UNIVERSITY of York

This is a repository copy of What type of environmental assessment and modification prevents falls in community dwelling older people?.

White Rose Research Online URL for this paper: <u>https://eprints.whiterose.ac.uk/146809/</u>

Version: Published Version

## Article:

Pighills, Alison, Drummond, Avril, Crossland, Shelley et al. (1 more author) (2019) What type of environmental assessment and modification prevents falls in community dwelling older people? BMJ. 1880. ISSN 1756-1833

https://doi.org/10.1136/bmj.1880

## Reuse

Items deposited in White Rose Research Online are protected by copyright, with all rights reserved unless indicated otherwise. They may be downloaded and/or printed for private study, or other acts as permitted by national copyright laws. The publisher or other rights holders may allow further reproduction and re-use of the full text version. This is indicated by the licence information on the White Rose Research Online record for the item.

## Takedown

If you consider content in White Rose Research Online to be in breach of UK law, please notify us by emailing eprints@whiterose.ac.uk including the URL of the record and the reason for the withdrawal request.



eprints@whiterose.ac.uk https://eprints.whiterose.ac.uk/



## BMJ 2019;364:1880 doi: 10.1136/bmj.1880 (Published 14 March 2019)

# PRACTICE



## UNCERTAINTIES

# What type of environmental assessment and modification prevents falls in community dwelling older people?

Alison Pighills *principal research fellow*<sup>1</sup> *adjunct associate professor*<sup>1</sup>, Avril Drummond *professor*<sup>2</sup>, Shelley Crossland *occupational therapist*<sup>3</sup>, David J Torgerson *professor*<sup>4</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Mackay Institute of Research and Innovation, Queensland Health, Mackay Base Hospital, Queensland 4740/College of Healthcare Sciences, James Cook University, Townsville, Queensland, Australia; <sup>2</sup>School of Health Sciences, University of Nottingham, Nottingham, UK; <sup>3</sup>Mental Health Services for Older People, Leicestershire Partnership NHS Trust, Leicester, UK; <sup>4</sup>York Trials Unit, Department of Health Sciences, University of York, York, UK

## What you need to know

- Evidence suggests that environmental interventions can prevent falls in older people at high risk of falls, but they have little or no benefit in people at low risk
- Offer environmental assessment and modification led by an occupational therapist to people over 65 who have had a fall in the past year, use a mobility aid, need assistance with any activities of daily living, take psychoactive medications, or are concerned about falling
- Environmental assessment and modification encompasses a comprehensive, validated functional assessment of the individual in their home environment, a joint problem solving approach, and follow-up as required

One third of people over the age of 65 experience a fall.<sup>1</sup> The health and social care costs of falls are increasing with longevity.<sup>23</sup> Falls are one of the leading causes of morbidity and death caused by injury in people over 75. Nearly a quarter of older people who fall are concerned about further falls, and some restrict activity. This can result in physical deconditioning, increased risk of future falls, institutionalisation, and reduced quality of life.<sup>4</sup>

Box 1 lists features that predispose older people to falls.<sup>5</sup>

## Box 1: Risk factors for falls in community dwelling older people

Age (≥ 65) History of falls in the past year Use of mobility device, such as a walking aid Requiring assistance for any activities of daily living Use of psychoactive medications Fear of falling

## We categorise falls risk as

**High falls risk**—  $\geq$ 65 years, have a history of falls, and also possess one or more of the other risk factors for falls

Moderate risk of falls—  $\geq$ 65 years and possess one of the above additional risk factors

Low falls risk—Possess only one falls risk factor

Risk factors for falls can be categorised as

- Intrinsic (personal risk factors such as age and gender)
- Extrinsic (environmental risk factors/environmental hazards)
- Behavioural (activity related risk factors).67

Environmental hazards, such as trailing cables and poor lighting, are linked to 30-50% of falls in observational studies.<sup>18</sup> Guidelines in Australia,<sup>9</sup> the US,<sup>10</sup> and Britain<sup>611</sup> recommend interventions to reduce environmental hazards for older people at risk of falling. However, it remains uncertain whether environmental assessment and modification reduces falls in high risk older people, and which healthcare workers most effectively provide this intervention.

Box 2 gives examples of environmental interventions. Such interventions are typically provided by occupational therapists

Correspondence to A Pighills alison.pighills@health.qld.gov.au

who specialise in environmental assessment and modification. However, in research studies, environmental interventions have been provided by healthcare support workers and healthcare professionals such as nurses and physiotherapists. The intensity of environmental assessment and modification ranges from hazard screening checklists, administered without the older person necessarily being present, to high intensity intervention comprising a comprehensive functional assessment of the older person in their home environment. Thus, the level of expertise of the healthcare worker and the intensity of the environmental intervention are likely to influence the outcome.

## Box 2: Types of environmental intervention to reduce risk of falls

- Assessment and modification of the environment and tasks performed, including raising awareness of risks of falls and problem solving with the older person to find solutions
- Home modifications to improve task performance, independence and/or safety (eg, modifying a shower to improve access)
- Assistive technology to maintain or improve independence (eg, provision of mobility aids, grab rails, and personal alarms)

## What is the evidence of uncertainty?

## Search strategy

We searched the Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews, Medline, Embase, and CINAHL (Cumulative Index to Nursing and Allied Health Literature) for studies published between 2010 and 2017. We applied English language and peer reviewed journal restrictions. We used the following terms for the literature search:

"accidental falls," "fall\*," "frail elderly," "aged," "older\*," "elder\*," "senior\*," "home N5 (assessment or intervention or design or hazard or modification or safety)," "home N3 hazard N3 reduction N3 visit\*," "equipment," "adaptation\*," "assistive technology," "enviro\*," "N5 (assessment or design or hazard or modification or safety or risk)," "facility design and construction."

We found four systematic reviews of trials on environmental assessment and modification in community dwelling older people, including a Cochrane Review which included eight randomised controlled trials isolating the clinical effectiveness of environmental assessment and modification, and four clinical guidelines.

Best evidence suggests a possible benefit of high intensity occupational therapist led environmental assessment and modification in reducing falls in high risk populations.<sup>12-15</sup> These led to a reduction in falls of 19-21% in all risk categories and around a 38-39% reduction in high risk groups.<sup>1213</sup> Specialism in environmental assessment (eg, by occupational therapists) and participant risk profile are likely to influence effectiveness of the intervention. Falls prevention interventions have less effect when delivered by health workers other than occupational therapists or to low risk populations.<sup>12</sup>Figure 1 presents a summary of the systematic reviews (all data are in the supplementary files with this article). Of the trials that isolate environmental assessment and modification, five studies showed a statistically significant reduction in falls in high risk participants through high intensity, occupational therapist led environmental assessment and modification.3 16-19 The remaining three trials found no effect on falls when low intensity interventions were provided by other professionals<sup>20</sup> or trained support workers to both high and low risk populations.<sup>21 22</sup>

Methodological weaknesses and the small sample sizes in studies mean that it is difficult to ascertain which interventions are effective. Most studies include people at low risk of falls and there is considerable variation in the expertise of the healthcare worker delivering the intervention and in the intensity of the intervention. Some studies incorporated a checklist/screen as opposed to a functional environmental assessment.

## Is ongoing research likely to provide relevant evidence?

We searched the Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews, ClinicalTrials.gov, the World Health Organization, and Australian New Zealand Clinical Trials Registry for research protocols on environmental assessment and modification; environmental interventions; occupational therapy; falls prevention; and community dwelling older people.

Ongoing research is likely to add to the evidence on the clinical effectiveness of environmental interventions delivered by occupational therapists for falls prevention. The question of whether trained home care support workers and other professionals can deliver environmental assessment and modification still needs to be addressed.

We found two ongoing studies: a small study (15 participants) in Chicago investigating an occupational therapist led falls prevention intervention to reduce fear of falling, and the Occupational Therapy Intervention Study (OTIS) which we are conducting. The OTIS trial aims to evaluate effectiveness of occupational therapist led environmental assessment and modification delivered to older people at moderate to high risk of falls.<sup>23</sup> To date, 1331 older people have been randomised to high intensity environmental assessment and modification or usual care control. The trial is in the follow-up phase, in which fall events are being recorded over one year. Follow-up is scheduled to be completed in late 2019. This trial will add to the evidence base on whether occupational therapist led environmental assessment and modification delivered to people at moderate to people at moderate to high risk is clinically effective in preventing falls.

## **Recommendations for future research**

Large trials in community dwelling older people  ${\geq}65$  at high risk of falls to evaluate whether:

- Occupational therapist led environmental assessment and modification
   is clinically effective compared with usual care controls
- High intensity environmental assessment and modification is as clinically
  effective in reducing falls if delivered by other trained professionals as
  compared with occupational therapists
- Intensive follow-up to implement recommendations, immediately after occupational therapist led environmental assessment and modification, produces a greater reduction in falls than no follow-up or a single follow-up visit. A nested project to identify the most effective level of follow-up would enable resources to be deployed efficiently
- Qualitative studies to understand what occupational therapists consider in their clinical reasoning when carrying out environmental assessment and modification. This would help determine what the important elements are and inform future staff training

# What should we do in the light of the uncertainty?

We recommend that occupational therapist led environmental assessment and modification is only offered to older people at high risk of falls (box 1).<sup>561213</sup> This appears pragmatic given the lack of evidence on benefit in moderate or low risk people, and considering the cost and resource implications of occupational therapists intervening with people in all risk categories.

In the United Kingdom, guidelines from the National Institute for Health and Care Excellence (NICE) and the College of Occupational Therapists recommend that occupational therapist led environmental assessment and modification is routinely provided for older people at risk of falling or who are admitted to hospital following a fall.<sup>611</sup> This has not routinely happened, however, as indicated by recent qualitative and implementation research.<sup>24 25</sup> This could be due to a perceived lack of robust evidence, limited awareness of clinical guidelines, complexity of the intervention, and a perceived lack of practitioner skill and time to carry out the assessment.<sup>24</sup>

When referring older people at high risk of falls for occupational therapy intervention, explain to your patient that the occupational therapist will support them to identify hazards in the home and those activities which might increase the risk of falling, and that the therapist and patient will jointly consider solutions.<sup>13</sup> Active engagement of older people in environmental interventions is vital. The context, environment, use of environment, and a person's capacity are key features of environmental assessment and modification to reduce falls risk. Occupational therapy practice aims to enhance, restore, or create a balance between these elements. Interventions encompassing functional assessment of the individual will be more effective, rather than a checklist style hazard removal.

#### Education into practice

- How would you assess whether an older person is at high risk of falls?
- What would you include in a comprehensive environmental assessment, who would provide it, and which patients would you offer it to?
- Of the frail older patients that you treated in the last year following a fall, how many received an environmental assessment and functional assessment in their home with follow-up?

## How patients were involved in the creation of this article

A member of the OTIS Consumer Reference Group reviewed the manuscript and provided feedback. We thank her for her input. As a result, we changed the article in the following ways:

- · We clarified the term "community dwelling"
- We specified that only some, not all, of those who are fearful of falling subsequently restrict their activity
- We provided more information on factors causing escalation in the cost of falls

#### What patients need to know

- If you are 65 or over and live in the community, your risk of falls in the future is higher if you have had a fall in the past year, use a mobility aid, need assistance with any activities of daily living, take psychoactive medications, or are concerned about falling
- It is likely that environmental assessment and modification, provided by an occupational therapist, would reduce your risk of future falls
- An occupational therapist visits your home to assess and recommend modifications to the environment and tasks that you perform. This may reduce falls hazards and improve your independence and/or safety. The therapist would also consider whether assistive technology might help to maintain or improve your independence
- Occupational therapists typically ask you to identify what you think puts you at risk of falling and you jointly problem solve and agree on solutions.

**Competing interests** *The BMJ* has judged that there are no disqualifying financial ties to commercial companies. The authors declare the following other interests: None.

Further details of BMJ policy on financial interests is here: https://www.bmj.com/ about-bmj/resources-authors/forms-policies-and-checklists/declaration-competinginterests Provenance and peer review: commissioned; externally peer reviewed. Patient consent not applicable.

- Tinetti ME, Speechley M, Ginter SF. Risk factors for falls among elderly persons living in the community. N Engl J Med 1988;319:1701-7. 10.1056/NEJM198812293192604 3205267
- 2 Scuffham P, Chaplin S, Legood R. Incidence and costs of unintentional falls in older people in the United Kingdom. J Epidemiol Community Health 2003;57:740-4. 10.1136/jech.57.9.740 12933783
- 3 Campbell AJ, Robertson MC, La Grow SJ, etal. Randomised controlled trial of prevention of falls in people aged > or =75 with severe visual impairment: the VIP trial. *BMJ* 2005;331:817. 10.1136/bmj.38601.447731.55 16183652
- 4 Jørstad EC, Hauer K, Becker C, Lamb SEProFaNE Group. Measuring the psychological outcomes of falling: a systematic review. J Am Geriatr Soc 2005;53:501-10. 10.1111/j.1532-5415.2005.53172.x 15743297
- 5 Lusardi MM, Fritz S, Middleton A, etal . Determining risk of falls in community dwelling older adults: a systematic review and meta-analysis using post test probability. J Geriatr Phys Ther 2017;40:1-36. 10.1519/JPT.00000000000099 27537070
- 6 College of Occupational Therapists. Falls: the role of occupational therapy in the prevention and management of falls—practice guideline. London: COT Ltd; 2015. https://www.rcot. co.uk/practice-resources/rcot-practice-guidelines/falls
- 7 Lawton MP, Windley PG, Byers TD, eds. Ageing and the environment: theoretical approaches, Springer, 1982.
- 8 Rubenstein LZ. Falls in older people: epidemiology, risk factors and strategies for prevention. Age Ageing 2006;35(Suppl 2):ii37-41. 10.1093/ageing/afi084 16926202
- 9 Australian Commission on Safety and Quality in Healthcare. Preventing falls and harm from falls in older people: Best Practice Guidelines for Australian Community Care. Canberra: Commonwealth of Australia; 2009.
- 10 AGS/BGS clinical practice guideline. Prevention of falls in older persons. 2010. http:// www.americangeriatrics.org/health\_care\_professionals/clinical\_practice/clinical\_guidelines\_ recommendations/2010/.
- 11 National Institute for Health and Care Excellence. Falls in older people: quality standard 2015. nice.org.uk/guidance/qs86.
- 12 Gillespie LD, Robertson MC, Gillespie WJ, etal. Interventions for preventing falls in older people living in the community. *Cochrane Database Syst Rev* 2012;9:CD007146.22972103
- 13 Clemson L, Mackenzie L, Ballinger C, Close JC, Cumming RG. Environmental interventions to prevent falls in community-dwelling older people: a meta-analysis of randomized trials. J Aging Health 2008;20:954-71. 10.1177/0898264308324672 18815408
- 14 Chang JT, Morton SC, Rubenstein LZ, etal. Interventions for the prevention of falls in older adults: systematic review and meta-analysis of randomised clinical trials. *BMJ* 2004;328:680-3. 10.1136/bmj.328.7441.680 15031239
- 15 Tricco AC, Thomas SM, Veroniki AA, etal. Comparisons of interventions for preventing falls in older adults: A systematic review and meta-analysis. *JAMA* 2017;318:1687-99. 10.1001/jama.2017.15006 29114830
- 16 Nikolaus T, Bach M. Preventing falls in community-dwelling frail older people using a home intervention team (HIT): results from the randomized Falls-HIT trial. J Am Geriatr Soc 2003;51:300-5. 10.1046/j.1532-5415.2003.51102.x 12588572
- 17 Chu MM-L, Fong KN-K, Lit AC-H, etal . An occupational therapy fall reduction home visit program for community-dwelling older adults in Hong Kong after an emergency department visit for a fall. J Am Geriatr Soc 2017;65:364-72. 10.1111/jgs.14527 27858951
- 18 Pighills AC, Torgerson DJ, Sheldon TA, Drummond AE, Bland JM. Environmental assessment and modification to prevent falls in older people. J Am Geriatr Soc 2011;59:26-33. 10.1111/j.1532-5415.2010.03221.x 21226674
- 19 Cumming RG, Thomas M, Szonyi G, etal . Home visits by an occupational therapist for assessment and modification of environmental hazards: a randomized trial of falls prevention. J Am Geriatr Soc 1999;47:1397-402. 10.1111/j.1532-5415.1999.ib01556.x 10591231
- 20 Day L, Fildes B, Gordon I, Fitzharris M, Flamer H, Lord S. Randomised factorial trial of falls prevention among older people living in their own homes. *BMJ* 2002;325:128-31. 10.1136/bmj.325.7356.128 12130606
- 21 Stevens M, Holman CD, Bennett N, de Klerk N, de Klerk N. Preventing falls in older people: outcome evaluation of a randomized controlled trial. J Am Geriatr Soc 2001;49:1448-55. 10.1046/j.1532-5415.2001.4911236.x 11890582
- 22 Lin M-R, Wolf SL, Hwang H-F, Gong S-Y, Chen C-Y. A randomized, controlled trial of fall prevention programs and quality of life in older fallers. J Am Geriatr Soc 2007;55:499-506. 10.1111/j.1532-5415.2007.01146.x 17397426
- 23 Cockayne S, Pighills A, Adamson J, etal. OTIS study. Can occupational therapist-led home environmental assessment prevent falls in older people? A modified cohort randomised controlled trial protocol. *BMJ Open* 2018;8:e022488. 10.1136/bmiooen-2018-022488 30206086
- 24 Clemson L, Donaldson A, Hill K, Day L. Implementing person-environment approaches to prevent falls: a qualitative inquiry in applying the Westmead approach to occupational therapy home visits. *Aust Occup Ther J* 2014;61:325-34. 10.1111/1440-1630.12132.24825447
- 25 Pighills A, Furness L, Rawle M, Tynan A. Occupational therapist led environmental assessment and modification (EAM) to prevent falls: Current practice in an Australian rural health service district. *Aust Occup Ther J* 201910.1111/1440-1630.12560.

Published by the BMJ Publishing Group Limited. For permission to use (where not already granted under a licence) please go to http://group.bmj.com/group/rights-licensing/ permissions

|                      | INCLUDED STUDIES         |                               |  |   | POOLED ESTIMATES |   |                    |               | IMPLICATIONS |   |   |
|----------------------|--------------------------|-------------------------------|--|---|------------------|---|--------------------|---------------|--------------|---|---|
|                      | Trials                   | Participants                  | Interventions  | 0 | 00               | 0   | Point estim<br>0.2 | ate, 9<br>0.6 |              | Clinical implications   | Uncertainty   |
| Chang et al          | <b>(</b> 5               | Unable to isolate             | EAM<br>(Environmental<br>assessment and<br>modification) |   | •                | Adjusted risk ratio<br>for falling during follow-up<br>Adjusted incidence rate<br>for monthly rate of falling | 2                  |               | +            | Environmental modification<br>deemed not to be effective in<br>reducing falls   | Pooled estimates no<br>statistically significar                                   |
| 2008 Clemson et al   |                          | <b>i</b> 3298<br><b>i</b> 570 | 2<br>Environmental<br>modification                       | * |                  | Relative risk<br>All participants<br>Relative risk<br>Participants at high risk                               | 5                  | -             | +            | High quality environmental<br>interventions with adequate<br>follow-up can significantly<br>reduce falls  | The 4 trials with high<br>risk populations were<br>relatively small               |
| 2012 Gillespie et al | <b>1</b> 6<br><b>1</b> 7 | <b>i</b> 4208                 | Exercise, vision<br>assessment<br>and treatment          | - | 3                | Rate ratio<br>Rate of falls<br>Relative risk<br>Risk of falling   | 5                  |               | •            | Home safety interventions<br>reduce the rate and risk of<br>falls. More effective in high<br>risk groups and if delivered<br>by an occupational therapist | Cannot isolate<br>effect of risk profile<br>and occupational<br>therapist led EAM |
| 2017 Tricco et al    | Unable                   | to isolate                    | Exercise,<br>education,<br>hip protectors                | - | -                | Odds ratio     Risk of falls     Odds ratio     Risk of injurious falls                                       |                    | •             |              | Environmental interventions<br>reduced falls when combined<br>with exercise and other<br>interventions  | EAM in isolation did<br>not reduce injurious<br>falls or falls risk               |

Fig 1 Summary of systematic reviews of environmental management for falls prevention