



**UNIVERSITY OF LEEDS**

This is a repository copy of *Functional Active Microbiome in Supragingival Biofilms in Health and Caries*.

White Rose Research Online URL for this paper:  
<https://eprints.whiterose.ac.uk/176914/>

Version: Accepted Version

---

**Article:**

Corralo, DJ, Ev, LD, Damé-Teixeira, N et al. (4 more authors) (2021) Functional Active Microbiome in Supragingival Biofilms in Health and Caries. *Caries Research*. ISSN 0008-6568

<https://doi.org/10.1159/000518963>

---

**Reuse**

Items deposited in White Rose Research Online are protected by copyright, with all rights reserved unless indicated otherwise. They may be downloaded and/or printed for private study, or other acts as permitted by national copyright laws. The publisher or other rights holders may allow further reproduction and re-use of the full text version. This is indicated by the licence information on the White Rose Research Online record for the item.

**Takedown**

If you consider content in White Rose Research Online to be in breach of UK law, please notify us by emailing [eprints@whiterose.ac.uk](mailto:eprints@whiterose.ac.uk) including the URL of the record and the reason for the withdrawal request.



[eprints@whiterose.ac.uk](mailto:eprints@whiterose.ac.uk)  
<https://eprints.whiterose.ac.uk/>

1 **Research Article**

2 **Functional Active Microbiome in Supragingival Biofilms in Health and**  
3 **Caries**

4 Daniela Jorge Corralo<sup>a</sup>, Laís Daniela Ev<sup>b</sup>, Nailê Damé-Teixeira<sup>c,d</sup>, Marisa Maltz<sup>b</sup>, Rodrigo Alex Arthur<sup>b</sup>,  
5 Thuy Do<sup>d</sup>, Clarissa Cavalcanti Fatturi Parolo<sup>b</sup>

6  
7 <sup>a</sup> PhD by Faculty of Dentistry, Federal University of Rio Grande do Sul (UFRGS); Faculty of Dentistry,  
8 Passo Fundo University (UPF), Passo Fundo, Rio Grande do Sul, Brazil

9 <sup>b</sup> Department of Social and Preventive Dentistry, Faculty of Dentistry, Federal University of Rio  
10 Grande do Sul (UFRGS), Porto Alegre, Rio Grande do Sul, Brazil

11 <sup>c</sup> Department of Dentistry, School of Health Sciences, University of Brasília, Federal District, Brasília,  
12 Brazil

13 <sup>d</sup> Division of Oral Biology, School of Dentistry, University of Leeds, Leeds, United Kingdom

14  
15 Short Title: Healthy and caries biofilm bacteriome

16 Corresponding Author:

17 Daniela Jorge Corralo

18 Federal University of Rio Grande do Sul / University of Passo Fundo

19 2492 Ramiro Barcelos st., Santa Cecilia

20 Porto Alegre, RS, Brazil

21 cellular: +55 54 999632422

22 phone: +55 51 3308 5247

23 e-mail: danijcorralo@gmail.com

24  
25 Number of Tables: 03.

26 Number of Figures: 06.

27 Word count: 3412.

28 Keywords: Non-cavitated caries lesions, Supragingival Biofilms, Metatranscriptomic Data,  
29 Microbiome, Bioinformatics.

## 30 **Abstract**

31 The oral microbiome is unique at inter and intra- individual levels at various sites due to physical and  
32 biological factors. This study aimed to compare the bacterial composition of supragingival biofilms  
33 collected from enamel sites with different caries activity, from active and inactive-caries subjects,  
34 and from caries-free subjects. Twenty-two individuals (aged between 13 and 76 years old; med=23.5  
35 years old) were allocated into three groups: caries-active (CA) (n=10); caries-inactive (CI) (n=6); and,  
36 caries-free (CF) (n=6). From the caries-active group, 3 sites were sampled: caries-active (ANCL),  
37 caries-inactive (INCL), and sound enamel surface (S). From the subjects of the caries-inactive group,  
38 biofilm from caries-inactive lesion was collected (INCL); while for the caries-free subjects (S), a pool  
39 of biofilm from sound enamel surfaces were sampled. The total RNA was extracted, cDNA libraries  
40 were prepared and paired-end sequenced (Illumina HiSeq 3000). The final dental biofilm samples  
41 analysed from CA was 16 (ANCL-CA=6, INCL-CA=4, S-CA=6); from CI, three (INCL-CI=3); and from CF,  
42 six (S-CF=6) (some samples were lost by insufficient genetic material). Read sequences were  
43 processed and analysed using MG-RAST (Metagenomics Analysis Server). High-quality sequences  
44 (3,542,190) were clustered into operational taxonomic units (OTUs) (97% identity; SILVA SSU),  
45 representing 915 genera belonging to 29 phyla (higher abundant: *Actinobacteria*, *Firmicutes*,  
46 *Bacteroidetes*, *Fusobacteria*). The presence of a core microbiome was observed (123 shared genus).  
47 The alpha diversity analysis showed less bacterial diversity in disease (S-CA) compared to health (S-  
48 CF). The dominant genera included *Actinomyces*, *Corynebacterium*, *Capnocytophaga*, *Leptotrichia*,  
49 *Veillonella*, *Prevotella*, *Streptococcus*, *Eubacterium*, and *Neisseria*. *Veillonella* and *Leptotrichia* were  
50 related with disease, and *Prevotella* with health. *Corynebacterium*, *Capnocytophaga*, and  
51 *Actinomyces* clustered together presenting high abundance in health and disease. The Metric  
52 Multidimensional Scaling Ordination analysis shows that sites from active subjects (ANCL-CA, INCL-CA  
53 and S-CA) are closer to each other than either INCL-CI subjects or S-CF subjects. In conclusion,  
54 supragingival bacterial communities presented intra-individual similarities, but inter-individual  
55 diversity and difference in bacterial composition reveal that the subject's caries activity status  
56 matters more than sites.

## 57 **Introduction**

58 The oral cavity harbours diverse niches for microbial colonization, supporting distinct site-specific  
59 microbial consortia combination, which responds and reflects to ecological determinants at each site,  
60 [Marsh, 1994; 2018; Aas et al., 2005]. Investigating the total microbial population, which is  
61 metabolically active in dental health and disease sites is necessary to understand mechanisms leading  
62 to dysbiosis [Benítez-Páez et al., 2014; Henne et al., 2016; Nascimento et al., 2017]. Although the  
63 microbial composition of these biofilms remains stable over time, an increase in dietary fermentable  
64 carbohydrate induces a shift in the microbial ecosystem leading to low pH in the biofilm environment,  
65 and resulting in dental demineralization [Loesche, 1986; Marsh, 1994; Paes Lemes et al., 2006, Bjørndal  
66 et al., 2019]. Microbial homeostasis can be restored if changes occur in the dental plaque ecosystem,  
67 for instance by increasing pH to neutral conditions which could result in dental remineralization  
68 [Marsh, 1994; Paes Lemes et al., 2006]. Both active and inactive conditions, as well as non-affected  
69 sites, can be found in the same subject [Marsh, 1994; 2018; Aas et al., 2005; Filoche et al., 2010; Simón-  
70 Soro et al., 2014; Arweiler and Netuschil, 2016].

71 Culture-based studies of dental caries [Orland et al., 1954; Fitzgerald and Keyes, 1960; Gibbons et al.,  
72 1964; Krasse, 1966; Krasse et al., 1967; Loesche et al., 1975; Loesche, 1986] have failed to explain the  
73 aetiology of the disease. Organism interactions are essential to understand ecosystem dynamics of  
74 oral microbial communities are more than the sum of the individual species [Mark Welch et al., 2016;  
75 Marsh, 2018] justifying biofilms communities' studies. Currently, culture independent molecular  
76 biology methods, and recently, next-generation sequencing technologies (NGS) are improving  
77 knowledge about diversity, composition and functional aspects of the dental biofilms microbial  
78 communities in its natural habitats [Simón-Soro et al., 2013; 2014; Benitez-Páez et al., 2014; Johansson  
79 et al., 2016; Xiao et al., 2016; Eriksson et al., 2017; Espinoza et al., 2018; Richards et al., 2017; He et  
80 al., 2018; Jiang et al., 2019; Schoilew et al., 2019]. Moreover, the RNA sequencing (RNA-Seq) approach  
81 allows the functional characterization of a complex microbial community (microbiome) under a  
82 specific condition, revealing both the composition of the metabolically active microbiota and the gene  
83 expression levels which provide an insight into the ongoing metabolic pathways within the microbial  
84 community [Jiang et al., 2016; Hrdlickova et al., 2017].

85 Studies have demonstrated substantial differences in biofilm microbiota composition in caries lesions,  
86 showing a community stability disruption, with acidogenic and acid-tolerant species enrichment [Aas  
87 et al., 2008; Gross et al., 2010; Benitez-Páez et al., 2014; Simón-Soro et al., 2014; Johansson et al.,  
88 2016; Xiao et al., 2016; Eriksson et al., 2017; Espinoza et al., 2018; Richards et al., 2017; Jiang et al.,  
89 2019; Schoilew et al., 2019]. According to Marsh [2018] there is specificity in terms of caries aetiology  
90 biochemical function, despite the lack of bacterial name specificity; but organisms are highly relevant  
91 to understand the structure, function, and dynamics of the members in a microbial consortium [Mark  
92 Welch, 2016]. Considering the dental caries polymicrobial aetiology and complex dental biofilm  
93 ecosystem [Simón-Soro et al., 2014; Mark Welch, 2016; Xiao et al., 2016; He et al., 2017], and that  
94 microbiota composition is not the same on different surfaces [Aas et al., 2008; Simón-Soro et al., 2014;  
95 Richards et al., 2017; Espinoza et al., 2018; Schoilew et al., 2019], we proposed to characterize the  
96 functional active microbiome composition and diversity of supragingival biofilms in caries-free, caries-  
97 inactive, and in three different dental conditions from caries-active subjects.

## 98 **Subjects, Materials and Methods**

### 99 Study Population and subjects

100 Subjects (19.3±29.6 years old) were selected at the Federal University of Rio Grande do Sul (UFRGS,  
101 Porto Alegre, Brazil). This research is a collaboration between the Biochemistry and Microbiology Oral  
102 Laboratories (LABIM/UFRGS) and the Division of Oral Biology, at the University of Leeds, United  
103 Kingdom. The inclusion criteria were the absence of using antimicrobial agents for at least two months  
104 before sample collections, and complete permanent dentition (age≥12). In the first appointment,  
105 caries diagnostic was performed by visual-tactile method (Nyvad criteria), after dental prophylaxis,  
106 isolation (cotton rolls) and teeth air-drying, by two calibrated examiners (LDE and NDT). The lesion was  
107 diagnosed as follow: Active non-cavitated lesion (ANCL): whitish/yellowish opaque surface, exhibiting  
108 a chalky or white appearance; the surface felt rough by probing; Inactive non-cavitated lesion (INCL):  
109 shiny and felt smooth surface on gentle probing, and colour varying from whitish to brownish or black  
110 [Kidd and Fejerskov, 2004]. After caries diagnosis, subjects were allocated in the following groups,  
111 according to their caries activity (Figure 1): CA (caries-active subjects) (n=10): DMF-T/S ≥ 1, presenting  
112 at least one active non-cavitated caries lesions; CI (caries-inactive subjects) (n=6): DMF-T/S ≥ 1, but  
113 presenting only inactive non-cavitated caries lesions and any active caries lesion; CF (caries-free  
114 subjects) (n=6): DMF-T/DMF-S=0.

### 115 Sample collection and storage

116 The subjects were not treated with topical antimicrobial agents, and any recommendation to change  
117 diet or dental hygiene method was done at the first appointment. After one week, subjects returned  
118 to collect dental biofilm. They refrained from teeth brushing for 12 hours, and from eating and drinking  
119 for at least one-hour prior sample collection. Samples of supragingival biofilm (SB) were collected with  
120 sterilized Gracey curette. From CA, 3 conditions were sampled: sites presenting ANCL; sites presenting  
121 INCL; and sound enamel surfaces (S) (samples were pooled from enamel surfaces/lesions with the  
122 same characteristics from the same subject); from CI, only INCL were collected; and from CF, a pool of  
123 biofilm from S were sampled. The samples were immediately treated into 1 mL RNA stabilization  
124 solution (RNAlater, Ambion Inc., Cambridgeshire, UK) at room temperature (until 24 hours);  
125 centrifuged (5 minutes; 10.000 rpm); pelleted, and frozen at -80°C until further processing.

### 126 RNA Extraction and Quantification

127 UltraClean® Microbial RNA Isolation kit (Mo-bio, San Diego, USA; DNase digestion Qiagen, Inc) as  
128 described elsewhere [Damé-Teixeira et al., 2019], with a previous treatment with Lysozyme (10  
129 minutes; 37°C). RNA measurement was performed (Quant-iT™ RiboGreen® RNA Reagent and Kit;  
130 Invitrogen, Ltd.; spectrofluorometer with excitation ~480 nm, and emission ~520 nm). Samples with  
131 total RNA concentration less than 30 ng/uL were excluded from analysis.

### 132 Library preparation and RNA-sequencing

133 The True Seq® Sample Preparation Guide, Low Sample (LS) Protocol Illumina (Illumina, Inc., San Diego,  
134 CA) was used for genomic library preparations and Agilent Technologies 2200 TapeStation was used  
135 for genomic library quality validation. The double strand DNA was quantified with Quant-iT™

136 PicoGreen® dsDNA Kit (Turner BioSystems, Inc., CA) before sequencing at the Illumina HiSeq3000  
137 (Illumina Inc.) (2x150bp).

#### 138 Bioinformatic analysis

139 The sequences were filtered, excluding the ones <150 bp and an expected error >0.5. The resulting  
140 FASTA files were submitted to Metagenomics RAST Server (MG-RAST) [Meyer et al., 2008], that  
141 generates taxonomic and functional categories graphs. The MG-RAST pipeline options included a  
142 sequence data trimming to remove low quality reads (phred score=15) [Cox et al., 2011]. Artificial  
143 replicate sequences produced by sequencing artifacts were removed (dereplication) [Gomez-Alvarez  
144 et al., 2009]. A screening to remove human host sequences using DNA level matching with bowtie was  
145 selected to *H. sapiens*, NCBI v36 [Langmead et al., 2009]. A phylogenetic reconstruction was computed  
146 from a set of hits against SILVA SSU database, considering 97% of similarity to genus taxonomic level.

#### 147 Statistical analysis

148 Kruskal-Wallis test, post-hoc Bonferroni and Nemenyi, compared the average number of reads for all  
149 groups. Friedman test, post-hoc Nemenyi, compared the composition profile and bacterial diversity  
150 among CA sites (paired analysis). Mann-Whitney U test with a Benjamini-Hockenberg correction for  
151 multiple comparisons compared INCL-CA versus INCL-CI; S-CA versus S-CF; and CA versus CF subjects.  
152 The significance level was 95%. Richness estimators (Chao-1; ACE: Abundance-based Coverage  
153 Estimator), and indexes (Shannon-Wiener; Simpson; Pielou-Shannon) were used for alpha diversity  
154 analysis. The K-means clustering beta-diversity analysis compared healthy and diseased conditions,  
155 and metric Multidimensional Distance Scaling (mMDS/PCoA: Principal components analysis) using  
156 average of log2 fold change (avg(logFC)) compared all groups. A Venn diagram was generated using  
157 the gplots package (RStudio). Shared genera present in all subjects (100% core threshold) were defined  
158 as the core microbiome (Xiao et al., 2016). All analyses were conducted in RStudio (version 3.5.0) using  
159 packages for ecological data analysis (Vegan, BiodiversityR, Phyloseq).

## 160 Results

161 The characteristics of the included subjects are shown in Table 1. From 22 subjects, a total of 42 SB  
162 samples were collected to analysis. However, lost of samples occurred due to insufficient total RNA  
163 recovered, low quality of the library prep or insufficient reads recovered (Figure 1).

164 A good coverage >97% was obtained in the sequencing. The rarefaction curve considering the average  
165 of sequences count can be observed is shown in the supplementary Figure 1. After data trimming and  
166 quality filtering of reads by removing artifacts an average of 3,542,190 high-quality sequences with  
167 147.7±3.7 base pairs (bp) were recovered, corresponding to 16.48% of sequences generated.

168 There were recovered reads from domain Archaea (mean= 2.76 reads), Bacteria (mean= 8602231.96  
169 reads), Eukaryota (mean= 72118.12 reads), Viruses (mean= 758.28 reads) and unclassified sequences  
170 (mean= 65841.56 reads) (supplementary Figure 2). Bacteria were the most abundant domain.

171 The ≥ 1% relative abundance of OTUs to phylum are detailed in Table 2. Of 29 phyla recovered  
172 (supplementary Figure 3 and supplementary Table 1), *Bacteroidetes* was less abundant in INCL-CI  
173 compared to INCL-CA (p<0.05) (Table 2; supplementary Table 1). We recovered 915 genera, 18

174 representing >1% relative abundance (Table 3); *Capnocytophaga* was less abundant in INCL-CI  
175 compared to INCL-CA ( $p < 0.05$ ) (Table 3). Also, 123 genera were shared in all sites and subjects,  
176 revealing a common core microbiome (Figure 2; supplementary Table 2). The low abundant  
177 microbiome ( $\geq 0.1\%$  and  $< 1\%$ ) corresponded to 74 genera (8.09%).

178 Paired analysis from sites of the CA (ANCL, INCL and S) revealed *Actinomyces* genera higher abundant  
179 in CA-ANCL (relative abundance = 20.83%) compared to CA-S (relative abundance = 9.63%) (Friedman  
180 test; Nemenyi post-hoc;  $p < 0.05$ ). *Capnocytophaga* showed significant higher abundance in CA-INCL  
181 (relative abundance = 14.88%) compared to CA-ANCL (relative abundance = 4.82%) (Friedman test;  
182 Nemenyi post-hoc;  $p < 0.05$ ). No statistical difference was observed for other genera in these group  
183 (CA), considering relative abundance cutoff point of 0.1% (data not showed).

184 The Chao1, ACE (Abundance-based Coverage Estimator) did not reveal difference in OTU's richness  
185 between the sample groups (Figure 3). Shannon-Wiener, Simpson, and Pielou-Shannon alpha diversity  
186 indices revealed similar intrapersonal bacteriome among ANCL, INCL and S sites from CA subjects; and,  
187 between INCL-CA and INCL-CI groups (Figure 4). The bacteriome between sound sites from CA (S-CA)  
188 and CF (S-CF) subjects, and CA and CF groups was less diverse in diseased condition and showed less  
189 evenness compared to the healthy ones (Figure 5).

190 Sites from CA were closer each other compared to CI and CF (Figure 6). The MDS1 explain 37.4% of the  
191 variation observed, and MDS2 explain 28% of the variation. However, the samples did not form well-  
192 separated clusters corresponding to the five groups, suggesting that the bacterial structures in healthy  
193 and caries groups were similar. *Corynebacterium*, *Capnocytophaga*, and *Actinomyces* clustered  
194 together presenting high abundance in health and disease conditions; *Veillonella* was associated with  
195 disease, and *Prevotella* to health (supplementary Figure 4).

196 Functional analysis revealed 2,467 unique KO numbers found for all the genes. In the CA, 2,364 unique  
197 KO numbers were expressed (ANCL-CA=1,877; INCL-CA=1,464; S-CA=2,100); in the CI, 1,325 from INCL;  
198 and, in the CF, 1,662 (supplementary Tables 3 and 4). Essential components of the glycolytic pathway,  
199 as glyceraldehyde 3-phosphate dehydrogenase, enolase, formate C-acetyltransferase, fructose-  
200 bisphosphate aldolase and phosphoglycerate kinase, were among highly expressed genes in dental  
201 biofilm microbiome from active group (supplementary Table 4).

## 202 Discussion/Conclusion

203 This study revealed, for the first time, the metabolically active bacteriome from whole SB in dental  
204 health and enamel caries. We demonstrate the bacteriome composition and diversity from caries-  
205 active, caries-inactive, and caries-free subjects. Our study confirms that high bacterial diversity in the  
206 biofilm samples, identified from RNA-seq analysis (RNA-based) is related to live organisms in SB and  
207 not due to dead/inactive species, highlighting polymicrobial dental caries aetiology, where  
208 multispecies microbial consortia are metabolically active in lesions [Simón-Soro et al.; 2014]. The  
209 functional analysis of unique KO numbers confirms a functionally active state of the microbiome in the  
210 dental biofilms (supplementary data).

211 An average of 21,855,554 high-quality sequences were obtained from all groups, which was higher  
212 than previously reported [Benítez-Páez et al., 2014; Simon-Soro et al., 2014]. The good coverage of



213 >97% suggested that sequencing depth was sufficient to full SB diversity estimation, indicating that  
214 extremely low rare genera abundance could be detected. We observed few >1% relative abundance  
215 genera in all groups, and a great portion of very low abundant genera. The functional redundancy  
216 feature of microbiota, inherent to related species, may explain the human microbiome inter-individual  
217 variability. The interpersonal microbial composition variability extension, within and across varied  
218 dental plaque niches, is largely uncharacterized, but these factors are likely to directly contribute to  
219 the disparate results obtained from various studies examining dental caries [Benítez-Páez et al., 2014;  
220 Simon-Soro et al., 2014; Mark Welch et al., 2016, Xiao et al., 2016; Espinoza et al., 2018; Wolff et al.,  
221 2019].

222 The abundance differences observed in microbial communities may result from real differences among  
223 individuals, fluctuations within a single individual over time, or a combination of the two [Mark Welch  
224 et al., 2016]. The dental plaque “hedgehog” structured consortia described by Mark Welch et al.  
225 [2016], indicate that, its structure composition and organisms across many individuals are highly  
226 relevant to understand organization, function, and dynamics of consortium members. In our research,  
227 123 genera formed a “core microbiome”. Its existence was first proposed by Turnbaugh et al. [2007]  
228 and referred to organisms, genes, or functions shared by all or most individuals in a given human  
229 habitat, such as the oral cavity. Considering the polymicrobial aspect of caries we can suggest that a  
230 shared community should be modulated during metabolic alterations in host and in local niche driving  
231 to healthy or diseased conditions, corroborating with the ecological plaque hypothesis proposed by  
232 Marsh [1991] and the extended concept proposed by Takahashi and Nyvad [2011].

233 Our study supports that supragingival ecological niche is a highly selective environment once we  
234 observed four phyla higher than 10% abundance, among 29 phyla in these bacteriomes [Keijsers et al.,  
235 2008; Benítez-Páez et al., 2014; Xiao et al., 2016; Eriksson et al., 2017; Jiang et al., 2019]. The dominant  
236 phyla were *Actinobacteria*, *Firmicutes*, *Bacteroidetes* and *Fusobacteria*. *Bacteroidetes* was higher  
237 abundant in INCL from CA than CI subjects. *Bacteroidetes* had been retrieved among abundant phyla  
238 from dental plaque microbiome, but show a variable abundance, sometimes first or second most  
239 abundant [Johansson et al., 2015; Xiao et al., 2016; Eriksson et al., 2017; Jiang et al., 2019], sometimes  
240 moderate or low abundant [Gross et al., 2010; He et al., 2017], suggesting a high genera and species  
241 adaptability that make up this phylum.

242 *Actinomyces*, *Corynebacterium*, and *Capnocytophaga* presented >10% relative abundance from all 915  
243 recovered genera. *Capnocytophaga* was more abundant in INCL from CA than CI subjects, indicating  
244 that this genus was the most abundant of *Bacteroidetes* phyla. In DNA-based approaches it has been  
245 highly retrieved from health conditions [Aas et al., 2008; He et al., 2017; Jiang et al., 2019]. Eriksson et  
246 al. [2018] demonstrated that dental plaque members, including *Capnocytophaga*, can be disease-  
247 related in microbiomes with extreme low or no detectable *Streptococcus mutans*, suggesting microbial  
248 community mutualistic relationship. When a metabolite is used by different microorganisms, a  
249 metabolic communication that drives a positive or negative regulatory effect into the microbiome is  
250 generated [Hojo et al., 2009]. The fact that biofilms are found in healthy and diseased subjects, the  
251 presence of commensal bacteria, playing important role for the microbiome equilibrium, is suggested.  
252 This fact can be an important explanation for high abundance of *Capnocytophaga* in both diseased and  
253 healthy oral conditions. In the RNA-based study from Benítez-Páez et al. [2014], *Corynebacterium*,  
254 *Actinomyces* and *Neisseria* were the most abundant genera in a community from a 24-hour dental

255 plaque in one dental healthy subject. Our RNA-based study also recovered *Corynebacterium* with high  
256 abundance in health subjects. March Welch et al. [2016] suggest that *Corynebacterium* is the  
257 foundation taxon of dental plaque bacterial consortium, structuring the environment, creating habitat  
258 for other organisms and nucleating a plaque-characteristic consortium. Nyvad and Fejerskov [1987]  
259 observed scattered filamentous cells oriented perpendicularly to the primarily coccus-covered surface  
260 at 24-hour biofilm and a mixed community of abundant filamentous organisms by 48 hours, suggesting  
261 that colonization with *Corynebacterium* may take place around the 24-hour stage in plaque  
262 development. Our samples recovered high abundance of *Corynebacterium* from all sites, and can  
263 represent a well-established microbial community, once the subjects were oriented to remain, at least,  
264 12 hours without dental hygiene. *Actinomyces* was highly represented in ANCL than INCL in CA  
265 subjects. Benítez-Páez et al. [2014] found *Actinomyces* overrepresented in healthy conditions from  
266 RNA-based community. Eriksson et al. [2018] found *Actinomyces* related with disease in microbiome  
267 with extreme low or no detectable *S. mutans*. These results can indicate that these genera have an  
268 important capability for metabolic modulation, adapting itself in different host conditions.  
269 *Streptococcus* and *Actinomyces* are among the early colonizers in dental biofilm formation [Keijsers et  
270 al., 2008; Dige et al., 2009; Marsh and Zaura, 2017]. Mark Welch et al. [2016] demonstrated that  
271 *Actinomyces* can be found near the “hedgehog” structure base, and that *Corynebacterium* attaches in  
272 sites with pre-existent biofilm consisting of *Streptococcus* and *Actinomyces*, and not directly on the  
273 tooth surfaces. This observation can explain the *Actinomyces* high abundance in both, diseased and  
274 healthy conditions.

275 The richness estimators Chao1 and ACE did not differ among all sites and subjects, suggesting a similar  
276 number of genera recovered from all sites. The richness indexes, Shannon-Wiener, Simpson and  
277 Pielou-Shannon revealed similar alpha diversity among sites from CA subjects, and from INCL from CA  
278 and CI subjects. However, sound sites from CA subjects were less diverse and presented less evenness  
279 than CF-S. Higher diversity has been described in healthy sites by several ecologic studies [Gross et al.,  
280 2010; Benitez-Paez et al., 2014; Simón-Soro et al., 2014; Xiao et al., 2016; Schoilew et al., 2019; Wolff  
281 et al., 2019]. The lowering of the pH, from lactate produced by acid-producing species, could lead to  
282 suppression of acid-sensitive species and overgrowth of acid-tolerant species, resulting in decreased  
283 bacterial diversity in supragingival plaques as caries progresses, as well as a decreasing number of  
284 species capable of surviving harsh conditions [Gross et al., 2010]. Bacteriome in diseased condition  
285 presented significantly less diversity, higher dominance of rare genera, and showed less evenness than  
286 healthy ones, suggesting interpersonal variability.

287 In our study, *Veillonella* was associated with disease, and *Prevotella* to health conditions. *Prevotella*  
288 and *Veillonella* species could be recovered from both healthy and diseased conditions [Gross et al.,  
289 2012; Richards et al., 2017; Wolff et al., 2019]. These findings support that the degree of dominance  
290 of pathogens depends on environmental factors during progression of the disease and not only of the  
291 disease status [Wolff et al., 2019]. *Corynebacterium*, *Capnocytophaga*, and *Actinomyces* clustered  
292 together presenting high abundance in both conditions. Utter et al. [2016] described plaque  
293 microbiome characterized by a community stability showing variability in the relative abundance of  
294 members of the community and between individuals and over time. They found *Corynebacterium*,  
295 *Capnocytophaga*, *Fusobacterium*, *Actinomyces* and *Streptococcus* relatively abundant and constant  
296 among individuals. In the “hedgehog” structure, Mark Welch et al. [2016] observed nine taxa as regular  
297 participants, including these above mentioned. The same nine genera presented higher abundance in

298 our supragingival microbiome analysis, proving that our analysis obtained a good picture of  
299 supragingival active microbiome.

300 We observed a tendency for CA sites cluster together and distant from CI and CF subjects. The mMDS  
301 (betadiversity analysis) could explain 37.4% of distance among groups, by the x-axis, and 28% by the  
302 y-axis, exhibiting very similar communities' structures. However, it is important to analyse the  
303 composition of genera into different microbiomes. Jiang et al. [2019] found a difference in niches but  
304 did not observe clear differences among dental microbiome from active and caries free subjects.  
305 Richards et al. [2017] observed more similar CA communities in different site-specific conditions than  
306 communities from CF subjects. The authors highlight the concept of plaque communities as a part of  
307 a larger ecosystem and that the changes in the structure of one community may eventually affect  
308 another, reinforcing the importance of site-specific studies.

### 309 Conclusion

310 We concluded that the functional active microbiome in supragingival bacterial community profiles  
311 show intra-individual similarities but were more diverse at inter-individual levels. The differences in  
312 bacterial composition may indicate that the individual's healthy/diseased status matters more than  
313 sites. We suggest that alterations from supragingival microbial communities should be analysed, from  
314 a longitudinal way, in caries diseased subjects for a better comprehensive understanding of this  
315 ecological process.

## 316 **Acknowledgement**

317 The authors acknowledge the investigative group of the Biochemistry and Microbiology Laboratory  
318 (LABIM) of Federal University of Rio Grande do Sul (UFRGS), the study staff, and all study  
319 participants, as well as the team from the Division of Oral Biology laboratory, University of Leeds, and  
320 the team of Genomics facility at Leeds St James' Teaching Hospital, Leeds, United Kingdom. This work  
321 was supported by the Brazilian National Counsel of Technological and Scientific Development (CNPQ)  
322 [grant number 482504/2013-7]; the Coordination for the Improvement of Higher-Level Education  
323 (CAPES) grant number 201642/2015-8]; and the Rio Grande do Sul State Foundation for Research  
324 Support (FAPERGS) [grant number 001/2013–PQG].

## 325 **Statement of Ethics**

326 This study had Ethics Committee of Federal University of Rio Grande do Sul (UFRGS) approval (CAAE  
327 56583316.8.0000.5347). All subjects provided informed consent or assent participation (Resolution  
328 466/2012, National Commission of Ethic in Research, Department of National Health, Brazil). All  
329 patients received dental treatment at UFRGS.

## 330 **Conflict of Interest Statement**

331 “The authors have no conflicts of interest to declare.”

## 332 **Funding Sources**

333 This study was developed in partnership with the University of Leeds and the Federal University of  
334 Rio Grande do Sul (UFRGS). Financial support was provided by the Brazilian National Counsel of  
335 Technological and Scientific Development (CNPQ) (process no. 482504/2013-7), the Coordination for  
336 the Improvement of Higher-Level Education (CAPES) (process 201642/2015-8), and the Rio Grande  
337 do Sul State Foundation for Research Support (FAPERGS) (process no. 001/2013–PQG), and Leeds  
338 Teaching Hospitals Charitable Foundation (R&D/PP/12011), the Dunhill Medical Trust (R245/0212).

339 **Author Contributions**

340 DJ. Corralo, contributed to design, data analysis and interpretation, drafted and critically revised the  
341 manuscript; LD. Ev, contributed to conception, design, samples acquisition, data analysis, and  
342 critically revised the manuscript; N. Damé-Teixeira, contributed to conception, design, samples  
343 acquisition, data analysis, interpretation, and critically revised the manuscript; M. Maltz, contributed  
344 to conception, design, data analysis, interpretation, drafted and critically revised the manuscript; RA.  
345 Arthur, contributed to conception, design, samples acquisition, samples, and critically revised the  
346 manuscript; T. Do, contributed to conception, design, data analysis, and critically revised the  
347 manuscript; CCF. Parolo, contributed to conception, design, samples acquisition, data analysis,  
348 interpretation, drafted and critically revised the manuscript. All authors gave final approval and agree  
349 to be accountable for all aspects of the work.

## References [Alphabetical]

- 350 Aas JA, Griffen AL, Dardis SR, Lee AM, Olsen I, Dewhirst FE, Leys EJ, Paster BJ: Bacteria of dental  
351 caries in primary and permanent teeth in children and young adults. *J Clin Microbiol* 2008;46:1407-  
352 17. doi: 10.1128/JCM.01410-07
- 353 Aas JA, Paster BJ, Stokes LN, Olsen I, Dewhirst FE: Defining the normal bacterial flora of the oral  
354 cavity. *J Clin Microbiol* 2005;43:5721-32. doi: 10.1128/JCM.43.11.5721-5732.2005
- 355 Arweiler NB, Netuschil L: The Oral Microbiota. *Adv Exp Med Biol* 2016;902:45-60. doi: 10.1007/978-  
356 3-319-31248-4\_4
- 357 Benítez-Páez A, Belda-Ferre P, Simón-Soro A, Mira A: Microbiota diversity and gene expression  
358 dynamics in human oral biofilms. *BMC Genomics* 2014;15:311. doi: 10.1186/1471-2164-15-311
- 359 Bjørndal L, Simon S, Tomson P.L, Duncan HF: Management of deep caries and the exposed pulp. *Int*  
360 *Endod J* 2019;52:949–973. doi: <https://doi.org/10.1111/iej.13128>
- 361 Consortium HMP: Structure, function and diversity of the healthy human microbiome. *Nature*  
362 2012;486:207-14. doi: <https://doi.org/10.1038/nature11234>
- 363 Cox MP, Peterson DA, Biggs PJ: SolexaQA: At-a-glance quality assessment of Illumina second-  
364 generation sequencing data. *BMC Bioinformatics* 2010;11:485. doi: <https://doi.org/10.1186/1471-2105-11-485>
- 366 Damé-Teixeira N, Deng D, Do T: Streptococcus mutans transcriptome in the presence of sodium  
367 fluoride and sucrose. *Arch Oral Biol* 2019;102:186-192. doi:  
368 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.archoralbio.2019.04.020>
- 369 Dige I, Grønkjær L, Nyvad B: Molecular studies of the structural ecology of natural occlusal caries.  
370 *Caries Res* 2014;48:451-60. doi: <https://doi.org/10.1159/000357920>
- 371 Eriksson L, Lif Holgerson P, Esberg A, Johansson I: Microbial Complexes and Caries in 17-Year-Olds  
372 with and without Streptococcus mutans. *J Dent Res* 2018;97:275-282. doi:  
373 10.1177/0022034517731758
- 374 Eriksson L, Lif Holgerson P, Johansson I: Saliva and tooth biofilm bacterial microbiota in adolescents  
375 in a low caries community. *Sci Rep* 2017;7:5861. doi: <https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-017-06221-z>
- 376 Espinoza JL, Harkins DM, Torralba M, Gomez A, Highlander SK., Jones MB, et al.: Supragingival Plaque  
377 Microbiome Ecology and Functional Potential in the Context of Health and Disease. *MBio*  
378 2018;9:e01631-18. doi: 10.1128/mBio.01631-18
- 379 Filoche S, Wong L, Sissons CH: Oral biofilms: emerging concepts in microbial ecology. *J Dent Res*  
380 2010;89:8-18. doi: 10.1177/0022034509351812
- 381 Fitzgerald RJ, Keyes PH: Demonstration of the etiologic role of streptococci in experimental caries in  
382 the hamster. *J Am Dent Assoc* 1960;61:9-19. doi: 10.14219/jada.archive.1960.0138
- 383 Gibbons RJ, Socransky SS, DeAraujo WC, VanHoute J: Studies of the predominant cultivable  
384 microbiota of dental plaque. *Arch Oral Biol* 1964;9:365-70. doi: [https://doi.org/10.1016/0003-9969\(64\)90069-X](https://doi.org/10.1016/0003-9969(64)90069-X)
- 386 Gomez-Alvarez V, Teal TK, Schmidt TM: Systematic artifacts in metagenomes from complex microbial  
387 communities. *ISME J* 2009;3:1314-1317. doi: 10.1038/ismej.2009.72
- 388 Gross EL, Leys EJ, Gasparovich SR, Firestone ND, Schwartzbaum JA, Janies DA, Asnani K, Griffen AL:  
389 Bacterial 16S sequence analysis of severe caries in young permanent teeth. *J Clin Microbiol*  
390 2010;48:4121-8. doi: 10.1128/JCM.01232-10

391 He J, Tu Q, Ge Y, Qin Y, Cui B, Hu X, Wang Y, Deng Y, Wang K, Van Nostrand JD, et al.: Taxonomic and  
392 Functional Analyses of the Supragingival Microbiome from Caries-Affected and Caries-Free Hosts.  
393 *Microb Ecol* 2018;75:543-554. doi: 10.1007/s00248-017-1056-1

394 Henne K, Gunesch AP, Walther C, Meyer-Lueckel H, Conrads G, Esteves-Oliveira M: Analysis of  
395 Bacterial Activity in Sound and Cariogenic Biofilm: A Pilot in vivo Study. *Caries Res* 2016;50:480-488.  
396 doi: 10.1159/000448485

397 Hojo K, Nagaoka S, Ohshima T, Maeda N: Bacterial interactions in dental biofilm development. *J Dent*  
398 *Res* 2009;88:982-90. doi: 10.1177/0022034509346811

399 Jiang Q, Liu J, Chen L, Gan N, Yang D: The Oral Microbiome in the Elderly with Dental Caries and  
400 Health. *Front Cell Inf Microb* 2018;8:442. doi: 10.3389/fcimb.2018.00442

401 Johansson I, Witkowska E, Kaveh B, Lif Holgerson P, Tanner AC: The Microbiome in Populations with  
402 a Low and High Prevalence of Caries. *J Dent Res* 2016;95:80-6. doi: 10.1177/0022034515609554

403 Keijser BJ, Zaura E, Huse SM, van der Vossen JM, Schuren FH, Montijn RC, ten Cate JM, Crielaard W:  
404 Pyrosequencing analysis of the oral microflora of healthy adults. *J Dent Res* 2008;87:1016-20. doi:  
405 10.1177/154405910808701104

406 Kidd EA, Fejerskov: What constitutes dental caries? Histopathology of carious enamel and dentin  
407 related to the action of cariogenic biofilms. *J Dent Res* 2004;83:C35-8. doi:  
408 10.1177/154405910408301s07

409 Krasse B, Edwardsson S, Svensson I, Trell L: Implantation of caries-inducing streptococci in the  
410 human oral cavity. *Arch Oral Biol* 1967;12:231-6. doi: [https://doi.org/10.1016/0003-9969\(66\)90107-](https://doi.org/10.1016/0003-9969(66)90107-5)  
411 [5](https://doi.org/10.1016/0003-9969(66)90107-5)

412 Langmead B, Trapnell C, Pop M, Salzberg SL: Ultrafast and memory-efficient alignment of short DNA  
413 sequences to the human genome. *Gen Biol* 2009;10:R25. doi: 10.1186/gb-2009-10-3-r25

414 Loesche WJ: Role of *Streptococcus mutans* in human dental decay. *Microbiol Rev* 1986;50:353-80.  
415 PMID: 3540569; PMCID: PMC373078.

416 Loesche WJ, Rowan J, Straffon LH, Loos PJ: Association of *Streptococcus mutans* with human dental  
417 decay. *Infect Immun* 1975;11:1252-60. PMCID: PMC415207

418 Mark Welch JL, Rossetti BJ, Rieken CW, Dewhirst FE, Borisy GG: Biogeography of a human oral  
419 microbiome at the micron scale. *Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A* 2016;113:E791-800. doi:  
420 <https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1522149113>

421 Marsh PD: Microbial ecology of dental plaque and its significance in health and disease. *Adv Dent*  
422 *Res* 1994;8:263-71. doi: 10.1177/08959374940080022001

423 Marsh PD: In Sickness and in Health-What Does the Oral Microbiome Mean to Us? An Ecological  
424 Perspective. *Adv Dent Res* 2018;29:60-65. doi: 10.1177/0022034517735295

425 Marsh PD, Zaura E: Dental biofilm: ecological interactions in health and disease. *J Clin Periodontol*  
426 2017;44:S12-S22. doi: 10.1111/jcpe.12679

427 Meyer F, Paarmann D, D'Souza M, Olson R, Glass EM, Kubal M, Paczian T, Rodriguez A, Stevens R,  
428 Wilke A, et al.: The metagenomics RAST server - a public resource for the automatic phylogenetic  
429 and functional analysis of metagenomes. *BMC Bioinformatics* 2008;9:386. doi:  
430 <https://doi.org/10.1186/1471-2105-9-386>

431 Nascimento MM, Zaura E, Mira A, Takahashi N, Ten Cate JM: Second Era of OMICS in Caries  
432 Research: Moving Past the Phase of Disillusionment. *J Dent Res* 2017;96:733-740. doi:  
433 10.1177/0022034517701902

434 Nyvad B, Fejerskov O: Scanning electron microscopy of early microbial colonization of human enamel  
435 and root surfaces in vivo. *Scand J Dent Res* 1987;95:287-96. doi: 10.1111/j.1600-  
436 0722.1987.tb01844.x

437 Orland FJ, Blayney JR, Harrison RW, Reyniers JA, Trexler PC, Wagner M, et al.: Use of the germfree  
438 animal technic in the study of experimental dental caries. I. Basic observations on rats reared free of  
439 all microorganisms. *J Dent Res* 1954;33:147-74. doi: 10.1177/00220345540330020201

440 Paes Leme AF, Koo H, Bellato CM, Bedi G, Cury JA: The role of sucrose in cariogenic dental biofilm  
441 formation-new insight. *J Dent Res* 2006;85:878-87. doi: 10.1177/154405910608501002

442 Padmanaban A. End to end sample quality control for next generation sequencing library  
443 preparation and sure select target enrichment on the Agilent 2200 TapeStation system. 2014;1.  
444 Accessible in: <https://www.agilent.com/cs/library/applications/5991-3654EN.pdf>

445 Richards VP, Alvarez AJ, Luce AR, Bedenbaugh M, Mitchell ML, Burne RA, et al.: Microbiomes of Site-  
446 Specific Dental Plaques from Children with Different Caries Status. *Inf Immunity* 2017;85:e00106-17.  
447 doi: 10.1128/IAI.00106-17

448 Schoilew K, Ueffing H, Dalpke A, Wolff B, Frese C, Wolff D, et al.: Bacterial biofilm composition in  
449 healthy subjects with and without caries experience. *J Oral Microb* 2019;11:1633194. doi:  
450 10.1080/20002297.2019.1633194

451 Simón-Soro A, Guillen-Navarro M, Mira A: Metatranscriptomics reveals overall active bacterial  
452 composition in caries lesions. *J Oral Microbiol* 2014;6:25443. doi: 10.3402/jom.v6.25443

453 Simón-Soro A, Tomás I, Cabrera-Rubio R, Catalan MD, Nyvad B, Mira A: Microbial geography of the  
454 oral cavity. *J Dent Res* 2013;92:616-21. doi: 10.1177/0022034513488119

455 Solbiati J, Frias-Lopez J: Metatranscriptome of the Oral Microbiome in Health and Disease. *J Dent Res*  
456 2018;97:492-500. doi: 10.1177/0022034518761644

457 Takahashi N, Nyvad B: The role of bacteria in the caries process: ecological perspectives. *J Dent Res*  
458 2011;90:294-303. doi: 10.1177/0022034510379602

459 Turnbaugh PJ, Ley RE, Hamady M, Fraser-Liggett CM, Knight R, Gordon JI: The human microbiome  
460 project. *Nature* 2007;449:804-810. doi: <https://doi.org/10.1038/nature06244>

461 Wolff D, Frese C, Schoilew K, Dalpke A, Wolff B, Boutin S: Amplicon-based microbiome study  
462 highlights the loss of diversity and the establishment of a set of species in patients with dentin  
463 caries. *PLOS One* 2019;14:e0219714. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0219714

464 Xiao C, Ran S, Huang Z, Liang J: Bacterial Diversity and Community Structure of Supragingival Plaques  
465 in Adults with Dental Health or Caries Revealed by 16S Pyrosequencing. *Front Microbiol*  
466 2016;7:1145. doi: 10.3389/fmicb.2016.01145

467 Yarza P, Richter M, Peplies J, Euzéby J, Amann R, Schleifer KH, et al.: The All-Species Living Tree  
468 project: a 16S rRNA-based phylogenetic tree of all sequenced type strains. *Syst Appl Microbiol*  
469 2008;31:241-50. doi: 10.1016/j.syapm.2008.07.001

470 Zaura E, Keijser BJ, Huse SM, Crielaard W: Defining the healthy "core microbiome" of oral microbial  
471 communities. *BMC Microbiol* 2009;9:259. doi: <https://doi.org/10.1186/1471-2180-9-259Examples>



## Figure Legends

Fig. 1. Flow chart showing the number of subjects enrolled and allocated to groups.

Fig. 2. Venn diagram showing shared and unique OTU abundances at 97% identity, for genus taxonomic level, among supragingival biofilm from caries active subjects (ANCL-CA: active non-cavitated lesion; INCL-CA: inactive non-cavitated lesion; S-CA: sound); caries inactive subjects (INCL-CI: inactive non-cavitated lesion); and caries-free subjects (S-CF: sound).

Fig. 3. Richness estimators Chao 1 and ACE (Abundance-based Coverage Estimator) among different dental surfaces from caries-active (CA) subjects (ANCL: active non-cavitated lesions; INCL: inactive non-cavitated lesions; S: sound surfaces) (A); between inactive sites (INCL) from CA and caries-inactive (CI) subjects (B); and between CA and caries-free (CF) subjects (C). Mann-Whitney U test, 95% confidence level.

Fig. 4. Alpha diversity indexes Shannon-Wiener, Simpson, and Pielou-Shannon among different dental surfaces from caries-active (CA) subjects (ANCL: active non-cavitated lesions; INCL: inactive non-cavitated lesions; S: sound surfaces) (A); and, between inactive sites (INCL) from CA and caries-inactive (CI) subjects (B). Mann-Whitney U test, 95% confidence level.

Fig. 5. Alpha diversity indexes Shannon-Wiener, Simpson, and Pielou-Shannon between sound sites from caries-active (S-CA) and caries-free (S-CF) subjects (A); and, from caries-active (CA) and caries-free (CF) groups (B). Mann-Whitney U test, 95% confidence level.

Fig. 6. Metric Multidimensional Scaling Ordination (mMDS/PCoA) among supragingival biofilms communities from all groups. Each sample is represented by a diamond. Black square represents the active non-cavitated lesions from caries active subjects (ANCL-CA). Horizontal black lines diamond represents the inactive non-cavitated lesions from caries active subjects (INCL-CA). Chess circle represents the sound surfaces from caries active subjects (S-CA). Black diamond represents the inactive non-cavitated lesions from caries inactive subjects (INCL-CI). Gray circle represents the sound surfaces from caries-free subjects (S-CF). mMDS using average of log2 fold change (avg(logFC)).