# UNIVERSITY OF LEEDS

This is a repository copy of Complex kame belt morphology, stratigraphy and architecture.

White Rose Research Online URL for this paper: http://eprints.whiterose.ac.uk/154283/

Version: Accepted Version

# Article:

Lovell, H, Livingstone, SJ, Boston, CM et al. (3 more authors) (2019) Complex kame belt morphology, stratigraphy and architecture. Earth Surface Processes and Landforms, 44 (13). pp. 2685-2702. ISSN 0197-9337

https://doi.org/10.1002/esp.4696

© 2019 John Wiley & Sons, Ltd. This is the peer reviewed version of the following article: Lovell, H., Livingstone, S. J., Boston, C. M., Booth, A. D., Storrar, R. D., and Barr, I. D. (2019) Complex kame belt morphology, stratigraphy and architecture. Earth Surf. Process. Landforms, 44: 2685–2702. https://doi.org/10.1002/esp.4696, which has been published in final form at https://doi.org/10.1002/esp.4696. This article may be used for non-commercial purposes in accordance with Wiley Terms and Conditions for Self-Archiving. Uploaded in accordance with the publisher's self-archiving policy.

#### Reuse

Items deposited in White Rose Research Online are protected by copyright, with all rights reserved unless indicated otherwise. They may be downloaded and/or printed for private study, or other acts as permitted by national copyright laws. The publisher or other rights holders may allow further reproduction and re-use of the full text version. This is indicated by the licence information on the White Rose Research Online record for the item.

#### Takedown

If you consider content in White Rose Research Online to be in breach of UK law, please notify us by emailing eprints@whiterose.ac.uk including the URL of the record and the reason for the withdrawal request.



1	Complex kame belt morphology, stratigraphy and architecture
2 3	Harold Lovell <sup>1*</sup> , Stephen J. Livingstone <sup>2</sup> , Clare M. Boston <sup>1</sup> , Adam Booth <sup>3</sup> , Robert D Storrar <sup>4</sup> and lestyn D. Barr <sup>5</sup>
4	<sup>1</sup> Department of Geography, University of Portsmouth, Portsmouth, PO1 3HE;
5	<sup>2</sup> Department of Geography, University of Sheffield, Sheffield, S10 2TN;
6	<sup>3</sup> School of Earth and Environment, University of Leeds, Leeds, LS2 9JT
7 8	<sup>4</sup> Department of the Natural and Built Environment, Sheffield Hallam University, Sheffield, S1 1WB
9 10	<sup>5</sup> School of Science and the Environment, Manchester Metropolitan University, Manchester, M15 6BH
11	*Correspondence: harold.lovell@port.ac.uk

12

# 13 Abstract

The development of glacier karst at the margins of melting ice sheets produces 14 complex glaciofluvial sediment-landform assemblages that provide information on ice 15 sheet downwasting processes. We present the first combined geomorphological, 16 sedimentological and geophysical investigation of the Brampton Kame Belt, an 17 important glaciofluvial depositional zone at the centre of the last British-Irish Ice Sheet. 18 Ground-penetrating radar (GPR) data allow the broad scale internal architecture of 19 ridges (eskers) and flat-topped hills (ice-walled lake plains) to be determined at four 20 sites. In combination with sediment exposures, these provide information on lateral 21 and vertical variations in accretion styles, depositional boundaries, and grain size 22 23 changes. Building on existing work on the subject, we propose a refined model for the formation of ice-walled lake plains resulting from the evolution and collapse of major 24 drainage axes into lakes as stable glacier karst develops during deglaciation. The 25 internal structure of esker ridges demonstrates variations in sedimentation that can be 26 linked to differences in ridge morphologies across the kame belt. This includes low 27 energy flow conditions and multiple accretion phases identified within large S-N 28

oriented esker ridges; and fluctuating water pressures, hyperconcentrated flows, and 29 significant deformation within a fragmented SW-NE oriented esker ridge. In 30 combination with updated geomorphological mapping, this work allows us to identify 31 two main styles of drainage within the kame belt: (1) major drainage axes aligned 32 broadly S-N that extend through the entire kame belt and collapsed into a chain of ice-33 walled lakes; and (2) a series of smaller, fragmented SW-NE aligned esker ridges that 34 35 represent ice-marginal drainage as the ice sheet receded south-eastwards up the Vale of Eden. Our study demonstrates the importance of integrated geomorphological, 36 37 sedimentological and geophysical investigations in order to understand complex and polyphase glaciofluvial sediment-landform assemblages. 38

39

Key words: Kame, glaciofluvial, geomorphology, sedimentology, ground-penetrating
radar (GPR), British-Irish Ice Sheet

42

#### 43 Introduction

Ice sheet downwasting and recession leads to the deposition of large zones of ice-44 contact glaciofluvial and glaciolacustrine sediment-landform assemblages. These 45 assemblages are often given the general term 'kames' or 'kame belts' and are formed 46 where sediment and meltwater accumulates in interlobate locations and/or areas 47 constrained by local or regional topography (Curtis and Woodworth, 1899; Flint, 48 49 1928a,b, 1929; Cook, 1946; Holmes, 1947; Winters, 1961; Rieck, 1979; Warren and Ashley, 1994; Thomas and Montague, 1997; Mäkinen, 2003; Livingstone et al., 2010a; 50 Evans et al., 2017). Kame belts are characterised by large volumes of sands and 51 gravels and a complex geomorphology of ridges, mounds, flat-topped hills, 52

depressions, and meltwater channels (Woodworth, 1894; Cook, 1946; Holmes, 1947; 53 Winters, 1961; Huddart, 1981; Malmberg Persson, 1991; Auton, 1992; Attig and 54 Clayton, 1993; Thomas and Montague, 1997; Johnson and Clayton, 2003; Livingstone 55 et al., 2010a; Schaetzl et al., 2013; Attig and Rawling III, 2018). The complex 56 sediment-landform assemblage originates from the development of a glacier karst 57 system formed by extensive supra-, en- and subglacial channel networks and 58 supraglacial ponding, fed by increased meltwater production during ice sheet 59 recession (Clayton, 1964; Price, 1969; Huddart, 1981; Brodzikowski and van Loon, 60 61 1991; Bennett and Evans, 2012). Understanding the genesis of the various elements that comprise complex kame topography is crucial to reconstructing ice-marginal and 62 interlobate environments, and deciphering the pattern, style and pace of deglaciation 63 and ice sheet wastage (Warren and Ashley, 1994; Thomas and Montague, 1997; 64 Livingstone et al., 2010a). 65

The Brampton Kame Belt is located in the central sector of the last (Late 66 Devensian) British-Irish Ice Sheet (Fig. 1). At ~44 km<sup>2</sup>, it is one of the largest areas of 67 glaciofluvial sediment deposition in the UK (Livingstone et al., 2008). The kame belt 68 formed between the Penrith sandstone outcrop and north Pennine escarpment during 69 deglaciation as the Tyne Gap Ice Stream receded westwards across the Solway 70 71 Lowlands and Vale of Eden ice receded south-eastwards (Trotter, 1929; Huddart, 72 1981; Livingstone et al., 2010a,b, 2015). A minimum age of 15.7 ± 0.1 cal. ka BP for deglaciation of the kame belt was presented by Livingstone et al. (2015), based on 73 radiocarbon dating of organic sediment in a core taken from the Talkin Tarn kettle lake 74 75 (Fig. 2A). The kame belt comprises a series of ridges, mounds, flat-topped hills, and depressions (Trotter, 1929; Huddart, 1981; Livingstone et al., 2010a), and is the 76 downstream extension of a series of subglacial and lateral meltwater channels 77

extending SE-NW along the lower slopes of the Pennine escarpment (Trotter, 1929; 78 Arthurton and Wadge, 1981; Greenwood et al., 2007; Livingstone et al., 2008). Aided 79 by insights into the sedimentary composition provided by borehole records and 80 sections in sand and gravel quarries, Huddart (1981) and Livingstone et al. (2010a) 81 interpreted the ridges as eskers originating from sub-, en- and supraglacial meltwater 82 channels; the flat-topped hills as ice-walled lake plains; and the depressions as kettles. 83 Formation during deglaciation was time-transgressive, with polyphase and polygenetic 84 landform and sediment deposition controlled by the evolution of an enlarging glacier 85 86 karst, and by extensive reworking and fragmentation during topographic inversion (Livingstone et al., 2010a). 87

The widespread availability of high-resolution digital elevation models (DEMs) 88 has enabled the complex topography of some kame deposits to be mapped in detail 89 (e.g. Livingstone et al., 2010a; Schaetzl et al., 2017). However, establishing process-90 form relationships for the range of different landforms based on their internal 91 sediments is more challenging, given the sparse distribution and single point nature of 92 sedimentological data. A number of studies have instead conducted geophysical 93 investigations using ground-penetrating radar (GPR) to provide information on 94 subsurface sedimentary architecture in glacial environments (Woodward and Burke, 95 96 2007), often where suitable sediment exposures are limited or absent (e.g. Busby and Merritt, 1999; Cassidy et al., 2003; Sadura et al., 2006; Lukas and Sass, 2011; Pellicer 97 and Gibson, 2011; Spagnolo et al., 2014). 98

In this study, we use GPR and sedimentological data to investigate the sedimentary architecture of the Brampton Kame Belt. The information on internal structure is combined with updated mapping from a high-resolution DEM to provide a

new appraisal of the kame belt and refine existing models for the formation of complexglaciofluvial assemblages.

104

105

## [FIGURE 1 HERE]

Figure 1 – Location map of the Brampton Kame Belt. Underlying image is shaded relief NEXTMap data. (A) Kame belt location relative to the topography of the area and major towns and roads. Inset shows location of the study area in the central sector of the British-Irish Ice Sheet. Last Glacial Maximum (LGM) limit is 'Scenario One – 27ka' in Clark et al. (2012). (B) The kame belt in the context of the regional glacial geomorphology. Mapping is from the BRITICE Glacial Map version 2 (Clark et al., 2018).

113

114 Methods

#### 115 Geomorphological mapping

Mapping was conducted within a GIS on hillshaded DEMs following the suggestions 116 of best practice outlined in Chandler et al. (2018). Two mosaiced DEMs were used: a 117 1 m resolution digital surface model (DSM) provided by the Environment Agency from 118 airborne LiDAR data (available via environment.data.gov.uk/ds/survey), and a 5 m 119 resolution NEXTMap DSM provided by the British Geological Survey for NERC from 120 121 airborne Interferometric Synthetic Aperture data (available via ceda.ac.uk). The 1 m DSM was used for the majority of the mapping, with the 5 m DSM providing coverage 122 for a small strip missing from the 1 m DSM. Similar to Livingstone et al. (2010a), 123 mapping focused on the identification of key landforms based on morphological 124

characteristics: ridges and mounds (mapped as polygons) with ridge crest lines
(mapped as lines); flat-topped hills (polygons); depressions (polygons); and channels
(lines).

128

#### 129 Sedimentology

Sedimentological investigations, where possible, were used in conjunction with the 130 GPR data to inform the interpretation of radar profiles. Two pre-existing sediment 131 exposures within small quarries at the Morley Farm and Brampton Farm sites (Fig. 2B) 132 were logged in the field as scaled section sketches. Grain size, sedimentary structure, 133 bedding contacts, and evidence for deformation were recorded at each site. 134 135 Sedimentary units were identified using the lithofacies codes of Evans and Benn (2004). Structural measurements (strike/dip) were taken to characterise the trend of 136 bedding and faults. Additional sedimentological data presented by Livingstone et al. 137 (2010a), based on sediment exposures in quarries and a number of borehole logs, 138 provided further insight into the wider sedimentary composition and stratigraphy of the 139 140 kame belt.

141

# 142 GPR data acquisition and processing

GPR survey lines were collected using a Mala 100 MHz unshielded Rough Terrain Antenna (RTA). Survey lines were collected at an even walking pace, with traces collected every 0.25 s and stacked automatically using the autostacks setting. The topography and length of survey lines were recorded simultaneously using a TopCon differential GPS. An effort was made to avoid objects (e.g. trees, fences, walls) that could introduce noise to the surveys, although this was often unavoidable towards the

start and end of lines due to the constraints of working in fields. GPR data processing 149 was conducted in Sandmeier ReflexW software, with trace interpolations and 150 topographic corrections performed in Mathworks MATLAB software. All profiles 151 followed the same generic processing sequence. Prior to interpolation, spurious 152 frequency content in the profiles was removed using dewow and bandpass filters, with 153 frequencies outside of the bandwidth 40-120 MHz suppressed. Trace first-breaks were 154 then corrected to 6.7 ns, the travel-time of the direct airwave across the 2 m 155 transmitter-receiver offset in the 100 MHz RTA, before profiles were exported to 156 157 MATLAB. Since trace acquisition in the profiles was triggered at a fixed time interval, the distance interval between traces depends on the tow speed and can vary along 158 and between profiles. It must therefore be regularised before any spatial processing 159 step (e.g. migration) can be applied. In raw data, excluding static traces, the mean 160 trace interval is 0.29 ± 0.05 m. A 2D linear interpolation algorithm was applied to 161 regularise the trace interval to 0.25 m, with the time sampling interval also interpolated 162 from the raw value of 0.9674 ns to a more convenient 1 ns. Regularised data were 163 reimported to ReflexW for Kirchhoff migration, which assumed a velocity of 0.12 m/ns 164 (measured from sparse diffraction hyperbolae in the record, given the inability to 165 perform common midpoint surveys with the RTA) and an aperture of 12 m. Horizontal 166 striping was suppressed using a 2D subtracting-average filter, spanning a 4 m trace 167 range, and amplitudes were boosted using a 75 ns automatic gain control window. 168 Depth conversion and topographic corrections were applied to the migrated data in 169 MATLAB, again assuming a velocity of 0.12 m/ns, with the reference datum being the 170 highest elevation point in the profile (or in the group of intersecting profiles). Finally, 171 fully-processed profiles were imported into Schlumberger Petrel software for 172 visualisation. 173

174

#### 175 **Results and interpretation**

#### 176 Geomorphology

We mapped over 400 ridges and mounds across the Brampton Kame Belt (Fig. 2), 177 substantially adding to the original mapping of Livingstone et al. (2010a). Ridges 178 display a wide range of morphologies, dimensions and orientations. A number of 179 rounded mounds with no discernible crest lines or orientation are also mapped. The 180 181 largest ridge is the Brampton ridge in the north of the kame belt (BR in Fig. 2B), which is straight, single-crested, ~3 km long, ~300 m wide and reaches a height of ~50 m 182 above the surrounding terrain. Several other ridges are up to ~2 km in length, but the 183 184 majority are shorter (mean ridge crest length = 227 m, n = 439) and <20 m high. Ridge morphology ranges from straight to sinuous. Ridges are generally single-crested, but 185 there are some notable multi-branched morphologies (e.g. the large ridge at Carlatton 186 Farm), and others with multiple crests caused by channel dissection transverse to the 187 main ridge alignment (Fig. 2). Ridge orientation varies across the kame belt. In the 188 189 south, ridges are generally aligned SE-NW and SW-NE, transitioning to S-N in the central part of the kame belt. Towards the north, the ridges return to a SW-NE 190 alignment leading to W-E where the kame belt trends towards the Tyne Gap (Fig. 2B). 191 192 Ridges are interpreted as eskers originating from sub-, en- and supraglacial channels (e.g. Woodworth, 1894; Flint, 1928b, 1930; Mannerfelt, 1945; Lewis, 1949; Brennand, 193 1994; Warren and Ashley, 1994; Livingstone et al., 2010a). 194

Flat-topped hills are raised features reaching a height of ~20 m above the surrounding terrain, with clearly identifiable flat upper surfaces. The largest flat-topped hills are ~1 km wide and are generally grouped together in a ~2 km wide, 7 km long

zone in the central part of the kame belt (Fig. 2B). Esker ridges are closely associated 198 with flat-topped hills in a number of places. In some instances, ridges transition into 199 flat-topped hills and appear to be partially buried by them (e.g. immediately south of 200 North Scales); elsewhere ridges are superimposed on the surface of flat-topped hills. 201 Flat-topped hills are interpreted as ice-walled lake plains (e.g. Cook, 1946; Winters, 202 1961; Clayton, 1967; Clayton and Cherry, 1967; Huddart, 1981; Clayton et al., 2001, 203 204 2008; Johnson and Clayton, 2003; Livingstone et al., 2010a; Curry and Petras, 2011; Stanley and Schaetzl, 2011). 205

Depressions are distributed throughout the kame belt (Fig. 2B), ranging in size 206 from Talkin Tarn (~500 m wide, ~700 m long) to small (<20 m wide), circular 207 depressions. The densest cluster of depressions is in the southern and central part of 208 the kame belt, giving a pockmarked appearance to the terrain (Livingstone et al., 209 2010a). Depressions are often located between closely-spaced esker ridges and, in 210 places, cut into them (Fig. 2B). The majority (72%) of the depressions are dry, with 211 only 12 containing water at the time they were mapped. The depressions are 212 interpreted as kettles (e.g. Trotter, 1929; Maizels, 1977; Livingstone et al., 2010a). 213 Whether a kettle is currently dry or is water-filled is likely controlled by its position 214 relative to the water table and the connectivity to the groundwater system (e.g. Cook, 215 1946; Gerke et al., 2010; Levy et al., 2015; Lischeid et al., 2017; Kayler et al., 2018). 216

The kame belt contains several channels, ranging from continuous channels that form part of an extended regional meltwater system, to shorter channel fragments (Fig. 2B). A parallel series of SE-NW aligned channels that enter the kame belt at its south-eastern edge form part of a major meltwater system that extends for ~50 km along the western flank of the Pennine escarpment (Trotter, 1929; Arthurton and Wadge, 1981; Greenwood et al., 2007; Livingstone et al., 2008, 2010a). Meltwater channels within the kame belt are typically shorter than those outside its limits, and are often routed around the edges of, or between, closely-spaced landforms. In several places, meltwater channels dissect landforms (e.g. a large esker ridge immediately west of Talkin Tarn, and an ice-walled lake plain ~2 km to the south-west of this ridge) (Fig. 2B). The drainage direction of meltwater channels within the kame belt is variable.

229

## [FIGURE 2 HERE]

Figure 2 – (A) NEXTMap mosaic showing the topography of the Brampton Kame
Belt (dashed red line delimits kame belt boundary). (B) Geomorphological map
of the Brampton Kame Belt (dashed black line delimits kame belt boundary).
Sites of GPR lines and sediment sections presented in the paper: MF = Morley
Farm, BF = Brampton Farm, CF = Carlatton Farm, NS = North Scales. Additional
locations of relevance: BR = Brampton ridge, TT = Talkin Tarn.

236

## 237 Sedimentology and GPR lines

We investigated two sediment exposures and collected seven GPR survey lines 238 totalling ~2 km from esker ridges and ice-walled lake plains at four sites located in the 239 south of the kame belt (Figs. 2B and 3). Intersecting lines were collected across 240 landforms (e.g. parallel and perpendicular to ridge crest lines) at two sites in order to 241 provide an insight into their 3D architecture (Fig. 3). Seven common radar facies (RF1-242 RF7) were identified from the profiles (Fig. 4). Where possible, these have been 243 interpreted based on the two sites where GPR lines were acquired immediately above 244 logged sediment sections to provide a tie between sediment and radar facies. These 245 interpretations have then been used to guide the analysis of sites with only GPR data. 246

247	[FIGURE 3 HERE]
248	Figure 3 – Location and geomorphological context of GPR lines (in yellow)
249	presented in this study. Underlying images are 1 m resolution DSMs. Mapped
250	landforms are esker ridges (in red), ice-walled lake plains (in purple), kettles (in
251	light blue), and meltwater channels (blue lines). (A) Morley Farm (MF), Carlatton
252	Farm (CF) and North Scales (NS) sites. (B) Brampton Farm (BF) site.
253	
254	[FIGURE 4 HERE]
255	Figure 4 – Radar facies classification used to describe and interpret the GPR
256	profiles.
257	
258	Morley Farm
259	The Morley Farm section (Fig. 5) is located in the south-west of the kame belt within
260	a small quarry excavated into the south-west end of a S-N oriented esker ridge. The
261	ridge forms part of a discontinuous series of four ridges interspersed with small
262	depressions (Figs. 2, 3A and 5C). The ~8 m high ridge that the section is excavated
263	into is relatively straight, ~500 m long, and ~150 m wide at its widest, narrowing
264	significantly at its northern end to <30 m. The section is ~12 m long and comprises up
265	to 6 m of gently dipping to horizontal beds of sand (Sh, Sm, Sp) and some fine gravel
266	(GRm). This includes sequences of horizontally laminated and massive fine to coarse
267	sand, with occasional cross-stratification, fining upwards and outsized gravel clasts.
268	Beds are <0.5 m thick and form gently inclined troughs and crests, widening slightly
269	towards the trough bottom and thinning towards the crest. In general, the bedding
270	surfaces appear laterally continuous. Towards the centre of the exposure, bedding
271	within an onlapping trough truncates the underlying bed. The entire section is

overprinted by a series of cross-cutting sand-filled veins that bifurcate in a downwards direction. Differential weathering indicates that the veins are composed of finer sediments compared to the surrounding beds. At the macro-scale, these in-filled veins do not appear to displace the surrounding bedding. Some of the veins can be traced all the way through the section, but the majority are more discontinuous. The crosscutting veins are most common in the lower beds, and the veins become more parallel in the upper part of the section.

279

# [FIGURE 5 HERE]

Figure 5 – Morley Farm site. (A) Section photo. (B) Sediment log. (C) DSM showing mapped esker ridges (in red) and kettles (in light blue) with location of section (yellow line) and GPR line 188 (green arrow). (D) GPR line 188 and annotated interpretation of GPR data. See text and Fig. 4 for reference to numbered radar facies (RF). Approximate location of section in (A) and (B) is indicated by the yellow line in the top panel. See Figs. 2B and 3A for location of site.

287

The fine- to coarse-grained sandy lithofacies at Morley Farm indicate deposition 288 in a low energy fluvial environment characterised by variations in flow velocity. The 289 dominance of horizontally laminated sand records planar bed flow in lower and/or 290 upper flow regimes (Miall, 1977, 1985; Allen, 1984), with rarer periods of dune 291 migration recorded by tabular cross-beds. Massive fine-coarse sand beds record 292 suspension settling or high sediment concentration density underflows (e.g. Rust and 293 Romanelli, 1975; Paterson and Cheel, 1997). Granule gravel beds indicate higher 294 energy flows, while truncation of the larger-scale onlapping troughs may be associated 295 with channel migration over time (Gorrell and Shaw, 1991). The cross-cutting veins 296

are interpreted as a conjugate set of sand-filled fractures (Lee et al., 2015). The 297 pervasiveness of the fractures throughout the section, and their cross-cutting 298 relationship with the horizontal to cross-laminated sand beds, indicates that formation 299 of these fractures post-date deposition of the sand beds. Such fracture sets can be 300 formed by hydrofracturing, or by vertical compression, perhaps due to either loading 301 of ice or simply the overlying weight of a thick sediment sequence. In the case of 302 303 vertical compression, the extensional fractures create a void space that can then be exploited by water escape in the form of liquefaction and injection of sediments to 304 305 produce the sand-filled fractures (Lee et al., 2015).

GPR line 188 (Fig. 5D) was collected from above the Morley Farm section (with 306 ~2-5 m offset) and extends for 150 m across the full width of the ridge (Fig. 5C). The 307 first ~10-12 m of the line, which coincides with the sediment section, contains strong 308 sub-horizontal reflectors (RF1 in Fig. 5D), and similar reflectors are found in several 309 places across the profile, including beneath the ridge crest at ~50 m and on the south-310 eastern flank (Fig. 5D). We interpret these as bedded sands, based on the similar sub-311 horizontal layering of the reflectors and the sands exposed in the section. A series of 312 trough-shaped reflectors can also be identified across the profile (e.g. RF6 in Fig. 5D). 313 These are of a similar scale (~5-10 m across) to the shallow trough seen in the 314 315 sediment section (Fig. 5B), suggesting a common origin relating to continued sedimentation within a migrating channel system. We note that these features are also 316 similar to channel fills identified in GPR profiles by other studies (e.g. Russell et al., 317 2001; Winsemann et al., 2018). Sub-horizontal reflectors towards the top of the ridge 318 crest have a more discontinuous, in places disorganised, arrangement (e.g. RF2 in 319 Fig. 5D). This implies that the top of the esker ridge is composed of sediment of a 320 different texture, such as gravel layers (see also similar packages associated with 321

gravels at Brampton Farm, below and Fig. 6). It is also possible that the disorganised
reflectors are evidence for deformed sediment packages (e.g. Fiore et al., 2002).

324

325 Brampton Farm

The Brampton Farm section (Fig. 6A) is located within a small guarry excavated into 326 the southern flank of a ~10 m high double-branched esker ridge in the south-east of 327 the kame belt (Figs. 2 and 3A). The western end of the section is located at the point 328 329 where the ridge bifurcates, with the section aligned sub-parallel to the W-E oriented crest line of the southern branch and extending for ~70 m along its total length of ~150 330 m (Fig. 6B). The northern branch of the ridge is aligned SW-NE for the first ~100 m 331 332 after the bifurcation, before curving to the east to become parallel to the southern branch. To the north of the branched ridge there are four parallel S-N aligned esker 333 ridges (Fig. 3B), which mark the start of a discontinuous series of similarly oriented 334 ridges that can be traced for ~4 km into the central part of the kame belt (Fig. 2B). The 335 sediment section (Fig. 6A) comprises a thick (up to 10 m), heavily deformed sequence 336 337 of interbedded rippled (type-A and -B) and sub-horizontally laminated sands (Sr, Sh), and massive to crudely-bedded clast and matrix-supported gravels (Gm, Gms, Gh). 338 The sands contain frequent interbeds of granule gravel to pebbles (often one clast 339 thick). The western end of the exposure has the greatest thickness of sands (>8 m), 340 with the succession comprising steeply dipping (34°) bedded sands trending towa rds 341 the south, unconformably overlain by gently dipping sands trending eastwards. The 342 343 top of the section is incised by a ~5 m wide channel fill of trough-stratified sands and gravel. Tabular sheets, up to several metres thick, of crudely stratified to massive 344 matrix- and clast-supported gravels ranging in size from cobbles to granule gravel and 345

with sharp or erosional lower contacts become more prevalent towards the central and 346 eastern ends of the section. There are occasional imbricated clast clusters, while 347 stratification is imparted by the crude alignment of clasts and variations in matrix 348 concentration and clast size. The gravels contain frequent deformed soft-sediment 349 rafts (Sd) of massive and bedded sand. Clast forms are predominantly rounded to sub-350 rounded and comprise a mix of lithologies, including Borrowdale Volcanic lavas and 351 352 Permo-Triassic sandstone. Deformation is pervasive, with the most extensive evidence along the western side (Fig. 6A-C). This includes widespread normal faulting 353 354 with dips towards the north-east and south, convolute bedding, open fold structures and clastic dykes. The largest clastic dyke is up to 1 m wide, cuts through the upper 355 gravel bed at the eastern end of the exposure and comprises vertically-aligned 356 laminated fine sand/silt (Fig. 6F). The dyke has deformed edges, tapers slightly 357 downwards and has a sub-horizontal offshoot extending diagonally upwards off the 358 main body. 359

Alternating gravels and sands at Brampton Farm sediment section record a 360 dynamic fluvial environment, characterised by significant fluctuations in flow velocity 361 and sediment supply (e.g. Banerjee and MacDonald, 1975; Ringrose, 1982; Brennand, 362 1994). Low energy conditions are recorded by ripples deposited in the lower flow 363 364 regime (Jopling and Walker, 1968) and laminated sands that demonstrate planar bed flow in lower and/or upper flow regime conditions (Flint, 1930; Miall, 1977, 1985; Allen, 365 1984). The general trend of palaeocurrent directions revealed by the ripples suggest 366 that water flow was northwards. The gravels are interpreted to have been deposited 367 by powerful fluidal flows, with traction transport dominating where gravels are 368 imbricated, crudely stratified, and clast supported (Brennand, 1994). The crude 369 stratification, reflecting subtle sorting, is likely imparted by pulses in flow strength 370

(Mäkinen, 2003). Isolated patches of openwork gravels likely represent winnowing of 371 finer-grained material (Lundqvist, 1979; Shulmeister, 1989), whereas matrix-372 supported massive gravels indicate hyperconcentrated flood flow deposits 373 (Saunderson, 1977; Shulmeister, 1989). Further evidence for high energy flows is 374 provided by the soft-sediment rafts, ripped up from underlying beds or derived from 375 bank collapses. The entire section has been heavily deformed, with the prevalence of 376 normal faulting indicative of gravitational failure, possibly due to the removal of 377 supporting ice walls (e.g. Flint, 1930; McDonald and Shilts, 1975; Brennand, 2000; 378 379 Fiore et al., 2002), and (sub-)vertical clastic dykes (Fig. 6F) recording hydrofracture during periods of high water content and hydrostatic pressure (e.g. Rijsdijk et al., 1999; 380 van der Meer et al., 2009; Phillips and Hughes, 2014). 381

GPR line 195 (Fig. 6G) is 90 m long and was collected above and adjacent 382 (with ~2-5 m offset) to the Brampton Farm section, which provides an exposure for 383 ~75 m of the GPR line (Fig. 6B). This large overlap allows a number of features to be 384 tied between the section and the radar data. The lower part of the profile, particularly 385 in the central and eastern end (Fig. 6G), is largely composed of strong sub-horizontal 386 reflectors (RF1), interpreted as bedded sands. These areas are consistent with the 387 horizontally bedded sands (Sh, Sr) seen in the sediment section (Fig. 6A) and at 388 389 Morley Farm (Fig. 5). Gently dipping reflectors in the centre of the profile (RF3) 390 downlap onto well-defined, continuous sub-horizontal reflectors of RF1, consistent with the dip of the bedded sand (Sh) layer seen in the section to the west of the area 391 of slumping. Fainter, more-discontinuous sub-horizontal reflectors (RF2) overlaying 392 RF1 correspond closely to gravel layers (Gh, Gm) seen in the centre and eastern end 393 of the section, suggesting these are sub-horizontally deposited gravel sheets (Fig. 394 6G). The western end of the sediment section is deformed, with a number of faults 395

visible (Figs. 6A and 6D). The GPR profile in this area of faulting contains several linear features that appear to offset layered reflectors, but these could be radar artefacts rather than the imaging of faults by the radar data. No features matching the hydrofracture at the eastern end of the sediment section (Figs. 6A and 6F) could be identified from the GPR profile.

401

# [FIGURE 6 HERE]

Figure 6 – Brampton Farm site. (A) Sediment log. (B) DSM showing mapped 402 esker ridges (in red) and location of section (yellow line) and GPR line 195 (green 403 arrow). (C) to (F) Photographs showing close-up of details in (A). (G) GPR line 404 195 and annotated interpretation of GPR data. See text and Fig. 4 for reference 405 to numbered radar facies (RF). Approximate location of section in (A) is 406 407 indicated by the yellow line in the top panel. The diagonal swipes to the west end of the section are thought to be artefacts from trees located at the edge of 408 the field. See Figs. 2B and 3B for location of site. 409

410

411 Carlatton Farm

Two intersecting GPR lines were acquired from close to the crest line of a 1000 m 412 long, 250 m wide, ~12 m high S-N orientated multi-branched esker ridge in the south-413 west of the kame belt (Figs. 2B, 3A and 7A). Line 150 (Fig. 7C) is a 140 m long cross 414 profile running perpendicular to (and crossing) the ridge crest line (Figs. 3A, 7A and 415 7B). Line 155 (Fig. 7D) is a long profile that intersects with line 150 at approximately 416 the ridge crest line before extending ~250 m to the north-west, following a subtle sub-417 ridge aligned sub-parallel to the main ridge crest line (Figs. 7A and 7B). Areas of 418 strong, quasi-continuous, wavy sub-horizontal reflectors (RF1) are found in the lower 419

part of both profiles. This suggests a ridge core composed of bedded sands (Figs. 7C 420 and 7D), which, coupled with the morphology of the ridge, is indicative of planar flow 421 and vertical accretion in an ice-walled channel. Northwards-dipping reflectors (RF3) at 422 the S end of line 155 suggest downflow accretion of sediments within the esker ridge. 423 Areas of discontinuous sub-horizontal reflectors (e.g. RF2 in Figs. 7C and 7D) may 424 represent deposition of coarser sediment, such as gravel, as seen in the Morley and 425 Brampton Farm profiles (Figs. 5D and 6G). Discontinuous sub-horizontal and wavy 426 reflectors, in places dipping gently southwards, with a hummocky upper surface that 427 428 mimics the underlying reflectors (RF5), can be identified in line 155. These are consistent with ridge-scale sediment macroforms associated with a dynamic 429 depositional environment (Brennand, 1994; Burke et al., 2015). The dip direction of 430 some reflectors in this zone is opposite to the general northwards drainage trend, 431 indicating that these are shallow backsets related to headward accretion on the stoss-432 side of the sediment macroform in a channel (e.g. Miall, 1985; Fiore et al., 2002; Heinz 433 and Aigner, 2003; Burke et al., 2008). The transition from northwards dipping reflectors 434 at the southern end of the long profile, to shallow backsets overlying sub-horizontal 435 bedded sands, with a series of clearly defined boundaries, at the northern end, is 436 indicative of multiple phases of accretion and changes in flow conditions within the 437 esker ridge, characterised by significant lateral variation in the radar facies. Line 155 438 also contains a series of high-angle, disrupted reflectors in the central and uppermost 439 part of the profile (RF7 in Fig. 7D). We interpret this as possible evidence for post-440 depositional deformation resulting from collapse due to ice melt out/removal of ice 441 walls during deglaciation (e.g. Flint, 1930; Holmes, 1947; McDonald and Shilts, 1975; 442 Brennand, 2000; Fiore et al., 2002; Livingstone et al., 2010a). This is consistent with 443

the geomorphological context, as RF7 is located close to a small (30 m wide) kettle on
top of the ridge (Fig. 7A).

446

## [FIGURE 7 HERE]

Figure 7 – GPR lines 150 and 155 collected from the Carlatton Farm esker ridge.
(A) DSM showing mapped esker ridges (in red), ice-walled lake plains (in purple),
kettles (in light blue), and meltwater channels (blue lines) with location of GPR
lines 150 (black arrow) and 155 (blue arrow). See Figs. 2B and 3A for location of
site. (B) Fence diagram of lines. (C) Line 150 and annotated interpretations. (D)
Line 155 and annotated interpretations. See text and Fig. 4 for reference to
numbered radar facies (RF) in (C) and (D).

454

455 North Scales

Three intersecting lines up to 500 m in length were collected across the southern end 456 of a ~20 m high ice-walled lake plain, close to the point where a SW-NE oriented esker 457 ridge meets the hill (Figs. 3A, 8A and 8B). The bottom radar facies in line 159 458 comprises strong, undulating reflectors with a hummocky surface up to 6 m thick (e.g. 459 RF5 in Fig. 8C). These are overlain by discontinuous dipping reflectors (e.g. RF3 in 460 Fig. 8C) that in places fill troughs in the underlying hummocky surface and tend to 461 thicken from <2 m to >5 m towards the north-west. The RF5 hummocky reflectors (e.g. 462 Fig. 8C, lower panel), also found at Carlatton Farm (Fig. 7D), are consistent with ridge-463 464 scale esker macroforms (Brennand, 1994; Burke et al., 2015). The discontinuous dipping reflectors that overlay the hummocky surface are interpreted as foresets 465 (Russell et al., 2001; Woodward and Burke, 2007; Clayton et al., 2008; Winsemann et 466 al., 2018), indicating north-west drainage and sediment progradation into a water body 467

based on the orientation of dip. Sediment infilling of the >5 m deep water body (based 468 on thickness of the foreset structures) has resulted in the formation of the flat-topped 469 surface. Clear downlapping boundaries (RF3 in Fig. 8C) record multiple phases of 470 accretion and sediment deposition. To the north-west end of the line there are areas 471 of discontinuous, disrupted reflectors (e.g. RF7 in Fig. 8C) that are interpreted as 472 potential evidence of deformation due to removal of lateral ice support leading to 473 474 sediment collapse (e.g. Holmes, 1947; Fiore et al., 2002; Johnson and Clayton, 2003; Clayton et al., 2008; Burke et al., 2015). 475

The lowermost radar facies in line 161, which is 5 m thick, consists of strong-476 sub-horizontal to wavy reflectors (RF1 in Fig. 8D), which are interpreted as vertically-477 accreted bedded sands (i.e. esker deposits associated with a continuation of the ridge 478 located to the south of the ice-walled lake plain). These are overlain by a series of 479 reflectors dipping to the south-west (RF3 in Fig. 8D) that are restricted to the stoss 480 (south-west) side of the ice-walled lake plain and are up to  $\sim 2$  m thick, and are in turn 481 overlain by faint, often discontinuous sub-horizontal reflectors with a thickness of ~2 482 m (RF4 in Fig. 8D). At the north-east end of the profile, the hummocky radar surface 483 (RF5) is draped by discontinuous reflectors that mimic the underlying hummocks (RF4 484 in Fig. 8D). The draped reflectors are consistent with fine-grained glaciolacustrine 485 486 sedimentation (topsets) that has buried underlying glaciofluvial deposits. Line 161 also contains a large trough structure at its south-west end (RF6 in Fig. 8D), suggesting 487 the presence of a large channel towards the margin of the ice-walled lake that was 488 buried by subsequent lake infill. 489

Line 166 contains similar features to those seen in lines 159 and 161. This includes strong sub-horizontal reflectors (e.g. RF1 in Fig. 8E) interpreted as bedded sands laid down as esker deposits; dipping reflectors (RF3 in Fig. 8E) interpreted as

foresets and indicating northwards sediment progradation into a lake environment; and 493 an uppermost series of faint sub-horizontal reflectors (e.g. RF4 in Fig. 8E) consistent 494 with deltaic topsets. There appear to be at least two phases of foreset deposition, with 495 the lowermost foresets contiguous with the bedded sands, followed by a second set 496 of foresets that in places infill the hummocky surface. This suggests formation was 497 characterised by an initial phase of esker formation indicative of vertical accretion (RF1 498 499 and RF5), which terminated in a lake forming a subaqueous fan (lower RF3 unit) indicative of more complex horizontal accretion, followed by expansion of the lake, 500 501 and subsequent infilling and burial of the esker and lower fan by a prograding delta (upper RF3 unit and RF4). 502

RF3 dipping reflectors are found in all three lines at North Scales and display a 503 range of dip directions from south-west to north. The south-west dipping RF3 reflectors 504 in line 166 contrast to the north-west and north dipping RF3 (interpreted as delta or 505 subaqueous fan foresets) in lines 159 and 166, respectively, and the overall 506 northwards trend of drainage within the kame belt (Huddart, 1981; Livingstone et al., 507 2010a). There are two possible explanations for this apparent broad range in dip 508 directions. RF3 reflectors in line 161 are consistent with backsets, indicating headward 509 accretion on the stoss-side of the sediment macroform at a hydraulic jump during high-510 511 energy water flows (e.g. Fiore et al., 2002; Burke et al., 2008; Winsemann et al., 2018). Alternatively, they could represent foreset deposition in a heavily splayed subaqueous 512 fan/prograding delta, with foreset dip orientation ranging from south-west to north. This 513 would suggest a stream input from the south-east of the ice-walled lake plain. Of these 514 alternatives, we favour the interpretation of RF3 in line 161 as backsets based on their 515 restriction to the stoss side of the ice-walled lake plain, in close proximity to the likely 516 entrance point to the lake of an outflow channel (as indicated by the esker ridge to the 517

south and the evidence for buried esker deposits within the ice-walled lake plain).
However, it is also possible that they relate to a large, splayed subaqueous fan feature
burying the initial phases of esker sedimentation.

521

522

# [FIGURE 8 HERE]

Figure 8 – GPR lines 159, 161 and 166 collected from North Scales ice-walled 523 524 lake plain. (A) DSM showing mapped ice-walled lake plain (in purple), esker ridges (in red), kettles (in light blue), and meltwater channels (blue lines) with 525 526 location of GPR lines 159 (green arrow), 161 (blue arrow) and 166 (red arrow). See Figs. 2B and 3A for location of site. (B) Fence diagram of lines. (C) Line 159 527 and annotated interpretations. (D) Line 161 and annotated interpretations. (E) 528 Line 166 and annotated interpretations. See text and Fig. 4 for reference to 529 numbered radar facies (RF) in (C), (D) and (E). 530

531

532 Discussion

#### 533 **Process-form relationships of landforms within complex kame belts**

Our interpretation of the North Scales radar data provides a conceptual model for 534 535 progressive phases of sedimentation during ice-walled lake-plain formation (Fig. 9), building on existing models (e.g. Winters, 1961; Clayton and Cherry, 1967; Johnson 536 and Clayton, 2003; Clayton et al., 2008; Livingstone et al., 2010a,c). The model shows 537 evolution from initial subglacial esker sedimentation to subaqueous fan deposition into 538 a lake following channel collapse and the development of glacier karst (e.g. Flint, 1930; 539 540 Holmes, 1947; Lewis, 1949; Clayton, 1964; Evans et al., 2018), followed by a final phase of lake and delta infill. The identified radar facies suggest initial glaciofluvial 541 deposition within ice-walled channels, as shown in all three profiles by the lowermost 542

units of bedded sands (RF1) and the ridge-scale hummocky sub-horizontal reflectors 543 (RF5) indicating subglacial esker formation as a series of macroforms (Fig. 8). This 544 glaciofluvial sedimentation is likely to be connected to the ridge located immediately 545 south of the ice-walled lake plain (Fig. 8A). The northwards dipping lower RF3 unit in 546 line 166 is contiguous with the esker sedimentation, suggesting a switch from channel 547 sedimentation to subaqueous fan deposits as the lake begins to form during the initial 548 549 stages of glacier karst development (Fig. 9C). The south-west dipping reflectors (RF3) in Fig. 8D are likely to be backsets and indicate a high energy hydraulic system 550 551 consistent with a subglacial channel entering an ice-marginal lake (e.g. Flint, 1930) (Fig. 9D). The backsets are confined to the south and south-west side of the flat-552 topped hill, closest to the likely input points based on the northwards-draining 553 meltwater system (e.g. Fig. 2B). This sequence suggests higher energy flows to the 554 south-west of the ice-walled lake, transitioning to distal lower energy deposition to the 555 north-east and the centre of the lake. However, south-west dipping reflectors may 556 alternatively record a heavily-splayed subaqueous fan fed by a stream input at the 557 south-east margin of the lake. Subaqueous fan deposits have been identified in other 558 ice-walled lake plain studies based on the presence of gravelly rim-ridges surrounding 559 the flat-topped hill (e.g. Winters, 1961; Clayton and Cherry, 1967; Johnson and 560 Clayton, 2003; Clayton et al., 2008). The lake continued to evolve and infill, with the 561 northwards-dipping reflectors interpreted as delta foresets (RF3) indicating that lake 562 infill was primarily a result of rapid fan/delta progradation, burying the early phases of 563 esker sedimentation (Fig. 9D). The stacked units (e.g. northern end of line 166) (Fig. 564 8E) indicate multiple pulses of rapid sediment deposition relating to the continued 565 downwasting of ice, changing stream inputs and expansion of the lake. The final stage 566 of lake infill is represented by the uppermost faint sub-horizontal reflectors (RF4), 567

interpreted as draped lake deposits and topsets (Fig. 9E). These are located towards 568 the central part of the ice-walled lake plain, consistent with the deepest parts of the 569 lake (Clayton and Cherry, 1967; Clayton et al., 2008). The relative lack of fine-grained 570 lake deposits, common in other ice-walled lake plains (e.g. Winters, 1961; Clayton and 571 Cherry, 1967; Johnson and Clayton, 2003; Clayton et al., 2008), suggests that lake 572 progradation and infilling may have been rapid. Subsequent de-icing and removal of 573 ice walls then revealed an upstanding ice-walled lake plain, with sediment collapse 574 likely towards the flanks (e.g. Holmes, 1947; Winters, 1961; Brodzikowski and van 575 576 Loon, 1991; Huddart, 1981; Clayton et al., 2001, 2008; Johnson and Clayton, 2003; Livingstone et al., 2010a) (Fig. 9F). 577

578

#### [FIGURE 9 HERE]

579 Figure 9 – Conceptual model showing formation of North Scales ice-walled lake plain and esker ridges based on interpretation of GPR data. (A) Brampton Kame 580 Belt conceptual model, adapted from Livingstone et al. (2010c). Panels (B) to (F) 581 are two-dimensional cross-sections showing the evolution of a section of the 582 kame belt along the transect X-Y, which transitions from a major subglacial 583 drainage channel into an ice-walled lake. The situation depicted in (A) is broadly 584 equivalent to that shown in panels (C) and (D) in terms of stage of kame belt 585 evolution. (B) Ice sheet with major subglacial drainage axis and late-stage ice-586 walled lake forming. (C) Partial collapse of drainage axis into early-stage lake as 587 glacier karst begins to develop. (D) Lake expansion as glacier karst evolves. (E) 588 Late-stage lake infill and esker formation. (F) Esker ridges and ice-walled lake 589 plains. 590

The sedimentological and radar data from the esker ridges investigated at the 592 Morley, Brampton and Carlatton Farm sites highlight significant variations in flow 593 conditions. The Morley Farm esker ridge sediment and radar facies indicate low 594 energy flows, characterised by planar bedded sands and shallow trough features, with 595 little apparent variation in flow conditions evident in the ridge cross-profiles (Fig. 5). By 596 contrast, the Brampton Farm section (Fig. 6A) contains variations in grain sizes 597 598 (bedded sands to gravel sheets) and evidence of significant deformation. Faulting (e.g. Fig. 6D) is consistent with gravitational deformation indicative of sediment pile let-599 600 down or removal of supporting ice walls (e.g. McDonald and Shilts, 1975; Brennand, 2000; Fiore et al., 2002; Livingstone et al., 2010a), and hydrofracturing (e.g. Fig. 6F) 601 indicates fluctuating water pressures (e.g. Lee et al., 2015). The Carlatton Farm GPR 602 603 long-profile (Fig. 7B) shows evidence of multiple phases of sediment accretion, recording changes in flow conditions both vertically within the ridge and laterally across 604 the long-profile. We suggest the identified variations in flow conditions recorded by the 605 sediment and GPR data are also consistent with differences in overall esker ridge 606 morphologies (e.g. Burke et al. 2015) and their context within the kame belt. Both the 607 Morley and Carlatton Farm sites are within large S-N aligned ridges that form part of 608 a consistent esker ridge network extending northwards through the kame belt (Fig. 609 2B). We suggest these ridges record stable meltwater drainage routes, characterised 610 611 by both largely homogenous sedimentation in cross-profile (e.g. Figs. 5 and 7C) and multiple phases of accretion evident along-section. The greater variation in flow 612 conditions recorded in the Carlatton Farm profiles is likely to reflect the complex 613 morphology of the esker ridge (i.e. multiple ridge crests and branches leading off the 614 main ridge; Fig. 7A) compared to Morley Farm (Fig. 5C). The Brampton Farm ridges 615 are smaller and form part of a more-fragmented system aligned broadly SW-NE (Figs. 616

617 2B and 3B). Variation in grain size, evidence for fluctuating water pressures 618 (hydrofracture) and hyperconcentrated flows, indicate availability of large sediment 619 volumes and rapid ridge formation (Fiore et al., 2002; Mäkinen, 2003). Evidence for 620 faulting suggests that the channel system subsequently underwent significant 621 modification during dead ice melt out as supporting ice-walls were removed, consistent 622 with englacial or supraglacial deposition (e.g. Lewis, 1949; Huddart, 1981; Burke et 623 al., 2008) and/or formation in an ice-marginal position (e.g. Storrar et al., in revision).

624

#### 625 Evolution of complex kame belts during deglaciation

Two types of drainage network can be identified within the Brampton Kame Belt, providing insight into the formation of kame belts as glacier karst evolves during deglaciation. These are (1) major stable drainage axes that collapsed into a chain of ice-walled lakes as glacier karst develops; and (2) fragmentary ice-marginal esker ridges that formed at or close to the ice sheet margin during recession south-east along the Vale of Eden (Fig. 10).

632

#### [FIGURE 10 HERE]

Figure 10 – Identification of two main styles of meltwater drainage within the Brampton Kame Belt. (A) Geomorphological map with identified major meltwater drainage axes oriented broadly S-N, and ice-marginal drainage routes aligned broadly SW-NE tracing ice sheet recession to the SE. (B) Southern part of the kame belt highlighting the difference between major drainage axis and icemarginal drainage esker ridges.

We suggest that the broadly S-N and SE-NW aligned esker ridges in the south and 640 central parts of the kame belt, trending to SW-NE in the north, record major meltwater 641 drainage axes in this part of the ice sheet (Fig. 10). These esker ridges are consistent 642 with a continuation of the meltwater channel system that extends for tens of kilometres 643 along the western side of the Pennine escarpment (Arthurton & Wadge, 1981; 644 Greenwood et al., 2007; Livingstone et al., 2008, 2010a). The largest esker ridges 645 646 within the kame belt, including the Brampton ridge (Fig. 2B), follow this general alignment, and therefore their size is likely a function both of the stability of the 647 648 drainage network and the focusing of sediment and water down these axes. The internal data from the Morley Farm and Carlatton Farm esker ridges (Figs. 5 and 7) 649 show multiple phases of accretion and a lack of pervasive deformation, consistent with 650 a subglacial drainage network. We propose that evolution and continued downwasting 651 of major subglacial drainage axes during deglaciation led to the formation of a series 652 of aligned ice-walled lakes within a well-developed and stable glacier karst system, as 653 supported by the linear distribution of ice-walled lake plains within the kame belt (e.g. 654 Holmes, 1947) (Figs. 2B and 10A). We suggest this is analogous to the linear chains 655 of supraglacial ponds observed on the debris-covered tongue of Tasman Glacier, New 656 Zealand (Röhl, 2008) (Fig. 11A). The presence of major drainage axes initiated 657 collapse of overlying ice (unroofing), causing a drainage reorganisation and localised 658 659 ponding of water where channels became blocked by dead ice and debris within the glacier karst. As the ice continued to stagnate and the glacier karst expanded and 660 stabilised, so did the ice-walled lakes (e.g. Holmes, 1947; Lewis, 1949; Clayton, 1964; 661 Evans et al., 2018). The presence of thick (>5 m) sequences of delta foresets dipping 662 northwards within the North Scales ice-walled lake plain (Fig. 8), and the evidence for 663 rapid infilling of lakes (inferred from the relative lack of fine-grained lake deposits 664

identified in the radar data), is consistent with major drainage axes and suggest a large
supraglacial debris source, such as the Penrith sandstone ridge and/or the flanks of
the Pennine escarpment (Livingstone et al., 2010a).

668

# [FIGURE 11 HERE]

Figure 11 – Modern analogues for the two drainage network types identified 669 within the Brampton Kame Belt. (A) Evolution from 1965 to 1986 of chains of 670 supraglacial ponds (black arrows in left panel) on the debris-covered lower 671 tongue of Tasman Glacier, New Zealand. Note that the axis of the chain of ponds 672 coincides with the outflow of a subglacial channel (white arrow in left panel) at 673 the glacier front. Aerial photographs from 1965, 1973 and 1986 are accessible 674 from Land Information New Zealand (www.linz.govt.nz) and are used under the 675 676 Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International Licence. (B) Ice-marginal eskers (white arrows) at the margin of Hørbyebreen, Svalbard (see Storrar et al., in 677 revision). Black arrows show flow-parallel eskers, analogous to the major 678 drainage axis esker ridges in Fig. 10B. Inset shows context of the eskers at the 679 glacier margin. Aerial photograph from 2009 acquired from the Norwegian Polar 680 Institute TopoSvalbard online archive (toposvalbard.nploar.no). 681

682

A series of smaller, more-fragmentary esker ridges aligned SW-NE in the southern part of the kame belt are interpreted to represent deposition in channels running parallel to the south-east retreating ice margin up the Vale of Eden and towards the Stainmore Gap (Fig. 10) (Huddart, 1981; Livingstone et al., 2010a; 2015). A number of these ridges have complex, multi-branched morphologies, including at Brampton Farm (Fig. 6). The sedimentological and radar data from the Brampton Farm

esker ridge suggest that formation was likely to have been rapid and associated with 689 fluctuating water pressures and high sediment availability. Evidence for significant 690 deformation is consistent with a partially englacial/supraglacial component to the 691 drainage channels and the subsequent collapse caused by ice ablation (e.g. Lewis, 692 1949; Fiore et al., 2002). Eskers formed partly in englacial/supraglacial positions are 693 also consistent with the fragmentary nature of the ridges in this part of the kame belt. 694 695 Together, these observations suggest late-stage ice-marginal formation during deglaciation, with partial englacial and supraglacial sections to the drainage, 696 697 contrasting with the relatively stable S-N major drainage axes (Fig. 10). The inferred ice-marginal eskers are consistent with observations of complex polyphase esker 698 systems formed on modern glacier forelands, some of which mimic the shape of the 699 700 ice margin in addition to the flow-parallel orientation typically associated with eskers (Fig. 11B) (e.g. Storrar et al., in revision). Ice-marginal eskers form where meltwater 701 supply and sedimentation are high, channel abandonment and drainage network 702 reorganisation are frequent and dynamic (e.g. Trotter, 1929; Lewis, 1949; Huddart, 703 1981), and where the glacier front consists of both a defined ice margin and ice 704 stagnation terrain (Storrar et al., in revision). 705

706

# 707 GPR as a tool for investigating kame belt sedimentary architecture

The GPR profiles provided good insight into the internal structure of landforms within the kame belt, in accordance with previous work in modern and ancient glaciofluvial environments (e.g. Russell et al., 2001; Fiore et al., 2002; Cassidy et al., 2003; Burke et al., 2008, 2015; Winsemann et al., 2018). In particular, the 100 MHz GPR data were effective at capturing broad scale architectural elements, including vertical and lateral

variations in styles of sediment accretion (e.g. lateral, headward, downflow or vertical 713 accretion), and the morphology of boundaries and contacts (e.g. troughs, hummocky 714 surfaces). We also used the GPR data to identify changes in grain size (e.g. bedded 715 sands versus gravel sheets) and depositional structures (e.g. planar, cross-bedded), 716 but in these cases it was important to have sedimentary sections that acted as tie 717 points to identify key radar facies (e.g. Fig. 4). The wider geomorphological and 718 719 sedimentological context of a site is also important when interpreting radar facies. For instance, at North Scales (Fig. 8), we suggest dipping reflectors are likely to be 720 721 backsets in some profiles (as opposed to foresets) because the dip direction of the reflectors was opposite to the general S-N/SW-NE trend of meltwater drainage (cf. 722 Fiore et al., 2002; Burke et al., 2008). The GPR data were not effective for identifying 723 724 individual features, such as hydrofracturing or faulting, even where this was shown to be significant within a sedimentary section (e.g. Fig. 6). The difficulty in picking out 725 finer scale detail may be due to artefacts/noise in the GPR data (e.g. reflectors from 726 727 trees, fences etc.). The use of a radar system with shielded antenna could be one way to try and improve this in future surveys. Finally, wherever possible, we advocate a 728 combined geomorphological, sedimentological and geophysical approach to the study 729 of complex glaciofluvial sediment-landform assemblages. 730

731

## 732 Conclusions

Our combined geomorphological, sedimentological and geophysical investigation provides a new assessment of the morphology and internal stratigraphy and architecture of the Brampton Kame Belt. We present a conceptual model for the formation of ice-walled lake plains based on our interpretation of GPR profiles, building on and adding to the body of existing work on this topic. The process-form model

suggests that major drainage pathways collapse into a chain of ice-walled lakes as 738 glacier karst develops during deglaciation. Sediment and GPR data demonstrate 739 significant variation in esker ridge internal structure, indicating differences in flow 740 conditions, styles of accretion, and degree of deformation that can be linked to 741 observed differences in ridge morphologies. The morphology, orientation and internal 742 structure of esker ridges and ice-walled lake plains allow two main styles of drainage 743 744 to be identified within the kame belt: (1) major drainage axes broadly oriented S-N that collapsed to form a series of aligned ice-walled lakes during the development of 745 746 relatively stable glacier karst; and (2) ice-marginal drainage systems oriented SW-NE that formed parallel to the ice margin as it downwasted and retreated to the south-east 747 during deglaciation. These esker ridges are likely to have formed rapidly and 748 749 undergone significant modification during dead ice melt out. Our study demonstrates that GPR data provides good insight into the broad scale internal stratigraphy and 750 architecture of landforms in complex kame belts, including variations in accretion 751 styles and boundary morphology. However, sediment exposures are important to help 752 tie sediments to radar facies and to validate interpretations. 753

754

#### 755 Acknowledgements

We thank the Quaternary Research Association (QRA) for funding the fieldwork. Several landowners within the Brampton kame belt are thanked for allowing access to sites. Jonathan Lee and Emrys Phillips are thanked for their help with interpreting aspects of the sedimentology. Paul Carter and William Pearson helped format the GPS data. Heather Purdie assisted with the acquisition of aerial photographs of Tasman Glacier. The Associate Editor and two anonymous reviewers are thanked for improving the paper with their constructive comments. 763

#### 764 **References**

- Allen JRL. 1984. Parallel lamination developed from upper-stage plane beds: a model
- based on the larger coherent structures of the turbulent boundary layer. Sediment.
- 767 Geol. 39: 227-242.
- Arthurton RS, Wadge AJ. 1981. Geology of the Country around Penrith. Memoir of
   the British Geological Survey, HMSO, London.

Attig JW, Clayton L. 1993. Stratigraphy and origin of an area of hummocky glacial
 topography, northern Wisconsin, USA. Quaternary International 18: 61-67. DOI:

772 10.1016/1040-6182(93)90054-J

Attig JW, Rawling III JE. 2018. Influence of persistent buried ice on late glacial
landscape development in part of Wisconsin's Northern Highlands. In Quaternary
Glaciation of the Great Lakes Region: Process, Landforms, Sediments, and
Chronology, Kehew AE, Curry BB (eds). Geol. Soc. Am. Spec. Paper 530: 103–
114.

Auton CA. 1992. Scottish landform examples—6: The Flemington eskers. Scottish
 Geographical Magazine 108(3): 190-196.

Banerjee I, McDonald BC. 1975. Nature of esker sedimentation. In Glaciofluvial and
Glaciolacustrine Sedimentation, Jopling AV, McDonald BC (eds). Soc. Econ.
Paleontol. Mineral., Spec. Publ. 23: 304-320.

783 Bennett GL, Evans DJA. 2012. Glacier retreat and landform production on an 784 overdeepened glacier foreland: the debris-charged glacial landsystem at

785 Kvíárjökull, Iceland. Earth Surface Processes and Landforms 37(15): 1584-1602.
786 DOI:10.1002/esp.3259

Brennand TA. 1994. Macroforms, large bedforms and rhythmic sedimentary
sequences in subglacial eskers, south-central Ontario: implications for esker
genesis and meltwater regime. Sedimentary Geology 91(1-4): 9-55.

Brennand TA. 2000. Deglacial meltwater drainage and glaciodynamics: inferences
 from Laurentide eskers, Canada. Geomorphology 32(3-4): 263-293. DOI:
 10.1016/S0169-555X(99)00100-2

793 Brodzikowski K, van Loon AJ. 1991. Glacigenic sediments. Elsevier: Oxford.

Burke MJ, Woodward J, Russell AJ, Fleisher PJ, Bailey PK. 2008. Controls on the
sedimentary architecture of a single event englacial esker: Skeiðarárjökull, Iceland.
Quaternary Science Reviews 27(19-20): 1829-1847. DOI:
10.1016/j.quascirev.2008.06.012

Burke MJ, Brennand TA, Sjogren DB. 2015. The role of sediment supply in esker
formation and ice tunnel evolution. Quaternary Science Reviews 115: 50-77. DOI:
10.1016/j.quascirev.2015.02.017

Busby JP, Merritt JW. 1999. Quaternary deformation mapping with ground penetrating
radar. Journal of Applied Geophysics 41(1): 75-91. DOI: 10.1016/S09269851(98)00050-0

Cassidy NJ, Russell AJ, Marren PM, Fay H, Knudsen O, Rushmer EL, Van Dijk TAGP.
2003. GPR derived architecture of November 1996 jökulhlaup deposits,
Skeiðarársandur, Iceland. Geological Society, London, Special Publications 211(1):
153-166. DOI: 10.1144/GSL.SP.2001.211.01.13

Chandler BM, Lovell H, Boston CM, Lukas S, Barr ID, Benediktsson ÍÖ, Benn DI, Clark
CD, Darvill CM, Evans DJA, Ewertowski MW, Loibl D, Margold M, Otto J-C, Roberts
DH, Stokes CR, Storrar RD, Stroeven AP. 2018. Glacial geomorphological
mapping: A review of approaches and frameworks for best practice. Earth-Science
Reviews 185: 806-846. DOI: 10.1016/j.earscirev.2018.07.015

of retreat of the last British-Irish Ice Sheet. Quaternary Science Reviews 44: 112-

Clark CD, Hughes AL, Greenwood SL, Jordan C, Sejrup HP. 2012. Pattern and timing

815 146. DOI: 10.1016/j.quascirev.2010.07.019

813

819

Clark CD, Ely JC, Greenwood SL, Hughes AL, Meehan R, Barr ID, Bateman MD,

Bradwell T, Doole J, Evans DJA, Jordan CJ, Monteys X, Pellicer XM, Sheehy M.
2018. BRITICE Glacial Map, version 2: a map and GIS database of glacial

landforms of the last British-Irish Ice Sheet. Boreas 47(1): 11-27. DOI:

- 820 10.1111/bor.12273
- Clayton L. 1964. Karst topography on stagnant glaciers. Journal of Glaciology 5(37):
   107-112. DOI: 10.3189/S0022143000028628
- Clayton L. 1967. Stagnant-glacier features of the Missouri Coteau in North Dakota.
  North Dakota Geological Survey, Miscellaneous Series 30: 25-46.
- Clayton L, Cherry JA. 1967. Pleistocene superglacial and ice-walled lakes of westcentral North America. North Dakota Geological Survey, Miscellaneous Series 30:
  47-52.
- Clayton L, Attig JW, Mickelson DM. 2001. Effects of late Pleistocene permafrost on
  the landscape of Wisconsin, USA. Boreas 30(3): 173-188. DOI: 10.1111/j.15023885.2001.tb01221.x

- Clayton L, Attig JW, Ham NR, Johnson MD, Jennings CE, Syverson KM. 2008. Icewalled-lake plains: Implications for the origin of hummocky glacial topography in
  middle North America. Geomorphology 97(1-2): 237-248. DOI:
  10.1016/j.geomorph.2007.02.045
- Cook JH. 1946. Kame complexes and perforation deposits. American Journal of
  Science 244(8): 573-583. DOI: 10.2475/ajs.244.8.573
- Curry B, Petras J. 2011. Chronological framework for the deglaciation of the Lake
  Michigan lobe of the Laurentide Ice Sheet from ice-walled lake deposits. Journal of
  Quaternary Science 26(4): 402-410. DOI: 10.1002/jqs.1466
- Curtis GC, Woodworth JB. 1899. Nantucket, a morainal island. The Journal of Geology
  7(3): 226-236.
- Evans DJA, Benn DI (eds.). 2004. A practical guide to the study of glacial sediments.
  Hodder Education: London.
- Evans DJA, Hughes AL, Hansom JD, Roberts DH. 2017. Scottish landform examples
- 43: Glacifluvial landforms of Strathallan, Perthshire. Scottish Geographical Journal
- 846 133(1): 42-53. DOI: 10.1080/14702541.2016.1254276
- Evans DJA, Roberts DH, Bateman MD, Ely J, Medialdea A, Burke MJ, Chiverell RC,
- Clark CD, Fabel D. 2018. A chronology for North Sea Lobe advance and recession
- on the Lincolnshire and Norfolk coasts during MIS 2 and 6. Proceedings of the
- Geologists' Association. DOI: 10.1016/j.pgeola.2018.10.004
- Fiore J, Pugin A, Beres M. 2002. Sedimentological and GPR studies of subglacial deposits in the Joux Valley (Vaud, Switzerland): backset accretion in an esker

- followed by an erosive jökulhlaup. Géographie physique et Quaternaire 56(1): 19-
- 854 32. DOI:10.7202/008602ar
- Flint RF. 1928a. Pleistocene terraces of the lower Connecticut Valley. Bulletin of the Geological Society of America 39(4): 955-984. DOI: 10.1130/GSAB-39-955
- 857 Flint RF. 1928b. Eskers and crevasse fillings. American Journal of Science: (89), 410-
- 416. DOI: 10.2475/ajs.s5-15.89.410
- Flint RF. 1929. The stagnation and dissipation of the last ice sheet. Geographical
  Review 19(2): 256-289. DOI: 10.2307/208535
- Flint RF. 1930. The Origin of the Irish" Eskers". Geographical Review 20(4): 615-630.
   DOI: 10.2307/209015
- Gerke HH, Koszinski S, Kalettka T, Sommer M. 2010. Structures and hydrologic
  function of soil landscapes with kettle holes using an integrated hydropedological
  approach. Journal of Hydrology 393(1-2): 123-132. 10.1016/j.jhydrol.2009.12.047.
- Gorrell G, Shaw J. 1991. Deposition in an esker, bead and fan complex, Lanark,
  Ontario, Canada. Sedimentary Geology 72(3-4): 285-314. DOI: 10.1016/00370738(91)90016-7
- Greenwood SL, Clark CD, Hughes AL. 2007. Formalising an inversion methodology
  for reconstructing ice-sheet retreat patterns from meltwater channels: application to
  the British Ice Sheet. Journal of Quaternary Science 22(6): 637-645. DOI:
  10.1002/jqs.1083
- Heinz J, Aigner T. 2003. Hierarchical dynamic stratigraphy in various Quaternary
  gravel deposits, Rhine glacier area (SW Germany): implications for
  hydrostratigraphy. International Journal of Earth Sciences 92(6): 923-938.

Holmes CD. 1947. Kames. American journal of Science 245(4): 240-249. DOI:
10.2475/ajs.245.4.240

Huddart D. 1981. Fluvioglacial systems in Edenside (middle Eden Valley and
Brampton kame belt). Field Guide to Eastern Cumbria. Quaternary Research
Association: London: 79-103.

Johnson MD, Clayton L. 2003. Supraglacial landsystems in lowland terrain. glacial
 landsystems. In Glacial Landsystems. Evans DJA (ed). Arnold: London: 228-258.

Jopling AV. Walker RG. 1968. Morphology and origin of ripple-drift cross-lamination,
with examples from the Pleistocene of Massachusetts. Journal of Sedimentary
Research 38(4): 971-984. DOI: 10.1306/74D71ADC-2B21-11D78648000102C1865D

Kayler ZE, Badrian M, Frackowski A, Rieckh H, Nitzsche KN, Kalettka T, Merz C,
Gessler A. 2018. Ephemeral kettle hole water and sediment temporal and spatial
dynamics within an agricultural catchment. Ecohydrology 11(2): e1929. DOI:
10.1002/eco.1929.

Lee JR, Wakefield OJ, Phillips E, Hughes L. 2015. Sedimentary and structural evolution of a relict subglacial to subaerial drainage system and its hydrogeological implications: an example from Anglesey, north Wales, UK. Quaternary Science Reviews 109: 88-110. DOI: 10.1016/j.quascirev.2014.09.010

Levy A, Robinson Z, Krause S, Waller R, Weatherill J. 2015. Long-term variability of
proglacial groundwater-fed hydrological systems in an area of glacier retreat,
Skeiðarársandur, Iceland. Earth Surface Processes and Landforms 40(7): 981-994.
DOI: 10.1002/esp.3696.

899	Lewis WV. 1949. An esker in process of formation: Böverbreen, Jotunheimen, 1947	7.
900	Journal of Glaciology 1(6): 314-319. DOI: 10.3189/S0022143000010066	

- Lischeid G, Balla D, Dannowski R, Dietrich O, Kalettka T, Merz C, Schindler U, Steidl
- J. 2017. Forensic hydrology: what function tells about structure in complex settings.
- 903 Environmental Earth Sciences 76(1): 40. DOI: 10.1007/s12665-016-6351-5.
- Livingstone SJ, Ó Cofaigh C, Evans DJA. 2008. Glacial geomorphology of the central
  sector of the last British-Irish Ice Sheet. Journal of Maps 4(1): 358-377. DOI:
  10.4113/jom.2008.1032
- <sup>907</sup> Livingstone SJ, Evans DJA, Ó Cofaigh C, Hopkins J. 2010a. The Brampton kame belt

and Pennine escarpment meltwater channel system (Cumbria, UK): morphology,

sedimentology and formation. Proceedings of the Geologists' Association 121(4):

910 423-443. DOI: 10.1016/j.pgeola.2009.10.005

- Livingstone SJ, Ó Cofaigh C, Evans DJA. 2010b. A major ice drainage pathway of the
  last British–Irish Ice Sheet: the Tyne Gap, northern England. Journal of Quaternary
  Science 25(3): 354-370. DOI: 10.1002/jqs.1341
- Livingstone SJ., Evans DJA, Ó Cofaigh C (eds). (2010c). The Quaternary of the
  Solway Lowlands and Pennine escarpment. Quaternary Research Association:
  London
- Livingstone SJ, Roberts DH, Davies BJ, Evans DJA, Ó Cofaigh C, Gheorghiu DM.
- 2015. Late Devensian deglaciation of the Tyne Gap Palaeo-Ice Stream, northern
- England. Journal of Quaternary Science 30(8): 790-804. DOI: 10.1002/jqs.2813
- Lukas S, Sass O. 2011. The formation of Alpine lateral moraines inferred from
  sedimentology and radar reflection patterns: a case study from Gornergletscher,

- 922 Switzerland. Geological Society, London, Special Publications 354(1): 77-92. DOI:
  923 10.1144/SP354.5
- Lundqvist J. 1979. Morphogenic classification of glaciofluvial deposits. Sver. Geol.
  Unders., Ser. C 767: 72.
- Maizels JK. 1977. Experiments on the origin of kettle-holes. Journal of Glaciology
  18(79): 291-303. DOI: 10.3189/S0022143000021365
- Mäkinen J. 2003. Time-transgressive deposits of repeated depositional sequences
  within interlobate glaciofluvial (esker) sediments in Köyliö, SW Finland.
  Sedimentology 50(2): 327-360.
- 931 Malmberg Persson K. 1991. Internal structures and depositional environment of a
- kame deposit at V. Ingelstad, Skåne, southern Sweden. GFF 113(2-3): 163-170.
- 933 DOI: 10.1080/11035899109453850
- 934 Mannerfelt CM. 1945. Några glacialmorfologiska Formelement. Geografiska Annaler,
- 935 27: 1–239. DOI: 10.1080/20014422.1945.11880740
- 936 McDonald B, Shilts WW. 1975. Interpretation of faults in glaciofluvial sediments. In
- 937 Glaciofluvial and Glaciolacustrine Sedimentation. Jopling AV, McDonald BC. (eds).
- Soc. Econ. Paleontol. Mineral., Spec. Publ. 23: 123-131.
- Miall AD. 1977. A review of the braided-river depositional environment. Earth-Science
  Reviews 13(1): 1-62. DOI: 10.1016/0012-8252(77)90055-1
- Miall AD. 1985. Architectural-element analysis: a new method of facies analysis
  applied to fluvial deposits. Earth-Science Reviews 22(4): 261-308. DOI:
  10.1016/0012-8252(85)90001-7

Paterson J, Cheel RJ. 1997. The depositional history of the Bloomington complex, an
ice-contact deposit in the Oak Ridges Moraine, southern Ontario, Canada.
Quaternary Science Reviews 16(7): 705-719. DOI: 10.1016/S02773791(97)00017-6

Pellicer XM, Gibson P. 2011. Electrical resistivity and Ground Penetrating Radar for
the characterisation of the internal architecture of Quaternary sediments in the
Midlands of Ireland. Journal of Applied Geophysics: 75(4): 638-647. DOI:
10.1016/j.jappgeo.2011.09.019

Phillips E, Hughes L. 2014. Hydrofracturing in response to the development of an
overpressurised subglacial meltwater system during drumlin formation: an example
from Anglesey, NW Wales. Proceedings of the Geologists' Association 125(3): 296311. DOI: 10.1016/j.pgeola.2014.03.004

Price RJ. 1969. Moraines, sandar, kames and eskers near Breidamerkurjökull,
Iceland. Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers 46: 17-43. DOI:
10.2307/621406

Rieck RL. 1979. Ice stagnation and paleodrainage in and near an interlobate area.
Papers of the Michigan Academy of Sciences, Arts, and Letters 11:219-235.

Rijsdijk KF, Owen G, Warren WP, McCarroll D, van der Meer JJM. 1999. Clastic dykes
in over-consolidated tills: evidence for subglacial hydrofracturing at Killiney Bay,
eastern Ireland. Sedimentary Geology, 129(1-2): 111-126. DOI: 10.1016/S00370738(99)00093-7

Ringrose S. 1982. Depositional processes in the development of eskers in Manitoba.
In Research in Glacial, Glacio-Fluvial and Glacio-Lacustrine Systems. Proceedings
of the 6th Guelph Symposium on Geomorphology 1980: 117-137.

Röhl K. 2008. Characteristics and evolution of supraglacial ponds on debris-covered
Tasman Glacier, New Zealand. Journal of Glaciology 54(188): 867-880. DOI:
10.3189/002214308787779861

Russell AJ, Knudsen O, Fay H, Marren PM, HeinzJ, Tronicke J. 2001. Morphology
and sedimentology of a giant supraglacial, ice-walled, jökulhlaup channel,
Skeiðarárjökull, Iceland: implications for esker genesis. Global and Planetary
Change 28(1-4): 193-216. DOI: 10.1016/S0921-8181(00)00073-4

Rust BR, Romanelli R. 1975. Late Quaternary subaqueous outwash deposits near
Ottawa, Canada. In Glaciofluvial and Glaciolacustrine Sedimentation. Jopling AV,
McDonald BC (eds). Soc. Econ. Paleontol. Mineral., Spec. Publ. 23: 177-192.

Sadura S, Martini IP, Endres AL, Wolf K. 2006. Morphology and GPR stratigraphy of
a frontal part of an end moraine of the Laurentide Ice Sheet: Paris Moraine near
Guelph, ON, Canada. Geomorphology 75(1-2): 212-225. DOI:
10.1016/j.geomorph.2005.01.014

Saunderson HC. 1977. The sliding bed facies in esker sands and gravels: a criterion
for full-pipe (tunnel) flow? Sedimentology 24(5): 623-638. DOI: 10.1111/j.13653091.1977.tb00261.x

Schaetzl RJ, Enander H, Luehmann MD, Lusch DP, Fish C, Bigsby M, Steigmeyer M,
Guasco J, Forgacs C, Pollyea A. 2013. Mapping the physiography of Michigan
using GIS. Physical Geography 34:1-38. DOI: 10.1080/02723646.2013.778531

Schaetzl RJ, Lepper K, Thomas SE, Grove L, Treiber E, Farmer A, Fillmore A, Lee J,
Dickerson B, Alme K. 2017. Kame deltas provide evidence for a new glacial lake
and suggest early glacial retreat from central Lower Michigan, USA.
Geomorphology 280: 167-178. DOI: 10.1016/j.geomorph.2016.11.013

Shulmeister J. 1989. Flood deposits in the Tweed esker (southern Ontario, Canada).
Sedimentary Geology 65(1-2): 153-163. DOI: 10.1016/0037-0738(89)90012-2

Spagnolo M, King EC, Ashmore DW, Rea BR. Ely JC, Clark CD. 2014. Looking
through drumlins: testing the application of ground-penetrating radar. Journal of
Glaciology 60(224): 1126-1134. DOI: 10.3189/2014JoG14J110

- Stanley KE, Schaetzl RJ. 2011. Characteristics and paleoenvironmental significance
  of a thin, dual-sourced loess sheet, north-central Wisconsin. Aeolian Research 2(4):
  241-251. DOI: 10.1016/j.aeolia.2011.01.001
- 1000 Storrar R, Ewertowski M, Tomczyk AM, Barr ID, Livingstone SJ, Ruffell A, Stoker BJ,

Evans DJA. In revision. Polyphase development and preservation potential of complex eskers. Boreas. Pre-print available at: https://eartharxiv.org/me879/

1003 Thomas GSP, Montague E. 1997. The morphology, stratigraphy and sedimentology

of the Carstairs Esker, Scotland, UK. Quaternary Science Reviews 16(7): 661-674.

1005 DOI: 10.1016/S0277-3791(97)00014-0

1006Trotter FM. 1929. The glaciation of eastern Edenside, the Alston block, and the1007Carlisle plain. Quarterly Journal of the Geological Society 85(1-4): 549-612. DOI:

1008 10.1144/GSL.JGS.1929.085.01-04.17

1009 van der Meer JJM, Kjær KH, Krüger J, Rabassa J, Kilfeather AA. 2009. Under

1010 pressure: clastic dykes in glacial settings. Quaternary Science Reviews 28(7-8):

1011 708-720. DOI: 10.1016/j.quascirev.2008.07.017

Warren WP, Ashley GM. 1994. Origins of the ice-contact stratified ridges (eskers) of
Ireland. Journal of Sedimentary Research 64(3a): 433-449. DOI:
10.1306/D4267DD9-2B26-11D7-8648000102C1865D

1015	Winsemann J, Lang J, Polom U, Loewer M, Ige J, Pollok L, Brandes C. 2018. Ice-
1016	marginal forced regressive deltas in glacial lake basins: geomorphology, facies
1017	variability and large-scale depositional architecture. Boreas 47(4): 973-1002. DOI:
1018	https://doi.org/10.1111/bor.12317

- Woodward J, Burke MJ. 2007. Applications of ground-penetrating radar to glacial and
   frozen materials. Journal of Environmental and Engineering Geophysics 12(1): 69 85.
- 1022 Woodworth JB. 1894. Some typical eskers of southern New England. Proceedings of
- the Boston Society of Natural History 26: 197-220.