

This is a repository copy of Dynamics and multi-annual fate of atmospherically deposited nitrogen in montane tropical forests.

White Rose Research Online URL for this paper: https://eprints.whiterose.ac.uk/170392/

Version: Accepted Version

Article:

Wang, A, Chen, D, Phillips, OL orcid.org/0000-0002-8993-6168 et al. (8 more authors) (2021) Dynamics and multi-annual fate of atmospherically deposited nitrogen in montane tropical forests. Global Change Biology, 27 (10). pp. 2076-2087. ISSN 1354-1013

https://doi.org/10.1111/gcb.15526

Reuse

Items deposited in White Rose Research Online are protected by copyright, with all rights reserved unless indicated otherwise. They may be downloaded and/or printed for private study, or other acts as permitted by national copyright laws. The publisher or other rights holders may allow further reproduction and re-use of the full text version. This is indicated by the licence information on the White Rose Research Online record for the item.

Takedown

If you consider content in White Rose Research Online to be in breach of UK law, please notify us by emailing eprints@whiterose.ac.uk including the URL of the record and the reason for the withdrawal request.



eprints@whiterose.ac.uk https://eprints.whiterose.ac.uk/

Ι	Dynamics and fate of atmospherically deposited nitrogen in two tropical montane
1	forests over three years
	Ang Wang ^{a, h, 1} , Dexiang Chen ^b , Oliver L. Phillips ^c , Per Gundersen ^d , Xulun Zhou ^{a, e} ,
	Geshere A. Gurmesa ^{a, h, i} , Shanlong Li ^{a, h} , Weixing Zhu ^f , Erik A. Hobbie ^g , Xueyan Wang ^j ,
	Yunting Fang ^{a, h, i, *}
	^a CAS Key Laboratory of Forest Ecology and Management, Institute of Applied
	Ecology, Chinese Academy of Sciences, Shenyang, 110164, China
	^b Hainan Jianfengling Forest Ecosystem National Field Science and Observation
	Station, Research Institute of Tropical Forestry, Chinese Academy of Forestry,
	Guangzhou 510520, China
	^c School of Geography, University of Leeds, Leeds LS2 9JT, UK
	^d Department of Geosciences and Natural Resource Management, University of
	Copenhagen, 1958 Frederiksberg C, Denmark
	^e School of Resources and Civil Engineering, Northeastern University, Shenyang,
	110819, China
	^f Department of Biological Sciences, Binghamton University, The State University of
	New York, Binghamton, New York, 13902, USA
	^g Earth Systems Research Center, Morse Hall, University of New Hampshire, Durham,
	New Hampshire, 03824, USA
	^h Qingyuan Forest CERN, Shenyang, 110016, China
	ⁱ Key Laboratory of Stable Isotope Techniques and Applications, Shenyang, Liaoning
	Province 110016, China
	^j School of Energy and Water Resources, Shenyang Institute of Technology, Fushun,
	113122, China
	*Corresponding author:
	Yunting Fang, Institute of Applied Ecology, Chinese Academy of Sciences, $/2$ wennua
	Road, Snenyang, China 110016. 1ei: $+86-24-83970302$. E-mail: <u>tangyt@iae.ac.cn</u>
	High Kabén
	Highlights
	1 ¹⁵ NIH ⁺ and ¹⁵ NO- ⁻ tracers were applied to two tropical montane forests to explore
	the fotes and redistribution of atmospherically denosited N over three years
	the fates and redistribution of atmosphericany deposited in over three years.
	2 More than 60% of ¹⁵ N tracer was rate and within the two forests over other three
	2. More than 0070 01 IN tracer was retained within the two forests even after three
	ycais.
	3 Ecosystem ¹⁵ N retention was not significantly different between two study forests
	and between two N forms
	1^{-15} N tracer was redistributed over time from the organic soil lower to plants and
	T. IN tracer was redistributed over time from the organic son layer to plants and
	1

- 45 mineral soil.
- 46

47 5. Proportionally more ¹⁵N was distributed to mineral soil and plant in tropical forests
48 while more to organic soil layer in temperate forests.

49

50 Abstract

51

The effects of nitrogen (N) deposition on forest ecosystems largely depends on its fates 52 after entering the ecosystems. Several studies have addressed the fates of N deposition 53 using ¹⁵N tracers, but long-term fate and redistribution of deposited N in tropical forests 54 remains unknown. In this study, we applied ¹⁵N tracers to examine the fates of deposited 55 56 ammonium (NH_4^+) and nitrate (NO_3^-) , separately, over three years in a primary and a secondary tropical montane forests in southern China. Three months after ¹⁵N tracer 57 addition, over 60% of ¹⁵N was retained in our study tropical forests, and the ecosystem 58 retention did not change significantly over the study period. From three months to three 59 years, the ¹⁵N recovery in plants increased from 10% to 19% and 13% to 22% in the 60 primary and secondary forests, respectively, while ¹⁵N recovery in the organic soil layer 61 decreased from 16% to 2% and 9% to 2% over time. Mineral soil retained 50% and 35% 62 in the primary and secondary forests of ¹⁵N, with retention being stable over time. We 63 found no significant difference in ecosystem retention between two N forms, but plants 64 retained more ¹⁵NO₃⁻ than ¹⁵NH₄⁺ and the organic layer retained more ¹⁵NH₄⁺ than 65 $^{15}NO_3$. Mineral soil did not differ in $^{15}NH_4^+$ and $^{15}NO_3^-$ retention. Compared to 66 temperate forests, proportionally more ¹⁵N was distributed to mineral soil and plant in 67 68 our study tropical forests. Overall, our results indicate that atmospherically deposited 69 of both NH4⁺ and NO3⁻ is lost within the first three months, and then can be retained 70 steadily over a relatively longer term within the ecosystem, with retained N being 71redistributed to plants and mineral soil over time from organic soil layer. As a result, we suggest that this N retention may benefit tropical montane forest growth and 72 enhance carbon sequestration from the atmosphere. 73

74

Key words: N deposition; N retention and redistribution; Long-term fate; Tropical
 montane forests; ¹⁵N tracer; Ammonium and nitrate

77

78 Introduction

79

80 Nitrogen (N) is a limiting nutrient that affects primary productivity and ecosystem 81 functions in many terrestrial ecosystems (Vitousek & Howarth, 1991). However, 82 reactive N emitted from human activities such as fossil fuel burning and fertilizer use has tripled N deposition to Earth's terrestrial ecosystems over recent decades 83 (Ackerman et al., 2019; Yu et al. 2019). Increased N deposition could reduce N 84 limitation and promote plant growth in N-limited forest ecosystems. However, once N 85 inputs exceed biotic and abiotic sinks for N, increased N deposition can induce ion 86 imbalances, reduce biodiversity, and acidify soil and water due to losses of nitrate 87 (Gundersen et al., 1998; Aber et al., 2003; Niu et al., 2016; Du et al., 2019). The effects 88

of N deposition on forest ecosystems largely depend on whether and where the 89 deposited N is retained within ecosystems. 90

91

The ¹⁵N tracer method is the only approach currently available to trace and quantify the 92 fate and (re)distribution of deposited N over multi-year periods in forest ecosystems 93 94 (Nadelhoffer et al., 1999a; Templer et al., 2012). Many studies have examined the fate of various forms of ¹⁵N added to forest ecosystems (Feng et al., 2008; Templer et al., 95 2012; Gurmesa et al., 2016; Goodale, 2017; Liu et al., 2017a; Liu et al., 2017b; Wang 96 et al., 2018; Li et al., 2019). However, most studies tracked the deposited N for no more 97 98 than one year and primarily in temperate and boreal forests (see Templer et al., 2012), and they reported that the fate of deposited N varied between temperate and tropical 99 forests, with most added ¹⁵N ended up in the organic soil layer in temperate and boreal 100 forests (Feng et al., 2008; Templer et al., 2012; Goodale, 2017; Liu et al., 2017a; Li et 101 al., 2019) whereas plants and mineral soil were more important sinks in tropical and 102 subtropical forests (Gurmesa et al., 2016; Liu et al., 2017b; Wang et al., 2018). Despite 103 these numerous studies, the long-term retention dynamics of deposited N is uncertain 104 105 since N initially retained in the organic soil layer and mineral soil may redistribute to 106 woody plants (Goodale, 2017), or be lost from the ecosystem (Preston & Mead, 1994; Wessel et al., 2013). To date, only several studies in temperate forests have traced the 107 108 distribution of deposited N more than two years (Preston & Mead, 1994; Nadelhoffer et al., 2004; Krause et al., 2012; Wessel et al., 2013; Goodale, 2017; Li et al., 2019). 109 However, the long-term retention dynamics of deposited N in topical forest ecosystems 110 are poorly understood. Tropical forests cover approximately 12% of the earth's land 111 112 area and play a vital role in sustaining global climate and regulating global N and C 113 cycles (Field et al., 1998; Phillips et al., 1998). Nitrogen deposition has substantially increased in the tropics (Galloway et al., 2008; Bejarano-Castillo et al., 2015; Cusack 114115 et al., 2016; Ackerman et al., 2019). Thus, it is critical to study the long-term fate of deposited N in tropical forests to predict how these ecosystems respond to N deposition. 116

117

Previous short-term ¹⁵N tracer studies have suggested that deposited ¹⁵NH₄⁺ and ¹⁵NO₃⁻ 118 may have different fates since NH4⁺ is more preferable uptake by soil microbes or 119 immobilized in mineral soil while NO3⁻ is more prone to leaching and gaseous loss 120 (Providoli et al., 2006; Jacob & Leuschner, 2015; Liu et al., 2017a; Wang et al., 2018). 121 However, most of long-term ¹⁵N tracer studies focused on ¹⁵NH₄⁺ or ¹⁵NO₃⁻ separately 122 or ¹⁵NH₄¹⁵NO₃ (Providoli et al., 2005; Wessel et al., 2013; Gurmesa et al., 2016; 123 124 Goodale, 2017), the different fates of deposited NH₄⁺ and ¹⁵NO₃ were seldom compared 125 for the same forests over multi-year time scales (Preston et al., 1990; Preston & Mead, 126 1994; Nadelhoffer et al., 2004; Li et al., 2019), especially in tropical forests. Furthermore, few studies have been carried out on different forests within a given site 127 (Nadelhoffer et al., 2004; Li et al., 2019). There may be differences in the patterns of 128 N retention in forests with different successional status due to different species 129 130 composition and N status (Li et al., 2019).

131

In this study, for the first time, we applied ${}^{15}NH_4^+$ and ${}^{15}NO_3^-$ tracers to explore the 132

long-term patterns and mechanisms of retention of deposited NH4⁺ versus NO3⁻ in 133 tropical forests. Two forests with different species composition and N status (Wang et 134 al., 2014), a primary and a secondary tropical montane forests in southern China, were 135selected. Our main objectives were to test: 1) the mechanisms and patterns of retention 136 and redistribution of deposited N over three years, and 2) how different N forms (NH4⁺ 137 138 versus NO₃⁻) and forests (primary versus secondary) influence patterns of retention and redistribution of ¹⁵N. We hypothesized that: (H1) Tropical montane forests would lose 139 the experimentally added ¹⁵N over time due to the rapid N turnover. Even though 140 tropical montane forests are considered to be N-limited (Matson et al., 1999), a previous 141 study shows that in a primary montane forest about 40% of the deposited N was lost 142 during the first year, presumably through rapid hydrologic or gaseous pathways under 143 the hot and humid climate (Wang et al., 2018); (H2) Plants would become a more 144 important sink for N over time as the re-mineralization of organic matter those had 145 initially retained in ¹⁵N tracer; (H3) Plants would retain more NO₃⁻ than NH₄⁺ while 146 soil (organic soil layer and mineral soil) retain more NH_4^+ than NO_3^- ; (H4) We expected 147 lower ¹⁵N retention in the primary forest due to its relatively higher N status than the 148 secondary forest (Wang et al., 2014). 149

150 151

Methods and materials

152

153 Site description

154

155Our study was conducted in the Jianfengling National Natural Reserve, on Hainan Island, southern China. The region is characterized by tropical monsoons climate, with 156 a wet season (from May to October) and a dry season (from November to April). 157 Between 2009 and 2018, annual precipitation averages 2414 mm (from 1637 mm to 158 159 3458 mm), and the mean annual temperature was 19.7 °C. For this study, we selected two major tropical montane forests: a primary forest (18°43'47"N, 108°53'23"E, 160 elevation 893 m) and a secondary forest (18°44′41″N, 108°50′57″E, elevation 935 m). 161 Total inorganic N deposition in bulk precipitation was 6.7 kg N ha⁻¹ yr⁻¹, with the ratio 162 of NH_4^+/NO_3^- being 1, and no fertilization had ever been previously applied. 163

164

The primary forest has never been disturbed by human activities and is dominated by 165 Mallotus hookerianus, Gironniera subaequalis, Cryptocarya chinensis, Nephel 166 iumtopengii and Cyclobalanopsis patelliformis. The secondary forest has developed 167 naturally after a clear-cutting in the 1960s and mainly consists of Castanopsis 168 tonkinensis, Schefflera octophylla, Psychotria rubra and Blastus cochinchinensis. The 169 soil is an acidic lateritic yellow, well-drained soil with the porosity of 52% in the 170 primary forest and 47% in the secondary forest. Soil pH was 4 in both forests. Soil 171texture is similar between the two forests, being sandy clay loam with 57.1% sand, 18.2% 172silt, and 24.7% clay in the primary forest and with 53.8% sand, 12.1% silt, and 34.1% 173174clay in the secondary forest (Fang et al., 2004; Luo et al., 2005).

175

176 Experimental design

178 In each forest, three separate plots (20 m \times 20 m each) were randomly selected. Each plot was divided into two (10 m \times 20 m each), with each subplot receiving a solution 179 of either ¹⁵NH₄NO₃ or NH₄¹⁵NO₃. In April 2015 and 2016, ¹⁵N tracer solutions were 180 sprayed directly on the forest floor using backpack sprayers in the primary forest (Wang 181 et al., 2018) and in the secondary forest to simulate N deposition during the rainfall, 182 respectively. In the primary forest, the quantity of applied ¹⁵N tracers was 25 mg ¹⁵N 183 $m^{-2} \,as \, 99.14$ atom% $^{15} NH_4 NO_3$ and 99.21 atom% $NH_4 ^{15} NO_3.$ In the secondary forest, 184 the labelling method was similar to that used in the primary forest, but the ¹⁵N tracer 185 levels were doubled to 50 mg ¹⁵N m⁻² to increase the ¹⁵N signal further above 186 background levels and trace the long-term fate of deposited N. Yet, the added ¹⁵N tracer 187 188 is relatively small compared to N deposition and ecosystem N pool. Thus, the added ¹⁵N tracer can substantially increase the concentration of ¹⁵N above its natural 189 abundance in all ecosystem pools with minimal disturbance of ecosystem N cycling. 190 The fate of ¹⁵N tracer in the first year was reported previously for the primary forest 191 (Wang et al., 2018) and submitted to review for the secondary forest along with the 192 193 results from 12 other forests (Gurmesa et al., submitted). Here, we reported the fates 194 after three years and compared them with those in the first three months and years and other temperate forests. 195

196

198

177

197 Sampling and chemical analysis

Samples were taken away from the edges to minimize edge effects. Major plant 199 components and soil layers were sampled prior to ¹⁵N tracer application at three months, 200 one year and three years after ¹⁵N tracer application. In the primary forest, samples were 201 also collected at one week and one month after labelling. For plant samples, foliage and 202 203 branches of trees and shrubs were sampled from common species in each subplot. Bark and wood core (3 cm of an exterior portion) were sampled using an increment corer 204 from trees with a diameter at breast height (DBH) above 5 cm. Herbs and organic soil 205 206 layer (mainly consisting of undecomposed plant materials on the soil surface) were sampled using a 20 cm × 20 cm iron frame. Six samples taken randomly in each subplot 207 were mixed into one composited sample. Mineral soil samples were taken using an 208 auger (2.5 cm inner diameter) and divided into three layers (0-10, 10-20, and 20-40 cm). 209 Six soil cores taken randomly in each subplot were mixed into one composite soil by 210 211 soil depth. Living fine roots (< 2 mm, 0-40 cm) were hand-sorted from separate 212 composite soil samples (taken using an auger of 5 cm inner diameter), and then cleaned 213 by deionized water.

214

All plant and organic soil layer samples were oven-dried at 65 °C to constant weight. Mineral soil from each plot was passed through a 2 mm mesh to remove fine roots and coarse fragments and then air-dried at room temperature. All samples were ball-milled and analyzed for ¹⁵N abundance and total N and total C concentrations by elemental analyzer-isotope ratio mass spectrometry at the Institute of Applied Ecology (Elementar Analysen Systeme GmbH, Hanau, Germany; IsoPrime100, IsoPrime limited, Stockport, 221 UK). Calibrated D-glutamic, glycine, acetanilide and histidine were used as references. 222 The analytical precision for δ^{15} N was better than 0.2‰.

223

224 Calculation and Statistical analysis

225

Dry masses of tree or shrub compartments were estimated using allometric equations of mixed-species (Zeng et al., 1997; Chen et al., 2010). Dry masses of herbs, organic layer samples and fine roots were calculated by the weight of the harvested samples. Nitrogen pools of the different tree or shrub tissues, herbs, litters and fine roots were calculated by multiplying dry mass and N concentration of each measured component. Soil N pools were calculated by multiplying soil bulk density at different soil layers, soil depth and the corresponding N concentration.

233

The ¹⁵N tracer recovery in all sampled components of ecosystem was estimated using ¹⁵N tracer mass balances as the following (Nadelhoffer & Fry, 1994):

236 237

$${}^{15}N_{rec} = \frac{(atom\%^{15}N_{sample} - atom\%^{15}N_{ref}) \times N_{pool}}{(atom\%^{15}N_{tracer} - atom\%^{15}N_{ref}) \times N_{tracer}} \times 100\%$$

238

where ${}^{15}N_{rec}$ = percent of ${}^{15}N$ tracer recovered in the labelled N pool; $N_{pool} = N$ pool of each ecosystem compartment; atom% ${}^{15}N_{sample}$ = atom percent ${}^{15}N$ in the labelled sample; atom% ${}^{15}N_{ref}$ = atom percent ${}^{15}N$ in the reference sample (non- ${}^{15}N$ labelled); and atom% ${}^{15}N_{tracer}$ = atom percent ${}^{15}N$ of added tracer; N_{tracer} = the mass of ${}^{15}N$ in the ${}^{15}N$ tracer applied to the plot.

244

The carbon sequestration efficiency stimulated by N deposition (NUE_{dep}) was estimated using the ¹⁵N recoveries of tree woody biomass (including branch, bark, stem and coarse root of trees) and their corresponding C/N ratios, by the following standard stoichiometry approach of Nadelhoffer et al. (1999b):

- 249
- 250 251

 $NUE_{dep} = {}^{15}N_{recovery in wood} \times (C/N)_{wood}$

The differences in ¹⁵N abundance and ¹⁵N recovery between the treatments at each sampling time were tested by the analysis of independent t-tests. Repeated-measures ANOVA was used to test the differences in ¹⁵N abundance and ¹⁵N recovery over time together with forest types and N forms. All analyses were conducted using the SPSS software (version 19.0; SPSS Inc., Chicago, Illinois, U.S.A.) with significance threshold set at $P \le 0.05$.

- 258
- 259 **Results**
- 261 *Ecosystem nitrogen pools and* $\delta^{15}N$ *in the two forests*
- 262

260

²⁶³ The total ecosystem N pool was about 7700 kg N ha⁻¹ in the primary forest and 7100

- kg N ha⁻¹ in the secondary forest (excluding soils below 40 cm) (Table 1). The N pools 264 of trees were 2200 kg N ha⁻¹ in the primary forest and 1700 kg N ha⁻¹ in the secondary 265 forest, accounting for 95% of the total plant N pool in both forests. Total soil N pools 266 down to 40 cm depth were about 5500 kg N ha⁻¹ and 5400 kg N ha⁻¹ in the primary and 267 the secondary forest, respectively. There were 82 kg N ha⁻¹ and 68 kg N ha⁻¹ in the forest 268 269 floor in the primary and the secondary forests, accounting for only about 1% of the total ecosystem N pools. The N pools in the major ecosystem compartments did not differ 270 between the two forests, except that the N pool in 0-10 cm mineral soils in the primary 271 forest was significantly higher than that in the secondary forest (Table 1). 272
- 273

The δ^{15} N values of different ecosystem compartments did not differ between two forests before labelling, except in tree stems. Plants δ^{15} N varied from -1.8‰ to 0.3‰ in the primary forest and from -1.7‰ to 0.8‰ in the secondary forest (Figure 1, Table S1 and S2). The δ^{15} N of organic soil layer δ^{15} N averaged -0.4‰ in the primary forest and -1.1‰ in the secondary forest, respectively. The δ^{15} N of mineral soil was always positive and increased with soil depth in both forests (Figure 1).

280

After the ¹⁵N tracer addition, the δ^{15} N increased in all ecosystem pools of the two forests 281 282 (Figure 1, Table S1 and S2). However, the temporal patterns of $\delta^{15}N$ in different ecosystem pools varied. The $\delta^{15}N$ of tree components and shrubs increased over time 283 (from -1.8‰ to 48.3‰ in the primary forest and from -1.5‰ to 84.8‰ in the secondary 284 forest) while the δ^{15} N of herbs, fine roots, and organic soil layer peaked at three months 285 and then decreased (Figure 1, Table S1 and S2). For 0-40 cm mineral soils, δ^{15} N also 286 increased three months after ¹⁵N tracer addition but did not change significantly from 287 288 three months to three years.

289

There were major differences in ¹⁵N abundance in the receiving ecosystem components 290 between ${}^{15}NH_4^+$ and ${}^{15}NO_3^-$. In the two forests, the $\delta^{15}N$ of tree foliage and branches 291 were significantly lower under ¹⁵NH₄⁺ labelling (4.2‰ to 18.6‰ in the primary forest 292 and 17.3% to 63.3% in the secondary forest) than under ${}^{15}NO_3^{-1}$ labelling (21.4% to 293 38.8% in the primary forest and 44.1% to 84.8% in the secondary forest) from three 294 months to three years (Figure 1, Table S1 and S2). In contrast, the $\delta^{15}N$ of the organic 295 soil layer was consistently higher under ¹⁵NH₄⁺ labelling than under ¹⁵NO₃⁻ labelling. 296 However, there were no significant differences in $\delta^{15}N$ of herbs and mineral soils 297 between ${}^{15}NH_4^+$ and ${}^{15}NO_3^-$ labelling in the primary forest. In the secondary forest, the 298 δ^{15} N of 0-10 cm mineral soils was significantly higher under 15 NH₄⁺ than under 15 NO₃⁻ 299 labelling three months to one year after ¹⁵N tracer addition, but this difference 300 disappeared at three years after the ¹⁵N tracer addition. 301

- 302
- 303 Total ecosystem recovery
- 304

Three months after ¹⁵N tracer addition, the total ecosystem recovery in the primary forest was 60.4% and 59.1% with ¹⁵NH₄⁺ and ¹⁵NO₃⁻ labelling, respectively, and 63.8% and 48.0% in the secondary forest (Figure 2, Table S3 and S4). One year after ¹⁵N tracer

addition, the total ecosystem recovery in the primary forest was 58.5% and 64.5% with 308 $^{15}\mathrm{NH_4^+}$ and $^{15}\mathrm{NO_3^-}$ labelling, respectively, and 60.9% and 59.7% in the secondary forest 309 (Figure 2, Table S3 and S4). Three years after ¹⁵N tracer addition, the ¹⁵N recovery in 310 the primary forest under ¹⁵NH₄⁺ and ¹⁵NO₃⁻ labelling was 67.9% and 73.7%, 311 respectively, and 61.0% and 57.1% in secondary forest (Figure 2, Table S3 and S4). 312 313 The change in the total ecosystem recovery over time was minor considering the uncertainties in estimating the ¹⁵N recovery. In addition, neither the tracer form nor the 314 forest type significantly affected the total ecosystem recovery of added ¹⁵N (Table S6). 315

316 317

318

¹⁵N tracer redistribution in different ecosystem components

There was no significant difference in plant ¹⁵N recovery between two forests over time 319 (Table S6). In both forests, ¹⁵N recovery in plants increased from three months to three 320 years after ¹⁵N tracer addition. The ¹⁵N recovery in plants in the primary forest increased 321 from 6.4% to 12.6% with ${}^{15}NH_4^+$ labelling and from 13.7% to 26.0% with ${}^{15}NO_3^-$ 322 labelling (P < 0.05, Table S3). The ¹⁵N recovery in plants in the secondary forest 323 increased from 12.1% to 21.3% with $^{15}NH_4^+$ labelling and from 13.8% to 22.1% with 324 $^{15}NO_3$ labelling (P < 0.05, Table S4). However, the temporal patterns of ^{15}N recovery 325 differed greatly among different plant components (Figure 3, Table S3, and S4). The 326 327 ¹⁵N recovery in herbs and fine roots decreased with time in both forests, whereas recovery in tree components and shrubs increased with time. Moreover, in the primary 328 forest, significantly more ¹⁵N was recovered in plants after the ¹⁵NO₃⁻ tracer addition 329 than after ¹⁵NH₄⁺ addition at all sampling times. However, ¹⁵N recovery in plant 330 compartments in the secondary forest did not differ significantly between ¹⁵NO₃⁻ and 331 ¹⁵NH₄⁺ labelling. 332

333

The temporal pattern of ¹⁵N recovery in the organic soil layer differed from the patterns of the plant pools. In both forests, ¹⁵N recovery was high in the organic soil layer three months after the ¹⁵N tracer addition (21.0% and 11.7% with ¹⁵NH₄⁺ and ¹⁵NO₃⁻ labelling in the primary forest, and 13.0% and 4.5% in the secondary forest), but declined significantly over time afterward (Figure 2, Table S3 and S4). In addition, ¹⁵N recovery in the organic soil layer was higher for ¹⁵NH₄⁺ than for ¹⁵NO₃⁻ tracer in both forests (Table S6), but the difference between the two decreased over time.

341

Mineral soil was the dominant sink for the added ¹⁵N tracer (Figure 2, Table S3 and S4). 342 In the primary forest, 33.0% and 33.7% of the ¹⁵N was found in the mineral soil after 343 three months with ${}^{15}NH_4^+$ and ${}^{15}NO_3^-$ labelling, and that recovery was 53.5% and 46.3% 344 after three years. However, soil retention of ¹⁵N in the secondary forest did not change 345 significantly over time, with 37.6% and 33.2% of the ¹⁵N being retained in the mineral 346 soil after three years under ¹⁵NH₄⁺ and ¹⁵NO₃⁻ labelling. The recovery of ¹⁵N declined 347 with soil depth in two forests, with the highest ¹⁵N recovery being observed in the 0-10 348 cm (26.6% and 21.9% with ${}^{15}NH_4^+$ and ${}^{15}NO_3^-$ labelling in the primary forest and 22.9% 349 and 19.2% in the secondary forest). Nevertheless, substantial amounts of ¹⁵N were also 350 retained at 10-20 cm and 20-40 cm depth. Overall, ¹⁵N recovery in mineral soil did not 351

differ significantly between ${}^{15}\text{NH}_4^+$ and ${}^{15}\text{NO}_3^-$ treatments in either forest (Table S3 and S4).

354

355 Discussion

- 356
- 357 358

Temporal patterns of total ecosystem recovery compared to temperate forests

Our results indicated that large quantities of ¹⁵N (about 40%) were lost only during the 359 first growing season, and from three months to three years, there was no significant 360 change in total ecosystem recovery. These results contradicted our first hypothesis that 361 the amount of ¹⁵N retained in tropical montane forests over longer periods would 362 363 decrease substantially through leaching and gaseous loss. The potential mechanism for the rapid initial losses might be that ¹⁵N might be absorbed physically on the litter and 364 surface mineral soil and therefore lost through physical processes such as leaching or 365 erosion caused by heavy rain in the first few months after ¹⁵N labelling (Wang et al., 366 2018; Li et al., 2019). In addition, this pattern of initial losses in the first few months is 367 368 similar to that observed in several temperate forest experiments (Figure 4), suggesting that total long-term ecosystem retention might be determined by the initial loss. A 369 recent long-term study also suggested that ¹⁵N initially retained would remain in 370 temperate forests while newly deposited N would be lost from the system (Veerman et 371 al., 2020). We speculate that ¹⁵N initially retained after the first few months might be 372 373 converted to organic forms and then enters the ecosystem internal N cycling.

374

The observed total ecosystem recovery of 70% and 60% of ¹⁵N in the primary and 375 secondary tropical montane forests three years after the ¹⁵N tracer addition (Table S3 376 and S4) were comparable to the mean recovery reported by long-term ¹⁵N studies in 377 temperate forests which are considered to be N-limited (Figure 4, on average 58%, n = 378 8, t test, P = 0.935). Synthesis results of ¹⁵N tracer studies have suggested that total 379 ecosystem retention is positively correlated with soil C/N represented ecosystem N 380 status (Vitousek et al., 1998; Templer et al., 2012). The soil C/N (11) in the studied 381 forests being within the range of that in temperate forests (9.7 to 29.6, Table S5), 382 suggesting that the N retention capacity in the studied tropical montane forests is 383 comparable to temperate forests over the long-term. In addition, the net primary 384 production (NPP) in the primary and secondary forests is about 4.5 and 8.3 Mg C ha⁻¹ 385 yr⁻¹ according to field inventory (Jiang, 2016). If the average C/N of 230 was used, 35 386 to 64 kg N ha⁻¹ yr⁻¹ at least was needed to sustain the NPP. Thus, about 80% - 90% N 387 388 sustaining the NPP comes from soil N pool and is inner-recycled. We, therefore, 389 conclude that both the primary and secondary tropical montane forests we studied have a conservative N cycle, where N is tightly recycled within these ecosystems once after 390 the atmospherically deposited inorganic N was transformed into organic form. 391

392

393 Distribution of ¹⁵N in different ecosystem components

394

395 The distribution patterns of deposited N in the studied tropical forests differed

substantially from temperate and boreal forests, with larger fractions of added ¹⁵N found 396 in plants and mineral soils than is the case with temperate and boreal forests where the 397 organic soil layer is a much more important sink (Figure 4, t-test, P < 0.05). This 398 difference in the patterns of ¹⁵N distribution can be attributed to the differences between 399 tropical and temperate forests in climate (e.g., mean annual temperature and 400 401 precipitation), mass and decomposition rate of organic soil layers (Templer et al., 2012). The thin organic soil layer and fast decomposition of litter in tropical forests due to high 402 temperature and precipitation might be release the ¹⁵N retained and facilitate plant N 403 uptake (Wang et al., 2018). In contrast, thicker organic soil layers (and lower rainfall) 404 hamper the transfer of ¹⁵N to mineral soil in temperate and boreal forests (Buchmann 405 et al., 1996; Gundersen, 1998; Koopmans et al., 1996; Nadelhoffer et al., 1999a; 406 407 Providoli et al., 2006; Liu et al., 2017a; Li et al., 2019). Our results also suggested that the ¹⁵N recovery in soil organic layer was positively correlated to the soil organic layer 408 mass ($R^2 = 0.88$, P < 0.001) (Figure S1, Table S5), further supporting these mechanisms. 409

410

411 Over a longer time scale, the deposited N is recycled and redistributed among the plant, organic soil layer, and mineral soil in the studied tropical forests. Consistent with our 412 second hypothesis, the ¹⁵N recovery increased in plants after three years (Figure 3), 413 indicating that deposited N that was initially retained in mineral soil and organic soil 414 415 layer over the long term has become available for plant uptake and assimilation (Wessel et al., 2013; Goodale, 2017; Li et al., 2019). Earlier studies have also suggested that ¹⁵N 416 tracer immobilized by microorganisms was slowly released to soil solution and then 417 assimilated by plants (Zogg et al., 2000; Zak et al., 2004). In our results, ¹⁵N recovery 418 419 in shrubs and all tree components increased with time, but decreased in herbs and fine 420 roots (Figure 3), suggesting that assimilated N was transferred from active plant pools to stable plant pools (Nadelhoffer et al., 2004; Goodale, 2017; Li et al., 2019).The 421 422 carbon sequestration efficiency of plants (NUE_{dep}) was estimated to be 14 and 18 kg C per kg N for primary and secondary forest after three years, which is within the range 423 of values in temperate forests (Wang et al., 2018) and higher than the values estimated 424 for tropical forests (9 kg C per kg N, De Vries et al., 2014). According to a nutrient 425 addition experiment in the studied forests (Zhou, 2013), N addition enhanced 426 aboveground biomass carbon pool (NUE_{dep} by 24-35 kg C per kg N and 11 kg C per kg 427 N in the primary and secondary forests, respectively). Together, these results suggest 428 that over time more deposited N will be increasingly retained in high C/N ratio tree 429 components and therefore enhance N deposition-induced carbon sequestration 430 431 (Nadelhoffer et al., 1999a, b; Goodale, 2017).

432

In contrast to the pattern in the plants, the organic soil layer ¹⁵N recovery declined from three months (4.5% to 21.0%) to three years (1.5% to 2.1%), especially so in the primary forest (Figure 2, Table S3 and S4). We attribute this to fast litter turnover in tropical forests, resulting in the small capacity of organic soil layer to retain the added ¹⁵N (Gurmesa et al., 2016; Liu et al., 2017b; Wang et al., 2018). The ¹⁵N initially retained in organic soil layer could be transferred to the mineral soil, or released and assimilated by plants (Wessel et al., 2013; Veerman et al., 2020). In numerous studies

in temperate forests, ¹⁵N recovery decreased over time in the organic soil layer, which
was attributed to litter decomposition, physical leaching or downward transport by soil
fauna (Nadelhoffer et al., 2004; Goodale, 2017; Li et al., 2019).

443

In the mineral soils, there was no significant change in ¹⁵N recovery from three months 444 to three years (Figure 2 and 4). The mineral soil was still the largest sink for deposited 445 N after three years. The long-term persistence of ¹⁵N in mineral soil might be attributed 446 to the incorporation of ¹⁵N into stable soil organic matter (SOM) pools (Perakis & Hedin, 447 2001; Goodale et al., 2015; Veerman et al., 2020). Previous studies have demonstrated 448 that inorganic N could be immobilized in the organic N pool through microbial 449 accumulation, condensation of N in microbial enzymes with phenolic compounds, or 450 abiotic reactions of inorganic N with soil organic matter (Johnson, 1992; Johnson et al., 451 452 2000; Lewis & Kaye, 2012; Goodale et al., 2015; Liu et al., 2017a; Fuss et al., 2019), while inputs of high C/N woody debris would also promote the immobilization of ¹⁵N 453 by microbes (Lajtha, 2020). Moreover, the deposited N retained in mineral soil may 454 promote soil organic carbon accumulation in the studied forests which have the 455 conservative N cycle (Manzoni et al., 2017; Zhou et al., 2019). The nutrient addition 456 457 experiment in the studied forests also found that N addition enhanced soil organic carbon pool (Zhou, 2013). 458

459

461

460 Different fates of ¹⁵NH₄⁺ and ¹⁵NO₃⁻

In present study, total ecosystem retention did not differ significantly between ¹⁵NH₄⁺ 462 463 and ${}^{15}NO_3^-$ (Figure 2, Table S6), indicating that deposited NH₄⁺ and NO₃⁻ can be retained equally by the studied forest. Nonetheless, the patterns of ¹⁵N distribution 464 within ecosystems (plants, organic soil layer and mineral soil) did differ, which might 465 be the potential reason for the similar total ecosystem ¹⁵N recovery. Consistent with 466 many previous ¹⁵N-field studies (Nadelhoffer et al., 2004; Feng et al., 2008; Sheng et 467 al., 2014; Liu et al., 2017a; Wang et al., 2018; Li et al., 2019), our results indicate that 468 deposited NO_3^- is more efficiently used by plants compared to NH_4^+ . The higher 469 recovery ¹⁵NO₃⁻ in plants than ¹⁵NH₄⁺ could be attributed to its higher mobility, so that 470 ¹⁵NO₃⁻ can move more easily to the root surface and be assimilated by plants (Jacob & 471 Leuschner, 2015). Additionally, NO3⁻ is more important in balancing cation uptake (e.g., 472 K^+ , Ca^{2+} and Mg^{2+}) than NH_4^+ (Hoffmann et al., 2007). In contrast, NH_4^+ is likely 473 retained on cation exchange sites in soil organic matter and clay particles or 474 preferentially taken up by soil microbes (Gebauer et al., 2000; Providoli et al., 2006; 475 476 Jacob & Leuschner, 2015; Liu et al., 2017a). Furthermore, plant uptake of NO₃⁻ would avoid direct competition for NH4⁺ with microbes (Kuzyakov & Xu, 2013). However, 477these difference in tree components were less prevalent in the long-term, indicating that 478 both deposited ¹⁵NH₄⁺ and ¹⁵NO₃⁻ are slowly redistributed to stable plant pools over 479 time. 480

⁴⁸² In our results, retention in the organic soil layer was significantly higher for ${}^{15}\text{NH}_4^+$ 483 than for ${}^{15}\text{NO}_3^-$ (Table S6), which is consistent with previous studies (Corre &

Lamersdorf, 2004; Feng et al., 2008; Liu et al., 2017a; Li et al., 2019). Many studies 484 have demonstrated that forest floor microbes prefer NH4⁺ to NO3⁻ due to its lower 485 energy cost during assimilation (Recous et al., 1990). Moreover, NO₃⁻ has greater 486 mobility than NH4⁺ and leaches readily to mineral soils. In the primary forest, the 487 organic soil layer was the major sink for deposited N (46%) under ¹⁵NH₄⁺ labelling at 488 one week after ¹⁵N tracer addition while 65% of ¹⁵N was retained in mineral soil under 489 ¹⁵NO₃⁻ labelling (Figure 2), further supporting this mechanism. However, ¹⁵N recovery 490 three years after ¹⁵N tracer addition in the organic soil layer did not differ between the 491 two N forms. Fast decomposition of litter in tropical forests is a possible mechanism 492 493 for similar retention patterns after three years. Both deposited NH_4^+ and NO_3^- could over the three years be finally transferred to the mineral soil, or released and assimilated 494 495 by plants in the growing season (Nadelhoffer et al., 2004; Goodale, 2017; Li et al., 2019). 496

497

Surprisingly, ¹⁵N recovery in mineral soil did not differ between ¹⁵NH₄⁺ and ¹⁵NO₃⁻ 498 considering the uncertainties in estimating the mineral soil N pools (Table S3-S4 and 499 S6), in contrast to previous studies (Nadelhoffer et al., 2004; Feng et al., 2008; Sheng 500 et al., 2014; Liu et al., 2017a; Liu et al., 2017b; Li et al., 2019). This might be attributed 501 to the conservative N cycle of the studied tropical montane forests. A previous study 502 also suggested that both ¹⁵NH₄⁺ and ¹⁵NO₃⁻ can be incorporated into stable soil organic 503 matter and hence resulting in similar long-term "equilibrium" patterns of ¹⁵NH₄⁺ and 504 ¹⁵NO₃⁻ retention in N-poor forests (Perakis & Hedin, 2001). Added ¹⁵NH₄⁺ can be 505 immobilized by soil microbes or incorporated into cation exchange sites in soil organic 506 507 matter (SOM) and clays (Perakis & Hedin, 2001; Zhu & Wang, 2011; Lewis & Kaye, 2012; Templer et al., 2012). The NO3⁻ could also be incorporated to particulate and 508 mineral-associated SOM fractions through abiotic or biotic processes (Matus et al., 509 510 2019; Fuss et al., 2019). For example, dissimilatory nitrate reduction to ammonium (DNRA) has been hypothesized to play a key role in the retention of bioavailable N in 511 forests from high rainfall areas (Silver et al., 2001; Huygens et al., 2007; Templer et al., 512 513 2008; Gao et al., 2016).

514

515 Difference between the two forests

516

517 In our study, both tropical montane forests have low N status (Wang et al., 2014), as indicated by low rates of atmospheric N deposition and persistent ecosystem retention 518 519 (Figure 2), but the primary forest was initially somewhat more N-rich than the 520 secondary forest (Wang et al., 2014). However, there was no significant difference in ecosystem N retention between two forests over time (Table S6), which contradicted 521 our fourth hypothesis that lower ¹⁵N retention in the primary forest due to its relatively 522 higher N status than the secondary forest. Although there were differences in labelling 523 time and the amount of ¹⁵N tracer between the two forests, the similarity in N retention 524 pattern were not due to the inconsistent experimental designs. The precipitation varied 525 between two years and the precipitation in the first three months after ¹⁵N labelling in 526the primary forest (Year 2015) was larger than that in the secondary forest (Year 2016) 527

(Figure S2). Moreover, twice as much tracer was applied to the secondary forest (50 528 mg ¹⁵N m⁻²) as to the primary forest (25 mg ¹⁵N m⁻²). However, our results suggested 529 that about 40% of ¹⁵N were lost only during the first three months in the two forests, 530 and from three months to three years, there was no significant change in total ecosystem 531 recovery (Figure 2). Thus, the differences in precipitation and the amount of ¹⁵N tracer 532 533 could not affect the patterns of ¹⁵N retention in the two forests. We therefore suggested that succession status did not strongly affect total ecosystem recovery nor the 534 distribution patterns of added ¹⁵N in our two tropical forests. 535

- 537 Conclusions
- 538

536

In this study, we presented the first analysis of the fates of deposited NH_4^+ and NO_3^- 539 over three years for two tropical montane forests. More than 60% of ¹⁵N was retained 540 in both primary and secondary tropical montane forests one as well as three years after 541 ¹⁵N tracer addition, indicating persistent ecosystem retention of deposited N in these 542 forests. Although total ecosystem ¹⁵N recovery did not change significantly with time, 543 the deposited N became redistributed within the forests. The retention and 544 545 retranslocation patterns in plants, organic soil layers, and mineral soil differed between $^{15}\text{NH}_4^+$ and $^{15}\text{NO}_3^-$ tracer in the two forests. More $^{15}\text{NO}_3^-$ than $^{15}\text{NH}_4^+$ was retained by 546 plants and the total ¹⁵N recovery attributed to plants increased over time. In contrast to 547 long-term retention in plants, the organic soil layer was a transient sink for deposited N 548 and more ¹⁵NH₄⁺ was retained here. The mineral soil was the largest ecosystem sink for 549 deposited N. It was surprising that the ¹⁵N recovery of mineral soil remained relatively 550 steady in study forests over time and that ¹⁵N recovery in mineral soil did not differ 551between the two N forms. Neither forest types nor N forms significantly affected total 552 ecosystem N retention. Overall, our results suggest that deposited N is redistributed to 553 554 more stable plant and soil pools over time. Critically, our results indicate that roughly 60% of the deposited N was still retained within tropical montane forests after three 555 years, from which we expect the retained N to benefit tropical forest growth and 556 557 enhance carbon sequestration.

558

559 Acknowledgements

560

561 The work was supported financially by the National Key Research and Development Program of China (2016YFA0600802), Key Research Program of Frontier Sciences of 562 Chinese Academy of Sciences (QYZDB-SSW-DQC002), K.C. Wong Education 563 Foundation (GJTD-2018-07), Liaoning Vitalization Talents Program (XLYC1902016), 564 the National Natural Science Foundation of China (41773094, 41811530305, 31901134 565 and 31770498), and the Strategic Priority Research Program of the Chinese Academy 566 of Sciences (XDA23070103). We thank many students and field staff for assisting 567 sampling and analyses. The work was jointly supported by the Jianfengling National 568 Key Field Station. The authors declare no competing financial interest. 569

570

571 References

572	
573	Aber, J. D., Goodale, C. L., Ollinger, S. V., Smith, M. L., Magill, A. H., Martin, M. E.,
574	Hallett, R. A., & Stoddard, J. L. (2003). Is nitrogen deposition altering the nitrogen
575	status of northeastern forests? Bioscience, 53(4), 375-389.
576	https://doi.org/10.1641/0006-3568(2003)053[0375:indatn]2.0.co;2
577	Ackerman, D., Millet, D. B., & Chen, X. (2019). Global estimates of inorganic nitrogen
578	deposition across four decades. Global Biogeochemical Cycles, 33(1), 100-107.
579	https://doi.org/10.1029/2018GB005990
580	Bejarano-Castillo, M., Campo, J., & Roa-Fuentes, L. L. (2015). Effects of increased
581	nitrogen availability on C and N cycles in tropical forests: a meta-analysis. Plos
582	One, 10(12). https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0144253
583	Buchmann, N., Gebauer, G., & Schulze, E. D. (1996). Partitioning of ¹⁵ N-labeled
584	ammonium and nitrate among soil, litter, below-and above-ground biomass of
585	trees and understory in a 15-year-old Picea abies plantation. Biogeochemistry,
586	33(1), 1-23. https://doi.org/10.1007/BF00000967
587	Chen, D., Li, Y., Liu, H., Xu, H., Xiao, W. F., Luo, T. S., Zhou, Z., Lin, M. (2010).
588	Biomass and carbon dynamics of a tropical mountain rain forest in China. Science
589	China-life Sciences, 53, 798-810. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11427-010-4024-2
590	Corre, M. D., & Lamersdorf, N. P. (2004). Reversal of nitrogen saturation after long-
591	term deposition reduction: impact on soil nitrogen cycling. Ecology, 85(11), 3090-
592	3104. <u>https://doi.org/10.1890/03-0423</u>
593	Cusack, D. F., Karpman, J., Ashdown, D., Cao, Q., Ciochina, M., Halterman, S., Lydon,
594	S., & Neupane, A. (2016). Global change effects on humid tropical forests:
595	Evidence for biogeochemical and biodiversity shifts at an ecosystem scale.
596	Reviews of Geophysics, 54(3), 523-610. https://doi.org/10.1002/2015RG000510
597	De Vries, W., Du, E., & Butterbach-Bahl, K. (2014). Short and long-term impacts of
598	nitrogen deposition on carbon sequestration by forest ecosystems. Current
599	Opinion in Environmental Sustainability, 9-10, 90-104.
600	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cosust.2014.09.001
601	Du, E., Fenn, M. E., De Vries, W., & Ok, Y. S. (2019). Atmospheric nitrogen deposition
602	to global forests: Status, impacts and management options. Environmental
603	Pollution, 250, 1044-1048. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envpol.2019.04.014
604	Fang, J., Li, Y., Zhu, B., Liu, G., & Zhou, G. (2004). Community structures and species
605	richness in the montane rain forest of Jianfengling, Hainan Island, China.
606	<i>Biodivers Sci</i> , 12, 29-43.
607	Feng, Z., Brumme, R., Xu, Y. J., & Lamersdorf, N. (2008). Tracing the fate of mineral
608	N compounds under high ambient N deposition in a Norway spruce forest at
609	Solling/Germany. Forest Ecology and Management, 255(7), 2061-2073.
610	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foreco.2007.12.049.
611	Field, C. B., Behrenfeld, M. J., Randerson, J. T., & Falkowski, P. (1998). Primary
612	production of the biosphere: integrating terrestrial and oceanic components.
613	Science, 281(5374), 237-240. https://doi.org/10.1126/science.281.5374.237
614	Fuss, C. B., Lovett, G. M., Goodale, C. L., Ollinger, S. V., Lang, A. K., & Ouimette, A.
615	P. (2019). Retention of nitrate-N in mineral soil organic matter in different forest

- 616 age classes. *Ecosystems*, 22(6), 1280-1294. <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/s10021-018-</u> 617 0328-z
- Galloway, J. N., Townsend, A. R., Erisman, J. W., Bekunda, M., Cai, Z., Freney, J. R.,
 Martinelli, L. A., Seitzinger, S. P., & Sutton, M. A. (2008). Transformation of the
 nitrogen cycle: recent trends, questions, and potential solutions. *Science*,
 320(5878), 889-892. <u>https://doi.org/10.1126/science.1136674</u>
- Gao, W., Kou, L., Yang, H., Zhang, J., Müller, C., Li, S. (2016). Are nitrate production
 and retention processes in subtropical acidic forest soils responsive to ammonium
 deposition. *Soil Biology & Biochemistry*, 100, 102-109.
 http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.soilbio.2016.06.002
- Gebauer, G., Zeller, B., Schmidt, G., May, C., Buchmann, N., Colin-Belgrand, M.,
 Dambrine, E., Martin, F., Schulze, E. D., & Bottner, P. (2000). The fate of ¹⁵Nlabelled nitrogen inputs to coniferous and broadleaf forests. In *Carbon and nitrogen cycling in European forest ecosystems* (pp. 144-170): Springer.
 <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-642-57219-7_7</u>
- Goodale, C. L. (2017). Multiyear fate of a ¹⁵N tracer in a mixed deciduous forest:
 retention, redistribution, and differences by mycorrhizal association. *Global Change Biology*, 23(2), 867-880. <u>https://doi.org/10.1111/gcb.13483</u>
- Goodale, C. L., Fredriksen, G., Weiss, M. S., McCalley, C. K., Sparks, J. P., & Thomas,
 S. A. (2015). Soil processes drive seasonal variation in retention of ¹⁵N tracers in
 a deciduous forest catchment. *Ecology*, 96(10), 2653-2668.
 <u>https://doi.org/10.1890/14-1852.1</u>
- Gundersen, P. (1998). Effects of enhanced nitrogen deposition in a spruce forest at
 Klosterhede, Denmark, examined by moderate NH₄NO₃ addition. *Forest Ecology and Management*, 101, 251-268. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/S0378-1127(97)00141-2</u>
- Gundersen, P., Callesen, I., & De Vries, W. (1998). Nitrate leaching in forest ecosystems
 is related to forest floor CN ratios. *Environmental Pollution*, 102(1), 403-407.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/S0269-7491(98)80060-2
- Gurmesa, G. A., Lu, X., Gundersen, P., Mao, Q., Zhou, K., Fang, Y., & Mo, J. (2016).
 High retention of ¹⁵N-labeled nitrogen deposition in a nitrogen saturated old growth tropical forest. *Global Change Biology*. <u>https://doi.org/10.1111/gcb.13327</u>
- Hoffmann, A., Milde, S., Desel, C., Hümpel, A., Kaiser, H., Hammes, E., Piippo, M.,
 Soitamo, A., Aro, E., Gerendás, J., Sattelmacher, B., Hansen, U. (2007). N formdependent growth retardation of *Arabidopsis thaliana* seedlings as revealed from
 physiological and microarray studies. Journal of Plant Nutrition & Soil Science
 170: 87-97. https://doi.org/10.1002/jpln.200625032
- Huygens, D., Rütting, T., Boeckx, P., Van Cleemput, O., Godoy, R., & Müller, C. (2007).
 Soil nitrogen conservation mechanisms in a pristine south Chilean Nothofagus
 forest ecosystem. *Soil Biology and Biochemistry*, 39(10), 2448-2458.
 <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.soilbio.2007.04.013</u>
- Jacob, A., & Leuschner, C. (2015). Complementarity in the use of nitrogen forms in a
 temperate broad-leaved mixed forest. *Plant Ecology & Diversity*, 8(2), 243-258.
 <u>https://doi.org/10.1080/17550874.2014.898166</u>
- Jiang, L., 2016. Effects of nitrogen and phosphorus fertilization on carbon cycling of

tropical montain rainforests in Hainan Island, China (in Chinese). Ph.D. Theses. 660 Peking University. 661 Johnson, D. W. (1992). Nitrogen retention in forest soils. Journal of Environmental 662 Quality, 21, 1-12. https://doi.org/10.2134/jeq1992.00472425002100010001x 663 Johnson, D. W., Cheng, W., & Burke, I. C. (2000). Biotic and abiotic nitrogen retention 664 665 in a variety of forest soils. Soil Science Society of America Journal, 64(4), 1503-1514. https://doi.org/10.2136/sssaj2000.6441503x 666 Koopmans, C., Tietema, A., & Boxman, A. (1996). The fate of ¹⁵N enriched throughfall 667 in two coniferous forest stands at different nitrogen deposition levels. 668 Biogeochemistry, 34(1), 19-44. https://doi.org/10.1007/BF02182953 669 Krause, K., Providoli, I., Currie, W. S., Bugmann, H., & Schleppi, P. (2012). Long-term 670 tracing of whole catchment ¹⁵N additions in a mountain spruce forest: 671 measurements and simulations with the TRACE model. Trees, 26(6), 1683-1702. 672 https://doi.org/10.1007/s00468-012-0737-0 673 Kuzyakov, Y., & Xu, X. (2013). Competition between roots and microorganisms for 674 nitrogen: mechanisms and ecological relevance. New Phytologist, 198(3), 656-669. 675 676 https://doi.org/10.1111/nph.12235 677 Lajtha, K. (2020). Nutrient retention and loss during ecosystem succession: revisiting a classic model. Ecology, 101(1). https://doi.org/10.1002/ecy.2896 678 679 Lewis, D. B., & Kaye, J. P. (2012). Inorganic nitrogen immobilization in live and sterile soil of old-growth conifer and hardwood forests: implications for ecosystem 680 169-186. 681 nitrogen retention. Biogeochemistry, 111: https://doi.org/10.1007/s10533-011-9627-6 682 683 Li, S., Gurmesa, G. A., Zhu, W., Gundersen, P., Zhang, S., Xi, D., Huang, S., Wang, A., Zhu, F., Jiang, Y., Zhu, J., & Fang, Y. (2019). Fate of atmospherically deposited 684 NH_4^+ and NO_3^- in two temperate forests in China: temporal pattern and 685 686 redistribution. Ecological Applications, 29(6). https://doi.org/10.1002/eap.1920 Liu, J., Peng, B., Xia, Z., Sun, J., Gao, D., Dai, W., Jiang, P., & Bai, E. (2017a). Different 687 fates of deposited NH₄⁺ and NO₃⁻ in a temperate forest in northeast China: a ¹⁵N 688 689 tracer study. Global Change Biology, 23:2441-2449. https://doi.org/10.1111/gcb.13533 690 Liu, W., Yu, L., Zhang, T., Kang, R., Zhu, J., Mulder, J., Huang Y., & Duan, L. (2017b). 691 692 In situ N-15 labeling experiment reveals different long-term responses to 693 ammonium and nitrate inputs in N-saturated subtropical forest. Journal of Geophysical Research-Biogeosciences, 2251-2264. 694 122(9), https://doi.org/10.1002/2017JG003963 695 696 Luo, T., Li, Y., Chen, D., Lin, M., & Sun, Y. (2005). A study on the soil properties of Dacrycarpus imbricatus Bl. plantation in tropical mountainous region in Hainan 697 Island. Natural Sci J of Hainan University, 23(4), 340-346. 698 Manzoni, S., Čapek, P., Mooshammer, M., Lindahl, B. D., Richter, A., Šantrůčková, H. 699 700 (2017). Optimal metabolic regulation along resource stoichiometry gradients. 701 Ecology Letters, 20, 1182-1191. https://doi.org/10.1111/ele.12815 Matson, P. A., McDOWELL, W. H., Townsend, A. R., & Vitousek, P. M. (1999). The 702 globalization of N deposition: ecosystem consequences in tropical environments. 703

704	Biogeochemistry, 46(1-3), 67-83. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-94-011-4645-6_4
705	Matus, F., Stock, S., Eschenbach, W., Dyckmans, J., Merino, C., Najera, F., Koester,
706	M., Kuzyakov, Y., & Dippold, M. A. (2019). Ferrous Wheel Hypothesis: Abiotic
707	nitrate incorporation into dissolved organic matter. Geochimica et Cosmochimica
708	Acta, 245, 514-524. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gca.2018.11.020
709	Nadelhoffer, K., & Fry, B. (1994). Nitrogen isotope studies in forest ecosystems. Stable
710	Isotopes in Ecology and Environmental Science, 22-44.
711	Nadelhoffer, K. J., Colman, B. P., Currie, W. S., Magill, A., & Aber, J. D. (2004).
712	Decadal-scale fates of ¹⁵ N tracers added to oak and pine stands under ambient and
713	elevated N inputs at the Harvard Forest (USA). Forest Ecology and Management,
714	196(1), 89-107. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foreco.2004.03.014
715	Nadelhoffer, K. J., Downs, M. R., & Fry, B. (1999a). Sinks for ¹⁵ N-enriched additions
716	to an oak forest and a red pine plantation. Ecological Applications, 9(1), 72-86.
717	https://doi.org/10.1890/1051-0761(1999)009[0072:SFNEAT]2.0.CO;2
718	Nadelhoffer, K. J., Emmett, B. A., Gundersen, P., Kjønaas, O. J., Koopmans, C. J.,
719	Schleppi, P., Tietema, A., & Wright, R. F. (1999b). Nitrogen deposition makes a
720	minor contribution to carbon sequestration in temperate forests. Nature, 398(6723),
721	145-148. https://doi.org/10.1038/18205
722	Niu, S., Classen, A. T., Dukes, J. S., Kardol, P., Liu, L., Luo, Y., Rustad, L., Sun, J.,
723	Tang, J., Templer, P. H., Thomas, R. Q., Tian, D., Vicca, S., Wang, Y. P., Xia, J., &
724	Zaehle, S. (2016). Global patterns and substrate-based mechanisms of the
725	terrestrial nitrogen cycle. Ecology Letters, 19(6), 697-709.
726	https://doi.org/10.1111/ele.12591
727	Perakis, S. S., & Hedin, L. O. (2001). Fluxes and fates of nitrogen in soil of an
728	unpolluted oldg-rowth temperate forest, southern Chile. Ecology, 82(8), 2245-
729	2260. https://doi.org/10.1890/0012-9658(2001)082[2245:FAFONI]2.0.CO;2
730	Phillips, O. L., Malhi, Y., Higuchi, N., Laurance, W. F., Núnez, P. V., Vásquez, R. M.,
731	Laurance, S. G., Ferreira, L. V., Stern, M., & Brown, S. (1998). Changes in the
732	carbon balance of tropical forests: evidence from long-term plots. Science,
733	282(5388), 439-442. https://doi.org/10.1126/science.282.5388.439
734	Preston, C. M., Marshall, V. G., McCullough, K., & Mead, D. J. (1990). Fate of N-15-
735	labeled fertilizer applied on snow at 2 forest sites in British-Columbia. Canadian
736	Journal of Forest Research-Revue Canadienne De Recherche Forestiere, 20(10),
737	1583-1592.
738	Preston, C. M., & Mead, D. J. (1994). Growth-response and recovery of N-15-fertilizer
739	one and 8 growing seasons after application to lodgepole pine in British-Columbia.
740	Forest Ecology and Management, 65(2-3), 219-229. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/0378-</u>
741	<u>1127(94)90172-4</u>
742	Providoli, I., Bugmann, H., Siegwolf, R., Buchmann, N., & Schleppi, P. (2005). Flow
743	of deposited inorganic N in two gleysol-dominated mountain catchments traced
744	with ${}^{15}NO_{3}^{-}$ and ${}^{15}NH_{4}^{+}$. <i>Biogeochemistry</i> , 76(3), 453-475.
745	https://doi.org/10.1007/s10533-005-8124-1
746	Providoli, I., Bugmann, H., Siegwolf, R., Buchmann, N., & Schleppi, P. (2006).
747	Pathways and dynamics of ¹⁵ NO ₃ ⁻ and ¹⁵ NH ₄ ⁺ applied in a mountain Picea abies

748	forest and in a nearby meadow in central Switzerland. Soil Biology and
749	Biochemistry, 38(7), 1645-1657. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.soilbio.2005.11.019
750	Recous, S., Mary, B., & Faurie, G. (1990). Microbial immobilization of ammonium and
751	nitrate in cultivated soils. Soil Biology and Biochemistry, 22(7), 913-922.
752	https://doi.org/10.1016/0038-0717(90)90129-N
753	Schleppi, P., Bucher-Wallin, L., Siegwolf, R., Saurer, M., Muller, N., & Bucher, J.
754	(1999). Simulation of increased nitrogen deposition to a montane forest ecosystem:
755	partitioning of the added ¹⁵ N. Water, Air, and Soil Pollution, 116(1-2), 129-134.
756	https://doi.org/10.1023/A:1005206927764
757	Sheng, W., Yu, G., Fang, H., Jiang, C., Yan, J., & Zhou, M. (2014). Sinks for inorganic
758	nitrogen deposition in forest ecosystems with low and high nitrogen deposition in
759	China. Plos One, 9(2), e89322. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0089322
760	Silver, W. L., Herman, D. J., & Firestone, M. K. (2001). Dissimilatory nitrate reduction
761	to ammonium in upland tropical forest soils. Ecology, 82(9), 2410.
762	https://doi.org/10.1890/0012-9658(2001)082[2410:DNRTAI]2.0.CO;2
763	Templer, P., Mack, M., III, F. C., Christenson, L., Compton, J., Crook, H., Currie, W.,
764	Curtis, C., Dail, D., & D'Antonio, C. (2012). Sinks for nitrogen inputs in terrestrial
765	ecosystems: a meta-analysis of ¹⁵ N tracer field studies. <i>Ecology</i> , 93(8), 1816-1829.
766	https://doi.org/10.1890/11-1146.1
767	Templer, P. H., Silver, W. L., Pett-Ridge, J., DeAngelis, K. M., & Firestone, M. K.
768	(2008). Plant and microbial controls on nitrogen retention and loss in a humid
769	tropical forest. <i>Ecology</i> , 89(11), 3030-3040. <u>https://doi.org/10.1890/07-1631.1</u>
770	Veerman, L., Kalbitz, K., Gundersen, P., Kjønaas, J., Moldan, F., Schleppi, P., van Loon,
771	E. E., Schoorl, J., Wessel, W., & Tietema, A. (2020). The long-term fate of
772	deposited nitrogen in temperate forest soils. Biogeochemistry.
773	https://doi.org/10.1007/s10533-020-00683-6
774	Vitousek, P. M., & Howarth, R. W. (1991). Nitrogen limitation on land and in the sea:
775	how can it occur? <i>Biogeochemistry</i> , 13(2), 87-115.
776	https://doi.org/10.1007/BF00002772
777	Vitousek, P. M., Hedin, L. O., Matson, P. A., Fownes, J. H. & Neff, J. (1998). Within-
778	system element cycles, input-output budgets, and nutrient limitation. Successes,
779	Limitations, and Frontiers in Ecosystem Science, 432–451.
780	<u>https://doi:10.1007/978-1-4612-1724-4_18</u>
781	Wang, A., Fang, Y., Chen, D., Koba, K., Makabe, A., Li, Y., Luo, T., & Yoh, M. (2014).
782	Variations in nitrogen-15 natural abundance of plant and soil systems in four
783	remote tropical rainforests, southern China. <i>Oecologia</i> , 174(2), 567-580.
784	https://doi.org/10.1007/s00442-013-2778-5
785	Wang, A., Zhu, W., Gundersen, P., Phillips, O. L., Chen, D., & Fang, Y. (2018). Fates
786	of atmospheric deposited nitrogen in an Asian tropical primary forest. Forest
787	Ecology and Management, 411, 213-222.
788	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foreco.2018.01.029
789	
-0.2	Wessel, W. W., Tietema, A., & Boxman, A. W. (2013). The fate of ¹⁵ NH ₄ ⁺ labeled
790	Wessel, W. W., Tietema, A., & Boxman, A. W. (2013). The fate of ¹⁵ NH ₄ ⁺ labeled deposition in a Scots pine forest in the Netherlands under high and lowered NH ₄ ⁺

792 <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/s10533-012-9775-3</u>

- Yu, G., Jia, Y., He, N., Zhu, J., Chen, Z., Wang, Q., Piao, S., Liu, X., He, H., Guo, X.,
 Wen, Z., Li, P., Ding, G., & Goulding, K. (2019). Stabilization of atmospheric
 nitrogen deposition in China over the past decade. *Nature Geoscience*, 12(6), 424429. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41561-019-0352-4
- Zak, D. R., Pregitzer, K. S., Holmes, W. E., Burton, A. J., & Zogg, G. P. (2004).
 Anthropogenic N deposition and the fate of ¹⁵NO₃⁻ in a northern hardwood ecosystem. *Biogeochemistry*, 69(2), 143-157.
 https://doi.org/10.1023/B:BIOG.0000031045.24377.99
- Zeng, Q., Li, Y., Chen, B., Wu, Z., Zhou, G. (1997). Management on tropical forest
 ecosystems (in Chinese). 1997. 202. Beijing: China Forestry Press, 202.
- Zhou, G., Xu, S., Ciais, P., Manzoni, S., Fang, J., Yu, G., Tang, X., Zhou, P., Wang, W.,
 Yan, J., Wang, G., Ma, K., Li, S., Du, S., Han, S., Ma, Y., Zhang, D., Liu, J., Liu,
 S., Chu, G., Zhang, Q., Li, Y., Huang, W., Ren, H., Lu, X., Chen, X. (2019).
 Climate and litter C/N ratio constrain soil organic carbon accumulation. *National Science Review*, 6, 746-757. https://doi.org/10.1093/nsr/nwz045
- Zhou, Z., 2013. Effects of nitrogen and phosphorus additions on carbon cycling of
 tropical mountain rainforests in Hainan Island, China (in Chinese). Ph.D. Theses.
 Peking University.
- Zhu, W., & Wang, W. (2011). Does soil organic matter variation affect the retention of
 ¹⁵NH₄⁺ and ¹⁵NO₃⁻ in forest ecosystems? *Forest Ecology and Management*, 261(3),
 675-682. <u>https://doi.org/doi:10.1016/j.foreco.2010.11.024</u>
- Zogg, G. P., Zak, D. R., Pregitzer, K. S., & Burton, A. J. (2000). Microbial
 immobilization and the retention of anthropogenic nitrate in a northern hardwood
 forest. *Ecology*, 81(7), 1858-1866. <u>https://doi.org/10.1890/0012-</u>
 9658(2000)081[1858:MIATRO]2.0.CO;2

Table 1 Dry mass, nitrogen pool, total nitrogen concentration and carbon: nitrogen ratio (C/N) of major ecosystem components before adding ¹⁵N

tracer in the two tropical montane forests. Values in parentheses are one standard error (n = 3). Different lowercase superscript letters within a row represent statistically significant ($P \le 0.05$) differences.

Ecosystem	Dry mass (Mg ha ⁻¹)		N pool (kg ha ⁻¹)		%N		C/N	
components	Primary	Secondary	Primary	Secondary	Primary	Secondary	Primary	Secondary
Tree								
Foliage	11 (1)	10 (0.2)	188 (24)	167 (3)	1.69 (0.03)	1.72 (0.03)	28.4 (0.5)	28.2 (0.5)
Branch	80 (14)	65 (2)	481 (87)	419 (10)	0.61 (0.02)	0.65 (0.02)	76.6 (2.1)	78.3 (1.8)
Bark	32 (5)	26 (0.5)	189 (29)	188 (4)	0.66 (0.05)	0.71 (0.05)	74.3 (4.1)	82.6 (4.0)
Stem	289 (52)	234 (6)	578 (104)	396 (10)	0.18 (0.01)	0.17 (0.01)	318.9 (24.8)	326.5 (14.8)
Root	167 (37)	130 (4)	670 (146)	530 (17)	0.40 (0.01) *	0.41 (0.01) *	197.7 (13.4) *	202.4 (9.3) *
Subtotal	579 (109)	465 (12)	2105 (390)	1701 (43)				
Shrub	0.4 (0.1)	0.7 (0.1)	5 (0.9)	8 (1)	1.23 (0.1)	1.19 (0.03)	45.9 (3.2)	52.9 (1.4)
Herb	0.1 (0.0)	0.05 (0.01)	2 (0.6)	0.7 (0.2)	1.76 (0.2)	1.51 (0.19)	24.0 (2.0)	27.8 (4.5)
Root								
< 2 mm	5 (1)	3 (0.4)	55 (12)	34 (4)	1.20 (0.1)	1.01 (0.06)	40.8 (2.5)	46.1 (2.8)
2-10mm	8 (0.4)	5 (2)	62 (3)	37 (10)	0.77 (0.1)	0.69(0.04)	64.7 (4.2)	68.9 (4.1)
Plant subtotal	592 (110)	475 (14)	2228 (395)	1781 (60)				
Organic soil layer	6 (0.5)	6 (0.4)	82 (7)	68 (5)	1.31 (0.04)	1.21 (0.03)	33.2 (1.0)	36.4 (1.0)
Mineral soil								
0-10 cm	1134 (18)	1085 (18)	2154 ^a (35)	1830 ^b (18)	0.19 (0.01)	0.17 (0.02)	12.0 (0.6)	11.8 (0.5)
10-20 cm	1204 (58)	1106 (21)	1445 (70)	1364 (25)	0.12 (0.02)	0.12 (0.02)	10.9 (0.4)	11.4 (0.2)
20-40 cm	2651 (161)	2397 (80)	1856 (113)	2198 (63)	0.07 (0.01)	0.09 (0.01)	10.0 (0.3)	10.9 (0.2)
Soil subtotal	4995 (208)	4594 (135)	5537 (171)	5395 (115)				
Ecosystem total	5587 (532)	5069 (25)	7768 (965)	7164 (110)				

822 Notes: *Root of trees was not sampled due to the highly destructive. The N concentration and C/N of tree root was estimated by the mean value of branch and stem.

- 824 Legends for figures
- 825

Figure 1 Mean δ^{15} N values of major ecosystem compartments before and three months after, one year after and three years after ¹⁵N addition in two forests. Error bars are standard error of the mean (n = 3).

829

Figure 2 The ¹⁵N recovery in plant, organic soil layer and mineral soil at three months, one year and three years in the two study forests. Labelling date was April 15th, 2015 (primary forest) and April 15th, 2016 (secondary forest). ¹⁵N recovery one week and one month after ¹⁵N tracer addition was only available for the primary forest and only trees and shrubs were included as plants.

835

Figure 3 The ¹⁵N recovery in different plant compartments three months, one year and three years after ¹⁵N labelling in the two study forests. "Tree-woody biomass" includes branch, bark, stem and root of trees. Labelling date was on April 15th, 2015 (primary forest) and April 15th, 2016 (secondary forest). ¹⁵N recovery one week and one month after ¹⁵N tracer addition was only available for the primary forest and only trees and shrubs were included as plants. ¹⁵N recovery in stems and roots of trees was only measured for one year and three years after ¹⁵N tracer addition.

843

Figure 4 The ¹⁵N recovery (%) in our two tropical forest ecosystems in comparison 844 with other studies from temperate forests. Only forests for which ¹⁵N recovery has been 845 846 determined for at least three years were analyzed. Details of site characteristics are provided in Table S5. Note: JFL-P and JFL-S represent primary forest and secondary 847 forest in Jianfengling (current study); QY-L and QY-M represent larch forest and mixed 848 849 forest in Oingyuan (Li et al., 2019); Harvard-H and Harvard-P represent oak forest and red pine forest in Harvard (Nadelhoffer et al., 1999a; Nadelhoffer et al., 2004); 850 Spillimacheen (Preston et al., 1990; Preston & Mead, 1994); Ysselsteyn (only ¹⁵NH₄⁺ 851 labelling, Wessel et al., 2013); Arnot (only ¹⁵NO₃⁻ labelling, Goodale, 2017); Alptal 852 (¹⁵NH₄¹⁵NO₃ labelling, Schleppi et al., 1999; Providoli et al., 2005; Krause et al., 2012). 853









