This is a repository copy of *Developing definitions of reform in the church in the ninth and tenth centuries*.

White Rose Research Online URL for this paper:
http://eprints.whiterose.ac.uk/100444/

Version: Accepted Version

Book Section:

Developing definitions of reform in the church in the ninth and tenth centuries

Julia Barrow

Since the nineteenth century it has been normal for modern scholars of the middle ages to

frame the narrative of the medieval church as a sequence of periods of decadence

interspersed with periods of reform,[1] with little reflection on the values inherent in the

word 'reform', on the post-medieval associations of the word, or on the actual frequency

of medieval use of the Latin terms reformare and reformatio from which English

'reform' derives.[2] Gerhart Ladner's The Idea of Reform, published in 1959,[3] which traced

the development of the use of the term 'reform' by St Paul and by Patristic authors to

describe individual spiritual change of heart, was not followed by further study of how

the term 'reform' was used in other contexts in the earlier and central middle ages, apart

from Ladner's own trailblazing study of Gregory VII's use of the word, which showed

that it was used only four times in Gregory's letters to describe institutional change in

---

[1] For example, Augustin Fliche, La réforme grégorienne, 3 vols. (Louvain, 1924-37), esp. i, 1-128; Émile Amann and Auguste Dumas, *L'Église au pouvoir des laïques (888-*1057) (Paris, 1948); I. S. Robinson, 'Reform and the Church', in David Luscombe and Jonathan Riley-Smith (eds.), The New Cambridge Medieval History, IV: c.1024-c.1198, Part 1 (Cambridge, 2008), 268-334. Giles Constable, The Reformation of the Twelfth Century (Cambridge, 1996), is a little more analytical but insufficiently so, lumping together different terms and overstating the extent to which the word reformare was used in the twelfth century. For a survey of the religious and political uses of the term from medieval to modern times, see Eike Wolgast, 'Reform, Reformation', in Otto Brunner, Werner Conze and Reinhart Koselleck (eds.), Geschichtliche Grundbegriffe: Historisches Lexikon zur politisch-sozialen Sprache in Deutschland, 8 vols. in 9 (Stuttgart, 1972-97), v, 313-60; for more on the post-medieval associations, see Joanna Innes, 'Reform in English public life: the fortunes of a word' and Arthur Burns, 'English church reform revisited, 1780-1840', both in Arthur Burns and Joanna Innes (eds.), Rethinking the Age of Reform: Britain 1780-1850 (Oxford, 2013).
[2] Reformare ('to reshape'; 'to form anew') is a translation of Greek metamorphoun, used in Platonic philosophy to define changes in form and then by Paul to describe change of heart in Romans XII, 2.
[3] Gerhart B. Ladner, The Idea of Reform (Cambridge, MA, 1959), dealing with the development of theological ideas about reform in Patristic writings and the transmission of these into the very early middle ages, is fundamental.

churches.[4] Reframing the history of reform is long overdue. There has recently been more awareness of the need to examine the vocabulary used by medieval authors themselves to define change, especially for the Frankish church, and recent scholarship has stressed the roles of terms such as *correctio* and *emendatio* in official demands for improvement and change, but more needs to be done.[5] However, there has hitherto been no attempt to pinpoint when the words *reformare* and *reformatio* began to be used to describe the process of intentional, programmatic change in ecclesiastical institutions in the period before the mid-eleventh century. This is what this paper sets out to do. It will begin by surveying the range of uses of the word *reformare* in the earlier middle ages and will then trace the stages by which 'reform' came to be applied to change within individual ecclesiastical institutions in the tenth and early eleventh centuries. Key areas in this process were the ecclesiastical provinces of Rheims and Trier, which had been the heartland of the Carolingian empire, reacting to destruction of churches by Vikings, Hungarians and others, but church leaders here were building on earlier ninth-century canon law formulae circulating throughout Frankish territories that themselves were a response to Carolingian civil war.

For a general overview of the development of the definitions of *reformare* and *reformatio* word searches in Migne's Patrologia Latina are helpful, for, although its editions are faulty and long out-dated, it does supply a chronological sweep of the most

---

[4] Gerhart Ladner, 'Gregory the Great and Gregory VII: a comparison of their concepts of renewal' (with 'A note on the computer methods used' by D.W. Packard), Viator, iv (1973), 1-31, at 17-19.

[5] Timothy Reuter, 'Kirchenreform und Kirchenpolitik" im Zeitalter Karl Martells: Begriffe und Wirklichkeit', in Jörg Jarnut, Ulrich Nonn and Michael Richter (eds.), Karl Martell in seiner Zeit (Sigmaringen, 1994), 35-59; Julia Smith, '"Emending evil ways and praising God's omnipotence": Einhard and the uses of Roman martyrs', in Kenneth Mills and Anthony Grafton (eds.), Conversion in Late Antiquity and the Early Middle Ages: Seeing and Believing (Rochester, NY, 2003), 189-223 on correctio; Julia Barrow, 'Ideas and applications of reform', in Thomas F. X. Noble and Julia M. H. Smith (eds.), The Cambridge History of Christianity: Early Medieval Christianities, III: c. 600-c. 1100 (Cambridge, 2008), 345-62. The term deformatio also deserves examination.

significant Christian theological writings, together with many minor theological and canonistic works and a large number of historical narratives, allowing a very basic timeline to be worked out.[6] This can usefully be supplemented by word-searches in other, much more authoritative series, such as the digital Monumenta Germaniae Historica and Chartes originales antérieures à 1121 conservées en France, a searchable database of original charters from the earlier middle ages preserved in French collections.[7] What is attempted here is simply an outline; more detailed work will have to be undertaken to fill in the gaps. These searches show that, first, the word reformare was used much less often than the word 'reform' in modern English, and secondly that the range of meanings was wider. Over the period from c. 800 to c. 1030, the principal meanings of the word were:

(1) individual spiritual change of heart (Paul's sense of 'reform');[8]

(2) restoring health, or sight, or hearing (reformare occurs quite frequently in healing miracles);[9] similarly, regaining one's mental faculties;[10]

(3) restoring peace, concord, charity or friendship – reformare pacem is a frequently occurring phrase in annals and charters;[11]

---

[6] http://pld.chadwyck.co.uk (Patrologia Latina Database, consulted 19 April 2013), hereafter PL.
[7] http://www.mgh.de/dmgh/pub/ (Die digitalen Monumenta Historica Germaniae); http://www.cn-telma.fr/originaux/index (Chartes originales antérieures à 1121 conservées en France, hereafter Chartes originales). For discussion of reform language in Chartes originales, see Laurent Morelle, 'Les mots de la "réforme" dans les sources diplomatiques du XIe siècle. Un premier bilan', in Julia Barrow, Fabrice Delivré and Véronique Gazeau (eds.), Autour de Lanfranc (1010-2010). Réforme et réformateurs dans l'Europe du Nord-Ouest (XIe-XIIe siècle (Caen, 2015), 33-55.
[8] For example PL, cxxx, 49C, 66A, 215A (Pseudo-Isidore); cxxxi, 157D, 165A, 268A, 509C, 537A (Remigius of Auxerre, Enarrationes in Psalmos); cxxxiv, 210-11 (Atto of Vercelli, Expositio epistolarum Sancti Pauli).
[9] PL, cxxxii, 596D, 599B (Odilo of Soissons, De translatione Sancti Sebastiani); PL, cxxxv, 609, 635, 705 (Flodoard, De Christi triumphis apud Italiam libri quatuordecim).
[10] Ibid., 534B (Flodoard, De triumphis Christi sanctorumque Palaestinae libri tres).
[11] For example, Capitularia regum Francorum, ed. Alfred Boretius and Victor Krause, 2 vols. (MGH LL, ii, 1-2 Hanover, 1883-97), ii, 106, 447; Ruotgeri Vita Brunonis, ed. Irene Ott (MGH SSRG, x, Cologne, 1958), 22 (c. 21: the peace of the church). See also Morelle, 'Les mots', 42.

(4) restoring property, rights and privileges. Carolingian capitularies use reformare for the restoration of runaway slaves and for the restoration of wives to men who had been presumed dead and who had then returned from long-term captivity.[12] Charters and other sources frequently use reformare for restoration of property.[13]

(5) restoring people to office. Gunthar, deposed as archbishop of Cologne, wrote a treatise pleading to be restored to office in 865.[14] In this, he notes that popes had often restored ('reformasse') bishops to their former offices and also cites a letter of Leo I to Bishop Anatolius saying that penitent clerics should be restored to their orders ('suis ordinibus reformentur').[15]

(6) rebuilding or restoration of buildings: although restaurare and reparare are more frequently used in this sense than reformare, the latter is quite often used for this meaning.[16]

---

[12] Leo I had used reformare for the restoration of wives to husbands released after long captivity (Regesta pontificum romanorum, ed. Philipp Jaffé, 2nd edn by S. Loewenfeld, F. Kaltenbrunner and P. Ewald, 2 vols. (Leipzig, 1885-8), i, no. 536, often quoted in Carolingian sources, for example Hincmar, De divortio Lotharii regis et Theutbergae reginae, ed. Letha Böhringer (MGH, Concilia, iv, Suppl. 1 (Hanover, 1992), 197); see also Ladner, 'Gregory', 14, for use in this sense by Gregory I.

[13] Die Konzilien der karolingischen Teilreiche, 860-874, ed. Wilfried Hartmann (MGH, Concilia, iv, Hanover, 1998), 329 (in the sanction clause of a charter for the abbey of Charroux issued at the Synod of Verberie in 869); Capitula Episcoporum, ed. Peter Brommer, Rudolf Pokorny and Martina Stratmann, 4 vols. (MGH, Hanover, 1984-2005), ii, 220 (Capitula of Bishop Isaac of Langres, VI, c. 7); Pseudo-Isidore, Preface (PL, cxxx, 9A); Morelle, 'Les mots', 59; for Gregory I's use of this meaning see Ladner, 'Gregory', 14.

[14] Konzilien der karolingischen Teilreiche, 860-874, ed. Hartmann, 192-7; for similar usage by Gregory I see Ladner, 'Gregory', 14.

[15] Konzilien der karolingischen Teilreiche, 860-874, ed. Hartmann, 192, 194; in addition, Gunthar says that the grace of redemption has transformed ('reformavit') the sons of wrath into the glory of sons of adoption (ibid., 193). For some further examples see Concilia aevi Karolini, i: 742-817, ed. Alfred Werminghoff, MGH Concilia, ii, part 1 (Berlin, 1906), 121; Papsturkunden 896-1046, ed. Harald Zimmermann, 3 vols. (Vienna, 1984-9), i, 21 (no. 10 [899]), ii, 714 (no. 366 [999]).

[16] Ladner, 'Gregory', 15; Capitularia regum Francorum, ed. Boretius, i, 290 (Capitulare missorum, c. 10) and see nn. 35-7 below on Regino; Die Urkunden der deutschen Karolinger, II: Die Urkunden Karls III., ed. Paul Kehr (MGH DD, Berlin, 1937), 137 (no. 85, reforming, i.e. restoring, the canonica or canons' accommodation at Reggio in 883) and 213 (no. 133 for St Maximin, Trier, in 885: see below at n. 28).

(7) restoring things pertaining to the orders of the Church, or more specifically the monastic order.[17] Occasionally in Carolingian canon law contexts we find reformare with 'monastic order', presumably meaning 'to restore', and connected with uses 3-6 above.

The development of 'reform' vocabulary for institutional reform appears to grow not simply out of the idea of reform as individual spiritual renewal, but, perhaps more strongly, out of the application of the word for restoration of the ordines within the church and also for rebuilding. Interest in the word reformare seems to have been triggered by the political crisis caused by Louis the Pious' death and the outbreak of war between his sons; formulae produced then were preserved for later re-use. The association of reformare with ordines ecclesiae occurs in two pairs of similarly-phrased documents for two monasteries, Saint-Laumer at Moutiers-au-Perche (Orne) in 843 and Cessieu (Isère) in 859: in each case the monastery received a charter from an ecclesiastical synod, and, subsequently, a royal diploma. The wording of the two synodal documents is almost identical and the two royal documents also contain some of the wording of the synodal documents. In the case of Saint-Laumer, the synodal document was produced by a meeting of bishops at Germigny in September-October 843,[18] and the royal diploma was issued by Charles the Bald 14 October 843, probably at Chazé-sur-Argos, about 30 km north-west of Angers.[19] For Cessieu, the synodal document was

---

[17] For example, PL, cxxxii, 1088B (Leo VII on the rights of the church and Christian religion after attacks by invaders, between 937 and 939); note also Archbishop Brun of Cologne's restoration of monasteries in Ruotgeri Vita Brunonis, ed. Ott, 10 (c. 10, describing events of 967-9).

[18] Die Konzilien der karolingischen Teilreiche, 843-859, ed. Wilfried Hartmann (MGH, Concilia, iii, Hanover, 1984), 1-7.

[19] Recueil des actes de Charles II le Chauve, ed. Georges Tessier, 3 vols. (Paris, 1943-52), i, 67-71, no. 27; many of the problems in this document, including the identification of the place of issue, were discussed and explained by Ferdinand Lot, 'Sur l'authenticité d'un diplôme de Charles le Chauve en faveur de Moutiers-Saint-Lomer, du 14 octobre 843', Le Moyen Âge, xxi (1908), 261-274.

produced at a meeting of bishops at Sisteron in 859,[20] and was confirmed in a diploma

issued by Charles of Provence, probably also in 859 though it bears no date.[21] As

Engelbert Mühlbacher argued, the parallels between the two synodal documents suggest

the use of a formulary, one that apparently was also used in a document produced at the

synod of Paris in 846/7.[22] Although the two abbeys lay in different Frankish kingdoms

and were not connected with each other institutionally, their circumstances were not

wholly dissimilar. Saint-Laumer had been an ancient monastery in the diocese of

Chartres, destroyed and then refounded in the reign of Louis the Pious by Abbot Heiric of

Saint-Mesmin de Micy (near Orléans) with monks from his congregation; Cessieu was a

new foundation by Abbot Aurelian of Saint-Martin d'Ainay (Lyon), also with monks

from his congregation, though in this case on a site which he had obtained through family

inheritance. The synods of Germigny in 843 and Sisteron in 859 were both held in the

aftermath of conflict between Carolingian brothers, as kingdoms were split up on the

deaths of fathers. Germigny came two months after the treaty of Verdun, which divided

the Frankish kingdom between Louis the Pious' three surviving sons and thus

acknowledged Charles' position as ruler of the Western Franks.[23] The council at Sisteron

was held four years after the death of Charles of Provence's father Lothar I (855): during

that time Charles of Provence had secured his succession in Provence and Burgundy only

---

[20] Konzilien der karolingischen Teilreiche, 843-859, ed. Hartmann, 490-3.

[21] Recueil des actes des rois de Provence (855-928), ed. René Poupardin (Paris, 1920), 6-10, no. 4; for discussion of the document see also Engelbert Mühlbacher, 'Eine Urkunde Karls von Burgund', Neues Archiv, xxv (1900), 636-51, who established the text on the basis of two surviving textual fragments.

[22] Mühlbacher, 'Eine Urkunde Karls von Burgund', 640: a privilege for Saint-Denis produced at the synod of Paris (846 or 847) uses the same form of words to describe violence caused by civil war (Konzilien der karolingischen Teilreiche, 843-859, ed. Hartmann, 144).

[23] Janet Nelson, Charles the Bald (London, 1992), 137: Charles' position was still insecure and the council at Germigny was part of the process by which he tried to consolidate support.

with difficulty against his brothers Louis II and Lothar II.[24] By 859 Charles' position was a little more secure: in June of that year it was possible to hold a joint council of bishops from the kingdoms of Charles the Bald, Lothar II and Charles of Provence at Savonnières.[25] The synods at Germigny and Sisteron therefore took place at moments when authorities were seeking to restore peace after periods of civil war. All four documents contain a passage talking of the need to reform for the better those matters in any of the ordines of the church that seem to be established 'less usefully' because of carelessness of the negligent or because of the violence of civil war: 'ea, quae in quibuslibet ordinibus ecclesiae minus constare utiliter videbantur, ob incuriam negligentium aut propter civilis belli transactam violentiam iuvante Christo in melius reformare sategeret'.[26] Presumably reformare is being used to mean 'to restore' here, but the phrase 'in melius' suggests an element of change.

Anxiety about the effects of warfare increased from the later ninth century onwards, as ecclesiastical authorities began to be preoccupied with the effects of Viking attacks, which, interestingly, they often compared with depredations by power-hungry local inhabitants. The preface to the decrees of the council of Fismes in 881, the last council presided over by Hincmar, archbishop of Rheims (845-82), opens 'We, the bishops of diverse provinces, whose names are written below, who before this were prevented through diverse preoccupations, hobbled as much by the attacks of the pagans as the persecutions of wicked Christians, have now, compelled by the greatest necessity,

---

[24] Mühlbacher, 'Eine Urkunde Karls von Burgund', 636.
[25] Nelson, Charles the Bald, 192; Konzilien der karolingischen Teilreiche, 843-859, ed. Hartmann, 447-89; on the abbey of Ainay see Jean-François Reynaud and François Richard (eds.), *L'abbaye d'Ainay des origines au XIIe siècle* (Saint-Just-la-Pendue, 2008).
[26] Konzilien der karolingischen Teilreiche, 843-859, ed. Hartmann, 3; see also ibid., 492 (with 'sategerit'); Recueil des actes de Charles II le Chauve, ed. Tessier, i, 70 (here with 'reformaremus' in place of 'reformare sategeret'); Recueil des actes des rois de Provence (855-928), ed. Poupardin, 8 (also with 'reformaremus' in place of 'reformare sategeret').

met in the name of Christ in the year of the Incarnation 881, in the fourteenth indiction, on 2 April, at the shrine of St Macra in the place which is called Fismes in the diocese of Rheims'.[27] Viking damage to Lotharingian monasteries led Charles the Fat to include an arenga about the necessity of 'reforming' (in the sense of restoring) destroyed monasteries in a grant to St Maximin's Trier in 885.[28] At much greater length, the council of Mainz in 888 commented on the fire and the sword ('gladio et igne') savagery of the pagani, who had destroyed and burned churches, crushed altars, stolen and burned church furnishings, and killed people of both sexes and all ages, but these comments were immediately followed by sharp critique of local 'robbers and schismatics' as well, and they likewise were accused of using fire and the sword.[29] This even-handed approach is also taken by the council of Metz of 893, which complains about 'perverse Christians'.[30] Most significant for our purposes, however, was the Council of Trosly in 909. This brought together the bishops of the province of Rheims under Archbishop Hervey (900-22), and also the archbishop of Rouen and the bishop of Meaux.[31] The decrees of the

---

[27] Die Konzilien der karolingischen Teilreiche, 875-911, ed. Wilfried Hartmann (MGH, Concilia, v, Wiesbaden, 2014), 178: 'Diversarum provinciarum episcopi, quorum nomina tenentur subter adscripta, qui ante nequivimus diversis occupationibus, tam paganorum infestationibus quam pravorum christianorum insectationibus prepediti, nunc anno incarnationis dominicae DCCCLXXXI indictione XIIIIma, IIII nonas Aprilis maxima necessitate compulsi apud martyrium sanctae Macrae in loco, qui dicitur Finibus Remensis parrochiae, in nomine Christi convenimus'.
[28] Urkunden Karls III., ed. Kehr, 213, no. 133 (issued at Worms, 1 October 885): 'ut destructa quaeque monasteria et a propriis incuria deviata privilegiis nostris studiis, ubicumque poterimus, ad pristinum statum reformentur'.
[29] Konzilien der karolingischen Teilreiche, 875-911, ed. Hartmann, 254: 'omnis aetas utriusque sexus, gladio et igne, diversi mortium genere consumpti … Ecce enim e latere turbo raptorum et schismaticorum saevit, qui pauperes et humiles Christi opprimunt et interimunt …. omnes, quos possunt, …. crudeliter, sui immemores, aut igni aut gladio … interimunt'.
[30] Konzilien der karolingischen Teilreiche, 875-911, ed. Hartmann, 309, citing Isaiah, i, 7: '"Terram vestram in conspectus vestro alieni devorant, et erit in vastitate hostili". Ergo qualiter a Nortmannis hec omnia in nobis completa sint, nemo dubitat, quomodo etiam a perversis christianis undique atteramur, omnes in commune sentimus'. The Council of Tribur in 895 avoided comment on the Northmen, but opened with a passage about Satan sowing tares (ibid., 343).
[31] Konzilien der karolingischen Teilreiche, 875-911, ed. Hartmann, 497-562; see also Gerhard Schmitz, 'Das Konzil von Trosly (909). Überlieferung und Quellen', Deutsches Archiv, xxxiii (1977), 341-434, esp. 343-4 on the significance of Archbishop Hervey's role.

council, which were based on patristic sources, the Carolingian capitularies and Pseudo-Isidore, are written in the style of short sermons, rather than in a concise form suitable for legislation. Canon 3 of Trosly deals with monasteries: some had been burned or destroyed by pagani; they often had external leaders (lay abbots). A long quotation from Gregory I commenting on the Lamentations of Jeremiah 4, 1 leads into a statement by the bishops attending the council that just as gold cannot be 'reformed' in its original colour without a goldsmith, so monastic life cannot be 'reformed' to its original and best order of living without the providence of a regular abbot.[32] Here 'to reform' must be being used in the sense of 'to restore', but there is a sense of institutional change here as well: Trosly specified a regular abbot to preclude lay abbots, and underlined this by saying that kings should consider canon law on this point. This passage unites two themes that we have already observed, the use of the term 'reform' and the need to restore monasteries that had been destroyed, with a new theme, the need to observe a rule. Trosly thus echoes earlier Carolingian church council material using reformare in connection with the word ordo, but now the monastic context is more explicitly stated. Mabillon, noting the closeness in time between Trosly and the foundation of Cluny in 909/10, viewed the former as providing the go-ahead for the latter;[33] since Cluny lay in a different ecclesiastical province, this cannot have been the case, but Mabillon's claim was echoed with variations by many subsequent commentators, for example Christopher Dawson in 1950, for whom Trosly acted as a response to the breakdown of the Carolingian empire at

---

[32] 'Cum propheta cogimur Hieremia nostrae civitatis sanctae videlicet ecclesiae flere dispendia et voce proclamare publica: "Quomodo obscuratum est aurum, mutatus est color optimus, dispersi sunt lapides sanctuarii in capite omnium platearum". Quod ita beatus exponit papa Gregorius: "Aurum obscuratum est, cum sacerdotum et spiritualium vita quondam per gloriam virtutum clara, nunc per actiones infimas ostenditur reproba …" Quomodo igitur aurum sine aurifice in pristinum et optimum non potest reformari colorem, sic et monastica vita sine regularis abbatis providentia ad pristinum atque optimum vivendi nequit reformari ordinem' (Konzilien der karolingischen Teilreiche 875-911, ed. Hartmann, 512).

[33] Jean Mabillon, Annales Ordinis Sancti Benedicti, 6 vols. (Lucca, 1739-45), iii, p. vii and 306-7.

the hands of the Vikings, Saracens, Magyars, and 'the leaders of the new feudal society'.

Dawson expressed optimism: 'When the leaders of any society realize the gravity of the

situation and admit their own responsibility like this the situation is never desperate, and

in fact at the very time when the bishops of the Belgic province were composing this

jeremiad [at Trosly] the first steps of reform were being taken in neighbouring

provinces'.[34]

The need for church authorities to work at restoration was emphasised by Regino

of Prüm in his synodal handbook of 906. He gathered together a group of Carolingian

capitulary texts giving guidelines about what to do with ruined churches and urging their

restoration.[35] One of Regino's headings, 'De locis iam dudum sacris et nunc spurcitia

foedatis, ut iuxta possibilitatem in antiquum statum reformantur' ('concerning places for

long sacred and now corrupted by filth, that they should be restored as far as possible') is

a citation of part of a capitulary of Louis the Pious of 819.[36] It brings in themes – filth and

the need for cleansing – that were also enthusiastically used by tenth-century church

leaders anxious to tidy up monastic life. Regino's Chronicle does not talk about the repair

or rebuilding of churches (presumably this was not being undertaken much in the first

decade of the tenth century) but he does sometimes refer to the repair and rebuilding of

fortresses and other military structures under Charlemagne, using the word reformare for

---

[34] Christopher Dawson, Religion and the Rise of Western Culture (London, 1950), 143-4. Other commentators following Mabillon in linking Trosly and Cluny included August Neander, General History of the Christian Religion and Church, trans. Joseph Torrey, 9 vols. (Edinburgh, 1847-55), vi, 195, and by François Cucherat, Cluny au onzième siècle. Son influence religieuse, intellectuelle et politique (Mâcon, 1851), 3-6. Amann and Dumas, L'Église au pouvoir des laïques (888-1057), 319 thought the Trosly bishops were powerless, but fitted the council into the sequence of events leading to the foundation of Cluny.

[35] Regino, Libri duo de synodalibus causis et disciplinis ecclesiasticis, ed. F. G. A. Wasserschleben (Leipzig, 1840), 42-4 (I, cc. 37-42).

[36] Ibid., 43 (I, c. 39), taken from Capitularia regum Francorum, ed. Boretius, i, 290 (Capitulare missorum, c. 10); see also Die Kapitulariensammlung des Ansegis, ed. Gerhard Schmitz (MGH, Capitularia regum Francorum, new ser., i, Hanover, 1996), 651 (IV, c. 51).

the rebuilding of fortresses in Saxony in 776.[37] Regino's writings remind us of the close

links between historical writing and work on canon law in the Carolingian period. He was

working at Trier, one of the chief centres of Carolingian canon law.[38] Similar cross-over

between history and law is visible elsewhere: at Rheims, Archbishop Hincmar had

likewise united historical narrative and canon law, especially in their application to daily

diocesan life,[39] and this approach was continued by the Rheims churches over the

following century. The decrees of the Council of Trosly were not circulated widely, it is

true, but were carefully preserved at the abbey of Saint-Remy, which was closely

associated with Rheims cathedral; both were centres for historical writing.[40]

'Restoration' of ruined monastic houses gets picked up in tenth-century historical

sources, and here Flodoard's History of the Church of Rheims provides useful examples.

Flodoard uses the term reformare rarely, and only for healing and for restoring rights,[41]

but the reconstruction and improvement of church buildings was an important theme for

him and when this was carried out by archbishops he approved of, especially Hervey, he

referred to it as restaurare. This was his favoured verb, both for the rebuilding of

churches and for the restoration of monastic standards. The young Hincmar helped Louis

---

[37] Regino, Chronicon, ed. Friedrich Kurze (MGH SSRG, i, Hanover, 1890), 51, and see also 71 ('restauravit'), 106 ('renovant').

[38] Wilfried Hartmann, Kirche und Kirchenrecht um 900 (Hanover, 2008), 149-59; History and Politics in Late Carolingian and Ottonian Europe: The Chronicle of Regino of Prüm and Adalbert of Magdeburg, trans. Simon MacLean (Manchester, 2009), 6-7.

[39] See now Rachel Stone and Charles West (eds.), Hincmar of Rheims: Life and Work (Manchester, 2015).

[40] Schmitz, 'Das Konzil von Trosly', 351-2, notes that Flodoard seems not to have made direct use of the manuscript at Saint-Remy containing the decrees of the council. On the circulation of Trosly, note also the summary of the council decrees created in the tenth century in the diocese of Rheims and edited by Rudolf Pokorny, 'Eine Kurzform der Konzilskanones von Trosly (909)', Deutsches Archiv, xlii (1986), 118-44, esp. 131 on the dating and provenance of the text.

[41] Flodoard von Reims, Die Geschichte der Reimser Kirche, ed. Martina Stratmann (MGH, Scriptores, xxxvi, Hanover, 1998), 72, 124, 170, 185; reformatio occurs only in quotations from papal letters (ibid., 166, 217). Flodoard uses renovare on three occasions to refer to Ebo's rebuilding of Rheims cathedral (ibid., 176, 179, 197). On Flodoard, note also Stéphane Lecouteux, 'Le contexte de rédaction des Annales de Flodoard de Reims (919-966)', Le Moyen Âge, cxvi (2010), 51-121 and 283-318.

the Pious and Hilduin work for the restoration of the ordo monasticus;[42] a priest called

Gerhard who spent too much money on doctors was urged by St Peter in a vision to

restore his church;[43] as archbishop, Hincmar 'restored religion' in the monastery of Saint-

Germain-de-Flay, which he had rebuilt;[44] Archbishop Hervey, once he had repaired the

fortifications at Mouzon, restored the ruined church there and gave it relics of St Victor,[45]

and he saw to the restoration of several churches that had been ruined by the Vikings.[46]

Archbishop Artald (946-61) repaired the roof and replaced the ceilings in a church

dedicated to St Hilary just outside the Porta Martis in Rheims, but failed to translate the

relics of a saint into it even after being warned to do so, and was punished by being

forced to give up his archbishopric soon afterwards.[47]

The idea of rebuilding marking a fresh start for newly founded or newly

refounded monastic communities was enthusiastically received by tenth-century monastic

authors: the most popular verbs for describing the process were restaurare, as we have

seen, and restituere.[48] Authors were slow to find verbs to define deliberate change of

personnel or religious way of life within ecclesiastical institutions, although such changes

were an important feature of tenth-century monasticism. The earliest narrative source that

uses reformatio to mean change within an ecclesiastical institution appears to be the Life

of John of Gorze, written between 974 and 984 by John, abbot of Saint-Arnoul in Metz

---

[42] Flodoard, Geschichte, 190 ('ut ordo monasticus in predicto monasterio quorundam voluptuosa factione diu delapsus restauraretur').
[43] Ibid., 202 ('ut restauraret ecclesiam').
[44] Ibid., 256 ('quodque a quodam invasore restruxerat et religionem, prout valuit, in eo restauraverat').
[45] Ibid., 405 ('Hic pontifex castrum Mosomum reparatis muniit muris et ecclesiam inibi dirutam a novo restauravit atque in honore sancta dei genitricis, ut olim fuerat, dedicavit, collocatis ibi sancti Victoris ossibus'). On Mouzon see also below at nn. 51-2.
[46] Ibid., 406 (''Ecclesias etiam nonnullas, que sub persecutione Nordmannorum dirute fuerant, restaurari fecit atque consecravit').
[47] Ibid., 451 ('tectis ac novis reparata laquearibus').
[48] Adalbert's continuation of Regino's Chronicle has 'restituitur' for abbey of Lorsch s.a. 956 and 'restituit' for abbey of Wissembourg s.a. 957: Regino, Chronicon, ed. Kurze, 169.

(960-c.984). In this work the word occurs once only, almost as an aside, in a passage in which Abbot John describes some of John of Gorze's companions. Of Odilo, who became abbot of Stavelot, he says: 'He also, after the strength of his holy behaviour had matured, was sought for the reformatio of the monastery which is called Stavelot, and once he was made abbot there, with Christ's help he corrected the things he found to be depraved there along the lines of righteousness'.[49] Here reformatio probably has some sense of 'restoration', but Odilo is undertaking Carolingian-style correction as well: there is a shift here towards the use of reformatio for institutional change. A similar shift may also be perceptible in a charter of Bishop Widerold of Strasbourg for the abbey of Eschau in 999, though here the sense of restoration is clear too.[50]

A more definite application of reform language for institutional change is visible at about this time in the Chronicle of Mouzon. This is a work in three parts, a life of an obscure lay saint called Arnulf with an account of his cult up to the translation of his body to Mouzon by Archbishop Adalbero of Rheims in 971, an account of how Adalbero replaced the clergy serving the church there with a group of monks, and finally a catalogue of the abbots of Mouzon between 972 and the start of the abbatiate of Ralph in 1031. The chronicle was written within the community: while most commentators have proposed a date of composition of between 1025 and 1033, Ortwin Huysmans has recently argued that the first two parts of the chronicle, different in style from the third,

---

[49] Jean de Saint-Arnoul, La vie de Jean, abbé de Gorze, ed. and transl. Michel Parisse (Paris, 1999), 88 (c. 56): 'Is quoque post bene adultum sancte conversationis robur, petitus reformationi monasterii quod dicitur Stabulacum ibidemque promotus, ad rectitudinis lineas quas prava forte invenerat Christo auxiliante correxit'. Odilo had been primicerius, in other words the leading dignitary, of Verdun cathedral.
[50] Chartes originales, no. 570: 'qualiter Wideroldus, Argentinensis episcopus, Escowensem ecclesiam que per tyrannidem Attale regis destructa fuerat, de reditibus episcopatus …. restauravit. Prefatus episcopus … quatenus locum desolatum in locum reformaret orationis …. temperavit penuriam'.

were probably written earlier, perhaps between 989 and 997.[51] Mouzon was a proprietary

church of the archbishops of Rheims and lay in the small part of the diocese of Rheims

that lay in the empire, in Lotharingia; it was thus a border stronghold of great strategic

importance.[52] The church of Mouzon had originally been a nunnery; this community had

ceased to exist owing to 'a savage whirlwind of evils' and the church had been burnt, but

Archbishop Hervey of Rheims had restored it ('restituit') as a community of canons.[53]

Archbishop Adalbero (969-88), objecting to the fact that the canons had married and

produced children, replaced them with monks from the small abbey of Thin, a

dependency of the abbey of Saint-Remi in Rheims. The first two sections of the

Chronicle of Mouzon use 'reform' terms four times. In the prologue the author urges his

brothers to celebrate the feasts of saints 'that we may outwardly be fortified in works,

from which inwardly we are reformed in mind' – in other words, reform in the Pauline

sense of spiritual change.[54] Next the Chronicle depicts Adalbero commenting on the state

of the ancient monasteries in his diocese and noting that some, that should have been

improved for the better, had got worse; he would like to try to reform one of them.[55] This

---

[51] Chronique ou livre de foundation du monastère de Mouzon, ed. and tr. Michel Bur (Paris, 1989), 62-4): Bur (pp. 63-4) notes that the use of the term bannus at 165 suggests that it could not have been written before the early eleventh century when this term began to be used in this region. See also Charles West, Reframing the Feudal Revolution: Political and Social Transformation between Marne and Moselle, c. 800-c. 1100 (Cambridge, 2013), 176. Bur's dating has recently been questioned by Ortwin Huysmans, 'Pious foundation or strategic masterstroke? The Chronicon Mosomense and the reform of Mouzon by Archbishop Adalbero of Reims (969-989)', Revue d'histoire ecclésiastique, cx (2015), 103-34, esp. 132.
[52] Huysmans, 'Pious foundation', 118-19.
[53] Chronique de Mouzon, ed. Bur, 161; Bur suggests (p. 134) that the 'turbine saeviente malorum' responsible for bringing the female community to an end was the Viking raid of 882, but the description is too vaguely worded for this to be absolutely certain.
[54] Ibid., 146: 'Ideo nobis pia intentione curandum est, ut, quod exterius per speciem significamus, interius in veritate teneamus, et inde foris solidemur in opera, unde intus reformamur in mente'.
[55] Ibid., 160: 'Consideratis namque huius episcopi quibusdam antiquissimis locis …. modo autem prorsus neglectis, aliquibus solam nominis famam praetendentibus, aliquibus sic ad solum dirutis ut nec fama supersit nominis, quibusdam, dum emendari debuerunt in melius, ad deteriora perventis, eorum aliquem, cuius incoepti artificio reformare prius attentem ….'

14

is of course Mouzon. Adalbero recounts Hervey's attempts to set up canons there,[56] and

then explains that he will seek support from the abbot of Saint-Remi to obtain monks

from Thin.[57] Finally at a council in 971, Adalbero says: 'Hence it has seemed to be from

divine inspiration that I should reform that place for the better with the order and

discipline of monks according to the Rule of St Benedict'.[58] 'Reform' (here 'in melius

reformare') is being used here to underline the replacement of clergy by monks, and thus

a change in order. This is a significant development. Similar use of the word 'reform' is

also visible in the earlier 1030s, when Rodulfus Glaber was writing his Life of William of

Saint-Bénigne (1030 x 1035): he employs the verb reformare twice to mean to restore or

rebuild but on two occasions with connotations of institutional change.[59] This usage was

slow to take off in charters: even in the last quarter of the eleventh century and the early

twelfth century 'reform' was still principally being used for restoration of property and of

peace.[60]

 The tenth and very early eleventh centuries thus emerge as a formative period for

the development of the concept of 'reform' as institutional change: it seems to have been

during this period that ideas about restoring rights and peace and especially restoring and

---

[56] Ibid., 161: 'Qua [sc. ecclesia] reformata et in statum pristinum recollectis praebendariis exornata'.
[57] Ibid., 161-2.
[58] Ibid., 168: 'Unde, ut credo, ex inspiratione Dei visum est mihi, monachorum ordine et disciplina secundum sancti Benedicti regulam locum illum in melius reformare'.
[59] Rodulfus Glaber, Opera, ed. John France and Neithard Bulst, tr. John France and Paul Reynolds (Oxford, 1989), 268 (Bishop Bruno of Langres asking Maiolus to reform Saint-Bénigne, Dijon: 'in melius reformare'), 272 (Duke Richard of Normandy restoring Fécamp: 'a suo tamen patre Richardo honorificentius reformatam'), 274 (William rebuilding Saint-Bénigne: 'coepit ipsius aecclesie reformande mirificum construere apparatum'), 296 (William reforming Gorze: 'ad regulare specimen reformatum'). It is also worth noting the closing words of Rodulfus' Five Books of the Histories, ibid., 252: 'Cuius [Pope Gregory VI] videlicet bona (fama quicq)uid prior fedaverat in melius reformavit'.
[60] Chartes originales, nos. 4278 (1079), 4287-8 (Gregory VII, 1081), 848 (Bishop Robert of Langres, 1101), 896 (Bishop Joceran of Langres, 1120) use reform with a sense of institutional change or new direction. See also Julia Barrow, 'Les évêques et leur conception de la réforme ecclésiastique dans l'Europe du Nord-Ouest (XIe-XIIe siècles)', in Barrow, Delivré and Gazeau (eds.), Autour de Lanfranc, 21-31, at 27-8.

rebuilding churches began to get fused with the idea of individual personal reform. Bishops and clerics were active at the start and the main arena to begin with was church councils; then the fusion of the twin themes of restoration and change of heart got picked up by monastic circles for institutional purposes and from the late tenth century onwards monastic writers started, very slowly at first, to apply 'reform' in a conscious way to describe changes in individual ecclesiastical communities, especially when groups of clerics were replaced with monks or when nuns were replaced with monks, and later on when secular clerics were replaced with regular canons.[61]

---

[61] For some examples see Barrow, 'Les évêques', 27-9.