annual mean width of the thermocline. The mixed layer refers to the top of the water column, where environmental conditions are relatively homogeneous and stable due to mixing. Mixed layer depth was derived from HadCM3L output, which used a Kraus-Turner<sup>78</sup> bulk mixed layer approach that calculated a balance between the energy available for mixing the water column and the introduction of buoyancy at the ocean surface. For more detail, see Foreman<sup>79</sup>.

The thermocline is the section of the water column below the mixed layer where temperature changes rapidly with depth. Below the thermocline, temperature is relatively stable. On a rescaled temperature profile (where the temperature and depth axes are rescaled from 0 to 1), the base of the thermocline was calculated as the point where the gradient steepens past a -1:1 line using a loess function in the base R stats package<sup>58</sup>. We chose a span  $\alpha = 0.4$  based on sensitivity analyses: if the span is too large, the regression will be oversmoothed, whereas if the span is too small, large variance will result.

Water column temperature structure. We calculated the mean temperature range
 within the mixed layer and thermocline based on their identified boundaries, described above.
 The temperature range within the thermocline and mixed layer provided a proxy for the
 diversity of temperature niches at depth within the water column.

- 771 Maps for the environmental variables can be found in Fig. S25.
- 772

## 773 **1.4.3.2. Variable selection**

The interpolated AOGCM data provided mean global estimates for each of the nine variables at 2.5 Ma intervals. Shallow-water grid cells (water depth < 200m) were excluded for each time bin, based on a Scotese bathymetry model<sup>72</sup>. Removing shallow-water cells excluded coastal environments where planktonic foraminifera communities may be limited by environmental conditions <sup>44</sup>. Variables were centred and rescaled within each 2.5 Ma time bin to better interpret the intercept terms and to ensure similar units for regression coefficients.

781 The environmental variables were highly collinear with each other in most time 782 periods (Fig. S26). We tested for multicollinearity within each of the 2.5 Ma time bins using 783 variance inflation factors (VIFs). Analyses relied on the 'vif' function in the HH R package v. 784  $3.1-47^{80}$ . To include the same set of environmental predictors across the 16 time bin models, 785 we limited analyses to those variables with VIFs < 2 in each time interval, following<sup>81</sup>. The 786 final variable set included mean sea surface temperature, mean annual mixed layer depth, 787 mean annual sea surface salinity, and width of the thermocline. Mean thermocline 788 temperature range was also considered of interest, but was too strongly correlated with mean 789 sea surface temperature to be included in the same models (i.e., the mean  $R^2$  for a model 790 between these two variables is 0.886 across time bins).

We assessed the relationship of these four variables with richness using both
multivariate and univariate models (Figs. S28-S33). For univariate analyses, we included
thermocline temperature range alongside the other four predictors (Fig. S33). Before
modelling, mixed layer depth (mean and seasonality) and salinity (mean and seasonality)
were log transformed to correct for non-linearity.

796

798

## 797 **1.4.4. Model building and calibration**

## 1.4.4.1. Identifying LDG drivers within time intervals

799 We modelled the relationship between richness and the four selected environmental 800 predictors within each 2.5 Ma time bin using spatial autoregressive models. Models were fit 801 using the errorsarlm function in the spatialreg R package v.1.2- $3^{82}$ . We adjusted significance 802 levels ( $\alpha$  of 0.05) to account for multiple comparisons by applying the Bejamini & Hochberg (BH) correction<sup>83</sup>. The optimum neighborhood distance was calculated for each time period,
 between 500 km and the distance where autocorrelation becomes non-significant, following
 <sup>84</sup> using AIC. Models were checked for heteroscedasticity. We restricted analyses to within
 55° latitude, because older time periods lacked data at high latitudes. Using all latitudinal
 data, rather than limiting analysis to within 55° latitude, produced similar results (Fig. S28).

808

### 809 1.4.4.2. Model exploration and sensitivity analyses

810 We explored the effects of sampling and preservation on within-age-bin model 811 results. Sampling in the fossil record varies over time, with older time bins typically 812 characterized by fewer data points. Data loss can potentially mask relationships between the 813 predictors and species richness (Fig. 2). We therefore explored whether the results held when 814 fewer data points were used for within-age-bin models. Specifically, in each time bin, data 815 were subsampled to include the same number of data points as the most data-poor time bin 816 (n=49, for 37.5–40 Ma), iterated 100 times. To summarize these results, we used the mean 817 coefficient and standard error from the 100 subsampling iterations for each time bin. Model 818 results removed any statistically significant relationship between temperature and richness, 819 even for more recent time periods, but coefficients were similar (Fig. S30). Importantly, 820 modern-day LDGs constructed from the more limited data show similar patterns to those 821 constructed on the full dataset (Fig. S31).

822 Dissolution increases with water depth as the carbonate ion concentration and calcite saturation state decrease. Dissolution can artificially reduce richness at a particular site and 823 824 time as a function of ocean basin depth and the species present, because certain species are 825 more susceptible to dissolution<sup>44</sup>. The differential impact of dissolution may obscure the 826 relationship between environmental variables and species richness. We assessed the potential 827 effect of dissolution on model results by excluding samples with species richness in the lowest 25<sup>th</sup> percentile, based on 15° latitude and 2.5 Ma age bins. Model results suggested 828 829 similar relationships and patterns (Fig. S32).

830 The warmer, greenhouse conditions on Earth ~40 Ma ago limited temperature 831 variability across latitudes. Reduced temperature variation may obscure any relationship of 832 temperature with species richness. We therefore tested whether a relationship between 833 temperature and richness can be detected in more recent time bins, when analyses were 834 limited to the range of temperatures characteristic of warmer times. We identified the time 835 bin with the smallest temperature range (35–37.5 Ma time bin, with a temperature range from 836 15.25–33.38°C) and restricted analyses for the other time bins to this temperature range. 837 Using this approach resulted in some time bins having an even narrower temperature range, 838 since time bins towards the present do not have temperatures reaching 33°C.

839 When a narrow temperature range was used, the relationship between temperature and 840 richness was lost for most time bins, aside from the most recent (Fig. S29). Limiting analyses 841 to a narrower temperature range suggested that no relationship exists between temperature 842 and species richness, even for more recent time bins. Thus, the absence of a relationship 843 between richness and temperature for deeper time bins may reflect the narrower temperature 844 range, which itself elevated species richness across latitudes.

845

## 846 **1.4.4.3. Identifying LDG drivers through time**

In addition to investigating the relationship between potential environmental drivers and richness within time bins spatially, we examined the degree to which change in environmental variables drives change in richness at given sites. To compare shorter- and longer-term trends, differences were calculated using a range of temporal gaps (from 2.5 Ma to 12.5 Ma, in 2.5 Ma steps). For each temporal gap, we modelled the change in species richness as a linear function of the change in the selected environmental variables. Only a subset of the data used for spatial, within-time analyses could be used for the across-time
analyses: to be included, sites were required to have pairs of samples with the requisite time
gap (Fig. S35-36). Analyses with longer time gaps had fewer data points (Table S3).

856 We ran both multivariate and univariate models; for the latter, we included analysis of 857 thermocline temperature range (Table S4). Richness was estimated as the mean richness for 858 each site within each 2.5 Ma time bin. Analyses used values for the environmental variables 859 on their original scale, rather than rescaled values. Because separate models were run for 860 different time gaps, we adjusted significance values ( $\alpha$  of 0.05) following the Bejamini & 861 Hochberg (BH) correction<sup>83</sup>. Results were insensitive to latitudinal extent (Table S3 & S4).

862

870

# 863 1.4.5. The effect of ocean area on species richness

864 Open ocean area has been hypothesized to drive the LDG, because area is found to 865 correlate positively with species richness today<sup>26</sup>. To test whether this relationship holds 866 through time for planktonic foraminifera, we modelled richness as a function of open ocean 867 area within 15° latitude and 2.5 Ma time bins (Fig. S34). Open ocean area was defined as the 868 area of grid cells with depths > 200 m based on the Scotese bathymetry models<sup>72</sup>. We 869 quantified area using the areaPolygon function in the geosphere R package<sup>85</sup>.

## 871 *1.5. Depth partitioning across space and time*

Species of planktonic foraminifera live at different depths in the water column, down to 872 about two kilometers<sup>44</sup>. Depth preferences for fossil species can be estimated using the 873 isotopic signature of their shells and are usually divided into mixed layer, thermocline, and 874 875 sub-thermocline dwellers<sup>52</sup>. We investigated how the depth structure of planktonic 876 foraminiferal assemblages changed across space and time. For each unique site and time bin, 877 we partitioned species by three depth categories (mixed layer, thermocline, and sub-878 thermocline dwellers). We classified the single species inferred to occur across multiple 879 depths (Chiloguembelina ototara) as a mixed layer dweller, since it possessed photo-880 symbionts.

881 We quantified evenness of depth habitat within each unique site-by-age with Simpson's 882 index using the diversity function in the vegan R package v.2.5 $-7^{86}$ . This metric determined 883 how evenly spread species are among the three depths for a given time and place. That is, 884 highly even assemblages would have roughly equal numbers of species in each depth class, 885 whereas uneven assemblages would vary more in species count by depth class. We excluded 886 sites most likely to be subject to dissolution, defined as those that fell in the lowest 25<sup>th</sup> 887 percentile of species richness for a given site and time. The mean of these evenness estimates 888 was taken for each 2.5 Ma and 15° latitude bin (Fig. S44). Analyses were performed only 889 within 55° latitude, given the sparse data at high latitudes earlier in the Cenozoic (Fig. 3).

Current knowledge of foraminiferal depth preferences only allowed for measurement of evenness across three depths over the last 40 million years. Our assumption, however, is that the thermocline and subthermocline are subdivided to contain multiple thermal niches, with more niches available during warmer conditions earlier in the Cenozoic across latitudes, and more niches available at low latitudes during the last 15–10 Ma. The mixed layer is unlikely to be as subdivided, given conditions within are more homogenous.

896

## 897 1.6. Speciation, extinction, and dispersal dynamics

To determine the macroevolutionary processes structuring LDGs, we quantified spatial patterns of speciation, extinction, and dispersal in planktonic foraminifera over the last 40 Ma. Specifically, we investigated whether species originated and went extinct in tropical or temperate regions, whether they dispersed primarily into or out of these regions, and whether they were extirpated (went regionally extinct) at higher rates in one region over 903 the other (Fig. 4, Fig. S37-40). Since our focus is on latitudinal patterns, not climatic patterns,
904 we defined the separation between tropical and temperate regions as 30° for all time periods.
905 We selected 30° because modern-day richness for planktonic foraminifera peaks in the
906 subtropics; present-day richness quantified using the typical cut-off of 23° would result in
907 similar diversity in these regions.

908 We used two approaches to quantify macroevolutionary dynamics. In the first approach 909 (Fig. S37), we considered all site-by-age records, including those outside of 55° latitude. 910 Speciation was considered to have occurred in the region of first occurrence for a species 911 (Fig. S39). Similarly, extinction was considered to have occurred in the region of last 912 occurrence for a species. That is, even if a species was present in both temperate and tropical 913 regions within a 2.5 Ma time bin, the species was counted as going extinct in the tropics if 914 that region held the last occurrence. Extirpation was documented in the time bin when the 915 species last disappeared from a region (either temperate or tropics) but persisted in the other 916 region. In this way, each species had, at most, one extirpation. Dispersal dynamics were 917 identified by documenting how long it took a species after origination to appear in a region 918 different from where it originated; for example, if a species originated in the tropics, we 919 assessed whether the species ever left the tropics, and, if so, how long it took the species to 920 move to the temperate region. Species that originated and moved within a 2.5 Ma time bin 921 were counted towards both metrics in that time bin. Raw counts (Fig. S37), proportions (Fig. 922 S37), and per capita rates (Fig. S40) were calculated.

923 In the second approach (Fig. S38), we excluded species present in both temperate and 924 tropical regions within a given 2.5 Ma time bin. These species do not contribute to the 925 development of the LDG. Thus, by focusing only on species present in one region, we can 926 more clearly distinguish the processes contributing to LDG formation. For these analyses, we 927 counted a speciation as the region of first occurrence for a species, but only if the species did 928 not expand its range to another region in the same time bin. Extinction was recorded in the 929 region where the species was last observed, but only if the species was found uniquely in that 930 region. Extirpation occurred when a species was present in both regions but was lost from 931 one region. Thus, extirpation could occur numerous times for each species over time, unlike 932 in the previous approach. Dispersal was counted when a species moved from one region to 933 another. For example, when a species was found only in the tropical region in one time bin, to 934 when it was found only in the temperate region in another time bin. The two approaches 935 produced congruent conclusions, which is that low-latitude speciation and high-latitude 936 regional extirpation, contributed to the steepening of the diversity gradient over the last 40 937 Ma.

938 Incomplete sampling may affect the location of first and last appearance for taxa in the 939 fossil record. Although it is unlikely that geographic error in the first and last appearances 940 would be sufficient to mask true patterns given the broad geographic bins used here, we 941 employed a bootstrap resampling protocol to test this assumption. Each species was 942 subsampled down to 75% of available records across its lifetime, and the evolutionary 943 metrics (speciation, extinction, extirpation, dispersal) re-calculated for each time bin. This 944 subsampling process was repeated 100 times, such that 100 temperate and 100 tropical 945 estimates were returned for each metric (speciation, extinction, extirpation, and dispersal) in 946 each time bin. Our goal was to assess how sampling may affect understanding of the location 947 of first and last appearance and dispersal patterns for species. The estimates, however, 948 remained broadly consistent across bootstrap replicates (Figs. S41-43), most likely because 949 planktonic foraminifera are densely sampled with high spatio-temporal resolution-arguably the best of any fossil group<sup>52</sup>. Planktonic foraminifera are employed extensively for 950 951 biostratigraphy and have been subject to considerable taxonomic revision, resulting in well-

- established stratigraphic ranges<sup>87</sup>; accordingly, the geographic locations of first and last occurrences in Triton that correlate with these datums are robust.

956	Methods References		
957	52	Aze, T. et al. A phylogeny of Cenozoic macroperforate planktonic foraminifera from	
958		fossil data. Biological Reviews 86, 900-927 (2011).	
959	53	Matthews, K. J. et al. Global plate boundary evolution and kinematics since the late	
960		Paleozoic. Global and Planetary Change 146, 226-250,	
961		doi: <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gloplacha.2016.10.002</u> (2016).	
962	54	v. Gyldenfeldt, AB., Carstens, J. & Meincke, J. Estimation of the catchment area of	
963		a sediment trap by means of current meters and foraminiferal tests. DSR 47, 1701-	
964		1717, doi: <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/S0967-0645(00)00004-7</u> (2000).	
965	55	Qiu, Z., Doglioli, A. M. & Carlotti, F. Using a Lagrangian model to estimate source	
966		regions of particles in sediment traps. Science China Earth Sciences 57, 2447-2456	
967		(2014).	
968	56	Siegel, D. A. & Deuser, W. G. Trajectories of sinking particles in the Sargasso Sea:	
969		modeling of statistical funnels above deep-ocean sediment traps. Deep Sea Research	
970		Part I: Oceanographic Research Papers 44, 1519-1541,	
971		doi: <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/S0967-0637(97)00028-9</u> (1997).	
972	57	Waniek, J., Koeve, W. & Prien, R. D. Trajectories of sinking particles and the	
973		catchment areas above sediment traps in the northeast Atlantic. Journal of Marine	
974		<i>Research</i> <b>58</b> , 983-1006 (2000).	
975	58	R: A language and environment for statistical computing (R Foundation for Statistical	
976		Computing, Vienna, Austria, 2019).	
977	59	Alroy, J. The Fossil Record of North American Mammals: Evidence for a Paleocene	
978		Evolutionary Radiation. Systematic Biology 48, 107-118,	
979		doi:10.1080/106351599260472 (1999).	
980	60	Marcot, J. D. The fossil record and macroevolutionary history of North American	
981		ungulate mammals: standardizing variation in intensity and geography of sampling.	
982		Paleobiology 40, 238-255 (2014).	
983	61	Gaston, K. J., Williams, P. H., Eggleton, P. & Humphries, C. J. Large scale patterns	
984		of biodiversity: spatial variation in family richness. Proceedings of the Royal Society	
985		<i>Biological Sciences</i> <b>260</b> , 149-154 (1995).	
986	62	Valdes, P. J. et al. The BRIDGE HadCM3 family of climate models:	
987		HadCM3@Bristol v1.0. Geoscience Model Development 10, 3715-3743 (2017).	
988	63	Cox, P. M. et al. The impact of new land surface physics on the GCM simulation of	
989		climate and climate sensitivity. <i>ClDy</i> <b>15</b> , 183-203, doi:10.1007/s003820050276	
990		(1999).	
991	64	Sagoo, N., Valdes, P., Flecker, R. & Gregoire, L. J. The Early Eocene equable climate	
992		problem: can perturbations of climate model parameters identify possible solutions?	
993		Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society A: Mathematical, Physical and	
994		Engineering Sciences <b>371</b> , 20130123 (2013).	
995	65	Kiehl, J. T. & Shields, C. A. Sensitivity of the Palaeocene–Eocene Thermal	
996		Maximum climate to cloud properties. Philosophical Transactions of the Royal	
997		Society A: Mathematical, Physical and Engineering Sciences <b>371</b> , 20130093 (2013).	
998	66	Cox, M. D. A primitive equation, 3-dimensional model of the ocean. GFDL Ocean	
999		Group Technical Report No 1, GFDL, Princeton University (1984).	

1000	67	Collins, M., Tett, S. F. B. & Cooper, C. The internal climate variability of HadCM3, a
1001		version of the Hadley Centre coupled model without flux adjustments. ClDy 17, 61-
1002		81, doi:10.1007/s003820000094 (2001).
1003	68	Farnsworth, A. et al. Climate Sensitivity on Geological Timescales Controlled by
1004		Nonlinear Feedbacks and Ocean Circulation. Geophysical Research Letters 46, 9880-
1005		9889, doi: <u>https://doi.org/10.1029/2019GL083574</u> (2019).
1006	69	Valdes, P. J., Scotese, C. R. & Lunt, D. J. Deep ocean temperatures through time.
1007		Clim. Past 17, 1483-1506, doi:10.5194/cp-17-1483-2021 (2021).
1008	70	Farnsworth, A. et al. Past East Asian monsoon evolution controlled by
1009		paleogeography, not CO <sub>2</sub> . Science Advances 5, eaax1697,
1010		doi:doi:10.1126/sciadv.aax1697 (2019).
1011	71	Jones, L. A., Mannion, P. D., Farnsworth, A., Bragg, F. & Lunt, D. J. Climatic and
1012		tectonic drivers shaped the tropical distribution of coral reefs. Nature
1013		Communications 13, 3120, doi:10.1038/s41467-022-30793-8 (2022).
1014	72	Scotese, C. R. & Wright, N. PALEOMAP Paleodigital Elevation Models
1015		(PaleoDEMS) for the Phanerozoic, 2018).
1016	73	Foster, G. L., Royer, D. L. & Lunt, D. J. Future climate forcing potentially without
1017		precedent in the last 420 million years. Nature Communications 8, 14845,
1018		doi:10.1038/ncomms14845 (2017).
1019	74	Gough, D. O. Solar interior structure and luminosity variations. SoPh 74, 21-34
1020		(1981).
1021	75	Farnsworth, A. et al. Paleoclimate model-derived thermal lapse rates: Towards
1022		increasing precision in paleoaltimetry studies. Earth and Planetary Science Letters
1023		564, 116903, doi:https://doi.org/10.1016/j.epsl.2021.116903 (2021).
1024	76	Bahcall, J. N., Pinsonneault, M. H. & Basu, S. Solar Models: Current Epoch and Time
1025		Dependences, Neutrinos, and Helioseismological Properties. The Astrophysical
1026		Journal 555, 990-1012, doi:10.1086/321493 (2001).
1027	77	Hawkins, E. & Sutton, R. The Potential to Narrow Uncertainty in Regional Climate
1028		Predictions. Bulletin of the American Meteorological Society 90, 1095-1108,
1029		doi:10.1175/2009BAMS2607.1 (2009).
1030	78	Kraus, E. B. & Turner, J. S. A one-dimensional model of the seasonal thermocline,
1031		Part II. Tell 19, 98-105 (1967).
1032	79	Foreman, S. J. Unified Model Documentaiton Paper Number 40, The Ocean Model
1033		Report. (The Met Office, 2005).
1034	80	HH: Statistical Analysis and Data Display: Heiberger and Holland. R package version
1035		3.1-47 (2022).
1036	81	Zuur, A. F., Ieno, E. N. & Elphick, C. S. A protocol for data exploration to avoid
1037		common statistical problems. Methods Ecol. Evol. 1, 3-14 (2010).
1038	82	Bivand, R., Millo, G. & Piras, G. A Review of Software for Spatial Econometrics in
1039		R. Mathematics 9, 1276 (2021).
1040	83	Benjamini, Y. & Hochberg, Y. Controlling the false discovery rate: a practical and
1041		powerful approach to multiple testing. Journal of the Royal statistical society: Series
1042		B (Methodological) 57, 289-300 (1995).
1043	84	Cooper, N. & Purvis, A. Body size evolution in mammals: complexity in tempo and
1044		mode. Am Nat 175, 727-738 (2010).
1045	85	geosphere: Spherical Trigonometry. R package version 1.5-14 (2021).
1046	86	Oksanen, J. et al. vegan: Community Ecology Package. R package version 2.5-7.
1047		(2020).
1048	87	Wade, B. S., Pearson, P. N., Berggren, W. A. & Pälike, H. Review and revision of
1049		Cenozoic tropical planktonic foraminiferal biostratigraphy and calibration to the

1050geomagnetic polarity and astronomical time scale. Earth-Sci Rev 104, 111-142,1051doi:<a href="https://doi.org/10.1016/j.earscirev.2010.09.003">https://doi.org/10.1016/j.earscirev.2010.09.003</a> (2011).1052







