Letter: proving the benefit of exercise intervention in metabolic associated fatty liver disease - authors' reply **Running Head: Letter to the Editors Authors and Affiliations** Philip O'Gorman<sup>1</sup>, Sara Naimimohasses<sup>2,3</sup>, Ann Monaghan<sup>1</sup>, Megan Kennedy<sup>1</sup>, Stephen P. Finn<sup>4</sup>, J. Bernadette Moore<sup>5</sup>, John Gormley<sup>1</sup> and Suzanne Norris<sup>2,3</sup> <sup>1</sup>Discipline of Physiotherapy, Trinity College Dublin, Ireland <sup>2</sup>Department of Hepatology, St James's Hospital, Dublin, Ireland <sup>3</sup>Department of Clinical Medicine, Trinity College Dublin, Ireland <sup>4</sup>Department of Histopathology, St James's Hospital and Trinity College Dublin, Ireland <sup>5</sup>School of Food Science and Nutrition, University of Leeds, United Kingdom **Corresponding Author** Philip O'Gorman, Discipline of Physiotherapy, Trinity Centre for Health Sciences, St James's Hospital, phone: +353858247248, email: pogorma@tcd.ie 

## **Editors:**

1

- We would like to thank Drs Stine and Schmitz<sup>1</sup> for their interest in our paper<sup>2</sup>, and for
- 3 their comments inviting further discussion of the interpretation of our results.
- 4 The first comment relates to the heterogeneity of the exercise group in our study, which
- 5 included 16 metabolic associated fatty liver disease (MAFLD) patients across the
- 6 histological spectrum. Although we acknowledge the author's comment, the decision
- 7 to include patients across the entire histological spectrum of MAFLD enabled
- 8 comparison to previous exercise-only studies that did not exclude non-NASH and/or
- 9 cirrhotic patients and used histological endpoints<sup>3,4</sup>. The reporting of histological
- outcomes was also done to facilitate comparison with these previous studies<sup>3,4</sup>.
- As stated, this was a pilot study with the goal of informing larger randomised controlled
- trials on the potential benefits of aerobic exercise in improving histological features of
- 13 MAFLD. Therefore, in line with the CONSORT extension for pilot and feasibility trials<sup>5</sup>,
- rather than state primary outcome, as is appropriate in a definitive trial, we prespecified
- our assessments of a significant improvement in *any* histological endpoint of MAFLD
- 16 (fibrosis and/or NAS components), similar to previous reports<sup>3,4</sup>. But the point of a
- benefit for defining outcomes in line with the FDA/EMA's intermediate endpoints is well
- 18 taken.
- 19 Exercise is reported as safe and recommended for cirrhotic patients<sup>6,7</sup>, and we argue
- 20 that excluding these patients would limit our understanding of the benefits of exercise
- 21 across the histological spectrum of MAFLD. Furthermore, as is common in exercise
- 22 trials, our sample size was low, as acknowledged in the limitations, and we established
- *a priori* to analyse all included participants. It should be noted that of the 12 patients
- 24 that had post-intervention liver biopsies in our study, at baseline, 11/12 (92%) had

- 1 NASH and 10/12 (83%) had fibrosis stages 1-3, while 2/12 (17%) had cirrhotic
- 2 staging<sup>2</sup>. When restricting patients to NASH and fibrosis stages 1-3 (n=9), 5/9 (56%)
- achieved NASH resolution without worsening of fibrosis (P=0.025), 7/9 (78%)
- 4 regressed one hepatocyte ballooning stage (*P*=0.008), 5/9 (56%) patients decreased
- NAS by  $\geq$ 1-point (2-points n=2, P=0.023), and 5/9 (56%) regressed one fibrosis stage
- 6 (P=0.102). We are heartened by these results which confirms the proof of concept and
- 7 are not convinced that one can infer time to regression from the meta-analysis of
- 8 progression data by Singh et al8.
- 9 The authors questioned whether patients on pharmacologic treatment were included<sup>1</sup>.
- 10 While no participants were taking any anti-NASH agents currently under investigation;
- as detailed in Table 1<sup>2</sup>, at baseline some participants were taking anti-hypertensives,
- lipid-lowering agents and hypoglycaemic medication as part of their standard of care.
- We acknowledged in our limitations (Section 4.1, point e) that pharmacology was only
- assessed at baseline, meaning that initiation or discontinuation of medications during
- the intervention could not be determined.
- In conclusion, we thank Drs Stine and Schmitz<sup>1</sup> for their comments. Our results confirm
- the proof of concept, and we anticipate that our data will inform the design of future
- randomised controlled trials to strengthen the evidence on the beneficial effects of
- aerobic exercise on histological endpoints of MAFLD.

## **Declaration of personal and financial interests**

- 22 The authors' declarations of personal and financial interests are unchanged from those
- 23 in the original article<sup>2</sup>.

20

21

## 1 References

- Jonathan G. Stine & Kathryn H. Schmitz. Letter: proving the benefit of exercise intervention in metabolic associated fatty liver disease. *Aliment Pharmacol Ther* (2020).
- O'Gorman, P. *et al.* Improvement in histological endpoints of MAFLD following a 12-week aerobic exercise intervention. *Aliment Pharmacol Ther* **n/a**, doi:10.1111/apt.15989 (2020).
- Hickman, I. *et al.* A Pilot Randomised Study of the Metabolic and Histological Effects of Exercise in Non-alcoholic Steatohepatitis. *Journal of Diabetes* & *Metabolism* **4** (2013).
- Eckard, C. *et al.* Prospective histopathologic evaluation of lifestyle modification in nonalcoholic fatty liver disease: a randomized trial. *Therap Adv Gastroenterol* **6**, 249-259, doi:10.1177/1756283x13484078 (2013).
- Eldridge, S. M. *et al.* CONSORT 2010 statement: extension to randomised pilot and feasibility trials. *BMJ* **355**, i5239, doi:10.1136/bmj.i5239 (2016).
- Aamann, L., Dam, G., Rinnov, A. R., Vilstrup, H. & Gluud, L. L. Physical exercise for people with cirrhosis. *Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews*, doi:10.1002/14651858.CD012678.pub2 (2018).
- Tandon, P. *et al.* Exercise in cirrhosis: Translating evidence and experience to practice. *Journal of Hepatology* **69**, 1164-1177, doi:10.1016/j.jhep.2018.06.017 (2018).
- Singh, S. *et al.* Fibrosis progression in nonalcoholic fatty liver vs nonalcoholic steatohepatitis: a systematic review and meta-analysis of paired-biopsy studies. *Clin Gastroenterol Hepatol* **13**, 643-654.e641-649; quiz e639-640, doi:10.1016/j.cgh.2014.04.014 (2015).