# UNIVERSITY OF LEEDS

This is a repository copy of Latest advances in imaging techniques for characterizing soft, multiphasic food materials.

White Rose Research Online URL for this paper: http://eprints.whiterose.ac.uk/159317/

Version: Accepted Version

#### Article:

Metilli, L, Francis, M, Povey, M orcid.org/0000-0002-9740-2596 et al. (4 more authors) (2020) Latest advances in imaging techniques for characterizing soft, multiphasic food materials. Advances in Colloid and Interface Science, 279. 102154. ISSN 0001-8686

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cis.2020.102154

© 2020 Elsevier B.V. Licensed under the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International License (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-ncnd/4.0/).

#### Reuse

This article is distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivs (CC BY-NC-ND) licence. This licence only allows you to download this work and share it with others as long as you credit the authors, but you can't change the article in any way or use it commercially. More information and the full terms of the licence here: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/

#### Takedown

If you consider content in White Rose Research Online to be in breach of UK law, please notify us by emailing eprints@whiterose.ac.uk including the URL of the record and the reason for the withdrawal request.



eprints@whiterose.ac.uk https://eprints.whiterose.ac.uk/

# Latest advances in imaging techniques for characterizing soft, multiphasic food materials

5	Lorenzo Metilli <sup>1</sup> , Mathew Francis <sup>1</sup> , Megan Povey <sup>1</sup> , Aris Lazidis <sup>2</sup> , Stephanie Marty-Terrade <sup>2</sup> , Joydeep Ray <sup>3</sup> ,
6	Elena Simone <sup>1</sup> *
7	<sup>1</sup> School of Food Science and Nutrition, Food Colloids and Bioprocessing group, University of Leeds,
8	Woodhouse Lane, Leeds LS2 9JT, UK
9	<sup>2</sup> Nestlé Product Technology Centre, Haxby Road, York YO31 8TA, UK
10	<sup>3</sup> Nestlé Research, Vers-chez-les-Blanc, 1000 Lausanne 26, Switzerland
11	*Corresponding author: <u>e.simone@leeds.ac.uk</u> , +44(0)113 343 1424
12	Keywords: Food, Soft Matter, Characterization, Microscopy, Imaging

### 14 Abstract

15 Over the last two decades, the development and production of innovative, customer-tailored food products with enhanced health benefits have seen major advances. However, the manufacture of edible materials 16 17 with tuned physical and organoleptic properties requires a good knowledge of food microstructure and its 18 relationship to the macroscopic properties of the final food product. Food products are complex materials, 19 often consisting of multiple phases. Furthermore, each phase usually contains a variety of biological 20 macromolecules, such as carbohydrates, proteins and lipids, as well as water droplets and gas bubbles. 21 Micronutrients, such as vitamins and minerals, might also play an important role in determining and engineering food microstructure. Considering this complexity, highly advanced physio-chemical techniques 22 23 are required for characterizing the microstructure of food systems prior to, during and after processing. Fast, 24 in situ techniques are also essential for industrial applications. Due to the wide variety of instruments and 25 methods, the scope of this paper is focused only on the latest advances of selected food characterization 26 techniques, with emphasis on soft, multi-phasic food materials.

#### 27 Contents

28 1. Introduction

- 29 2. Optical and Polarized Microscopy
- 30 3. Confocal Scanning Laser Microscopy
- 31 4. Electron Microscopy
- 32 4.1 Scanning Electron Microscopy
- 33 4.2 Transmission Electron Microscopy
- 34 4.3 Scanning Transmission Electron Microscopy
- 35 4.4 Environmental / Variable Pressure Scanning Electron Microscopy
- 36 4.5 Liquid Cells in Electron Microscopy
- 37 5. Atomic Force Microscopy
- 38 5.1 Topology of Soft Food Materials
- 39 5.2 Interfacial Film Properties

- 40 6. Vibrational Microscopy
- 41 7. X-Ray Tomography
- 42 8. Scanning Acoustic Microscopy
- 43 9. Other Techniques
- 44 Conclusions
- 45 Acknowledgements

# 46 Introduction

47 In the last few decades, demands arising from both governmental institutions and consumer associations set specific goals for food science and technology, seeking to improve the nutritional quality of food products. 48 Obesity, lactose intolerance and celiac diseases are examples of diet-related conditions that require 49 50 addressing (Agha & Agha, 2017; Belc et al., 2018; Corgneau et al., 2017; Meijer et al., 2015). Moreover, 51 vegan, vegetarian, and religion-based diets (Eliasi & Dwyer, 2002) represent a significant share of consumers' 52 preferences. There is also an increasing trend in developing "clean label" products. Broadly speaking, there 53 is an increasing trend in developing "clean label" products (Asioli et al., 2017) and introducing functional 54 foods (e.g., antioxidants, probiotics) to the market (Huang et al., 2010; Shahidi, 2000). Lastly, enhancement 55 of food shelf-life is necessary to reduce food waste and to improve products' quality during storage.

56 Food manufacturers and researchers are tackling these challenges through 1) New Product Development 57 (NPD), 2) Existing Product Development (EPD) and 3) monitoring quality attributes online during 58 manufacturing, using robust, rapid and reliable technologies. Food scientists manipulate micron-sized 59 structures, such as biological macromolecules and colloidal assemblies, because these structures critically 60 participate in transport properties, physical and rheological behaviour, as well as textural and sensorial traits 61 in edible systems (Aguilera, 2005). Generally, the vast majority of food materials can be described as soft 62 condensed matter, where basic building blocks self-organize into larger, more complex structures with 63 intricate phase diagrams (Ubbink et al., 2008)

Specific food structures and properties can be generated at the microscale in a variety of ways: health sensitive ingredients in foods can be replaced with alternative substances that mimic organoleptic and textural properties of the original ingredients (Palzer, 2017); digestion and absorption profiles of the main food biopolymers can be modified with the aid of single or multiple emulsions, through encapsulation or gel formation (Norton et al., 2015). Additionally, in the last decade, nanotechnology has been applied to manipulate and design food structures. In fact, the effectiveness of nutrients and antioxidants delivery can be improved by organizing the assembly of food components on the nanoscale (He & Hwang, 2016).

71 Despite significant work in food science research, further efforts are required to understand the relationship 72 between processing, microstructure and macroscopic properties, such as sensorial attributes (taste and 73 texture) and nutritional aspects (calorific density and delivery profiles). Investigating food microstructure is, 74 however, a challenging task: foods are complex multicomponent and multiphase systems, and the 75 microstructural elements are difficult to distinguish in both their natural and processed states (Aguilera, 76 2005), not to mention their reciprocal interaction in the final product. Simulative technologies represent an 77 additional tool for researchers to investigate the physiochemical properties of single molecules or larger 78 assemblies. With the increasing accessibility of computational tool packages, simulations are becoming a 79 common addition to research (Feng et al., 2016; Bellissent-Funel et al., 2016; Euston, 2017). The behaviour 80 of proteins, carbohydrates, lipids and colloidal particles can be predicted by computational efforts and used 81 to complement results from experimental techniques (Euston, 2013). Complex, multi-phasic systems such as 82 chocolate during the conching process have been modelled using molecular dynamics (Greiner et al., 2014). 83 The authors successfully simulated the interactions between lecithin molecules and sucrose crystals in a non-84 aqueous matrix (cocoa butter). In addition, computational power can be invested in high-throughput, image-85 analysis algorithms to study dynamic processes with microscopic techniques image (Gao et al., 2018; Stapley et al., 2009). 86

Typically, the spatial distribution of phases and localization of particles in multiphasic materials is determined
via specific imaging techniques that exploit a broad range of electromagnetic radiation, from X-Rays through

- 89 visible to infrared waves. Spatial resolution, together with sample preparation, are key factors in determining
- 90 which technique is most suitable for a specific material.

Some of the latest advances in characterisation techniques applied to food microstructure over the past five years are presented here. A particular emphasis is put on the analysis of soft, multiphasic systems. The advantages and limitations of each technique are discussed here, together with consideration of their use in tackling specific challenges in the food industry, including nutraceutical delivery, shelf-life improvement, calorific reduction and the incorporation of "clean label" ingredients. Table 1 summarizes the techniques considered in this review paper, along with the main advantages and limitations of each technique.

Table 1. Summary of the characterization techniques presented in this Review.

Technique	Approximate resolution	Advantages	Limitations
Optical and Polarized Microscopy (PLM)	200 nm laterally and 600 nm axially	Full colour information Customizable with polarized light, temperature/pressure/shear- controlled stages	Limited depth of focus Requires flat, thin samples
Confocal Scanning Laser Microscopy (CSLM)	200 nm	3D reconstruction of images	Requires sample staining, with potential artefacts Issues with fast-flowing samples during long image acquisition
Super Resolution Optical Microscopy/Stimulated emission depletion microscopy (STED)	40 nm laterally and 500–600 nm axially	Full colour information Customizable with polarized light, temperature/pressure/shear- controlled stages	As for CLSM and currently further limited by the need to halt diffusion of imaged objects
Scanning Electron Microscopy (SEM) and CryoSEM	1 nm	Ease of image interpretation Large depth of focus (mm to nm) Elemental analysis available with EDS detectors	Requires vacuum in the sample chamber Sample coating and chemical fixation (or cryogenic conditions) required Cannot probe internal structure
Transmission Electron Microscopy (TEM) and CryoTEM	0.1 nm	Highest resolution available in microscopy Can probe internal structure of samples	Sample coating and slicing (100 nm thickness) Complex image interpretation
Environmental/Low- Vacuum Scanning Electron Microscopy (ESEM/LV-SEM)	10 to 100 nm	Enables the presence of gas (1.3 – 13 kPa) and relatively higher temperatures (5°C) in the	Artefacts due gas-scattere electrons Potential damage to the sample

<sup>97</sup> 

		sample chamber compared to SEM	
Atomic Force Microscopy (AFM)	1 nm	Can probe specific intermolecular forces on surfaces Minimal sample preparation	Reduced scan size, slow scanning speeds Cannot probe internal structure
FT-IR microspectroscopy, Confocal Raman Microscopy (CRM)	10 – 1 μm	Enables chemical and physical mapping of ingredients in samples No sample preparation required	Challenging data analysis Fluorescence affects vibrational spectra quality
Scanning Acoustic Microscopy (SAM)	0.3 μm	Non-invasive, non-destructive Can investigate opaque materials	Complex data interpretation Limited application to food analysis
X-Ray computed tomography (XCT)	0.1 to 100 μm	Non-invasive, non-destructive 3D reconstruction of samples Phase-contrast available for soft materials	Small sample size (1 mm <sup>3</sup> ) Lengthy data analysis Limited access to synchrotron facilities
Magnetic Resonance Imaging (MRI)	100s µm	Wide range of contrast methods available Can probe opaque samples	Lengthy acquisition times 3D reconstruction are computationally demanding
Neutron Tomography (NT)	50 – 100 μm	Interactions complementary to X-Rays, non-destructive and non-invasive analysis of opaque samples	Limited access to neutron source facilities

98

# 99 Optical and Polarized Microscopy

Optical microscopy is one of the most common characterization techniques for complex soft materials. Compared to more modern and advanced microscopies, such as electron-based ones, optical images preserve full colour information, which leads to the possibility of using dyes to differentiate phases in samples. More importantly, light microscopy can be operated at room temperature and pressure, allowing study of samples in their native, hydrated state (Gunning, 2013).

105 The main drawbacks of the technique are its diffraction-limited resolution power and poor depth of focus,

106 confining light microscopy to the study of flattened, thin objects in the micron to millimetre range. However,

some of these disadvantages can, in principle, be overcome or mitigated by enhancing image quality (*e.g.* 

108 contrast and brightness, removing background noise) with computer processing software (Russ, 2015).

109 Moreover, the development of several ultrafast optical imaging methods – such as Serial Time-Encoded

110 Amplified Microscopy (STEAM) or Compressed Ultrafast Photography (CUP) - allow microscopy to study fast-111 occurring phenomena at the microscale with high temporal resolution (up to 10<sup>6</sup> frames per second) (Mikami 112 et al., 2016). Hence, a variety of dynamic conditions can be applied to observe changes in the appearance of 113 the specimen by coupling the microscope with a stage that controls temperature, pressure, or can apply 114 shear. Examples of these include Hot-Stage Microscopy (HSM) (Harrison et al., 2016; Stapley et al., 2009; 115 Stewart et al., 2017) and Freeze-Drying Microscopy (FDM) (Ray et al., 2017). Resolution, and thereby image 116 quality of light microscopes can be improved using suitable contrast enhancement methods. A popular 117 approach in food characterization consists of using Polarized Light Microscopy (PLM). Polarized light is 118 generated using a polarizing sheet mounted below the sub-stage condenser lens; a second sheet is placed 119 above the objective lenses, filtering the incoming light from the specimen. All the light radiating from the 120 object that is not subject to a change in polarization angle is extinguished, while birefringent objects remain 121 visible.

Birefringence occurs commonly in lipids (Den Engelsen, 1976), proteins (Oriel & Schellman, 1966) and carbohydrates (Liu et al., 1991), when they are present either as solid crystals or as ordered liquid crystalline phases, making this technique ideal for food systems. Rapid detection and phase behaviour of these compounds can therefore be investigated with this imaging method.

Crystallization of lipids from the melt constitutes a relevant example of multi-phasic systems, as solid is formed from a liquid phase during cooling. The solid crystalline particles exhibit birefringence and thus are distinguishable from the continuous phase, which appears dark under polarized light. Thus, PLM reveals microstructural features of the crystals such as shape, size and state of agglomeration. The crystallization of cocoa butter, which is the main lipid for confectionery production, has been thoroughly investigated via PLM, as well the effect of additional ingredients on the crystallization behaviour (Marangoni & McGauley, 2003; Ray et al., 2012)

133 With suitable image analysis algorithms, optical microscopy enables the quantitative analysis of crystal 134 nucleation and growth rates. Experimental results can be related to macroscopic properties of the lipid structures under examination, such as rheological behaviour, texture, oil retention and stability (Wright et al., 2000). The potential of such a technique has been repeatedly demonstrated (Harrison et al., 2016; Stapley et al., 2009; Stewart et al., 2017), where model fat systems were crystallized and characterized using HSM. It should be noted, however, that the HSM crystallization environment is confined to few millimetres, and therefore not representative of large-scale processes.

More recently, a more straight-forward use of PLM allowed the investigation of the crystallization behaviour of pure triacylglycerides (Da Silva et al., 2016), natural wax oleogels (as shown in Figure 1) (Doan et al., 2016; Doan et al., 2015), sucrose ester and lecithin oleogels (Bin Sintang et al., 2017; Godoy et al., 2015) and oil-inwater emulsions (Ishibashi et al., 2016).



144

Figure 1. PLM image of a rice bran wax oleogel, where the fat crystals are highlighted (adapted from Doan 2015, with permission
 from John Wiley and Sons).

Aside from fat crystallization, PLM can be employed to visualize and assess the crystallinity of carbohydrate particles such as starch and cellulose in multi-component systems. Recent examples include oil-in-water emulsions stabilized by mixed cellulose and xanthan gum microgels (Meng et al., 2018), where the interfacial morphology is best highlighted under polarized light – as compared to conventional bright field microscopy. Moreover, the effect of processes such as thermal annealing (Sittipod & Shi, 2016), gelatinisation (Díaz-Calderón et al., 2018) and pulsed electric field (PEF) (Li et al., 2019) on the crystallinity of starch particles can be monitored as well, by comparing the birefringence intensity of starch samples prior to and after 154 treatment. A further example of food processing characterization can be found in (Ray et al., 2017), where 155 the lyophilisation of a lactose solution was investigated by coupling an optical microscope with a temperature 156 and vacuum stage. In this work, the effect of different processing conditions (e.g. freezing rate, lactose 157 concentration, lyophilisation temperature) on the resulting dried lactose powder was studied. Despite its 158 wide applicability, optical microscopy cannot provide information about the chemical and internal structure 159 of materials, especially for multi-component systems. Structural details below the micron range are 160 complemented with either confocal scanning laser microscopy (CSLM) or electron microscopy, and the crystal 161 structures are best investigated with X-Ray techniques.

162 The use of high speed cameras coupled with suitable optical lenses allow researchers to visualize and study 163 samples under dynamic conditions. Generally speaking, the term high-speed photography covers any device 164 able to capture more than 250 frames per second (fps). Several techniques have been developed in the last 165 decade that can increase the frame rate up to a billion fps – although by sacrificing spatial resolution in some 166 instances (Mikami et al., 2016). In food science research, high speed photography has been used in the study 167 of droplet morphology under stimuli, such as drying or impact with a surface. A recent example can be found 168 in Sadek et al. (2015), where the authors compared the drying kinetics of an aqueous solution of whey protein 169 with sodium caseinate, the main protein constituting milk. The diameter of a single droplet was measured by 170 combining high speed photography and image analysis, revealing different drying behaviour between the 171 two protein solutions. Relevant physical phenomena such as gelation were also investigated with a similar 172 methodology in Haldar & Chakraborty, (2018); in this paper a sodium alginate solution was added dropwise 173 to a calcium chloride solution, triggering chemical gelation upon impact with the surface. The phase transition 174 to liquid to gel was captured with a frame rate of 14,760 fps, and the diameter of the gelled droplet was 175 determined via an image analysis algorithm. In both studies the optical images were compared and supported by electron microscopy. 176

Similarly, the shockwave-stimulated gelation of aqueous methylcellulose solution (AMCS) was studied in a recent publication from Parvari et al. (2018). The gelation kinetics in the droplet was assessed by measuring the variation of pixel brightness from the micrograph dataset, as the solution became opaque after being

stimulated by a mechanical shockwave. High speed photography can also be implemented into industrial lines, as reported in the work of Zoheidi et al. (2017); in this publication the flow of a casein-stabilized foam in a transparent pipeline was studied with a high speed camera setup, which allowed the monitoring of the bubble size distribution as a function of the flow pressure. As with the previous examples, the images were processed and analysed with a dedicated computer software.

In summary, optical microscopy and its subset of techniques constitutes a reliable tool for the imaging of food samples. Considering the ease and rapidity of use, this technique occupies an important position in the array of techniques for the investigation of food systems, such as visualizing the morphology, size and spatial distribution (*e.g.* agglomeration) of crystals. A limitation of optical microscopy is that it only provides 2D images of samples, meaning that the characterization of complex 3D materials is not achievable with this techniques. More sophisticated tools and techniques are required for 3D spatial characterization of complex materials as outlined in the following sections.

# 192 Confocal Scanning Laser Microscopy

Confocal scanning laser microscopy (CSLM) greatly enhances the performance of traditional light microscopes, with increased resolution – down to 200 nm – and improved depth of focus. The term "confocal" describes the operational mode of CSLM, in which illumination and collection of light is controlled through pinholes, focusing the light beam only on small volumes, rather than the entire sample, as used in conventional wide-field illumination. A step motor embedded in the microscope allows scanning all sections of the sample, in order to obtain a final 3D image (Auty, 2013).

While light microscopy uses a white light beam, a typical confocal microscope contains four laser lines, covering the range from UV to infrared. This feature is exploited in combination with fluorescent probes to optically section food samples in its main components (e.g., lipids, proteins and carbohydrates). Highcontrast images of different phases and interfaces are used to investigate the microstructure and morphology of multi-component systems by using specific combinations of probes that have different affinity to the different phases (Auty, 2013). Commonly employed dyes for food samples are Nile Blue and Nile Red for lipids; Fluorescein, Aniline Blue and Congo Red for carbohydrates (in particular starch) and Rhodaminebased fluorophores, isothiocyanate and Texas Red for proteins. Guidelines for selecting fluorophores include a matching sample excitation wavelength with respect to the laser source, high emission intensity and a relatively small shift between excitation and emission (Stokes shift). When performing multi-labelling experiments, minimal spectral overlap is desirable. Finally, the photon flux should be fine-tuned to achieve better contrast, and at the same time to prevent chemical deterioration of the fluorescent probe by photobleaching (Ferrando & Spiess, 2000).

3D rendering of the investigated specimen can be obtained, provided the sample's surface is sufficiently smooth and displaying an even illumination throughout the surface. It should be noted that rapidly flowing or diffusing samples create a challenge for long-lasting image acquisition. The typical z-axis resolution of confocal microscopes is limited to 750 nm due to Abbe's equation:

$$d = \frac{\lambda}{2NA} \qquad \qquad \text{Eq. (1)}$$

216 where d represents resolution (in m),  $\lambda$  is the wavelength of the radiation, and NA the numerical aperture of 217 the microscope, which is a technical parameter of the adopted lenses. Due to this technical limit, the probing 218 depth of CSLM in the z direction is restricted to just below the micron regime. Technological advances (Hell, 219 2009) have improved the resolution for fluorescent samples, as demonstrated by Stimulated Emission 220 Depletion microscopy (STED). This technique, closely related to CSLM, is based on depleting the excited 221 electronic state of the fluorophore with a second laser pulse, in order to "sharpen" the emitted signal's spatial 222 distribution. Therefore the resolution of the technique increases to around 40 nm, as demonstrated in Willig 223 et al. (2006).

CSLM is used extensively in studying the microstructure and interfacial morphology of a range of multiphasic systems, such as single and double emulsions and edible foams. In emulsions, successful dispersion of the oil phase as droplets is easily visualized through staining the sample with a suitable lipophilic label, yielding a sufficient contrast to discriminate the oil droplets from the continuous water phase, which then appears dark under the microscope. In edible foams the air phase appears darker than the liquid, which can be stained 229 with an appropriate dye. For Pickering stabilized systems CSLM has been used to study the arrangement of 230 Pickering particles at the interface of bubbles or droplets. Examples of imaged particles include proteins (Wu et al., 2015; Abbas et al., 2015), protein microgels (Torres et al., 2017; Sarkar et al., 2016), and carbohydrates 231 such as cellulose (Guo et al., 2018; Hu et al., 2016; Hu et al., 2015; Wang et al., 2016). Autofluorescence of 232 233 the Pickering particles can be exploited as well; Zembyla et al., 2018 imaged polyphenol crystals (guercetin 234 and curcumin) arranged around water droplets in a water-in-oil emulsion without adding any fluorophores. Furthermore, a dual-staining approach is recommended for mixed Pickering particles systems, where images 235 236 overlain with different colours are exploited to visualize interactions between the different components 237 (Feng & Lee, 2016). This method was employed also for a whipped cream system, with the aim of monitoring 238 its microstructural evolution during aeration (as shown in Figure 2) (Han et al., 2018).



239

Figure 2. Confocal image of a whipped cream sample. An air bubble (black) is displayed in the centre of the image, stabilized by
 protein particles (green) and surrounded by a continuous phase containing both protein and fat particles (red) (adapted from Han et al., 2018, with permission from Elsevier).

- The same approach can be extended to complex double emulsions systems, as presented in Xiao et al, 2017, Zhu et al., 2017 and Estrada-Fernández et al., 2018. Further applications of CSLM in the characterization of food materials includes elucidating the lipid organization in milk fat globule membranes (MFGMs) (Lopez et al., 2015). In this study the MFGMs were analysed with a systematic choice of multiple fluorophores, confocal
- 247 imaging, supported by atomic force microscopy (AFM) and electron transmission microscopy (TEM). The

248 research was extended further to infant formulas, dairy products (Lopez et al., 2015) and other mammalian 249 milks, which were studied at different temperatures (Et-Thakafyet al. 2017; Huang et al. 2017). In Xing et al. 250 (2019), the complexation of oleic acid with annealed starch was investigated using molecular dynamics (MD) 251 simulation combined with confocal microscopy. The thermal treatment increased the porosity of starch 252 granules to the oil phase, as observed from CSLM images where the lipid fluorescence (stained with Nile Red) 253 was stronger inside the granules. Untreated starch granules, instead displayed fluorescence around the 254 surface rather than from the internal channels and pores. Molecular dynamics was applied to the 255 complexation mechanism of a single amylopectin molecule (representative of a starch unit) with oleic acid, 256 revealing that van der Waals forces were the predominant driving force for complexation.

257 Confocal microscopy can also provide quantitative measurements of specific macromolecules' concentration 258 and their spatial distribution in a sample, as described in the work of Ako et al. (2009). With a suitable 259 calibration curve, the fluorophores' signal intensity is related to the concentration of the macromolecule of 260 interest; in turn, spatial fluctuations of said concentration are described by a pair correlation function. The 261 outcome of this function is a "coarseness" parameter, which is used to describe the microstructure of 262 biopolymeric networks and how it is affected by pH, ionic force, or the presence of additional ingredients. 263 This methodology has been employed in several recent publications, including gelled whey protein mixtures 264 (Ainis et al, 2018; Jose et al., 2016; Kharlamova et al., 2018), carrageenan mixtures (Bui et al., 2019) and 265 cellulose nanoparticles (Moud et al., 2018). When the system of interest approaches the resolution limit of 266 conventional confocal microscopy, such as for a casein micellar network (average diameter 150-200 nm), 267 STED microscopy can be used to image and subsequently quantify the correlation length of casein gel 268 microstructure, as demonstrated in Glover et al., (2019a) and Glover et al. (2019b).

Determining droplet size distributions through image analysis of confocal micrographs is possible, although other techniques, such as static light scattering, are routinely used instead. This choice could be ascribed partly to the limited sample quantity present in microscopy glass slides - therefore not being representative — as well as the ease of use of light scattering instruments. Nevertheless, microscopy allows validation of light scattering results in complex mixed systems. Moreover, the interfacial morphology and properties of droplets

has been studied with more powerful, higher resolution electron microscopy techniques, which will bediscussed in the following section.

276 Confocal microscopes in inverted configuration can be coupled to a rheometer to provide simultaneous 277 microstructural and viscoelastic characterization of soft matter systems; this technique has been termed 278 confocal rheology (Besseling et al., 2009). With the advance of image acquisition systems in confocal 279 microscopy, it is possible to obtain 3D stacks of a single particle in motion, within certain shear velocities. By 280 these means, the microstructure of foods can be directly related to macroscopic properties, such as shear 281 and bulk moduli. A custom-made confocal rheometer was described by Dutta et al. (2013), and the same 282 authors employed it in the study of wheat dough (Boitte et al., 2013). Recent work from Tran-Ba et al. (2017) 283 involved the study of collagen network gelation, where additional parameters were obtained from image 284 analysis of the confocal images, such as fractal dimension and gelation time.

285 Confocal microscopy now has an established role in studying multi-phasic materials, with particular emphasis 286 on the characterization of emulsions, foams and particle dispersions. However, this technique requires 287 sample preparation with fluorophores, which inherently carries the possibility of artefacts in the images and 288 possible reactivity with the sample. The wide variety of fluorescent probes available allows the separation 289 and identification of different sample domains, although the limit in resolution might hinder nanometre-290 sized features. Due to this, confocal microscopy findings are usually supported by other higher-resolution 291 techniques, such as electron microscopy.

## 292 Electron microscopy

Electron microscopy is a key technique in the characterization of structure at the molecular, nano- and microscale in different areas of science, including food. It can provide surface and internal features of samples, and reveal the role of single biomolecules such as proteins, fat crystals and polysaccharides in multiphasic systems such as emulsions, gels, foams (Groves & Parker, 2013). While conventional light microscopes have limited resolution due to the use of visible light radiation, described by the Abbe equation (Eq. 1), electron-based microscopy can achieve sub-nanometre resolution. This is due to the shorter wavelength of the electron beam as compared to light beam, together with increased penetration in the sample due to higher beamenergy.

The term "electron microscopy" encompasses several techniques, of which the two main methods are transmission (TEM) and scanning electron microscopy (SEM). The common working principle behind these techniques involves accelerating electrons and focusing the resulting beam on the sample by using a voltage between 1 and 100 keV. Conventional electron microscopes require vacuum conditions so that the electron beam is not scattered by gaseous molecular species, which would deteriorate the image quality. (McClements & McClements, 2016)

High resolution and image quality are achieved by maintaining high vacuum in the enclosed instrument. In turn, samples require severe treatment in order to withstand the operating conditions of an electron microscope. In fact, this single criterion poses limitations to the suitability of studying biological and food samples with this technique, which can be partly overcome by using reduced levels of vacuum.

#### **311** *Scanning Electron Microscopy (SEM)*

312 In SEM, the electron beam scans the specimen line by line, across a rectangular cross-section (also termed 313 raster mode), collecting scattered electrons from the surface of the sample. With a typical accelerating 314 voltage of 30 keV, modern instruments can achieve a resolution of 1 nm (Dudkiewicz et al., 2011). During 315 measurement the primary beam electrons (PEs) interact with the specimen surface, and are either scattered 316 inelastically as secondary electrons (SEs) or elastically as back-scattered electrons (BSEs). The former are 317 collected by a specific detector and used to build a topographic image, while the latter can be used to increase 318 contrast based upon atomic number (Z) differences of the analysed surface features (Dudkiewicz et al., 2011). 319 Additionally, X-Rays are generated in the chamber and can be collected to combine topological and chemical 320 composition of the sample with a technique called Energy Dispersive X-Ray Spectroscopy (EDS). The field of 321 view can vary from millimetres to nanometres, thus being able to probe samples at different length scales. 322 The resulting image is very similar to a conventional optical microscopy micrograph (albeit without colour) 323 but with much higher magnification; this enables rapid and easy interpretation (Groves & Parker, 2013).

324 As the majority of food materials are electrically insulating, a conductive coating is applied to the surface of 325 the sample in order to avoid damage as well as loss in image quality due to charge build-up. Samples prone 326 to degradation require chemical fixation and, for hydrated or liquid samples, drying is usually carried out 327 prior to the measurement in the vacuum chamber. This process, however, can result in significant 328 microstructure alteration compared to the native-state structure of the sample. Therefore, a popular 329 alternative to chemical fixation or drying involves quick-freezing, which is considered less invasive than other 330 methods. Frozen samples and SEM are combined in a technique called Cryogenic Scanning Electron 331 Microscopy (CryoSEM). However, the formation and successive sublimation of ice crystals during pre-332 treatment occurs with this technique, potentially leading to the presence of artefacts in the images (James, 333 2009).

Recent SEM applications to food systems include ice cream (Guo et al., 2017), single (Tabibiazar et al., 2015; O'Sullivan et al. 2016) and double emulsions (Xiao et al., 2017; Patel et al., 2015), protein gels (Zou et al. 2015), gelled vegetable oils (Bin Sintang et al., 2017; Tavernier et al. 2017) and aerated fats and oils (Binks et al. 2016) (as shown in Figure 3). In particular, SEM has been used to visualize the morphology of particlestabilized droplets, ice crystals and the interface of gas bubbles.



Figure 3. Cryo-SEM images of (a) oil-in-water gelled emulsion, (b) ice cream (scale bar 300 μm), (c) zein-tannic acid colloidal particles and (d) whipped oil stabilized by monoglyceride crystals (adapted from Tavernier et al. 2017, Guo et al., 2017, Zou et al. 2015 and Binks et al. 2016, respectively, with permission of Elsevier).

For frozen samples, further treatment involves fracturing and sublimation of the ice; therefore, the internal structure of the sample can be visualized, such as the arrangement of nanoparticles at the interface of droplets or bubbles (Tavernier et al., 2017; Patel et al., 2015). For specific food systems, the continuous phase is not removed and objects are imaged directly, as in the work from Binks et al. (2016) and Guo et al. (2017). Furthermore, the low electrical conductivity of many food materials leads to charge build-up during analysis, which can affect image quality and sample stability. Coating samples with a layer of platinum or gold palladium can reduce surface charging.

Dynamic studies at variable temperatures have also been recently attempted (Tran et al., 2015): chocolate bloom was monitored over time with SEM and images showed the spatial distribution of different components (*e.g.*, fats, sugars) on the sample surface. Dynamic conditions are, however, difficult to investigate with SEM, as samples are kept at very low temperatures (-120°C) during analysis. Moreover, food
 samples are always coated with conductive metal coatings, making their observation in natural conditions
 unachievable. This highlights the main limitations of conventional electron microscopy applications for food
 science.

Similarly to confocal microscopy, SEM micrographs can be analysed to provide descriptive parameters of food microstructure, such as fractal dimension and lacunarity (*i.e.* the distribution gap sizes within datasets). These parameters have been used to characterize the effect mixing or gelation of protein solutions (Zhuang et al., 2019) has on macroscopic properties such as surface homogeneity. Additional examples can be found in Rahimi & Ngadi, (2016) and Oliveros et al. (2017), where the high resolution of SEM has been employed to visualize and assess the porosity of fried batters and roasted coffee beans respectively.

#### **363** Transmission Electron Microscopy (TEM)

In contrast to a scanning microscope, the transmission electron microscope (TEM) directs a spread beam of electrons through the specimen, which alters the phase and intensity of the incident electrons. Contrast is thus generated and measured by a detector from the opposite side of the beam generator. The internal structure of nano-sized objects can be analysed with a resolution of 0.07 nm, the highest resolution capable with microscopic techniques (Groves & Parker, 2013). The superior resolution of TEM compared to SEM stems from the higher accelerating voltage (100 keV), which provides an electron beam with smaller wavelength and thus higher resolving power.

For food materials, contrast is routinely enhanced by sample staining with metal oxides, as proteins, lipids and carbohydrates display small differences in terms of atomic density. In addition to coating (as described for SEM) samples must be cut into thin slices (100 nm) to allow enough electrons to reach the detector during TEM measurements. Sectioning is usually carried out by ultramicrotomy, which is a costly and complex operation (Groves & Parker, 2013). This requirement on sample thickness has inherent consequences for the kind of structures can be successfully imaged, *.e.g.* droplets larger than 100 nm cannot be visualized in their entirety.

378 In terms of data interpretation, the narrow depth of field, lack of three-dimensionality and the presence of 379 several artefacts arising from metal staining makes TEM operation more difficult in comparison to SEM. 380 Nevertheless, TEM is highly effective in imaging gel systems stabilized by biopolymers, as shown by recent work carried out on curcumin nanocapsules (Abbas et al., 2015; Zhou et al. 2016). Contrary to SEM, which 381 382 provides only surface morphology, TEM allows visualization of the internal structure of droplets and 383 therefore is able to measure the relative thickness of the shell and core. In the curcumin nanocapsule studies, 384 emulsions were dried and stained with phosphotungstic acid to obtain contrast, and the particle size 385 measured from TEM was then compared to dynamic light scattering measurements. This was beneficial as 386 light scattering techniques provide only an estimate of particle apparent size, while TEM enables detailed 387 visualization of the morphology of interest – provided it has not been altered by sample preparation. Good 388 agreement on the particle size between the two techniques was found, with minimal discrepancies attributed 389 to the drying step.

TEM was used to study the protein network of casein in milk through an automated image analysis algorithm, using several TEM micrographs as a dataset (Silva et al. 2015). Petit et al., (2017) studied in detail the mechanism of caking in cocoa powder particles (shown in Figure 4). The double staining technique used in this work, with uranyl acetate and lead citrate, assisted with the characterization of the fat phase in cocoa particles, as uranyl ions are reported to interact preferentially with lipids. Unambiguous identification was finally achieved with X-Ray photoemission spectroscopy (XPS).



#### 396

Figure 4. TEM image of a fat bridge occurring between chocolate particles during storage (adapted from Petit et al., 2017, with permission from Elsevier).

High resolution TEM was exploited to image single triacylglycerides crystals obtained from tristearin/triolein blends (Acevedo & Marangoni, 2010) and fractionated milk fat (Ramel & Marangoni, 2016). The use of cryogenic conditions (Cryo-TEM) allowed higher magnification without beam damage to the sample, and the layered nanostructure of this specific sample was observed. Further work on triacylglycerides was carried out in Sebben et al. (2018). In this case, TEM images were complemented with X-Ray diffraction and Atomic Force Microscopy (AFM) which confirmed the three-dimensional structure of the crystals. In fact, while AFM yields a three-dimensional image, transmission electron microscopy images are bi-dimensional.

The microstructure of a O/W emulsion was studied by TEM in the work of Sarkar et al., 2016. Whey protein microgels were imaged with TEM, among other techniques, prior and after the emulsification step. The surface coverage of proteins on oil droplets was visualized, as well as the effect of thermal treatment on the system. While other microscopic techniques were employed (CSLM), TEM was fundamental in providing high resolution images of the protein layers, as they were in the range of 20 nm.

#### 411 Scanning Transmission Electron Microscopy (STEM)

Scanning transmission electron microscopy is a modification of TEM, whereby the electron optics focus the beam into a narrow spot, which is then scanned across the sample. The transmitted electrons are then collected to form the image. A lower voltage (20 – 30 keV) is employed compared to conventional TEM operation, resulting in lower sample excitation and an increased scattering cross-section. This enables higher
contrast between samples containing low atomic number elements – such as hydrogen, carbon, oxygen and
nitrogen which are typically found in food materials. As a consequence, invasive sample preparation involving
chemical fixation or metal staining is therefore reduced or avoided. Furthermore, STEM allows thicker
samples to be analysed (500 nm compared to 100 nm in conventional TEM) (Gee et al., 2010). However,
there is scarce literature available regarding the use of this technique in food science, perhaps due to the
prominence of Cryo-SEM in the area.

#### 422 Environmental / Variable Pressure Scanning Electron Microscopy (ESEM/VP-SEM/LV-SEM)

423 Environmental scanning electron microscopy (ESEM) enables the analysis of soft, moist and/or electrically 424 insulating materials without pre-treatment, which represents a major breakthrough for the application of 425 electron microscopy to biological systems (Stokes, 2003). Research in the 1970s on the operation of SEM 426 instruments with relatively high gas pressure in the sample chamber led to the first development of a 427 commercial ESEM instrument in 1989 (James, 2009). Environmental microscopes are designed to have 428 differentially pumped chambers, with pressure-limiting apertures between them. A range of 0.1 to 10 torr 429 (13 to 1.3kPa) conditions is available, which allows hydrated samples to have liquid water coexisting with its 430 vapour phase at room temperature. At the same time, the environmental chamber is ordinarily kept at lower 431 temperatures (around 5°C) to improve image quality. While the acronym ESEM is most common, the 432 acronyms Variable Pressure (VP-SEM) or Low Vacuum (LV-SEM) are also used, referring to instruments that 433 work at 2500 Pa (20 torr) and 600 Pa (5 torr), respectively. The presence of a gas in the sample environment 434 has several implications on the operation of an ESEM. As the electron beam travels through the sample 435 chamber, gas molecules are ionized providing a two-fold improvement to the detected signal: positive ions 436 counteract charge build-up from the sample, while the generated electrons amplify the signal that reaches 437 the detector. The choice of voltage, gas type and pressure as well as temperature are crucial for obtaining 438 images of reasonable quality with an ESEM for a specific sample (Stokes, 2013).

While ESEM suffers a modest decrease in resolution (10 to 100 nm) compared to conventional SEM setups,
 access to the native state of vacuum-sensitive samples overcomes this disadvantage, with several studies

441 reporting the analysis of diverse food systems using ESEM in the past 20 years (James, 2009). ESEM has 442 submicron resolution while retaining quasi-native imaging conditions, extending the range of conventional 443 light microscopy resolution. Moreover, with ESEM it is possible to exploit novel contrast mechanisms arising 444 both from the electronic properties of the sample, the scan speed or the choice of the imaging gas. In 445 multiphasic systems such as oil/water emulsions, for example, the different secondary electron emission 446 from the water and the lipid phase increases contrast, despite the small difference in atomic number of the 447 two components. This phenomenon could be exploited to perform further studies on materials such as 448 margarine and milk (James, 2009).

449 Environmental SEMs are, however, not immune to artefacts. The imaging gas can interact with the beam 450 leading to misinterpretation of the obtained images. As the primary beam is "skirted", electrons are in part 451 deflected, enlarging the potentially damaged sample area. As a further consequence, backscattered X-Rays 452 become diffuse and their interpretation for chemical analysis is regarded as more qualitative, compared to 453 conventional SEM. Moreover, water can deposit on the surface of the sample if the conditions are not tightly 454 controlled, with generation of reactive species via radiolysis that can damage the sample (Stokes, 2013). By 455 coupling ESEM with a Peltier stage or a similar device, the water activity in the sample can be regulated – 456 keeping it within the range of the allowed pressure in the instrument. This finds particular application in the 457 study of dehydration and rehydration of foods where water at different values of activity is used as the 458 imaging gas. Otherwise, if the sample has a high vapour pressure at ambient temperature, image quality can 459 be improved by lowering the temperature of the stage. The microstructural evolution of chocolate across its 460 fundamental manufacturing steps has been recently investigated with ESEM in the work of Glicerina et al., 461 2015; particle size and the presence of voids was studied while changing temperature and pressure. ESEM 462 images were obtained in low vacuum mode (100 Pa) in order to minimize sample damage and improve 463 micrographs quality. Further applications of ESEM can be found in Nuzzo et al., 2015, where this technique 464 has been coupled with Raman Confocal Microscopy to study the phase separation of cellulose and 465 maltodextrin triggered by water evaporation. The same combination of techniques was also used to evaluate

- 466 the effect of different drying processes on whole milk particles; moreover, a comparison of using different
- 467 detectors for visualizing the images is presented in Figure 5 (Nuzzo et al., 2017).



468

- 469 Figure 5. Comparison of ESEM imaging modes of a single dried particle of whole milk. On the left a low field detector (LFD) was used
  470 to visualize the whole particle (a) and a fractured particle (c). On the right images obtained with a backscatter detector for a whole
  471 particle (b) and a fracture particle (d) (adapted from Nuzzo et al., 2017, with permission from Elsevier).
- 472 ESEM has been successfully employed also to study different gel morphologies in a whey protein–kefiran 473 system, by varying the relative concentration of the two components (Kazazi et al., 2017). Finally, an 474 interesting application of ESEM can be found in Ma et al., 2017, where the crystallization of honey was 475 studied using molecular dynamics (MD) simulation and compared to electron microscopy images in the 476 native state.

#### 477 Liquid cells in electron microscopy

The environmental chamber in ESEM is not suitable if the sample requires embedding in a liquid layer of controlled thickness, or the experiment involves a flowing liquid. This barrier has been overcome with the development of enclosed, electron-transparent cells, also called "liquid cells" (De Jonge & Ross, 2011). Advances in thin-film technology and microfabrication allowed the manufacturing of robust windows that can withstand the standard vacuum environment of TEM, SEM and STEM instruments, combining high resolution with natural conditions in the specimen. An example can be found in Dyab & Paunov, 2010, where an oil-water emulsion was imaged using a "wet-SEM" apparatus. A model food emulsion stabilized with silica
particles was observed, and the arrangement of the stabilizing particles at the interface was clearly visualized.
However, applications of this technique for the study of liquid food materials have not been reported yet.

In conclusion, there is a wide range of electron microscopes available to food scientists, each one with advantages and limitations. Traditional scanning and transmission microscopes still dominate the field, as their applicability to food materials contributes significantly with unrivalled high resolution images. At the same time, the necessity of easing the sample pre-treatment and exploring environmental condition is boosting the use and development of either low – vacuum instruments or, more recently, liquid enclosed cells. Currently, there is still limited work available on applications to food science for the instruments which do not employ invasive pre-treatment methods.

# 494 Atomic force microscopy

495 Atomic force microscopy (AFM) generates images of a sample by measuring force interactions between a 496 nanometre-sized probe and the surface of the specimen. Typically the technique is used for flat samples to 497 obtain high resolution (1 nm) images (Morris, 2013). Contrary to other forms of microscopy, AFM provides 498 not only detailed three-dimensional topographical images of samples, but also maps the mechanical 499 behaviour of the material under investigation. The use of this technique in food science has enabled the 500 understanding of biological systems at the nanometre scale, owing to both the high resolution (comparable 501 to TEM) and the fact that samples require minimal preparation and can be imaged either in air or liquid 502 environments. Nowadays, AFM has become an invaluable tool for food research, although it's not routinely 503 used and requires skilled operators to perform experiments. Several imaging methods are available to 504 analyse soft food materials, and sample preparation can vary depending on the nature of the material 505 (Morris, 2013).

506 Furthermore, interactions between single molecules can be studied by functionalising the probe with 507 hydrophobic or hydrophilic materials, or specific ligands. Recent fundamental research on interactions in 508 food colloids can be found in Mettu et al., 2018. In this work, water droplets emulsified with PGPR (Poly509 Glycerol-Poly-Ricinoleate) in a continuous oil phase were attached to the cantilever probe and a substrate, 510 and their interaction forces studied during dynamic collisions by AFM. This methodology allowed the 511 discovery of a weak, short-range bridging interaction between the emulsifier chains on the surface. Moreover, AFM probes forces in the range of  $10^2$ - $10^4$  pN, thus smaller energy interactions between particles 512 513 are potentially not detected. A recently developed technique called optical tweezers or photon microscopy 514 covers the lower force range, from 0.1 to 100 pN. Complementary to AFM, this technique allows the capture 515 of single molecules with the use of focused lasers, which subsequently moves them in three-dimensions to 516 probe their interaction forces with objects in a similar way to AFM (Gunning et al., 2010). Recent work on the 517 collision interactions between oil droplets was performed using the optical tweezers method (Chen et al., 518 2018).

519 The working principle of AFM resides in monitoring force interactions between the probe and the sample, as 520 they are scanned in a raster fashion relative to each other. AFM probes are cantilever-shaped, with a 521 pyramidal tip, approximately 3 microns in height and a typical tip radius of 30 to 50 nm; typically the probes 522 are made of silicon nitride. As the cantilever tip approaches the specimen, electrostatic interactions will cause 523 it to twist and bend during the scan. This movement is tracked with a laser beam and converted into a signal, 524 which is used to generate a topographical image. The AFM has several operation methods, such as the 525 contact mode that is typically used for hard, flat samples and the non-contact mode, where the oscillations 526 of the probe are converted into an Alternate Current (AC) signal. A third mode, called tapping mode, involves 527 oscillation of the probe while intermittently touching the surface of the sample. The tapping mode relies on 528 changes in amplitude and phase of the oscillation to generate contrast based on differences in stiffness and 529 viscoelasticity in the sample. This mode is frequently used for food science applications, such as imaging 530 polysaccharides and protein gels and their respective aggregation processes (Yang et al., 2007). Hard, 531 homogeneous samples are best probed in contact mode to obtain a high-resolution topographical image. 532 Heterogeneous samples will display a variety of interactions with the probe and imaging conditions can be 533 chosen to enhance mechanical contrast rather than acquiring a 3D image (Morris, 2013). The main limitations 534 of AFM is the small scan size and slow scanning speeds. While AFM can image samples in natural conditions, it cannot give information on the internal structure. For this reason, it can be considered a complimentary
technique to TEM. AFM applications in food science can be grouped in two main areas: analysis of surface
topology of soft food materials and determination of interfacial film properties.

#### **538** Topology of soft food materials

539 Carbohydrates are one of the main food macromolecules. Due to their key role in the human diet, a 540 conspicuous body of work has been produced on the understanding of their microstructure using AFM. 541 Several polysaccharides such as pectin, gellan and Xanthan gum have been investigated at the molecular 542 level using AFM, with particular emphasis on the morphology and degradation mechanisms by enzymes 543 (Gunning & Morris, 2018). Furthermore, the complex hierarchical structure of starch granules was studied 544 using AFM as the main characterization technique (Zhu, 2017). By using an ultramicrotome tool, the internal 545 structure the granules was exposed, and the arrangement of carbohydrate strands was visualized in 546 topographical images. In Zhang et al. (2018), the structure-function relationship of a bioactive carbohydrate 547 extracted from Ganoderma atrum fungi (PSG-1-F<sub>0.2</sub>) was simultaneously investigated with AFM and 548 simulation techniques. Specifically, the spherical conformation of the branched carbohydrate of interest was 549 predicted by molecular dynamics (MD) and observed in AFM micrographs. Protein assemblies such as casein 550 micelles modified by enzymatic cross-linking were imaged using AFM. AFM has been used as a microscope 551 to assess changes in shape and size between modified and native casein micelles; as a force transducer, the instrument revealed the heterogeneity of mechanical domains across the casein assemblies. In this study 552 553 scanning electron microscopy supported AFM results by providing morphological data on the casein micelles 554 (Bahri et al. 2018). In Sun et al. (2019), the effect of binding of several lactone-type flavourings on human 555 serum albumin (HSA) was investigated by AFM, and supported by both molecular dynamics (MD) and 556 molecular docking simulations. The molecular structure of the host molecule affected the binding strength 557 and therefore the conformational changes in HSA proteins, which could be visualized by atomic force 558 microscopy images.

Lipid crystals can be conveniently imaged with AFM as they require minimal sample preparation compared to other techniques. In the previous decade, AFM was successfully used to study the morphology of fat

561 crystals growing on the surface of chocolate-based confectionery products, which is also known as fat bloom 562 (Smith & Dahlman, 2005). Recently, AFM has been employed to study oleogels structured with a network of 563 high-melting fat crystals. AFM analysis can provide information on the morphology of the crystalline network 564 at the nanoscale level, as well as investigating mechanical properties. In this regard, AFM was used to inspect 565 the topography of samples on a length scale varying from few nm to 100 microns (Lupi et al., 2018). Samples 566 were deposited on a sample holder without further preparation, and the microstructural analysis with AFM complemented X-Ray diffraction data and PLM images. Geometrical features on the crystal surfaces, such as 567 568 cuts and planes, were successfully detected and imaged. AFM in tapping mode can be used to increase 569 resolution and contrast between liquid oil and crystals, by generating high phase contrast images. Edible 570 oleogels with varying concentrations of sitosterol and oryzanol were prepared, and AFM was employed to 571 study the growth mechanism and microstructure of these systems, allowing the fibrous structure to be 572 visualized and the thickness of fat bundles measured (Matheson et al., 2017). Suitable contrast was 573 generated through phase images, which can discriminate between solid fat and oil according to the different 574 mechanical response measured by the probe. Further research on lipids was carried out on single triacylglyceride crystals, extracted from high melting point milk fractions (Sebben et al., 2018). In this paper, 575 576 AFM was used as a complementary technique to TEM to characterize the structure of the single crystals as 577 shown in Figure 6. A cross-sectional height profile of the crystal was obtained, along with the layering size of 578 TAGs which was also confirmed by X-Ray diffraction data.



Figure 6. AFM image of a single TAG crystal from hard milk fraction. Right: height image; left: phase image (adapted from Sebben et al., 2018, with permission from Elsevier).

582 Furthermore, in the Sebben et al. study, AFM could assess the efficiency of the fractionation process by 583 detecting low melting oil droplets on the surface of crystals – in phase contrast AFM images. This is relevant 584 as analysis by standard techniques (DSC and XRD) did not provide evidence of lower melting lipid fractions in 585 the sample. As with the previous example, this is particularly useful in imaging different components that 586 exhibit different mechanical and viscoelastic properties. AFM was also used for visualizing finer details of 587 Pickering particles and their use in stabilizing emulsions. Cellulose nanocrystals with different allomorphs were imaged using AFM (Li et al., 2018), and their distribution as Pickering particles on oil droplets was also 588 589 studied with this technique (Liu et al. 2018). O/W emulsions made with soybean oil and commercial 590 emulsifiers (Span 20, 40 60 and 80 and Tween 20, 40, 60 and 80) have been also recently studied with AFM 591 (Galvão et al. 2018). In this case, sample preparation included a dehydration step which removed the water 592 phase, potentially affecting the surface morphology of the dried emulsion droplets.

#### 593 Interfacial film properties

594 AFM has been successfully employed in studying the interfacial behaviour of protein and surfactant films, as 595 these compounds are widely used as stabilizers in edible emulsions and foams. AFM was used to study 596 protein agglomeration at the interface and to understand how proteins are displaced by other molecules at 597 the interface (Gunning & Morris, 2018). Samples were prepared using the Langmuir-Blodgett film technique, 598 in which solutions of proteins are adsorbed as a thin layer on a flat substrate, and successively imaged by 599 AFM. By adding increasing concentrations of a competitive stabiliser, protein films started aggregating and 600 protruded outwards from the layer, in what has been termed "orogenic displacement" (Gunning & Morris, 601 2018). It has been established that this mechanism is common to several proteins and surfactant systems, as 602 well as for oil/water interfaces (Gunning et al., 1996).

Understanding protein-surfactant interactions at interfaces provides a basis for improving the stability of the interface and hence the lifetime of a food product. Furthermore, with the appropriate conditions this methodology can be extended to investigate the effects of digestion on food systems, such as the interfacial structure of emulsion droplets. In Yao et al. (2018) the interfacial structure of O/W emulsion stabilized by guar gum was investigated during simulated digestion. The effect of the addition of a surfactant (Tween 80) 608 was also studied. In Qu & Ikeda (2017) AFM was used to study competitive displacement between proteins at interfaces, whey protein films were prepared with Langmuir-Blodgett method and the effect of sodium 609 caseinate on protein coverage at the interface was observed. AFM was also used to characterize lipid films 610 mimicking the milk fat globule membrane (Murthy et al. 2016). The aim of this work was to investigate the 611 612 effect of cholesterol addition on the lipid structure of MFGMs. AFM successfully characterized a phase 613 transition in which solid, mechanically rigid sphingomyelin-rich domains in the membrane decreased in size 614 and in mechanical resistance upon addition of cholesterol. AFM thus provided both topographical and 615 mechanical images of the system as shown in Figure 7.

616



Figure 7. AFM topographical image of a lipid monolayer mimicking the milk fat membrane globule (MFMG) prior (right) and after (left) cholesterol addition (taken from Murthy, Guyomarc'h, & Lopez, 2016, with permission from American Chemical Society).
In summary, AFM is a powerful technique for investigating the morphology of nano-scale objects, such as biopolymer molecules on flat surfaces such as interfacial films. Its unique working principle constitutes at the same time its strength and weakness: the absence of a complex lenses apparatus and the high resolution obtained is a tremendous advantage over other microscopy techniques, especially considering the relative non-invasiveness and limited sample preparation required. At the same time, AFM probes only surface

properties of samples, unless fracturing or sectioning can be carried out. Moreover, the complex operation
 modes require a trained operator that can avoid damaging the sample and artefacts from the AFM image.

# 627 Vibrational microscopy

628 Vibrational spectroscopy represents a popular analytical technique to study soft food materials that can 629 provide chemical and structural characterization of samples. Measurements are relatively fast and non-630 invasive and with Infrared and Raman spectroscopies, two of the most common vibrational spectroscopic methods, it is possible to carry out qualitative and quantitative measurements of edible biomolecules in 631 632 complex food matrices. By coupling the spectroscope with optical elements, microspectroscopy combines 633 chemical analysis with spatial imaging of samples, with the possibility of studying sample heterogeneity at 634 the microscopic level in food systems (Wellner, 2013). In particular, Near Infrared Spectroscopy (NIRS) 635 represents the most popular technique for in-line safety and quality assessment in the food industry (Porep 636 et al. 2015).

637 Molecules possess several modes of vibration, which depend on the mass of the atoms and the strength of 638 the chemical bonds connecting them. Transitions between vibrational modes are achieved either by 639 absorption of infrared light or by the so-called Raman Effect, which is the inelastic scattering of visible 640 photons. Thus, IR and Raman spectroscopy are complementary techniques, the former detecting vibrations 641 with a change in the electrical dipole moment, while the latter responding to vibrations accompanied by 642 variation in the polarizability of the bond. Thus, heteropolar bonds such as N-H and O-H will appear as intense 643 bands in an IR spectrum, while they will be hardly detectable in Raman. Conversely, homopolar bonds such 644 as C=C will result more active in a Raman experiment, while they will not appear intense in IR spectroscopy 645 (Thygesen et al., 2003).

Infrared radiation covers wavelengths ranging from 780 nm up to 1000 microns and is divided into Near
Infrared (780 to 2500 microns), Mid-Infrared (2.5 to 25 microns) and Far Infrared (25 microns up to 1000
microns). Each of these spectral regions present different vibrational modes and are studied by either Near
Infrared Spectroscopy (NIRS) or IR spectroscopy (often termed Fourier Transform Infrared Spectroscopy, FT-

650 IR). Due to the higher energy involved in the NIR spectrum, only specific bonds vibrational modes are 651 detected, such as C-H, O-H, N-H and S-H. Compared to ordinary FT-IR spectroscopy, NIR spectra feature broad 652 and severely overlapping bands, therefore making assignment of NIR bands frequently challenging (Porep et 653 al., 2015).

654 In an FT-IR microscope, the modulated infrared beam is focused on the sample by a set of gold or aluminium 655 mirrors, as glass lenses are IR-active. The transmitted or reflected intensity is then collected by a photodiode 656 and converted into an electric signal. As mid-IR radiation is highly adsorbed by most food samples, thin 657 sections must be prepared for analysis, or alternatively an Attenuated Total Reflection (ATR) crystal can be 658 used. This device exploits the partial adsorption of IR radiation by the sample at the interface of a prism, in 659 which the beam is propagated and reflected once or multiple times. Due to water appearing as a large broad 660 band in the IR spectrum, hydrated samples are challenging to analyse as the O-H band can cover several 661 peaks of interest. The resolution of a FT-IR microscope is limited by the low brightness of the ceramic lamp, 662 and by the long wavelength employed. Spot size can be reduced with smaller apertures; however, this 663 reduces the beam intensity as well. An ideal 10x10 microns spot size is routinely used, as an acceptable 664 compromise. Synchrotron sources that possess a dedicated IR beamline can provide higher resolution, down 665 to 3 microns (Wellner, 2013)

NIR instruments are based on the same principle, featuring however more design versatility: fast-scanning setups without interferometer parts are available, such as diode-array, acousto-optic tuneable filters and light emitting diodes. An important difference lies in the weaker adsorption of NIR radiation compared to mid-IR (about a factor of 10-100), thus allowing higher penetration depths in samples. For these reasons, NIR spectroscopy finds easily implementation in moving industrial lines; transmission, reflection and other setup geometries can be adopted, depending on the application (Porep et al., 2015).

Raman microscopes instead implement a traditional microscope design with a series of high intensity lasers
in the visible light range (400 to 1100 nm). A narrow bandpass filter blocks all Rayleigh scattering, and collects
only Raman shifted photons. As Raman scattering is weak (1 in 10<sup>6</sup> photons), the intensity and the signal to

noise ratio are low, but this technique offers greater resolution (around 1 microns) and the possibility to use a confocal beam for 3D spatial analysis. Moreover, water bands are not intense in Raman spectra, allowing hydrated samples to be analysed. Raman microscopy is sensitive to fluorescence, due to the higher energy of the radiation, even though it's possible to mitigate the issue by tuning the beam intensity or the wavelength of the selected laser beam. However, proteins containing fluorescent amino acids such as tyrosine, tryptophan and phenylalanine are difficult to image with Raman microscopy for this reason (Thygesen et al., 2003).

The relatively small spot size (10x10 micron to 1x1 micron) can give high resolution images, however it returns an averaged spectrum of all the chemical compounds present in that sampling area. Thus, if Raman and NIR instruments are used to study heterogeneities in food systems, the samples need to be larger than the sampling size to avoid biased results.

686 Pure compounds display an almost unique band pattern in IR or Raman spectra and the intensity of specific 687 peaks can be linked to that compound's concentration in the sample through the Lambert-Beer law. 688 However, external factors such as temperature strongly affect the bands intensity. Furthermore, vibrational 689 spectroscopy can assess the physical state of chemical compounds in the sample as spectra of a specific 690 substance in the solid, liquid and gas state present several differences arising from the different degree of 691 freedom of the molecules in each state. This kind of information is particularly relevant in multiphasic 692 systems, where the macroscopic properties are influenced by the physical state of lipids, the crystallinity of 693 carbohydrates and the three-dimensional structure of proteins (Wellner, 2013).

Raman and IR micro-spectroscopic analysis can provide information in the format of a hyperspectral cube, where each pixel of the collected image is associated to a spectrum. Chemometric techniques can be used to obtain images that highlight the differences in structure and chemistry of the analysed samples (Lohumiet al., 2017).

698 NIR imaging is routinely employed to assess the concentration and spatial distribution of compounds of 699 interest inside food products. Recent examples in literature include proteins, carbohydrates and sialic acid in

edible bird nests (Shi et al., 2017), protein content in wheat kernels (Caporaso, et al. 2018), sucrose, caffeine
and trigonelline in coffee beans (Caporaso et al. 2018b) and intramuscular fat in pork meat (Huang et al.,
2017). To calibrate and subsequently validate NIR results, traditional destructive chemical methods – such as
liquid chromatography or mass spectrometry - are required for measuring precisely the concentration of the
compounds of interest.

705 The use of Raman and Infrared hyperspectral imaging represent an effective analytical method to investigate 706 complex food materials containing fats. While optical, laser and electron microscopy enable detailed 707 visualization of crystalline fat, they cannot provide information regarding the polymorphic state. At the same 708 time, X-Ray diffraction techniques enable precise measurement of cell spacings, but fail to provide the spatial 709 distribution of crystals in the sample. Moreover, all these techniques require significant specimen 710 preparation, which represents an inherent risk of creating artefacts. Raman and Infrared instruments allow 711 simultaneous chemical (and physical) analysis combined with relatively high spatial resolution (around 1 712 micron). Research on fats in porcine rind (Chikuni et al., 2015), fat spreads (van Dalen et al., 2017) and 713 chocolate (Zhang, et al. 2015) with Raman and IR hyperspectral imaging have been recently published. In the 714 work of Chikuni et. al, 2015, pure porcine fat was stored at 0°C and the crystallization of different polymorphs 715  $(\beta' \text{ and } \beta)$  over time was followed with a Raman microscope, together with the development of the fat 716 crystalline network. Van Dalen et al., 2017 showed how Raman hyperspectral imaging enabled the location 717 and differentiation of the major ingredients in a water-in-oil emulsion, such as the solid fat crystals, 718 emulsifier, water droplets and the continuous oil phase as shown in Figure 8. Finally, an experimental 719 approach featuring both IR and Raman was presented in Zhang et al., 2015, where commercial chocolate 720 samples were analysed for mapping their ingredient distribution. Despite having a lower spatial resolution 721 than Raman (10 micron compared to 1 micron), infrared microscopy did not suffer from fluorescence 722 saturation and was thus used to compare results between the two techniques.



Figure 8. Raman hyperspectral imaging of a commercial fat spread, displaying sunflower oil phase (top left), solid fat crystals (top right), emulsifier distribution (bottom left) and water droplets (bottom right) (adapted from van Dalen et al., 2017, with permission from John Wiley and Sons).

723

Raman imaging has also been used to study protein-stabilized oil/water emulsions during an enzymatic demulsification in Wu et al., 2018. Samples taken at different times of the enzymatic process were analysed with Raman microscopy, which gave a 3D image of the arrangement of the protein particles around the oil droplets. A fluorescence quenching model was used, due to the broad signal arising from the proteins. Location and partitioning characteristic of compounds in emulsions was successfully carried out with Confocal Raman Microscopy (CRM).

CRM can be a powerful tool for the analysis of any strong Raman scattering bioactive compound in a heterogeneous system. Carotene and  $\alpha$ -tocopherol display a strong C=C band in Raman spectra, and their partitioning in an oil/water emulsion stabilized by whey protein was investigated with CRM (Mohamad et al., 2017). A simple chemometric method was used to generate quantitative spatial and chemical mapping of the carotene and  $\alpha$ -tocopherol within both the water and oil phase. Light microscopy was used as a comparative imaging method, by overlaying Raman and optical images. In the same work the interactions between carotene and whey protein were investigated by observing spectral variations. 740 CRM has also been used to visualize distribution of solid fat crystals in a complex air-in-oil-in-water emulsion 741 (Brun et al. 2015). The negative contrast from air was helpful to image the air bubbles interface, where fat 742 crystals adsorbed and acted as stabilizers. The crystalline networks within the water and oil phases were also 743 characterized. The focused penetration of Raman microscopes can be exploited to probe the internal 744 structure of solid particles. Powders containing hydroxypropyl methylcellulose (HPMC) and maltodextrin 745 (Nuzzo et al., 2015), whole milk (Nuzzo et al., 2017) and milk serum and lactose (Andersson et al., 2019), 746 produced with different drying techniques were investigated in this fashion. CRM was applied to probe the 747 inner phase separation of the components after controlled evaporation of the aqueous solvent; even in the 748 case of whole milk, all major constituents (lactose, fat and protein) were spatially resolved. The powder 749 particles structure was also investigated with higher resolution techniques such as LV-SEM, to provide better 750 characterization of the surface. Chemical composition was also obtained using XPS.

In conclusion, vibrational micro-spectroscopies have gained popularity due to technological advances in equipment and data processing methods, allowing researchers to chemically map biological molecules in complex food systems with a good resolution (1 - 10 micron) for the meso-scale. Raman imaging in complex media is quite straightforward and allows both chemical identification of the different sample components and their quantitative analysis. This technique can also unveil interactions among molecules via analysis of peak positions.

757 While Raman and IR allow simultaneous chemical information and spatial resolution of complex food 758 materials, their micron-limited resolution might make the analysis of systems containing particles or 759 aggregates in the nanometre range very challenging.

# 760 X-Ray Tomography

The use of X-Ray micro computed tomography (XCT) is a novel application for investigating the internal microstructure of food products. XCT is a non-destructive and non-invasive technique, with a sub-micron resolution and field of view ranging from few centimetres to a few millimetres. Spatial arrangement and interactions of ingredients in food systems can be viewed in three-dimensions and under conditions of
external stimuli, such as temperature and pressure variations. This technique is often termed dynamic or 4D tomography (Guo et al., 2018). As a rule, the scattering of X-Rays increases as the atomic mass increases, so food samples, being primarily composed of hydrogen, carbon and oxygen scatter less than many other materials which can be comprised of heavier elements. This puts a premium on (a) the intensity of the X-Ray beam used and (b) the presence or otherwise of heavier elements in the food which scatter more strongly than the carbon, hydrogen and oxygen components.

771 In XCT, the sample attenuates X-Rays by absorption and scattering, depending on factors such as atomic 772 mass, density and absorption coefficient of the material. As the sample is being rotated, several 2D 773 radiographs are acquired, which represent the spatial distribution of the radio-opacity of the sample. The 774 stack of generated images are then reconstructed into a 3D volume by software processing and yields the 775 internal microstructure of the sample. This is particularly advantageous as light microscopes cannot 776 penetrate opaque samples, and electron microscopes – despite their resolution being higher in certain 777 configurations – require invasive sample preparation in order to penetrate inside samples (Barigou & 778 Douaire, 2013).

779 In food science applications soft X-Rays (up to 50 keV) are preferentially used, both to limit sample damage 780 and to increase contrast between phases with similar density. In fact, as the attenuation of X-Rays is affected 781 by density, emulsions constitute a challenging sample to investigate, due to the close density of water and 782 edible oils, at small length scales. Aerated materials, on the other hand, are more straightforward to image 783 due to the large density difference between air and liquids or solids. Phase-contrast imaging exploits the 784 differences in refractivity displayed by X-Rays that cross different domains, which is used to generate 785 additional contrast in the image. This emerging mode of operation complements attenuation-based 786 measures and it is useful especially for biological samples that display low absorption of X-Rays (Willner et 787 al., 2016).

XCT equipment consists of an X-Ray source, a rotating sample holder, and a detector. The sample is mounted
 into a movable stage that rotates during the tomography measurement. Detectors convert the X-Ray

790 radiation to visible light, which is then focused by optical lenses into a CCD camera (Barigou & Douaire, 2013). 791 Furthermore, the sample can be accommodated in an enclosed chamber to control temperature and 792 pressure and perform dynamic studies on the sample microstructure. For benchtop XCT equipment a conical 793 X-Ray beam is generated, and then collimated to a fixed width. The focal spot size limits the maximum 794 achievable resolution. The generated X-Ray beam is polychromatic and, when traversing the sample, can 795 cause artefacts due to the selective attenuation of low-energy X-Rays with higher energy X-Rays reaching the 796 detector unaltered. This phenomenon is called beam hardening. To limit those artefacts, a filter is placed 797 between the source and the sample to block specific X-Ray wavelengths. Resolution is usually in the order of 798 hundreds of microns. Synchrotron facilities instead produce a beam of parallel rays, allowing better 799 resolution (hundreds of nm) due to the homogeneous signal obtained. Furthermore, the use of a 800 monochromator permits selection of specific X-Ray energies, improving qualitative and quantitative analysis. 801 The synchrotron beam size is smaller (1x30mm), thus limiting its applicability to samples of comparable size 802 only. Additionally, synchrotron facilities are limited, expensive to build and difficult to access for routine 803 analysis.

804 Reconstruction of the 3D volume from the stack of acquired images is required to visualize XCT data and to 805 extract suitable information from the image (Schoeman et al. 2016). Parameters such as density, porosity, 806 and surface to volume ratio of the object analysed, together with particle size and sample thickness are used 807 to characterize the microstructure of the sample. However, data processing for XCT data is very demanding 808 in terms of time and computational power, as well as requiring a large volume of data storage. Segmentation 809 is usually performed on the images in order to extract features of interest via distinct greyscales or 810 morphological characteristics, including particles, voids, or layers. The presence of noise in the image can 811 make segmentation very challenging and pre-processing of the images is often required (Wang et al., 2018).

Despite its wide applicability, XCT has some limitations regarding the type of samples that can be analysed. Semi-liquid samples such as emulsions and foams might move as a result of the applied shear during the rotation of the sample holder. Systems such as these, might benefit from a rotating source setup (gantry

37

system). At the same time, temperature sensitive samples such as mousses and ice creams should be scanned
in a temperature controlled environment to avoid damage due to the beam (Wang et al., 2018).

817 As mentioned earlier, phase-contrast XCT is the preferred mode for studying low-density, multi-phasic 818 systems such as food. By exploiting a synchrotron X-Ray source, details of the microstructures of oil/water 819 emulsions (Nielsen et al., 2016), sucrose suspensions in oil (Hounslow et al., 2016) and ice-cream (Guo et al., 2017; Guo et al., 2018) samples have been obtained. All the major phases in these samples could be 820 821 identified, allowing a better understanding of the spatial arrangement of all ingredients in the sample matrix. 822 Moreover, in Guo et al. (2018) the sample was subject to thermal cycling and the microstructural evolution 823 was followed with time; this led to understanding the functional role of the unfrozen matrix (mostly 824 characterized by sugar in water) in the stability of ice-cream.

825 In the work of Nielsen et al. (2016), a mayonnaise-type emulsion was studied using XCT. However, the fluid 826 nature of this emulsion caused loss of resolution as the sample moved during tomography acquisition and 827 this resulted in blurring of the reconstructed image. Nevertheless, the resolution was still reasonably good 828 (200 to 300 nm) and allowed identification of the lipid colloidal network, water phase, and isolated lipid and 829 water pockets as shown in Figure 9. Additionally, cellulose nanocrystals acting as emulsifiers could be 830 identified in the structure as well. The 3D reconstruction of the colloidal network was subsequently compared 831 with CSLM images. The morphology of the lipid phase appeared as larger, irregular aggregates, while in the 832 tomographic slice individual fat globules could be observed. This difference is due to the higher vertical 833 resolution of XCT (200-300 nm) compared to CSLM (ca. 750 nm).



Figure 9. X-Ray tomography reconstruction of an O/W emulsion, displaying the extent of the lipid network, along with pockets of
 emulsifier and isolated water droplets (taken from Nielsen et al., 2016, with permission from Elsevier).

834

In Hounslow et al., 2016, a model food system featuring a water droplet added to a suspension of sucrose particles in oil was studied with XCT, due to its ability to monitor simultaneously the motion of the droplet and the interactions and structural changes taking place during the experiment. The sample investigated in this work represents a model of how moisture diffusion can trigger phase transitions between fluid and pastelike material. The relatively low resolution (9 microns) was compensated for by a large field of view, as the scope of the study was qualitative. Detailed imaging of the separated sucrose-enriched droplet was carried out subsequently with SEM, which allowed imaging of the sucrose crystal arrangement on the surface.

Commercial chocolate microstructure was investigated in the work from Reinke et al., 2016. In this case, tomography was performed in the conventional adsorption contrast mode, since the purpose of the investigation was to monitor voids and fractures in the chocolate microstructure while cooling from the melt. Electron microscopy cannot provide information of the internal changes in microstructure during cooling since only the sample surface can be imaged. The obtained resolution was around 1-2 microns per voxel, and was sufficient to identify significant defects in the cooling mixture.

Benchtop XCT was also recently applied to the study of food materials. Ellis et al., 2017 evaluated the internal
morphology of an aqueous foam stabilized by agar particles by using a XCT scan. While the reconstructed 3D

852 tomogram was not presented, XCT was used mainly to assess the stability of the bubbles against coalescence 853 over several days. In this work, a relatively quick analysis yielded qualitative information about the sample. 854 In Duquenne et al., 2016, instead, a custom made laboratory-scale XCT machine was used to study the 855 internal microstructure of freeze-thawed gelatin mousses. The relatively lower resolution (12 microns) of this 856 machine was compensated for by minor blurring as the XCT source rotated around the sample (gantry mode) 857 as opposed to the usual operating condition where the sample is rotating. In this work the reconstruction of 858 the 3D volume did not account for bubbles smaller than 10 micron, but still provided useful information on 859 the microstructural evolution of gelatin foams with time as well as on the stabilizing role of peptides in the 860 continuous phase.

In conclusion, XCT has successfully contributed to microstructure investigation of a few food materials, requiring little or no sample preparation and with minor impact on the sample compared with other imaging techniques. The emergence of phase-contrast techniques and improved tomographic reconstruction algorithms can push the resolution and quality of images below the micron level. However, the required small sample volume preparation could be challenging. The application of XCT for the study of soft materials is not widespread; however, encouraging recent results will perhaps bring more popularity to this powerful imaging technique.

## 868 Scanning Acoustic Microscopy

Ultrasonic techniques represent an attractive method for studying food systems due to their noninvasiveness, non-destructiveness and lack of sample preparation. Ultrasound respond to a different set of physical parameters compared to electromagnetic radiation: thermal conductivity, heat capacity, viscosity, density, elastic modulus and acoustic attenuation will affect sound propagation. Moreover, acoustic methods provide a suitable alternative to other techniques for investigating opaque materials (Povey et al., 2013). Pressure waves with frequencies above 20 kHz are termed ultrasound; their propagation through homogeneous media follows the Wood equation, shown in Equation 2:

$$v = \frac{1}{\sqrt{\rho\kappa}}$$
 Eq. 2

Where v is the speed of sound (m/s),  $\rho$  is the density (kg/m<sup>3</sup>) and  $\kappa$  is the adiabatic compressibility (m<sup>2</sup>/kg) (Eq. 2) (Wood, 1941). However, in heterogeneous media such as food systems, the acoustic behaviour is not trivial, due to the presence of multiple phases through which sound waves will travel at different velocities.

As ultrasound pulses traveling in a medium encounter an interface between different materials, the magnitude of the reflected waves will depend on the difference in acoustic impedance of the two materials. The impedance Z is calculated by multiplying the density of the material by the material's speed of sound  $(Z = \rho v)$ . Reflected waves carry information about the mechanical properties of the sample, such as compressibility, elastic modulus, and stress (Povey et al., 2013). Equation 3 shows the relationship between the reflection coefficient of two different materials (here named 1 and 2) and their impedances.

Reflection coefficient 
$$= \frac{Z_1 - Z_2}{Z_1 + Z_2}$$
 Eq. 3

The use of different ultrasonic frequencies for material characterization is termed acoustic spectroscopy, and found application in food science research several decades ago (Povey, 1998; Povey, 2013). Acoustic microscopy investigates material and surface properties at the microscopic scale; the first acoustic microscope was developed in 1974 (Lemons & Quate, 1974). The ultrasonic transducer is the key element in an acoustic microscope, as it determines the resolution and depth of focus of the instrument. Most commonly, a single transducer in reflection mode is used to collect measurements via scanning of the surface of the sample with a stage motor.

Acoustic microscopes generate topographic images of a surface by measuring the time of flight of sound pulses reflected from the sample surface. Attenuation images can also be obtained, which give insight into the mechanical properties of the material analysed. Airborne setups are most suitable for online applications but air has poor sound propagation properties, therefore in higher resolution instruments the sample is immersed in a liquid, usually water (Povey et al., 2013). Due to the wide application variability, most instruments are custom built, featuring transducers with different size, shape and frequency; some examples
can be found in the work of Parker (2010) and Watson et al. (2014).

Despite possessing several advantages, acoustic microscopes are not commonly employed to study food as imaging tools, whereas sound waves find popular application for in-line non-destructive testing in industry (Gallo et al.2018). This is due to the necessity for high-throughput data analysis, robustness and wide applicability in industrial production lines. Nevertheless, a few recent examples of acoustic imaging include vegetable cells (Watson et al. 2012) and cured ham samples (Corona et al., 2013). In the latter, a scanning acoustic microscope with a 50 MHz immersion transducer was employed to differentiate the lean tissue from the fat in meat samples as shown in Figure 10. The resolution for these two studies was around 300 microns.

906



907

908Figure 10. Lateral scan performed by an acoustic microscope; sample reflections are the ones below the dotted line, which display909differential intensity between fat and lean tissue (taken from Corona et al., 2013, with permission from Elsevier).

910 With an appropriate design, several transducers can be used to build a 3D image of a sample in ultrasonic 911 tomography (Watson, 2015). In food–related applications, at present this technique is mostly employed to 912 detect foreign objects in food products, such as drinks cans (Ho et al.2007) and refrigerated milk cartons 913 (Khairi et al. 2018). The ability to probe opaque materials with fast scan rates and the non-destructive character of acoustic tools bear promising applications for investigating food materials, including on-line, non-contact applications in manufacturing. A potential barrier to ultrasounds becoming commonplace could be ascribed to the notwidely understood properties of ultrasound in complex media. While ultrasonic spectroscopy constitutes an established technique, acoustic microscopy still requires efforts to match resolving power and data interpretation with other microscopy techniques (*e.g.*, electron, optical).

## 920 Other techniques

#### 921 Magnetic Resonance Imaging

922 Nuclear Magnetic Resonance Imaging (MRI) offers an alternative non-invasive, non-destructive technique 923 that can probe the internal structure of opaque edible materials without sample preparation. In brief, the 924 physical principle of this technique stems from the magnetic moment that specific nuclei possess, such as 925 hydrogen or carbon. When subjected to an external magnetic field, nuclei in a sample align in a parallel (low-926 energy) or antiparallel (high-energy) orientation; the energy gap between these states is in the range of radio-927 frequency radiation, which is used in form of a pulse to excite nuclei to the high-energy state. Relaxation then 928 occurs by returning to the low-energy state and a radio-frequency radiation is emitted. The decay profile, 929 and magnitude of this radiation depends on the chemical nature of the nuclei, as well as on their local motility 930 (Belton, 2013). Imaging based on magnetic resonance is performed with an MRI instrument equipped with 931 magnetic gradient coils that can perform spatial measurements, thus creating 3D images of the spatial 932 distribution of the MRI signal. MRI can provide several contrast methods to differentiate water phases from 933 lipids, proteins, solid and liquid states, making it particularly useful for studying multiphasic soft matter. 934 However, due to the relative low intensity of MRI radiation, acquisition times are typically lengthy, and the 935 spatial resolution is limited to hundreds of microns. There is renewed interest in improving both acquisition 936 times and spatial resolution, as reported in Reci et al. (2018) and Karlsons et al. (2019). Due to the 937 quantitative nature of the measurement (signal is proportional to proton density), MRI has found application 938 in food science for the study of transport phenomena such as moisture diffusion (Paluri et al., 2015) and oil migration in confectionery products (Wang & Maleky, 2018) (Cikrikci & Oztop, 2018). However, at present
further development of this technique for food applications is still stalled by its complexity of operation and
its relatively low spatial resolution.

#### 942 Neutron Tomography

943 Neutron imaging can provide two- or three-dimensional spatially resolved images of the internal 944 microstructure of bulk samples that are not accessible by other techniques. Neutrons interact with atomic 945 nuclei, rather than with the electron cloud as X-Rays do. The different nature of the interaction phenomena 946 is reflected by the high attenuation displayed by light elements such as hydrogen, while X-Rays are hardly 947 absorbed by lower atomic number nuclei. As a consequence, neutron imaging is particularly useful to 948 investigate soft biological matter like food systems, and can be considered complementary to X-Ray-based 949 techniques. Neutron tomography (NT) provides 3D spatially resolved images which generally display the 950 attenuation coefficient distribution in the sample volume, in a similar fashion to other tomographic 951 techniques. The typical spatial resolution for NT is between 50 and 100 microns, depending on the selected 952 field of view. Similarly to XCT, a phase contrast mode is also available, based on the different neutron 953 refractivity of the phase domains occurring in the sample (Strobl et al., 2009).

954 The use of neutrons for imaging biological matter has increased in the recent years, with the development 955 of several dedicated facilities that provide a suitable neutron source (Burca et al., 2018). In the field of food 956 science research, neutron imaging has been employed to study quantitatively the effect of drying conditions 957 on the water migration in fruit, as water provides a strong contrast in specimens (Defraeye et al., 2016). 958 Further work has been published on the effect of cooking on the microstructure of meat samples (Scussat et 959 al., 2016) (Scussat et al., 2017). The authors quantified both the water migration and protein fibre contraction 960 through image analysis of the 3D tomogram. NT has also been applied to investigate several starch/microalgae foam samples, providing an in-depth characterization of the porous microstructure – and 961 962 to assess the effect of different formulation on the porosity, void distribution and connectivity (Martínez-963 Sanz et al., 2020). Neutron tomography represents a unique and promising technique to investigate food 964 materials, however is limited by the accessibility to a dedicated neutron source facility to perform such 965 experiments.

966

## 967 Conclusions

Investigating the microstructure of multi-phasic food materials, either in static or dynamic conditions, is an
extremely challenging task. The difficulty arises from several factors, including the presence of multiple
phases within the structure and the wide variety of ingredients present in each phase.

The plethora of available characterization techniques provides the food scientist with several strategies for studying microstructure; however – as presented in the current review – all techniques have strengths and limitations, which need consideration when planning experimental analysis. No technique is sufficiently exhaustive to provide fully unambiguous results on a specific type of sample. A successful approach consists in choosing a set of techniques that complement the respective limitations and provide meaningful and comparable results for good quality results.

977 With the development of novel complex food formulations, whose properties and manufacturability are 978 strongly related to the product microstructure, characterization techniques must evolve to assist food 979 product developers and ensure efficient industrial manufacturing. This review presented some of the 980 innovative trends in characterization techniques that will lead the future of food science research.

981 Reducing sample preparation procedures constitutes a key challenge in food research, since analysis of native 982 state specimens yield more representative results and are less prone to artefacts due to staining or slicing of 983 the sample. In addition, enhancing the ability to perform dynamic analysis would allow researchers to 984 investigate food microstructure and its evolution in several contexts, such as processing or shelf storage 985 conditions. These demands can be addressed by employing, for example, environmental electron 986 microscopes, which can analyse samples in native state with high-resolving power. While ESEMs are slowly 987 entering the field of food science, the development of environmental TEM and the use of liquid cells for 988 biological samples is paving the way for their use in research in the next decade.

989 With the diffusion of simulative tools, it will likely become commonplace to support experimental data from 990 microscopy with simulation that can predict the behaviour of complex, multi-component systems such as 991 food. Computer simulation can assist researchers both in terms of results validation, as well as reducing the 992 experimental workload by identifying optimal conditions for specific systems.

993 Furthermore, there is significant interest in developing online, compact versions of currently existing 994 techniques in order to monitor microstructural evolution in real time on industrial production lines. Fast data 995 acquisition, processing and storage are fundamental requirements for techniques to be used in this 996 perspective, not mentioning the absence of sample preparation. Therefore, spectroscopic techniques such 997 as NIR are particularly suited for online application. The ability of penetrating the sample surface and 998 investigating the internal structure is also sought, especially for opaque materials. In this regards, X-Ray 999 tomography and Acoustic Microscopy constitute promising techniques to include in online monitoring, due 1000 to their non-invasive nature and depth of penetration. However, X-Ray tomography is currently weighted 1001 down by the extensive computational workload to produce the images, whereas acoustic microscopy would 1002 largely benefit from an improvement in spatial resolution.

1003 In general, multiple techniques are required to provide valid results during investigation of food systems. 1004 Recently, the development of hybrid techniques has been reported, such as AFM-IR (Dazzi & Prater, 2017), 1005 SEM-Raman (Cardell & Guerra, 2016) and Photoacoustic Tomography (Wang, 2017). In the first two 1006 examples, detailed chemical imaging is coupled with a high-resolution technique, combining these benefits 1007 in one single instrument. Photoacoustic imaging, which found successful employment in the medical field, 1008 measures the pressure waves emitted by radiation-excited molecules, working de facto as a light-stimulated 1009 acoustic microscope. While there are scarce examples in literature with these techniques regarding food 1010 systems, it is likely that complex challenges in the field will lead to their adoption in the near future.

### 1011 Acknowledgements

The authors would like to acknowledge the Engineering and Physical Sciences Research Council funded
 Centre for Doctoral Training in Soft Matter and Functional Interfaces, grant ref. no. EP/L015536/1 as well as
 Nestlé PTC Confectionery (York, UK) for the financial and writing support.

# 1015 References

- 1016 Abbas, S., Karangwa, E., Bashari, M., Hayat, K., Hong, X., Sharif, H. R., & Zhang, X. (2015). Fabrication of
- 1017 polymeric nanocapsules from curcumin-loaded nanoemulsion templates by self-assembly. *Ultrasonics*
- 1018 Sonochemistry, 23, 81–92. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ultsonch.2014.10.006
- 1019 Acevedo, N. C., & Marangoni, A. G. (2010). Characterization of the nanoscale in triacylglycerol crystal
- 1020 networks. Crystal Growth and Design, 10(8), 3327–3333. https://doi.org/10.1021/cg100468e
- 1021 Agha, M., & Agha, R. (2017). The rising prevalence of obesity: part A: impact on public health. *International*

1022 Journal of Surgical Oncology, 2(7), e17. https://doi.org/10.1097/IJ9.000000000000017

- Aguilera, J. M. (2005). Why food micro structure? *Journal of Food Engineering*, 67(1–2), 3–11.
- 1024 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jfoodeng.2004.05.050
- Ainis, W. N., Ersch, C., & Ipsen, R. (2018). Partial replacement of whey proteins by rapeseed proteins in
   heat-induced gelled systems: Effect of pH. *Food Hydrocolloids*, 77, 397–406.
- 1027 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodhyd.2017.10.016
- 1028 Ako, K., Durand, D., Nicolai, T., & Becu, L. (2009). Quantitative analysis of confocal laser scanning
- 1029 microscopy images of heat-set globular protein gels. *Food Hydrocolloids*, 23(4), 1111–1119.
- 1030 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodhyd.2008.09.003
- 1031 Andersson, I. M., Millqvist-Fureby, A., Sommertune, J., Alexander, M., Hellström, N., Glantz, M., Paulsson,
- 1032 M., & Bergenståhl, B. (2019). Impact of protein surface coverage and layer thickness on rehydration
- 1033 characteristics of milk serum protein/lactose powder particles. *Colloids and Surfaces A:*
- 1034 *Physicochemical and Engineering Aspects*, 561(August 2018), 395–404.
- 1035 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.colsurfa.2018.10.073
- 1036 Asioli, D., Aschemann-Witzel, J., Caputo, V., Vecchio, R., Annunziata, A., Næs, T., & Varela, P. (2017). Making
- 1037 sense of the "clean label" trends: A review of consumer food choice behavior and discussion of
- 1038 industry implications. *Food Research International*, *99*(April), 58–71.

- 1039 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodres.2017.07.022
- 1040 Auty, M. A. E. (2013). Confocal microscopy: Principles and applications to food microstructures. In *Food*
- 1041 *Microstructures: Microscopy, Measurement and Modelling.*
- 1042 https://doi.org/10.1533/9780857098894.1.96
- 1043 Bahri, A., Martin, M., Gergely, C., Marchesseau, S., & Chevalier-Lucia, D. (2018). Topographical and
- 1044 nanomechanical characterization of casein nanogel particles using atomic force microscopy. *Food*
- 1045 *Hydrocolloids*, 83, 53–60. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodhyd.2018.03.029
- 1046 Barigou, M., & Douaire, M. (2013). X-ray micro-computed tomography for resolving food microstructures.
- 1047 In *Food Microstructures: Microscopy, Measurement and Modelling*. Woodhead Publishing Limited.
- 1048 https://doi.org/10.1533/9780857098894.1.246
- 1049 Belc, N., Smeu, I., Macri, A., Vallauri, D., & Flynn, K. (2018). Reformulating foods to meet current scientific
- 1050 knowledge about salt, sugar and fats. Trends in Food Science and Technology, 84(October 2018), 25–
- 1051 28. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tifs.2018.11.002
- 1052 Bellissent-Funel, M. C., Hassanali, A., Havenith, M., Henchman, R., Pohl, P., Sterpone, F., Van Der Spoel, D.,
- 1053 Xu, Y., & Garcia, A. E. (2016). Water Determines the Structure and Dynamics of Proteins. *Chemical*

1054 *Reviews*, 116(13), 7673–7697. https://doi.org/10.1021/acs.chemrev.5b00664

- 1055 Belton, P. S. (2013). Using magnetic resonance to explore food microstructures. In *Food Microstructures:*
- 1056 *Microscopy, Measurement and Modelling* (Issue October 2012). Woodhead Publishing Limited.
- 1057 https://doi.org/10.1533/9780857098894.1.223
- 1058 Besseling, R., Isa, L., Weeks, E. R., & Poon, W. C. K. (2009). Quantitative imaging of colloidal flows. In
- 1059 *Advances in Colloid and Interface Science* (Vol. 146, Issues 1–2, pp. 1–17).
- 1060 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cis.2008.09.008
- 1061 Bin Sintang, M. D., Danthine, S., Patel, A. R., Rimaux, T., Van De Walle, D., & Dewettinck, K. (2017). Mixed
- 1062 surfactant systems of sucrose esters and lecithin as a synergistic approach for oil structuring. *Journal*

- 1063 *of Colloid and Interface Science*, 504, 387–396. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.pec.2017.09.013
- Binks, B. P., Garvey, E. J., & Vieira, J. (2016). Whipped oil stabilised by surfactant crystals. *Chem. Sci.*, 7(4),
  2621–2632. https://doi.org/10.1039/C6SC00046K
- 1066 Boitte, J. B., Hayert, M., & Michon, C. (2013). Observation of wheat flour doughs under mechanical
- 1067 treatment using confocal microscopy and classification of their microstructures. *Journal of Cereal*
- 1068 *Science*. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jcs.2013.07.009
- 1069 Brun, M., Delample, M., Harte, E., Lecomte, S., & Leal-Calderon, F. (2015). Stabilization of air bubbles in oil
- 1070 by surfactant crystals: A route to produce air-in-oil foams and air-in-oil-in-water emulsions. *Food*
- 1071 *Research International, 67,* 366–375. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodres.2014.11.044
- 1072 Bui, V. T. N. T., Nguyen, B. T., Renou, F., & Nicolai, T. (2019). Rheology and microstructure of mixtures of 1073 iota and kappa-carrageenan. *Food Hydrocolloids*, *89*, 180–187.
- 1074 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodhyd.2018.10.034
- 1075 Burca, G., Nagella, S., Clark, T., Tasev, D., Rahman, I. A., Garwood, R. J., Spencer, A. R. T., Turner, M. J., &
- 1076 Kelleher, J. F. (2018). Exploring the potential of neutron imaging for life sciences on IMAT. *Journal of*
- 1077 *Microscopy*, 272(3), 242–247. https://doi.org/10.1111/jmi.12761
- Caporaso, N., Whitworth, M. B., & Fisk, I. D. (2018). Protein content prediction in single wheat kernels using
   hyperspectral imaging. *Food Chemistry*, *240*, 32–42. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodchem.2017.07.048
- 1080 Caporaso, N., Whitworth, M. B., Grebby, S., & Fisk, I. D. (2018). Non-destructive analysis of sucrose, caffeine
- and trigonelline on single green coffee beans by hyperspectral imaging. *Food Research International*,
- 1082 106(September 2017), 193–203. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodres.2017.12.031
- 1083 Cardell, C., & Guerra, I. (2016). An overview of emerging hyphenated SEM-EDX and Raman spectroscopy
- 1084 systems: Applications in life, environmental and materials sciences. *TrAC Trends in Analytical*
- 1085 *Chemistry*, 77, 156–166. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.trac.2015.12.001
- 1086 Chen, A., Li, S. W., Sang, F. N., Zeng, H. B., & Xu, J. H. (2018). Interactions between micro-scale oil droplets

- 1087 in aqueous surfactant solution determined using optical tweezers. *Journal of Colloid and Interface*
- 1088 Science, 532, 128–135. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jcis.2018.07.116
- 1089 Chikuni, K., Sasaki, K., Hamaguchi, H., Motoyama, M., Aikawa, K., Ando, M., & Nakajima, I. (2015).
- 1090 Simultaneous imaging of fat crystallinity and crystal polymorphic types by Raman microspectroscopy.
- 1091 Food Chemistry, 196, 411–417. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodchem.2015.09.043
- 1092 Cikrikci, S., & Oztop, M. H. (2018). Oil migration in hazelnut paste/chocolate systems using magnetic
- 1093 resonance imaging. *Journal of Food Measurement and Characterization*, *12*(3), 1460–1472.
- 1094 https://doi.org/10.1007/s11694-018-9761-0
- 1095 Corgneau, M., Scher, J., Ritie-Pertusa, L., Le, D. t. l., Petit, J., Nikolova, Y., Banon, S., & Gaiani, C. (2017).
- 1096 Recent advances on lactose intolerance: Tolerance thresholds and currently available answers. *Critical*
- 1097 *Reviews in Food Science and Nutrition*, 57(15), 3344–3356.
- 1098 https://doi.org/10.1080/10408398.2015.1123671
- 1099 Corona, E., Garcia-Perez, J. V., Gomez Alvarez-Arenas, T. E., Watson, N., Povey, M. J. W., & Benedito, J.
- 1100 (2013). Advances in the ultrasound characterization of dry-cured meat products. Journal of Food
- 1101 Engineering, 119(3), 464–470. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jfoodeng.2013.06.023
- 1102 Da Silva, R. C., De Martini Soares, F. A. S., Maruyama, J. M., Dagostinho, N. R., Silva, Y. A., Ract, J. N. R., &
- 1103 Gioielli, L. A. (2016). Microscopic approach of the crystallization of tripalmitin and tristearin by
- 1104 microscopy. *Chemistry and Physics of Lipids*, 198, 1–9.
- 1105 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemphyslip.2016.04.004
- 1106 Dazzi, A., & Prater, C. B. (2017). AFM-IR: Technology and applications in nanoscale infrared spectroscopy
- and chemical imaging. *Chemical Reviews*, *117*(7), 5146–5173.
- 1108 https://doi.org/10.1021/acs.chemrev.6b00448
- 1109 Defraeye, T., Nicolaï, B., Mannes, D., Aregawi, W., Verboven, P., & Derome, D. (2016). Probing inside fruit
- slices during convective drying by quantitative neutron imaging. *Journal of Food Engineering*, 178,

- 1111 198–202. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jfoodeng.2016.01.023
- Den Engelsen, D. (1976). Optical anisotropy in ordered systems of lipids. *Surface Science*, *56*(C), 272–280.
   https://doi.org/10.1016/0039-6028(76)90452-0
- 1114 Díaz-Calderón, P., MacNaughtan, B., Hill, S., Foster, T., Enrione, J., & Mitchell, J. (2018). Changes in
- 1115 gelatinisation and pasting properties of various starches (wheat, maize and waxy maize) by the
- addition of bacterial cellulose fibrils. *Food Hydrocolloids*, *80*, 274–280.
- 1117 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodhyd.2018.02.023
- 1118 Doan, C. D., Patel, A. R., Tavernier, I., De Clercq, N., Van Raemdonck, K., Van de Walle, D., Delbaere, C., &
- 1119 Dewettinck, K. (2016). The feasibility of wax-based oleogel as a potential co-structurant with palm oil
- in low-saturated fat confectionery fillings. *European Journal of Lipid Science and Technology*, 118(12),
- 1121 1903–1914. https://doi.org/10.1002/ejlt.201500172
- 1122 Doan, C. D., Van De Walle, D., Dewettinck, K., & Patel, A. R. (2015). Evaluating the oil-gelling properties of
- 1123 natural waxes in rice bran oil: Rheological, thermal, and microstructural study. JAOCS, Journal of the
- 1124 *American Oil Chemists' Society*, *92*(6), 801–811. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11746-015-2645-0
- 1125 Dudkiewicz, A., Tiede, K., Loeschner, K., Jensen, L. H. S., Jensen, E., Wierzbicki, R., Boxall, A. B. A., &
- 1126 Molhave, K. (2011). Characterization of nanomaterials in food by electron microscopy. *TrAC Trends in*
- 1127 Analytical Chemistry, 30(1), 28–43. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.trac.2010.10.007
- 1128 Duquenne, B., Vergauwen, B., Capdepon, C., Boone, M. A., De Schryver, T., Van Hoorebeke, L., Van
- 1129 Weyenberg, S., Stevens, P., & De Block, J. (2016). Stabilising frozen dairy mousses by low molecular
- 1130 weight gelatin peptides. *Food Hydrocolloids*, *60*, 317–323.
- 1131 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodhyd.2016.04.001
- Dutta, S. K., Mbi, A., Arevalo, R. C., & Blair, D. L. (2013). Development of a confocal rheometer for soft and
  biological materials. *Review of Scientific Instruments*, *84*(6). https://doi.org/10.1063/1.4810015
- 1134 Dyab, A. K. F., & Paunov, V. N. (2010). Particle stabilised emulsions studied by WETSEM technique +. 44(0),

- 1135 2613–2615. https://doi.org/10.1039/c0sm00032a
- Eliasi, J. R., & Dwyer, J. T. (2002). *Kosher and Halal: Religious Observances Affecting Dietary Intakes* (pp. 911–913).
- Ellis, A. L., Norton, A. B., Mills, T. B., & Norton, I. T. (2017). Stabilisation of foams by agar gel particles. *Food Hydrocolloids*, *73*, 222–228. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodhyd.2017.06.038
- 1140 Estrada-Fernández, A. G., Román-Guerrero, A., Jiménez-Alvarado, R., Lobato-Calleros, C., Alvarez-Ramirez,
- 1141 J., & Vernon-Carter, E. J. (2018). Stabilization of oil-in-water-in-oil (O1/W/O2) Pickering double
- 1142 emulsions by soluble and insoluble whey protein concentrate-gum Arabic complexes used as inner
- and outer interfaces. *Journal of Food Engineering*, *221*, 35–44.
- 1144 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jfoodeng.2017.10.006
- 1145 Et-Thakafy, O., Guyomarc'h, F., & Lopez, C. (2017). Lipid domains in the milk fat globule membrane:
- 1146 Dynamics investigated in situ in milk in relation to temperature and time. Food Chemistry, 220, 352–
- 1147 361. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodchem.2016.10.017
- 1148 Euston, S. R. (2013). Modelling and computer simulation of food structures. In *Food Microstructures:*
- 1149 *Microscopy, Measurement and Modelling*. Woodhead Publishing Limited.
- 1150 https://doi.org/10.1533/9780857098894.2.336
- 1151 Euston, Stephen R. (2017). Molecular simulation of biosurfactants with relevance to food systems. *Current*
- 1152 *Opinion in Colloid and Interface Science*, 28, 110–119. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cocis.2017.04.002
- 1153 Feng, T., Zhu, X., & Campanella, O. (2016). Molecular modeling tools to characterize the structure and
- 1154 complexation behavior of carbohydrates. *Current Opinion in Food Science*, *9*, 62–69.
- 1155 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cofs.2016.08.003
- 1156 Feng, Y., & Lee, Y. (2016). Surface modification of zein colloidal particles with sodium caseinate to stabilize
- 1157 oil-in-water pickering emulsion. *Food Hydrocolloids*, *56*, 292–302.
- 1158 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodhyd.2015.12.030

- 1159 Ferrando, M., & Spiess, W. E. L. (2000). Confocal Scanning Laser Microscopy. A powerful tool in Food
- 1160 Science. Food Science and Technology International, 267–284.
- Gallo, M., Ferrara, L., & Naviglio, D. (2018). Application of Ultrasound in Food Science and Technology: A
   Perspective. *Foods*, 7(10), 164. https://doi.org/10.1088/0029-5515/53/8/083029
- 1163 Galvão, K. C. S., Vicente, A. A., & Sobral, P. J. A. (2018). Development, Characterization, and Stability of O/W
- 1164 Pepper Nanoemulsions Produced by High-Pressure Homogenization. *Food and Bioprocess Technology*,
- 1165 *11*(2), 355–367. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11947-017-2016-y
- 1166 Gao, Z., Wu, Y., Bao, Y., Gong, J., Wang, J., & Rohani, S. (2018). Image Analysis for In-line Measurement of
- 1167 Multidimensional Size, Shape, and Polymorphic Transformation of I -Glutamic Acid Using Deep
- 1168 Learning-Based Image Segmentation and Classification [Rapid-communication]. *Crystal Growth and*
- 1169 *Design*, 18(8), 4275–4281. https://doi.org/10.1021/acs.cgd.8b00883
- 1170 Gee, V. L., Carey, M. A., & Auty, M. A. E. (2010). A New Cryo-STEM Method for Imaging Food Colloids in the
- 1171 Scanning Electron Microscope. *Scanning*, *32*, 150–154. https://doi.org/10.1002/sca.20190
- 1172 Glicerina, Virginia; Balestra, Federica; Dalla Rosa, Marco; Romani, S. (2015). Effect of manufacturing process
- 1173 on the microstructural and rheological properties of milk chocolate. *Journal of Food Engineering*,
- 1174 *1*(145), 45–50. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jfoodeng.2014.06.039
- 1175 Glover, Z. J., Bisgaard, A. H., Andersen, U., Povey, M. J., Brewer, J. R., & Simonsen, A. C. (2019). Cross-
- 1176 correlation analysis to quantify relative spatial distributions of fat and protein in super-resolution
- 1177 microscopy images of dairy gels. *Food Hydrocolloids*, *97*(May), 105225.
- 1178 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodhyd.2019.105225
- 1179 Glover, Z. J., Ersch, C., Andersen, U., Holmes, M. J., Povey, M. J., Brewer, J. R., & Simonsen, A. C. (2019).
- 1180 Super-resolution microscopy and empirically validated autocorrelation image analysis discriminates
- 1181 microstructures of dairy derived gels. *Food Hydrocolloids*, *90*(September 2018), 62–71.
- 1182 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodhyd.2018.12.004

- 1183 Godoy, C. A., Valiente, M., Pons, R., & Montalvo, G. (2015). Effect of fatty acids on self-assembly of soybean
- 1184 lecithin systems. *Colloids and Surfaces B: Biointerfaces, 131,* 21–28.
- 1185 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.colsurfb.2015.03.065
- 1186 Greiner, M., Sonnleitner, B., Mailänder, M., & Briesen, H. (2014). Modeling complex and multi-component
- 1187 food systems in molecular dynamics simulations on the example of chocolate conching. *Food and*
- 1188 Function, 5(2), 235–242. https://doi.org/10.1039/c3fo60355e
- 1189 Groves, K., & Parker, M. L. (2013). Appendix: Electron microscopy: principles and applications to food
- 1190 microstructures. In *Food Microstructures*. Woodhead Publishing Limited.
- 1191 https://doi.org/10.1533/9780857098894.2.386
- 1192 Gunning, A. Patrick, & Morris, V. J. (2018). Getting the feel of food structure with atomic force microscopy.
- 1193 *Food Hydrocolloids, 78,* 62–76. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodhyd.2017.05.017
- 1194 Gunning, A. Patrick, Wilde, P. J., Clark, D. C., Morris, V. J., Parker, M. L., & Gunning, P. A. (1996). Atomic
- force microscopy of interfacial protein films. *Journal of Colloid and Interface Science*, *183*(2), 600–602.
- 1196 https://doi.org/10.1006/jcis.1996.0584
- 1197 Gunning, A P, Kirby, A. R., Parker, M. L., Cross, K. L., & Morris, V. J. (2010). Utilizing Atomic Force
- 1198 Microscopy in Food Research. *Food Technology*, *12*(Suppl 2), 32–37.
- 1199 https://doi.org/10.1017/S1431927605509711
- 1200 Gunning, P. A. (2013). Light microscopy: Principles and applications to food microstructures. In Food
- 1201 *Microstructures: Microscopy, Measurement and Modelling* (Vol. 1665). Woodhead Publishing Limited.
- 1202 https://doi.org/10.1533/9780857098894.1.62
- 1203 Guo, E., Kazantsev, D., Mo, J., Bent, J., Van Dalen, G., Schuetz, P., Rockett, P., StJohn, D., & Lee, P. D. (2018).
- 1204 Revealing the microstructural stability of a three-phase soft solid (ice cream) by 4D synchrotron X-ray
- 1205 tomography. *Journal of Food Engineering*, 237(May), 204–214.
- 1206 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jfoodeng.2018.05.027

- 1207 Guo, E., Zeng, G., Kazantsev, D., Rockett, P., Bent, J., Kirkland, M., Van Dalen, G., Eastwood, D. S., StJohn, D.,
- & Lee, P. D. (2017a). Synchrotron X-ray tomographic quantification of microstructural evolution in ice
   cream-a multi-phase soft solid. *RSC Advances*, 7(25), 15561–15573.
- 1210 https://doi.org/10.1039/c7ra00642j
- 1211 Guo, E., Zeng, G., Kazantsev, D., Rockett, P., Bent, J., Kirkland, M., Van Dalen, G., Eastwood, D. S., StJohn, D.,
- 1212 & Lee, P. D. (2017b). Synchrotron X-ray tomographic quantification of microstructural evolution in ice
- 1213 cream a multi-phase soft solid. RSC Adv., 7(25), 15561–15573. https://doi.org/10.1039/C7RA00642J
- 1214 Guo, Y., Zhang, X., Hao, W., Xie, Y., Chen, L., Li, Z., Zhu, B., & Feng, X. (2018). Nano-bacterial cellulose/soy
- 1215 protein isolate complex gel as fat substitutes in ice cream model. *Carbohydrate Polymers*, 198(June),
- 1216 620–630. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.carbpol.2018.06.078
- Haldar, K., & Chakraborty, S. (2018). Effect of liquid pool concentration on chemically reactive drop impact
  gelation process. *Journal of Colloid and Interface Science*, *528*, 156–165.
- 1219 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jcis.2018.05.078
- Han, J., Zhou, X., Cao, J., Wang, Y., Sun, B., Li, Y., & Zhang, L. (2018). Microstructural evolution of whipped
- 1221 cream in whipping process observed by confocal laser scanning microscopy. *International Journal of*
- 1222 Food Properties, 21(1), 593–605. https://doi.org/10.1080/10942912.2018.1437630
- 1223 Harrison, P. D., Smith, K. W., Bhaggan, K., & Stapley, A. G. F. (2016). Image analysis of palm oil crystallisation
- as observed by hot stage microscopy. *Journal of Crystal Growth*, 444, 28–38.
- 1225 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jcrysgro.2016.03.026
- 1226 He, X., & Hwang, H. (2016). ScienceDirect Nanotechnology in food science : Functionality , applicability , and
- safety assessment. *Journal of Food and Drug Analysis*, 24(4), 671–681.
- 1228 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jfda.2016.06.001
- Hell, S. W. (2009). Microscopy and its focal switch. *Nature Methods*, *6*(1), 24–32.
- 1230 https://doi.org/10.1038/nmeth.1291

- 1231 Ho, K. S., Billson, D. R., & Hutchins, D. A. (2007). Inspection of drinks cans using non-contact
- electromagnetic acoustic transducers. *Journal of Food Engineering*, 80(2), 431–444.

1233 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jfoodeng.2006.04.025

- Hounslow, M. J., Salman, A. D., Islam, S. F., Palzer, S., Whitehouse, S., Sundara, R. V., & Mancini, L. (2016).
- 1235 Studying model suspensions using high resolution synchrotron X-ray microtomography. *Chemical*
- 1236 Engineering Research and Design, 117, 756–772. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cherd.2016.11.034
- 1237 Hu, Z., Marway, H. S., Kasem, H., Pelton, R., & Cranston, E. D. (2016). Dried and Redispersible Cellulose
- 1238 Nanocrystal Pickering Emulsions. *ACS Macro Letters*, *5*(2), 185–189.
- 1239 https://doi.org/10.1021/acsmacrolett.5b00919
- 1240 Hu, Z., Patten, T., Pelton, R., & Cranston, E. D. (2015). Synergistic Stabilization of Emulsions and Emulsion
- 1241 Gels with Water-Soluble Polymers and Cellulose Nanocrystals. ACS Sustainable Chemistry and

1242 Engineering, 3(5), 1023–1031. https://doi.org/10.1021/acssuschemeng.5b00194

- 1243 Huang, H., Liu, L., & Ngadi, M. O. (2017). Assessment of intramuscular fat content of pork using NIR
- 1244 hyperspectral images of rib end. *Journal of Food Engineering*, 193, 29–41.
- 1245 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jfoodeng.2016.07.005
- 1246 Huang, Q., Yu, H., & Ru, Q. (2010). Bioavailability and delivery of nutraceuticals using nanotechnology.
- 1247 *Journal of Food Science*, 75(1). https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1750-3841.2009.01457.x
- Huang, Z., Liu, H., Luo, J., Ren, F., & Zhang, Y. (2017). Yak milk fat globules from the Qinghai-Tibetan
- 1249 Plateau: Membrane lipid composition and morphological properties. *Food Chemistry*, 245(August
- 1250 2017), 731–737. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodchem.2017.12.001
- 1251 Ishibashi, C., Hondoh, H., & Ueno, S. (2016). Influence of morphology and polymorphic transformation of

1252 fat crystals on the freeze-thaw stability of mayonnaise-type oil-in-water emulsions. *Food Research* 

1253 International, 89, 604–613. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodres.2016.09.012

1254 James, B. (2009). Advances in "wet" electron microscopy techniques and their application to the study of

- 1255 food structure. *Trends in Food Science and Technology*, 20(3–4), 114–124.
- 1256 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tifs.2009.01.057
- Jose, J., Pouvreau, L., & Martin, A. H. (2016). Mixing whey and soy proteins: Consequences for the gel
   mechanical response and water holding. *Food Hydrocolloids*, *60*, 216–224.
- 1259 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodhyd.2016.03.031
- 1260 Joung, H. J., Choi, M. J., Kim, J. T., Park, S. H., Park, H. J., & Shin, G. H. (2016). Development of Food-Grade
- 1261 Curcumin Nanoemulsion and its Potential Application to Food Beverage System: Antioxidant Property
- and In Vitro Digestion. Journal of Food Science, 81(3), N745–N753. https://doi.org/10.1111/1750-
- 1263 3841.13224
- 1264 Karlsons, K., de Kort, D. W., Sederman, A. J., Mantle, M. D., de Jong, H., Appel, M., & Gladden, L. F. (2019).
- 1265 Identification of sampling patterns for high-resolution compressed sensing MRI of porous materials:

1266 'learning' from X-ray microcomputed tomography data. *Journal of Microscopy*.

- 1267 https://doi.org/10.1111/jmi.12837
- 1268 Kazazi, H., Khodaiyan, F., Rezaei, K., Pishvaei, M., Mohammadifar, M. A., & Moieni, S. (2017). Rheology and
- 1269 microstructure of kefiran and whey protein mixed gels. Journal of Food Science and Technology, 54(5),
- 1270 1168–1174. https://doi.org/10.1007/s13197-017-2553-4
- 1271 Kharlamova, A., Nicolai, T., & Chassenieux, C. (2018). Mixtures of sodium caseinate and whey protein
- aggregates: Viscosity and acid- or salt-induced gelation. *International Dairy Journal, 86,* 110–119.
- 1273 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.idairyj.2018.07.002
- Lemons, R. A., & Quate, C. F. (1974). Acoustic microscope Scanning version. *Applied Physics Letters*, 24(4),
   163–165. https://doi.org/10.1063/1.1655136
- 1276 Li, J., Shin, G. H., Lee, I. W., Chen, X., & Park, H. J. (2016). Soluble starch formulated nanocomposite
- increases water solubility and stability of curcumin. *Food Hydrocolloids*, *56*, 41–49.
- 1278 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodhyd.2015.11.024

- 1279 Li, Q., Wu, Q. Y., Jiang, W., Qian, J. Y., Zhang, L., Wu, M., Rao, S. Q., & Wu, C. Sen. (2019). Effect of pulsed
- 1280 electric field on structural properties and digestibility of starches with different crystalline type in solid
- 1281 state. *Carbohydrate Polymers*, 207(November 2018), 362–370.
- 1282 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.carbpol.2018.12.001
- 1283 Li, X., Li, J., Gong, J., Kuang, Y., Mo, L., & Song, T. (2018). Cellulose nanocrystals (CNCs) with different
- 1284 crystalline allomorph for oil in water Pickering emulsions. *Carbohydrate Polymers*, 183(September
- 1285 2017), 303–310. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.carbpol.2017.12.085
- 1286 Liu, F., Zheng, J., Huang, C. H., Tang, C. H., & Ou, S. Y. (2018). Pickering high internal phase emulsions
- 1287 stabilized by protein-covered cellulose nanocrystals. *Food Hydrocolloids*, *82*, 96–105.
- 1288 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodhyd.2018.03.047
- Liu, H., Lelievre, J., & Ayoung-Chee, W. (1991). A study of starch gelatinization using differential scanning
   calorimetry, X-ray, and birefringence measurements. *Carbohydrate Research*, *210*(C), 79–87.
- 1291 https://doi.org/10.1016/0008-6215(91)80114-3
- 1292 Lohumi, S., Kim, M. S., Qin, J., & Cho, B. K. (2017). Raman imaging from microscopy to macroscopy: Quality
- and safety control of biological materials. *TrAC Trends in Analytical Chemistry*, *93*, 183–198.
- 1294 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.trac.2017.06.002
- 1295 Lopez, C., Cauty, C., & Guyomarc'h, F. (2015). Organization of lipids in milks, infant milk formulas and
- 1296 various dairy products: role of technological processes and potential impacts. Dairy Science and
- 1297 Technology, 95(6), 863–893. https://doi.org/10.1007/s13594-015-0263-0
- 1298 Lupi, F. R., De Santo, M. P., Ciuchi, F., Baldino, N., & Gabriele, D. (2018). The role of edible oils in low
- 1299 molecular weight organogels rheology and structure. Food Research International, 111(May), 399–
- 1300 407. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodres.2018.05.050
- Ma, Y., Zhang, B., Li, H., Li, Y., Hu, J., Li, J., Wang, H., & Deng, Z. (2017). Chemical and molecular dynamics
   analysis of crystallization properties of honey. *International Journal of Food Properties*, 20(4), 725–

- 1303 733. https://doi.org/10.1080/10942912.2016.1178282
- Marangoni, A. G., & McGauley, S. E. (2003). Relationship between crystallization behavior and structure in
   cocoa butter. *Crystal Growth and Design*, 3(1), 95–108. https://doi.org/10.1021/cg025580l
- 1306 Martínez-Sanz, M., Larsson, E., Filli, K. B., Loupiac, C., Assifaoui, A., López-Rubio, A., & Lopez-Sanchez, P.
- 1307 (2020). Nano-/microstructure of extruded Spirulina/starch foams in relation to their textural
- 1308 properties. *Food Hydrocolloids*, *103*(September 2019), 105697.
- 1309 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodhyd.2020.105697
- 1310 Matheson, A. B., Koutsos, V., Dalkas, G., Euston, S., & Clegg, P. (2017). Microstructure of β-Sitosterol:γ-
- 1311 Oryzanol Edible Organogels. *Langmuir*, *33*(18), 4537–4542.
- 1312 https://doi.org/10.1021/acs.langmuir.7b00040
- 1313 McClements, J., & McClements, D. J. (2016). Standardization of Nanoparticle Characterization: Methods for
- 1314 Testing Properties, Stability, and Functionality of Edible Nanoparticles. *Critical Reviews in Food Science*
- 1315 *and Nutrition*, *56*(8), 1334–1362. https://doi.org/10.1080/10408398.2014.970267
- 1316 Meijer, C. R., Shamir, R., & Mearin, M. L. (2015). Coeliac disease and noncoeliac gluten sensitivity. *Journal of*
- 1317 *Pediatric Gastroenterology and Nutrition, 60*(4), 429–432.
- 1318 https://doi.org/10.1097/MPG.0000000000000708
- 1319 Meng, Z., Qi, K., Guo, Y., Wang, Y., & Liu, Y. (2018). Effects of thickening agents on the formation and
- 1320 properties of edible oleogels based on hydroxypropyl methyl cellulose. Food Chemistry,
- 1321 246(November 2017), 137–149. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodchem.2017.10.154
- 1322 Mettu, S., Wu, C., & Dagastine, R. R. (2018). Dynamic forces between emulsified water drops coated with
- 1323 Poly-Glycerol-Poly-Ricinoleate (PGPR) in canola oil. Journal of Colloid and Interface Science, 517, 166–
- 1324 175. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jcis.2018.01.104
- 1325 Mikami, H., Gao, L., & Goda, K. (2016). Ultrafast optical imaging technology: Principles and applications of
- 1326 emerging methods. *Nanophotonics*, 5(4), 441–453. https://doi.org/10.1515/nanoph-2016-0026

- 1327 Mohd Khairi, M. T., Ibrahim, S., Md Yunus, M. A., & Faramarzi, M. (2018). Ultrasonic tomography for
- detecting foreign objects in refrigerated milk cartons. *International Journal of Dairy Technology*, 71(4),

1329 1005–1011. https://doi.org/10.1111/1471-0307.12534

- 1330 Morris, V. J. (2013). Probe microscopy and photonic force microscopy: Principles and applications to food
- 1331 microstructures. In *Food Microstructures: Microscopy, Measurement and Modelling*. Woodhead
- 1332 Publishing Limited. https://doi.org/10.1533/9780857098894.1.27
- 1333 Moud, A. A., Arjmand, M., Yan, N., Nezhad, A. S., & Hejazi, S. H. (2018). Colloidal Behavior of Cellulose
- 1334 Nanocrystals in Presence of Sodium Chloride. *ChemistrySelect*, *3*(17), 4969–4978.
- 1335 https://doi.org/10.1002/slct.201703152
- 1336 Murthy, A. V. R., Guyomarc'H, F., & Lopez, C. (2016). Cholesterol Decreases the Size and the Mechanical
- 1337 Resistance to Rupture of Sphingomyelin Rich Domains, in Lipid Bilayers Studied as a Model of the Milk
- 1338 Fat Globule Membrane. *Langmuir*, *32*(26), 6757–6765. https://doi.org/10.1021/acs.langmuir.6b01040
- 1339 Nielsen, M. S., Munk, M. B., Diaz, A., Pedersen, E. B. L., Holler, M., Bruns, S., Risbo, J., Mortensen, K., &
- 1340 Feidenhans'l, R. (2016). Ptychographic X-ray computed tomography of extended colloidal networks in
- 1341 food emulsions. *Food Structure*, 7, 21–28. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foostr.2016.01.001
- 1342 Norton, J. E., Gonzalez Espinosa, Y., Watson, R. L., Spyropoulos, F., & Norton, I. T. (2015). Functional food
- 1343 microstructures for macronutrient release and delivery. *Food and Function*, *6*(3), 663–678.
- 1344 https://doi.org/10.1039/c4fo00965g
- 1345 Nuzzo, M., Sloth, J., Bergenstahl, B., & Millqvist-Fureby, A. (2015). Phase Segregation in Individually Dried
- 1346 Particles Composed of Biopolymers. *Langmuir*, *31*(40), 10946–10954.
- 1347 https://doi.org/10.1021/acs.langmuir.5b02023
- 1348 Nuzzo, M., Sloth Overgaard, J., Bergenståhl, B., & Millqvist-Fureby, A. (2017). The morphology and internal
- 1349 composition of dried particles from whole milk—From single droplet to full scale drying. *Food*
- 1350 Structure, 13, 35–44. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foostr.2017.02.001

- 1351 O'Sullivan, J., Murray, B., Flynn, C., & Norton, I. (2016). The effect of ultrasound treatment on the
- 1352 structural, physical and emulsifying properties of animal and vegetable proteins. *Food Hydrocolloids*,
- 1353 53, 141–154. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodhyd.2015.02.009
- 1354 Oliveros, N. O., Hernández, J. A., Sierra-Espinosa, F. Z., Guardián-Tapia, R., & Pliego-Solórzano, R. (2017).
- 1355 Experimental study of dynamic porosity and its effects on simulation of the coffee beans roasting.
- 1356 *Journal of Food Engineering*, 199, 100–112. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jfoodeng.2016.12.012
- 1357 Oriel, P. J., & Schellman, J. A. (1966). Studies of the birefringence and birefringence dispersion of
- 1358 polypeptides and proteins. *Biopolymers*, 4(4), 469–494. https://doi.org/10.1002/bip.1966.360040408
- 1359 Paluri, S., Shavezipur, M., Heldman, D. R., & Maleky, F. (2015). Analysis of moisture diffusion mechanism in
- 1360 structured lipids using magnetic resonance imaging. *RSC Advances*, *5*(94), 76904–76911.
- 1361 https://doi.org/10.1039/c5ra13882e
- 1362 Palzer, S. (2017). Technological solutions for reducing impact and content of health sensitive nutrients in
- 1363 food. Trends in Food Science and Technology, 62, 170–176. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tifs.2016.11.022
- 1364 Parker, N. G. (2010). A versatile scanning acoustic platform. https://doi.org/10.1088/0957-
- 1365 0233/21/4/045901
- Parvari, G., Rotbaum, Y., Eichen, Y., & Rittel, D. (2018). Impact-induced gelation in aqueous methylcellulose
  solutions. *Chemical Communications*, 54(89), 12578–12581. https://doi.org/10.1039/c8cc06378h
- 1368 Patel, A. R., Dumlu, P., Vermeir, L., Lewille, B., Lesaffer, A., & Dewettinck, K. (2015). Rheological
- 1369 characterization of gel-in-oil-in-gel type structured emulsions. *Food Hydrocolloids*, 46, 84–92.
- 1370 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodhyd.2014.12.029
- 1371 Petit, J., Michaux, F., Jacquot, C., Chávez Montes, E., Dupas, J., Girard, V., Gianfrancesco, A., Scher, J., &
- 1372 Gaiani, C. (2017). Storage-induced caking of cocoa powder. *Journal of Food Engineering*, 199, 42–53.
- 1373 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jfoodeng.2016.12.005
- 1374 Porep, J. U., Kammerer, D. R., & Carle, R. (2015). On-line application of near infrared (NIR) spectroscopy in

- 1375 food production. *Trends in Food Science and Technology*, *46*(2), 211–230.
- 1376 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tifs.2015.10.002
- 1377 Povey, M. J.W., Watson, N., & Parker, N. G. (2013). Ultrasonic and acoustic microscopy: Principles and
- 1378 applications to food microstructures. In *Food Microstructures: Microscopy, Measurement and*
- 1379 *Modelling*. Woodhead Publishing Limited. https://doi.org/10.1533/9780857098894.1.192
- 1380 Povey, Malcolm J.W. (1998). Ultrasonics of food. *Contemporary Physics*, *39*(6), 467–478.
- 1381 https://doi.org/10.1080/001075198181784
- 1382 Povey, Malcolm J.W. (2013). Ultrasound particle sizing: A review. *Particuology*, *11*(2), 135–147.
- 1383 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.partic.2012.05.010
- 1384 Qu, B., & Ikeda, S. (2017). Caseinate-Induced Competitive Displacement of Whey Protein from Interfaces.
- 1385 Food Biophysics, 12(4), 462–469. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11483-017-9502-7
- 1386 Rahimi, J., & Ngadi, M. O. (2016). Structure and irregularities of surface of fried batters studied by fractal
- dimension and lacunarity analysis. *Food Structure*, *9*, 13–21.
- 1388 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foostr.2016.07.002
- 1389 Ramel, P. R., & Marangoni, A. G. (2016). Engineering the microstructure of milk fat by blending binary and
- ternary mixtures of its fractions. *RSC Advances*, *6*(47), 41189–41194.
- 1391 https://doi.org/10.1039/c6ra07114g
- 1392 Ray (née Raman), P., Rielly, C. D., & Stapley, A. G. F. (2017). A freeze-drying microscopy study of the kinetics
- 1393 of sublimation in a model lactose system. *Chemical Engineering Science*, *172*, 731–743.
- 1394 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ces.2017.05.047
- 1395 Ray, J., MacNaughtan, W., Chong, P. S., Vieira, J., & Wolf, B. (2012). The effect of limonene on the
- 1396 crystallization of cocoa butter. JAOCS, Journal of the American Oil Chemists' Society, 89(3), 437–445.
- 1397 https://doi.org/10.1007/s11746-011-1934-5
- 1398 Reci, A., de Kort, D. W., Sederman, A. J., & Gladden, L. F. (2018). Accelerating the estimation of 3D spatially

- resolved T2 distributions. *Journal of Magnetic Resonance, 296*, 93–102.
- 1400 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jmr.2018.08.008
- 1401 Reinke, S. K., Wilde, F., Kozhar, S., Beckmann, F., Vieira, J., Heinrich, S., & Palzer, S. (2016). Synchrotron X-
- 1402 Ray microtomography reveals interior microstructure of multicomponent food materials such as
- 1403 chocolate. Journal of Food Engineering, 174, 37–46. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jfoodeng.2015.11.012
- 1404 Russ, J. C. (2015). Image Analysis of Foods. *Journal of Food Science*, *80*(9), 1974–1987.
- 1405 https://doi.org/10.1111/1750-3841.12987
- 1406 Sadek, C., Pauchard, L., Schuck, P., Fallourd, Y., Pradeau, N., Le Floch-Fouéré, C., & Jeantet, R. (2015).
- 1407 Mechanical properties of milk protein skin layers after drying: Understanding the mechanisms of
- 1408 particle formation from whey protein isolate and native phosphocaseinate. Food Hydrocolloids, 48, 8–
- 1409 16. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodhyd.2015.01.014
- 1410 Sarkar, A., Murray, B., Holmes, M., Ettelaie, R., Abdalla, A., & Yang, X. (2016). In vitro digestion of Pickering
- 1411 emulsions stabilized by soft whey protein microgel particles: Influence of thermal treatment. *Soft*
- 1412 Matter, 12(15), 3558–3569. https://doi.org/10.1039/c5sm02998h
- 1413 Schoeman, L., Williams, P., & Manley, M. (2016). Trends in Food Science & Technology characterisation of

1414 food microstructure. *Trends in Food Science & Technology*, 47, 10–24.

- 1415 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tifs.2015.10.016
- 1416 Scussat, S., Ott, F., Hélary, A., Desert, S., Cayot, P., & Loupiac, C. (2016). Neutron Imaging of Meat during
- 1417 Cooking. *Food Biophysics*, *11*(3), 207–212. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11483-016-9431-x
- 1418 Scussat, S., Vaulot, C., Ott, F., Cayot, P., Delmotte, L., & Loupiac, C. (2017). The impact of cooking on meat
- 1419 microstructure studied by low field NMR and Neutron Tomography. *Food Structure*, 14(June), 36–45.
- 1420 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foostr.2017.06.002
- 1421 Sebben, D. A., Gao, N., Gillies, G., Beattie, D. A., & Krasowska, M. (2018). Fractionation and characterisation
- 1422 of hard milk fat crystals using atomic force microscopy. Food Chemistry, 279(November 2018), 98–

- 1423 104. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodchem.2018.11.136
- 1424 Shahidi, F. (2000). Sahidi 2000. 44(3). https://doi.org/10.1002/anie.201600546
- 1425 Shi, J., Hu, X., Zou, X., Zhao, J., Zhang, W., Holmes, M., Huang, X., Zhu, Y., Li, Z., Shen, T., & Zhang, X. (2017).
- 1426 A rapid and nondestructive method to determine the distribution map of protein, carbohydrate and
- sialic acid on Edible bird's nest by hyper-spectral imaging and chemometrics. *Food Chemistry*, 229,
- 1428 235–241. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodchem.2017.02.075
- 1429 Silva, J. V. C., Legland, D., Cauty, C., Kolotuev, I., & Floury, J. (2015). Characterization of the microstructure
- 1430 of dairy systems using automated image analysis. *Food Hydrocolloids*, 44, 360–371.
- 1431 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodhyd.2014.09.028
- 1432 Sittipod, S., & Shi, Y. C. (2016). Changes in physicochemical properties of rice starch during steeping in the
- parboiling process. Journal of Cereal Science, 69, 398–405. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jcs.2016.05.010
- 1434 Smith, P. R., & Dahlman, A. (2005). The use of atomic force microscopy to measure the formation and
- 1435 development of chocolate bloom in pralines. JAOCS, Journal of the American Oil Chemists' Society,
- 1436 82(3), 165–168. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11746-005-5167-3
- 1437 Stapley, A. G. F., Himawan, C., MacNaughtan, W., & Foster, T. J. (2009). A computational method for
- 1438 extracting crystallization growth and nucleation rate data from hot stage microscope images. *Crystal*

1439 *Growth and Design*, 9(12), 5061–5068. https://doi.org/10.1021/cg9000413

- 1440 Stewart, D. I., Chong, P. S., & Stapley, A. G. F. (2017). Investigation of the Crystallization and Melting of the
- 1441 Tripalmitin/Triolein System via Hot Stage Microscopy, Differential Scanning Calorimetry, and Pulsed
- 1442 NMR. *Crystal Growth and Design*, *17*(6), 3005–3016. https://doi.org/10.1021/acs.cgd.6b01621
- 1443 Stokes, D. J. (2003). Recent advances in electron imaging, image interpretation and applications:
- 1444 environmental scanning electron microscopy. *Philosophical Transation of the Royal Society of London*.
- 1445 Series A: Mathematical, Physical and Engineering Sciences, 361(1813), 2771–2787.
- 1446 https://doi.org/10.1098/rsta.2003.1279

- 1447 Stokes, D. J. (2013). Environmental scanning electron microscopy (ESEM): Principles and applications to
- food microstructures. In *Food Microstructures: Microscopy, Measurement and Modelling*. Woodhead
   Publishing Limited. https://doi.org/10.1533/9780857098894.1.3
- 1450 Strobl, M., Manke, I., Kardjilov, N., Hilger, A., Dawson, M., & Banhart, J. (2009). Advances in neutron
- radiography and tomography. *Journal of Physics D: Applied Physics*, 42(24).
- 1452 https://doi.org/10.1088/0022-3727/42/24/243001
- 1453 Sun, Q., Gan, N., Zhang, S., Zhao, L., Tang, P., Pu, H., Zhai, Y., Gan, R., & Li, H. (2019). Insights into protein
- 1454 recognition for γ-lactone essences and the effect of side chains on interaction via microscopic,
- spectroscopic, and simulative technologies. *Food Chemistry*, 278(August 2018), 127–135.
- 1456 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodchem.2018.11.037
- 1457 Tabibiazar, M., Davaran, S., Hashemi, M., Homayonirad, A., Rasoulzadeh, F., Hamishehkar, H., &
- 1458 Mohammadifar, M. A. (2015). Design and fabrication of a food-grade albumin-stabilized
- nanoemulsion. Food Hydrocolloids, 44, 220–228. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodhyd.2014.09.005
- 1460 Tavernier, I., Patel, A. R., Van der Meeren, P., & Dewettinck, K. (2017). Emulsion-templated liquid oil
- 1461 structuring with soy protein and soy protein: κ-carrageenan complexes. Food Hydrocolloids, 65, 107–
- 1462 120. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodhyd.2016.11.008
- 1463 Thygesen, L. G., Løkke, M. M., Micklander, E., & Engelsen, S. B. (2003). Vibrational microspectroscopy of
- 1464 food. Raman vs. FT-IR. *Trends in Food Science and Technology*, 14(1–2), 50–57.
- 1465 https://doi.org/10.1016/S0924-2244(02)00243-1
- 1466 Torres, O., Murray, B., & Sarkar, A. (2017). Design of novel emulsion microgel particles of tuneable size.
- 1467 *Food Hydrocolloids*, 71, 47–59. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodhyd.2017.04.029
- 1468 Tran-Ba, K. H., Lee, D. J., Zhu, J., Paeng, K., & Kaufman, L. J. (2017). Confocal Rheology Probes the Structure

and Mechanics of Collagen through the Sol-Gel Transition. *Biophysical Journal*.

1470 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.bpj.2017.08.025

- 1471 Tran, P. D., Van de Walle, D., Hinneh, M., Delbaere, C., De Clercq, N., Tran, D. N., & Dewettinck, K. (2015).
- 1472 Controlling the stability of chocolates through the incorporation of soft and hard StOSt-rich fats.
- 1473 European Journal of Lipid Science and Technology, 117(11), 1700–1713.
- 1474 https://doi.org/10.1002/ejlt.201400584
- 1475 Ubbink, J., Burbidge, A., & Mezzenga, R. (2008). Food structure and functionality: a soft matter perspective.
- 1476 Soft Matter, 4(6), 1569–1581. https://doi.org/10.1039/b800106e
- 1477 van Dalen, G., van Velzen, E. J. J., Heussen, P. C. M., Sovago, M., van Malssen, K. F., & van Duynhoven, J. P.
- 1478 M. (2017). Raman hyperspectral imaging and analysis of fat spreads. *Journal of Raman Spectroscopy*,
- 1479 *48*(8), 1075–1084. https://doi.org/10.1002/jrs.5171
- 1480 Wan Mohamad, W. A. F., Buckow, R., Augustin, M. A., & McNaughton, D. (2017). In situ quantification of β-
- 1481 carotene partitioning in oil-in-water emulsions by confocal Raman microscopy. *Food Chemistry*, 233,
- 1482 197–203. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodchem.2017.04.086
- 1483 Wang, H., & Maleky, F. (2018). Effects of cocoa butter triacylglycerides and minor compounds on oil
- 1484 migration. *Food Research International, 106*(December 2017), 213–224.
- 1485 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodres.2017.12.057
- 1486 Wang, L. V. (2017). Photoacoustic Tomography: Omniscale Imaging from Organelles to Patient. March,
- 1487 T5A.1. https://doi.org/10.1364/pibm.2017.t5a.1
- 1488 Wang, W., Du, G., Li, C., Zhang, H., Long, Y., & Ni, Y. (2016). Preparation of cellulose nanocrystals from
- asparagus (Asparagus officinalis L.) and their applications to palm oil/water Pickering emulsion.
- 1490 *Carbohydrate Polymers*, 151, 1–8. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.carbpol.2016.05.052
- 1491 Wang, Z., Herremans, E., Janssen, S., Cantre, D., Verboven, P., & Nicolaï, B. (2018). Visualizing 3D Food
- 1492 Microstructure Using Tomographic Methods: Advantages and Disadvantages. Annual Review of Food
- 1493 *Science and Technology*, *9*(1), 323–343. https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev-food-030117-012639
- 1494 Watson, N., Hazlehurst, T., Povey, M., Vieira, J., Sundara, R., & Sandoz, J. P. (2014). Can airborne ultrasound

- 1495 monitor bubble size in chocolate? *Journal of Physics: Conference Series, 498*(1).
- 1496 https://doi.org/10.1088/1742-6596/498/1/012001
- Watson, N. J. (2015). Ultrasound tomography. In *Industrial Tomography: Systems and Applications*. Elsevier
  Ltd. https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-1-78242-118-4.00009-5
- 1499 Watson, N., Povey, M., Corona, E., Benedito, J., & Parker, N. (2012). Acoustic microscopy in the food
- 1500 industry. *IOP Conference Series: Materials Science and Engineering*, 42(1).
- 1501 https://doi.org/10.1088/1757-899X/42/1/012006
- 1502 Wellner, N. (2013). Fourier transform infrared (FTIR) and Raman microscopy: Principles and applications to
- 1503 food microstructures. In Food Microstructures: Microscopy, Measurement and Modelling. Woodhead
- 1504 Publishing Limited. https://doi.org/10.1533/9780857098894.1.163
- 1505 Willig, K. I., Keller, J., Bossi, M., & Hell, S. W. (2006). STED microscopy resolves nanoparticle assemblies.
- 1506 New Journal of Physics, 8. https://doi.org/10.1088/1367-2630/8/6/106
- 1507 Willner, M., Viermetz, M., Marschner, M., Scherer, K., Braun, C., Fingerle, A., Noël, P., Rummeny, E.,
- 1508 Pfeiffer, F., & Herzen, J. (2016). Quantitative three-dimensional imaging of lipid, protein, and water
- 1509 contents via x-ray phase-contrast tomography. *PLoS ONE*, *11*(3), 1–13.
- 1510 https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0151889
- 1511 Wood, A. B. (1941). A textbook of Sound, 578 pp. In Bell, London.
- 1512 Wright, A. J., Narine, S. S., & Marangoni, A. G. (2000). Comparison of experimental techniques used in lipid
- 1513 crystallization studies. *JAOCS, Journal of the American Oil Chemists' Society*, 77(12), 1239–1242.
- 1514 https://doi.org/10.1007/s11746-000-0194-2
- 1515 Wu, J., Shi, M., Li, W., Zhao, L., Wang, Z., Yan, X., Norde, W., & Li, Y. (2015). Pickering emulsions stabilized
- 1516 by whey protein nanoparticles prepared by thermal cross-linking. *Colloids and Surfaces B:*
- 1517 *Biointerfaces*, *127*, 96–104. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.colsurfb.2015.01.029
- 1518 Wu, L., Wang, L., Qi, B., Zhang, X., Chen, F., Li, Y., Sui, X., & Jiang, L. (2018). 3D confocal Raman imaging of

1519 oil-rich emulsion from enzyme-assisted aqueous extraction of extruded soybean powder. *Food* 

1520 *Chemistry*, 249(August 2017), 16–21. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodchem.2017.12.077

1521 Xiao, J., Lu, X., & Huang, Q. (2017). Double emulsion derived from kafirin nanoparticles stabilized Pickering

- 1522 emulsion: Fabrication, microstructure, stability and in vitro digestion profile. Food Hydrocolloids, 62,
- 1523 S29–S38. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodhyd.2016.08.014
- 1524 Yang, H., Wang, Y., Lai, S., An, H., Li, Y., & Chen, F. (2007). Application of atomic force microscopy as a
- 1525 nanotechnology tool in food science. *Journal of Food Science*, 72(4), 65–75.
- 1526 https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1750-3841.2007.00346.x
- 1527 Yao, X., Nie, K., Chen, Y., Jiang, F., Kuang, Y., Yan, H., Fang, Y., Yang, H., Nishinari, K., & Phillips, G. O. (2018).
- 1528 The influence of non-ionic surfactant on lipid digestion of gum Arabic stabilized oil-in-water emulsion.

1529 Food Hydrocolloids, 74, 78–86. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodhyd.2017.07.043

- 1530 Zembyla, M., Murray, B. S., & Sarkar, A. (2018). Water-In-Oil Pickering Emulsions Stabilized by Water-
- 1531 Insoluble Polyphenol Crystals [Research-article]. *Langmuir*, *34*(34), 10001–10011.
- 1532 https://doi.org/10.1021/acs.langmuir.8b01438
- 1533 Zhang, H., Nie, S., Guo, Q., Wang, Q., Cui, S. W., & Xie, M. (2018). Conformational properties of a bioactive
- 1534 polysaccharide from Ganoderma atrum by light scattering and molecular modeling. *Food*

1535 *Hydrocolloids*, *84*(April), 16–25. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodhyd.2018.05.023

- 1536 Zhang, Xin, de Juan, A., & Tauler, R. (2015). Multivariate Curve Resolution Applied to Hyperspectral Imaging
- 1537 Analysis of Chocolate Samples. *Applied Spectroscopy*, 69(8), 993–1003. https://doi.org/10.1366/14-
- 1538 07819
- 1539 Zhang, Xing, Wang, Y. S., & Chen, H. H. (2019). Effect of annealing temperature on morphology and
- 1540 physicochemical properties of cornstarch complexed with oleic acid and molecular dynamics
- 1541 simulation. *Cereal Chemistry*, *96*(4), 668–677. https://doi.org/10.1002/cche.10163
- 1542 Zhou, M., Wang, T., Hu, Q., & Luo, Y. (2016). Low density lipoprotein/pectin complex nanogels as potential

- 1543 oral delivery vehicles for curcumin. *Food Hydrocolloids*, *57*, 20–29.
- 1544 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodhyd.2016.01.010
- 1545 Zhu, F. (2017). Atomic force microscopy of starch systems. *Critical Reviews in Food Science and Nutrition*,

1546 57(14), 3127–3144. https://doi.org/10.1080/10408398.2015.1094650

- 1547 Zhu, Q., Zhao, L., Zhang, H., Saito, M., & Yin, L. (2017). Impact of the release rate of magnesium ions in
- 1548 multiple emulsions (water-in-oil-in-water) containing BSA on the resulting physical properties and
- 1549 microstructure of soy protein gel. *Food Chemistry*, 220, 452–459.
- 1550 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodchem.2016.10.016
- 1551 Zhuang, X., Han, M., Jiang, X., Bai, Y., Zhou, H., Li, C., Xu, X. lian, & Zhou, G. hong. (2019). The effects of
- insoluble dietary fiber on myofibrillar protein gelation: Microstructure and molecular conformations.
- 1553 *Food Chemistry*, 275(March 2018), 770–777. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foodchem.2018.09.141
- 1554 Zoheidi, L., Panradl, C., Rauh, C., & Delgado, A. (2017). Experimental investigation of the protein foam flow
- 1555 structure in horizontal channels: Flow regime and corresponding bubble size distribution. *Journal of*
- 1556 *Food Process Engineering*, 40(6), 1–6. https://doi.org/10.1111/jfpe.12563
- 1557 Zou, Y., Guo, J., Yin, S., Wang, J., & Yang, X. (2015). Pickering Emulsion Gels Prepared by Hydrogen-Bonded
- 1558 Zein/Tannic Acid Complex Colloidal Particles. https://doi.org/10.1021/acs.jafc.5b03113