



UNIVERSITY OF LEEDS

This is a repository copy of *Thermal and tectonic consequences of India underthrusting Tibet*.

White Rose Research Online URL for this paper:
<http://eprints.whiterose.ac.uk/92646/>

Version: Accepted Version

Article:

Craig, TJ orcid.org/0000-0003-2198-9172, Copley, A and Jackson, J (2012) Thermal and tectonic consequences of India underthrusting Tibet. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 353. pp. 231-239. ISSN 0012-821X

<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.epsl.2012.07.010>

© 2012, Elsevier. Licensed under the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International
<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/>

Reuse

Unless indicated otherwise, fulltext items are protected by copyright with all rights reserved. The copyright exception in section 29 of the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988 allows the making of a single copy solely for the purpose of non-commercial research or private study within the limits of fair dealing. The publisher or other rights-holder may allow further reproduction and re-use of this version - refer to the White Rose Research Online record for this item. Where records identify the publisher as the copyright holder, users can verify any specific terms of use on the publisher's website.

Takedown

If you consider content in White Rose Research Online to be in breach of UK law, please notify us by emailing eprints@whiterose.ac.uk including the URL of the record and the reason for the withdrawal request.



eprints@whiterose.ac.uk
<https://eprints.whiterose.ac.uk/>

Thermal and tectonic consequences of India underthrusting Tibet

Timothy J. Craig*, Alex Copley, James Jackson
COMET+, Bullard Laboratories, Department of Earth Sciences,
University of Cambridge, Cambridge, CB3 0EZ, UK

*Corresponding author: tjc52@esc.cam.ac.uk

July 6, 2012

Abstract

The Tibetan Plateau is the largest orogenic system on Earth, and has been influential in our understanding of how the continental lithosphere deforms. Beneath the plateau are some of the deepest (~ 100 km) earthquakes observed within the continental lithosphere, which have been pivotal in ongoing debates about the rheology and behaviour of the continents. We present new observations of earthquake depths from the region, and use thermal models to suggest that all of them occur in material at temperatures of $\lesssim 600$ °C. Thermal modelling, combined with experimentally-derived flow laws, suggests that if the Indian lower crust is anhydrous it will remain strong beneath the entire southern half of the Tibetan plateau, as is also suggested by dynamic models. In northwest Tibet, the strong underthrust Indian lower crust abuts the rigid Tarim Basin, and may be responsible for both the clockwise rotation of Tarim relative to stable Eurasia, and the gradient of shortening along the Tien Shan.

Keywords: Deep earthquakes, Continental rheology, Tibet, temperature, Central Asian tectonics.

1 Introduction

The distribution of earthquakes provides an important insight into the rheology of continental regions. Rare earthquakes at depths up to ~ 100 km beneath Tibet have

20 been used to support contrasting views about the vertical distribution of strength within
21 the continental lithosphere (Chen and Molnar, 1983; Chen and Yang, 2004; Monsalve
22 et al., 2006; Priestley et al., 2008). This topic is controversial and important, as it
23 has implications for our understanding of rheology, deformation and topography in
24 continental regions worldwide.

25 Early views on the connection between seismicity and rheology treated the crust
26 as a homogenous medium, in which the seismic-aseismic transition occurred at 350°C
27 everywhere (Chen and Molnar, 1983). More recently, the importance of trace amounts
28 of water within crystal lattices has been recognised as affecting the depth of the seismic-
29 aseismic transition in crustal materials. This realisation has led to a revised view
30 of seismicity in the crust, in which the seismic-aseismic transition is thought to be
31 at $\sim 350^\circ\text{C}$ in hydrous rocks, and up to $\sim 600^\circ\text{C}$ in anhydrous rocks (Jackson et al.,
32 2008). The proposed 600°C temperature limit in anhydrous continental crust is similar
33 to current estimates for the temperature cut-off of earthquakes in the oceanic mantle
34 (McKenzie et al., 2005). However, debate continues about the existence and significance
35 of continental mantle seismicity, and the relation between the seismic-aseismic transition
36 and the distribution of lithospheric strength (Chen and Yang, 2004; Monsalve et al.,
37 2006; Priestley et al., 2008; Burov, 2010).

38 In slowly-deforming areas, the thermal structure is close to steady-state, and easily
39 comparable to the distribution of earthquakes (e.g., Sloan et al., 2011). However, in
40 these relatively undeforming regions it is difficult to probe the rheology of the litho-
41 sphere, which requires knowledge of the distribution of strain-rates. We therefore focus
42 on the Tibetan Plateau, which is rapidly deforming, and is far from thermal steady
43 state. The purpose of this paper is to show that the distribution of earthquakes be-
44 neath the Tibetan Plateau can be linked, through simple calculations, to the evolution
45 of temperature and rheology within the India-Asia collision zone, and hence integrated
46 into our understanding of continental rheology and dynamics.

47 We first present new results for earthquake depths across the Tibetan plateau. We

48 then describe the results of thermal models that can provide insights into this observed
49 earthquake distribution, and how it relates to the rheological structure of the India-Asia
50 collision zone. Finally, we discuss the implications of our results for the tectonics of
51 Central Asia, north of the Tibetan Plateau.

52 **2 Earthquake Locations**

53 By using array-stacking techniques and coherency analyses (Heyburn and Bowers, 2008)
54 for small-aperture seismic arrays at teleseismic distances ($30 - 90^\circ$), we have observed
55 and identified the direct arrival (P) and subsequent depth phases (pP , sP) for smaller
56 earthquakes in the region of the Tibetan Plateau than have previously been analysed
57 using teleseismic data.

58 For seven arrays in North America, Europe and Australia, the expected back-
59 azimuth and slowness for a given event were calculated based on the best available
60 earthquake location (from the EHB catalogue if available (Engdahl et al., 1998), or
61 the NEIC if not), with the expected slowness calculated using the ak135 earth model
62 (Kennett et al., 1995). Data from each station within an array were then timeshifted,
63 based on the assumption that the wavefront travels as a plane-wave across the array at
64 a uniform velocity (slowness) and from a single direction (back-azimuth), and linearly
65 stacked. Data were also bandpassed in an attempt to isolate the signal of the earth-
66 quake and remove unrelated noise. To assist in the correct identification of seismic
67 phases, we used the coherency analyses of Heyburn and Bowers (2008), calculating the
68 F-statistic (defined as the power of the beam divided by the average of the power of
69 the difference between the beam and the single-station seismograms from within the
70 array). An example, for a $M_W 4.7$ earthquake beneath northwestern Tibet, is shown in
71 Figure 1.

72 To confirm that the identified arrivals are from a seismic event at the expected point
73 of origin, we performed a sweep through azimuth and slowness ranges, and discarded

74 phases where the peak in both radiated energy and in coherence occurred at a signifi-
75 cantly different origin point from that expected based on the catalogue location. Given
76 the small array aperture required to resolve the relatively high frequency content of
77 such small earthquakes, the spatial resolution is typically quite poor, particularly in
78 slowness (see Figure 1f-i). Whilst consideration of the signal coherence improves on
79 the resolution of the simple linear stack (Figure 1g,i), discrimination between origin
80 points separated by $<15^\circ$ or $<1.5\text{-}2^\circ/\text{s}$ is rarely possible. However, we were able to
81 confirm that the signals we analysed were generated by the events we have selected in
82 the region of the Tibetan Plateau, and were not from events elsewhere in the world at
83 similar times.

84 Once multiple depth phases had been identified, forward modeling of the waveforms
85 was then used to constrain the focal depths. We used velocity structures based on the S -
86 wave velocity models of Acton et al. (2010) for the India-Asia region, with P -wavespeeds
87 calculated using V_p/V_s ratios based on those determined by Monsalve et al. (2008) for
88 a transect across the Himalayas from peninsular India into Tibet. Outside the Tibetan
89 Plateau, we used $V_p/V_s = 1.74$. Within the Plateau, we use $V_p/V_s = 1.65$ at <40 km
90 depth, and $V_p/V_s = 1.74$ at > 40 km depth. Synthetic seismograms were calculated
91 using the WKBJ algorithmn (Chapman et al., 1988), assuming the CMT mechanism if
92 available, or one consistent with the relative amplitudes of the observed phases. This
93 technique yielded a total of 69 new earthquake depths (Table S1). Uncertainties arose
94 principally from the accuracy in phase identification, and the accuracy of the velocity
95 model. For phase identification, which is non-systematic, we estimate this uncertainty
96 to be ± 3 km, based on the ability to pick phase arrivals to within half the typical
97 duration of the pulse width. Errors from the velocity model will be systematic to the
98 dataset, and depth dependent. Based on a 10% perturbation in the velocities used, we
99 estimate these to range from ± 1 km at shallow depths, to ± 9 km at ≈ 100 km, leading
100 to an overall error estimate between ± 4 km at shallow depth and ± 12 km at around
101 100 km.

102 In addition, 25 other new larger-magnitude earthquakes ($M_W \geq 5.5$) were mod-
103 elled using the body-waveform inversion techniques described in detail in Sloan et al.
104 (2011) (Table S2). This method inverts P and SH waveform shape and amplitude
105 for the depth, mechanism and magnitude of larger earthquakes. Numerous previous
106 studies have also determined accurate earthquake depths within the India-Asia colli-
107 sion zone, which are plotted along with our results in Figure 2. The studies from which
108 these earthquakes were taken are detailed in the supplementary material. Our new
109 well-located earthquakes provide insights into the seismicity of the Tibetan Plateau.
110 Previously described isolated deep earthquakes (e.g., Chen and Yang, 2004; Priestley
111 et al., 2008) can now be seen to form part of seismogenic layers continuous in the di-
112 rection of the overall convergence in the deep interior of the range, and the numbers of
113 events observed make the distribution patterns robust.

114 While earthquakes at shallow (<20 km) depths are observed across the whole of
115 Tibet and the surrounding active regions, earthquakes deeper than 40 km are observed
116 in only restricted areas. Earthquakes up to 300 km deep are observed in the Hindu
117 Kush Deep Seismic Zone and the Burmese Arc (enclosed by dashed black lines, Figure
118 2a), and occur in recognisable steeply-inclined slab-like zones, which are not considered
119 further here. Deep earthquakes outside these areas in Figure 2a occur only within
120 the Tibetan Plateau, and are restricted to patches in NW Tibet ($73-78^\circ$ E) and the
121 eastern Himalayas ($85-93^\circ$ E). A similar picture of the earthquake depth distribution
122 for restricted areas emerges from sparse local seismic surveys (e.g., Langin et al., 2003;
123 Monsalve et al., 2006; Liang et al., 2008).

124 Significant effort was put into investigating possible deep earthquakes between the
125 two observed patches, beneath south-central Tibet (region A on Figure 2a). Routine
126 catalogues (e.g., NEIC, EHB) report earthquakes in this region at depths exceeding the
127 20 km typically seen in Tibet, but lack the accuracy in depth required for our purposes.
128 However, despite analysing all reported earthquakes at depths > 20 km, with $M_W >$
129 4.5, since 2005, all events in this region either occurred at shallow depth, or failed to

130 yield a depth that was robust and reliable. We are therefore unable to confirm the
131 presence of any deep seismicity in this region.

132 Figure 2d shows earthquake depths within India and the Tibetan Plateau as a func-
133 tion of distance from the Himalayan Front, projected along the India-Asia convergence
134 vector. Although care must be taken when interpreting events significantly off the line
135 of projection, some clear patterns emerge. Peninsular India has earthquakes throughout
136 the thickness of the crust, as is most visible around the Shillong Plateau and the 2001
137 Bhuj earthquake (*S* and *B* on Figure 2a), and a small number of earthquakes extend
138 to depths of 48 ± 5 km, potentially into the top of the upper mantle. Beneath the
139 Himalayas, earthquakes also occur throughout the crust and possibly into the upper-
140 most 10–15 km of the mantle (Monsalve et al., 2006). Beneath Tibet, beyond ~ 200 km
141 north of the Himalayan front, the earthquake distribution is more complex. Shallow
142 earthquakes occur across the whole plateau at depths < 20 km, and beneath this the
143 mid-crust is generally aseismic (with the exception of two small events labeled *K* on
144 Figure 2d, in northwest Tibet, discussed later). Beneath Tibet, deep earthquakes are
145 also present in a 10–30 km thick band close to the Moho, but only in the two patches
146 described above, which are within ~ 500 km of the Himalayan front.

147 **3 Temperature Structure**

148 We now consider how the thermal structure in the region relates to the earthquake
149 distribution. Evidence from surface-wave tomography and from mantle xenoliths indi-
150 cates that the lithosphere under peninsular India is ~ 150 – 200 km thick, and that the
151 uppermost ~ 10 km of the mantle is likely to be colder than 600°C (Priestley et al.,
152 2008). The distribution of earthquakes in India is therefore easily explained, provided
153 the lower crust is largely anhydrous and thereby capable of producing earthquakes at
154 temperatures up to approximately 600°C (Mackwell, 1998; Jackson et al., 2008).

155 Previous thermal models for the India-Asia collision have predominantly focused

156 on the fine-scale thermal structure of the Himalayas, to analyse thermochronological
157 and thermobarometric data (e.g., Bollinger et al., 2006; Herman et al., 2010). How-
158 ever, these models have not focused on the deeper thermal structure in the lower crust
159 and uppermost mantle beneath Tibet, as is required to investigate the relationship be-
160 tween temperature and the deep earthquakes beneath the plateau. Although Priestley
161 et al. (2008) conducted a one-dimensional diffusion calculation for the Indian plate,
162 the importance of thermal advection in Tibet requires a more complex model. We
163 have therefore constructed our own thermal model to investigate how the temperature
164 structure relates to the pattern of earthquakes beneath Tibet.

165 We model the plateau in two dimensions using the finite-difference method, tak-
166 ing into account horizontal and vertical diffusion of heat, the horizontal and vertical
167 advection of material associated with the relative motion between India and Tibet,
168 and radiogenic heat production. Conductivities, heat capacities and densities are de-
169 termined as a function of temperature using the expressions given in McKenzie et al.
170 (2005) and Nabelek et al. (2010). Several parameters in such thermal models are poorly
171 constrained, particularly the rates of radiogenic heating at depth and the model kine-
172 matics. However, by making reasonable assumptions based on available observations
173 and insights from previous models (e.g. Henry et al., 1997; Bollinger et al., 2006; Her-
174 man et al., 2010), we can estimate the major characteristics of the thermal structure
175 beneath Tibet (Figures 3; S1).

176 The geometry and kinematics of our model are summarised in Figure 3a. India,
177 in initial thermal steady state, starts horizontal across the model. The orogenic front
178 marking the leading edge of Tibetan crust starts at the north end of the model, and
179 moves gradually southwards through time, overriding the Indian crust and mantle. The
180 overthrusting material has a thickness of 40 km, which tapers over a distance of 200 km
181 to zero at the leading edge. The frame of reference is fixed to India. Models are run
182 for 50 Myrs (the approximate age of the collision). Velocities in our model are constant
183 through time, and imposed based on values consistent with high-end estimates for late

184 Cenozoic deformation (convergence at 22 mm yr^{-1} , with 4 mm yr^{-1} of overthrusting;
185 Henry et al. 1997; Lavé and Avouac 2000).

186 We model a scenario in which India is underthrust beneath Tibet in a ramp-and-flat
187 geometry, reflecting a combination of the southwards-relative flow of Tibetan material
188 over India, and the northwards-relative underthrusting of India. Previous studies have
189 focused on the effect of accretion of Indian material onto the southern edge of Tibet
190 by transmission across the plate interface, determining relatively low accretion rates
191 ($\sim 60 \text{ km}^2 \text{ Myr}^{-1}$; Bollinger et al. 2006). We have therefore included in our model 5 km
192 of accretion from the top of the Indian crust into the Himalayas as our preferred model
193 (Figure 3a). Changing the degree of accretion to be zero or double the amount shown
194 in Figure 3 has little effect on the part of our model where the deep earthquakes are
195 detected. Tests to demonstrate the effects of varying the accretion are shown in Figure
196 S2.

197 For India, we use an initial steady-state geotherm, based on a crustal thickness of
198 40 km (see Figure 2d) and a lithospheric thickness of 175 km, constrained by xenolith
199 data from southern India and surface-wave derived estimates of temperatures (Priestley
200 et al., 2008). The surface is maintained at 0°C , and the base of the lithosphere is
201 maintained at a mantle potential temperature of 1315°C . Observed surface heat-flow
202 measurements across northern India have average values in the range $45\text{-}70 \text{ mW m}^{-3}$
203 (after Roy and Rao, 2000), which constrains the total crustal heat production and
204 mantle heat flux. The input model used here has a surface heat flux of 61 mW m^{-3} .
205 For radiogenic heating, we use two crustal layers in India, with values of $2.0 \mu\text{W m}^{-3}$
206 (upper crust) and $0.4 \mu\text{W m}^{-3}$ (lower crust), consistent with a slightly enriched gneissic
207 upper crust (Roy and Rao, 2003) overlying a depleted granulitic lower crust (Jaupart
208 and Mareschal, 1999; Roy and Rao, 2003), with an interface at 20 km.

209 The upper (Tibetan) crustal material input into the model at the northern edge has
210 the northern Tibet geotherm derived from crustal xenoliths (Hacker et al., 2000). For
211 Tibetan material, we do not have accurate constraints on the distribution of radiogenic

212 heat production with depth. Surface measurements of heat production from the Hi-
213 malayas are usually high ($>1 \mu\text{W m}^{-3}$), but the source of such values is complicated by
214 the inclusion of Indian derived material into the wedge. The origin of material sourced
215 from the northern side of the collision is complex, comprising a series of accreted ter-
216 ranes and island arcs, and the distribution of radiogenic heat production is unlikely
217 to be as uniform as in ancient continental crust. Given the lack of precise constraint,
218 we assume a single average value for all Tibetan material, in this case taken to be
219 $1.5 \mu\text{W m}^{-3}$. Tests varying this value indicate that it predominantly affects the tem-
220 perature evolution in Tibetan material and at the top of the underthrust Indian crust,
221 and hence the initial point of inversion in the vertical temperature gradients (Figure
222 3b), whilst its influence on the temperatures near the Indian Moho, which is the focus
223 of this study, is minor when compared to other factors.

224 In our model (Figure 3b,c; S1), as India is underthrust beneath southern Tibet, it
225 heats up because of the emplacement of hot and radiogenic heat-producing Tibetan
226 crust above it. The Indian lower crust heats up slowly during underthrusting, and the
227 calculations show that by ~ 20 Myrs it is the coolest part of the Indian crust, indi-
228 cating why the lower crust remains seismic, whilst the mid-crust above it is aseismic
229 within Tibet. Our models show that the 600°C isotherm in the Indian lower crust
230 can extend horizontally for $\sim 450\text{--}500$ km beneath the Tibetan Plateau. Changing the
231 model parameters, particularly advective velocities, within reasonable ranges can move
232 the extent of the 600°C isotherm by up to ~ 150 km, but the essential shape of the
233 isotherms remains similar. Variations in accretion rates and the radiogenic heating in
234 Tibet influence the distance to the initial point of inversion of the vertical thermal gra-
235 dient, but have a lesser effect on the on the deeper structure within the plate (see Figure
236 S2). The model shown in Figures 3 and S1 demonstrates that, with reasonable assump-
237 tions for poorly constrained parameters, the observed seismicity is consistent with an
238 understanding of continental rheology in which seismicity can persist to $\sim 600^\circ\text{C}$ in
239 anhydrous lower crust or in mantle material (Jackson et al., 2008). Deep earthquakes

240 beneath Tibet are thus reasonably explained by the cold Indian lowermost crust and
241 uppermost mantle, displaced downwards by underthrusting beneath Tibet, heating up
242 slowly enough to remain seismogenic long after the overlying material has been heated
243 beyond the seismic-aseismic transition.

244 4 Relationship to Surface Tectonics

245 The style of active tectonics at the surface of Tibet is likely to be governed by the
246 rheology of India at depth (Copley et al., 2011). Earthquake focal mechanisms at
247 shallow depth within the plateau (Figure 2b) show a clear division between south-
248 ern Tibet, where the dominant faulting is east-west extension on north-south striking
249 normal faults, and northern Tibet, where conjugate strike-slip faulting accommodates
250 north-south shortening and east-west extension. There are some exceptions to this pat-
251 tern, but these are likely to be the result of local kinematic effects, such as the Yutian
252 normal fault system, labelled *Y* on Figure 2b, which is linked to the change in strike of
253 the Altyn-Tagh strike-slip fault (Furuya and Yasuda, 2011). The same pattern can be
254 seen in GPS data (Figure 2c; Gan et al. 2007; Banerjee et al. 2008), which is interpreted
255 in southern Tibet to show east-west extension and transient elastic strain accumula-
256 tion around the Himalayan thrust faults, and in northern Tibet to show permanent
257 north-south shortening and east-west extension. The transition between the two tec-
258 tonic regimes occurs 600 ± 100 km north of the Himalayan front, slightly beyond the
259 northernmost deep earthquakes.

260 Dynamic models suggest that the presence of pure east-west extension in southern
261 Tibet indicates that the surface is mechanically coupled to the underthrust Indian
262 lithosphere, which must have a high enough viscosity ($\geq 5 \times 10^{23}$ Pa s) to act as a
263 rigid base to the flow of the overlying crust (Copley et al., 2011). Using our thermal
264 model and experimentally-derived mineral flow-laws, we can estimate the viscosity of the
265 Indian crust beneath Tibet. Figure 3c shows estimated viscosities in the underthrust

266 Indian lower crust, calculated using a dry anorthite flow-law (Rybacki and Dresen,
267 2000), a grainsize of 1 mm, and a strain-rate of $3 \times 10^{-9} \text{ yr}^{-1}$ (an order of magnitude
268 less than the observed strain-rate at the surface). With this dry anorthite flow-law, our
269 calculated viscosities fall below $5 \times 10^{23} \text{ Pa s}$ slightly ($\sim 100 \text{ km}$) north of the limit of deep
270 earthquakes, in agreement with the transition between tectonic regimes at the surface
271 (Figure 3c). Other flow-laws would obviously produce different results. However, we can
272 conclude that our thermal model is consistent with the observed tectonics of Tibet if the
273 Indian lower crust is anhydrous and contains significant plagioclase, in line with previous
274 suggestions of an anhydrous granulite rheology (Cattin et al., 2001; Priestley et al.,
275 2008), and with our conclusions regarding the thermal control on the deep seismicity.

276 Our proposed rheological model, in which a rigid, strong India persists to significant
277 distances beneath the plateau, is consistent with measured seismic anisotropy beneath
278 Tibet. The significant anisotropy observed in north and northeastern Tibet contrasts
279 with the isotropic or weakly anisotropic fabric of peninsular India and southern and
280 western Tibet (Zhao et al., 2010). This transition may reflect where the underlying
281 Indian material becomes hot and weak enough to deform significantly, and develop an
282 anisotropic fabric.

283 **5 Central Southern Tibet**

284 A striking feature of Figure 2a is the lack of earthquakes deeper than 20 km beneath
285 central-southern Tibet (region A). Both surface- and body-wave tomography indicate
286 that all of southern Tibet is underlain by high velocity Indian material, with no resolv-
287 able along-strike variation (Priestley et al., 2008; Li et al., 2008; Hung et al., 2011).
288 One possible explanation for the lack of deep earthquakes might be that the Indian
289 crust in this region is too hot to deform in earthquakes (for example, due to higher
290 radiogenic heating). However, allowing the parameters in our thermal models to vary
291 within reasonable ranges only moves the isotherms (and hence the expected extent of

292 seismicity) southwards, and cannot heat the entire Indian lower crust in this region to
293 temperatures above 600°C. Similarly, influences on the thermal structure from deeper
294 in the mantle would again simply push the cutoff of seismicity southwards, and would
295 not be expected to heat the entire region above the seismogenic limit.

296 Alternatively, the absence of deep seismicity in region A might be related to a lower
297 crust of different composition (e.g. more hydrated or quartz-rich), deforming by ductile
298 flow rather than failure in earthquakes. However, we can use numerical experiments to
299 suggest that a lateral variation in mineral composition, and hence strength, would be
300 be mirrored by a change in the surface tectonics.

301 Figure 4a shows the results of a calculation by Copley et al. (2011), who constructed
302 a model of the deformation of a plateau subjected to compression between bounding
303 plates and gravity-driven flow. They suggested that for pure east-west extension to oc-
304 cur in southern Tibet, rigid Indian lower crust must underlie the entire southern half of
305 the plateau. To directly investigate if an along-strike variation in lower crustal rheology
306 would be revealed in the surface tectonics, we have performed additional calculations
307 to test if the aseismic region in central southern Tibet could have a different rheology
308 to the seismogenic material to the east and west, and yet still produce a pattern of
309 surface deformation consistent with the observations. The results of such a calculation
310 are shown in Figure 4b, in which the lower crust in the part of the model corresponding
311 to region A has been weakened relative to the rest of the underthrusting lower crust. In
312 this situation, the predicted surface tectonics in the southern part of the model plateau
313 is a mix of east-west extension and north-south compression, at odds with the observed
314 faulting in southern Tibet (Figure 2b,c; Section 4). Given the dominance of normal
315 faulting across southern Tibet, it therefore appears that the aseismic region A is not
316 likely to be significantly weaker than the seismically active parts of underthrusting India
317 to the east and west.

318 We therefore conclude that the reason for the rarity of deep earthquakes, and for
319 their absence in south-central Tibet during our observation period, is likely to be that

320 the Indian lower crust is too strong to break in response to the forces being exerted
321 on it, or that the strain rates are so low that earthquake repeat times are extremely
322 long. In this context, it is regions where earthquakes have been observed that may
323 be anomalous, possibly due to a spatially limited influx of fluids (Lund et al., 2004),
324 or local structural heterogeneities or triggering (analogous, perhaps, to the uneven
325 concentrations of events within peninsular India around the Shillong Plateau and in
326 the vicinity of the Bhuj earthquake).

327 **6 Implications for Regional Tectonics**

328 Our results have implications for the kinematics of deformation in central Asia. In
329 northwest Tibet, seismogenic Indian lithosphere underthrusts far enough north to be in
330 contact with the lithosphere of the western Tarim Basin, which is in turn underthrust
331 beneath the northern edge of Tibet, and whose limit is observed as a sharp step in
332 the Moho (Figure 2d; Wittlinger et al. 2004). Collision between the rigid Indian and
333 Tarim lithospheres at depth beneath the northwestern Tibetan Plateau will impart a
334 northwards push to the western end of the Tarim Basin. In doing so, it will provide
335 a force to drive the observed clockwise rotation of the Tarim Basin relative to stable
336 Eurasia and the westwards-increasing convergence taken up across the Tien Shan (Chen
337 et al., 1991; Avouac et al., 1993; Zubovich et al., 2010). The unusually large number of
338 earthquakes at 80–100 km beneath NW Tibet, accompanied by some minor earthquakes
339 at mid-crustal levels (Huang et al. 2011; labelled *K* on Figure 2a,d), may then be
340 explained by stress concentrations and high strain-rates near the India-Tarim contact,
341 combined with the cooling effect on the overlying crust resulting from the proximity of
342 both cold Tarim and cold Indian lithospheres.

343 The timing of events within the India-Asia collision remains, to some extent, contro-
344 versial. However, simple calculations based on the rates of plate convergence between
345 India and Asia (Copley et al., 2010), paleomagnetic estimates for the shortening ac-

346 accommodated within the Tibetan Plateau itself (Tan et al., 2010; Sun et al., 2012), and
347 the present-day separation of the Tarim basin from the Himalayan Front, indicate that
348 the collision at depth between the Indian and Tarim lithospheres is expected to have
349 occurred sometime in the range 20 – 40 Ma (see Figure S3). Notably, this timing coin-
350 cides with the initiation of compression north of the Tarim basin in the Tien Shan (30 –
351 25 Ma; Glorie et al. 2011) and the Altai (25 – 20 Ma; Yuan et al. 2006), and the start of
352 significant sedimentation in the Tarim and Junggar basins (Miocene onwards; Métivier
353 and Gaudemer 1997). We are not able to state definitively if this agreement in timing
354 is causative rather than coincidence, but we can conclude that the dates of initiation
355 of mountain building in central Asia are consistent with our suggestions regarding the
356 forces exerted upon Tarim by India.

357 The present-day convergence between western India and Asia is accommodated by
358 a combination of shortening between India and Tarim, and convergence distributed
359 across the Tien Shan and further north. The different surface velocities measured
360 by GPS in India and Tarim indicate that the two cannot be completely mechanically
361 coupled where they meet at depth beneath NW Tibet. However, it is likely that the
362 high strain-rates associated with their contact will permit the transmission of large
363 compressive stresses between them. Some of the convergence between India and Tarim
364 is likely to be occurring by the loss of material from the leading end of India, as it heats
365 up and is expelled out of the collision between the two otherwise rigid bodies.

366 **7 Conclusion**

367 In conclusion, our view of the seismicity, rheology and tectonics of Tibet is summarised
368 in Figure 5. The underthrusting beneath Tibet of cold, rigid and seismogenic Indian
369 lower crust, which heats up slowly as it is overridden by hot Tibetan material, results in
370 seismicity extending beneath the plateau at the base of the Indian crust and possibly the
371 top of the Indian mantle. This cold Indian material retains a sufficiently high viscosity

372 to act as a rigid base to the flowing Tibetan crust, resulting in east-west extension
373 at the surface in southern Tibet. The collision beneath northwestern Tibet of rigid
374 Indian lower crust with Tarim may drive the rotation of Tarim with respect to Asia,
375 and contribute to the westwards-increasing shortening taken up by the Tien Shan.

376 **8 Acknowledgements**

377 We thank two anonymous reviewers, and the Editor for comments that improved the
378 manuscript. We also thank D. McKenzie and K. Priestley for useful discussions, and R.
379 Heyburn for use of his array processing code. Seismograms were retrieved from the IRIS
380 DMC, and from the Seismological Central Observatory (SZGRF). TJC is supported by
381 a Girdler scholarship from the University of Cambridge. AC is supported by a research
382 fellowship at Pembroke College in the University of Cambridge. All authors also thank
383 a NERC-NCEO grant to COMET+ for additional support.

384 **References**

- 385 C. E. Acton, K. Priestley, V. K. Gaur, and S. S. Rai. Group velocity tomography of
386 the Indo-Eurasian collision zone. *Journal of Geophysical Research*, 115, 2010. doi:
387 10.1029/2009JB007021.
- 388 J.-P. Avouac, P. Tapponnier, M. Bai, H. You, and G. Wang. Active Thrusting and
389 Folding Along the Northern Tien Shan and Late Cenozoic Rotation of the Tarim
390 Relative to Dzungaria and Kazakhstan. *Journal of Geophysical Research*, 98:6755–
391 6804, 1993.
- 392 P. Banerjee, R. Bürgmann, B. Nagarajan, and E. Apel. Intraplate deforma-
393 tion of the Indian subcontinent. *Geophysical Research Letters*, 35, 2008. doi:
394 10.1029/2008GL035468.
- 395 L. Bollinger, P. Henry, and J.-P. Avouac. Mountain building in the Nepal Himalaya:
396 Thermal and kinematic model. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 244:58, 2006.
- 397 E. Burov. The equivalent elastic thickness (T_e), seismicity and the long-term rheology of
398 continental lithosphere: Time to burn-out 'crème brûlée'? Insights from large-scale
399 geodynamic modeling. *Tectonophysics*, 484:4–26, 2010.

- 400 R. Cattin, G. Martelet, P. Henry, J. P. Avouac, M. Diament, and T. R. Shakya. Grav-
401 ity anomalies, crustal structure and thermo-mechanical support of the Himalaya of
402 Central Nepal. *Geophysical Journal International*, 147:381–392, 2001.
- 403 C. Chapman, C. Yen-Li, and D. Lyness. The WKBJ seismogram algorithm. In
404 D. Doornbos, editor, *Seismological algorithms: Computational methods and computer*
405 *programs*, pages I.2,47–74. Academic Press Limited, London, 1988.
- 406 W.-P. Chen and P. Molnar. Focal depths of intracontinental and intraplate earthquakes
407 and their implications for the thermal and mechanical properties of the lithosphere.
408 *Journal of Geophysical Research*, 88:4183–4214, 1983.
- 409 W.-P. Chen and Z. Yang. Earthquakes Beneath the Himalayas and Tibet: Evidence
410 for Strong Lithospheric Mantle. *Science*, 304, 2004. doi: 10.1126/science.1097324.
- 411 Y. Chen, J.-P. Cogne, V. Courtillot, J.-P. Avouac, P. Tapponier, G. Wang, M. Bai,
412 H. You, M. Li, C. Wei, and E. Buffetaut. Paleomagnetic Study of Mesozoic Conti-
413 nental Sediments Along the Northern Tien Shan (China) and Heterogenous Strain in
414 Central Asia. *Journal of Geophysical Research*, 96:4065–4082, 1991.
- 415 A. Copley, J.-P. Avouac, and J.-Y. Royer. India-Asia collision and the Cenozoic slow-
416 down of the Indian plate: Implications for the forces driving plate motions. *Journal*
417 *of Geophysical Research*, 115, 2010. doi: 10.1029/2009JB006634.
- 418 A. Copley, J.-P. Avouac, and B. P. Wernicke. Evidence for mechanical coupling and
419 strong Indian lower crust beneath southern Tibet. *Nature*, 472:79–81, 2011. doi:
420 10.1038/nature09926.
- 421 E.R. Engdahl, R.D. van der Hilst, and R.P. Buland. Global teleseismic earthquake relo-
422 cation with improved travel times and procedures for depth determination. *Bulletin*
423 *of the Seismological Society of America*, 88:722–743, 1998.
- 424 M. Furuya and T. Yasuda. The 2008 Yutian normal faulting earthquake (M_W), NW
425 Tibet: Non-planar fault modeling and implications for the Karakax Fault. *Tectono-*
426 *physics*, 511:125–133, 2011. doi: 10.1016/j.tecto.2011.09.003.
- 427 W. Gan, P. Zhang, Z.-K. Shen, Z. Niu, M. Wang, Y. Wan, D. Zhou, and J. Cheng.
428 Present-day crustal motion within the Tibetan Plateau inferred from GPS measure-
429 ments. *Journal of Geophysical Research*, 112, 2007. doi: 10.1029/2005JB004120.
- 430 S. Glorie, J. De. Grave, M. M. Buslov, F. I. Zhimulev, D. F. Stockli, V. Y. Batalev,
431 A. Izmer, P. Van den haute, F. Vanhaecke, and M. A. Elburg. Tectonic his-
432 tory of the Kyrgyz South Tien Shan (Atbashi-Inylchek) suture zone: The role
433 of inherited structures during deformation-propagation. *Tectonics*, 30, 2011. doi:
434 10.1029/2011TC002949.
- 435 B. R. Hacker, E. Gnos, L. Ratschbacher, M. Grove, M. McWilliams, S. V. Sobolev,
436 J. Wan, and W. Zhenhan. Hot and Dry Deep Crustal Xenoliths from Tibet. *Science*,
437 287, 2000. doi: 10.1126/science.287.5462.2463.

- 438 P. Henry, X. Le Pichon, and B. Goffé. Kinematic, thermal and petrological model of
439 the Himalayas: constraints related to metamorphism within the underthrust Indian
440 crust and topographic elevation. *Tectonophysics*, 273:31–56, 1997.
- 441 F. Herman, P. Copeland, J.-P. Avouac, L. Bollinger, G. Mahéo, P. Le Fort, S. Rai,
442 D. Foster, A. Pêcher, K. Stüwe, and P. Henry. Exhumation, crustal deformation, and
443 thermal structure of the Nepal Himalaya derived from the inversion of thermochrono-
444 logical and thermobarometric data and modeling of the topography. *Journal of Geo-
445 physical Research*, 115, 2010. doi: 10.1029/2008JB006126.
- 446 R. Heyburn and D. Bowers. Earthquake depth estimation using the F Trace and
447 Associated Probability. *Bulletin of the Seismological Society of America*, 98:18–35,
448 2008. doi: 10.1785/0120070008.
- 449 G.-C. D. Huang, S. W. Roecker, and V. Levin. Lower-crustal earthquakes in the West
450 Kunlun range. *Geophysical Research Letters*, 38, 2011. doi: 10.1029/2010GL045893.
- 451 S.-H. Hung, W.-P. Chen, and L.-Y. Chiao. A data-adaptive, multiscale approach of
452 finite-frequency, travelttime tomography with special reference to P and S wave
453 data from central Tibet. *Journal of Geophysical Research*, 116, 2011. doi:
454 10.1029/2010JB008190.
- 455 J. Jackson, D. McKenzie, K. Priestley, and B. Emmerson. New views on the structure
456 and rheology of the lithosphere. *Journal of the Geological Society, London*, 165:
457 453–465, 2008. doi: 10.1144/0016-76492007-109.
- 458 C. Jaupart and J. C. Mareschal. The thermal structure and thickness of continental
459 roots. *Lithos*, 48:93–114, 1999.
- 460 B. L. N. Kennett, E. R. Engdahl, and R. Buland. Constraints on seismic velocities in
461 the Earth from travel times. *Geophysical Journal International*, 122:108–124, 1995.
- 462 W. R. Langin, L. D. Brown, and E. A. Sandvol. Seismicity of Central Tibet from
463 Project INDEPTH III Seismic Recordings. *Bulletin of the Seismological Society of
464 America*, 93:2146–2159, 2003.
- 465 J. Lavé and J. P. Avouac. Active folding of fluvial terraces across the Siwaliks Hills,
466 Himalayas of central Nepal. *Journal of Geophysical Research*, 105:5735–5770, 2000.
- 467 C. Li, R. D. van der Hilst, A. S. Meltzer, and E. R. Engdahl. Subduction of the Indian
468 lithosphere beneath the Tibetan Plateau and Burma. *Earth and Planetary Sciences*,
469 274:157–168, 2008. doi: 10.1016/j.epsl.2008.07.016.
- 470 X. Liang, S. Zhou, Y. J. Chen, G. Jin, L. Xiao, P. Liu, Y. Fu, Y. Tang, X. Lou, and
471 J. Ning. Earthquake distribution in southern Tibet and its tectonic implications.
472 *Journal of Geophysical Research*, 113, 2008. doi: 10.1029/2007JB005101.
- 473 M. G. Lund, H. Austrheim, and M. Erambert. Earthquakes in the deep continental
474 crust - insights from studies on exhumed high-pressure rocks. *Geophysical Journal
475 International*, 158:569–576, 2004. doi: 10.1111/j.1365-246X.2004.02368.x.

- 476 S. J. Mackwell. High-temperature deformation of dry diabase with application to tec-
477 tonics on Venus. *Journal of Geophysical Research*, 103:975–984, 1998.
- 478 D. M^cKenzie, J. Jackson, and K. Priestley. Thermal structure of oceanic and conti-
479 nental lithosphere. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 233:337–349, 2005. doi:
480 10.1016/j.epsl.2005.02.005.
- 481 F. Métivier and Y. Gaudemer. Mass transfer between eastern Tien Shan and adjacent
482 basins (central Asia): constraints on regional tectonics and topography. *Geophysical*
483 *Journal International*, 128:1–17, 1997. doi: 10.1111/j.1365-246X.1997.tb04068.x.
- 484 G. Monsalve, A. Sheehan, V. Schulte-Pelkum, S. Rajaure, M. R. Pandey, and F. Wu.
485 Seismicity and one-dimensional velocity structure of the himalayan collisions zone:
486 Earthquakes in the crust and upper mantle. *Journal of Geophysical Research*, 111,
487 2006. doi: 10.1029/2005JB004062.
- 488 G. Monsalve, A. Sheehan, C. Rowe, and S. Rajaure. Seismic structure of the crust
489 and the upper mantle beneath the Himalayas: Evidence for eclogitization of lower
490 crustal rocks in the Indian Plate. *Journal of Geophysical Research*, 113, 2008. doi:
491 10.1029/2007JB005424.
- 492 P. I. Nabelek, A. G. Whittington, and A. M. Hofmeister. Strain heating as a mechanism
493 for partial melting and ultrahigh temperature metamorphism in convergent orogens:
494 Implications of temperature dependent thermal diffusivity and rheology. *Journal of*
495 *Geophysical Research*, 115, 2010. doi: 10.1029/2010JB007727.
- 496 K. Priestley, J. Jackson, and D. M^cKenzie. Lithospheric structure and deep earthquakes
497 beneath India, the Himalaya and southern Tibet. *Geophysical Journal International*,
498 172:345–362, 2008. doi: 10.1111/j.1365-246X.2007.03636.x.
- 499 S. Roy and R. U. M. Rao. Heat flow in the Indian shield. *Journal of Geophysical*
500 *Research*, 105:25587–25604, 2000.
- 501 S. Roy and R. U. M. Rao. Towards a crustal thermal model for the Archean Dharwar
502 craton, southern India. *Physics and Chemistry of the Earth*, 28:361–373, 2003.
- 503 E. Rybacki and G. Dresen. Dislocation and diffusion creep of synthetic anorthite ag-
504 gregates. *Journal of Geophysical Research*, 105:26017–26036, 2000.
- 505 R. A. Sloan, J. A. Jackson, D. M^cKenzie, and K. Priestley. Earthquake depth dis-
506 tribution in central Asia, and their relations with lithosphere thickness, shorten-
507 ing and extension. *Geophysical Journal International*, 2011. doi: 10.1111/j.1365-
508 246X.2010.04882.x.
- 509 Z. Sun, J. Pei, H. Li, W. Xu, W. Jiang, Z. Zhu, X. Wang, and Z. Yang. Palaeomag-
510 netism of late Cretaceous sediments from southern Tibet: Evidence for the consistent
511 palaeolatitudes of the southern margin of Eurasia prior to the collision with India.
512 *Gondwana Research*, 21:53–63, 2012. doi: 10.1016/j.gr.2011.08.003.

- 513 X. Tan, S. Gilder, K. P. Kodama, W. Jiang, Y. Han, and H. Zhang. New paleomagnetic
514 results from the Lhasa block: Revised estimation of latitudinal shortening across Ti-
515 bet and implications for dating the India-Asia collision. *Earth and Planetary Science
516 Letters*, 293:396–404, 2010. doi: 10.1016/j.epsl.2010.03.013.
- 517 G. Wittlinger, J. Vergne, P. Tapponnier, V. Farra, G. Poupinet, M. Jiang, H. Su,
518 G. Herquel, and A. Paul. Teleseismic imaging of subducting lithosphere and Moho
519 offsets beneath western Tibet. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*, 221:117–130,
520 2004.
- 521 W. Yuan, A. Carter, J. Dong, Z. Bao, Y. An, and Z. Guo. Mesozoic-Tertiary ex-
522 humation history of the Altai Mountains, northern Xinjiang, China: New con-
523 straints from apatite fission track data. *Tectonophysics*, 412:183–193, 2006. doi:
524 10.1016/j.tecto.2005.09.007.
- 525 J. Zhao, X. Yuan, H. Liu, P. Kumar, S. Pei, R. Kind, Z. Zhang, J. Teng, L. Ding,
526 X. Gao, Q. Xu, and W. Wang. The boundary between the Indian and Asian tectonic
527 plates below Tibet. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*, 107:11229–
528 11233, 2010. doi: 10.1073/pnas.1001921107.
- 529 A. V. Zubovich, X.-Q. Wang, Y. G. Scherba, G. G. Schelochkov, R. Reilinger, C. Reig-
530 ber, O. I. Mosienko, P. Molnar, W. Michajljow, V. I. Makarov, J. Li, S. I. Kuzikov,
531 T. A. Herring, M. W. Hamburger, B. H. Hager, Y. Dang, V. D. Bragin, and R. T.
532 Beisenbaev. GPS velocity field for the Tien Shan and surrounding regions. *Tectonics*,
533 29, 2010. doi: 10.1029/2010TC002772.

Figure 1: **Depth determination using teleseismic arrays.** An example of the array processing techniques used in this study for a M_W 4.7 earthquake on 2nd April 2011 in northwestern Tibet, recorded at the Alice Springs Array in Australia. (a) Example of an unfiltered seismogram from a single station within the array. (b) Unfiltered beamformed linear stack of all seismograms from the array. (c) Bandpass filtered beamformed linear stack of all seismograms from the array. (d) Synthetic waveform calculated with a depth of 95 km, and the given mechanism. The three principle phases (direct P , and the two depth phases pP and sP) are labelled. (e) F-Statistic (see text and Heyburn and Bowers 2008). (f) Beam power as a function of time and slowness (earthquake expected at 5.331 s/°, based on NEIC location). (g) F-statistic as a function of time and slowness. (h) Beam power as a function of time and azimuth (earthquake expected at 316.9° , based on NEIC location). (i) F-statistic as a function of time and azimuth. The colour scales for (f)-(i) are all normalised to the maximum value within the window shown.

Figure 2: **Seismicity and deformation across the India-Asia collision.** (a) Map of earthquakes with accurately constrained depths, from this study (Tables S1, S2) and others (see supplementary material). Depths are indicated by colour, and earthquakes deeper than 20 km are scaled by magnitude. Black arrow indicates the India-Asia convergence vector. The dashed blue line (A) outlines the area in central southern Tibet where there is no deep seismicity. B : 2001 Bhuj earthquake. S : Shillong Plateau. K : Mid-crustal earthquakes beneath NW Tibet (Huang et al., 2011). (b) Normal (purple) and strike-slip (green) focal mechanisms across the Tibetan Plateau from the GCMT catalogue (depth ≤ 40 km, $M_W \geq 5.5$, only well constrained mechanisms with a % double couple $\geq 70\%$). Y indicates the the 2008 Yutian earthquake. (c) GPS velocities in southern Tibet, relative to India (Banerjee et al., 2008). (d) Earthquake cross section, with earthquakes within the white box in (a) reprojected as a function of distance from the Himalayan front, along the India – Asia convergence vector. Earthquakes in the Hindu Kush Deep Seismic Zone and the Burmese Arc (dashed black lines in (a)) are excluded. The green band encompasses published receiver function estimates for the Moho from within the white box in (a) (green triangles; see supplementary material).

Figure 3: **Thermal modeling of India underthrusting Tibet.** (a) Structure of the 2 dimensional thermal model. (b) Calculated temperatures for the top section of our preferred model, presented in full in supplementary material. Contours are at 50°C intervals. Green lines represent boundaries between Tibetan crust, Indian crust, and mantle. (c) Temperature (blue) and viscosity (brown) estimates for the Indian crust (grey region, (a)). For both temperature and viscosity, the thick dark line indicates the average, with the lighter shaded area indicating the range. Viscosities are calculated using a dry anorthite flow-law (Rybacki and Dresen, 2000) at a strain rate of $3 \times 10^{-9} \text{ yr}^{-1}$ and using a grain size of 1 mm. Deep earthquakes are shown as a function of distance from the front, coloured as in Figure 2. The blue arrow indicates the distance at which temperatures fall below those expected to cut off seismicity. The brown arrow indicates the distance at which viscosities fall below the criterion required to explain surface extension. The southern extent of the topographic low of the Tarim basin is indicated by the black arrow.

Figure 4: **Dynamic models relating surface deformation to lower crustal rheology.** (a) The calculation shown in Copley et al. (2011), in which rigid lower crust underlies the entire southern half of the plateau (south of the southernmost dashed line; see (c) for model geometry). The coloured bars represent the principal axes of the horizontal strain-rate tensor, with isolated blue bars representing horizontal extension, isolated red bars representing horizontal compression, and coupled red and blue crosses being equivalent to strike-slip deformation. Note the pure east-west extension in the southern plateau (inset). (b) Calculation identical to (a), except that the part of the lower crust corresponding to region A in Figure 2a has been weakened relative to the other underthrust material. Again, the lower crust is only rigid south of the southernmost dashed line. Note the combination of east-west extension and north-south shortening in the southern plateau (inset). (c) Cartoon of the model geometry. Dark regions are rigid, with imposed velocities. The lighter region deforms by viscous flow in response to the applied India-Tarim convergence, and gravitational potential energy contrasts.

Figure 5: **Schematic sketch of the tectonics and structure of the India-Asia collision zone.** Black arrows indicate velocities with respect to stable Eurasia. Grey arrows represent velocities with respect to peninsular India. Grey double arrows within Tibet are indicative of the local strain field. The red line indicates the seismic-aseismic transition. Blue lines indicate the extent of the rigid behaviour of India at depth (solid) and its projection to the surface (dashed). Rotation of the Tarim basin relative to Eurasia, and westwards increasing compression across the Tien Shan, may be driven by the collision between the rigid extent of India and the Tarim basin at depth beneath northwest Tibet.