



Deposited via The University of Leeds.

White Rose Research Online URL for this paper:

<https://eprints.whiterose.ac.uk/id/eprint/1655/>

Article:

Lamb, M. (2004) Integrative motivation in a globalizing world. *System*, 32 (1). pp. 3-19.
ISSN: 0346-251X

<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.system.2003.04.002>

Reuse

See Attached

Takedown

If you consider content in White Rose Research Online to be in breach of UK law, please notify us by emailing eprints@whiterose.ac.uk including the URL of the record and the reason for the withdrawal request.



White Rose
university consortium
Universities of Leeds, Sheffield & York

White Rose Consortium ePrints Repository

<http://eprints.whiterose.ac.uk/>

This is an author produced version of a paper published in **System**.

White Rose Repository URL for this paper:

<http://eprints.whiterose.ac.uk/1655/>

Published paper

Lamb, M. (2004) *Integrative motivation in a globalizing world*. *System*, 32 (1).
pp. 3-19.

Abstract

This article reports on research into the motivation of Indonesian children aged 11-12 years old, as they begin formal study of English in an urban junior high school. The research used closed and open questionnaire items, backed up by class observations and interviews with a selected group of learners. Very high levels of motivation to learn the language were found throughout the cohort, including both integrative and instrumental orientations, but these two traditionally distinct constructs were found to be almost indistinguishable. The article argues that as English loses its association with particular Anglophone cultures and is instead identified with the powerful forces of globalization, the desire to 'integrate' loses its explanatory power in many EFL contexts. Individuals may aspire towards a 'bicultural' identity which incorporates an English-speaking globally-involved version of themselves in addition to their local L1-speaking self. It is speculated that changes in individuals' motivation to learn the language may therefore be partly explained by reference to ongoing processes of identification, especially during the formative years of adolescence.

Keywords: motivation; identity; Psychology and language learning; Asian students; culture; learner behaviour

Integrative motivation in a globalizing world

1. Introduction

The notion of ‘integrativeness’ – a desire to learn a language in order to “come closer to the other language community” (Gardner, 2001a: 5) – has been a central concept in language learner motivation for several decades now, influential not just in theory and research but in teaching methodology and materials (e.g. Harmer, 2001). In Gardner’s (1985) socio-educational model of second language acquisition, learners who had the characteristic of ‘integrativeness’ were said to have an integrative orientation (or goal) towards learning the language, favourable attitudes towards the language community, and a general openness towards other groups in general (sometimes interpreted as an ‘interest in foreign languages’ e.g. in Masgoret et al., 2001). They were said to be ‘integratively motivated’ if they also had positive attitudes towards the learning situation, and exhibited aspects of motivated behaviour such as effort, an expressed desire and enjoyment in the process of learning.

As Dörnyei & Csizér point out (2002: 453), “the core aspect of ...the integrative disposition is some sort of psychological and emotional ‘*identification*’”, and following Gardner and Lambert’s (1972) lead, this has been conceived of being with the people who speak the L2 and their culture. The theoretical justification for this view lies in the fact that “learning another language is not like learning math or word processing. Especially in adolescence, it is likely to involve not only the linguistic and cognitive capacities of the learner as an individual, but her social, historical, emotional, cultural, moral sense of self as a subject.” (Kramsch, 2001: 12). The sense of self is challenged, Gardner claims, by the need to take on “the behavioural characteristics of another cultural group of people.” (Gardner, 2001b: 6).

A considerable amount of research effort has been, and is still being, expended on the question of whether integrative motivation exists among different language learner groups, and whether it can be linked to achievement behaviour and ultimate success with the L2. According to Gardner himself, this research has generally endorsed the significance of the concept, and he proposes only minor changes to his original model (ibid). Nevertheless there have been dissenting voices. Even in Canada itself, where Gardner and Lambert’s ideas originated, there are those who contest the precise definition of integrative motivation in particular learning contexts (e.g. Clement and Kruidenier, 1983, Clement et al., 1994, Belmechri and Hummel, 1998). Others have suggested that integrative motivation is more important in ESL settings like Canada than in many EFL contexts around the world, where learners have limited contact with L2 speakers or their culture, rarely reach beyond an intermediate level and where an instrumental orientation may be more helpful in promoting successful learning (e.g. Dörnyei, 1990, Oxford and Shearin, 1994, Warden and Lin, 2000). Questions have also been raised about the relevance of the concept with younger language learners (Nikolov, 1999).

Moreover, the past decade has seen what Gardner himself has called a “motivational renaissance” (Gardner and Tremblay, 1994) with new concepts from educational psychology widening the research agenda and new understandings emerging of the nature of motivation itself. It is increasingly recognised, for example, that learner attributes and activity are profoundly influenced by the socio-cultural environment, such that motivation itself could be said to reside not in the individual but in the interaction of the individual with his/her environment (Hickey, 1997, McGroarty, 2001). Likewise, our emerging awareness of the dynamic nature of motivation and the way it changes over time is recognised in Dörnyei and Ottó’s process-oriented model of L2 motivation, which proposes that different types of motivation may operate on the individual learner at different stages of the learning process (Dörnyei and Ottó, 1998). These ideas tend to undermine the notion of a fixed trait – such as ‘integrativeness’ – inevitably impacting upon learner behaviour and determining long-term success. They also question whether the research methods which have underpinned the construct - large-scale psychometric surveys of attitude – can justly claim to capture the complexity of motivation either as a precursor to action (for example as an ‘orientation’) or as a sustainer of action (Spolsky, 2000).

The world itself has changed greatly too since Gardner and Lambert first introduced the notion of integrative motivation in the late 1950’s. Their ideas are predicated upon there being clearly identifiable social groups associated with particular languages, with some contact between them. One may argue about whether the relative status of the languages matter (e.g. Clement and Kruidenier, 1983), or how much contact there is between the groups (e.g. see for example Gardner, 2001a); but in the case of English, the arguments may possibly be redundant. As Warschauer (2000: 512) points out, globalization has brought about “a new society, in which English is shared among many groups of non-native speakers rather than dominated by the British or Americans.” In the minds of learners, English may not be associated with particular geographical or cultural communities but with a spreading international culture incorporating (inter alia) business, technological innovation, consumer values, democracy, world travel, and the multifarious icons of fashion, sport and music. In a study of university students of English in Jordan, for example, Kaylani (1996) was puzzled to find integrative motivation among her male students, because she did not expect the average Jordanian male to identify closely with American or British culture. However, she was able to explain her results by arguing that “he probably does see himself as a member of an international English speaking community, disassociated from any particular culture” (ibid: 87). Yashima (2002: 57) similarly found that for Japanese university students “English symbolizes the world around Japan” and proposed that some learners may have an ‘international posture’ that motivates them to learn and communicate in the language more than others. In a recent review of the literature, Dörnyei and Csizér (2002: 453) state “some sort of ‘integrativeness’-related factor typically emerges in empirical studies on L2 motivation”, but admit that “it may be timely to re-examine the term”.

The rest of this paper reports a study of English language learning at an Indonesian junior high school which, I will claim, throws some light on the nature of integrative motivation in one corner of this rapidly globalizing world.

2. The study

In August 2002 I spent one month investigating the language learning attitudes and motivation of first year pupils in an urban junior high school in a provincial capital on the Indonesian island of Sumatra, a town where I had previously worked for several years. This was the first phase of a longitudinal study aiming to track changes in motivation over the first two years of serious formal study of English (almost all pupils have studied English at primary school, but most very briefly), to identify factors associated with changes in motivation, and to explore the relationship between what they say about their motivation and what they actually do inside and outside the classroom.

This school is located in an area of the town where government officials and academics live, and was different in many respects from schools even on the outskirts of the city, let alone rural areas. According to the head of the local education office, it was “one of the best three junior high schools” in the city, and local parents compete to get their children accepted there. Comparing my own data on the school (e.g. teacher background, parental occupations, proportion of pupils who attend private language schools and own an English dictionary) with those presented in a 1996 national survey of junior high schools, it clearly falls into the category of a relatively “well-resourced, high-achieving state school in the provincial capital city” (Sadtono et al., 1996). Nevertheless, general living standards are still far lower than anything found in the west - only a small minority of homes have a computer or car, for example, and few parents have travelled abroad or acquired any proficiency in English.

3. Method

My investigation combined a questionnaire survey of almost all (219) first-year students (aged 11-12) in the school, with semi-structured interviews with a ‘focal group’ of 12 individual learners. I also observed these individual learners at least twice during English classes, and interviewed the eight English teachers who worked at the school.

The questionnaire contained 8 items eliciting background information about the students. The remainder of items sought to uncover students’ attitudes and motivation to learn English, and their level and type of independent English learning activity. Using a simple 3-point Likert scale, one item focussed on each of these issues:-

- How satisfied they felt with their progress in English so far.
- How confident they were of their ability to learn well.
- How much they liked learning English.
- How important English was to them.
- How important English was compared to other subjects in school.

Two further items asked students to rank on a scale from 1-3 the importance of five different reasons for learning English (e.g. ‘because I need it for my future career’), and

the regularity of their use of English outside of school in seven specified activities (e.g. 'watching English language films'). Both the five possible reasons for learning English, and the seven possible activities using English, were chosen on the basis of older students' comments in a previous study in this context (Lamb 2002). Finally, three open items asked students to say why they liked or disliked English, to state their preferred way of working in the classroom, and to ask the researcher any question they liked. The main purpose of the questionnaire was to provide an overall description of the first-year students' disposition and behaviour, which would enable the selection of a broadly representative sample to form the 'focal group', and (when administered again) to show trends over the first 20 months of study in junior high school.

The interviews with the 12 selected learners were intended to explore the above issues in more depth, in particular how they felt about learning English in their new school, how their friends felt, what they and their friends did to learn English outside the school, and their attitudes towards English-speaking peoples and cultures. Interviews lasted approximately 20 minutes. I began speaking in English to see how willing and able they were to respond in the language, but in all cases switched to Bahasa Indonesia within two minutes. My own communicative ability in Indonesian was sufficient to hold a conversation without need of an interpreter, though misunderstandings did occasionally arise and topics were changed prematurely. Later I carried out a detailed content analysis of the transcribed interviews, directly comparing the learners' responses and identifying common themes in their comments. Where necessary I consulted an Indonesian colleague to help interpret remarks.

By generating a combination of quantitative and qualitative data, I hoped to be able to uncover general patterns of activity and attitude among the whole school population, while at the same time uncovering learners' own interpretations of their experiences. Pintrich and Schunk (2002: 11) recognise the value of qualitative research "for raising new questions and new slants on old questions", though caution that findings need to be interpreted in the light of an existing theoretical framework. Ushioda (2001) has argued that qualitative or interpretative approaches, involving in-depth and long-term study of individuals' thinking, is especially appropriate where motivation is conceived of as context-dependent, multifaceted, and dynamic. The sociocultural context of this study was very different from the mainly western and/or developed country contexts where most motivation research has taken place, and if I relied on questionnaires alone I could not be certain that my respondents were interpreting my questions in the same way as, for example, Canadian or Japanese undergraduates would do. The two contrasting types of data can also illuminate each other, for example by allowing checking of individual learners' comments against their previous questionnaire responses.

In the following section I present the findings from this study which throw some light on the nature of these children's motivation to learn English. I will report first on data from the questionnaire, but will use data from the interviews to help interpret some of the results. I will then report my analysis of the interview data itself. At all times I attempt to take a reflexive stance, aware that my presence in the school will have inevitably affected

the responses of the children, for whom I was often the first native English speaker they had met. Their reactions to me, however, are valuable data in themselves.

4. Results

4.1. Questionnaire Data

4.1.1. Experience of learning English

An unexpected finding was that all but one of the 219 respondents had studied English at primary school, though this was often as little as one lesson a week for one year. English is not yet part of the official primary school curriculum, but schools are often pressured into introducing it by parents anxious to give their children a head-start in the language. What is more, just over half (51%) had already taken a private course in English, and all had now been learning English in their junior high school, for two 90-minute lessons per week, for just over a month. In addition to the formal morning classes, the school also offered afternoon ‘extra coaching’ in English on two afternoons a week, and over 80% of the learners were now attending these one-hour sessions too.

The children were also asked whether they ever use or learn English at home. Only two respondents claimed never to have any contact with English (except for school-assigned homework, which all have to do), and Table 1 below gives the children’s own estimates for how frequently they engaged in various activities:-

Table 1 – *Frequency of activities involving English at home (n = 219)*

ACTIVITY INVOLVING ENGLISH	Never (%)	Once a month (%)	Once a week (%)	Almost every day (%)
Watching TV or video	11	52	22	15
Listening to the radio	48	44	6	2
Listening to songs	6	47	23	24
Reading books or magazines	27	51	16	6
Conversation	37	50	10	2
Studying the language	6	42	41	11
Using a computer	52	29	12	7

Even allowing for some exaggeration in responses, to impress the native-speaker researcher, the overall impression gained is that English is already very much a part of the lives of children in provincial Indonesia in 2002. Their proficiency may still be very low, but the language is all around them, most notably in the music they like to listen to on cassette (western boy bands are especially popular in this age group) and in Hollywood movies and other programmes (e.g. English soccer matches) shown on TV. Listening to English radio programmes and reading English-language magazines or books are less popular, though they can be found by dedicated learners; perhaps there is

little that is accessible to very elementary level learners. The figures for computer use can be expected to rise sharply as prices fall and the internet becomes more widely available. It is notable that only a small minority do deliberately study the language at home on their own initiative (discounting homework assigned by their teacher) on a regular basis.

4.1.2. The importance of English

In view of the prevalence of English in their lives, it is not surprising that the great majority of children regard English as either important (35%) or very important (64%). Only two respondents said it was not important. They were then asked to evaluate five possible reasons for its importance, selected because they reflected findings in the research literature on school level motivation. The five statements were intended to measure strength of learners' integrative orientation (meeting foreigners and finding out about English-speaking countries), instrumental orientation (career), intrinsic motivation (pleasure in the process of learning), the motive of satisfying parents, and finally of doing well at school. The results are presented in Table 2.

Table 2 – Respondents' views on why English is important (n = 219)

<i>Reason why English is important</i>	<i>Not imp</i>	<i>Imp</i>	<i>Very imp</i>	<i>Mean score (1-3)</i>
Can help my career in the future	3	26	71	2.68
It's a pleasure to study	3	68	29	2.26
Can help me meet foreigners & learn about foreign countries	7	37	56	2.50
My parents encourage me to learn it	6	45	49	2.43
It's an important school subject	13	46	41	2.27

This result would initially appear to support the view that in many Asian settings, instrumental motives for learning English are predominant (e.g. Lai, 1999, Warden and Lin, 2000). It should be pointed out, however, that all five reasons seem to be considered important. The respect for parental views has also been found to be a common feature of Asian students' attitudes (e.g. Eaton and Dembo, 1997), while the learners' general desire to succeed academically in their new school is confirmed by the fact that only 24% believe that English is *more* important than other subjects.

4.1.3. Liking for learning English

Despite the slightly lower score for 'pleasure' on the above item, responses to the specific question 'Do you like learning English so far?' indicate that they have very positive impressions of learning English thus far. Out of all 219 respondents, not a single one said that they didn't like learning English, 38 said that they 'quite liked it' and 181 said that

they liked it. These figures contrast starkly with findings in Britain, for example, where academic and public media seem to agree that foreign languages are among the least popular subjects at school (e.g. Chambers, 1998, Williams et al., 2002).

The children were then asked to explain their response in their own words. Their statements were analysed and coded to produce eight distinct reasons, presented in Table 3, along with an example comment taken from the questionnaire. Many of the respondents made more than one comment.

Table 3 – *Reasons given for liking to learn English*

	REASON	Freq. %
1.	English is enjoyable to learn <i>'Because learning English is a real pleasure; the language is different from Bahasa Indonesia'</i>	19
2.	English is important as an international language <i>'Because you can learn the language of other countries and the international language.'</i>	17
3.	English broadens one's outlook <i>"Because with English we can broaden our outlook and gain knowledge."</i>	14
4.	It's important to gain a mastery of English <i>"Because by learning English I can know how to speak it."</i>	13
5.	English helps one to meet foreigners <i>"Because if we learn English we can speak with other people, for instance when we visit a tourist area."</i>	10
6.	English is useful for one's career <i>"If we want to apply for work, in general we need English. And if we use a computer we can understand."</i>	9
7.	English is necessary for travel <i>"If we go to Europe we can speak with the people there."</i>	7
8.	The teacher is nice <i>"Because the teacher's nice and explains things which the pupils don't understand."</i>	4
9.	Other	7
	<i>TOTAL (from 181 learners who said they liked English)</i>	251

The first thing to notice about these comments is actually how few of them relate to the process of studying English. Only 47 of the learners actually expressed an intrinsic pleasure in learning, and only two of the twelve children I interviewed actually said that English was their favourite subject. Some of the comments clearly correspond to an integrative orientation (no.s 5 & 7), but it should be noted that there were only four specific references to English-speaking nations (all to Britain, reflecting my own nationality). Most comments referred to foreigners or foreign countries in general, either

abroad, as in “if we can speak English well then in the future we can travel, study or work outside of Indonesia because English is the international language and we’ve really got to study it”, or within Indonesia itself, as in “because if we already know English we will easily be able to understand if people ask us things in English.”

Some of the comments seem to relate directly to an instrumental orientation (no. 6), and one might expect the number to be more if the children were a little older. But well over a hundred of the comments (no.s 2,3 & 4) seem to express some more general need for English – a need strong enough that they express pleasure in satisfying it, even though the process itself (their lessons) may sometimes be boring. In fact the children’s written comments did not seem to make any distinction between learning the language for pleasure (intrinsic motivation), for future gain (instrumental orientation) or to meet and get to know other English-speakers (integrative orientation). These motives are blended together in statements such as: “Because English is important for our future and learning it can expand our awareness about other countries”; and “Because English is the international language and if I hear people speaking it, I also want to learn it”.

There are even comments which seem to invert the traditional definition of integrative orientation. For instance, one girl said she likes learning English “because we can then speak with people who are clever at English and so we’re not ignored by people”, suggesting not so much a wish to ‘come closer’ to English-speakers as not to be pushed away. Similarly, a boy wrote: “the basic reason is because if we know English, we can go abroad and we can use English”. This seemingly tautological statement can be explained if we understand his desire as being not to go abroad *per se*, but to be a competent enough linguist to go abroad and be seen communicating in English. This possible interpretation is supported by a comment from another girl in her interview, who when asked if she had an ambition, replied “Yes... for example if I can get to study abroad, I can become really fluent in English.” English is for her an end in itself.

4.1.4. Favourite activities in class

The children were asked which activities they liked best in their English lessons. Out of 184 responses, 44 related to a particular series of lessons they had done recently about personal introductions. Of the rest, 63% said they liked doing ‘conversation’ or ‘dialogues’. Singing came a distant second with 11% of the vote. The priority that they give to developing their speaking skills is interesting because in some ways it contradicts their most immediate needs. Class tests and school examinations (as well as private school progress tests) are all of the paper and pen type, and demand knowledge of English grammar and vocabulary. The English they come across outside of school is mainly in magazines (and therefore needs to be read) or in films and songs (and therefore needs to be understood). As their questionnaire responses showed, English conversation is one of the least likely activities for them to be engaged in outside the class. Perhaps being able to *speak* English is so important because it is the most visible of the skills; when they imagine their future selves, it is as fluent *speakers* of the language able, should the need arise, to deal with tourists’ queries or attend an English-language job interview. Unfortunately teaching methods and materials do not emphasise speaking skills, which

may well lead to increasing dissatisfaction with their school English lessons. In the lessons I observed, however, many of the learners took whatever opportunities were available to express themselves in English, for example by calling out answers to questions and enthusiastically repeating English words and phrases after the teacher.

4.1.5. Other comments

The final part of the questionnaire allowed the children if they wanted to make further comments about English, or to ask me, the researcher a question. For many this would represent the first instance of communication with a foreigner. Their comments/questions are categorized and presented in Table 4.

Table 4 – *Responses in the final ‘Any other comments’ section*

	COMMENTS	Freq.
1.	Statements emphasising importance of English & their desire to learn it	45
2.	Questions about how to learn English effectively	21
3.	Questions about English and its place in the world	20
4.	Personal questions about the researcher	14
5.	Suggestions for increasing number of English lessons & teachers	12
6.	Questions about the use of <i>Bahasa Indonesia</i> abroad	8
7.	Questions about the UK	5
8.	Critical comments about the dominance of English	4
9.	Other	5
	<i>TOTAL</i>	<i>134</i>

As can be seen, about 60% chose to make a further comment, and a good proportion of these were reiterations of how important they regarded English to be (no.1). Some emphasize that English is beneficial not only to the individual but to society at large. “If I can speak English, I can go abroad and become a person who’s really useful for Indonesia” says one learner. Another learner says “English is so important for every person’s future” and goes on to ask me, the researcher, to travel to the poorer regions of the country to teach it. I suspect that the questions about methods of learning (no.2) were asked in the belief that, as a native-speaker from England itself, I might possess some insider knowledge which would make learning English effortless. Questions about English (no.3) sometimes revealed an almost awe-struck vision of its place in the world. “Will English be used often in the coming century?” one girl asked, “and will people who haven’t mastered it be considered illiterate?” Another asked: “Does everyone have to master their English lessons in order to achieve their dreams?”

The frequency and emotionality of such comments lead me to conclude that they are not simply an attempt to accommodate my own expected views. In fact, they suggest that these children have been repeatedly exposed to a pro-English discourse, not just in teachers’ pronouncements but in the official media, in advertising by private language schools, and in parental advice at home. Only faint traces of resistance can be found - one boy, for example, asked: “Why do we usually have to use a foreign language when receiving guests in our country, while they don’t use our language?”

4.2. Interview data

It was rarely possible for me to move around the school in the discreet manner expected of an ethnographic researcher. Pupils often called out a greeting, and I was constantly approached by more ‘daring’ pupils eager to say hello and try out their limited English. Many of the older pupils asked me for my email address and telephone number. Teachers too seemed anxious to take any opportunity to chat to me in English – and this applied not just to the English teachers, who were hungry for exposure to native-speaker language, but also teachers of other subjects. This persistent attention is often noted by foreign visitors to provincial Indonesia. It is noteworthy here because it may have some relevance to discussions of ‘integrativeness’. Many Indonesians are excited by contact with westerners, but the conversations rarely go very far beyond a simple exchange of personal information, and email and telephone details are rarely taken up. It is often sufficient to be ‘seen’ to be in contact with westerners; a meaningful relationship is not expected to follow.

Indeed several of the children found an interview with a real English-speaking foreigner to be an ordeal. All agreed to be interviewed, and seemed actually pleased to be ‘chosen’, but some clearly enjoyed the experience and would have been happy to continue for longer, while others couldn’t conceal their discomfort. It was not possible to link their reaction, though, to their responses on the questionnaire. For example, the boy who seemed most eager to leave the interview and return to his class marked English as very important for meeting foreigners, but not important as a school subject. Clearly ‘willingness to communicate’ in an L2 is a complex notion and no conclusions should be drawn from a possibly stressful first meeting with a foreigner (MacIntyre et al., 1998).

When asked directly for their views of western countries, almost all the children responded positively, citing for instance the absence of riots, the higher standard of living, and the advanced technology as reasons for admiring those countries, and even, in half the cases, actually wanting to travel or live there for a while. There were vivid expressions of ‘integrativeness’ in some of the children’s remarks. One boy said: “My comment is that English is good and stands on top of the world....and so too are English people like Queen Elizabeth, Princess Diana, David Beckham ...” But this, and one girl’s ambition to study at Oxford University, were the only references to Britain or other English-speaking countries. As in the questionnaire data, the vast majority of comments were about the ‘west’ in general, and it is difficult to separate the instrumentally-oriented comments from the integratively-oriented. For example, the same boy who referred to British cultural icons above also said: “I think Europeans and people from Asia, they’re generally good at English, if they’re interviewed [on TV] they reply in English...I was surprised at the way English has become the international language, that’s why I like it”.

The ‘West’ is perceived as the *source* of globalization, but these children are acutely aware that its social, economic and cultural effects will be felt *inside* Indonesia. One boy, whose questionnaire responses actually suggested a lower than average interest in English and low intrinsic motivation, said that his main ambition was “to be good at

English, because in the future, according to my parents, globalization is going to happen.....Western people are going to come to Indonesia, and will get involved in every country.....It'll be free, we can go wherever, they can go wherever." Asked if her parents had forced her to attend a private course in English, one girl replied: "No, because I'm interested in learning English, because people said that maybe a few years in the future, English is going to be used in Indonesia, so I was afraid I wouldn't be able to, so I was really interested". Again, the sense is not so much of language learners reaching out to integrate with the foreign culture or community, but of knowing they must embrace the changes already sweeping their own culture.

English is only one of many skills they need to acquire, though, and has to compete with other interests and goals for the children's attention. Apart from school subjects, the children are also involved in many other organized activities, such as the Scouts, the local children's marching band, art or music competitions, or sports teams. Asked whether she enjoyed learning English, one girl replied, "the pleasure comes from knowing it". English to her is an accomplishment which will be a part of her future identity, whether she ends up as a "doctor, painter, designer or astronomer". Another of the girls admitted: "I want to be a champion, for example if I enter a competition I always want to win... the important thing is to be good at whatever skills you learn." So even for these two very highly motivated girls, English was not something special but just one of many challenges that would dominate their teenage years.

All the children appeared to take a pride in having gained a place in their new school, and gave a variety of reasons for feeling happy there, including the "good discipline", "the English lessons", the "the way of teaching" and the fact that there were no "nasty pupils". On the other hand, none expressed pleasure in actually learning English in school classrooms (as opposed to using the language for their own purposes). They were also prepared to criticize previous teachers they had had – one boy complained, for instance, that the teacher in his private course ignored the children and failed to impose discipline, while a girl complained that her primary school lessons never provided any oral practice in English. What is more, nine out of the twelve children said that many of their friends were *not* interested in learning English; a frequent estimate was that only about half the class liked English or wanted to learn it. These responses indicate that, while they were still very reluctant to admit disenchantment with the school learning process, this may emerge later and affect their motivation to learn. One girl seemed to be aware of this danger and determined to avoid it: she said she was never bored in lessons "because I want to know; there are some people who if they don't understand they just get fed up and stop studying, but I want to know about it, till it becomes easy".

5. Discussion

Is 'integrativeness', then, a significant part of these Indonesian children's motivation to learn English? Gardner's (2001a) construct of 'integrativeness' includes an integrative as distinct from an instrumental orientation to learning the language (for example, wanting to meet L2-speaking people rather than just pass exams or get a better job), a favourable attitude towards the L2 community, and (usually) an openness to other groups in general.

Data from this study suggests that elements of this construct are certainly relevant in this context; but findings from the open sections of the questionnaire and the interviews in particular offer strong support to Dörnyei and Csizér's contention (2002: 454) that "the term may not so much be related to any actual, or metaphorical, *integration* into an L2 community as to some more basic *identification process* within the individual's self-concept". The results also cast doubt on how much it would contribute to an individual's long-term achievement in the language.

Firstly, whether learners have a favourable attitude towards English-speaking cultures may not be a relevant question any longer, as English is no longer associated just with Anglophone countries. Moreover, we have seen that an integrative and instrumental orientation are difficult to distinguish as separate concepts. Meeting with westerners, using computers, understanding pop songs, studying or travelling abroad, pursuing a desirable career – all these aspirations are associated with each other and with English as an integral part of the globalization processes that are transforming their society and will profoundly affect their own lives. This would in fact argue against Dörnyei and Csizér's (2002: 453) suggestion that integrativeness and instrumentality are "associated with different self-domains" and instead would offer some support to Yashima's (2002: 57) concept of 'international posture', a trait said to include "interest in foreign or international affairs, willingness to go overseas to study or work, readiness to interact with intercultural partners and...a non-ethnocentric attitude toward different cultures", which may be implicated in Japanese learners' willingness to communicate in a foreign language.

But it may be important to see this kind of motivation as a process rather than a stable trait. Arnett (2002: 777) has argued recently that one of the most striking psychological effects of globalization is that "most people now develop a *bicultural identity*, in which part of their identity is rooted in their local culture while another part stems from an awareness of their relation to the global culture" (original italics). Through the media, especially television but increasingly the internet, young people in diverse countries "develop a global identity that gives them a sense of belonging to a worldwide culture and includes an awareness of the events, practices, styles and information that are part of the global culture" (ibid). At the same time, however, they would retain a local identity which serves them well in their families and local communities and which enables them to observe local traditions and behavioural mores when necessary without any sense of contradiction with their other 'global' selves.

Such a duality has been noted in minority students in western countries, who face the challenge of reconciling the self to "membership in at least two worlds" (Syed 2001: 130).

e.g. McKay and Wong, for example, found cases among adolescent immigrants in the USA of "strong Chinese cultural identification and a strong desire to become American existing side by side" (1996: 604).

It has also been found in Asian EFL settings. LoCastro (2001: 83) observed a reluctance among her Japanese students to adopt certain English pragmatic norms, despite professing a strong motivation to learn the language, and explained it in terms of their

struggle to construct “an identity that includes being a competent speaker of English while retaining one’s L1 and the L1 culture.”

Many of the young adolescents in this study appear to be striving towards such a bicultural identity, as both a Sumatran (or other ethnic group) Indonesian and an Indonesian world citizen. Their role-models in this quest might not be English-speakers, therefore, nor even westerners in general, but rather other urban middle-class Indonesians who have already acquired this global identity. Gardner is still right to assert that language learning involves “taking on the behavioural characteristics of another cultural group of people” (Gardner, 2001b: 6), but paradoxically it may be the characteristics of their own compatriots, as a dominant cultural group within their society, which they covet. Admittedly this study provides no explicit references to this identification process, but in a previous interview study with university students in this city (see Lamb, 2002: 44), one high-achieving learner said: “Last month I went to Bandung for a holiday and I...like with the people in Bandung because they can speak English...most of the students especially they are very clever.” Just as this young woman aspires towards the sophisticated citizenry of Bandung, many young people in the rural areas of Sumatra would aspire towards her own position.

The English language is so important to this ‘world citizen’ identity because it is both the means and the end; that is, it is both a typical attribute of the Indonesian ‘world citizen’, and also an important means of becoming one, by providing access to financial, social and cultural resources. There is a small but growing market in home-published English-language literature for teenagers in Indonesia. One magazine on the newsstands of Jambi is *Cool ‘n Smart* – designed both to develop readers’ language skills (e.g. it provides glossaries of difficult words in each article), and also to keep them in tune with teenage global culture (e.g. topics in the August 2002 edition include Indonesian and British rock bands, tips on computer software, advice on sexually transmitted diseases, and stories about Muslims in the USA after 9/11). The magazine’s editorial, meanwhile, neatly captures the aspiring bicultural identity of its adolescent readers: “I’m not gonna say that you should be a good citizen and do good things to develop our country. I think you already know that it’s one of your duties. What I wanna say is that you have a freedom to do whatever you like” (vol. 2/10 page 7).

This study suggests that these students are exposed to a powerful discourse, channelled presumably through parents and schools as well as the media, which has encouraged them to develop a vision of an English-speaking, globally-involved but nationally-responsible future self, and which contributes to a high initial level of motivation to learn the language (and especially to learn to *speak* it). But adolescence is a time of life when identity is particularly in flux (Head 1997). Even for adults, in the globalizing world identity “has to be created and recreated on a more active basis than before” (Giddens, 2000: 65), and Norton (2000) found that her immigrant language learners’ motivation to learn and use English varied in close correspondence with their complex, dynamic identities in their new communities. It is probable, therefore, that these Indonesian school learners’ motivation will evolve in line with their own developing identities. As their ‘bicultural identity’ develops, there will inevitably be times of confusion when the global

identity seems to conflict with the local, and which may lead to a temporary loss of interest in learning English. Other learners may choose to resist the global culture altogether, identifying instead with what Arnett (2002) calls ‘self-selected cultures’, for example those based on Islamic fundamentalism. As they get older, some learners’ motivation may become more focussed as their personal aspirations change. Warschauer (2000) points out how people’s need for English will not be uniform among 21st century populations, but will vary from very high in jobs involving information processing (including business and technology) to a much more restricted and specific need in other occupations.

6. Implications

In this final section I will consider some possible implications of the study, both for research and teaching. First the small scale and exploratory nature of this research should be acknowledged. Having problematized the notion of integrative motivation in this context, it now needs to be examined more systematically. At this stage of the inquiry, qualitative approaches may be more productive than quantitative, because the identification processes being proposed are by definition highly context-sensitive, and as Hickey (1997: 182) has said, “self-report measures, particularly Likert-style scales....don’t capture the full range of responses, making different contexts appear more similar than they really are.” Open-ended questionnaire responses and conversations with learners, specifically focussing on their personal goals and role-models may help to clarify the nature of the identification process involved in motivation to learn English, and to tell us whether they vary within and between countries. The very personal nature of the topic means that indirect elicitation devices such as simulations or role-play may be needed (Cohen et al., 2000). Learner journals, oriented around learning activity inside and outside of school, might also help to reveal relevant thought processes (e.g. see Appleby, 2002). Meanwhile, insights into how this identification process may affect learning behaviour and ultimate achievement in English will only come from longitudinal research of an ethnographic nature, tracking learners over time in their natural environment (e.g. McKay & Wong 1996, Norton, 2000, Toohey, 2000).

Should our understanding of integrative motivation change, we may need to change teaching methods and materials too. If learners are found to identify with fluent *Indonesian* users of English, then Indonesian models of English should complement native-speaker models, certainly at early stages of learning. Similarly, materials writers need to acknowledge and utilize the wide variety of contexts in which young people use (or would use if they could) English within Indonesia, rather than concentrating on contexts of use involving native-speakers. As Cheung (2001) has suggested for Hong Kong, popular global culture may be motivating to teenagers in the classroom because it represents their most immediate meaningful contact with the language. In the long-term, the goal must be to enable them “to use the language less as an object of study and more as an additional language of their own to have an impact on and change the world.....to express their identity and make their voices heard” (Warschauer, 2000: 530). This will, of course, represent a real challenge for their teachers, whose own original motivation to learn English may have been very different.

References

- Appleby, R., 2002. English and East Timor. In: J. Lo Bianco, (Ed.), *Voices from Phnom Penh. Development and language: global influences and local effects*. Melbourne, Australia, Language Australia Ltd. pp. 23-36.
- Arnett, J. J., 2002. The Psychology of Globalization. *American Psychologist*, 57, 774-783.
- Belmechri, F., and K. Hummel, 1998. Orientations and Motivation in the Acquisition of English as a Second Language Among High School Students in Quebec City. *Language Learning*, 48, 219-244.
- Chambers, G., 1998. Pupils' perceptions of the foreign language learning experience. *Language Teaching Research*, 2, 231-259.
- Cheung, C.-K., 2001. The use of popular culture as a stimulus to motivate secondary students' English learning in Hong Kong. *ELT Journal*, 55, (1) 55-61.
- Clement, R., Z. Dörnyei, and K. A. Noels, 1994. Motivation, self-confidence and group cohesion in the foreign language classroom. *Language Learning*, 44, 417-448.
- Clement, R., and B. G. Kruidenier, 1983. Orientations in second language acquisition: The effects of ethnicity, milieu and target language on their emergence. *Language Learning*, 41, 469-512.
- Cohen, L., L. Manion, and K. Morrison, 2000. *Research Methods in Education*. London, RoutledgeFalmer.
- Dörnyei, Z., 1990. Conceptualizing motivation in foreign-language learning. *Language Learning*, 40, 45-78.
- Dörnyei, Z., and K. Csizér, 2002. Some dynamics of language attitudes and motivation: Results of a longitudinal nationwide survey. *Applied Linguistics*, 23, 421-462.
- Dörnyei, Z., and I. Otto, 1998. Motivation in action: A process model of L2 motivation. *Working Papers in Applied Linguistics* 4, London, Thames Valley University, 43-69.
- Eaton, M. J., and M. H. Dembo, 1997. Differences in the motivational beliefs of Asian American and Non-Asian students. *Journal of Educational Psychology*, 89, 433-440.

- Gardner, R., 1985. *Social Psychology and Second Language Learning: The Role of Attitude and Motivation*. London, Edward Arnold.
- Gardner, R., 2001a. Integrative motivation and second language acquisition. In: Z. Dornyei, and R. W. Schmidt, (Eds), *Motivation and Second Language Acquisition*. Honolulu, University of Hawai'i.
- Gardner, R., 2001b. Language learning motivation: The student, the teacher and the researcher. Key-note address to the Texas Foreign Language Education Conference, University of Texas, Austin.
- Gardner, R., and W. E. Lambert, 1972. *Attitudes and Motivation in Second Language Learning*. Rowley MA, Newbury House.
- Gardner, R., and P. F. Tremblay, 1994. On motivation: measurement and conceptual considerations. *The Modern Language Journal*, 78, 524-527.
- Giddens, A., 2000. *Runaway world: How globalization is reshaping our lives*. New York, Routledge.
- Harmer, J., 2001. *The Practice of English Language Teaching*. Harlow, Pearson.
- Head, J., 1997. *Working with Adolescents: Constructing Identity*. London, Falmer Press.
- Hickey, D. T., 1997. Motivation and contemporary socio-constructivist instructional perspectives. *Educational Psychologist*, 32, 175-193.
- Kaylani, C., 1996. The influence of gender and motivation on EFL learning strategy use in Jordan. In: Oxford, R. L., (Ed.), *Language learning strategies around the world: Cross-cultural perspectives*. Honolulu, University of Hawai'i, pp. 75-88.
- Kramsch, C., 2001. Beyond the second vs foreign language dichotomy: The subjective dimensions of language learning. Paper presented at the conference on Unity and Diversity in Language Use, University of Reading.
- Lai, E. F., 1999. Motivation to learn English in Hong Kong. *Language, Culture and Curriculum*, 12, 280-5.
- Lamb, M., 2002. Explaining successful language learning in difficult circumstances. *Prospect*, 17, 35-52.
- LoCastro, V., 2001. Individual differences in second language acquisition: attitudes, learner subjectivity, and L2 pragmatic norms. *System*, 2969-89.
- Masgoret, A. M., M. Bernaus, and R. Gardner, 2001. Examining the role of attitudes and motivation outside the formal classroom: A test of the mini-AMTB for children.

- In: Z. Dornyei, and R. W. Schmidt, (Eds.), *Motivation and Second Language Acquisition: Honolulu, University of Hawai'i*. pp. 281-295.
- McGroarty, M., 2001. *Situating Second Language Motivation*. In: Z. Dornyei, and R. W. Schmidt, (Eds.), *Motivation and Second Language Acquisition*. Honolulu, University of Hawai'i. pp. 69-91.
- MacIntyre, P. D., R. Clement, Z. Dornyei, and K. A. Noels, 1998. *Conceptualizing Willingness to Communicate in a L2: A Situational Model of L2 Confidence and Affiliation*. *The Modern Language Journal*, 82, (iv).
- Nikolov, M., 1999. 'Why do you learn English?' 'Because the teacher is short.' A study of Hungarian children's foreign language learning motivation. *Language Teaching Research*, 3, 33-56.
- Norton, B., 2000. *Identity and Language Learning: social processes and educational practice*. London, Longman.
- Oxford, R., and J. Shearin, 1994. *Language learning motivation: expanding the theoretical framework*. *Modern Language Journal*, 78, 12-28.
- Pintrich, P. R., and D. H. Schunk, 2002. *Motivation in Education: Theory, Research and Applications*. Upper Saddle River NJ, Merrill Prentice Hall.
- Sadtono, E., Handayani, and M. O'Reilly, 1996. *In-Service Training Programs for SLTP English Language Teachers: Report on diagnostic survey, with recommendations for program development.*, Jakarta, Ministry of Education and Culture
- Spolsky, B., 2000. *Language motivation revisited*. *Applied Linguistics*, 21, 157-169.
- Toohey, K., 2000. *Learning English at School: Identity, social relations and classroom practice*. Clevedon, England, Multilingual Matters.
- Ushioda, E., 2001. *Language learning at university: Exploring the role of motivational thinking*. In: Z. Dörnyei, and R. W. Schmidt, (Eds.), *Motivation and Second Language Acquisition*. Honolulu, University of Hawai'i, Second Language Teaching and Curriculum Center. pp. 93-125.
- Warden, C. A., and H. J. Lin, 2000. *Existence of integrative motivation in an Asian EFL setting*. *Foreign Language Annals*, 33, 535-547.
- Warschauer, M., 2000. *The Changing Global Economy and the Future of English Teaching*. *TESOL Quarterly*, 34, 511-535.

Williams, M., R. Burden, and U. Lanvers, 2002. 'French is the Language of Love and Stuff': student perceptions of issues related to motivation in learning a foreign language. *British Educational Research Journal*, 28, 504-528.

Yashima, T., 2002. Willingness to communicate in a second language: the Japanese EFL context. *The Modern Language Journal*, 86, 54-66.