UNIVERSITY OF LEEDS

This is a repository copy of Subgrain Rotation Recrystallization During Shearing: Insights From Full-Field Numerical Simulations of Halite Polycrystals.

White Rose Research Online URL for this paper: http://eprints.whiterose.ac.uk/135921/

Version: Accepted Version

Article:

Gomez-Rivas, E, Griera, A, Llorens, M-G et al. (3 more authors) (2017) Subgrain Rotation Recrystallization During Shearing: Insights From Full-Field Numerical Simulations of Halite Polycrystals. Journal of Geophysical Research: Solid Earth, 122 (11). pp. 8810-8827. ISSN 2169-9313

https://doi.org/10.1002/2017JB014508

©2017. American Geophysical Union. All Rights Reserved. This is the peer reviewed version of the following article: Gomez-Rivas, E, Griera, A, Llorens, M-G et al. (3 more authors) (2017) Subgrain Rotation Recrystallization During Shearing: Insights From Full-Field Numerical Simulations of Halite Polycrystals. Journal of Geophysical Research: Solid Earth, 122 (11). pp. 8810-8827 which has been published in final form at https://doi.org/10.1002/2017JB014508. This article may be used for non-commercial purposes in accordance with AGU terms and Conditions for Use of Self-Archived Versions.

Reuse

Items deposited in White Rose Research Online are protected by copyright, with all rights reserved unless indicated otherwise. They may be downloaded and/or printed for private study, or other acts as permitted by national copyright laws. The publisher or other rights holders may allow further reproduction and re-use of the full text version. This is indicated by the licence information on the White Rose Research Online record for the item.

Takedown

If you consider content in White Rose Research Online to be in breach of UK law, please notify us by emailing eprints@whiterose.ac.uk including the URL of the record and the reason for the withdrawal request.



eprints@whiterose.ac.uk https://eprints.whiterose.ac.uk/

Subgrain rotation recrystallization during shearing: insights from full-field 1 numerical simulations of halite polycrystals 2 3 E. Gomez-Rivas¹, A. Griera², M. -G. Llorens³, P. D. Bons³, R. A. Lebensohn⁴, and S. 4 Piazolo⁵ 5 ¹School of Geosciences, King's College, University of Aberdeen, Aberdeen AB24 3UE, United 6 Kingdom 7 ²Departament de Geologia, Universitat Autònoma de Barcelona, 08193 Bellaterra (Cerdanyola 8 del Vallès), Spain 9 ³Department of Geosciences, Eberhard Karls University of Tübingen, Wilhelmstr. 56, 72074 10 Tübingen, Germany 11 ⁴Materials Science and Technology Division, Los Alamos National Laboratory, Los Alamos NM 12 87545, USA 13 ⁵School of Earth and Environment, University of Leeds, Leeds LS2 9JT, United Kingdom 14 15 Corresponding author: Enrique Gomez-Rivas (e.gomez-rivas@abdn.ac.uk) 16 17 **Key Points:** 18 Full-field numerical simulations of subgrain rotation recrystallization, able to reproduce • 19 experiments, are presented for first time 20 • Intracrystalline recovery strongly decreases grain size reduction but does not change 21 crystal preferred orientations 22 • Mean subgrain misorientations can be used as a strain gauge for polycrystals undergoing 23 recrystallization, following a universal law 24

25

26 Abstract

We present, for the first time, results of full-field numerical simulations of subgrain rotation 27 recrystallization of halite polycrystals during simple shear deformation. The series of simulations 28 show how microstructures are controlled by the competition between (i) grain size reduction by 29 dislocation creep and (ii) intracrystalline recovery encompassing subgrain coarsening (SGC) by 30 31 coalescence through rotation and alignment of the lattices of neighboring subgrains. A strong grain size reduction develops in models without intracrystalline recovery, as a result of the 32 formation of high-angle grain boundaries when local misorientations exceed 15°. The activation 33 of subgrain coarsening associated with recovery decreases the stored strain energy and results in 34 grains with low intracrystalline heterogeneities. However, this type of recrystallization does not 35 significantly modify crystal preferred orientations. Lattice orientation and grain boundary maps 36 reveal that this full-field modelling approach is able to successfully reproduce the evolution of 37 dry halite microstructures from laboratory deformation experiments, thus opening new 38 opportunities in this field of research. We demonstrate how the mean subgrain boundary 39 misorientations can be used to estimate the strain accommodated by dislocation creep using a 40 universal scaling exponent of about 2/3, as predicted by theoretical models. In addition, this 41 strain gauge can be potentially applied to estimate the intensity of intracrystalline recovery, 42

43 associated with temperature, using EBSD maps in areas with strain gradients.

44 **1 Introduction**

Understanding rock deformation microstructures is essential to unravel tectonic processes 45 and to predict physical properties of crustal and mantle rocks. Polycrystalline aggregates 46 typically develop crystal preferred orientations (CPO) and may lead to strongly anisotropic 47 behavior when they are deformed by dislocation creep [Urai et al., 1986; Passchier and Trouw, 48 2005]. Halite (NaCl) is a widely used mineral to understand the behavior of rocks deformed in 49 the ductile regime. It has very special properties, since it is nearly incompressible, highly soluble, 50 has a very low permeability, and can flow ductily in the solid state under relatively low stresses. 51 Therefore, it is widely used for deformation and recrystallization experiments, and is an accepted 52 53 analogue material for silicates that deform ductily at much higher temperatures and pressures [e.g., Guillope and Poirier, 1979]. At low temperature and dry conditions halite deforms by 54 dislocation creep, with subgrain rotation [SGR; e.g., Urai et al., 1986; Trimby et al., 2000] being 55 the dominant recrystallization mechanism [regime 2 of Hirth and Tullis, 1992]. This results in an 56 anisotropic behavior with the development of strong intracrystalline heterogeneities. SGR is 57 linked to the formation of subgrain boundaries as a consequence of strain, and is also associated 58 with the reduction of free energy by the activation of intracrystalline processes that result in the 59 reorganization of subgrains (recovery) [e.g., Halfpenny et al., 2006; Karato, 2012]. Two main 60 processes influence the formation of subgrain boundaries: (i) annihilation of dislocations of 61 opposite signs and (ii) polygonization, which consists on the alignment of dislocations 62 [Humphreys and Hatherly, 2004; Borthwick and Piazolo, 2010]. In such a situation, dislocations 63 move and interact to form low-angle subgrain boundaries (LAGB), leading to an increase in 64 misorientation between subgrains [Urai et al., 1986]. Progressive strain increases this 65 misorientation angle until a critical value is reached, allowing the subgrains to become new 66 grains as their boundaries achieve high angles (HAGB). This critical angle ranges between 10° 67 and 15°, when the distances between dislocations are similar to the atomic ones [Karato, 2012]. 68 69 This process results in a strong grain size reduction with increasing deformation and the formation of recrystallized grains that tend to have a size similar to that of the subgrains. 70

71 Several studies have analyzed the development of low-angle boundaries and how 72 misorientations are related to strain. Two types of dislocation boundaries are distinguished [Kuhlmann-Wilsdorf and Hansen, 1991; Pantleon, 2001]: incidental dislocation boundaries 73 74 (IDBs), which result from statistical mutual trapping of dislocations, and geometrically necessary boundaries (GNBs), which form due to the activation of different sets of slip systems or the 75 different activity of the same set of slip systems on each side of the boundary. Hughes et al. 76 [1997; 1998; 2003] proposed a material-independent universal scaling behavior between the 77 average misorientation (θ_{av}) of the system and the natural strain (ε) using metal deformation 78 experiments. Pantleon [1997; 1998; 2001] and Sethna and Coffman [2003] confirmed these 79 scaling laws and provided explanations for the misorientation distributions and their scaling 80 laws, focusing on metals. Pennock et al. [2005] proposed a new approach, in which 81 misorientations are measured on a grain basis, and obtained a slightly different scaling law. If 82 this universal scaling also applies to rocks, this strain gauge can be a useful tool, since it allows 83 the estimation of strain by measuring misorientations from deformed samples with electron 84 backscatter diffraction analysis (EBSD). However, this method has only been applied to cases of 85 coaxial deformation, and the interplay between dislocation creep and synchronous recovery of 86 87 intracrystalline defects or post-deformation annealing can result in a substantial modification of the microstructure and the reduction of subgrain misorientations associated with the decrease of 88 free energy (i.e., boundary and strain stored energies). This process can strongly affect 89 90 microstructures in halite and other materials [Borthwick and Piazolo, 2010], thus potentially hindering the use of subgrain misorientations as a strain gauge. 91

92 Numerical simulation is a very useful tool that can complement the study of natural and experimental samples, because it allows analysis of the effects of single or coupled deformation 93 processes in a wide range of deformation scenarios and for systems with variable material 94 95 properties. Moreover, simulations can overcome some of the limitations of experiments, because variable sample sizes can be studied, and also high finite strain can be achieved at low strain 96 rates. The numerical evolution of textures and crystallographic preferred orientations (CPOs) of 97 98 polycrystalline aggregates has been widely investigated using kinematic [e.g., D-REX, Kaminsky and Ribe, 2001] and self-consistent approaches, such as the viscoplastic self-consistent 99 formulation (VPSC) [Wenk et al., 1989; Lebensohn et al., 2003]. The VPSC method models the 100 reorientation of grains through intracrystalline slip and grain interaction assuming a homogenous 101 equivalent matrix. It adequately predicts lattice rotations depending on the slip system activity, 102 and shows results similar to those observed in experiments or predicted by finite element models 103 [see Lebensohn et al., 2003]. However, these methods have the limitation that they only simulate 104 viscoplastic deformation and that dynamic recrystallization is only incorporated by using 105 probabilistic models. For instance, Signorelli and Tommasi [2015] successfully simulated 106 subgrain rotation recrystallization and the resulting CPOs in olivine with the VPSC approach, but 107 using an ad hoc probabilistic law for grain size reduction. In a similar way, the kinematical code 108 D-REX [Kaminsky and Ribe, 2001] incorporates dynamic recrystallization processes through 109 two dimensionless parameters that account for grain boundary migration and nucleation. 110 111 However, all these methods are not full-field, and therefore cannot model the full range of intracrystalline heterogeneities and intercrystalline interactions that develop in polycrystals. 112 Apart from these disadvantages, all the methods mentioned above do not allow to visualize the 113 explicit evolution of the microstructures with deformation and are only restricted to the texture, 114 and sometimes grain size evolution. 115

Recently, a full-field crystal viscoplastic approach based on the Fast Fourier Transform 116 117 (VPFFT) [Lebensohn, 2001; Lebensohn et al., 2008] has been integrated within the ELLE software platform [Jessell et al., 2001] to simulate coupled geological processes during 118 119 deformation and metamorphism [Griera et al., 2011; Griera et al., 2013; Llorens et al., 2016a; Llorens et al., 2016b; Llorens et al., 2017; Steinbach et al., 2017]. In this model the laws 120 controlling grain size reduction and intracrystalline recovery are defined from the mapped 121 variation of misorientations related to the relative misfit between local lattice orientations, 122 providing a more realistic framework for the simulation of microstructures. Additionally, this 123 code is able to simulate the spatial evolution of deformation, which has a strong influence on the 124 resulting microstructures, and can model processes such as strain localization up to high strain 125 [Llorens et al., 2016b]. This method allows a full control on the relative contribution of each 126 deformation mechanism during microstructure evolution. Finally, although VPFFT/ELLE is 127 expensive in computational time, it provides results in the same format as those obtained with 128 EBSD analysis from natural and experimental samples, allowing direct comparisons. 129

This contribution presents numerical simulations of pure halite deformation and 130 recrystallization under dry conditions at relatively low temperatures (< 200°C) up to a shear 131 strain of four, with the aim of understanding the behavior of polycrystalline aggregates 132 undergoing subgrain rotation recrystallization. At these temperatures, the rate of grain boundary 133 134 migration (GBM) is negligible, hence only intracrystalline recovery is considered here. We briefly introduce the VPFFT/ELLE method and present a series of numerical experiments in 135 which a polycrystalline aggregate is deformed varying the strength along halite slip systems. 136 Viscoplastic deformation is coupled with a process that simulates intracrystalline recovery 137 associated with the decrease of free energy by subgrain rotation. In this way, we evaluate the 138 competition between dislocation creep and recovery, and show how the interplay between these 139 processes influences the resulting microstructures. Moreover, we assess the use of subgrain 140 misorientations as a strain gauge in situations of simple shear deformation incorporating dynamic 141 recrystallization by subgrain rotation and recovery. Since most rocks undergo intracrystalline 142 143 recovery during and after deformation, we aim to understand how this process affects the strain gauge and whether misorientations can also be used to unravel the environmental conditions 144 associated with recovery (i.e., temperature). The numerical results match well those from coaxial 145 experiments by Pennock et al. [2005], torsion experiments by Armann [2008] or CPO modelling 146 by Wenk et al. [2009], and allow the study of microstructures in a much wider range of 147 conditions than those in the laboratory. This numerical method is not restricted to halite, but can 148 also be applied to less studied and less accessible polycrystalline aggregates of minerals with a 149 similar structure and slip systems, such as magnesiowüstite in the lower mantle. 150

151 2 Methods

The microstructural evolution of a pure halite polycrystalline aggregate during 152 deformation creep and recrystallization is numerically simulated using the software platform 153 ELLE [Jessell et al., 2001; http://www.elle.ws]. ELLE is open-source software for the simulation 154 of rock microstructures during deformation and metamorphism. Our models are based on the 155 coupling of a full-field viscoplastic formulation based on the Fast Fourier Transform (VPFFT 156 code; Lebensohn [2001]; Lebensohn et al. [2008]) and ELLE modules to simulate recovery 157 [Borthwick et al., 2014]. ELLE has been successfully used to model a range of coupled 158 microstructural processes, such as static grain growth, strain localization, dynamic 159

160 recrystallization, rotation of rigid objects in anisotropic rocks and coupled deformation and

recrystallization of polar ice [e.g., *Griera et al.*, 2011; *Griera et al.*, 2013; *Llorens et al.*, 2016a;

Llorens et al., 2016b; *Llorens et al.*, 2017; *Steinbach et al.*, 2017, and references thereof]. The

163 last four of these studies made use of the coupled VPFFT/ELLE approach that it is utilized for 164 our simulations. This method allows simulating deformation of a polycrystalline aggregate by

our simulations. This method allows simulating deformation of a polycrystalline aggregate by dislocation creep and dynamic recrystallization up to high strains, similar to those observed in

165 dislocation creep and dy166 nature.

167 The VPFFT code calculates lattice rotations associated with viscoplastic deformation. From these data, recrystallization processes such as grain boundary migration, new grain 168 nucleation or intracrystalline recovery can be simulated using ELLE processes (see descriptions 169 below). In the present study, only the process of recovery is considered, while grain boundary 170 migration, new grain nucleation and grain boundary sliding are deliberately not incorporated. 171 This contribution therefore aims to study the process of subgrain rotation recrystallization in 172 isolation, prior to its coupling with other recrystallization processes in future studies. Our 173 simulations thus cover the idealized regime II (rotational-recrystallization dominated) of Hirth 174 and Tullis [1992]. This is coherent with results from pure-halite deformation experiments under 175 dry conditions and relatively low temperatures (lower than 200°C), where the three last processes 176 are not active [Urai et al., 2008]. We therefore concentrate on the analysis of the competition 177 between (i) grain size reduction caused by dislocation creep and (ii) subgrain coarsening by 178 coalescence through rotation and alignment of the lattices of neighboring subgrains (SGC), 179 associated with intracrystalline recovery. The recovery (SGC) process reduces subgrain 180 misorientations associated with the decrease of free energy (i.e., boundary and stored strain 181 energies), thus producing coarsening and coalescence of subgrains that compensate grain size 182

183 reduction associated with dislocation creep.

184 2.1 VPFFT – Viscoplastic deformation

In this section we provide a brief summary of the VPFFT approach. A more detailed 185 explanation of the code and how it is implemented can be found in Lebensohn [2001] and 186 Lebensohn et al. [2008]. This FFT-based code is a full-field formulation that provides a solution 187 of the micromechanical problem by finding a stress and strain-rate field that minimizes the 188 average local work rate under the compatibility and equilibrium constraints (see Lebensohn 189 190 [2001]). In this full-field approach, lattice orientations are mapped on a rectangular grid of Fourier points or unconnected nodes (unodes) that represent small material elements and that are 191 also used to store local stress, strain rate and dislocation densities. Lattice rotations due to plastic 192 deformation by dislocation slip are calculated from the velocity gradient and stress fields. The 193 local mechanical response of a non-linear heterogeneous material can be calculated as a 194 convolution integral between Green functions associated with a linear homogenous medium and 195 a polarization field containing all the information on the heterogeneity and nonlinearity of the 196 material's behavior. For periodic media, the Fourier transform allows converting convolution 197 integrals in real space to simple products in the Fourier space. Therefore, the FFTs are used to 198 transform the polarization field into Fourier space, and thus get the mechanical fields by 199 transforming the convolution product back to real space. Since the polarization depend on the 200 unknown mechanical fields, an iterative method is used to obtain a compatible strain-rate field 201 and a stress field in equilibrium related by the constitutive equation. 202

The viscoplastic behavior of polycrystals is defined using a non-linear viscous ratedependent model, where deformation is assumed to be accommodated by dislocation glide [*Lebensohn*, 2001] along a number of pre-defined slip systems. The constitutive equation between the strain rate $\dot{\varepsilon}_{ii}(\mathbf{x})$ and the deviatoric stress $\sigma'(\mathbf{x})$ is given by:

207
$$\dot{\varepsilon}_{ij}(x) = \sum_{s=1}^{N_s} m_{ij}^s(x) \dot{\gamma}^s(x) = \dot{\gamma}_0 \sum_{s=1}^{N_s} m_{ij}^s(x) \left| \frac{m^s(x):\sigma'(x)}{\tau^s(x)} \right|^q sgn\big(m^s(x):\sigma'(x)\big), \quad (1)$$

where m^s , $\dot{\gamma}^s$ and τ^s are the symmetric Schmid tensor, the shear strain rate and the critical resolved shear stress defined for the slip system *s*, respectively. $\dot{\gamma}_0$ is the reference strain rate, *q* is the rate sensitivity exponent and N_s is the number of slip systems in the crystal.

211 Once the iteration converges, the microstructure is updated using an explicit scheme 212 assuming that the mechanical fields are constant during a small time increment Δt . The new 213 position of a point **x** of the Fourier grid is determined using the velocity fluctuation term $\tilde{v}_i(\mathbf{x})$ 214 (Eq. 25 in *Lebensohn* [2001]) arising from the heterogeneity field as

215
$$X_i(\mathbf{x}) = x_i^0 + \left(\vec{E}_{ij} x_j^0 + \tilde{v}_i(\mathbf{x}) \right) \times \Delta t, \qquad (2)$$

where \vec{E}_{ij} is the macroscopic strain rate. The local crystallographic orientations are updated according to the following local lattice rotation

218
$$\omega_{ij}(\boldsymbol{x}) = \left(\dot{\Omega}(\boldsymbol{x}) + \tilde{\omega}(\boldsymbol{x}) - \dot{\omega}_{ij}^{p}(\boldsymbol{x})\right) \times \Delta t, \qquad (3)$$

where $\dot{\Omega}(\mathbf{x})$ is the average rotation rate of the macroscopic velocity gradient tensor, $\tilde{\omega}(\mathbf{x})$ is the 219 local fluctuation in the rotation-rate obtained by taking the antisymmetric part of the velocity 220 gradient fluctuation term $\tilde{v}_{i,j}(\mathbf{x})$, and finally the last term $\dot{\omega}_{i,j}^{p}(\mathbf{x})$ is the plastic rotation-rate of the 221 crystal lattice that it is calculated as $\sum_{s=1}^{N_s} \alpha_{ij}^s(\mathbf{x}) \dot{\gamma}^s(\mathbf{x})$, where α_{ij}^s is the anti-symmetric Schmid 222 tensor. Lattice misorientations between neighboring Fourier points form where rotation gradients 223 develop, as a consequence of the formation of deformation gradients. As such, high subgrain 224 misorientations develop in areas of high strain gradients. After VPFFT induces lattice rotations, 225 and before the intracrystalline recovery process, a routine checks if the local misorientation 226 exceeds the local misorientation angle that defines a high-angle grain boundary (HAGB). A new 227 HAGB is thus created when misorientation exceeds 15°. This results in the formation of 228 recrystallized, new grains, and hence in grain size reduction. Grains in the model are defined by 229 nodes that are connected by straight grain-boundary segments, and therefore named boundary 230 231 nodes (bnodes). As grain boundary migration [e.g., Piazolo et al., 2002; Llorens et al., 2016a; *Llorens et al.*, 2016b; *Llorens et al.*, 2017] is disabled in this study, the only role of HAGBs is to 232 restrict recovery and subgrain-boundary formation within individual grains. Bnodes are displaced 233

by deformation according to Eq. (2).

235 2.2 ELLE – Intracrystalline recovery

After each deformation step, the new microstructure configuration provided by the VPFFT calculation is used by the ELLE-recovery module that simulates intracrystalline recovery that is driven by a reduction of the local misorientation generated by dislocations, following a

modification of the method of *Borthwick et al.* [2014] and *Llorens et al.* [2016a] (see Supporting

- Information for a full description of the method). Lattice-orientation heterogeneities are reduced by local rotation of the lattice without moving high-angle grain boundaries (HAGB). The
- by local rotation of the lattice without moving high-angle grain boundaries (HAGB). The recovery routine simulates annihilation of dislocations and their rearrangement into low-angle
- subgrain boundaries (i.e., polygonization; *Urai et al.* [1986]) and the development of areas with
- homogenous crystal orientations by coalescence through rotation and alignment of the lattices of
- 245 neighboring subgrains.

The smallest region with a homogenous lattice orientation in the model is a *unode* 246 (unconnected node), which is treated as a subgrain or crystallite. Geometrical necessary 247 dislocations arise from orientation differences between the lattices in adjacent unodes. Rotation 248 of the lattice in one single *unode* changes these orientation differences and, hence, the local 249 dislocation density and associated energy. Since all geometrically necessary dislocations are 250 located at the boundaries between *unodes*, their energy can be treated as a boundary energy that 251 is a function of orientation difference between *unodes*. The recovery routine essentially 252 calculates and applies small increments of lattice orientation in individual *unodes* that is driven 253 by the associated dislocation energy reduction. The model assumes that the rotation rate of a 254 crystallite/subgrain is proportional to the torque (*Q*) generated by the change of surface energy 255 associated with the misorientation reduction [Randle, 1993]. A linear relation between the 256

angular velocity ω and a driving torque Q is assumed

$$\omega = M'Q \tag{4}$$

where M' is the rotational mobility [*Moldovan et al.*, 2002]. Considering a 2D microstructure, the torque acting on a crystallite delimited by *n* subgrain boundaries (*sb*) is given by

261

$$Q = \sum_{n} l_{sb} \, d\gamma_{sb} / d\theta_{sb} \tag{5}$$

where l_{sb} denotes the boundary length with grain boundary energy γ_{sb} and misorientation angle 262 θ_{sb} across the boundary between the reference subgrain and a neighboring subgrain sb. In the 263 model, each crystallite (unode) is regarded as a small, square (potential) subgrain. For low-angle 264 boundaries, the boundary energy is calculated as a function of the misorientation angle with the 265 Read-Shockley equation [Read and Shockley, 1950]. For such misorientation angles, the 266 equivalent rotations by crystal symmetry are considered in order to obtain the minimum 267 misorientation θ between two crystallites or *unodes* (i.e., disorientation). In the original model by 268 Moldovan et al. [2001; 2002], the rotation mobility M' was expressed as function of boundary 269 and/or lattice self-diffusion. Here, our approach differs from the original one because we have 270 assumed that *unode* (crystallite) lattice rotation is accommodated by cooperative 271 motion/rearrangement of boundary dislocations (Li [1962]), by reducing the local misorientation. 272 Since we assume rigid rotation of square *unodes*, a mechanism of boundary and lattice diffusion 273 274 is required in order to keep areas constant along their edges. Due to the lack of experimental data, and as a first approach, we assume that subgrain rotation can be described as a linear 275 viscous process where M' is expressed as function of the effective viscosity of the material η (see 276 Supporting Information for the full description). For a square shape this relationship is 277

278
$$M' = \frac{1}{8\eta} \frac{1}{d^2}$$
(7)

279 where *d* is the subgrain size (i.e., one *unode*).

The recovery process in ELLE assumes that each *unode* is a potential subgrain and thus 280 the boundary energy and misorientation is minimized by the rotation of each *unode*. The 281 algorithm starts by choosing a random unode and finding the first-neighboring unodes that 282 belong to the same grain. The crystal orientation of the reference unode is rotated towards the 283 value that results in the maximum reduction in energy calculated from systematic trial rotations, 284 being the crystal orientation unchanged if all trial positions result in an increase of energy of the 285 neighborhood. This procedure is repeated for each *unode* in random order every time step. The 286 numerical predictions were verified by Borthwick et al. [2014] using results from intracrystalline 287 evolution during annealing experiments of deformed single salt crystals. Our method presents 288 some slight differences with that of Borthwick et al. [2014]. These are that: (i) rotation in our 289 approach depends on the boundary energy reduction and (ii) we use a direct relationship between 290 M' and the material properties based on the material's effective viscosity (see Supporting 291 Information for more details). An alternative way to constrain M' could be based on the use of 292 misorientation decay during annealing experiments. Although there is data from high-293 temperature halite experiments [e.g., Borthwick et al. 2012 and references therein], there is 294 certainly no published data for halite deformed in the low-temperature regime. Therefore, the 295 approach taken is the most appropriate for estimating M' values. A comparison of the kinetics of 296 recovery calculated from annealing experiments versus those using our approach is discussed in 297 the Supporting Information and Fig. S1. 298

299

2.3 Experimental setup and postprocessing

300 An initial microstructure composed of 255 grains is discretized into a resolution of 256x256 Fourier points (or *unodes*), resulting in a unit cell formed by 65,536 nodes. These nodes 301 provide the physical properties within grains and store the lattice orientation, defined with the 302 three Euler angles. A set of random initial orientations (Figure 1) was assigned to the initial 303 grains, and the initial crystal preferred orientation (CPO) results in near isotropic bulk behavior. 304 The data structure on VPFFT/ELLE is fully periodic, in a way that grains reaching one side of 305 the model continue on the other side. The initial model is a 1x1 cm square and, therefore, the 306 *unode* distance is set to d=1/256 cm. Every deformation time step all the parts of the model 307 outside the square unit cell are repositioned back into it. This improves the visualization of the 308 309 microstructures, even when high shear strains are reached. In ELLE, each process is simulated as a separate module that acts on the data structure [Jessell et al., 2001]. The program flow and 310 coupling between the viscoplastic VPFFT code and ELLE are similar to those used by Griera et 311 al. [2011], Griera et al. [2013], Llorens et al. [2016a], Llorens et al. [2016b], Llorens et al. 312 [2017] and Steinbach et al. [2017]. Each process is activated sequentially in a loop that 313 represents a small increment Δy of viscoplastic deformation calculated with VPFFT followed by 314 recovery during a small time increment Δt . Since an elastic component is not incorporated in our 315 models, the mechanical response of the viscoplastic model only depends on the current 316 configuration. Moreover, the same operator-splitting procedure of coupling processes 317 sequentially has been successfully used in a number of viscous and viscoplastic numerical 318 simulation studies utilizing the ELLE platform (see *Piazolo et al.* [2002], *Bons et al.*, [2008], 319 Jessell et al. [2009], Griera et al. [2013], Llorens et al. [2013], Llorens et al. [2017], Steinbach 320 et al. [2016] and references thereof), and tested for our specific model configuration (see below). 321

The constitutive behavior of halite polycrystals is simulated using a system with cubic 322 symmetry where deformation is accommodated by three sets of slip systems: $\{110\}\langle\overline{1}10\rangle$, 323 $\{100\}(011)$ and $\{111\}(\overline{1}10)$ [e.g., *Carter and Heard*, 1970]. In this approach, the resistance of 324 slip systems to glide is defined by a critical resolved shear stress (τ^{s}). The degree of anisotropy 325 (A) is set as the ratio between the critical resolved shear stress with respect to the easiest glide 326 system, which is $\{110\}\langle \overline{1}10 \rangle$ for halite at low temperature. Following single crystal experiments 327 by Carter and Heard [1970], we have set CRSS as three times higher for the {100}(011) slip 328 system (i.e., A=3), and two times for the {111}($\overline{110}$) system (i.e., A=2). The stress exponent is 329 set to q=7 for all the experiments. From a mechanical point of view, the VPFFT approach 330 331 assumes that the CRSS' do not change throughout time (i.e., there is no hardening associated with interaction of dislocations), and therefore these A values are kept constant throughout the 332 simulation. Experimental observations indicate that climb of dislocations is not active in halite at 333 the simulated range of temperatures [e.g., Borthwick and Piazolo, 2010], hence hardening of 334 CRSS (e.g., by cross slip) associated with strong interaction between slip systems is not expected 335 336 here.

Dextral simple-shear deformation was modeled in increments of $\Delta \not= 0.04$ up to $\not= 4$, 337 although significantly higher shear strains can be achieved at the cost of calculation time. Four 338 different recovery scenarios were modeled by varying the number of computational steps of the 339 recovery (SGC) process per deformation step: SGC0, SGC1, SGC10 and SGC25. A constant 340 time step of $2x10^8$ s (~6 years) was used for all simulations and, therefore, the shear strain rate 341 was 2×10^{-10} s⁻¹. There are no experimental data to constrain the rotation mobility M' parameter 342 used in the recovery models. The M' value was calculated with equation (7), taking a reference 343 viscosity of 5×10^{16} Pa·s (model SGC1). This value was determined from flow laws derived from 344 halite experiments for the given strain rate (after Urai et al. [2008]), assuming a low temperature 345 (< 50 °C) and for our strain rate. As the strain rate is constant for all models, an increase of the 346 number of recovery steps implies a reduction of the effective viscosity. We interpret this 347 348 reduction as associated with a temperature increase that causes a higher activity of recrystallization processes. For the SSG10 and SSG25 simulations the estimated viscosities are 349 5×10^{15} Pa·s and 2×10^{15} Pa·s, respectively. This range of calculated values is in agreement with 350 bulk viscosities observed from halite deformation experiments for the aforementioned low 351 temperature conditions [Urai et al., 2008]. For the model without recovery (SGC0), the rotation 352 mobility is assumed to be sufficiently small not to produce microstructure modifications for the 353 time and length scale of our simulations. The viscosity of this model should be at least higher 354 than that of the reference model SGC1. 355

The numerical results were post-processed using the texture calculation toolbox MTEX (<u>http://mtex.googlecode.com;</u> *Bachmann et al.* [2010], *Mainprice et al.* [2011]). MTEX allows generating maps (i.e., lattice orientation, misorientation boundaries) and analyzing the CPOs in a similar way as for EBSD data of natural or experimental samples, thus allowing a direct comparison of 2D sections.

A series of simulations based on the model SGC10 were analyzed in order to investigate the influence of the time step size on the resulting microstructures. For this purpose, we ran models with incremental shear strains of $\Delta \gamma$ =0.008, 0.016, 0.024, 0.032, 0.04, 0.08, 0.12 and 0.16, keeping the same balance of subgrain coarsening with respect to shearing. This means that runs with a larger shear strain increment underwent a higher number of recovery (SGC) steps.

The results are summarized in Figure S2 (Supporting Information) and demonstrate that the

chosen time step size has a very limited influence on the results. This difference is associated
 with the fact that relatively high misorientations are reduced in the first step of the SGC process.

with the fact that relatively high misorientations are reduced in the first step of the SGC proc We chose to run the models with a shear strain increment of $\Delta_{inc}=0.04$ per time step as a

370 compromise between accuracy and simulation time. The difference between this base model and

that with very small time steps is very small, with a variation of less than 0.2° of the mean

372 misorientation of the model (Figure S2).

373 **3 Results**

Orientation maps resulting from the simulations without recovery (SSG0) show a 374 microstructure with strong grain size reduction and increasing elongation of relict grains (defined 375 by the original grain boundaries) with progressive deformation (Figure 2; Movie ms01 of the 376 SGC0 model in additional supporting information). These processes become extreme at 377 relatively high shear strains, where only a few large relict grains immersed in a recrystallized 378 379 matrix are recognizable (e.g., Figure 2d at $\gamma=4$). It is worth noting that the term recrystallized matrix here refers to areas of small grains formed by rotation recrystallization (i.e., by the so 380 called grain refinement process in metallurgical and material science). As expected, the angle 381 between the developing foliation and the shear plane progressively reduces with increasing 382 strain, although at $\gamma=4$ the foliation is still oblique to the shear plane. Relict grains tend to show a 383 shape-preferred orientation oblique to the shear plane and coherent with the imposed dextral 384 shear sense. Deformation is distributed along the polycrystal, and no localization bands in areas 385 with preferred grain size reduction can be distinguished. With increasing shear strain, grain 386 orientations trend towards acquiring {110} orientations parallel to the shear direction (i.e., green 387 tones in Figure 2), while very few grains with {111} parallel to the shear direction (i.e., blue 388 tones in Figure 2) can be found. 389

Grains deform internally in a different way depending on their initial geometry and 390 orientation and those of their neighbors. For example, at relatively low strains (γ =1) some grains 391 develop a network of subgrains (Figure 2b), while others have homogeneous crystal orientations 392 or smooth orientation gradients without distinct subgrain boundaries. The first detectable low-393 angle grain boundaries (LAGB; smaller than 15°) tend to form next to triple nodes, because 394 orientation differences between grains in these areas tend to result in strain incompatibility and 395 therefore lead to the activation of different slip systems. Some of these LAGBs subsequently 396 develop into high-angle grain boundaries (HAGB; higher than 15°) to form new and smaller 397 398 grains, which display a parent and daughter grain structure between relict and recrystallized grains (i.e., formed by rotation recrystallization). Areas with recrystallized grains tend to be 399 initially isolated, surrounding parental grains. With progressive strain these areas tend to join and 400 form connected bands that finally result in a continuous matrix at higher strain. At relatively low 401 402 strains (γ =1) new grains formed by rotation recrystallization tend to be grouped in clusters. Grains with denser subgrain networks have a tendency to have {100} close to the shear direction 403 (red tones in Figure 2). The orientation of subgrain boundaries in banded grains generally varies 404 between the direction of the grain elongation or foliation and the shear plane. Subgrain rotation 405 significantly increases with progressive strain, causing a strong grain size reduction in the SGC0 406 model. 407

Simulations that include intracrystalline recovery show that subgrain coarsening and 408 409 coalescence significantly reduce subgrain misorientations and therefore the density of subgrain boundaries. Thus, the intensity of grain size reduction is significantly lower in those models, 410 411 allowing the survival of larger grains and subgrains with progressive deformation (Figure 3; Movie ms02 of the SGC0 model in additional supporting information). Crystal preferred 412 orientations (CPOs) are qualitatively not changed when there is recovery, but their intensity is 413 enhanced (Figs. 3, 4). Subgrain-free grains dominate in simulations with strong recovery 414 (SGC10 or SGC25; Figure 3g-1), with many grains having internal misorientations lower than 5°. 415 Orientation maps of the deviation of individual *unodes* or crystallites with respect to the mean 416 orientation of the grain help to highlight the subgrain structure (Figure 3c,f,i,l). Strong subgrain 417 size reduction with significant deviations from the mean orientation of the grains can be seen in 418 simulations with low or no recovery (SGC1 or SGC0). However, increasing recovery strongly 419 reduces these deviations and the map shows clearer (white) areas, meaning that the 420 misorientation of crystallites with respect to the grain mean is very low. 421

A close look at the grains better reveals the effects of recovery. For example, Figure 5 422 shows details of three selected grains (indicated in Figure 1), comparing the experiment without 423 recovery (SGC0) with that with 10 steps of recovery per deformation step (SGC10). The increase 424 of recovery reduces the spread of orientations and decreases subgrain boundary misorientations. 425 The results illustrate how two grains with relatively similar initial orientations (A and B) develop 426 different lattice orientation distributions after a shear strain of one. Three subgrains with very 427 different orientations develop in grain A. The new grain limits are subparallel to the shear plane. 428 Contrary to this, grain B develops banded subgrains, with alternating orientations. The new grain 429 boundaries within this grain are oriented parallel to its elongation direction. Grain C shows the 430 same orientations in both cases, although there are more subgrain boundaries in the model 431 without recovery (SGC0). For the three cases, subgrain boundaries are sub-parallel to a direction 432 of the {110} planes. There is a maximum clustering of axes parallel to the <100> direction (i.e., 433 434 parallel to the normal of the intermediate strain axis of simple shear deformation). On the contrary, the other axes are more dispersed. This indicates that the misorientation axes for this 435 type of boundaries is <100> and corresponds to a tilted boundary, as this axis is included in the 436 boundary plane. 437

Stereograms reveal that crystal orientation poles are oriented almost identical for the 438 whole series of experiments, but there is more scattering and a less intense CPO in the models 439 with limited or no recovery. At all stages of deformation, orientations are spread, as indicated by 440 orientation maps (Figs. 2,3) and pole figures (Figure 4). Despite the scattered distribution, the 441 {110} and {111} pole figures at $\not=$ 1 already display a weak hexagonal symmetry, both in models 442 with and without recovery. On the contrary, the $\{100\}$ stereogram shows a more asymmetric 443 pattern, which evolves with progressive deformation towards a pattern with a maximum 444 perpendicular to the shear plane and two maxima at 45° to it. At $\gamma=4$ there are two {110} maxima 445 parallel and perpendicular to the shear plane, respectively, plus another four maxima at 45° of it. 446 Four {111} maxima form at 45° to the shear direction. Orientations in individual grains display a 447 wide distribution with a similar symmetry to that of the bulk, although they can appear rotated 448 depending on the initial orientation of the selected grain and its neighbors (Figure 4). 449

The analysis of the slip system activity reveals that all the sets of pre-defined slip systems all contribute to deformation (Figs. 6, 7). In all our simulations, nearly 50% of strain is

accommodated, on average, by the {111} systems. At the onset of deformation, when grain 452 distribution is random, 48% of strain is accommodated by these systems, 34% by the easiest 453 glide {110} system, and 18% by the hardest {100} systems. In order to check the consistency of 454 these values, the SGC0 simulation was repeated ten times with different initial grain orientations, 455 and the maximum deviation of bulk activities at $\gamma=1$ was $\pm 0.4\%$. With increasing strain, the 456 activity of {111} systems remains approximately constant, while that of the {110} system 457 slightly decreases and $\{100\}$ increases. At $\gamma=4$, and for the model without subgrain coarsening, 458 29% of strain is accommodated by the {110} system and 24% by {100}. When there is recovery, 459 the activity of {111} system remains similar but the activity balance between the hardest and 460 easiest slip systems slightly changes throughout the experiment, although the activity of the 461 {110} system is always higher than that of the {100} (Figure 6d at $\gamma=4$). Maps displaying the 462 distribution of slip system activity show that the {111} systems dominate and widely affect the 463 whole sample (pale tones in Figure 7). The relative activity of the second slip system, either 464 {110} (blue) or {100} (red), determines the evolution of each grain. Some grains, such as those 465 marked with A, B and C, start displaying banded regions with differences in slip system activity 466 from the onset of deformation (Figure 7a), thus giving rise to subgrains that evolve to form new 467 grains with increasing strain. In some cases, subgrains can form even if the same slip systems 468 dominate, but they have different activities. The subgrains developed in the lower part of grain 469 A, which are all determined by {100} systems, are a good example of this phenomenon (Figs. 5 470 and 7b). The slip system activity maps are relatively similar in models with and without 471 recovery. For the three selected grains of Figure 5, subgrain boundaries are formed as 472 consequence of differences in the activation of the $\{110\}$ and $\{100\}$ sets between subgrains. 473

The frequency distribution of geometric mean misorientations of initial individual grains 474 is shown in Figure 8. At the onset of deformation, subgrain boundaries showed low mean 475 misorientations, which rapidly increased and spread with progressive deformation. However, the 476 477 rate of this increase slows down at relatively high strains. The distribution of mean values for individual grains is close to exponential at the beginning of deformation, but becomes closer to 478 normal at higher strains (e.g., at $\not=$ 2-4) for the models without recovery (SGC0). When subgrain 479 coarsening is active (in models with SGC>0), mean misorientation values are significantly lower, 480 although their spread is similar to the cases without SGC. Values at higher strains tend to deviate 481 from a normal distribution with increasing SGC. 482

483 4 Discussion

The main objectives of this study are (i) to investigate the microstructural evolution of 484 halite polycrystals during simple shear deformation with subgrain rotation recrystallization, and 485 (ii) to assess the use of subgrain misorientations as a strain gauge in polycrystals that undergo 486 different intensities of intracrystalline recovery. We specifically simulate halite deformation and 487 recrystallization under dry conditions and at relatively low temperatures, focusing on the 488 competition between (i) grain size reduction by subgrain rotation induced by dislocation creep 489 and (ii) subgrain coarsening driven by the reduction of local misorientation associated with 490 intracrystalline recovery. Our simple-shear simulations produce qualitatively similar results to 491 those from halite deformation experiments by other authors, validating the proposed numerical 492 approach. Specifically, our numerical microstructures (Figs. 2, 3, 5) and CPOs (Figure 4) can be 493 494 directly compared with the published torsion experiments of dry halite at 100 and 200 °C by Armann [2008] and Wenk et al. [2009]. Our calculated values of mean misorientation and 495

subgrain misorientation statistics are qualitatively similar to those obtained with EBSD by *Pennock et al.* [2005] for dry halite deformed in coaxial conditions at $165\pm10^{\circ}$ C.

The experiment without recovery (SGC0) very well illustrates the process of grain size 498 reduction, with the formation of LAGBs that evolve to HAGBs. Subgrains start forming at the 499 early stages of deformation, as in other materials [e.g., Hurley and Humphreys, 2003]. Subgrain 500 formation and the development of subgrain misorientations do not only depend on the initial 501 grain orientation, but also on the relative orientations of the surrounding grains. This was also 502 observed in experiments by Pennock et al. [2005]. The SGC0 simulation reproduces very similar 503 CPOs as those with the VPSC approach [e.g., Wenk et al., 2009], in which only deformation by 504 dislocation glide is taken into account. In this situation, there is a strong grain size reduction (see 505 evolution of number of grains in Fig. 8a-e), but there are a few relict grains that can survive 506 throughout deformation, depending on their initial orientation and that of their neighbors. As 507 expected, grain elongation increases and rotates towards the shear plane with increasing strain. 508 Orientation maps show a wide distribution, although grains with {110} orientations parallel to 509 the shear direction dominate. The predicted CPOs also reproduce those from low-temperature 510 halite experiments by Armann [2008] and Wenk et al. [2009] well, although our simulations 511 produce less scattering. This is probably due to the complete absence of other recrystallization 512 processes or deformation mechanisms in the simulations. The addition of recovery changes the 513 deformational behavior of the samples, since subgrain recrystallization associated with the 514 reduction of stored strain and boundary energies significantly decreases grain size reduction 515 (values displayed in Fig. 8), especially in the experiments SGC10 and SGC25. This process does 516 not change CPOs, but results in a more homogeneous microstructure. As indicated in section 2.3, 517 the increase of recovery is simulated with the assumption of a reduction of the effective viscosity 518 of the material, allowing more rotation at the same driving force. Since viscosity is temperature-519 dependent, this effect would be linked to a temperature increment in natural cases [Borthwick 520 and Piazolo, 2010]. 521

A detailed analysis of the slip system activity reveals that the three sets of slip systems all 522 contribute to accommodation of strain, with the {111} systems the most active through time in 523 all numerical experiments. This result is consistent with the VPSC simulations of Wenk et al. 524 [2009] after their models reached a relatively stable slip system activity (at $\gamma \sim 3.5$). This 525 predominance can be explained because there are twelve {111} slip systems, and only six of the 526 other two sets ({110} and {100}). Contrarily to VPSC models, the weakest {110} slip systems 527 dominate over the hardest {100} ones in our simulations. However, this difference varies with 528 progressive strain and is not very marked (Figure 6). Moreover, our results show how subgrain 529 coarsening associated with recovery can also slightly modify the distribution of slip system 530 activity, in addition to non-coaxial flow, making the use of texture patterns to determine slip 531 system activity more complex in such systems. Maps of slip system activity support this 532 observation (Figure 7). 533

In principle, subgrain misorientations can be used as a strain gauge for dislocation creep deformation in crystalline materials, if we can determine how the misorientation angles correlate with strain [e.g., *Pennock et al.*, 2004; 2005]. This tool can be especially useful for structural analysis in areas where there is a recognizable strain gradient. Over the past 15 years, EBSD mapping has allowed the collection of large misorientation datasets in materials such as metals or halite [e.g., *Randle and Enger*, 2000; *Humphreys*, 2001; *Pennock et al.*, 2002; 2005; 2006; 540 *Hurley and Humphreys*, 2003; *Pennock and Drury*, 2005, among others]. As discussed in the 541 introduction, a power law relationship of the average subgrain boundary misorientation of the 542 whole sample (θ_{av}) and natural strain (ε) can be found, and this scaling relationship seems to be 543 universal [e.g., *Hughes et al.*, 1997; 1998; 2003; *Pantleon*, 1997; 1998; 2001; *Sethna and* 544 *Coffman*, 2003]. These studies propose that $\theta_{av} \sim \varepsilon^{n=2/3}$ for geometrically necessary boundaries 545 (GBN's).

546 Pennock and Drury [2005] measured n=0.41 in halite pure shear experiments, while 547 Pennock et al. [2005] obtained n=0.42 when using the average subgrain misorientations within 548 grains ($\theta_{av,grains}$), instead of the whole sample:

$$\theta_{av-grains} = k_1 \varepsilon^n$$

(8)

where k_1 is a constant, with a value of 3.3° for their experiments. Our subgrain-misorientation 550 data measured on a grain basis closely follow the universal exponent of n=2/3 (Figure 9). Note 551 that here we use the geometric mean instead of the average, since this is a more appropriate 552 parameter given that misorientations distributions are frequently non-Gaussian (Figure 8). 553 Moreover, we prefer to calculate a weighted geometric mean, in a way that the contribution of 554 each grain to the mean depends on their number of crystallites. We find that the k_1 constant 555 depends on the intensity of recovery (SGC), and hence on temperature, and k_1 decreases from 556 4.82° for SGC0 to 0.72° for SGC25 (see list of values in Figure 9). Since only the models with 557 recovery can be scaled, k_l appears capped at about 4.82° for the model SGC0. The applicability 558 of this law is limited at the other end of the range by the rate where grain boundary migration 559 becomes a significant factor for the subgrain structure. It is important to note that the scaling law 560 561 is not the best power law fit of the simulation data (Figure 9). With increasing recovery, the best fit exponent decreases from n=0.81 for SGC0 to 0.53 for SGC25. However, the coefficients of 562 determination R^2 between these data and the predicted values are high (Figure 9), and therefore 563 the proposed law provides a good approximation. Our results demonstrate that recovery 564 influences the exponent of the scaling law and can help to interpret the low *n* values obtained by 565 Pennock and Drury [2005; 2006] (n=0.41-0.42). This low exponent can be related to the 566 activation of intracrystalline recrystallization processes during those deformation experiments, 567 leading to a decrease of intracrystalline heterogeneities and a reduction of n. Our simulations 568 show how the mean subgrain misorientations within grains can be used as a strain gauge in 569 570 materials undergoing intracrystalline recovery, not only in coaxial deformation conditions but also in simple shear up to high strain. The values obtained confirm that the universal exponent 571 proposed above applies to halite, at least when it is deformed in the absence of grain boundary 572 migration. Additionally, this strain gauge could be potentially applied to rock that underwent 573 grain boundary migration if grain nuclei keep relatively high misorientations (e.g., as in Schléder 574 and Urai [2007]). However, to verify this a whole new study would need to be made. 575 Unfortunately, our misorientation data cannot be compared with those from torsion (simple 576 shear) halite experiments, since Armann [2008] or Wenk et al. [2009] did not provide 577 quantifications of misorientation. 578

579 The models presented in this contribution reproduce the behavior of dry halite deformed 580 at low temperatures (<200 °C) well. This type of simulations may not only be key for 581 understanding halite rheology, but also that of other minerals with similar symmetry and slip 582 systems. For example, magnesiowüstite deforms plastically in the lower mantle, where it is one

- of the two major phases, potentially resulting in strain weakening and localized deformation
- [*Girard et al.*, 2016]. Full-field simulations such as the ones presented here, can provide new
- insights into the interplay of deformation mechanisms and resulting flow laws in the mantle, thus
- improving our understanding of Earth's dynamics.

587 5 Conclusions

588 We presented a new method to model subgrain rotation recrystallization in 589 polycrystalline aggregates, and applied it to dry halite. The analysis of the resulting 590 microstructures led to the following main conclusions:

- The VPFFT/ELLE numerical approach presented in this contribution accurately
 reproduces experimental microstructures, allowing the systematic analysis of systems in
 which multiple deformation processes are active. This full-field method has been applied
 to halite for first time, providing new insights into the competition between (i) grain size
 reduction by dislocation creep and (ii) subgrain coarsening by coalescence through
 rotation and alignment of the lattices of neighboring subgrains, associated with
 intracrystalline recovery.
- Viscoplastic deformation results in the development of low-angle grain boundaries that
 evolve to form high-angle grain boundaries, leading to a strong grain size reduction. The
 activation of subgrain coarsening associated with the decrease of strain stored energy by
 recovery significantly decreases grain size reduction, although grain orientations are
 similar in all cases.
- Subgrain coarsening does not significantly modify crystal preferred orientations, but results in less scattered crystal orientations.
- All the sets of pre-defined slip systems contribute to deformation, with changes in their relative activity depending on progressive strain and the amount of subgrain coarsening.
 These results are in accordance with published laboratory experiments and viscoplastic self-consistent simulations.
- Mean subgrain misorientations per grain can be used as a strain gauge in systems with different degrees of subgrain rotation recrystallization, with a universal scaling exponent of $n\sim2/3$ that accounts for all cases. The intensity of intracrystalline recovery, and hence temperature, can potentially be estimated with this strain gauge if misorientations can be measured in an area with a strain gradient. This type of strain gauge can be further developed and refined for different geological materials if misorientation data from experiments and field studies are available for comparison with simulations.

616 Acknowledgments and Data

We thank the Microdynamics of Ice (Micro-DICE) research network, funded by the European Science Foundation (ESF), for providing two short visit grants to EGR and AG that allowed carrying out the numerical experiments. EGR also acknowledges a mobility award funded by the Santander Universities network. The series of simulations were run using the Maxwell High Performance Computer Cluster of the University of Aberdeen. Supporting

- 622 information accompanies this paper, including (i) a detailed explanation of the approach taken to
- simulate intracrystalline recovery, (ii) a figure that analyzes the influence of the time step size in
- the numerical results and (iii) two simulation movies. The codes are open source and available at
- 625 <u>http://www.elle.ws</u>. Correspondence and requests for materials should be addressed to Enrique
- 626 Gomez-Rivas. We gratefully acknowledge three anonymous reviewers, whose constructive
- ⁶²⁷ reviews greatly improved the manuscript, together with the editorial guidance of Yoshihiro
- 628 Kaneko and Paul Tregoning.

629 **References**

- Armann, M. (2008), Microstructural and textural development in synthetic rocksalt deformed in
 torsion. PhD Thesis, ETH-Zürich, Switzerland.
- Ashby, M. F. (1970), The deformation of plastically non-homogeneous materials. Philos. Mag.
 21, 399-424.
- Bachmann, F., R. Hielscher, and H. Schaeben (2010), Texture analysis with MTEX free and
 open source software toolbox. Solid State Phenom. 160, 63-68.
- Bons, P.D., D., Koehn, M.W. Jessell (Eds.), (2008), Microdynamic Simulation. Lecture Notes in
 Earth Sciences 106, Springer, Berlin, 405 pp.
- Borthwick, V. E., and S. Piazolo (2010), Complex temperature dependent behaviour revealed by
 in-situ heating experiments on single crystals of deformed halite: New ways to recognize
 and evaluate annealing in geological materials. J. Struct. Geol. 32, 982-996.
- Borthwick, V.E., S. Piazolo, S. Schmidt, C. Gundlach, A. Griera, P.D. Bons, and M.W. Jessell,
 (2012), The application of in situ 3D X-ray diffraction in annealing experiments: first
 interpretation of substructure development in deformed NaCl. Mater. Sci. Forum 715716: 461-466.
- Borthwick, V. E., S. Piazolo, L. Evans, A. Griera, and P. D. Bons (2014), What happens to
 deformed rocks after deformation? A refined model for recovery based on numerical
 simulations. Geol. Soc. London Spec. Publ. 394(1), 215-534.
- Bunge, H. J. (1985), Representation of preferred orientations. In: Weiss, L. E., Wenk, H. R.
 (Eds.), Preferred orientation in deformed metals: an introduction to modern texture
 analysis. Academic Press, London, 73-104.
- Carter, N. L., and H. C. Heard (1970), Temperature and rate dependent deformation of halite.
 Am. J. Sci. 269, 193-249.
- Erb, U., and H. Gleiter (1979), The effect of temperature on the energy and structure of grain
 boundaries. Scripta Metall. 13, 61-64.
- Farla, R. J. M., H. Kokkonen, J. D. Fitz Gerald, A. Barnhoorn, U. H. Faul and I. Jackson (2010),
 Dislocation recovery in fine-grained polycrystalline olivine. Phys Chem Minerals, DOI
 10.1007/s00269-010-0410-3.
- Girard, J., G. Amulele, R. Farla, A. Mohiuddin, and S. Karato (2016), Shear deformation of
 bridgmanite and magnesiowüstite aggregates at lower mantle conditions. Science
 351(6269):144-7.

- Griera, A., P. D. Bons, M. W. Jessell, R. Lebensohn, L. Evans, and E. Gomez-Rivas (2011),
 Strain localization and porphyroclast rotation. Geology 39, 275-278.
- Griera, A., M. -G. Llorens, E. Gomez-Rivas, P. D. Bons, M. W. Jessell, L. A. Evans, and R.
 Lebensohn (2013), Numerical modelling of porphyroclast and porphyroblast rotation in
 anisotropic rocks. Tectonophysics 587, 4-29.
- 666 Guillope, M., and J. P. Poirier (1979), Dynamic recrystallization during creep of single-667 crystalline halite: an experimental study. J. Geophys. Res. 84, 5557-5567.
- Halfpenny, A., D. J. Prior, and J. Wheeler (2006), Analysis of dynamic recrystallization and
 nucleation in a quartzite mylonite. Tectonophysics 427, 3-14.
- Hirth, G., and J. Tullis (1992), Dislocation creep regimes in quartz aggregates. J. Struct. Geol 14,
 145-159.
- Hughes, D. A., Q. Liu, D. C. Chrzan, and N. Hansen (1997), Scaling of microstructural
 parameters: misorientations of deformation induced boundaries. Acta Mater. 45, 105-112.
- Hughes, D. A., D. C. Chrzan, Q. Liu, and N. Hansen (1998), Scaling of misorientation angle
 distributions. Phys. Rev. Lett. 81, 4664.
- Hughes, D. A., N. Hansen, and D. J. Bammann (2003), Geometrically necessary boundaries,
 incidental dislocation boundaries and geometrically necessary dislocations. Scr. Mater.
 48, 147-153.
- Humphreys, F. J. (2001), Review: grain and sub-grain characterization by electron backscatter
 diffraction. J. Mater. Sci. 36, 3833-3854.
- Humphreys, F. J., and M. Hatherly (2004), Recrystallization and Related Annealing Phenomena,.
 Third ed. Elsevier Ltd, Oxford.
- Hurley, P. J., and F.J. Humphreys (2003), The application of EBSD to the study of substructural
 development in a cold rolled single-phase aluminium alloy. Acta Mater. 51, 1087-1102.
- Jessell, M.W., P.D. Bons, L. Evans, T. Barr and K. Stüwe (2001), Elle: a micro-process approach
 to the simulation of microstructures. Comput. Geosci. 27, 17-30.
- Jessell, M. W., P. D. Bons, A. Griera, L. A. Evans, and C. J. L. Wilson (2009), A tale of two
 viscosities. J. Struct. Geol. 31, 719-736.
- Kaminski, E., and N. M. Ribe (2001), A kinematic model for recrystallization and texture
 development in olivine polycrystals. Earth Planet. Sci. Lett. 189, 253-267.
- Karato, S. (2012), Deformation of Earth Materials: An Introduction to the Rheology of Solid
 Earth. Cambridge University Press. 482 pp.
- Kuhlmann-Wilsdorf, D., and N. Hansen (1991), Geometrically necessary, incidental and
 subgrain boundaries. Scr. Mater. 25(7), 1557-1562.
- Lebensohn, R.A. (2001), N-site modelling of a 3D viscoplastic polycrystal using fast Fourier
 transform. Acta Mater. 49(14), 2723-2737.
- Lebensohn, R. A., P. R. Dawson, H. -R. Wenk, and H. M. Kern (2003), Heterogeneous
 deformation and texture development in halite polycrystals: comparison of different
 modeling approaches and experimental data. Tectonophysics 370, 287-311.

- Lebensohn, R. A., R. Brenner, O. Castelnau, and A. D. Rollett (2008), Orientation image-based
 micromechanical modelling of subgrain texture evolution in polycrystalline copper. Acta
 Mater. 56(15), 3914-3926.
- Li, J. C. M. (1962), Possibility of subgrain rotation during recrystallization. J. Appl. Phys. 33,
 2958-2965.
- Llorens, M-.G., P.D. Bons, A. Griera, E. Gomez-Rivas and L.A. Evans (2013), Single layer
 folding in simple shear. J. Struct. Geol., 50, 209-220.
- Llorens, M. -G., A. Griera, P. D. Bons, J. Roessiger, R. Lebensohn, L. A. Evans, and I. Weikusat
 (2016a), Dynamic recrystallisation of ice aggregates during co-axial viscoplastic
 deformation: a numerical approach. J. Glaciol. 62(232), 359-377.
- Llorens, M. -G., A. Griera, P. D. Bons, R. Lebensohn, L. A. Evans, D. Jansen, and I. Weikusat.
 (2016b), Full-field predictions of bubble-free ice dynamic recrystallisation under simple
 shear conditions. Earth Planet. Sci. Lett., 450, 233-242.
- Llorens, M. -G., A. Griera, F. Steinbach, P.D. Bons, E. Gomez-Rivas, D. Jansen, R. Lebensohn,
 and I. Weikusat (2017), Dynamic recrystallisation during deformation of polycrystalline
 ice: insights from numerical simulations. Phil. Trans. R. Soc. A, 375:20150346.
- Mainprice, D., R. Hielscher, and H. Schaeben (2011), Calculating anisotropic physical properties
 from texture data using the MTEX open source package. Geol. Soc. London Spec. Publ.
 360(1), 175-192.
- Moldovan, D., D. Wolf, and S. R. Phillpot (2001), Theory of diffusion-accommodated grain
 rotation in columnar polycrystalline microstructures. Acta Mater. 49(17), 3521-3532.
- Moldovan, D., D. Wolf, S. R. Phillpot, and A. J. Haslam (2002), Role of grain rotation during
 grain growth in a columnar microstructure by mesoscale simulation. Acta Mater. 50(13),
 3397-3414.
- Pantleon, W. (1997), On the evolution of disorientations in dislocation cell structures during
 plastic deformation. Mater. Sci. Eng. A234-236, 567-570
- Pantleon, W. (1998), On the statistical origin of disorientations in dislocation structures. Acta
 Mater. 46(2), 451-456.
- Pantleon, W. (2001), The evolution of disorientations for several types of boundaries. Mater. Sci.
 Eng. A319-321, 211-215.
- 730 Passchier, C. W., and R. A. J. Trouw (2005), Microtectonics. Springer, Berlin.
- Pennock, G. M., and M. R. Drury (2005), Low angle subgrain misorientations in deformed NaCl.
 J. Microsc. 217, 130-137.
- Pennock, G. M., M. R. Drury, P. W. Trimby, and C. J. Spiers (2002), Misorientation
 distributions in hot deformed NaCl using electron backscattered diffraction. J. Microsc.
 205(3), 285-294.
- Pennock, G. M., M. R. Drury, and C. J. Spiers (2004), Investigation of subgrain rotation
 recrystallization in dry polycrystalline NaCl. Mater. Sci. Forum 467-470, 597-602.

- Pennock, G. M., M R. Drury, and C. J. Spiers (2005), The development of subgrain
 misorientations with strain in dry synthetic NaCl measured using EBSD. J. Struct. Geol.
 27, 2159-2170.
- Piazolo, S., P.D. Bons, M.W. Jessell, L. Evans, and C.W. Passchier (2002), Dominance of
 microstructural processes and their effect on microstructural development: insights from
 numerical modelling of dynamic recrystallization. Geol. Soc. Lon. Spec. Pub. 200, 149 170.
- Pennock, G. M., M. R. Drury, C. J. Peach, and C. J. Spiers (2006), The influence of water on
 deformation microstructures and textures in synthetic NaCl measured using EBSD. J.
 Struct. Geol. 28, 588-601.
- Randle, V. (1993), Microtexture investigation of the relationship between strain and anomalous
 grain growth. Philos. Mag. A 67.6, 1301-1313.
- Randle, V., and O. Engler (2000), Introduction to Texture Analysis: Macrotexture, Microtexture
 and Orientation Mapping. Gorden & Breach Science Publications.
- Read, W. T., and W. Shockley (1950), Dislocation models of crystal grain boundaries. Phys.
 Rev. 78.3, 275.
- Schléder, Z., and J.L. Urai (2007), Deformation and recrystallization mechanisms in mylonitic
 shear zones in naturally deformed extrusive Eocene-Oligocene rocksalt from Eyvanekey
 plateau and Garmsar hills (central Iran). J. Struct. Geol. 29, 241-255.
- Sethna, J. P., V. R. Coffman, and E. Demler (2003), Scaling in plasticity-induced cell-boundary
 microstructure: Fragmentation and rotational diffusion. Physical Review B 67, 184107.
- Signorelli, J., and A. Tommasi (2015), Modeling the effect of subgrain rotation recrystallization
 on the evolution of olivine crystal preferred orientations in simple shear. Earth Planet.
 Sci. Lett. 430, 356-366.
- Steinbach, F., P. D. Bons, A. Griera, D. Jansen, M.-G. Llorens, J. Roessiger, and I. Weikusat
 (2016), Strain localization and dynamic recrystallization in the ice-air aggregate: a
 numerical study. The Cryosphere 10, 3071-3089.
- Trimby, P. W., M.R. Drury, and C. J. Spiers (2000), Recognising the crystallographic signature
 of recrystallization processes in deformed rocks: a study of experimentally deformed
 rocksalt. J. Struct, Geol 22, 1609-1620.
- ⁷⁶⁸ Urai, J.L., W. D. Means, and G. S. Lister (1986), Dynamic recrystallization of minerals. In:
 ⁷⁶⁹ Hoobs, B. (Ed.), Mineral and Rock Deformation: Laboratory Studies: The Paterson
 ⁷⁷⁰ Volume, pp. 161-199.
- Urai, J., Z. Schléder, C. Spiers, and P. A. Kukla (2008), Flow and Transport Properties of Salt
 Rocks. In: Littke, R., Bayer, U., Gajewski, D., Nelskamp, S. (Eds.), Dynamics of
 complex intracontinental basins: The Central European Basin System. Springer-Verlag,
 Berlin Heidelberg, 277-290.
- Wang, L., S. Blaha, T. Kawazoe, N. Miyajima, and T. Katsura (2017), Identical activation
 volumes of dislocation mobility in the [100](010) and [001](010) slip systems in natural
 olivine. Geophys. Res. Lett. 44, 2687-2692.

- Weiss, L. E., and H. R. Wenk (1985), Preferred orientation in deformed metals and rocks: an
 introduction to modern texture analysis. Academic Press, London.
- Wenk, H. -R., G. R. Canova, A. Molinari, and H. Mecking (1989), Texture development in
 halite: comparison of Taylor model and self-consistent theory. Acta Metall. 37, 2017 2029.
- Wenk, H. -R., M. Armann, L. Burlini, K. Kunze, and M. Bortolotti (2009), Large strain shearing
 of halite: Experimental and theoretical evidence for dynamic texture changes. Earth and
 Planetary Science Letters 280, 205-210.

786 Figure captions

Figure 1. Initial model configuration, with the original orientation of grains. Three grains are
 selected for a more detailed analysis (shown in Figure 5). Orientations are shown with respect to
 the *x* axis.

Figure 2. Orientation and grain boundary map of a simulation SGC0 with only viscoplastic deformation, i.e., without recovery (SGC0). Orientations are shown with respect to the horizontal x axis. The trace of the shear plane is horizontal and the shear sense is dextral in this and the following figures.

793 Ionowing ligures.

Figure 3. Orientation and grain boundary map of a series of simulations with different degrees of recovery, at a shear strain of y=1: (a-c) SGC0 (no recovery, only viscoplastic deformation), (d-f)

SGC1, (g-i), SGC10, (j-l), SGC25 (1, 10 and 25 steps of recovery per deformation step,

respectively). (a), (d), (g) and (j) show EBSD crystal orientation maps (as in Figure 2). (b), (e),

(h) and (k) display misorientation maps. (c), (f), (i) and (l) show the misorientation with respect

- to the mean of the grain, using the original grains as reference (Figure 1). Note that in order to
- show details only one fourth of the model area is displayed.

Figure 4. Pole figures for the simulations shown in Figure 3. Stereograms on the left and right groups of columns show the CPO evolution for the simulations without recovery (SGC0) and with 25 steps of recover per deformation time step (SGC25), respectively. Equal area projection, with linear contour intervals. The pole figures show that the addition of the recovery process has

remarkably little effect on the CPO's.

Figure 5. Orientation and grain boundary maps showing details of three selected grains (see

Figure 1 for their original orientation and geometry) in the models with SGC0 and SGC10 at

 γ =1.The addition of subgrain coalescence reduces subgrain boundary misorientations and

reduces the crystal orientation spread and the formation of grain and subgrain boundaries. Note

810 that the color coding for grain boundaries is the same as in Figures 2 and 3.

Figure 6. Evolution with progressive strain of the slip system activity for the different simulations, calculated as the average of all *unodes* or crystallites in the simulation.

- Figure 7. Distribution of the slip system activity for the SGC0 simulation, at two deformation stages: (a) $\gamma=0.04$ and (b) $\gamma=1$.
- **Figure 8.** Frequency distribution of grain geometric mean misorientations for different

816 deformation stages (expressed in terms of shear strain γ), for all the experiments performed.

B17 Geometric means of misorientation distributions $\theta_{mean-grains}$ are indicated, together with the

standard deviation of the mean. Misorientations were calculated with respect to the grains at the

- 819 current time step, considering that grains form when the misorientation is higher than 15°. The
- total number of grains is also displayed as an indication of the intensity of grain size reduction.
- 821 The value in parentheses corresponds to the number of grains that contain at least ten crystallites,

and which are considered for the strain gauge discussed in section 4 (see below).

- **Figure 9**. Weighted geometric mean of grain misorientation as a function of natural strain,
- calculated with equation (8). Geometric means are weighted according to the number of

- crystallites per grain. Only grains with a minimum of ten crystallites are considered for the
- calculation. Solid lines show the theoretical power-law relationship for experiments with
- different intensity of intracrystalline recovery using the k_1 values listed in the legend and a
- universal *n* exponent of 2/3 (see discussion section). The R² coefficients are calculated with
- respect to this scaling law. Dashed lines show the best fit for each model (with R^2), with
- exponents of 0.81 (SGC0), 0.76 (SGC1), 0.66 (SGC10) and 0.53 (SG25). The experimental data
- from *Pennock et al.* [2005] are displayed and used to calculate the power-law relationship for the
- experiment without recovery (SGC0) (thick solid line). These data are used as a reference to
- 833 normalize the results of our series of numerical simulations, at $\varepsilon = 1$.

834

Figure 1.



Figure 2 (revised).





Figure 3.



Figure 4.



Figure 5.



Figure 6 (revised).



Figure 7.



Figure 8 (revised).



Figure 9 (revised).

