



Deposited via The University of Sheffield.

White Rose Research Online URL for this paper:

<https://eprints.whiterose.ac.uk/id/eprint/130502/>

Version: Accepted Version

---

**Article:**

Harrison, E.A., Hall, J.P.J. and Brockhurst, M. (2018) Migration promotes plasmid stability under spatially heterogeneous positive selection. *Proceedings of the Royal Society of London: Biological Sciences*, 285. 20180324. ISSN: 0962-8452

<https://doi.org/10.1098/rspb.2018.0324>

---

© 2018 The Author(s) Published by the Royal Society. This is an author produced version of a paper subsequently published in *Proceedings of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences*. Uploaded in accordance with the publisher's self-archiving policy.

**Reuse**

Items deposited in White Rose Research Online are protected by copyright, with all rights reserved unless indicated otherwise. They may be downloaded and/or printed for private study, or other acts as permitted by national copyright laws. The publisher or other rights holders may allow further reproduction and re-use of the full text version. This is indicated by the licence information on the White Rose Research Online record for the item.

**Takedown**

If you consider content in White Rose Research Online to be in breach of UK law, please notify us by emailing [eprints@whiterose.ac.uk](mailto:eprints@whiterose.ac.uk) including the URL of the record and the reason for the withdrawal request.

1 **TITLE:** Migration promotes plasmid stability under spatially heterogeneous positive selection

2

3

4 Ellie Harrison<sup>1</sup>, James P.J. Hall<sup>2</sup> & Michael A. Brockhurst<sup>2</sup>

5 <sup>1</sup>P3 Institute, Department of Animal and Plant Sciences, University of Sheffield, Sheffield, UK, S10

6 1AE

7 <sup>2</sup>Department of Animal and Plant Science, University of Sheffield, Sheffield, UK, S10 2TN

8

9 Corresponding author: [ellie.harrison@sheffield.ac.uk](mailto:ellie.harrison@sheffield.ac.uk)

10

11 **Abstract**

12 Bacteria-plasmid associations can be mutualistic or antagonistic depending on the strength of  
13 positive selection for plasmid-encoded genes, with contrasting outcomes for plasmid stability. In  
14 mutualistic environments, plasmids are swept to high frequency by positive selection, increasing the  
15 likelihood of compensatory evolution to ameliorate the plasmid cost, which promotes long-term  
16 stability. In antagonistic environments, plasmids are purged by negative selection, reducing the  
17 probability of compensatory evolution and driving their extinction. Here we show, using  
18 experimental evolution of *Pseudomonas fluorescens* and the mercury-resistance plasmid, pQBR103,  
19 that migration promotes plasmid stability in spatially heterogeneous selection environments.  
20 Specifically, migration from mutualistic environments, by increasing both the frequency of the  
21 plasmid and the supply of compensatory mutations, stabilized plasmids in antagonistic  
22 environments where, without migration, they approached extinction. These data suggest that  
23 spatially heterogeneous positive selection, which is common in natural environments, coupled with  
24 migration helps to explain the stability of plasmids and the ecologically important genes that they  
25 encode.

26

27 **Key words**

28 Compensatory evolution; amelioration; species interactions; mobile genetic element; spatial  
29 heterogeneity; source-sink

30

31 **Main text**

32 Conjugative plasmids are semi-autonomous mobile genetic elements that have control over their  
33 own replication and transmission, but rely on the bacterial cell for their propagation [1]. Because  
34 plasmids often carry accessory genes encoding ecologically important traits — such as toxin  
35 resistance, novel metabolic functions or virulence factors [2] — they play an important role in  
36 bacterial adaptation and genome evolution through horizontal gene transfer. However, the ubiquity  
37 of plasmids is difficult to explain. Plasmid acquisition is often costly for host cells, due to the  
38 biosynthetic demand placed upon the cell and the disruption of cellular homeostasis [3,4]. The  
39 benefits of plasmid encoded traits meanwhile are often context dependent and only beneficial to  
40 the bacterial host under specific environmental conditions. Thus, interactions between plasmids and  
41 bacteria form a context dependent parasitism-mutualism continuum [5,6]. In environments where  
42 the benefits conferred by plasmid-encoded traits outweigh the costs of plasmid carriage, the  
43 interaction is mutualistic [5,6]. Where these costs are not offset by the benefits of plasmid-encoded  
44 traits, plasmids are parasitic and the interaction is antagonistic [5,6]. The ecological population  
45 dynamics of plasmids are dependent on the balance of these costs and benefits: plasmids will be  
46 maintained at higher frequencies in mutualistic environments due to positive selection. In  
47 antagonistic environments, plasmids which do not have sufficiently high rates of infectious  
48 transmission will be purged by purifying selection potentially leading to extinction of the plasmid  
49 and, concomitantly, reduced evolutionary potential for the bacterial community.

50

51 Compensatory evolution to ameliorate the cost of plasmid carriage can rescue plasmids from  
52 extinction by weakening purifying selection [5,7]. Compensatory evolution has been observed  
53 repeatedly in bacteria-plasmid co-culture studies and is therefore believed to be an important  
54 determinant of plasmid population dynamics [5,8–14]. Recent theory shows that compensatory  
55 evolution is more likely to occur in mutualistic environments because plasmids are at higher  
56 frequency for longer periods of time, increasing the probability that compensation mutations will  
57 arise [13,15]. We predicted, therefore, that under spatially heterogeneous positive selection,  
58 migration from mutualistic to antagonistic patches will stabilize plasmids across the entire landscape  
59 through an eco-evolutionary mechanism, whereby immigrants increase both the frequency of the  
60 plasmid and the supply of compensatory mutations ameliorating the plasmid cost.

61

62 The interaction between the bacterium *Pseudomonas fluorescens* SBW25 [16] and its conjugative  
63 plasmid, pQBR103 [17], forms a context-dependent parasitism-mutualism continuum. Plasmid  
64 carriage imposes a large fitness cost on the host cell, but this cost is progressively outweighed by the

65 fitness benefit of plasmid-encoded mercury resistance at higher concentrations of toxic Hg(II),  
66 creating a fitness gradient from strongly negative to strongly positive selection [5,6]. We previously  
67 showed that *P. fluorescens* can ameliorate the cost of plasmid carriage through compensatory  
68 mutations targeting the GacA/GacS global regulatory system [5]. While parallel compensatory  
69 evolution was observed across the entire parasitism-mutualism continuum, it occurred with higher  
70 likelihood and at a faster rate in mutualistic environments. Since GacA/GacS positively regulates a  
71 well-characterized suite of secreted proteins we are able to track compensatory evolution dynamics  
72 through time using simple phenotypic assays for protease production [18]. Thus, we have developed  
73 a tractable experimental system that allows us to simultaneously follow the ecological dynamics of  
74 plasmid prevalence and the evolutionary dynamics of compensatory mutation in real-time. Here, we  
75 test how the spatial heterogeneity of positive selection and migration rate interact to determine  
76 plasmid stability through their joint effects on plasmid frequency and compensatory evolution  
77 dynamics.

78

## 79 **Materials and Methods**

80 Experimental populations were established using isogenic strains of the bacteria *P. fluorescens*  
81 SBW25 with and without the mercury resistance plasmid, pQBR103. Strain SBW25-Gm carries a  
82 gentamicin resistance marker and strain SBW25-Sm-*lacZ* carries both a streptomycin resistance  
83 marker and the *lacZ* gene. Antibiotic markers were used to introduce the plasmid by conjugation  
84 [19] and the *lacZ* gene was used to distinguish between strains when spread on to media containing  
85 X-gal. Populations were grown in 30 ml glass vials in 6 ml Kings B Broth shaking at 28°C.

86

87 Six replicate populations were established for each treatment. Experimental treatments consisted of  
88 3 mercury selection 'landscapes' and 3 immigration rates in a factorial design, with the addition of 2  
89 control treatments which experienced no immigration (figure 1). Experimental landscapes consisted  
90 of a focal 'patch', which was represented by a 6 ml sub-population initiated with 50:50 plasmid-  
91 containing and plasmid-free SBW25-Gm, and a source patch, represented by a 6 ml sub-population  
92 of 50:50 plasmid-containing and plasmid-free SBW25-Sm-*lacZ*. The three mercury selection  
93 landscapes consisted of a heterogeneous landscape with a mutualistic (40  $\mu\text{M}$  HgCl<sub>2</sub>) source patch  
94 and an antagonistic (0  $\mu\text{M}$  HgCl<sub>2</sub>) focal patch, and two homogenous landscapes: purely antagonistic  
95 (0  $\mu\text{M}$  HgCl<sub>2</sub> in both patches) and purely mutualistic (40  $\mu\text{M}$  HgCl<sub>2</sub> in both patches). All populations  
96 were propagated by serial transfer every two days. For each replicate population, 60  $\mu\text{l}$  of the source  
97 sub-population was transferred directly to a fresh microcosm while focal sub-populations were first  
98 mixed with bacteria from their source sub-population at three rates of immigration (0.1, 1 and 10%)

99 and then transferred (figure. 1). Carry-over of HgCl<sub>2</sub> from mutualistic source patches due to  
100 migration is expected to be negligible. The *mer* operon provides resistance through detoxification of  
101 Hg(II) into the less toxic Hg(0) which evaporates. After approximately 6 hrs the supernatant of  
102 plasmid-containing cultures is non-toxic to plasmid-free sensitive cells, suggesting that the  
103 concentration of Hg(II) is already substantially reduced (figure S1). Control populations, with no  
104 immigration, were established at either 0 μM or 40 μM HgCl<sub>2</sub>.

105

106 Populations were evolved for 24 transfers (approx. 180 bacterial generations). Every transfer for the  
107 first 12 transfers, and thereafter every 2 transfers, samples of the focal sub-populations were spread  
108 on to skimmed milk agar (10% milk powder in KB agar) containing 20 mg/μl X-gal with and without  
109 20 μM HgCl<sub>2</sub>. Skimmed milk agar was used to identify the spontaneous appearance of GacA/S  
110 compensatory mutations, as the GacA/S regulator controls the production of exoprotease [20].  
111 Colonies positive for GacA/S function can be distinguished by a zone of clearing around the colony.  
112 X-gal was used to distinguish immigrant (blue) and resident (white) bacteria. Milk plates  
113 supplemented with X-gal therefore allowed us to estimate the total population density, the  
114 frequency of immigrants and residents and their GacA/S status, while milk plates supplemented with  
115 X-gal and mercury allowed us to estimate the proportions of these genotypes which contained the  
116 plasmid.

117

118 All analyses were conducted in the R statistical package (R Foundation for Statistical Computing)  
119 using end point data (from transfer 24) unless specified. Data were analysed with ANOVA and  
120 further interrogated using planned contrasts, defined using the 'contrasts' package, allowing specific  
121 comparisons between treatments. Where used specific contrasts are specified in lowercase capital  
122 letters.

123

## 124 **Results**

125 To determine the effects of spatial heterogeneity of positive selection and migration rate on plasmid  
126 population dynamics we tracked plasmid frequencies in focal patches over time. In control  
127 populations that were propagated without immigration, plasmids persisted in all populations but  
128 rapidly declined to very low frequencies in antagonistic patches, consistent with the high cost of  
129 plasmid carriage (figure 2a). With migration, we observed interactive effects of selection landscape  
130 and migration rate on plasmid frequency in focal patches (figure 2a, 2b; LANDSCAPE X MIGRATION  
131 RATE:  $F_{2,48} = 14.81$ ,  $p < 0.001$ ). This was driven by variation in response to migration between the  
132 heterogeneous treatment and the two homogeneous treatments (LANDSCAPE<sub>[HOMOGENEOUS(i.e. mutualistic +</sub>

133 antagonistic) VS HETEROGENEOUS] X MIGRATION RATE:  $t = 5.405$ ,  $p < 0.001$ ). In homogeneous landscapes,  
134 plasmid frequencies in focal patches varied according to the strength of positive selection, such that  
135 they were higher in mutualistic compared to antagonistic landscapes (Figure 2b;  
136 LANDSCAPE<sub>[MUTUALISTIC VS ANTAGONISTIC]</sub>:  $t = 9.89$ ,  $p < 0.001$ ), but did not vary with migration rate  
137 (LANDSCAPE<sub>[MUTUALISTIC VS ANTAGONISTIC]</sub> X MIGRATION RATE:  $t = -0.65$ ,  $p = 0.52$ ). In the heterogeneous  
138 landscape, however, plasmid frequency increased in antagonistic focal patches with increasing  
139 migration rate (figure 2b). While at the lowest migration rate, the plasmid frequency was similar to  
140 those observed in antagonistic focal patches within homogenous landscapes (LANDSCAPE<sub>[MIGRATION =</sub>  
141  $0.1\%$ ; HETEROGENEOUS VS ANTAGONISTIC HOMOGENEOUS] :  $F = 0.114$ ,  $p = 0.742$ ), at higher migration rates, the plasmid  
142 frequencies in focal patches of heterogeneous landscapes exceeded those observed in  
143 homogeneous landscapes (LANDSCAPE<sub>[MIGRATION > 0.1\%; HETEROGENEOUS VS ANTAGONISTIC HOMOGENEOUS]</sub> :  $F = 26.71$   $P$   
144  $< 0.0001$ ). This suggests that plasmid stability was enhanced by higher migration rates under  
145 spatially heterogeneous positive selection, whereas migration had no effect on plasmid frequency in  
146 spatially homogeneous selection environments.

147

148 To determine the dynamics of compensatory evolution in focal patches, we tracked the frequency of  
149 the protease negative phenotype associated with mutated *gacA/gacS* loci of *P. fluorescens* SBW25.  
150 Protease negative phenotypes appeared rapidly in all populations regardless of treatment (figure.  
151 2a; LANDSCAPE:  $F_{2,50} = 0.36$ ,  $p = 0.702$ , MIGRATION RATE:  $F_{1,50} = 2.66$ ,  $p = 0.110$ ), and swept to high  
152 frequency among plasmid-bearers (68-100% of mercury resistant colonies were protease negative at  
153 transfer-24; figure 2a), indicating that compensatory evolution played a key role in the survival of  
154 the plasmid in our experiment. We next estimated the proportion of immigrant genotypes among  
155 the plasmid-bearers in focal patches. Immigrant and resident genotypes were distinguished using  
156 the *lacZ* marker. Although the *lacZ* marked strain appears to have had a slight fitness advantage over  
157 the unlabelled strain, the response to migration rate differed significantly between homogeneous  
158 and heterogeneous treatments (LANDSCAPE<sub>[HOMOGENEOUS VS HETEROGENEOUS]</sub> X MIGRATION RATE:  $t = 5.41$ ,  
159  $p < 0.001$ ). In both types of homogeneous landscape, the proportion of immigrant plasmid-bearers  
160 in focal patches increased with the rate of migration (Fig. 2c; MIGRATION RATE<sub>[HOMOGENEOUS ONLY]</sub>:  $F =$   
161  $111.883$ ,  $p < 0.001$ ) with no significant difference between treatments (LANDSCAPE<sub>[MUTUALISTIC VS</sub>  
162  $ANTAGONISTIC]:  $t = 1.151$ ,  $p = 0.256$ ). By contrast, in the heterogeneous landscape, immigrant plasmid-  
163 bearers comprised >90% of plasmid-bearing population regardless of the migration rate  
164 (MIGRATION RATE<sub>[HETEROGENEOUS ONLY]</sub>:  $F = 0.517$ ,  $p = 0.482$ ). Taken together, these data suggest that  
165 plasmid stability in antagonistic focal patches under spatially heterogeneous positive selection  
166 required the immigration from mutualistic patches of plasmid-bearing genotypes that had acquired$

167 compensatory mutations.

168

## 169 **Discussion**

170 Using a tractable bacteria-plasmid model system, where the ecological plasmid population dynamics  
171 and the compensatory evolution dynamics can be jointly tracked in real-time, we show that  
172 migration stabilized plasmids under spatially heterogeneous positive selection by simultaneously  
173 increasing both the plasmid frequency and the supply of compensatory mutations. This adds to our  
174 understanding of the key role for compensatory evolution in plasmid stability, illustrating how  
175 ecological context can enhance this evolutionary process within heterogeneous environments. The  
176 likelihood of compensatory evolution, and thus plasmid survival, increases with the strength and  
177 frequency of positive selection [15], and, as shown here, with the rate of immigration from  
178 subpopulations experiencing positive selection. Spatial heterogeneity is widely thought to be a  
179 common feature of the environments bacterial communities inhabit across a wide range of  
180 ecological scales. Spatially structured environments, such as soils, are likely to contain  
181 heterogeneous microenvironments with localized patches of positive selection [21,22]. Indeed,  
182 positive selection for plasmid-encoded traits can vary at the  $\mu\text{m}$  scale, creating microscale  
183 population structure [23] that may be overlooked by less sensitive measurement approaches. Even  
184 low rates of migration in spatially heterogeneous selection landscapes can spread beneficial  
185 mutations from localized hotspots of positive selection to facilitate adaptation across the entire  
186 landscape [24–26]. At larger spatial scales, antibiotic use in hospitals and farms will create hotspots  
187 of positive selection for resistance plasmids, leading to higher plasmid frequencies and higher rates  
188 of compensatory evolution. Emigration of compensated plasmid-bearers from these environments,  
189 e.g. via waste-water systems [27], spreads not just the antibiotic resistance genes carried by the  
190 plasmid, but also bacterial lineages able to maintain plasmids in the absence of antibiotics with  
191 minimal fitness cost. By acting as plasmid ‘sources’ in their new communities, these lineages could  
192 maintain community-wide access to the mobile gene pool [28]. Thus, the joint eco-evolutionary  
193 effects of migration on plasmid frequency and compensatory evolution could help to explain why  
194 resistance plasmids are so commonly isolated from uncontaminated environments [29].

195

196 Our work has shown that compensatory mutations arise rapidly and have the potential to spread  
197 widely. We have previously shown that compensatory evolution is more likely to evolve in  
198 environments where plasmids are under positive selection [15]. Here we extend this to show that  
199 the invasion of compensatory evolution need not be limited by the prevailing local environment if  
200 migration increases the supply of compensatory mutations. Within our experimental system

201 compensatory mutations occur at relatively high frequency as the *gacA/gacS* loci are known to have  
202 an elevated mutation rate [30]. Thus, because compensatory mutations arose in all focal patches,  
203 an effect of migration on plasmid frequency could not be detected at the lowest migration rate. The  
204 frequency of compensated plasmid-carrying genotypes was, however, significantly increased by  
205 higher migration rates in environments with heterogeneous positive selection. For alternative  
206 mechanisms of compensation with lower mutation rates we would expect even low rates of  
207 migration to enhance the spread of compensatory mutations.

208

209 However, the success of plasmid-bearing emigrants in new environments may be limited by context  
210 dependent effects of the compensatory mutations themselves. For example, compensatory  
211 mutations targeting the GacA/S global regulatory system prevent expression of large set of bacterial  
212 secreted proteins which are important for competitive interactions with other microbes [31,32],  
213 protection from predators [33] and virulence against eukaryotic hosts [34]. In extreme cases,  
214 compensatory mutations can be costly in the absence of the plasmid even in the environment where  
215 they evolved [35]. Similarly, some compensatory mutations are beneficial only in the absence of  
216 positive selection [36,37], for example where the cost of the plasmid is linked to the expression of  
217 its beneficial trait [38]; under this scenario the effects of migration on the spread of compensatory  
218 mutations may be limited. Thus, pleiotropic effects of compensatory mutations may lead to  
219 compensated emigrants being at a disadvantage in their new environment, limiting their  
220 dissemination. Additionally, compensatory evolution could effectively 'lock' bacteria — by reducing  
221 the strength of purifying selection — into associations with plasmids that are not beneficial under  
222 local environmental conditions, a scenario akin to symbiont addiction [39]. This could be detrimental  
223 to the lineage's long-term evolvability, because it would prevent acquisition of alternative plasmids  
224 from the same incompatibility group [40], limiting access to the mobile gene pool.

225

226 Plasmids are the principal mobile genetic elements driving horizontal gene transfer in bacterial  
227 communities and, thus, plasmid stability is an important determinant of bacterial evolution.  
228 Environments without positive selection for plasmid-encoded functions have a greater degree of  
229 plasmid horizontal transmission [41] and of interspecific gene mobilization [42]. Thus, by boosting  
230 plasmid residence times in these environments through jointly increasing both the frequency of  
231 plasmids and the supply of compensatory mutations, migration could enhance rates of horizontal  
232 gene transfer in bacterial communities.

233

234 **Acknowledgements**

235 This work was supported funding from the European Research Council awarded to MAB (StG-2012-  
236 311490-COEVOCON), a Leverhulme Prize from the Leverhulme Trust awarded to MAB (PLP-2014-  
237 242) and a NERC Research Fellowship awarded to EH (NE/P017584/1)

238

#### 239 **Data accessibility**

240 The data supporting this article are available in supplementary table 1

241

#### 242 **Authors' contributions**

243 EH, JPJH and MAB conceived the experiment. EH conducted the experiment, analysis and wrote the  
244 first draft. EH, JPJH and MAB contributed substantially to the discussion, writing and revisions of the  
245 manuscript.

246

#### 247 **Competing interests**

248 We declare we have no competing interests.

249

#### 250 **Ethics statement**

251 There are not ethical issues regarding this work

252

253

254

255

256

257

258 Fig. 1 Transfer strategy for selection experiment. Bacterial populations were propagated by serial  
259 transfer of 1% of the population to fresh media (represented by arrows) every 48 hrs. Figure shows  
260 the strategy for a single bacterial transfer step for the 2 control treatments and 3 migration  
261 treatments. Control populations were propagated by simple transfer of bacteria from one  
262 population to a fresh environment. Populations in the migration treatments consisted of two paired  
263 sub-populations. At each transfer bacteria from the source (blue line) sub-population were  
264 transferred as normal and bacteria from the focal (black line) sub-population were first mixed with  
265 bacteria from the source (blue line) sub-population at 3 migration rates (0.1, 1 and 10%) before  
266 being transferred.

267

268 Fig. 2 The impacts of migration across treatments. A. Population dynamics within plasmid-containing  
269 individuals over the course of the selection experiment. The total shaded area shows the proportion

270 of plasmid containing individuals in the focal subpopulations, averaged across 6 replicate population.  
271 Shading is broken down by genotype, showing the relative proportion of resident (grey) and  
272 immigrant (blue) bacteria which were positive (light) or negative (dark) for the GacA/S phenotype  
273 (i.e. dark areas indicate compensatory mutations). B. Summary of endpoint (transfer 24) mean  
274 plasmid prevalence (n=6). C. Mean proportion of plasmid containing individuals that are from the  
275 source population (lacZ+) at the final time point (n=6).

276

277 Figure S1

278 Rate of Hg(II) detoxification by bacteria carrying the *mer* mercury resistance operon measured as  
279 MIC of supernatant following growth with plasmid containing bacteria. KB media microcosms were  
280 initiated with 40µM HgCl<sub>2</sub> and either inoculated with bacteria carrying the plasmid pQBR103 (black)  
281 or with no bacteria (grey). 3x bacteria and control microcosms were destructively sampled after 0, 2,  
282 4, 6 and 8 hrs of incubation at 28°C and media was filtered to remove bacteria. Media was then  
283 diluted with mercury free KB along a gradient of dilution factors from 1 (100% spent mercury  
284 supernatant) to 0 (100% mercury-free supernatant) in increments of 0.1 in a 96 well plate. 1 plate  
285 was established for each biological replicate per time point with 8x replicate wells per dilution  
286 factor. Mercury susceptible bacteria were then inoculated into 7 wells per dilution factor with one  
287 left as a control for carry over plasmid containing bacteria. Positive (fresh mercury free media) and  
288 negative (fresh mercury containing media) growth controls were included on each plate. After 24hrs  
289 of growth at 28°C the minimum inhibitory concentration was recorded.

290

291

292

293 Supplementary table 1

294 Raw data from immigration experiment. Data are shown as raw colony counts and converted to  
295 population density (cfus/ml). Counts of were taken from 2 plate types; skimmed milk agar + X-gal  
296 with no mercury (grey) which gives counts for the whole population and skimmed milk agar + X-gal +  
297 mercury (pink) which gives mercury resistant and therefore plasmid + counts only. From each plate 4  
298 genotypes can be distinguished: GAC+ lacz- (GacAS positive, resident), gac- lacz- (GacAS negative,  
299 resident), GAC+ LACZ+ (GacAS positive, immigrant), gac- LACZ+ (GacAS negative, immigrant). Colony  
300 counts are then converted to population density (cfu/ml) based on the dilution factor counted  
301 (selecting the dilution with the most countable colonies).

302

303 1. Norman A, Hansen LH, Sørensen SJ. 2009 Conjugative plasmids: vessels of the communal gene

- 304 pool. *Philos. Trans. R. Soc. Lond. B Biol. Sci.* **364**, 2275–2289.
- 305 2. Ochman H, Lawrence JG, Groisman EA. 2000 Lateral gene transfer and the nature of bacterial  
306 innovation. *Nature* **405**, 299–304.
- 307 3. Baltrus DA. 2013 Exploring the costs of horizontal gene transfer. *Trends Ecol. Evol.* **28**, 489–495.
- 308 4. San Millan A, MacLean RC. 2017 Fitness Costs of Plasmids: a Limit to Plasmid Transmission.  
309 *Microbiol Spectr* **5**. (doi:10.1128/microbiolspec.MTBP-0016-2017)
- 310 5. Harrison E, Guymer D, Spiers AJ, Paterson S, Brockhurst MA. 2015 Parallel compensatory  
311 evolution stabilizes plasmids across the parasitism-mutualism continuum. *Curr. Biol.* **25**, 2034–  
312 2039.
- 313 6. Hall JPJ, Harrison E, Lilley AK, Paterson S, Spiers AJ, Brockhurst MA. 2015 Environmentally co-  
314 occurring mercury resistance plasmids are genetically and phenotypically diverse and confer  
315 variable context-dependent fitness effects. *Environ. Microbiol.* **17**, 5008–5022.
- 316 7. Harrison E, Brockhurst MA. 2012 Plasmid-mediated horizontal gene transfer is a coevolutionary  
317 process. *Trends Microbiol.* **20**, 262–267.
- 318 8. Dahlberg C, Chao L. 2003 Amelioration of the cost of conjugative plasmid carriage in *Escherichia*  
319 *coli* K12. *Genetics* **165**, 1641–1649.
- 320 9. De Gelder L, Williams JJ, Ponciano JM, Sota M, Top EM. 2008 Adaptive plasmid evolution results  
321 in host-range expansion of a broad-host-range plasmid. *Genetics* **178**, 2179–2190.
- 322 10. Dionisio F, Conceição IC, Marques ACR, Fernandes L, Gordo I. 2005 The evolution of a  
323 conjugative plasmid and its ability to increase bacterial fitness. *Biol. Lett.* **1**, 250–252.
- 324 11. Heuer H, Fox RE, Top EM. 2006 Frequent conjugative transfer accelerates adaptation of a  
325 broad-host-range plasmid to an unfavorable *Pseudomonas putida* host: Adaptation of a plasmid  
326 to an unfavorable host. *FEMS Microbiol. Ecol.* **59**, 738–748.
- 327 12. Porse A, Schønning K, Munck C, Sommer MOA. 2016 Survival and Evolution of a Large Multidrug  
328 Resistance Plasmid in New Clinical Bacterial Hosts. *Mol. Biol. Evol.* **33**, 2860–2873.
- 329 13. San Millan A, Peña-Miller R, Toll-Riera M, Halbert ZV, McLean AR, Cooper BS, MacLean RC. 2014  
330 Positive selection and compensatory adaptation interact to stabilize non-transmissible  
331 plasmids. *Nat. Commun.* **5**, 5208.
- 332 14. Yano H, Wegrzyn K, Loftie-Eaton W, Johnson J, Deckert GE, Rogers LM, Konieczny I, Top EM.  
333 2016 Evolved plasmid-host interactions reduce plasmid interference cost. *Mol. Microbiol.* **101**,  
334 743–756.
- 335 15. Harrison E, Dytham C, Hall JPJ, Guymer D, Spiers AJ, Paterson S, Brockhurst MA. 2016 Rapid  
336 compensatory evolution promotes the survival of conjugative plasmids. *Mob. Genet. Elements*  
337 **6**, e1179074.
- 338 16. Bailey MJ, Lilley AK, Thompson IP, Rainey PB, Ellis RJ. 1995 Site directed chromosomal marking  
339 of a fluorescent pseudomonad isolated from the phytosphere of sugar beet; stability and  
340 potential for marker gene transfer. *Mol. Ecol.* **4**, 755–763.
- 341 17. Tett A *et al.* 2007 Sequence-based analysis of pQBR103; a representative of a unique, transfer-

- 342 proficient mega plasmid resident in the microbial community of sugar beet. *ISME J.* **1**, 331–340.
- 343 18. Stevenson C, Hall JPJ, Brockhurst MA, Harrison E. 2018 Plasmid stability is enhanced by higher-  
344 frequency pulses of positive selection. *Proc. Biol. Sci.* **285**. (doi:10.1098/rspb.2017.2497)
- 345 19. Simonsen L, Gordon DM, Stewart FM, Levin BR. 1990 Estimating the rate of plasmid transfer: an  
346 end-point method. *J. Gen. Microbiol.* **136**, 2319–2325.
- 347 20. Cheng X, de Bruijn I, van der Voort M, Loper JE, Raaijmakers JM. 2013 The Gac regulon of  
348 *Pseudomonas fluorescens* SBW25. *Environ. Microbiol. Rep.* **5**, 608–619.
- 349 21. Vos M, Wolf AB, Jennings SJ, Kowalchuk GA. 2013 Micro-scale determinants of bacterial  
350 diversity in soil. *FEMS Microbiol. Rev.* **37**, 936–954.
- 351 22. Becker JM, Parkin T, Nakatsu CH, Wilbur JD, Konopka A. 2006 Bacterial activity, community  
352 structure, and centimeter-scale spatial heterogeneity in contaminated soil. *Microb. Ecol.* **51**,  
353 220–231.
- 354 23. Slater FR, Bruce KD, Ellis RJ, Lilley AK, Turner SL. 2010 Determining the effects of a spatially  
355 heterogeneous selection pressure on bacterial population structure at the sub-millimetre scale.  
356 *Microb. Ecol.* **60**, 873–884.
- 357 24. Bell T. 2010 Experimental tests of the bacterial distance–decay relationship. *ISME J.* **4**, 1357–  
358 1365.
- 359 25. Franklin RB, Mills AL. 2003 Multi-scale variation in spatial heterogeneity for microbial  
360 community structure in an eastern Virginia agricultural field. *FEMS Microbiol. Ecol.* **44**, 335–346.
- 361 26. Zhang Q, Lambert G, Liao D, Kim H, Robin K, Tung C-K, Pourmand N, Austin RH. 2011  
362 Acceleration of Emergence of Bacterial Antibiotic Resistance in Connected Microenvironments.  
363 *Science* **333**, 1764–1767.
- 364 27. Kotay S, Chai W, Guilford W, Barry K, Mathers AJ. 2017 Spread from the Sink to the Patient: In  
365 Situ Study Using Green Fluorescent Protein (GFP)-Expressing *Escherichia coli* To Model Bacterial  
366 Dispersion from Hand-Washing Sink-Trap Reservoirs. *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.* **83**.  
367 (doi:10.1128/AEM.03327-16)
- 368 28. Hall JPJ, Wood AJ, Harrison E, Brockhurst MA. 2016 Source-sink plasmid transfer dynamics  
369 maintain gene mobility in soil bacterial communities. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U. S. A.* **113**, 8260–  
370 8265.
- 371 29. Lilley AK, Bailey MJ, Day MJ, Fry JC. 1996 Diversity of mercury resistance plasmids obtained by  
372 exogenous isolation from the bacteria of sugar beet in three successive years. *FEMS Microbiol.*  
373 *Ecol.* **20**, 211–227.
- 374 30. van den Broek D, Chin-A-Woeng TFC, Bloemberg GV, Lugtenberg BJJ. 2005 Molecular nature of  
375 spontaneous modifications in *gacS* which cause colony phase variation in *Pseudomonas* sp.  
376 strain PCL1171. *J. Bacteriol.* **187**, 593–600.
- 377 31. Berry CL, Nandi M, Manuel J, Brassinga AKC, Fernando WGD, Loewen PC, de Kievit TR. 2014  
378 Characterization of the *Pseudomonas* sp. DF41 quorum sensing locus and its role in fungal  
379 antagonism. *Biol. Control* **69**, 82–89.
- 380 32. Koch B, Nielsen TH, Sørensen D, Andersen JB, Christophersen C, Molin S, Givskov M, Sørensen J,

- 381 Nybroe O. 2002 Lipopeptide production in *Pseudomonas* sp. strain DSS73 is regulated by  
382 components of sugar beet seed exudate via the Gac two-component regulatory system. *Appl.*  
383 *Environ. Microbiol.* **68**, 4509–4516.
- 384 33. Bjørnlund L, Rønn R, Péchy-Tarr M, Maurhofer M, Keel C, Nybroe O. 2009 Functional GacS in  
385 *Pseudomonas* DSS73 prevents digestion by *Caenorhabditis elegans* and protects the nematode  
386 from killer flagellates. *ISME J.* **3**, 770–779.
- 387 34. Cha JY, Lee DG, Lee JS, Oh J-I, Baik HS. 2012 GacA directly regulates expression of several  
388 virulence genes in *Pseudomonas syringae* pv. *tabaci* 11528. *Biochem. Biophys. Res. Commun.*  
389 **417**, 665–672.
- 390 35. Bouma JE, Lenski RE. 1988 Evolution of a bacteria plamid association. *Nature* **335**, 351–352.
- 391 36. Paulander W, Maisnier-Patin S, Andersson DI. 2007 Multiple mechanisms to ameliorate the  
392 fitness burden of mupirocin resistance in *Salmonella typhimurium*. *Mol. Microbiol.* **64**, 1038–  
393 1048.
- 394 37. Schulz zur Wiesch P, Engelstadter J, Bonhoeffer S. 2010 Compensation of Fitness Costs and  
395 Reversibility of Antibiotic Resistance Mutations. *Antimicrob. Agents Chemother.* **54**, 2085–2095.
- 396 38. Bottery MJ, Wood AJ, Brockhurst MA. 2017 Adaptive modulation of antibiotic resistance  
397 through intragenomic coevolution. *Nat Ecol Evol* **1**, 1364–1369.
- 398 39. Aanen DK, Hoekstra RF. 2007 The evolution of obligate mutualism: if you can't beat 'em, join  
399 'em. *Trends Ecol. Evol.* **22**, 506–509.
- 400 40. Novick RP. 1987 Plasmid incompatibility. *Microbiol. Rev.* **51**, 381–395.
- 401 41. Stevenson C, Hall JP, Harrison E, Wood AJ, Brockhurst MA. 2017 Gene mobility promotes the  
402 spread of resistance in bacterial populations. *ISME J.* (doi:10.1038/ismej.2017.42)
- 403 42. Hall JPJ, Williams D, Paterson S, Harrison E, Brockhurst MA. 2017 Positive selection inhibits gene  
404 mobilisation and transfer in soil bacterial communities. *Nat Ecol Evol* **1**, 1348–1353.
- 405
- 406