

This is a repository copy of *Adaptive modulation of antibiotic resistance through intragenomic coevolution*.

White Rose Research Online URL for this paper:  
<http://eprints.whiterose.ac.uk/119682/>

Version: Accepted Version

---

**Article:**

Bottery, Michael John [orcid.org/0000-0001-5790-1756](https://orcid.org/0000-0001-5790-1756), Wood, Andrew James [orcid.org/0000-0002-6119-852X](https://orcid.org/0000-0002-6119-852X) and Brockhurst, Michael Alan [orcid.org/0000-0003-0362-820X](https://orcid.org/0000-0003-0362-820X) (2017) Adaptive modulation of antibiotic resistance through intragenomic coevolution. *Nature Ecology and Evolution*. ISSN 2397-334X

<https://doi.org/10.1038/s41559-017-0242-3>

---

**Reuse**

Items deposited in White Rose Research Online are protected by copyright, with all rights reserved unless indicated otherwise. They may be downloaded and/or printed for private study, or other acts as permitted by national copyright laws. The publisher or other rights holders may allow further reproduction and re-use of the full text version. This is indicated by the licence information on the White Rose Research Online record for the item.

**Takedown**

If you consider content in White Rose Research Online to be in breach of UK law, please notify us by emailing [eprints@whiterose.ac.uk](mailto:eprints@whiterose.ac.uk) including the URL of the record and the reason for the withdrawal request.

1 **Adaptive modulation of antibiotic resistance through intragenomic**  
2 **coevolution**

3 Michael J. Bottery<sup>1</sup>, A. Jamie Wood<sup>1,2</sup> & Michael A. Brockhurst<sup>3\*</sup>

4

5 \* Corresponding author

6

7 <sup>1</sup>Department of Biology, University of York, Wentworth Way, York, YO10 5DD,

8 UK. <sup>2</sup>Department of Mathematics, University of York, Heslington, York, YO10

9 5DD, UK. <sup>3</sup>Department of Animal and Plant Sciences, The University of

10 Sheffield, Western Bank, Sheffield, S10 2NT, UK.

11

12 **Bacteria gain antibiotic resistance genes by horizontal acquisition of**  
13 **mobile genetic elements (MGE) from other lineages. Newly acquired**  
14 **MGEs are often poorly adapted causing intragenomic conflicts, resolved**  
15 **by compensatory adaptation of the chromosome, the MGE or reciprocal**  
16 **coadaptation. The footprints of such intragenomic coevolution are**  
17 **present in bacterial genomes, suggesting an important role promoting**  
18 **genomic integration of horizontally acquired genes, but direct**  
19 **experimental evidence of the process is limited. Here we show adaptive**  
20 **modulation of tetracycline resistance via intragenomic coevolution**  
21 **between *Escherichia coli* and the multi-drug resistant (MDR) plasmid**  
22 **RK2. Tetracycline treatments, including monotherapy or combination**  
23 **therapies with ampicillin, favoured *de novo* chromosomal resistance**  
24 **mutations coupled with mutations on RK2 impairing the plasmid-**  
25 **encoded tetracycline efflux-pump. These mutations together provided**  
26 **increased tetracycline resistance at reduced cost. Additionally, the**  
27 **chromosomal resistance mutations conferred cross-resistance to**  
28 **chloramphenicol. Reciprocal coadaptation was not observed under**  
29 **ampicillin-only or no antibiotic selection. Intragenomic coevolution can**  
30 **create genomes comprised of multiple replicons that together provide**  
31 **high-level, low-cost resistance, but the resulting co-dependence may**  
32 **limit the spread of coadapted MGEs to other lineages.**

33

34

35 Horizontal gene transfer (HGT) is a fundamental process in bacterial evolution  
36 that accelerates adaptation by sharing ecologically important accessory traits  
37 between lineages<sup>1</sup>. These accessory traits are themselves frequently located  
38 on semi-autonomous mobile genetic elements (MGE), such as conjugative  
39 plasmids, that encode genes for their own replication, partition and horizontal  
40 transfer<sup>2,3</sup>. Conjugative multidrug resistance (MDR) plasmids, encoding  
41 antibiotic resistance genes (ARG) against multiple classes of antibiotics, are  
42 of particular clinical concern since they allow instantaneous acquisition of  
43 MDR phenotypes and thus potentiate the rapid emergence of MDR bacterial  
44 pathogens<sup>4,5</sup>. Newly acquired conjugative plasmids are often costly since the  
45 plasmid is unlikely to be well adapted to the new genetic background, causing  
46 intragenomic conflict<sup>6</sup>. The cost of plasmid carriage is likely to arise due to the  
47 metabolic burden of maintaining, transcribing and translating plasmid genes<sup>7</sup>,  
48 as well as via disruption of cellular homeostasis caused by gene regulatory  
49 interference between chromosomal and plasmid regulators<sup>8,9</sup>, and cytotoxic  
50 effects of plasmid gene products<sup>6</sup>.

51

52 An important route to resolving this intragenomic conflict is compensatory  
53 evolution to ameliorate the cost of plasmid acquisition<sup>10</sup>. Experimental  
54 evolution suggests that compensatory evolution can arise via mutations  
55 located on either the chromosome or the plasmid, or via intragenomic  
56 coevolution involving both plasmid and chromosome mutations<sup>8,9,11,12</sup>.  
57 Comparative genomics suggests a key role for compensatory evolution in  
58 natural bacterial populations, potentially stabilising MDR plasmids within  
59 lineages and thus allowing the evolutionary emergence by HGT of MDR

60 pathogens<sup>13</sup>. A key outstanding question is how the mode of compensatory  
61 evolution following MDR plasmid acquisition varies with antibiotic treatment.  
62 Here we experimentally evolved *Escherichia coli* MG1655 carrying the MDR  
63 plasmid RK2 (encoding tetracycline and ampicillin resistance genes) under a  
64 range of antibiotic treatment regimes including no antibiotic, mono- and  
65 combination-therapies of tetracycline and ampicillin. Following 530  
66 generations of selection we quantified evolved changes in antibiotic  
67 resistance and fitness, and used genome sequencing to determine the  
68 genetic bases of the observed adaptation.

69

## 70 **Results**

71 Thirty independent isogenic populations of *E. coli* MG1655 carrying the MDR  
72 plasmid RK2<sup>14</sup>, which encodes resistances to tetracycline (TET) and ampicillin  
73 (AMP), were experimentally evolved for ~530 generations (80 days), under  
74 five antibiotic treatments (six independently evolving lines per treatment): no  
75 antibiotic (N), AMP (A), TET (T), AMP plus TET (AT), and 24 hour cycling  
76 between AMP and TET (A/T) (see methods). Plasmids remained at high  
77 frequency in all populations for the duration of the selection experiment.  
78 Plasmid-free segregants were only observed at very low frequency in two of  
79 the six populations from treatment N (Supplementary Fig. 1), whereas  
80 transposition of resistance genes from RK2 onto the host's chromosome was  
81 never observed.

82

83 To test for changes in antibiotic resistance profiles following evolution we first  
84 determined the minimum inhibitory concentration (MIC) of evolved lineages to

85 TET and AMP. The susceptibility of the evolved strains to antibiotics differed  
86 between treatments (Fig. 1a). We observed a four-fold increase in TET MIC in  
87 evolved strains from the T and AT treatments and a small increase in lineages  
88 that had evolved under the cycling A/T treatment compared with the ancestral  
89 MG1655 with ancestral RK2 (Anc-RK2), whereas evolved strains from  
90 treatments N and A showed no change in tetracycline MIC (ANOVA,  $F_{5,30} =$   
91  $6.103$ ,  $p < 0.001$ ; Post-hoc Tukey Tests, Anc-RK2:T  $p < 0.001$ , Anc-RK2:AT  $p$   
92  $< 0.01$ , Anc-RK2:N  $p = 0.525$ , Anc-RK2:A  $p = 0.783$ ). By contrast, we  
93 observed no change in resistance to AMP in any treatment (ANOVA,  $F_{5,30} =$   
94  $1.212$ ,  $p = 0.327$ ), possibly due to a lower relative selection pressure imposed  
95 by the concentration of AMP used in the experiment compared to the  
96 concentration of TET<sup>15</sup>. Interestingly, TET selection led to the evolution of  
97 bacteria that were cross-resistant to chloramphenicol (CML), although the  
98 extent of the evolved cross-resistance varied between treatments (ANOVA,  
99  $F_{5,30} = 24.25$ ,  $p < 0.001$ ); with CML MIC increasing 8-, 4-, and 2-fold in T, AT,  
100 A/T treatments, respectively. Consistent with CML cross-resistance being a  
101 correlated response to TET selection, evolved strains from both the N and A  
102 treatments remained equally sensitive to CML as the ancestral MG1655(RK2)  
103 (Post-hoc Tukey Tests, Anc-RK2:N  $p = 0.975$ , Anc-RK2:A  $p = 0.993$ ). Thus  
104 whereas T and AT treatments, and to a lesser extent the cycling A/T  
105 treatment, led to the evolution increased TET resistance and cross-resistance  
106 to CML, evolved lineages from the N and A treatments showed no change in  
107 their resistance profile.  
108

109 To examine the genetic bases of evolved changes in resistance we next  
110 obtained whole genome sequences for one randomly selected clone per  
111 population. Excluding hypermutators, evolved clones had acquired between 2  
112 and 11 mutations, located exclusively on the chromosome in non-TET  
113 treatments (C, N, A), and on both the chromosome and plasmid in the  
114 treatments including TET (T, AT, A/T) (Supplementary Fig. 2, Supplementary  
115 Table 1). Of all the observed mutations 13.2% were synonymous and 19%  
116 were intergenic, the remaining non-synonymous mutations (67.8%) comprised  
117 missense mutations (42.8%), frameshifts (10.6%), insertion sequences (5.6%)  
118 and gene deletions (5.4%), and these were analysed further. While the  
119 variance in the number of non-synonymous mutations did not differ between  
120 treatments (Analysis of multivariate homogeneity of group variances excluding  
121 hypermutators  $F_{5,26} = 1.8617$ ,  $p = 0.1358$ ), the loci affected by non-  
122 synonymous mutations did vary between treatments (Permutational ANOVA,  
123 permutation test:  $F_{5,26} = 2.5231$ ,  $p < 0.01$ , Bonferroni corrected). Clones that  
124 had evolved under TET selection (T, AT, A/T) had significantly different sets  
125 of non-synonymous mutations compared to evolved clones from the other  
126 treatments (C, N, A) (permutation test:  $F_{1,30} = 6.9463$ ,  $p < 0.01$ , Bonferroni  
127 corrected), with a larger genetic distance between TET and non-TET  
128 treatments than within these treatment groups (Fig. 2a). Thus TET-selected  
129 lineages followed an evolutionary trajectory distinct from non-TET-selected  
130 lineages, leading to mutations on both the chromosome and the plasmid,  
131 which suggest that TET selection favoured bacteria-plasmid coadaptation.  
132

133 Strikingly parallel mutations were observed between independent replicate  
134 populations both within and between TET-containing treatments (Fig. 2b).  
135 Highly parallel mutations are likely to represent adaptive evolution at these  
136 loci, and because mutations at these loci were not observed in the  
137 populations from the N and A treatments, these mutations were likely to be  
138 TET-specific adaptations. Mutations in the chromosomal genes *ompF* (16 out  
139 of 18 clones), and *yehH* (16 out of 18 clones) showed strong locus-level  
140 parallelism within all three TET-containing treatments. Mutations in *ompF*,  
141 encoding a major non-specific diffusion porin<sup>16</sup>, were all predicted loss-of-  
142 function mutations, including the insertion of IS elements, frameshifts or  
143 premature stop codons. The loss of OmpF in *E. coli* reduces membrane  
144 permeability, including to antibiotics, and consequently is known to increase  
145 resistance to a wide spectrum of antibiotics<sup>17</sup> including TET and CML<sup>18,19</sup>.  
146 Deletion of *ompF* (*E. coli* K-12  $\Delta ompF$  JW0912<sup>20</sup>) significantly increased  
147 resistance to TET without the RK2 ( $t_{9.09} = 4.2836$ ,  $p < 0.01$ ), and further  
148 increased TET resistance when carrying RK2 (Two-way ANOVA Interaction  
149  $F_{1,20} = 14.724$ ,  $p < 0.01$ ; Supplementary Fig. 4a). Parallel loss of function  
150 mutations (IS elements and frameshifts) in *yehH* were observed across all the  
151 TET treatments. YehH is a hypothetical stress-induced inner membrane  
152 protein<sup>21,22</sup>, but deletion of *yehH* (*E. coli* K-12  $\Delta yehH$  JW1196<sup>20</sup>) did not  
153 significantly increase the resistance to TET with or without the plasmid  
154 (Supplementary Fig. 4b), suggesting that this general stress response may  
155 not be required under TET selection and is consequently selected against.  
156



157 Mutations in several loci observed in the T and AT treatments were not  
158 present in the cycling A/T treatment. These included mutations in both *acrR*  
159 (10 out of 12 clones) and *adhE* (9 out of 12 clones). Mutations in *adhE* were  
160 extensively parallel at the nucleotide level, with 8 clones from independent  
161 populations all having the same missense SNP in the ethanol dehydrogenase  
162 domain<sup>23</sup>. The phenotypic significance of these mutations is unclear due to  
163 the multiple roles assigned to this protein, including multiple metabolic  
164 pathways<sup>24</sup>, but intriguingly the AdhE protein is known to exhibit binding  
165 activity to the 30S ribosome<sup>25</sup>, the primary TET target. The *acrR* gene  
166 encodes a repressor of AcrAB multidrug efflux pump<sup>26</sup>, the majority of  
167 mutations in *acrR* are predicted loss of function mutations, with IS elements  
168 and frameshifts observed in evolved strains. The deletion of *acrR* results in  
169 the overexpression of *acrAB* leading to MDR phenotypes<sup>27,28</sup>. Deletion of *acrR*  
170 (*E. coli* K-12  $\Delta$ *acrR* JW0453<sup>20</sup>) alone did not significantly increase resistance  
171 to TET ( $t_{9.32} = -0.591$ ,  $p = 0.339$ ), but when combined with the RK2 plasmid  
172 did allow significantly increased growth in TET ( $t_{6.4} = 3.665$ ,  $p < 0.01$ ,  
173 Supplementary Fig. 4c). These findings are consistent with the higher TET  
174 resistance of evolved clones from the T and AT treatments versus the A/T  
175 treatment (Fig. 1a) and reflect overall weaker TET selection under the A/T  
176 cycling compared to the T and AT treatments where TET selection was  
177 constant. Interestingly, stronger TET selection appeared to constrain evolution  
178 at chromosomal loci not involved in resistance. For example, we observed  
179 highly parallel loss of function mutation in the flagellum operon in the A, N and  
180 A/T treatments, but only rarely observed mutations at these loci in T and AT  
181 treatments. Loss of the flagellar motility is a commonly observed adaptation of

182 *E. coli* to growth in liquid media<sup>29</sup> and this may have been impeded by clonal  
183 interference or negative epistasis with chromosomal resistance mutations in  
184 populations under strong TET selection. Consistent with this, whereas  
185 evolved clones from the N and A treatments increased in fitness relative to the  
186 plasmid-free ancestor in antibiotic-free media, such fitness gains were not  
187 observed in evolved clones from the TET-containing treatments  
188 (Supplementary Fig. 5).

189

190 To confirm that TET selection had led to the evolution of chromosomal  
191 resistance we next cured evolved strains of their plasmids and quantified  
192 resistance<sup>30</sup>. Evolved strains carrying putative chromosomal resistance  
193 mutations displayed increased TET (ANOVA,  $F_{5,30} = 42.63$ ,  $p < 0.001$ ), AMP  
194 (ANOVA,  $F_{5,30} = 12.55$ ,  $p < 0.001$ ) and CML (ANOVA,  $F_{5,30} = 35.88$ ,  $p <$   
195  $0.001$ ) resistance (Fig. 1b). Across all tested antibiotics, evolved clones  
196 carrying both *ompF* and *acrR* mutations had significantly increased resistance  
197 compared to the ancestral MG1655 (Post-hoc Tukey Tests, all  $p < 0.05$ ),  
198 whereas cured evolved strains without either of these mutations (i.e. from the  
199 N and A treatments) did not (Post-hoc Tukey Tests, all  $p > 0.05$ ). Interestingly,  
200 cured evolved clones from the cycling A/T treatment that carried only  
201 mutations in *ompF* but not in *acrR* showed marginally increased resistance to  
202 both TET and CML, but no detectable increase in AMP resistance, relative to  
203 MG1655. Thus TET selection favoured the *de novo* evolution of chromosomal  
204 resistance despite pre-existing plasmid-encoded TET resistance, and these  
205 chromosomal resistance mutations are responsible for the observed cross-  
206 resistance to CML.

207

208 We observed parallel mutations on the plasmid exclusively in evolved clones  
209 from the TET-containing treatments (T, AT, and A/T). These mutations  
210 occurred in *tetA/tetR* (18 out of 18 clones; *tetA*: 13, *tetR*: 2, both: 3, Fig. 2b)  
211 which encode the tetracycline-specific efflux pump. The expression *tetA* is  
212 tightly regulated by the repressor *tetR* in the absence of tetracycline<sup>31,32</sup>.  
213 Mutations in *tetA* were dispersed throughout the gene, affecting the protein's  
214 transmembrane, periplasmic and cytoplasmic domains<sup>33</sup>. Three of the five  
215 mutations observed in *tetR* are in direct contact with or in close proximity to  
216 the tetracycline binding pocket<sup>34</sup>, while the other two mutations are located in  
217 the central scaffolding of the protein, suggesting that they are likely to  
218 interfere with activity of the *tetR* repressor. Evolved plasmids carrying  
219 mutations in *tetA* or *tetR* displayed reduced resistance to TET in the ancestral  
220 MG1655 background compared to ancestral RK2 (Fig. 1d, ANOVA,  $F_{5,30} =$   
221 4.586,  $p < 0.01$ ). Consistent with reduced efficacy of plasmid-encoded  
222 resistance in evolved lineages with *tetA/tetR* mutations, when we replaced the  
223 evolved plasmid with ancestral RK2, this led to increased TET resistance  
224 (ANOVA,  $F_{5,30} = 71.86$ ,  $p < 0.001$ , Anc-RK2:T,AT,A/T all  $p < 0.05$ ).

225

226 Our data suggest that evolved strains from TET-containing treatments  
227 adapted their resistance to TET by acquisition of weak chromosomal  
228 resistance mutations in combination with mutations that reduced the efficacy  
229 of the plasmid-encoded TET efflux pump. To understand the evolutionary  
230 benefits of this counterintuitive dual resistance strategy we first compared the  
231 effect of chromosomal background (evolved or ancestral) and plasmid

232 genotype (evolved or ancestral) on growth in the presence of 10 µg/ml TET  
233 (i.e., the concentration used in our selection experiment). The evolved  
234 chromosomal background carrying resistance mutations displayed a  
235 significantly shortened lag phase compared to the ancestral chromosomal  
236 background, irrespective of the plasmid genotype (Supplementary Fig. 6;  
237 ANOVA,  $F_{3,56} = 76.92$ ,  $p < 0.001$ ; Post-hoc Tukey Tests, Evolved  
238 Host:Ancestral Host all  $p < 0.001$ ). This suggests that chromosomal  
239 resistances reducing membrane permeability to antibiotics allowed evolved  
240 strains to start growing faster in the presence of TET.

241

242 Whereas evolved bacteria grew equally well with evolved or ancestral  
243 plasmids, ancestral bacteria displayed impaired growth with evolved  
244 compared to ancestral plasmids (Supplementary Fig. 6; Max OD,  $W = 93$ ,  $p <$   
245  $0.01$ ). This is consistent with the mutations in *tetA/tetR* reducing resistance  
246 but importantly confirms that this reduction is not evident when in combination  
247 with the chromosomal resistance mutations, which appear to compensate for  
248 the reduced efficacy of the plasmid-encoded efflux pump.

249

250 We next competed evolved bacteria with either the evolved or ancestral  
251 plasmid against the ancestral MG1665(RK2) to compare the costs of carrying  
252 each plasmid genotype. The ancestral plasmid displayed a significantly higher  
253 cost than the evolved plasmid in the evolved chromosomal background  
254 (Supplementary Fig. 7,  $t_{25,71} = -2.287$ ,  $p < 0.05$ ). This suggests that the  
255 mutations to *tetR/tetA* ameliorate the cost of plasmid carriage but at the price  
256 of reduced efficacy of TET efflux. This is consistent with previous studies

257 showing a high cost of expressing the specific tetracycline efflux pump<sup>35</sup>.  
258 Taken together with the growth data, this suggests that although mutations to  
259 *tetA/tetR* reduce growth under tetracycline in the ancestral chromosomal  
260 background, they have minimal effect on resistance in the evolved  
261 chromosomal background due to the reduced membrane permeability and  
262 additional efflux systems expressed in the evolved chromosomal background  
263 carrying mutations in *ompF* and *acrR*, leading to high resistance and a  
264 lowered cost of plasmid carriage. This suggests that the chromosomal  
265 resistance mutations must have been gained prior to the mutations in the  
266 plasmid-encoded tetracycline efflux pump. To test this, for one population  
267 (AT2) we tracked the frequency over time of an observed IS-insertion in *ompF*  
268 by PCR and then determined by sequencing when these genotypes acquired  
269 mutations in the *tetA/tetR* genes. Consistent with the hypothesised order of  
270 mutations, the IS-insertion in *ompF* was first detected at transfer 8 and had  
271 swept to fixation by transfer 32, whereas mutations in *tetA/tetR* were not  
272 observed in this *ompF::IS* background until transfer 32 (supplementary figure  
273 8).

274

## 275 **Discussion**

276 Our current model of bacterial evolution suggests that horizontal acquisition of  
277 ARGs accelerates resistance evolution by providing bacteria with ready-made  
278 resistance mechanisms, bypassing the requirement for rare *de-novo*  
279 mutations<sup>1</sup>. However, recent population genomic data suggesting that  
280 lineages independently acquire and then subsequently coevolve with MDR  
281 plasmids<sup>13,36,37</sup> imply a more dynamic evolutionary process. Consistent with

282 this, here we show here that gaining an ARG can be just the starting point in  
283 the evolution of resistance and, due to the costs of expressing horizontally  
284 acquired ARGs, does not preclude subsequent *de novo* evolution of  
285 chromosomal resistance. Evolved strains from TET-containing treatments  
286 gained chromosomal resistance mutations reducing membrane permeability  
287 and enhancing efflux of TET and providing cross-resistance to other  
288 antibiotics, shortening lag phase in the presence of TET. These mutations  
289 also reduced the need for a fully operational plasmid-encoded tetracycline  
290 efflux pump, expression of which is highly costly<sup>35</sup>, allowing plasmid mutations  
291 in the TET efflux pump and its regulator which reduced the cost of plasmid-  
292 encoded resistance. A consequence of this intragenomic coevolution is that  
293 the increased TET resistance of evolved strains from T, AT and A/T  
294 treatments required the action of both the chromosomal- and plasmid-  
295 encoded resistances, which together acted multiplicatively. Thus intragenomic  
296 coevolution can lead to the evolution of bacterial genomes comprised of co-  
297 dependent replicons, limiting the potential for onward transmission of the  
298 plasmid due to the weaker resistance it now encodes in other lineages.

299

## 300 **References**

- 301 1. Jain, R., Rivera, M. C., Moore, J. E. & Lake, J. A. Horizontal Gene Transfer  
302 Accelerates Genome Innovation and Evolution. *Mol. Biol. Evol.* **20**, 1598–  
303 1602 (2003).
- 304 2. Frost, L. S., Leplae, R., Summers, A. O. & Toussaint, A. Mobile genetic  
305 elements: the agents of open source evolution. *Nat. Rev. Microbiol.* **3**, 722–  
306 732 (2005).

- 307 3. Norman, A., Hansen, L. H. & Sørensen, S. J. Conjugative plasmids: vessels  
308 of the communal gene pool. *Philos. Trans. R. Soc. B Biol. Sci.* **364**, 2275–  
309 2289 (2009).
- 310 4. Svara, F. & Rankin, D. J. The evolution of plasmid-carried antibiotic  
311 resistance. *BMC Evol. Biol.* **11**, 130 (2011).
- 312 5. Carattoli, A. Plasmids and the spread of resistance. *Int. J. Med. Microbiol.*  
313 **303**, 298–304 (2013).
- 314 6. Baltrus, D. A. Exploring the costs of horizontal gene transfer. *Trends Ecol.*  
315 *Evol.* **28**, 489–495 (2013).
- 316 7. Diaz Ricci, J. C. & Hernández, M. E. Plasmid Effects on Escherichia coli  
317 Metabolism. *Crit. Rev. Biotechnol.* **20**, 79–108 (2000).
- 318 8. Harrison, E., Guymier, D., Spiers, A. J., Paterson, S. & Brockhurst, M. A.  
319 Parallel Compensatory Evolution Stabilizes Plasmids across the  
320 Parasitism-Mutualism Continuum. *Curr. Biol.* **25**, 2034–2039 (2015).
- 321 9. San Millan, A., Toll-Riera, M., Qi, Q. & MacLean, R. C. Interactions  
322 between horizontally acquired genes create a fitness cost in *Pseudomonas*  
323 *aeruginosa*. *Nat. Commun.* **6**, (2015).
- 324 10. Harrison, E. & Brockhurst, M. A. Plasmid-mediated horizontal gene  
325 transfer is a coevolutionary process. *Trends Microbiol.* **20**, 262–267 (2012).
- 326 11. Porse, A., Schønning, K., Munck, C. & Sommer, M. O. A. Survival and  
327 Evolution of a Large Multidrug Resistance Plasmid in New Clinical Bacterial  
328 Hosts. *Mol. Biol. Evol.* msw163 (2016). doi:10.1093/molbev/msw163
- 329 12. Loftie-Eaton, W. *et al.* Evolutionary Paths that Expand Plasmid Host-  
330 Range: Implications for Spread of Antibiotic Resistance. *Mol. Biol. Evol.*  
331 msv339 (2015). doi:10.1093/molbev/msv339

- 332 13. McNally, A. *et al.* Combined Analysis of Variation in Core, Accessory  
333 and Regulatory Genome Regions Provides a Super-Resolution View into  
334 the Evolution of Bacterial Populations. *PLOS Genet.* **12**, e1006280 (2016).
- 335 14. Pansegrau, W. *et al.* Complete Nucleotide Sequence of Birmingham  
336 IncP $\alpha$  Plasmids: Compilation and Comparative Analysis. *J. Mol. Biol.* **239**,  
337 623–663 (1994).
- 338 15. Bottery, M. J., Wood, A. J. & Brockhurst, M. A. Selective conditions for  
339 a multidrug resistance plasmid depend on the sociality of antibiotic  
340 resistance. *Antimicrob. Agents Chemother.* AAC.02441-15 (2016).  
341 doi:10.1128/AAC.02441-15
- 342 16. Cowan, S. W. *et al.* Crystal structures explain functional properties of  
343 two *E. coli* porins. *Nature* **358**, 727–733 (1992).
- 344 17. Blair, J. M. A., Webber, M. A., Baylay, A. J., Ogbolu, D. O. & Piddock,  
345 L. J. V. Molecular mechanisms of antibiotic resistance. *Nat. Rev. Microbiol.*  
346 **13**, 42–51 (2015).
- 347 18. Cohen, S. P., McMurry, L. M., Hooper, D. C., Wolfson, J. S. & Levy, S.  
348 B. Cross-resistance to fluoroquinolones in multiple-antibiotic-resistant (Mar)  
349 *Escherichia coli* selected by tetracycline or chloramphenicol: decreased  
350 drug accumulation associated with membrane changes in addition to OmpF  
351 reduction. *Antimicrob. Agents Chemother.* **33**, 1318–1325 (1989).
- 352 19. Thanassi, D. G., Suh, G. S. & Nikaido, H. Role of outer membrane  
353 barrier in efflux-mediated tetracycline resistance of *Escherichia coli*. *J.*  
354 *Bacteriol.* **177**, 998–1007 (1995).



- 355 20. Baba, T. *et al.* Construction of Escherichia coli K-12 in-frame, single-  
356 gene knockout mutants: the Keio collection. *Mol. Syst. Biol.* **2**, 2006.0008  
357 (2006).
- 358 21. Lee, J., Hiibel, S. r., Reardon, K. f. & Wood, T. k. Identification of  
359 stress-related proteins in Escherichia coli using the pollutant cis-  
360 dichloroethylene. *J. Appl. Microbiol.* **108**, 2088–2102 (2010).
- 361 22. Mendoza-Vargas, A. *et al.* Genome-Wide Identification of Transcription  
362 Start Sites, Promoters and Transcription Factor Binding Sites in E. coli.  
363 *PLOS ONE* **4**, e7526 (2009).
- 364 23. Membrillo-Hernández, J. *et al.* Evolution of the adhE Gene Product  
365 of Escherichia coli from a Functional Reductase to a Dehydrogenase  
366 GENETIC AND BIOCHEMICAL STUDIES OF THE MUTANT PROTEINS.  
367 *J. Biol. Chem.* **275**, 33869–33875 (2000).
- 368 24. Kessler, D., Leibrecht, I. & Knappe, J. Pyruvate-formate-lyase-  
369 deactivase and acetyl-CoA reductase activities of Escherichia coli reside on  
370 a polymeric protein particle encoded by adhE. *FEBS Lett.* **281**, 59–63  
371 (1991).
- 372 25. Shasmal, M., Dey, S., Shaikh, T. R., Bhakta, S. & Sengupta, J. E. coli  
373 metabolic protein aldehyde-alcohol dehydrogenase-E binds to the  
374 ribosome: a unique moonlighting action revealed. *Sci. Rep.* **6**, 19936  
375 (2016).
- 376 26. Ma, D., Alberti, M., Lynch, C., Nikaido, H. & Hearst, J. E. The local  
377 repressor AcrR plays a modulating role in the regulation of acrAB genes of  
378 Escherichia coli by global stress signals. *Mol. Microbiol.* **19**, 101–112  
379 (1996).

- 380 27. Okusu, H., Ma, D. & Nikaido, H. AcrAB efflux pump plays a major role  
381 in the antibiotic resistance phenotype of Escherichia coli multiple-antibiotic-  
382 resistance (Mar) mutants. *J. Bacteriol.* **178**, 306–308 (1996).
- 383 28. Wang, H., Dzink-Fox, J. L., Chen, M. & Levy, S. B. Genetic  
384 Characterization of Highly Fluoroquinolone-Resistant Clinical Escherichia  
385 coli Strains from China: Role of acrR Mutations. *Antimicrob. Agents*  
386 *Chemother.* **45**, 1515–1521 (2001).
- 387 29. Cooper, T. F., Rozen, D. E. & Lenski, R. E. Parallel changes in gene  
388 expression after 20,000 generations of evolution in Escherichia coli. *Proc.*  
389 *Natl. Acad. Sci.* **100**, 1072–1077 (2003).
- 390 30. Hale, L., Lazos, O., Haines, A. & Thomas, C. An efficient stress-free  
391 strategy to displace stable bacterial plasmids. *BioTechniques* **48**, 223–228  
392 (2010).
- 393 31. Møller, T. S. B. *et al.* Relation between tetR and tetA expression in  
394 tetracycline resistant Escherichia coli. *BMC Microbiol.* **16**, 39 (2016).
- 395 32. Ramos, J. L. *et al.* The TetR Family of Transcriptional Repressors.  
396 *Microbiol. Mol. Biol. Rev.* **69**, 326–356 (2005).
- 397 33. Allard, J. D. & Bertrand, K. P. Membrane topology of the pBR322  
398 tetracycline resistance protein. TetA-PhoA gene fusions and implications  
399 for the mechanism of TetA membrane insertion. *J. Biol. Chem.* **267**, 17809–  
400 17819 (1992).
- 401 34. Orth, P., Schnappinger, D., Hillen, W., Saenger, W. & Hinrichs, W.  
402 Structural basis of gene regulation by the tetracycline inducible Tet  
403 repressor–operator system. *Nat. Struct. Mol. Biol.* **7**, 215–219 (2000).

- 404 35. Nguyen, T. N., Phan, Q. G., Duong, L. P., Bertrand, K. P. & Lenski, R.  
405 E. Effects of carriage and expression of the Tn10 tetracycline-resistance  
406 operon on the fitness of Escherichia coli K12. *Mol. Biol. Evol.* **6**, 213–225  
407 (1989).
- 408 36. Stoesser, N. *et al.* Evolutionary History of the Global Emergence of the  
409 Escherichia coli Epidemic Clone ST131. *mBio* **7**, e02162-15 (2016).
- 410 37. Johnson, T. J. *et al.* Separate F-Type Plasmids Have Shaped the  
411 Evolution of the H30 Subclone of Escherichia coli Sequence Type 131.  
412 *mSphere* **1**, e00121-16 (2016).
- 413 38. Crozat, E., Philippe, N., Lenski, R. E., Geiselmann, J. & Schneider, D.  
414 Long-Term Experimental Evolution in Escherichia coli. XII. DNA Topology  
415 as a Key Target of Selection. *Genetics* **169**, 523–532 (2005).
- 416 39. Li, H. & Durbin, R. Fast and accurate short read alignment with  
417 Burrows-Wheeler transform. *Bioinforma. Oxf. Engl.* **25**, 1754–1760 (2009).
- 418 40. McKenna, A. *et al.* The Genome Analysis Toolkit: A MapReduce  
419 framework for analyzing next-generation DNA sequencing data. *Genome*  
420 *Res.* **20**, 1297–1303 (2010).
- 421 41. Cingolani, P. *et al.* A program for annotating and predicting the effects  
422 of single nucleotide polymorphisms, SnpEff. *Fly (Austin)* **6**, 80–92 (2012).
- 423 42. Robinson, J. T. *et al.* Integrative genomics viewer. *Nat. Biotechnol.* **29**,  
424 24–26 (2011).
- 425 43. Chen, K. *et al.* BreakDancer: an algorithm for high-resolution mapping  
426 of genomic structural variation. *Nat. Methods* **6**, 677–681 (2009).
- 427 44. Anderson, M. J. Distance-Based Tests for Homogeneity of Multivariate  
428 Dispersions. *Biometrics* **62**, 245–253 (2006).

429 45. Anderson, M. J. A new method for non-parametric multivariate analysis  
430 of variance. *Austral Ecol.* **26**, 32–46 (2001).

431 46. Zapala, M. A. & Schork, N. J. Multivariate regression analysis of  
432 distance matrices for testing associations between gene expression  
433 patterns and related variables. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci.* **103**, 19430–19435  
434 (2006).

435

436

437

## 438 **Methods**

### 439 **Strains, culture conditions and evolution experiment**

440 *E. coli* MG1655 chromosomally labelled with GFP at the *attB* lambda  
441 attachment site was used in the evolution experiments. Isogenic *E. coli*  
442 MG1655-mCherry was used as a reference strain in competition and  
443 conjugation rate experiments. Both *E. coli* strains were provided by the Van  
444 Der Woude lab (University of York). The RK2 plasmid was introduced to the  
445 strains through conjugation from *E. coli* MV10 provided by the Thomas lab  
446 (University of Birmingham). All cultures were grown in Oxiod® Nutrient Broth  
447 (NB) at 37°C 5 ml in 50 ml microcosms shaken at 180 rpm. Independent  
448 selection lines were founded by 30 independent single colonies of *E. coli*  
449 MG1655-GFP harbouring RK2. These were grown overnight in non-selective  
450 conditions and split into the 5 antibiotic treatments, no antibiotic selection, 100  
451 µg/ml ampicillin, 10 µg/ml tetracycline, 100 µg/ml ampicillin plus 10 µg/ml  
452 tetracycline, and 24 hour cycling between 100 µg/ml ampicillin and 10 µg/ml  
453 tetracycline, with 6 replicate populations per treatment. In parallel, 6

454 independent *E. coli* MG1655-GFP colonies were picked for control treatments  
455 and grown under no selection. Selection lines were established by transferring  
456 50  $\mu$ l of saturated overnight culture into 5ml of selective media. These  
457 populations were maintained through transfer of 1% of the population into  
458 fresh media and antibiotics every 24 hours for 80 transfers, resulting in ~6.64  
459 generations per day, totalling ~530 bacterial generations. For the cycling  
460 treatment 3 populations were initiated with 100 $\mu$ g/ml ampicillin and 3  
461 populations were initiated with 10 $\mu$ g/ml tetracycline. Culture density (OD<sub>600</sub>)  
462 was recorded every 24 hours. Plasmid prevalence was measure at the start  
463 and end of the selection experiment by screening 20 randomly picked  
464 colonies from each population using multiplex primers specific to RK2  
465 replication origin (Fw: ctcatctgtcaacgccgc, Rv: aaccggctatgtcgtgct),  $\beta$ -  
466 lactamase (Fw: ataactacgatacgggagggc, Rv: acatttccgtgtcgcctta), and  
467 tetracycline efflux pump (Fw: tgggttctctatatcgggcg, Rv: tgggcgagtgaatgcagaat).  
468 These primers allowed for the detection of plasmid loss and transposition of  
469 resistances onto the chromosome. One end point clone was randomly  
470 selected from each population for phenotypic typing, curing, calculation of  
471 MICs and sequencing. Every eight transfers throughout the experiment 500  $\mu$ l  
472 samples of whole populations were collected and stored in 25% glycerol at -  
473 80°C. Whole populations were also plated out on non-selective media, 20  
474 individual clones were then randomly selected, sub-cultured for a further 24  
475 hours in non-selective media, and stored in 25% glycerol in 96 well plates.  
476  
477 **Relative Fitness**

478 The relative fitness of the evolved plasmid bearing versus ancestral plasmid  
479 free strain was estimated by direct competition, with six replicate strains per-  
480 treatment. The competitions were initiated with 50  $\mu$ l of 1:1 mixtures of  
481 plasmid-bearing evolved strain and plasmid-bearing ancestral strain marked  
482 with mCherry from overnight cultures in 5ml of non-selective NB media. The  
483 relative fitness of the evolved strains was calculated by gaining exact viable  
484 cell counts at 0 hours and 24 hours, strains were distinguished through  
485 detection of fluorescent markers using Zeis Stereo Lumar v12 microscope.  
486 The relative fitness of plasmid-bearing bacteria was calculated as a ratio of  
487 Malthusian parameters<sup>38</sup>:

$$W_{evo} = \frac{\ln\left(\frac{N_{final,evo}}{N_{initial,evo}}\right)}{\ln\left(\frac{N_{final,anc}}{N_{initial,anc}}\right)}$$

488

489 Fitness effects due to different markers was determined by competing plasmid  
490 free MG1655-GFP with plasmid free MG1655-mCherry, the relative fitness of  
491 MG1655-GFP was not significantly difference from 1 ( $t_5=0.015584$ ,  $p=0.9882$ )  
492 showing that there is no significant difference between the two marker strains.

493

494 Relative fitness of evolved strains harbouring evolved plasmid or evolved  
495 strains harbouring ancestral plasmid versus ancestral plasmid bearing cells  
496 was estimated using the same method as above, with eighteen replicate  
497 strains per competition, but grown in 100  $\mu$ l cultures in a 96 well plate, 37°C  
498 shaken at 600 rpm, 3 mm orbital radius, inoculated to an initial dilution of  
499 1:500. Again no fitness effect of markers was observed ( $t_5=-0.2795$ ,  $p=0.791$ ).

500

501 **Curing RK2 from evolved strains**

502 Evolved strains were cured using the pCURE curing system<sup>30</sup>. The anti-incP-1  
503 cassette (RK2 *oriV*, *parD*, *korA*, and *incC* genes) from pCURE11 was ligated  
504 into the pLAZ2 chloramphenicol resistant vector that contains the *sacB* gene  
505 allowing counter selection for plasmid free segregants. The resultant plasmid  
506 was transformed into chemically competent evolved strains and selected for  
507 using Cml 12.5 µg/ml. Single colony transformants were re-streaked on to  
508 Cml 12.5 µg/ml plates and Cml 12.5 µg/ml + 5% sucrose. Sucrose sensitive  
509 colonies were checked by PCR for the presence of the curing plasmid (Fw:  
510 aagtttggtgactgcgctc, Rv: caaagacgatgtgtagccg) and absence of RK2 β-  
511 lactamase and *tetA* (primers as above). Successfully cured clones were  
512 cultured for 24 hours in non-selective media to allow segregation of the curing  
513 plasmid; sergeants were selected on antibiotic free, 5% sucrose plates. To  
514 confirm loss of both plasmids sucrose resistant colonies were check for  
515 sensitivity to chloramphenicol, ampicillin, and tetracycline, as well as PCR  
516 using primers mentioned above. Both the ancestral strain harbouring RK2 and  
517 ancestral plasmid free strains under went the curing process and were used  
518 as a comparison to cured evolved strains to control for curing process.  
519 Ancestral RK2 was introduced into the cured evolved strains, and evolved  
520 RK2 was introduced into the plasmid free ancestor though conjugation. Again,  
521 to control for the curing and conjugation steps, ancestral RK2 was conjugated  
522 into cured ancestral strains and used for comparison. Saturated overnight  
523 cultures of donor plasmid containing strains and recipient plasmid free strains  
524 were mixed 1:1, and 50 µl was used to inoculate 5ml NB. The mixed cultures  
525 were grown for 24 hours and plated out on to 100 µg/ml ampicillin to select for

526 transconjugants. Transconjugants were confirmed by fluoresces and PCR  
527 screening for RK2 plasmid.

528

### 529 **MIC**

530 To measure minimal inhibitory concentrations, six replicate cultures per-  
531 treatment were grown overnight until stationary phase in 5 ml NB, the  
532 saturated cultures were then sub-cultured 50  $\mu$ l into 5 ml fresh NB and grown  
533 to an OD<sub>600</sub> of 0.5. These were then diluted into 96-well plates containing a  
534 log<sub>2</sub> serial dilution of antibiotic (AMP, TET or CML) to an initial density of  
535  $5 \times 10^5$  CFU/ml. 100  $\mu$ l cultures were grown for 24 hours 37°C shaken at 600  
536 rpm, 3 mm orbital radius. OD<sub>600</sub> was measured after 24 hours.

537

### 538 **Growth Curves**

539 Six replicate saturated overnight cultures per-treatment were sub-cultured to  
540 an OD<sub>600</sub> of 0.5, and used to inoculate 100  $\mu$ l NB supplemented with 10  $\mu$ g/ml  
541 TET per well in 96-well plates at a final dilution of 1:1000. Plates were grown  
542 at 37°C with shaking at 300 rpm, 3 mm orbital radius for 24 hours, OD<sub>600</sub> was  
543 measured every 16 minutes by Tecan infinite M200 Pro plate reader. Growth  
544 rates were calculated as the maximum slope of log<sub>2</sub> transformed OD<sub>600</sub>  
545 covering four time points (~1 hour of growth), lag phase was calculated to end  
546 when growth rate reached 10% of the maximum achieved growth rate.

547

### 548 **Genome sequencing and analysis**

549 Whole genomes were extracted from each evolved population's clone as well  
550 as the ancestral strain and ancestral strain harbouring the RK2 plasmid using



551 the DNeasy Blood and Tissue extraction kit (Qiagen). The total DNA was  
552 sequenced by MicrobesNG (<http://www.microbesng.uk>), which is supported  
553 by the BBSRC (grant number BB/L024209/1), using Illumina MiSeq. Reads  
554 were mapped to *E. coli* MG1655 K-12 genome (GenBank accession  
555 U00096.3) and RK2 (GenBank accession BN000925.1) reference using BWA-  
556 MEM<sup>39</sup>. Single nucleotide variants and small indel events were detected using  
557 GATK UnifiedGenotyper<sup>40</sup> and SnpEff<sup>41</sup>, insertion sequences were identified  
558 using custom scripts and Integrative Genomics Viewer<sup>42</sup>, and large genome-  
559 wide structural variants were detected using BreakDancer<sup>43</sup>. Mutations that  
560 were present in the ancestral clones were excluded, resulting in a set of  
561 mutations that were acquired during the selection experiment.

562

### 563 **Tracking mutations**

564 Populations that did not show a hypermutator phenotype, had insertion  
565 sequences within *ompF*, and mutations in the tetracycline resistance genes  
566 on the plasmid, from the constant TET treatments (T and AT treatments) were  
567 selected for further analysis to gain an understanding of the mutational  
568 timeline during the selection experiment. Insertion sequences within *ompF*  
569 were identified within whole populations of T4, AT2, AT3 and AT5 by PCR of  
570 the *ompF* gene (Fw: ACTTCAGACCAGTAGCCCAC, Rv:  
571 GCGCAATATTCTGGCAGTGA). A short product of 716 bp indicated no  
572 insertion sequence, a long product of 1484 bp indicated IS1 and a long product  
573 of 1911 bp indicated IS5. Whole population PCR indicated that *ompF*::IS  
574 mutants had swept into the population by transfer 40 for populations T4, AT2  
575 and AT5, and transfer 48 in population AT3. Frequency of *ompF* insertion

576 sequences were calculated by PCR of 20 clones from transfers 8, 16, 24, 32,  
577 and 40. Tetracycline resistance genes (*tetA* and *tetR*) from clones containing  
578 *ompF*::IS mutations from population AT2, transfers 8, 16, 24, and 32 were  
579 then Sanger sequenced to determine if *ompF* mutations arise before *tetAR*  
580 mutations (*tetA*: Fw: GGCTGCAACTTTGTCATG, Rv:  
581 TTCCAACCGCACTCCTAG, Internal1: ACAGCGCCTTTCCTTTG, Internal2:  
582 AAGGCAAGCAGGATGTAG; *tetR*: Fw: TCTGACGCGGTGGAAAG, Rv:  
583 ACGCGCGGATTCTTTATC, Internal1: GAGCCTGTTCAACGGTG, Internal2:  
584 TCTGACGACACGCAAAC).

585

### 586 **Statistical analysis**

587 To test if the mutations observed within each treatment had significantly  
588 different variances a multivariate homogeneity of groups variances test was  
589 conducted<sup>44</sup>. The binary presence or absence of a variant at each allele was  
590 use to calculate a Euclidean distance matrix between each population. This  
591 was used to test for homogeneity of variances between treatments using  
592 *betadisper* {vegan 2.4-0}. The variances between treatments were  
593 significantly different, with hypermutators significantly affecting within-group  
594 variation. These clones were removed from further analysis as significant  
595 differences in within-group variance can lead to falsely significant results  
596 when testing for differences between groups<sup>45</sup>. Permutational Multivariate  
597 Analysis of Variance was used to calculate whether different evolutionary  
598 treatments resulted in different sets of mutations<sup>45,46</sup>. Using the Euclidean  
599 distance matrix with hypermutators removed, the significance of within- and  
600 between-group distances was calculated using *adonis2* {vegan 2.4-0}. The

601 data was partitioned into different groups, multiple testing was corrected for  
602 using Bonferroni correction. Neighbour Joining phylogeny was constructed  
603 using the binary presence or absence table with hypermutators removed.  
604 Tree estimation and bootstrap support was conducted using *ape-package*  
605 {ape 4.0}. Significant difference between two related samples was calculated  
606 using two sided, two-sample t-test. Shapiro-Wilk test was conducted to check  
607 for normality, when normality could not be assumed a non-parametric  
608 Wilcoxon signed-rank test was used. Differences among treatments growth  
609 under antibiotic selection were calculated by ANOVA of the integral of the  
610 resistance profiles, with subsequent Tukey multiple comparison of means. All  
611 statistical analysis was conducted in R (version 3.2.3).

612

### 613 **Data Availability**

614 The sequence data supporting the findings of this study are available at the  
615 European Nucleotide Archive, accession: PRJEB20735. All other data in this  
616 study is available at Figshare data depository  
617 (<https://doi.org/10.6084/m9.figshare.5092225.v1>). Custom code used to map  
618 possible IS elements are available online  
619 ([https://github.com/mbottery/Co\\_Evo\\_IS\\_Analysis](https://github.com/mbottery/Co_Evo_IS_Analysis)).

620

621

622 **Acknowledgments** We thank J.P.W. Young, V. Friman, and members of the  
623 Friman and Brockhurst laboratories for discussion and comments on the  
624 manuscript. We thank C.M. Thomas for providing pCURE plasmids. This  
625 research was supported by the Wellcome Trust 4-year Ph.D. program

626 (WT095024MA) “Combating infectious disease: computational approaches in  
627 translation science.” This work was also supported by funding from the  
628 European Research Council under the European Union’s Seventh Framework  
629 Programme awarded to M.A.B. (FP7/2007-2013 ERC grant StG-2012-  
630 311490–COEVOCON).

631

632 **Contributions** M.A.B. and A.J.W. supervised the project. M.J.B. performed  
633 the experiments and analysed the data. All authors contributed towards the  
634 design of the study and wrote the manuscript.

635

636 **Competing interests** The authors declare no competing financial interests.

637

638 **Corresponding author** Correspondence to Michael. A. Brockhurst  
639 ([m.brockhurst@sheffield.ac.uk](mailto:m.brockhurst@sheffield.ac.uk)).

640

641 **Figure 1 | Resistance profiles of evolved plasmids and hosts.** Growth of  
642 **a**, evolved MG1655 strains with evolved RK2 plasmids **b**, evolved MG1655  
643 strains cured of evolved RK2 plasmids **c**, evolved MG1655 strains with  
644 ancestral RK2 plasmid and **d**, ancestral MG1655 clones with evolved RK2  
645 plasmids in the presence of tetracycline, ampicillin or chloramphenicol in  
646 comparison to ancestral MG1655. Points represent means of one clone from  
647 each of the six independent treatment populations, with SEM error bars.  
648 Dashed grey and black lines show the resistance profiles of plasmid free and  
649 plasmid containing ancestral strains respectively. Dashed lines in evolved  
650 host cured of plasmid plots (**c**) show ancestral MG1655 and ancestral

651 MG1655(RK2) after curing process. Dashed lines in ancestral host evolved  
652 plasmid plots (**d**) show ancestral MG1655 and ancestral MG1655(RK2) which  
653 had under gone curing with ancestral RK2 subsequently reintroduced.  
654 Vertical dashed lines in AMP and TET resistance profiles show the  
655 concentrations of AMP (100 µg/ml) or TET (10 µg/ml) used in the selection  
656 experiment.

657

658 **Figure 2 | Mutations show treatment specific parallelism. a**, An unrooted  
659 neighbour joining phylogeny of end-point evolved clones. The distance matrix  
660 was constructed from the binary presence or absence of variants at each  
661 gene relative to the ancestral strain; hypermutators were excluded from the  
662 analysis. Scale bar represents number of gene variants; percentage bootstrap  
663 support is shown at the branches, B=1000, values below 0.3 are omitted. Blue  
664 branches represent clone isolated from TET treatments. **b**, Mutations  
665 observed in evolved clones (excluding hypermutators) across treatment.  
666 Rings represent *E. coli* chromosomes or RK2 plasmids. Dots represent  
667 mutations, the size of the dots represent the number of mutations at the same  
668 loci across independent replicate populations. Plots of individual treatments  
669 are in Supplementary Fig. 3.



