UNIVERSITY of York

This is a repository copy of *The experiences of everyday travel for older people living in rural areas: a systematic review of UK qualitative studies*.

White Rose Research Online URL for this paper: <u>https://eprints.whiterose.ac.uk/137795/</u>

Version: Accepted Version

Article:

Graham, Hilary Mavis orcid.org/0000-0001-7949-6819, De Bell, Sian orcid.org/0000-0001-7356-3849, Flemming, Katherine Ann orcid.org/0000-0002-0795-8516 et al. (3 more authors) (2018) The experiences of everyday travel for older people living in rural areas: a systematic review of UK qualitative studies. Journal of Transport & Health. pp. 141-152. ISSN 2214-1405

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jth.2018.10.007

Reuse

This article is distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivs (CC BY-NC-ND) licence. This licence only allows you to download this work and share it with others as long as you credit the authors, but you can't change the article in any way or use it commercially. More information and the full terms of the licence here: https://creativecommons.org/licenses/

Takedown

If you consider content in White Rose Research Online to be in breach of UK law, please notify us by emailing eprints@whiterose.ac.uk including the URL of the record and the reason for the withdrawal request.



eprints@whiterose.ac.uk https://eprints.whiterose.ac.uk/

TITLE PAGE

Title: The experiences of everyday travel for older people in rural areas: a systematic review of UK qualitative studies

Author details

Hilary Graham, Professor, Dept of Health Sciences, University of York
Sian de Bell, Research Fellow, Dept of Health Sciences, University of York
Kate Flemming, Senior Lecturer, Dept of Health Sciences, University of York
Amanda Sowden, Professor, Centre for Reviews and Dissemination, University of York
Piran White, Professor, Dept of Environment, University of York
Kath Wright, Information Service Manager, Centre for Reviews and Dissemination, University of York

Financial disclosure

The review was undertaken as part of the Public Health Research Consortium (PHPEHF50/17), funded by the National Institute for Health Research (NIHR) Policy Research Programme. The views expressed are those of the authors and not necessarily those of the Department of Health and Social Care. Information about the wider programme of the PHRC is available from http://phrc.lshtm.ac.uk/.

Acknowledgements

We thank four external research experts, Judith Green, Charles Musselwhite, Tim Schwanen and Ian Shergold for help with identifying papers that our searches may have missed. We also thank Hugh Ortega Breton for his contribution to the initial scoping work to inform the focus of the review.

Particular thanks go to the project's policy advisors for their very helpful advice on the initial set of themes. Coordinated by Paul Butcher (Director of Public Health, Calderdale Council), we received feedback from transport planning, health and voluntary leads at Calderdale Council, including Mary Farrar, Corporate Lead Transportation, and Sian Rogers, Policy & Projects Manager, Lead for Voluntary and Community Sector. Coordinated by Nick Grayson (Climate Change and Sustainability Manager, Birmingham City Council), we received feedback from Ewan Hamnett (Lordswood House Group Medical Practice, Birmingham). We also received feedback from Joe Oldman (Housing and Transport Policy Manager, AgeUK).

HIGHLIGHTS

- Turns the spotlight on an often-neglected group: older people in rural areas
- Undertakes a thematic synthesis of qualitative studies to focus on their experiences of everyday travel
- Benefited from feedback on initial findings from policy and practice advisors
- Discusses how reductions in transport provision impact on older people's lives
- Highlights the role of travel in affirming or undermining valued identities
- Describes how the transport infrastructure underpins quality of life in older age

1

2 **1. Introduction**

3

4 In line with global patterns (UNDESA, 2009; UNECE, 2017), older people make up a larger

- 5 proportion of the UK's rural than urban population (DEFRA, 2018; Scottish Government,
- 6 2017; Wales Rural Observatory, 2013). While older people appreciate the beauty and
- 7 neighbourliness of rural life (Burholt, 2012; Hennessy and Means, 2018), everyday travel can
- 8 be a challenge. Older people are less likely to drive and more likely to have mobility
- 9 limitations (Gale et al., 2014) and to report problems with accessing essential services

10 (Shergold and Parkhurst, 2012).

- 11 Marked national differences in transport systems, including in car ownership (Eurostat,
- 12 2017) and public transport (Mageean and Nelson, 2003; Nelson et al., 2010), support a
- 13 country-level focus for studies of rural communities. In the UK, bus services are poorer and
- 14 car ownership is more common in rural areas: over 90% of households in villages, hamlets
- 15 and isolated dwellings have a car/van compared with 65% in urban conurbations (DfT,
- 16 2016). Since 2010, government austerity policies have compounded these diferences.
- 17 Reduced funding has brought major reductions (around 40%) in rural bus services and in
- 18 community transport schemes, for example demand-responsive transport (DRT) with home-
- 19 to-destination routing for users with mobility difficulties (Campaign for Better Transport,
- 20 2017; House of Commons Transport Select Committee, 2017). At the same time, the
- 21 government made a commitment to 'rural proof' its policies (Bradshaw, 2015; DEFRA, 2012;
- 22 DARD, 2015) to take account of the experiences of rural communities and imposed an
- 23 Equality Duty on all public bodies to minimise the disadvantages experienced by older
- 24 people (AgeUK, 2017; HM Government, 2010).
- 25 Qualitative studies provide insights into people's experiences, and evidence syntheses -
- 26 where the findings of multiple studies are brought together are singled out for the
- 27 contribution they make to policy-making (Langlois et al., 2018; Whitty, 2015). However,
- 28 despite the importance of travel for older people in rural areas, there are no systematic
- 29 reviews focused on their experiences of everyday travel. We address this gap by
- 30 synthesising evidence from UK qualitative studies.

31 2. Methods

- 32 Our review is registered on PROSPERO (CRD42018086275). PROSPERO is an international
- 33 database of prospectively-registered systematic review in health and social care, welfare,
- 34 public health, education, crime, justice and international development
- 35 (https://www.crd.york.ac.uk/prospero/). We followed the Centre for Reviews and
- 36 Dissemination (CRD) 'Guidance on Undertaking Reviews' (CRD, 2009) and reported the
- 37 review according to the Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-

- 38 analyses (PRISMA). PRISMA is an evidence-based set of items which encourage the
- 39 transparent reporting of systematic reviews (<u>http://www.prisma-statement.org/</u>).
- 40

41 2.1 Searches

- 42 We searched English language journals published between 1998 and 2017 in MEDLINE,
- 43 CINAHL Plus, Scopus, AgeInfo and TRID (Transport Research International Documentation).
- 44 Additionally, we checked references in potentially-relevant systematic reviews (Annear et
- 45 al., 2012; Dadpour et al., 2016; Moran et al., 2014), hand-searched key journals and sought
- 46 advice from researchers in the field.

47 2.2 Screening and study selection

- 48 We screened records by title and abstract to identify UK studies published in peer-reviewed
- 49 journals. Full texts were screened by two reviewers (HG, KF); a third reviewer (SdB)
- 50 undertook a full check of included and excluded studies.
- 51 Studies were included if they (i) included people aged ≥60 resident in rural areas (as defined
- 52 by the study authors) and (ii) used qualitative methods to explore experiences of everyday
- 53 travel. We included mixed-method studies where qualitative findings were described
- 54 separately and studies including other groups where older people's experiences were
- 55 separately reported.
- 56 We excluded studies where (i) participants were recruited based on their health condition
- 57 (e.g. people with cardiovascular disease) and (ii) the experiences of rural older people were
- 58 not separately reported (e.g. studies of adults; studies including both urban and rural
- 59 participants).

60 2.3 Data extraction and quality appraisal

- 61 Three reviewers (SdB, KF, HG) undertook data extraction (using the columns in Table 1) and
- 62 quality appraisal (Hawker et al., 2002). Quality appraisal (QA) of included studies was
- 63 undertaken to ensure transparency (Carroll et al., 2012; Noyes et al., 2017).

64 2.4 Synthesis

- 65 We undertook thematic synthesis, an iterative 3-stage process that: (i) generates codes
- 66 from the data (participant accounts and author interpretations), (ii) combines codes into
- 67 descriptive themes and (ii) identifies cross-cutting analytical themes (Booth et al., 2016;
- 68 Thomas and Harden, 2008). Three reviewers (SdB, KF, HG) undertook the synthesis using
- 69 NVivo version 11 (QSR, 2012).
- 70 An initial set of codes was developed, checked and then applied to the data. Next, related
- 71 codes were grouped together into broader descriptive themes from which analytical themes
- 72 were developed (SdB, KF, HG). This final stage involved linking descriptive themes both to

- 73 each other and back to the data from which the codes were generated. The analytical
- 74 themes were shared and refined with policy advisers. The advisors were senior officers and
- 75 practitioners working in local health, transport and environmental services, together with
- 76 the lead for transport and health for older people at a major UK charity.

77 3. Overview of results

78 **3.1 Study characteristics**

- 79 Our searches located 520 records (Figure 1). After screening, ten studies reported in twelve
- 80 papers met the inclusion criteria (Table 1). With one exception, quality scores were high
- 81 (≥20). Lower-scoring papers provided less information on analysis methods, ethics and bias
- 82 and contributed fewer codes to the coding schema.
- 83 Six papers (hereafter referred to as studies) were concerned with rural travel; the remainder
- 84 focused healthy ageing (3), the experience of living in a rural environment (2), and
- 85 environmental determinants of walking outdoors (1). The majority of study participants
- 86 were aged \geq 60; in two studies, they were \geq 65 years and in two studies \geq 70 years. In total,
- 87 the studies reported on the experiences of 814 older people. Sample sizes ranged from 13
- 88 to 423; most studies (7) had 30-40 participants.
- 89 Most studies were carried out in England (5) or England and Wales (2). There was one
- 90 Scottish and two Irish studies; both Irish studies enabled Northern Ireland participants to be
- 91 identified. Studies included remote rural communities and three studies included both rural
- 92 and urban participants; all three enabled identification of rural participants.
- 93 Eight studies were solely qualitative; four had a mixed-method design. Ten studies used one
- 94 method of data collection, one used two methods, and one used three methods. The
- 95 majority (7) of studies conducted semi-structured interviews with participants. Other
- 96 methods of data collection included focus groups (5 studies), questionnaires with qualitative
- 97 questions (1), and participant observation (1).
- 98 Eight studies provided information on their gender profile; 60% of their participants were
- 99 women. Other socio-demographic information was limited. One study reported that all
- 100 participants were white British; no other studies gave information on ethnicity. Eight
- 101 studies included some socioeconomic information, with four reporting that participants
- 102 were recruited from areas with differing socioeconomic profiles. Six studies included
- 103 information on car use and indicated that the majority of households had a car. Health
- 104 status was not reported in five studies; the remainder provided variable information (for
- 105 example, on health conditions, physical activity and social exclusion).
- 106 Some information was provided on the participants whose verbatim accounts were included
- 107 in the studies. The gender of the speaker was noted in six of the studies and, of these, five
- 108 indicated their age range. We report these details for the accounts included in the sections

- 109 below. Some studies noted the speaker's area of residence (e.g. 'Dorset', 'low density area
- 110 in Oxfordshire') but, where information on health status is provided, this related to the
- 111 study as a whole.

112 3.2. Codes and themes

- 113 Most codes related to older people's experiences of travel, and car travel in particular;
- 114 relatively few related to broader experiences of the rural environment. A smaller group of
- 115 codes related to health difficulties and wellbeing. The 37 descriptive themes captured the
- 116 challenges of rural travel, including the lack of transport options, car dependence and the
- 117 impact of driving cessation, and the relationship between being mobile, travel and
- 118 wellbeing. Three inter-connected analytical themes were identified and shared with the
- 119 project's policy advisors.
- 120 The first theme relates to the experience of living with an inadequate transport system. The
- 121 second and third themes highlight the practical importance of everyday travel in enabling
- 122 older people to maintain their lives and its symbolic importance in affirming valued
- 123 identities. The impact of travel on health and wellbeing ran through all three themes.

124 **4. Overarching themes**

125 **4.1 Theme 1: living with an inadequate transport system**

- 126 The inadequacies of the rural transport system provided the context in which older people's
- 127 experiences of everyday travel were set. Various system components were discussed,
- 128 including walking, local bus services, community transport, hospital transport, taxis, and lifts
- 129 from the family and friends.
- 130 *Walking* was described as an everyday travel mode only by those living in villages with safe
- 131 pedestrian access to village shops, pubs and clubs.
- 132 ... there are loads of clubs in the village ... I could walk to any of the ones that I wanted to 133 go to (female, aged in sixties) (Shergold et al., 2012)
- 134 We've got a really nice pub, exactly a mile down the road but I can't walk to it because it's
- 135 much too dangerous. (male, aged in sixties) (Shergold et al., 2012)
- 136 *Local bus services* were valued by some older people but there was a widespread
- 137 perception that the bus did not provide a reliable and accessible mode of transport (Ahern
- and Hine, 2012; de Koning et al., 2015; King and Farmer, 2009; Manthorpe et al., 2004;
- 139 Shergold and Parkhurst, 2012; Shergold et al., 2012; Ward et al., 2013; Windle, 2004). Study
- 140 participants spoke about the absence and inadequacies of the bus service, including
- 141 difficulties getting to bus stops and boarding buses. Such negative perceptions may not be
- 142 based on direct personal experience; the perceived barriers to bus travel went hand-in-hand
- 143 with limited knowledge of, and interest in, bus travel, perceptual barriers that further

- 144 contributed to car dependence (Ward et al., 2013; Shergold et al., 2012). In consequence,
- 145 and despite free travel being available for older people at off-peak times, the bus was
- 146 typically not considered a viable option for everyday travel.
- 147 It's all very well the government giving out free bus passes, but where are the buses for us to
- 148 use them on?! If it weren't for the community spirit in this area a lot of people wouldn't
- 149 survive. (King and Farmer, 2009)
- 150 I think there is a bus that runs twice a day, but I don't know. I'd be a hermit I think without
- 151 my car. (male) (Ward et al., 2013)
- 152 There is no bus. I've got to take the car to get to the bus! (Windle, 2004)
- 153 Steps off the bus are too difficult to get on and off. (Windle, 2004)
- 154 However, for the minority of older people without access to a car, without mobility
- 155 problems and in areas with a regular bus service (for example in villages near urban
- 156 centres), bus services were highly valued, with the concessionary bus travel scheme making
- 157 a major difference to travel opportunities (Ahern and Hine, 2012; de Koning et al., 2015;
- 158 Manthorpe et al., 2004).
- 159 Community transport, including community buses and DRT schemes, was widely discussed
- 160 (Ahern and Hine, 2012, 2015; Manthorpe et al., 2004; Shergold and Parkhurst, 2012;
- 161 Shergold et al., 2012; Ward et al., 2013; Windle, 2004) and was highly valued by users.
- 162 I am very pleased with community transport. I live 10 miles from the city, a very backward
- 163 area, and there is no way to get out except with community transport and I can get that
- 164 service anytime. It's absolutely brilliant. It's made a new life for me and also to say, the
- 165 staff are brilliant. (Ahern and Hine, 2015)
- 166 Having the village bus is great...On the bus of course it's fun, because you meet people you
- 167 know doing the same thing (male, aged in eighties) (de Koning et al., 2015)
- 168 However among non-users, there was a view, particularly among men, that community
- 169 transport carried a social stigma. Thus, male participants in Ahern & Hine (2012) regarded
- 170 community transport as a 'feminised' service offering 'trips that women like to make', such
- 171 as shopping trips and visits to social clubs; in consequence, men were reluctant to use it. In
- 172 a similar vein, participants in Shergold & Parkhurst (2012) study considered community
- 173 transport, both public sector dial-a-ride schemes and volunteer-run community services, as
- 174 being for 'the less able' and 'older people' (Shergold and Parkhurst, 2012).
- 175 As with travelling by bus, mobility limitations could make alternative travel modes difficult
- 176 to use. DRT schemes (for example, minibuses and shared taxis) may lack wheelchair access
- 177 and space to carry folded wheelchairs and mobility scooters (Ward et al, 2013). Lack of use

178 was again associated with low levels of awareness of and confusion about DRT, including

179 eligibility and how to access it (Ward et al., 2013).

Hospital transport and taxis. Travelling to healthcare appointments was particularly difficult for those without a car. But alternative travel modes – for example, hospital transport services and taxis - were experienced as problematic. Non-emergency hospital transport could be an ordeal, as the participant below explains. Taxis were regarded as expensive and were therefore reserved for occasional and/or emergency use (Ahern and

185 Hine, 2012, 2015; Shergold and Parkhurst, 2012; Shergold et al., 2012; Ward et al., 2013).

186 Now, you can book a hospital car service but if you are having chemotherapy and you're

187 picked up at something like half past seven in the morning because you've got...three other

188 passengers they've got to pick up. And it's from here to Cheltenham. So you could go to

189 Hereford, you could go all round, then you go in and you cannot come home until the last

190 person's had their treatment and that can be very very [long wait]. If you've had chemo, it's

191 evil. (female, aged in sixties) (Shergold and Parkhurst, 2012)

192 I was taken ill in October and I had to get a taxi; because the ambulance wasn't available I

193 had to have a taxi to Abergavenny to the hospital for further tests, and it was £20 for a

194 single journey. It is only 15 miles, you know. (female, aged in seventies) (Shergold and

195 Parkhurst, 2012)

196 *Lifts from family and friends* were an important part of the rural transport infrastructure – 197 but for occasional rather for regular use. It was only considered acceptable to ask for help

198 for certain types of trips, with accessing healthcare as the major example (Ahern and Hine,

199 2012; Shergold and Parkhurst, 2012; Shergold et al., 2012). Unable to afford taxis, those

200 without a car would forgo 'non-essential' trips, for example social and leisure trips, a pattern

201 noted to be more common among men (Ahern and Hine, 2012). As this suggests, there was

202 a commonly-expressed reluctance to turn to family and friends to meet travel needs. This

203 related to a strong preference for self-reliance and concerns about developing dependent

204 relationships in which the individual felt indebted to and a burden on the lift-giver

205 (discussed further under the third theme). As explained by one woman in her eighties

206 whose health problems meant she could no longer drive:

There are a few people who will offer it [rides], but not many who I would ask because I think
to them, and I know the feeling, that once they do it, they have to do it again, you know. So I
try not to ask too many people. (Schwanen et al., 2012)

210 As the accounts of walking, public transport, DRT, taxis and relying on family and friends

211 suggest, the inadequacies of the rural transport system were experienced most acutely by

212 those without access to a car. These inadequacies were also constantly invoked by car

213 owners and drivers to explain their travel preference.

- 214 *Having a car* was explained in terms of the inadequacies and unsuitability of other travel
- 215 modes. Having a car was 'essential' and 'a lifeline', a view summed up by the phrase 'no car,
- 216 *no transport'* (Ahern and Hine, 2015). The car was widely regarded as the *de facto* mode
- 217 (Shergold et al., 2012), with other modes seen to have inadequacies which owning and
- 218 driving a car avoided.
- 219 Without my car I don't know what I'd do. (male) (Ward et al., 2013)

To me, motoring and things like heating are essentials that you can't really avoid. (male,
aged in sixties) (Shergold and Parkhurst, 2012)

- 222 Unlike other modes of transport, car travel was widely viewed in positive terms. As one
- 223 study participant put it, 'I love my car' (female) (Ward et al., 2013). The car was 'handier'
- 224 (Windle, 2004), a dependable form of transport that could accommodate poor weather,
- 225 distance to services and mobility limitations in ways that other travel modes could not (de
- 226 Koning et al., 2015; Schwanen et al., 2012; Shergold et al., 2012; Windle, 2004; Ziegler and
- 227 Schwanen, 2011).
- 228 I find it very frustrating, my lack of mobility. I live 100 yards from this (village) hall and it will
- 229 take me nearly half an hour to walk and that's why I use the car. I use it as another pair of
- 230 legs. (male, aged in eighties) (Ziegler and Schwanen, 2011)
- 231 Not surprisingly, driving cessation (discussed further under theme three) had major negative
- 232 impacts on both the driver and, in households where their partner did not drive, on their
- 233 partner.
- 234 I don't like my life now with my husband not driving. It (the rural transport service) stops at
 235 6 o'clock at night. Rural transport has no flexibility. (Ahern and Hine, 2015)
- 236 While the emphasis was on the advantages of car travel, some negative aspects were noted.
- 237 These related to the financial cost of car ownership and to traffic conditions the speed and
- 238 density of traffic for example rather than the mode itself. An awareness of the
- 239 environmental impacts of car use was not evident in the studies.
- 240 Motoring is expensive . . . we are limited in our income and so there's a limit to how much 241 we can get out and about and go places. (female, aged in seventies) (Shergold et al., 2012)

242 **4.2** Theme 2: maintaining the lives older people wish to lead

- 243 This second theme linked closely to theme one. The adequacy of the transport system
- 244 mattered because it provided the platform on which fulfilling lives could be built and
- 245 sustained. Everyday travel provided access to two sets of valued resources.
- 246 The first were essential goods and services (Ahern and Hine, 2012; de Koning et al., 2015;
- 247 Guell et al., 2016; Manthorpe et al., 2004; Schwanen et al., 2012; Ward et al., 2013). Thus,

- 248 the studies described the common trips that older people made, including food shopping,
- 249 accessing services (e.g. the post office and bank) and getting to healthcare appointments.
- 250 As noted under theme one, the car was experienced as facilitating these trips, particularly to
- 251 distant locations and when the weather was poor, while other modes of transport made
- 252 access to these key resources difficult.
- 253 Secondly, transport, and the car in particular, enabled access to a wider range of activities
- 254 that gave pleasure and meaning to older people's lives. These included networks and
- 255 activities linked to places of worship, social clubs and community events (Ahern and Hine,
- 256 2012, 2015; de Koning et al., 2015; Shergold and Parkhurst, 2012; Shergold et al., 2012;
- 257 Ziegler and Schwanen, 2011). Study participants described being 'entirely dependent' on the
- 258 car with 'no other way of doing it'; without a car, they would 'have to cancel social activities'
- 259 (Shergold and Parkhurst, 2012).
- 260 (A car) is necessary, well if we are to sustain our activities at the current level (male, aged in 261 eighties) (de Koning et al., 2015)
- 262 The activities included informal care and volunteering, for example, care of grandchildren
- 263 (Guell et al., 2016) and, like the male participant below, volunteer visiting:
- 264 I like my visits. I visit the homes and the hospitals of sick people...I like doing it. People say:
- 265 'Oh I couldn't be bothered' and I say, 'Well, I can because it helps me as much as it helps the
- 266 people I am going to see' (male, aged in eighties) (Ziegler and Schwanen, 2011)

267 4.3 Theme 3: affirming identities

- 268 In addition to facilitating the lives they wished for, everyday travel enabled older people to
- 269 express and enjoy valued aspects of their identity. Two particular aspects were highlighted:
- 270 being self-reliant and being socially connected.
- 271 Firstly, everyday travel provided an arena in which to be self-reliant. Being able to drive
- 272 demonstrated a continuing capacity for independence (Schwanen et al., 2012; Ziegler and
- 273 Schwanen, 2011).
- 274 My own car is really important. It's my independence and although I go with my husband to
- 275 most places and we then use his car, I really love having my own car... I am not stuck; so that
- 276 is really important to me. (female, aged in seventies) (Shergold et al., 2012)
- 277 (The car enables me to be) almost totally independent (male, aged in eighties) (Ziegler and
 278 Schwanen, 2011)
- 279 Driving also avoided depending on others, a dependency seen to signal and symbolise
- 280 getting old. Study participants spoke of not wanting to 'bother' their family, given they had
- their own lives to lead (King and Farmer, 2009; Schwanen et al., 2012). Older people, and

282 older men in particular, were invested in 'ageing well': in being independent, active and

283 socially connected (Ahern and Hine, 2015; Schwanen et al., 2012).

Driving cessation meant losing this capacity; it was a tangible sign of increasing dependency
and was experienced as a major loss, particularly by men (Ahern and Hine, 2012, 2015;

286 Schwanen et al., 2012; Ziegler and Schwanen, 2011).

1've just had a medical condition [diagnosed] and the medicine that I've taken has deprived me of my driving licence and it is the most shattering blow I've ever felt in my life ... There's no return and I've found it very difficult to come to terms with. One of the penalties of living and I wouldn't wish it on any of you to have that trauma.... (asking others for help is) really quite humiliating, you know. ... I've never been as old as this before. (male, aged in

292 seventies) (Ziegler and Schwanen, 2011)

293 Issues of identity also emerged in older people's accounts of the use, and change in use, of

294 mobility aids. Some older people found that mobility aids like walking sticks and rollators

295 could help to maintain their sense of independence. However, others described how it

296 undermined their self-identity. As one wheelchair user put it:

297 I find now that I'm starting to get a bit reclusive. I've never ever been in the village in my

298 wheel chair ... and it's a lovely little village but the reason I don't go down the village in the

299 wheel chair is [because] people are so kind and they say, 'What's the matter Joan?'. You

300 know: 'What's happened? ' And I just don't want to sort of give them all a sob story. ... I just

301 wouldn't like to go down in the village in a wheelchair... So, no, I don't go down the village.

302 (female, aged in seventies) (Ziegler and Schwanen, 2011)

Secondly, everyday travel was an arena for social contact and engagement. In villages with
safe pedestrian access to local services, older people described how they enjoyed getting
out and feeling part of their local community (Ahern and Hine, 2012, 2015; de Koning et al.,
2015; Guell et al., 2016; Shergold et al., 2012; Ward et al., 2013; Ziegler and Schwanen,
2011).

308 If I was home all day ..., you know, I'd go loopy, I really would. (female, aged in seventies)
309 (Guell et al., 2016)

310 That's the good thing about [this village], the people are very, very friendly... Even (on) the

311 street, you can't walk past someone in the street, they'll pass comments. (male, aged in

312 sixties) (Ziegler and Schwanen, 2011)

313 *it's a lovely social event to go over (to the village shop) (female, aged in seventies)* (de314 Koning et al., 2015)

315 Like walking, bus travel could also open up valued social worlds, a dimension highlighted by

316 users of local buses and community transport.

317 I enjoy being on the buses with other people, it's a social thing . . . there's always somebody I
318 know on the buses. (female, aged in seventies) (Shergold et al., 2012)

319 It's a very social bus...he only runs the one bus, so we all know each other on the bus so it's 320 quite a social occasion (female, aged in seventies) (de Koning et al., 2015)

321 (Interviewer) 'So how long have you been using this (community transport) bus then?' I

322 asked. 'A few years,' she replied, 'it's a lifeline, as no one speaks to me in my street, so since 323 the death of my brother, it's the only place to talk to people sometimes'. (female) (Ward et 324 al., 2013)

325

326 5. Strengths and limitations

327 Our review focused on older people living in rural areas, a section of the population whose

328 voices are rarely heard in research and policy (Hennessy et al., 2014). Drawing on

329 qualitative studies, we used standard methods for systematic reviews and thematic

330 synthesis to draw out common dimensions of their travel experiences. The emerging

331 themes were shared with policy advisors. They endorsed the salience of the themes and

332 contributed additional insights to our review.

Firstly, advisors highlighted the health and wellbeing impacts of everyday travel, noting in
particular the part it played in social isolation and physical inactivity. An inadequate
transport system was seen as a major contributor to loneliness and to the poor mental and
physical health of older people who were 'housebound'. Conversely, an adequate transport
system could facilitate walking and bus travel and, in so doing, promote social engagement
and physical activity. For those with specific health needs, a well-functioning user-oriented
DRT system was a pre-requisite if they were to take part in community-based activities.

Secondly, the advisors noted how, through the local transport system, central government impacted directly on the lives of older people in rural communities. They spoke of how reduced investment in bus services, community transport and pavement repair was increasing car dependence and making it more difficult for older people, particularly those without cars and with health difficulties, to maintain fulfilling lives. However, recognising community needs was not straightforward; as one advisor observed, when local government lacked the resources to meet local needs, 'people feel they speak but are not heard'. Investing in rural transport was seen as integral to 'rural proofing' and 'age proofing' policies, for example by reversing reductions in central government's funding of local authorities and by strengthening commitments to older people in national policy frameworks. 351 Some limitations of our review should be noted. The studies provided limited socio-352 demographic information on participants, including financial circumstances and household 353 composition. Our review points to an important gender dimension to older people's travel 354 experiences, with the car more central to men's lives and identity and women more positive 355 about other modes of travel. These differences warrant separate study. Although older 356 people with mobility limitations (de Koning et al. 2015; Schwanen et al. 2012; Ziegler & Schwanen 2011; King & Farmer 2009) and care home residents (Ward et al. 2013) were 357 included in the studies, frail older people are likely to be under-represented in our review. 358 Because of differences in the transport infrastructure of rural and urban areas, our review 359 excludes older people living in urban areas; a separate review of their travel experiences is 360 361 in progress.

362 Finally, our UK focus may restrict the generalisability of our findings. There are important differences between high-income countries, including in rural population densities and in 363 364 transport systems (e.g. the coverage and quality of the road network and the public 365 transport infrastructure) (Mageean and Nelson, 2003; Nelson et al., 2010; Pucher and Renne, 2005). For example, a Europe-wide analysis found that, compared to the UK, DRT 366 367 services were more developed and better integrated in countries with a more regulated 368 transport market (Mageean and Nelson, 2003). Despite these differences, studies elsewhere 369 point to the centrality of transport for healthy ageing in rural communities (AARP, 2012; 370 Davis and Bartlett, 2008). Long distances to activity sites combine with limited public 371 transport provision to restrict rural travel mode choice and increase car dependence (Davis 372 and Bartlett, 2008). In the USA for example, over a third of rural residents live in areas with no public transport services (Pucher and Renne, 2005). Reductions in rural bus services, and 373 374 the differential impact on older people (AARP, 2012), are also common findings, as is the 375 importance of protecting and promoting integrated public and community transport 376 provision (UNECE, 2017).

377

378 6. Conclusion and policy relevance: everyday travel and quality of life in older age379

380 The themes running through our review highlight the essential contribution that everyday travel - whether by car, public transport or on foot - makes to the lives of older people. As 381 well as facilitating access to goods and services, everyday travel enables older people to 382 enjoy their lives and express important aspects of their identity. As this suggests, everyday 383 travel is best understood in terms of its impact on older people's 'quality of life'. The three 384 385 themes align very closely with those identified by older people when asked about 'the building blocks' of quality of life in older age (Bowling, 2018). Major building blocks are 386 387 'living in a neighbourhood with good community facilities and services, including transport' 'engaging in a large number of social activities and feeling supported' and 'feeling 388

389 independent, in control over life' (Bowling, 2018:87).

390

391 Quality of life is a broader concept than health or wellbeing, and is explicitly framed around 392 the individual's perception of their life in relation to their hopes, pleasures and concerns 393 (WHOQOL Group, 1994). It does not use clinical measures of health but relies on people's 394 subjective evaluation of their lives. As our review makes clear, everyday travel is central to 395 the achievement of older people's hopes and pleasures – and is, for many, a major concern. 396 It thwarts – or facilitates – an individual's capacity to lead the life they wish to live and be 397 the person they wish to be. Thus, modes of travel that are perceived as accessible, convenient and self-affirming provide the platform on which meaningful lives and important 398 399 identities are sustained. Loss of these modes – and loss of the capacity to drive in particular - brings with it the loss of the lifestyles and identities that matter. 400

401 This quality of life perspective is central to health policies that seek not only to 'add extra 402 years to life' but also to add 'extra life to those years' (Local Government Association (LGA), 403 2018a:1). It can also be applied to transport provision for older people, for example by 404 including quality of life in policy impact assessments. Such assessments are urgently needed: the government's commitment to 'rural proof' and 'age proof' policies has 405 406 coincided with the roll-out of austerity policies that have hit rural transport particularly hard 407 (AgeUK, 2013; LGA, 2018b). As all three themes indicate, the weakening of the rural public 408 transport infrastructure impacts most on non-car owners. Seen in a cross-sectional 409 perspective, high levels of car ownership mean that the impacts are limited to a minority of older people living in rural communities. However, car ownership provides temporary 410 411 protection; the ageing process brings with it declining car use and increasing dependence on 412 other travel modes (Breeze and Lang, 2008). As this suggests, the public and pedestrian 413 transport infrastructure underpins quality of life in older age. Investment in facilities for 414 pedestrians, local bus services and community transport and DRT schemes is essential to 415 improving alternatives to car dependence. In all these areas, ensuring provision for those 416 requiring assistance with travel holds the key to promoting and protecting quality of life in later life. 417

418 7. References

- 419 AARP, 2012. Meeting Older Adults' Mobility Needs. Transportation Planning and
- 420 Coordination in Rural Communities. <u>https://www.aarp.org/content/dam/aarp/livable-</u>
- 421 communities/learn/transportation/meeting-older-adults-mobility-needs-transportation-
- 422 planning-and-coordination-in-rural-communities-2012-aarp.pdf
- 423 AgeUK, 2013. Missed opportunities: the impact on older people of cuts to rural services,
- 424 https://www.ageuk.org.uk/documents/en-gb/for-
- 425 professionals/policy/transport/bus_services_in_rural_areas_may2013.pdf?dtrk=true.
- 426 AgeUK, 2017. Equality, Discrimination and the Public Sector Equality Duty,
- 427 https://www.ageuk.org.uk/globalassets/age-

- 428 <u>uk/documents/factsheets/fs79_equality_discrimination_and_the_public_sector_equality_d</u>
 429 <u>uty_fcs.pdf</u>.
- 430 Ahern, A., Hine, J., 2012. Rural transport valuing the mobility of older people. Research in 431 Transportation Economics 34, 27-34.
- 432 Ahern, A., Hine, J., 2015. Accessibility of health services for aged people in rural Ireland.
- 433 International Journal of Sustainable Transportation 9, 389-395.
- 434 Annear, M., Keeling, S., Wilkinson, T.I.M., Cushman, G., Gidlow, B.O.B., Hopkins, H., 2012.
- 435 Environmental influences on healthy and active ageing: a systematic review. Ageing and436 Society 34, 590-622.
- 437 Booth, A., Noyes, J., Flemming, K., Gerhaudus, A., Wahlster, P., Van der Wilt, G.J.,
- 438 Mozygemba, K., Refolo, P., Sacchini, D., Tummers, M., Rehfuess, E., 2016. Guidance on
- 439 choosing qualitative evidence synthesis methods for use in health technology assessments
- 440 of complex interventions [Online].
- 441 Bowling, A., 2018. Measuring quality of later life, in: Walker, A. (Ed.), The New Dynamics of
- 442 Ageing. Policy Press, Bristol.
- Bradshaw, R., 2015. Rural proofing, LGiU Policy Briefing, <u>https://www.lgiu.org.uk/wp-</u>
 <u>content/uploads/2015/03/Rural-proofing.pdf</u>.
- 445 Breeze, E., Lang, I., 2008. Physical functioning in a community context, in: Banks, J., Breeze,
- 446 E., Lessof, C., Nazroo, J. (Eds.), Living in the 21st Century: older people in England. The 2006
- 447 English Longitudinal Study of Ageing (Wave 3). Institute for Fiscal Studies, London, pp. 57-448 117.
- Burholt, V., 2012. The dimensionality of 'place attachment' for older people in rural areas of
 South West England and Wales. Environment and Planning A: Economy and Space 44, 29012921.
- 452 Campaign for Better Transport, 2017. Buses in crisis. A report on bus funding across England
- 453 and Wales, https://bettertransport.org.uk/sites/default/files/research-
- 454 files/Buses_In_Crisis_Report_AW_PDF_09.12.13.pdf.
- 455 Carroll, C., Booth, A., Lloyd-Jones, M., 2012. Should we exclude inadequately reported
- 456 studies from qualitative systematic reviews? An evaluation of sensitivity analyses in two
- 457 case study reviews. Qualitative Health Research 22, 1425 1434.
- 458 Centre for Reviews and DIssemination (CRD), 2009. Systemtatic Reviews: CRD's guidance for
- 459 undertaking reviews in health care,
- 460 https://www.york.ac.uk/media/crd/Systematic_Reviews.pdf

- 461 Dadpour, S., Pakzad, J., Khankeh, H., 2016. Understanding the influence of environment on
- 462 adults' walking experiences: A meta-synthesis study. International journal of environmental
- 463 research and public health 13, 731.
- 464 Davis, S., Bartlett, H., 2008. Healthy ageing in rural Australia: Issues and challenges.
- 465 Australasian Journal on Ageing 27, 56-60.
- 466 de Koning, J.L., Stathi, A., Fox, K.R., 2015. Similarities and differences in the determinants of
- trips outdoors performed by UK urban- and rural-living older adults. J Aging Phys Activity 23,613-621.
- 469 Department for Environment Food & Rural Affairs (DEFRA), 2012. Rural statement 2012.
- 470 <u>https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_</u>
- 471 data/file/69597/pb13814-rural-statement.pdf.
- 472 Department for Environment Food & Rural Affairs (DEFRA), 2018. Official Statistics Rural
- 473 Population 2014/15, https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/rural-population-and-
- 474 migration/rural-population-201415.
- 475 Department for Transport (DfT), 2016. Transport Statistics Great Britain 2016, Table
- 476 TSGB0914 (NTS9902), https://www.gov.uk/government/statistical-data-sets/nts99-travel-
- 477 <u>by-region-and-area-type-of-residence#table-nts9902</u>.
- 478 Department of Agriculture and Rural Development (DARD), 2015. Thinking Rural: The
- 479 Essential Guide to Rural Proofing, https://www.daera-
- 480 <u>ni.gov.uk/sites/default/files/publications/dard/guide-to-rural-proofing.pdf</u>.
- 481 Eurostat, 2017. Passenger cars in the EU, http://ec.europa.eu/eurostat/statistics-
- 482 explained/index.php/Passenger_cars_in_the_EU.
- 483 Gale, C.R., Cooper, C., Aihie Sayer, A., 2014. Prevalence of frailty and disability: findings from
- 484 the English Longitudinal Study of Ageing. Age and ageing 44, 162-165.
- Guell, C., Shefer, G., Griffin, S., Ogilvie, D., 2016. 'Keeping your body and mind active': an
 ethnographic study of aspirations for healthy ageing. BMJ Open 6.
- Hawker, S., Payne, S., Kerr, C., Hardey, M., Powell, J., 2002. Appraising the evidence:
 reviewing disparate data systematically. Qualitative Health Research 12, 1284-1299.
- Hennessy, C.H., Means, R., 2018. Connectivity of older people in rural areas. The New
 Dynamics of Ageing 1, 147.
- 491 Hennessy, C.H., Means, R., Burholt, V., 2014. Countryside connections: Older people,
- 492 community and place in rural Britain. Policy Press, Bristol: Policy Press.

- 493 HM Government, 2010. Equality Act 2010.
- 494 https://www.legislation.gov.uk/ukpga/2010/15/pdfs/ukpga_20100015_en.pdf.
- 495 House of Commons Transport Select Committee, 2017. Community transport and the
- 496 Department for Transport's proposed consultation,
- 497 https://publications.parliament.uk/pa/cm201719/cmselect/cmtrans/480/480.pdf.
- 498 King, G., Farmer, J., 2009. What older people want: evidence from a study of remote
- 499 Scottish communities. Rural and Remote Health 9, 1166.
- 500 Langlois, E., Tunçalp, Ö., Norris, S., Askew, I., Ghaffar, A., 2018. Qualitative evidence to
- improve guidelines and health decision-making. Bulletin of the World Health Organization96, 79-79A.
- 503 Local Government Association (LGA), 2018a. Adding extra years to life and extra life to those
- 504 years, <u>https://www.local.gov.uk/adding-extra-years-life-and-extra-life-those-years-local-</u> 505 government-guide-healthy-ageing.
- 506 Local Government Association (LGA), 2018b. The decline in the use of buses in England, LGA
- 507 briefing for the House of Lords, <u>https://www.local.gov.uk/parliament/briefings-and-</u>
- 508 responses/decline-use-buses-england-house-lords-8-march-2018.
- 509 Mageean, J., Nelson, J.D., 2003. The evaluation of demand responsive transport services in
- 510 Europe. Journal of Transport Geography 11, 255-270.
- 511 Manthorpe, J., Malin, N., Stubbs, H., 2004. Older people's views on rural life: a study of
- 512 three villages. Journal of Clinical Nursing 13, 97-104.
- 513 Moran, M., Van Cauwenberg, J., Hercky-Linnewiel, R., Cerin, E., Deforche, B., Plaut, P., 2014.
- 514 Understanding the relationships between the physical environment and physical activity in
- 515 older adults: a systematic review of qualitative studies. International Journal of Behavioral
- 516 Nutrition and Physical Activity 11, 79.
- 517 Nelson, J.D., Wright, S., Masson, B., Ambrosino, G., Naniopoulos, A., 2010. Recent
- developments in flexible transport services. Research in Transportation Economics 29, 243-248.
- 520 Noyes, J., Booth, A., Flemming, K., Garside, R., Harden, A., Lewin, S., Pantoja, T., Hannes, K.,
- 521 Cargo, M., Thomas, J., 2017. Cochrane Qualitative and Implementation Methods Group
- 522 guidance paper 3: methods for assessing methodological limitations, data extraction and
- 523 synthesis, and confidence in synthesized qualitative findings. Journal of Clinical
- 524 Epidemiology 97, 49-58.
- 525 Pucher, J., Renne, J.L., 2005. Rural mobility and mode choice: Evidence from the 2001
- 526 National Household Travel Survey. Transportation 32, 165-186.

- 527 QSR, 2012. NVivo qualitative data analysis software, vol 11, Melbourne: QSR International528 Pty Ltd.
- 529 Schwanen, T., Banister, D., Bowling, A., 2012. Independence and mobility in later life. 530 Geoforum 43, 1313-1322.
- 531 Scottish Government, 2017. Summary: Age and Rural and Environment,
- 532 http://www.gov.scot/Topics/People/Equality/Equalities/DataGrid/Age/AgeRuralEnv.
- 533 Shergold, I., Parkhurst, G., 2012. Transport-related social exclusion amongst older people in
- 534 rural Southwest England and Wales. Journal of Rural Studies 28, 412-421.
- 535 Shergold, I., Parkhurst, G., Musselwhite, C., 2012. Rural car dependence: An emerging
- barrier to community activity for older people. Transportation Planning and Technology 35,69-85.
- 538 Thomas, J., Harden, A., 2008. Methods for the thematic synthesis of qualitative research in
- 539 systematic reviews. BMC Medical Research Methodology 8, 45.
- 540 UN Department of Economic and Social Affairs (UNDESA), 2009. World Population Ageing
- 541 2009. ESA/P/WP/212, http://www.un.org/en/development/desa/publications/world-
- 542 population-ageing-2009.html.
- 543 United Nations Economic Commission for Europe (UNECE), 2017. Older persons in rural and
- 544 remote areas, UNECE policy brief on ageing No.18. UNECE,
- 545 <u>https://www.unece.org/fileadmin/DAM/pau/age/Policy_briefs/ECE-WG1-25.pdf</u>.
- 546 Wales Rural Observatory, 2013. Older people and place in Wales: demography, policy and

547 community,

- 548 http://www.walesruralobservatory.org.uk/sites/default/files/Older%20People%20and%20Pl
- 549 ace%20in%20Wales%20Demography%2C%20policy%20and%20community%202013.pdf.
- 550 Ward, M.R.M., Somerville, P., Bosworth, G., 2013. 'Now without my car I don't know what
- 551 I'd do': The transportation needs of older people in rural Lincolnshire. Local Economy 28,552 553-566.
- 553 Whitty, C.J.M., 2015. What makes an academic paper useful for health policy? BMC 554 Medicine 13, 301.
- 555 WHOQOL Group, 1994. Development of the WHOQOL: Rationale and current status.
- 556 International Journal of Mental Health 23, 24-56.
- 557 Windle, G., 2004. Transport in rural Wales. Working with older people: Community care
- 558 policy & practice 8, 32-35.

- 559 Ziegler, F., Schwanen, T.I.M., 2011. 'I like to go out to be energised by different people': an
- 560 exploratory analysis of mobility and wellbeing in later life. Ageing and Society 31, 758-781.

561

Figure 1: PRISMA flow chart of search strategy and study selection



From: Moher D, Liberati A, Tetzlaff J, Altman DG, The PRISMA Group (2009). Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses: The PRISMA Statement. PLoS Med 6(7): e1000097. doi:10.1371/journal.pmed1000097

Table 1 Summary of included studies

Source Paper (n=12)	Country setting	Article title & <i>journal</i>	Participants & area (as reported in paper)	Socio- demographic & health profile (as reported in paper)	Method- ology/ methods	Health or well-being related focus (as reported in paper)	Indicative findings	QA
Ahern & Hine (2012)*	Armagh, Antrim, Fermanagh & Down, Northern Ireland	Rural transport – Valuing the mobility of older people. <i>Research in</i> <i>Transportation</i> <i>Economics</i>	37 participants (26 female), aged 60 or over, living in four remote and accessible rural communities	1 employed, 36 retired; 4 had a walking disability, 4 a hearing disability; 4 participants were drivers.	Focus groups.	Not reported	The car was the most important mode of transport for men and women in rural areas. This meant driving cessation had a negative effect on quality of life, especially for men. Women were more used to using alternative modes of transport such as community transport. Public transport was rarely used as it was inaccessible and inconvenient. This created difficulties both for accessing health services, which were often centralised, and for discretionary travel.	24
Ahern & Hine (2015)*	Armagh, Antrim, Fermanagh & Down, Northern	Accessibility of health services for aged people in rural Ireland. International Journal of	37 participants (26 female), aged 60 or over.	Not reported; 4 participants were drivers.	Focus groups.	Not reported	Participants had to give up driving for reasons such as ill health or its cost, causing a loss of freedom and independence. Drivers and non- drivers both found accessing health services difficult, particularly as a	26

	Ireland	Sustainable Transportation					result of the centralisation of these services. As community and public transport were generally unsuitable to take people to health services, many relied on lifts from family and friends. Elderly women, many of whom did not drive, face significant problems in visiting spouses in nursing homes or hospitals.	
de Koning, Stathi & Fox (2015)	Southwest England	Similarities and differences in the determinants of trips outdoors performed by UK urban- and rural-living older adults. Journal of Aging and Physical Activity	13 participants (7 female), age range 67-85 years, from a village with population <530.	All white British; average household income £15,000, range £7500 to >£30,000; a range of physical abilities and activity (daily physical activity measured using accelerometry); 10 were married, 3 single/divorced.	Qualitative study using the Ecological Model framework. Semi- structured individual interviews.	Not reported	For older people in rural areas, a community-based social network was important in facilitating use of outdoor environments, as was access to facilities and public transport. Older people had high levels of car dependence and car use was seen as essential to trips outdoors. Barriers to using the outdoors were mainly age-related, resulting from physical conditions or mobility limitations, rather than environmental causes.	30

Guell,	Norfolk,	'Keeping your	27	Occupation: 14	Ethnographic	Interviews	'Activeness' can form part of more	30
Shefer,	England	body and mind	participants	professional, 13	research	discussed	general aspirations of ageing	
Griffin &		active': an	(12 female),	manual; 14	design framed	'attitudes	proactively, rather than being	
Ogilvie		ethnographic	aged 65-80	were active, 13	within social	towards	experienced as discrete behaviours	
(2016)		study of	years, living	inactive	theory. Semi-	active and	in everyday life. Social support can	
		aspirations for	in urban	(physical activity	structured	sedentary	be garnered as a facilitator of	
		healthy ageing	(n=12) and	levels measured	interviews and	living	active living, gaining	
		BMJ Open	rural (n=15)	using	semi-	relating to	encouragement, companionship or	
		,	areas.	accelerometry	structured	health and	purpose. Social context can also be	
				over a week): 7	participant	well-being'.	a barrier that needs to be	
				had	observation.		negotiated, for example, when the	
				musculoskeletal			ill-health or physical limitations of	
				conditions. 7			others reduce the time available	
				other chronic			for activeness or the intensity of	
				conditions eg			activities that can be performed	
				cancer diabetes			together	
				or			logether.	
				ordiovaccular				
				diagona, 12				
				disease; 13				
				conabited, 14				
				lived alone.				
King &	Scottish	What older	23	Participants	Interviews,	Not reported	Participants considered that living	32
Farmer	Highlands	people want:	participants,	were recruited	informal	·	in a remote area meant they had a	
(2009)	e e	 evidence from a	age range	to have 'varied	conversations		, degree of personal responsibility	

Farmer	Highlands	people want:	participants,	were recruited	informal	in a remote area meant they had a
(2009)		evidence from a	age range	to have 'varied	conversations,	degree of personal responsibility
		study of remote	55-87, from	socio-economic	and focus	for accessing services. A lack of
		Scottish	two remote	background'; 9	groups.	public transport meant those who
		communities.	mainland	lived alone, 14		could no longer drive had mobility
		Rural and	communities			problems and often relied on

		Remote Health		with others.			community support.	
Manthorpe, Malin & Stubbs (2004)	Midlands, England	Older people's views on rural life: a study of three villages. Journal of Clinical Nursing	48 participants, from three rural villages selected for populations with different socio- economic and occupational circumstance s.	Not reported; 50 to 73% (depending on village) had access to a car.	Mixed-method study. Surveys with quantitative and qualitative questions.	Not reported	Older people in rural areas were aware of the challenges they faced in accessing services and maintaining mobility. These difficulties were seen to stem from driving cessation and the lack of public transport in rural areas. Support from community and family meant older people felt able to overcome these problems and accepted them in return for the benefits of rural life.	26
Schwanen, Bannister & Bowling (2012)	England & Scotland	Independence and mobility in later life. <i>Geoforum</i>	42 participants (24 female), > 70 years, from areas of high (n=20) and low (n=22) population density.	Sociodemograp hic information was not reported; 28 participants had 'little or no difficulty walking 400 yards', 14 were 'unable to do so alone'; 29 rated their quality of	Semi- structured individual interviews.	Not reported	Independence was seen a complex concept that is dependent on bodies, technologies, infrastructures, social networks and other elements for it to be achieved. Independent mobility was viewed as avoiding lifts provided by next of kin, friends or others for getting around, connecting this with the concept of dependency in later life which incorporates passivity, burden and	21

				life as very good or good, 13 as very, bad or alright; 17 cohabited, 18 were widowed, 7 single or divorced/separa ted.			undesirability.	
Shergold & Parkhurst (2012)**	England: North Cornwall, North Dorset & Gloucester- shire; Wales: Dyfed, Powys & Monmouth -shire	Transport- related social exclusion amongst older people in rural Southwest England and Wales. Journal of Rural Studies	38 participants, aged over 60, from six areas representing a gradient of rurality and affluence.	4 participants were 'often excluded in their communities'; 'majority had access to car'	Mixed-method study. Semi- structured interviews.	Interviews asked about the role of transport in supporting quality of life and community participation	Many older people in rural areas reported difficulties in accessing both essential services such as hospitals and amenities such as cinemas. Public transport was seen as inaccessible or inconvenient and although community transport was used, it was not a reliable means of accessing health services or other essentials. This meant there was greater potential for exclusion from non-discretionary services than from discretionary activities. However, social exclusion was likely to result from driving cessation as a car was seen as essential for rural life.	20

Shergold, Parkhurst & Musselwhite (2012)**	England: North Cornwall, North Dorset & Gloucester- shire; Wales: Dyfed, Powys & Monmouth -shire	Rural car dependence: An emerging barrier to community activity for older people. <i>Transport</i> <i>Planning and</i> <i>Technology</i>	34 participants, aged over 60, from six areas representing a gradient of rurality and affluence.	'a range of characteristics of interest from a transport and community involvement perspective'	Mixed-method study. Semi- structured interviews.	Interviews 'focused on mobility issues'	Older people in rural areas felt they could access the level of community activity that they wanted, although transport was perceived to be more of a barrier for those without car access. Some other modes of transport, such as public or community transport, were used but were felt to need support to properly meet older people's needs.	26
Ward, Somerville & Bosworth (2013)	Lincolnshir e, England	"Now without my car I don't know what I'd do": The transportation needs of older people in rural LincoInshire. Local Economy	44 participants (35 female), aged > 60, from six rural communities with 'different levels of social and economic deprivation'.	Not reported; 19 participants were drivers.	Focus groups.	Not reported	Older people used a variety of transport options depending on their needs at the time and their ability to use a free bus pass, although they lacked awareness of community transport schemes. They held both positive and negative views of public transport, preferring the car as a mode of transport. They had suggestions for improving rural transport, and felt that social isolation and its associated health problems could be alleviated through better provision of transport.	23

Windle (2004)	Wales	Transport in rural Wales. <i>Working with</i> Older People	423 participants (247 female), aged 70- 90.	Not reported; 65% had car access; 30 were single, 217 married, 157 widowed, 15 divorced or separated.	Mixed- method; interviews with quantitative and qualitative questions.	Not reported	Car ownership was considered important in rural areas. Use of public transport was influenced by its accessibility and the health status of the user. Those who did not have access to private transport were more likely to have poorer health and suffer from loneliness.	13
Ziegler & Schwanen (2011)	County Durham, England	"I like to go out and be energised by different people": an exploratory analysis of mobility and wellbeing in later life. Ageing and Society	119 participants (71% female), aged 60-95 years, from five rural communities	'self-rated presence or absence of a physical condition which limits how individuals get around'	Constructivist grounded theory approach. Focus groups.	Focus groups sought views on 'inter- sections between spatial mobility, ageing and well-being'.	Mobility of the mind and self is a driver of the relationship between mobility and well-being. Loss of physical mobility can negatively affect well-being but this is not always the case as other mobilities can compensate. Well-being is enhanced by physical mobility because it enables independence through autonomy and inter- dependence through social relations with other people.	26

* & ** papers arising from the same study